Law Codes in Dynastic China
LAW CODES IN DYNASTIC CHINA

A Synopsis of Chinese Legal History in the
Thirty Centuries from Zhou to Qing

John W. Head
and
Yanping Wang

CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS
Durham, North Carolina
Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Head, John W. (John Warren), 1953—
Law codes in dynastic China: a synopsis of Chinese legal history in the thirty centuries from Zhou to Qing / by John W. Head and Yanping Wang.
p. cm.
Includes bibliographical references and index.
ISBN 1-59460-039-2
1. Law—China—Codification—History. 2. Law—China—History. I. Wang, Yanping. II. Title.

KNN122.H43 2004
349.51'09—dc22 2004009739

Carolina Academic Press
700 Kent Street
Durham, NC 27701
Telephone (919) 489-7486
Fax (919) 493-5668
www.cap-press.com

Printed in the United States of America
Contents

List of Maps and Boxes ix
Preface xi

Chapter I The Long Reach of Chinese Law 3
 I.A. Chinese Dynastic History in a Nutshell 3
    I.A.1. Introduction 3
    I.A.2. Before the Zhou Dynasty 5
    I.A.3. From Western Zhou to Qin (ca. 11th Century BCE to 3rd Century BCE) 9
    I.A.4. From Han to Tang (3rd Century BCE to 7th Century CE) 10
    I.A.5. From Tang to Qing (7th Century to 20th Century CE) 11
    I.A.6. Major Patterns in Chinese History 12
 I.B. Overview of Chinese Legal History and Key Concepts 14
    I.B.1. Historical Highlights 14
    I.B.2. Conceptual Highlights 16
    I.B.3. The Challenge of Chinese 16

Chapter II Confucianists and Legalists 23
 II.A. The Concept of Li in the Western Zhou Period 24
    II.A.1. The Duke of Zhou and Political Reforms 24
    II.A.3. “Lü Hou establishes xing” 30
 II.B. Li and Law in the Eastern Zhou Period 31
    II.B.1. Confucius—His Times and His Failure 32
    II.B.2. The Teachings of Confucius 35
        II.B.2.a. An Expanding Conception of Li 35
        II.B.2.b. Examples of the Expanded Concept of Li 37
        II.B.2.c. A Disdain for Law 39
        II.B.2.d. The Importance of Education 40
    II.B.3. Mengzi and Xunzi 41
        II.B.3.a. Social Stratification 42
        II.B.3.b. Punishment versus Moral Example 44
II.B.4. Legalism 45
II.B.5. Confucianism versus Legalism 48
II.B.6. The Xing Shu 48
   II.B.6.a. Account #1: An End to Secrecy in Law 53
   II.B.6.b. Account #2: Successor to Ancient and Open Codes 54
II.B.7. Significance of the Xing Shu and Its Successors 56
II.B.8. Synopsis—Chinese Law in the Balance 58

Chapter III Legalist Victory and Defeat:
The Qin and Han Dynasties 61
III.A. Overview of the Qin-Han Period 62
III.B. The Qin Dynasty—Legalism's Moment of Glory and Blood 63
   III.B.1. The State of Qin and Shang Yang 63
   III.B.2. The Unification of China under Qin Power 70
   III.B.3. Li Si and Legalism 72
   III.B.4. The Qin Code 73
III.B.5. The Demise of the Qin Dynasty 76
III.C. The Han Dynasty—Legalism's Surrender to Confucianism 77
   III.C.1. Building the Han Dynasty and Empire 77
      III.C.1.a. Prosperity and Expansion 78
      III.C.1.b. From Former Han to Later Han and Collapse 79
      III.C.1.c. Significance and Resilience 82
   III.C.2. Written Language and Civilization 83
III.C.3. Imperial Confucianism 86
      III.C.3.a. Outside Influences 87
      III.C.3.b. