

Civil Commitment

Civil Commitment

A Therapeutic Jurisprudence Model

Bruce J. Winick

Carolina Academic Press
Durham, North Carolina

Copyright © 2005
Bruce J. Winick
All Rights Reserved

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Winick, Bruce J.

Civil commitment : a therapeutic jurisprudence model / by Bruce J.

Winick.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references.

ISBN 1-59460-021-X (alk. paper)

1. Insane--Commitment and detention--United States. I. Title.

KF480.W56 2004

346.7301'38--dc22

2004021170

Carolina Academic Press
700 Kent Street
Durham, North Carolina 27701
Telephone (919) 489-7486
Fax (919) 493-5668
E-mail: cap@cap-press.com
www.cap-press.com

Printed in the United States of America

*To my new granddaughter, Allegra Belle Kinney Winick,
born February 15, 2003,
who one day will read this book, and some day soon
will reach for the stars.*

Contents Summary

Acknowledgments		xv
Chapter 1	Toward A Therapeutic Jurisprudence Model for Civil Commitment	1
Chapter 2	Striking the Balance Between Coercion and Autonomy: Therapeutic Jurisprudence Insights on Coercion and Its Consequences and Application in the Civil Commitment Process	17
Chapter 3	Civil Commitment Criteria: An Overview	41
Chapter 4	The Limits of <i>Parens Patriae</i> Commitment: How Incompetency Should Be Defined and Determined	99
Chapter 5	The Outer Limits of Police Power Commitment: The Civil Commitment of Sex Offenders	119
Chapter 6	Application of Civil Commitment Criteria: The Civil Commitment Hearing	139
Chapter 7	Voluntary Hospitalization	165
Chapter 8	Rights Within the Institution and the Standards Governing Their Exercise or Waiver	197
Chapter 9	Outpatient Commitment	239
Chapter 10	International Human Rights Law Limitations on Civil Commitment	289
Chapter 11	Conclusion: Therapeutic Jurisprudence’s Challenge to Civil Commitment Law and Practice	325
Index		333

Contents

Acknowledgments	xv
Chapter 1 Toward A Therapeutic Jurisprudence Model for Civil Commitment	1
The Consequences of Civil Commitment	1
The Medical Model and the Legal Model of Civil Commitment	4
A Therapeutic Jurisprudence Model of Civil Commitment	6
Organization of the Book	11
Conclusion	14
Chapter 2 Striking the Balance Between Coercion and Autonomy: Therapeutic Jurisprudence Insights on Coercion and Its Consequences and Application in the Civil Commitment Process	17
Legal and Psychological Conceptions of Coercion	18
A Therapeutic Jurisprudence Approach to Coercion	22
Does Coercive Treatment Work?: The Relationship Between Treatment Outcome and Patient Perceptions of Coercion and Voluntariness	23
The Perception of Coercion: What Makes People Feel Coerced?	24
Balancing the Positive and Negative Effects of Coercion	26
Applying the Law Therapeutically in Coercive Contexts: Therapeutic Jurisprudence Prescriptions for Clinicians	36
Conclusion	37
Chapter 3 Civil Commitment Criteria: An Overview	41
General Considerations	41
The Requirement of Mental Illness or Disability	48
Police Power Commitments	59
<i>Parens Patriae</i> Commitment	66
The Medical Appropriateness Principle	69

x Contents

The Least Restrictive Alternative Principle	71
Conclusion	72
Appendix	73
Table 3.1: Current Civil Commitment Statutes for the 50 States and the District of Columbia	73
Table 3.2: Statutory Definition of Mental Illness or Mental Disability for Civil Commitment	75
Table 3.3: Police Power Commitment Criteria	81
Table 3.4: <i>Parens Patriae</i> Commitment Criteria	86
Table 3.5: Statutory Language Contemplating that Commitment be Medically Appropriate	93
Table 3.6: The Least Restrictive Alternative Requirement for Involuntary Hospitalization	94
Chapter 4 The Limits of <i>Parens Patriae</i> Commitment: How Incompetency Should Be Defined and Determined	99
The Constitutional Problem of Defining <i>Parens Patriae</i> Commitment Too Broadly	99
The MacArthur Treatment Competence Study	104
Therapeutic Jurisprudence Considerations	110
How Incompetency Should Be Defined and Applied: A Proposed Presumption in Favor of Competency	111
Conclusion	116
Chapter 5 The Outer Limits of Police Power Commitment: The Civil Commitment of Sex Offenders	119
The Civil Commitment of Sex Offenders	120
Supreme Court Consideration of Sexually Violent Predator Laws	121
The Diminished Volitional Ability Requirement for Police Power Commitment	123
The Mental Illness Requirement for Civil Commitment	129
The Medical Appropriateness of Sex Offender Civil Commitment	131
Conclusion	135

Chapter 6 Application of Civil Commitment Criteria: The Civil Commitment Hearing	139
Introduction	139
Procedural Due Process and the Civil Commitment Hearing	140
The Gap Between Theory and Practice	142
The Psychology of Procedural Justice and the Commitment Hearing	145
The Psychological Effects of Coercion and Voluntary Choice	149
Restructuring the Role of the Actors in the Commitment Process: How Lawyers, Judges, and Expert Witnesses Should Play Their Roles	154
Conclusion	161
Appendix	162
Table 6.1: Statutory Procedures for Civil Commitment Hearings for the 50 States and the District of Columbia	162
Chapter 7 Voluntary Hospitalization	165
The Benefits of Voluntary Hospitalization	166
Competence to Consent to Voluntary Admission and How It Should Be Defined and Ascertained	168
How Voluntary Admission Should Work	171
The “Voluntariness” Requirement for Voluntary Hospitalization and How Its Satisfaction Should be Assured	174
Conclusion	177
Appendix	178
Table 7.1: Statutory Criteria and Procedures for Voluntary Admission	178
Table 7.2: Informal and Non-protesting Admission	185
Table 7.3: Requests for Release and Possible Conversion to Involuntary Status	187
Table 7.4: Duration of Voluntary Hospitalization	194
Chapter 8 Rights Within the Institution and the Standards Governing Their Exercise or Waiver	197
The Right to Treatment	199

The Right to Refuse Mental Health Treatment	204
Rights to Communication and Visitation	209
Rights Concerning Seclusion and Restraint	210
The Right of Institutionalized Patients To Engage in Future Decision Making Through Advance Directive Instruments	216
Waiver of Rights Within the Institution	219
Conclusion	229
Appendix	230
Table 8.1: Right to Treatment Statutory Provisions	230
Table 8.2: Right to Refuse Treatment Statutory Provisions	232
Table 8.3: Statutory Provisions Regarding Seclusion and Restraints	234
Chapter 9 Outpatient Commitment	239
Two Pre-existing Models of Outpatient Commitment: Conditional Release and LRA Outpatient Treatment	243
Preventive Outpatient Commitment	246
Balancing the Therapeutic and Antitherapeutic Consequences of Preventive Outpatient Commitment	255
Alternatives to Preventive Outpatient Commitment: Enhanced Services and Outreach, Assertive Community Treatment, Mental Health Courts, and the Use of Advance Directive Instruments	260
Applying the Law Therapeutically in Outpatient Commitment Cases	276
Conclusion	280
Appendix	281
Table 9.1: Statutory Provisions for Conditional Release	281
Table 9.2: Statutory Provisions for Preventive Outpatient Commitment	284
Chapter 10 International Human Rights Law Limitations on Civil Commitment	289
Abuses in the Mental Health System of Eastern Europe	290
Construing International Human Rights Law through the Lens of Therapeutic Jurisprudence: Resolving Vagueness in the European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms	293

The Factual Background of <i>Winterwerp v. The Netherlands</i>	294
The Meaning of “Unsound Mind” as a Justifying Condition for Civil Commitment	297
Procedural Requirements for Civil Commitment	307
The Right to Appropriate Treatment	315
Automatic Divestiture of Right to Administer Property upon Civil Commitment	318
Conclusion: Applying International Human Rights Law Therapeutically to Remedy Abuses in the Mental Health System of Eastern Europe	320
Chapter 11 Conclusion: Therapeutic Jurisprudence’s Challenge to Civil Commitment Law and Practice	325
Index	333

Acknowledgments

I am grateful to Ian Freckleton and Kate Diesfeld for inviting me to contribute a therapeutic jurisprudence analysis of civil commitment for their recently published comprehensive, comparative, and international consideration of involuntary commitment, *Involuntary Detention and Therapeutic Jurisprudence: International Perspectives on Civil Commitment* (Kate Diesfeld and Ian Freckleton eds. 2003). Preparing the chapter I submitted in response to their kind invitation, *A Therapeutic Jurisprudence Model for Civil Commitment*, made me realize that it was time to pull together my therapeutic jurisprudence thoughts on civil commitment into a book setting forth a comprehensive analysis of the field. My chapter for their book provided a useful beginning for that project and a skeletal framework for what became this book. I am most grateful to Ian and Kate for encouraging me to start this project and then to expand my brief chapter into this book. I also appreciate the permission of Ashgate Publishing Company, the publisher of Kate and Ian's edited book, to build upon the thoughts first advanced in my chapter for their book.

Many others contributed to the intellectual development of this book. Not the least of them is David Wexler, my long-time friend and collaborator in the therapeutic jurisprudence project we have shared for the past seven teen or so years. Therapeutic jurisprudence started out in the field of mental health law, e.g., *Essays in Therapeutic Jurisprudence* (David B. Wexler & Bruce J. Winick eds. 1991), but soon spread across the legal landscape. E.g., *Law in a Therapeutic Key: Developments in Therapeutic Jurisprudence* (David B. Wexler & Bruce J. Winick eds. 1996). Therapeutic jurisprudence then took on lawyering, *Practicing Therapeutic Jurisprudence: Law as a Helping Profession* (Dennis P. Stolle, David B. Wexler & Bruce J. Winick eds. 2000), and judging *Judging in a Therapeutic Key: Therapeutic Jurisprudence and the Courts* (Bruce J. Winick & David B. Wexler eds. 2003). With this book, I returned to mental health law, a field I have mined before with the approach of therapeutic jurisprudence, Bruce J. Winick, *Therapeutic Jurisprudence Applied: Essays on Mental Health Law* (1997); Bruce J. Winick, *The Right to Refuse Mental Health Treatment* (1997), this time undertaking a comprehensive analysis of the institution of involuntary hospitalization. It would have been impossible to conceive this work without David Wexler's pioneering insights.

As with my other efforts, the University of Miami School of Law has provided the hospitable intellectual environment that has made this work possible. I'm especially grateful to Dean Dennis O. Lynch and Associate Dean Stephen J.

Schnably for their continued support and encouragement. A summer research grant from the law school in the summer of 2003 made this book possible. I owe an important debt of gratitude to the University of Miami Law library and to its able reference librarians and library staff, Robin Schard, Helen Wohl, Barbara Brandon, Barbara Cuadras, Sue Ann Campbell, and its International Law Librarian, Eduardo Rotman. Finally, this work would not have been possible without the always able assistance of my Faculty Assistant, Eileen Russell, and my work-study students, Jessica C. Serrano and Jessica Martinez. I also thank Alison Moses, University of Miami School of Law, Class of Dec. 2003, for her able research assistance on several of the chapters and for her significant efforts in compiling the statutory appendices that are sprinkled throughout the chapters of the book.

Several of the chapters build upon previously published articles, and I am grateful to the following copyright holders and publications for permission to use portions of this work:

- The American Psychological Association, copyright holder for the following articles, all published by me in *Psychology, Public Policy and Law*, and reflected in portions of Chapters 4, 5, and 9, respectively: *The MacArthur Treatment Competence Study: Legal and Therapeutic Implications*, 2 PSYCHOL. PUB. POL'Y & L. 137 (1996); *Sex Offender Law in the 1990s: A Therapeutic Jurisprudence Analysis*, 4 PSYCHOL. PUB. POL'Y & L. 505 (1998); and *Outpatient Commitment: A Therapeutic Jurisprudence Analysis*, 9 PSYCHOL. PUB. POL. & L. 107 (2003);
- Ashgate Publishing Company for permission to use in Chapter 1 some of the material previously published in *A Therapeutic Jurisprudence Model for Civil Commitment*, in INVOLUNTARY DETENTION AND THERAPEUTIC JURISPRUDENCE: INTERNATIONAL PERSPECTIVES ON CIVIL COMMITMENT, 23 (Ashgate Publishing Co., Kate Diesfeld & Ian Freckleton, eds. 2003);
- The Denver Law Review for permission to reprint in Chapters 2 and 8 portions of *Coercion and Mental Health Treatment*, 74 DENVER L. REV. 1145 (1997);
- The Journal of Contemporary Legal Issues for permission to use in Chapter 6 portions of *Therapeutic Jurisprudence and the Civil Commitment Hearing*, 10 J. CONTEMP. L. ISSUES, 37 (1999); and
- The New York Law School Journal of Comparative and International Law for permission to use in Chapter 10 portions of *Therapeutic Jurisprudence and the Treatment of People with Mental Illness in Eastern Europe: Construing International Human Rights Law* 21 N.Y. L. SCH. J. INT'L & COMP L. 537 (2002).

This is the sixth therapeutic jurisprudence book that I have published with Carolina Academic Press, and as with the others, I am most grateful to Keith Sipe and the many other good people at Carolina for their wonderful work in the publication process. Keith's support and encouragement over the years have been indispensable.

