International Ocean Law
Carolina Academic Press
Law Casebook Series
Advisory Board

Gary J. Simson, Chairman
Cornell Law School

Raj K. Bhala
University of Kansas School of Law

John C. Coffee, Jr.
Columbia University School of Law

Randall Coyne
University of Oklahoma Law Center

John S. Dzienkowski
University of Texas School of Law

Paul Finkelman
University of Tulsa College of Law

Robert M. Jarvis
Shepard Broad Law Center
Nova Southeastern University

Vincent R. Johnson
St. Mary’s University School of Law

Michael A. Olivas
University of Houston Law Center

Kenneth Port
William Mitchell College of Law

Michael P. Scharf
Case Western Reserve University Law School

Peter M. Shane
Moritz College of Law
The Ohio State University

Emily L. Sherwin
Cornell Law School

John F. Sutton, Jr.
Emeritus, University of Texas School of Law

David B. Wexler
University of Arizona College of Law
International Ocean Law
Materials and Commentaries

Ted L. McDorman
Professor, Faculty of Law,
University of Victoria, Victoria,
British Columbia, Canada

Alexander J. Bolla
Professor, Cumberland School of Law,
Samford University, Birmingham, Alabama

Douglas M. Johnston
Professor Emeritus, Faculty of Law,
University of Victoria, Victoria,
British Columbia, Canada

John Duff
Director, Marine Law Institute,
Faculty of Law, University of Maine,
Portland, Maine

Carolina Academic Press
Durham, North Carolina
Summary of Contents

Preface xi

An Introductory Note to Students on International Treaties and Cases 3

Chapter One — The Nature and Structure of International Ocean Law 11

Chapter Two — National Jurisdiction: Regimes, Zones and Boundaries 41

Chapter Three — Vessels: Navigation and Pollution 147

Chapter Four — Marine Living Resources 231

Chapter Five — Protection and Preservation of the Marine Environment 311

Chapter Six — Ocean Science and Technology Meets Ocean Law 343

Chapter Seven — Third Party Dispute Settlement 391

Index 425
# Contents

Preface xi
A Note on Reference Materials xiii

An Introductory Note to Students on International Treaties and Cases 3
Major International Treaties 3
International Cases 5
Other Treaties and International Documents of Note 7

Chapter One — The Nature and Structure of International Ocean Law 11
I Introduction 11
II Key Concepts and History of International Law of the Sea 16
   A. History 16
   B. Common Heritage of Humankind 21
III The Law of the Sea Convention 26
   A. Overview of the Contents of the LOS Convention 28
   B. The United States and the LOS Convention 29
   C. The LOS Convention and Subsequent Developments 35

Chapter Two — National Jurisdiction: Regimes, Zones and Boundaries 41
I Introduction 41
II Regimes and Zones in the LOS Convention 42
   A. Overview 42
   B. The LOS Convention Treaty Provisions 45
   C. U.S. Ocean Claims 53
      1. Presidential Proclamations Respecting U.S. Ocean Claims 53
      2. U.S. Federal-State Issues 56
   D. The Exclusive Economic Zone 58
III Maritime Boundaries: Introduction 61
IV The International Law of Maritime Boundary-Making 64
   A. Delineation of Baselines 66
B. Determination of Seaward Limits: Territorial Sea and EEZ  77
C. Determination of Seaward Limits: Continental Shelf  79
D. Islands  86
   1. Archipelagic States  86
   2. Islands or Rocks?  88
   3. Islands and Contested Sovereignty  91
E. Delimitation of “Lateral” Boundaries  93
   1. History and Background  93
   2. The LOS Convention  104
   3. The U.S.-Canada Gulf of Maine Case  108
   4. Recent Developments  118
V The Diplomacy of Maritime Boundary-Making  132

Chapter Three — Vessels: Navigation and Pollution  147
I Introduction  147
II Vessel Nationality  148
III Freedom of Navigation: An Overview with Special Reference to Military Matters  155
IV Passage Rights  162
   A. Innocent Passage  162
      1. History and the Principal LOS Convention Provisions  163
      2. Warships and Innocent Passage  172
   B. Passage in International Straits  179
      1. Introduction  179
      2. Transit Passage  186
      3. Straits Used for International Navigation  192
   C. Archipelagic Sea Lanes Passage  193
V Vessel-Source Pollution  200
   A. Introduction  200
   B. The Law of the Sea Convention  202
   C. The Authority of a Port State  217
   D. The Challenge of Ultra-hazardous Radioactive Materials  223

Chapter Four — Marine Living Resources  231
I Introduction  231
II Legal Issues within National Zones  236
   A. Harvesting and Access  236
B. Illegal Foreign Fishing 244
C. Regulation of Foreign Fishing Vessel Passage 252

III Legal Issues and Transboundary Stocks: The Case of Pacific Salmon 254

IV Legal Issues beyond National Jurisdiction 264
A. Harvesting and Access: Introduction 264
B. The Canadian Arrest of the Spanish Trawler Estai 268
C. The 1995 Fish Stocks Implementing Agreement 272

