

Criminal Law

*Carolina Academic Press
Law Casebook Series
Advisory Board*



Gary J. Simson, Chairman
Dean, Case Western Reserve University School of Law

Raj Bhala
University of Kansas School of Law

John C. Coffee, Jr.
Columbia University Law School

Randall Coyne
University of Oklahoma College of Law

John S. Dzienkowski
University of Texas School of Law

Paul Finkelman
Albany Law School

Robert M. Jarvis
*Shepard Broad Law Center
Nova Southeastern University*

Vincent R. Johnson
St. Mary's University School of Law

Michael A. Olivas
University of Houston Law Center

Kenneth Port
William Mitchell College of Law

Michael P. Scharf
Case Western Reserve University School of Law

Peter M. Shane
*Michael E. Moritz College of Law
The Ohio State University*

Emily L. Sherwin
Cornell Law School

John F. Sutton, Jr.
Emeritus, University of Texas School of Law

David B. Wexler
*John E. Rogers College of Law
University of Arizona*

Criminal Law

Cases, Commentary, and Questions

José Felipe Anderson

Patricia Mell

CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS

Durham, North Carolina

Copyright © 2007
José Felipé Anderson and Patricia Mell
All Rights Reserved

ISBN 978-0-89089-543-6
LCCN 2007933959

Carolina Academic Press
700 Kent Street
Durham, North Carolina 27701
Telephone (919) 489-7486
Fax (919) 493-5668
www.cap-press.com

Printed in the United States of America

I would like to dedicate this book to my wife of almost twenty five years, Dreama Clarke Anderson and my children Kristen Anderson and Danielle Anderson who lovingly tolerated me during the years of preparing this book. I would like to acknowledge my late Grandmother Dorothy Alaba, an outstanding English scholar who taught me how to read and set the spiritual and ethical example for my life. I thank my parents Dr. William Anderson and Dr. Aquilla Alaba Rice who demonstrated by their personal achievement the value of higher education.

J.F.A.

I dedicate this book to my mother, Thelma W. Mell and to my grandmother, Clara Mae Stanley, both of whom were trailblazers in their own ways.

I also dedicate it to my father, Julian C. Mell, who encouraged my taking the less familiar path and to my husband, Dr. Michael Ragland, who supports me on this journey.

Finally, I dedicate this book to Marilyn Yarborough, the first African American woman to lead a non-historically black law school in the United States.

P.M.

Contents

Table of Cases	xv
Chapter I Introduction to the Methodology of the Casebook	3
Patricia Mell, Crossing the Bar: The Column of the Legal Education Committee: Taking Socrates' Pulse: Does the Socratic Method Have Continuing Vitality in 2002?	4
Patricia Mell, Crossing the Bar: The Column of the Legal Education Committee—Law Schools and Their Disciples	6
Overview of the Criminal Justice Process	13
Chapter II Participants in the Criminal Process	19
When Is a Person in Jeopardy of Criminal Prosecution?	19
<i>Baltimore City Department of Social Services, Petitioner v. Jacqueline Bouknight, Maurice M., Petitioner</i>	19
Notes and Questions	31
Role of Judge and Jury in a Criminal Case	31
<i>Vincent S. Stokes v. State of Maryland</i>	31
Notes on the Jury Trial	36
José Felipé Anderson, The Art of Litigating: The Burden and Benefits of the American Jury	36
José Felipé Anderson, Catch Me If You Can!: Resolving the Ethical Tragedies in the Brave New World of Jury Selection	39
Notes and Questions	44
Practice Perspective	45
Chapter III The Burden of Proof in a Criminal Case	47
Why Should a Criminal Conviction Require the Highest Level of Proof?	47
<i>In re Winship</i>	47
Notes	55
Can Assumptions Be Used to Establish Proof Beyond a Reasonable Doubt?	57
<i>Sandstrom v. Montana</i>	57
Notes and Questions	60
Practice Perspective	61
Does the Presumption of Innocence Really Exist?	61
<i>Willard H. Williams v. State of Maryland</i>	61
Notes and Questions	68
Practice Perspective	69
Can a State Legislature Change the Burdens of Proof in a Criminal Case?	69

<i>Montana v. James Allen Egelhoff</i>	69
Notes and Questions	82
Practice Perspective	84
Chapter IV Basic Concepts of Criminal Law	85
Can a Medical Condition Make Your Conduct Involuntary?	85
<i>The People of the State of New York, Appellant-Respondent v. Emil Decina, Respondent-Appellant</i>	85
Notes and Questions	93
Practice Perspective	94
The Act of Possession	94
<i>The State of Utah, Plaintiff and Respondent v. Gary L. Fox, Defendant and Appellant, The State of Utah, Plaintiff and Respondent v. Clive Fox, Defendant and Appellant</i>	94
Notes and Questions	98
Practice Perspective	99
Inaction and Omission	100
<i>Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, Appellee v. Dorothy A. Konz, Defendant-Appellant and Stephen R. C. Erikson, Defendant-Appellant</i>	100
Notes and Questions	108
Should Some Persons Receive Special Protection from Omission?	109
<i>State of Idaho, Plaintiff-Respondent v. Jack Leroy Folsom, Defendant-Appellant</i>	109
Notes and Questions	113
Practice Perspective	113
Specific Intent	114
<i>John Thacker v. Commonwealth</i>	114
Notes and Questions	116
Practice Perspective	116
General Intent Crimes	117
<i>State of Hawaii v. Richard Barry Rocker and Joseph Cava</i>	117
Notes and Questions	126
<i>The People of the State of Illinois, Appellant v. Gary “Mike” Garrison, Appellee</i>	127
Notes and Questions	133
Practice Perspective	133
No Intent Crimes	133
<i>Commonwealth v. Olshefski</i>	133
<i>In re Clay Marley, on Habeas Corpus</i>	135
Notes and Questions	141
<i>Hershorn v. The People</i>	141
Notes and Questions	148
Limits to Removing Intent from Crimes	148
<i>The People, Respondent v. Stephen Stuart, Appellant</i>	148
Practice Perspective	153
Can a Company Commit a No Intent Crime?	153
<i>United States v. Park</i>	153
Notes and Questions	162

Vicarious Liability of Parents for Children	163
<i>The State of New Hampshire v. Melvin E. Akers and Marshal H. Fox</i>	163
Practice Perspective	166
Transferred Intent	166
<i>Ex parte Jared Jerome Weems</i>	
(Re <i>Jared Jerome Weems v. State of Alabama</i>)	166
Notes and Questions	169
Practice Perspective	170
Causation	170
<i>Commonwealth v. Root, Appellant</i>	170
Notes and Questions	178
<i>The People of the State of Illinois, Appellant v. Tyrone Love, Appellee</i>	179
Notes and Questions	183
<i>The State v. C. O. Frazier, Appellant</i>	184
Notes and Questions	191
Should Criminal Responsibility Have a Time Limit?	191
<i>United States of America, Plaintiff-Appellee v.</i>	
<i>Michael Clifton Chase, Defendant-Appellant</i>	191
Notes and Questions	194
Practice Perspective	194
Chapter V Theft and Fraud	195
How Many Free Matches Can You Take?	195
<i>Mitchum v. The State</i>	195
Notes and Questions	195
Should There Be Punishment for Having a Wandering Cow on Your Property?	196
<i>M. L. Masters v. State of Florida</i>	196
Notes and Questions	197
How Unreasonable Can an Honest Belief Be?	197
<i>Leslie Allen Binnie v. State of Maryland</i>	197
Notes and Questions	202
Practice Perspective	203
Do I Need to Leave the Retail Store with Goods to Be a Thief?	203
<i>The People of the State of New York, Respondent v. Ronald Olivo,</i>	
<i>Appellant; The People of the State of New York, Respondent v.</i>	
<i>Stefan M. Gasparik, Appellant; The People of the State of</i>	
<i>New York, Respondent v. George Spatzier, Appellant</i>	203
Notes and Questions	208
Can You Steal Computer Time at Work?	209
<i>State of Indiana, Appellant (Plaintiff Below) v.</i>	
<i>Michael McGraw, Appellee (Defendant Below)</i>	209
Notes	212
How Little Proof Is Needed for Mail Fraud?	213
<i>Garvey v. United States</i>	213
Notes and Questions	215
Practice Perspective	216
Federal Bureau of Investigation—August 1, 1922	216
Federal Bureau of Investigation—August 10, 1922	217

Chapter VI Crimes Related to Habitation	219
Can a Person Commit a Burglary of His or Her Own Home?	219
<i>The People, Plaintiff and Respondent v.</i>	
<i>James Matthew Gauze, Defendant and Appellant</i>	219
Notes and Questions	223
Is an Intent to Steal Needed to Support Burglary?	224
<i>Carl C. McIntosh, Appellant v. State of Missouri, Respondent</i>	224
Notes	227
Practice Perspective	227
Is a Garage Attached to a Residence a Dwelling?	228
<i>The People of the State of Colorado, Plaintiff-Appellant v.</i>	
<i>James Vincent Jiminez, Defendant-Appellee</i>	228
Question	229
Problem	230
Practice Perspective	230
When Is a Dwelling No Longer a Dwelling?	230
<i>Lorenzo J. Wallace v. State of Maryland</i>	230
Notes and Questions	235
Practice Perspective	236
Note on Arson: Another Crime against Habitation	236
 Chapter VII Homicide and Other Crimes against Person	 239
Note on Assault and Battery	239
When Does Life Begin for the Purpose of Homicide?	240
<i>Keeler v. Superior Court</i>	240
Notes and Questions	243
What Was the Difference between Murder and Manslaughter at	
Common Law?	244
<i>Commonwealth v. John W. Webster</i>	244
Notes and Questions	250
Practice Perspective	251
Is Slow Torture Premeditated Murder?	252
<i>Ronnie Midgett, Sr. v. State of Arkansas</i>	252
Notes and Questions	258
Is It Possible for a Dangerous Driver to Ever Be Convicted of	
First-Degree Murder?	259
<i>In re Heflin Mack Langford v. State of Alabama;</i>	
<i>Ex parte Heflin Mack Langford</i>	259
Notes and Questions	262
Practice Perspective	262
Is One Reckless Shot in the Head Sufficient to Establish	
Premeditated Murder?	263
<i>State of Maryland v. Ronald Lee Raines and Lawrence Wayne Bentley</i>	263
Notes and Questions	271
Practice Perspective	271
Is It Ever Legal to Assist in Suicide?	272
<i>People of the State of Michigan, Plaintiff-Appellee v.</i>	
<i>Jack Kevorkian, Defendant-Appellant</i>	272
Notes and Questions	285

Is the Questionable Death of a Child Injured in the Care of a Baby Sitter Always Homicide?	286
<i>Commonwealth v. Louise Woodward</i>	286
Notes and Questions on Involuntary Manslaughter	291
Practice Perspective	292
Felony Murder	292
<i>The People of the State of Illinois, Appellant v. Antonio Lowery, Appellee</i>	292
Felony Problems	298
Can One Co-Felon Be Liable for Another Co-Felon's Independent Acts?	299
<i>Heriberto Rodriguez, Appellant v. State of Florida, Appellee</i>	299
The Outer Limits of Felony Murder	301
<i>State of Minnesota, Appellant v. Dean Scott Aarsvold, Respondent</i>	301
Questions	309
Note on Heat of Passion/Rule of Provocation	309
A Biblical Perspective on Homicide and Heat of Passion	312
Justifiable Homicide: Lawful Use of Police Force	314
Statement of Patricia C. Jessamy, State's Attorney for Baltimore City in Reference to the Death of James Quarles	314
Major Homicide Practice Problems	317
Statutes	319
Chapter VIII Insanity and Other Defenses	321
<i>Fisher v. United States</i>	321
Notes and Questions	336
Practice Perspective	336
Problems: Insanity/Diminished-Capacity Defenses	337
Which Insanity Test Should a Jurisdiction Choose if a Court Is to Decide?	338
<i>State v. Bruce L. Johnson</i>	338
Notes and Questions	347
Practice Perspective	348
<i>Raymond L. Middleton, Warden, Petitioner v. Sally Marie McNeil</i>	349
Notes and Questions on Justified and Necessity-Based Defenses	352
<i>The People of the State of New York, Appellant v. Bernhard Goetz, Respondent</i>	352
Notes	364
Can a Guest Invoke the Castle Doctrine in Self-Defense?	365
<i>The State of Florida, Petitioner v. Alexander James, Respondent</i>	365
Notes and Questions	367
Practice Perspective	368
Shelby A.D. Moore, Doing Another's Bidding under a Theory of Defense of Others: Shall We Protect the Unborn with Murder	368
Chapter IX Rape and Sexual Offense	371
When Should a Court Reject a Rape Victim's Testimony?	371
<i>Samuel Legions v. Commonwealth</i>	371
Notes and Questions	373
Practice Perspective	373
What Is Sufficient Evidence of an Imminent Threat?	374

<i>Jerry L. Jones, Appellant (Defendant Below) v. State of Indiana, Appellee (Plaintiff Below)</i>	374
Notes and Questions	375
What Is Sufficient Force?	376
<i>State of Maryland v. Edward Salvatore Rusk</i>	376
Notes and Questions	396
Problems	396
Should We Call Date Rape Just Rape?	398
<i>Alford Lee Toler v. State</i>	398
Notes and Questions	401
Why Is Eighteen Not Eighteen in California?	402
<i>The People, Plaintiff and Respondent v. Francisco Angel Hernandez, Defendant and Appellant</i>	402
Notes and Questions	406
Practice Perspective	407
What Are the Limits of Statutory Rape?	407
<i>Dixon v. The State</i>	407
Notes and Questions	417
Who Is Lord Hale and Why Do We Need His Instruction?	417
<i>James E. Hardin, Defendant Below, Appellant v. State of Delaware, Plaintiff Below, Appellee</i>	417
Notes	422
How Strong Is the Protection of a Rape Shield Law?	423
<i>Roosevelt Davenport, Jr. v. State of Maryland</i>	423
Practice Perspective	425
Chapter X Jurisdiction and Constitutional Limitations	427
The Classic Common Law of Jurisdiction	427
<i>Jean Pennington v. State of Maryland</i>	427
Notes and Questions	438
Practice Perspective	438
Can Jurisdiction to Prosecute Cross International Borders?	439
<i>United States of America, Plaintiff v. Manuel Antonio Noriega et al., Defendants</i>	439
Notes and Questions	451
Constitutional Limitations	452
<i>The State of Ohio, Appellant v. Beckley et al., Appellees</i>	452
Practice Perspective	458
<i>Coates et al. v. City of Cincinnati</i>	458
Notes and Questions	462
<i>Papachristou et al. v. City of Jacksonville</i>	462
Notes and Questions	466
<i>R. A. V., Petitioner v. City of St. Paul, Minnesota</i>	467
Notes and Questions	471
Are There Fewer Constitutional Rights in a “Drug Free Zone”?	471
<i>Earl Powers v. State of Maryland</i>	471
Notes and Questions	478
The Limits of Government Prosecution—Entrapment	479
<i>Keith Jacobson, Petitioner v. United States</i>	479

Notes and Questions	489
Practice Perspective	490
Can a State Criminalize Private Intimate Conduct?	490
<i>John Geddes Lawrence and Tyron Garner, Petitioners v. Texas</i>	490
Notes and Questions	505
The Limits of the Federal Government to Create Crimes	506
<i>United States, Petitioner v. Alfonso Lopez, Jr.</i>	506
Notes and Questions	512
Chapter XI Inchoate Offenses and Participants in Crime	513
Note on Inchoate Crimes	513
Note on Accomplice Liability	517
How Far Did the Watergate Conspiracy Reach into the Government?	517
<i>United States of America v. Robert C. Mardian, Appellant</i>	517
Notes and Questions	526
The Conspiracy Indictment	527
Chapter XII Capital Punishment	537
What Process Is Needed to Execute a Human Being?	537
<i>Gregg v. Georgia</i>	537
Notes	548
Should the Value of the Life That Has Been Taken Be a Factor When Considering the Death Penalty?	550
<i>Booth v. Maryland</i>	550
When Should the Supreme Court Overrule One of Its Prior Death Penalty Decisions?	562
<i>Pervis Tyrone Payne, Petitioner v. Tennessee</i>	562
José Felipé Anderson, Will the Punishment Fit the Victims? The Case for Pre-Trial Disclosure, and the Uncharted Future of Victim Impact Information in Capital Jury Sentencing	579
How Certain Does the Evidence of Guilt Need to Be to Justify an Execution?	582
<i>Eugene Sherman Colvin-El, Petitioner-Appellee v.</i> <i>Eugene Nuth, Warden</i>	582
How Much Doubt about the Propriety of a Death Sentence Is Needed in Order to Obtain a Stay of Execution?	590
<i>Eugene Sherman Colvin-El v. State of Maryland</i>	590
Notes	593
José Felipé Anderson, When the Wall Has Fallen: Decades of Failure in the Supervision of Capital Juries	594
Chapter XIII The Model Penal Code	605
The American Law Institute	605
Index	677

Table of Cases

- Addington v. Texas, 83
Binnie v. State, 197–203
Blakely v. Washington, 216
Booth v. Maryland
Bouknight, 44–45
Bouknight v. Baltimore City Dept. of Social Services, 19–30
Brown v. Board of Education, 373, 599
Carter v. State, 310, 416
City of Chicago v. Morales, 479
Coates v. Cincinnati, 458–462.
Coker v. Georgia, 373, 549
Colvin-El v. Nuth, 582
Colvin-El v. State, 590–591
Commonwealth v. Berggren, 178
Commonwealth v. Cotto, 224
Commonwealth v. Konz, 100
Commonwealth v. Moody, 479
Commonwealth v. Olshefski, 133
Commonwealth v. Rhodes, 401
Commonwealth v. Root, 170–171, 173
Commonwealth v. Sullivan, 311
Commonwealth v. Webster, 244
Commonwealth v. Welansky, 292
Commonwealth v. Woodward, 286
Cornell v. State, 109
Cox v. State, 312
Davenport v. State, 423
DeArman v. State, 375
Dixon v. State, 407
Dixon v. United States, 84, 348
Durham v. United States, 341, 343, 348
Ex parte Weems, 166
Fisher v. United States, 321
Fox v. State, 94
Furman v. Georgia, 538
Garrett v. State, 169
Garvey v. United States, 213
Girouard v. State, 312
Gregg v. Georgia, 537
Hancock v. State, 212
Hardin v. State, 417
Henson v. State, 195
Hershon v. People, 144
Huffstetler v. State, 216
In re Kemmler, 541, 548–549
In re Marley, 135
In re Winship, 47
In re Wright, 489
Jackson v. Virginia, 60, 232, 265, 381, 384–385, 587, 589, 591
Jacobson v. United States, 479
Jones v. Dugger, 193–194
Jones v. State, 374
Keeler v. Superior Court, 240
Kennedy v. State, 224
King v. Pear, 205, 216
Langford v. State, 259
Lawrence v. Texas, 505
Legions v. Commonwealth, 371
Leland v. Oregon, 49, 55, 83
Lund v. Commonwealth, 212
Martin v. Ohio, 74, 76, 83
Martin v. State, 93
Masters v. State, 196
McClain v. State, 93
McCullough v. State, 61
McIntosh v. State, 224
Michael M. v. Superior Court, 406
Middletown v. McNeil, 349
Midgett v. State, 252
Mitchum v. State, 195
Montana v. Egelhoff, 82
Papachristou v. City of Jacksonville, 462
Pasquantotino v. United States, 216
Patterson v. New York, 58, 71, 73, 75–76, 79, 81, 83
Payne v. Tennessee, 498, 579