V The Intersection of Trade Law and Fisheries Law 298

Chapter Five—Protection and Preservation of the Marine Environment 311
I Introduction 311
II State Obligations under Customary International Law 314
A. The Major International Cases 314
   1. Trail Smelter Arbitration 314
   2. Corfu Channel Case 316
   3. Nuclear Test Cases 318
B. Declarations, Institutions and Treaties 322
   1. Stockholm, UNEP and the Basel Convention 322
   2. The 1992 Rio Declaration 324

III The Law of the Sea Convention 325
A. Introduction 325
B. The LOS Convention Provisions 326
C. The MOX Plant Case 337

IV Looking Back and Looking Forward 340

Chapter Six—Ocean Science and Technology Meets Ocean Law 343
I Introduction 343
II Law, Science and Ethics in Conflict: Selected Contexts 345
A. Fishery Management and Conservation 345
B. The Driftnet Controversy 353
C. The Precautionary Controversy 371

III The Impact of Technology on International Ocean Law 378

Chapter Seven—Third Party Dispute Settlement 391
I Introduction 391
II Consent and Third Party Dispute Settlement 395
   A. Bilateral Agreement 396
CONTENTS

B. Agreement To Use the International Court of Justice 398

III The Law of the Sea Convention 400
   A. Basic Framework 400
   B. The International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea 407
   C. The Southern Bluefin Tuna Cases (New Zealand/Australia v. Japan) 413

IV Evaluating the Current Status of Adjudicative Dispute Settlement 421

Index 425
Preface

*International Ocean Law: Materials and Commentaries* is intended for use by faculty and students as an introductory volume for a law school course that has as its focus the international law of the sea. It is purposefully different than other course books that are available on this subject and is purposefully different than traditional course books used in U.S. law schools.

The American-Canadian compilers of this volume have been influenced by the insights of the American-Canadian Robert MacNeil (author and longtime co-anchor on the MacNeil-Lehrer Newshour on PBS, born in Montreal and raised in Halifax, Nova Scotia) who wrote: "Speak to me and you will move me; write to me and I’ll have to think about it." Adapted to a university course setting: speaking/lecturing is about moving an audience; while writing/reading is about informing an audience. The materials and commentaries in this volume are designed to provide students (and faculty faced with teaching law of the sea for the first time) with the fundamental building blocks of international ocean law — to inform the reader. It is the challenge of the faculty member to enrich the materials through appropriate supplemental materials that reflect the particular interests of the faculty member and to enliven the material through lecture and discussions. This is the relationship between course materials and the classroom that the compilers are aiming for with this book.

Other features of this collection of materials should be noted. First, it is designed largely to be read as a cohesive text. It is believed that a text of this kind should be easier for students to manage and understand than the more traditional collection of disputed cases, statutes, treaty provisions and commentaries. Second, this volume is intended as an introduction to a fairly complex field of specialization. The primary emphasis is placed on fundamental concepts. At the end of the Preface some suggestions are offered on books and website addresses that might be consulted by students or instructors wishing to pursue certain topics in more detail. Third, it is hoped this compilation will be useful to faculty members with a specialized knowledge of law-of-the-sea issues as well as the teacher teaching this subject for the first time. It may be sufficiently comprehensive for instructors in the latter category, but experienced specialists will certainly wish to add materials of their own choosing. Fourth, the volume has been kept relatively short in the hope that “less is more”. The philosophy of the compilers is that succinctness sharpens focus, making it easier to absorb than more extensive readings.

A word about the law of the sea. Despite its name as a sub-discipline of public international law, it is truly a multi-dimensional field of studies, composed of many disciplines. Although questions of strict law do arise (what is the law? how should it

---

be applied? how should the relevant texts be interpreted?), ocean policy and management issues engage many other professions. For example, marine biologists, economists, sociologists and others are just as deeply involved in fishery development and management problems as lawyers. Navigation concerns are of direct interest to military security specialists and mariners. Geologists work alongside lawyers in matters related to the continental shelf and the ocean floor. Geographers have a central role in the mapping of zones in the sea and the development of maritime boundaries. Many disciplines come together in the sector of marine pollution control. It is useful for readers of this work to be aware of the multi-disciplinary sophistication that permeates this fascinating field.

Although the law of the sea is inherently international and the perspective adopted by the compilers is not intended to reflect a particular national interest, this volume is designed for U.S. students with the result that they are U.S. oriented. Most of the referenced material is American, although, not surprising, some Canadian examples and experiences have seeped in.

New developments are taking place in the international law of the sea on a regular basis. At the time of the preparation of this volume neither the United States, nor Canada, were parties to the 1982 United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea. This could change at any time. Such a decision by the United States would not have a significant impact on materials in this volume. There are other developments that may have a more significant impact particularly in the areas of marine environmental protection, the utilization of dispute settlement and the application of principles regarding maritime boundary delimitation.

As the volume is intended to expose students to the basic building blocks of the international law of the sea, an effort has been made to constrain the special interests of the compilers. This has not always been possible. For example, Chapter Four “Marine Living Resources” contains a large section on the Canada-U.S. Pacific salmon dispute and a further section on the intersection of international trade law and fisheries law. In another situation, lack of editorial interest has resulted in the cursory treatment of an area that others may see as critical—the regime for harvesting minerals on the deep ocean floor. Chapter One, “The Nature and Structure of International Ocean Law,” contains a section on the common heritage of humanity, one of the new concepts in the international law of the sea, and there are other references to deep seabed mining in the volume, but no detailed materials are provided.

For reasons of expediency, much of the excerpted commentaries are drawn from the academic and other writings of the compilers. In almost every case, other writings could have been used to deal with the particular subject matter. The choice of excerpts has left many leading authorities unacknowledged in this volume. The reader will recognize that copyright issues have played a significant role in materials selection.

One of the compilers, Ted L. McDorman, is currently the editor-in-chief of Ocean Development and International Law: The Journal of Marine Affairs. The compilers wish to acknowledge with gratitude that Taylor and Francis, the publisher of Ocean Development and International Law, has provided generous copyright releases for material published in this journal.
A Note on Reference Materials

It is not the purpose here to provide a comprehensive listing of available reference materials and websites related to the international law of the sea. Nevertheless, it is hoped that the following information is of some assistance in furthering examination of the many law-of-the-sea issues raised in this volume.

Regarding the United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea and related treaties and activities, the United Nations, Office of Legal Affairs, Division for Ocean Affairs and the Law of the Sea (DOALOS) maintains a valuable web site at: www.un.org/Depts/los/index.htm. At this address information on the status of the Law of the Sea Convention and related treaties can be obtained, as well as information on the work of the Parties to the Convention and the bodies created by the Law of the Sea Convention including the International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea. As well, one can access directly the texts of the U.N. Convention on the Law of the Sea and the 1995 Straddling and Migratory Fish Stocks Agreement.

Attention is also drawn to www.oceanlaw.net which, while primarily focused on fisheries matters, provides access to treaty texts, legislation and case materials on a variety of ocean law topics.

There are a number of leading scholarly journals to which reference needs to be made. The following are journals that have ocean law and affairs as their specific focus:

- Ocean Development and International Law: The Journal of Marine Affairs (Taylor and Francis);
- International Journal of Marine and Coastal Law (Kluwer Law International);
- Marine Policy: The International Journal of Ocean Affairs (Butterworth-Heinemann);
- Ocean & Coastal Management (Elsevier Sciences);
- Ocean Yearbook (University of Chicago Press); and
- Ocean and Coastal Law Journal (Marine Law Institute, School of Law, University of Maine).

Journals in the discipline of international law that should be noted included:

- American Journal of International Law (American Society of International Law);
- British Yearbook of International Law; and
- International and Comparative Law Quarterly.

What follows is a partial list of what might be considered as fundamental books regarding the law of the sea.

Perhaps the single most comprehensive work is that of R.R. Churchill and A.V. Lowe, The Law of the Sea (3rd edition) (Manchester University Press, 1999). Not only is this text invaluable in itself, but in addition at the end of each chapter is added a bibliography of materials relating to that chapter. Another classic, general text is E.D. Brown, The International Law of the Sea: Introductory Manual (Dartmouth, 1994). A more dated text is D.P. O’Connell, The International Law of the Sea (two volumes, edited by I.A. Shearer) (Clarendon Press, 1982).

While not a book, per se, the recently published lectures of Tullio Scovazzi given at the Hague Academy of International Law entitled “The Evolution of International Law
of the Sea: New Issues, New Challenges” (Vol. 286, (2000), Collected Courses of the
Hague Academy of International Law, Recueil des Cours, pp. 39-244) provides a useful
overview of the history and issues arising in modern law of the sea.

Regarding the Law of the Sea Convention, the negotiating history of the provisions
1982: A Commentary (five volumes) (Martinus Nijhoff). A recent addition to the litera-
ture on the Law of the Sea Conference is Edward L. Miles, Global Ocean Politics (Mar-
tinus Nijhoff, 1998). The United Nations, Office of Legal Affairs, Division for Ocean Af-
airs and the Law of the Sea has produced commentaries on numerous parts of the LOS
Convention and, as well, publishes the Law of the Sea Bulletin on a semi-regular basis.

On recent developments in the international law of fisheries, the most authoritative
analysis is William T. Burke, The New International Law of Fisheries: UNCLOS 1982 and
Beyond (Clarendon Press, 1994). An excellent collection of papers on a wide range of
international fisheries issues is Ellen Hey, ed. Developments in International Fisheries

For years, the Law of the Sea Institute (located in Rhode Island, Hawaii, Miami and
now at the University of California, Berkeley) has published conference and workshop
proceedings of extremely high caliber. The Center for Oceans Law and Policy, Univer-
sity of Virginia School of Law has been hosting annual conferences on ocean law and
policy issues and having the proceedings published by Martinus Nijhoff. Note should
also be made of the books published as part of the International Environmental Law
and Policy Series of Kluwer Law International. (The web site for Kluwer Law Interna-
tional/Martinus Nijhoff is www.kluwerlaw.com.)

Author Format Note

Various authors from many English speaking backgrounds are represented in this
work and no attempt is made to achieve spelling uniformity following the American
English format.