- Pennington v. State, 210, 427
People v. Aris, 310
People v. Barker, 311
People v. Barnes, 376
People v. Beardsley, 109
People v. Birreuta, 169
People v. Decina, 85
People v. Drew, 341, 344, 347
People v. Evans, 401
People v. Garrison, 127
People v. Gauze, 219
People v. Goetz, 352
People v. Hernandez, 402
People v. Hill, 227
People v. Hood, 116
People v. Iniguez, 376
People v. Jiminez, 228
People v. Love, 179
People v. Lowery, 298
People v. Morrin, 250
People v. Newton, 93
People v. Olivo, 203, 207
People v. Olson, 93
People v. Sorden, 83
People v. Stuart, 404
People v. Taylor, 308, 396
Powers v. State, 471
R.A.V. v. City of St. Paul, 467
Raines & Bentley v. State, 263
Regina v. Dudley & Stevens, 352
Regina v. O'Brien, 224
Robinson v. California, 479, 538–539, 552
Rodriguez v. State, 299
Roe v. Wade, 492, 501, 505, 574
Rorie v. United States, 364
Ruffin v. State, 68
Sallee v. State, 93
Sandstrom v. Montana, 57, 350
State v. Aarvold, 301
State v. Akers, 163
State v. Ball, 223
State v. Beckley, 452
State v. Brady, 169
State v. Bridgeforth, 116
State v. Cabrera, 93
State v. Colbath, 425
State v. Dell, 203
State v. Folsom, 109
State v. Frazier, 184
State v. Gandy, 169
State v. Green, 326, 452
State v. Harrison, 109
State v. Hazen, 239
State v. Hefler, 194
State v. Hefner, 240
State v. Hernandez, 292
State v. Hupf, 292
State v. James, 326
State v. Johnson, 33, 35, 326, 339
State v. Kevorkian, 272
State v. Lopez, 240
State v. Lowery, 292
State v. Malone, 178
State v. Martinez, 223
State v. McGraw, 209
State v. Molnar, 83
State v. Montanez, 364
State v. O'Leary, 224
State v. Ramirez, 235
State v. Rocker, 117
State v. Rodriguez, 69
State v. Rusk, 376
State v. Sexton, 84
State v. Smith, 99, 223, 367
State v. Snowden, 250
State v. Sorenson, 223
State v. Superior Court, 406
State v. Urena, 365
State v. Ward, 268, 517
Steve v. State, 376
Stokes v. State, 31, 36
Sullivan v. Louisiana, 56
Thacker v. Commonwealth, 114
Toler v. State, 398
Tripp v. State, 309
United States v. Chase, 191
United States v. Czubinski, 215
United States v. Holmes, 352
United States v. James, 96, 527
United States v. Jimenez-Recio, 527
United States v. Lopez, 506
United States v. Main, 191
United States v. Mardian, 517
United States v. Noriega, 440
United States v. Park, 153
United States v. Resendiz-Ponce, 93
Victor v. Nebraska, 60
Wallace v. State, 230
Weems, 166–170, 539, 549
Weems v. United States, 539, 549
White v. State, 310
Williams v. State, 61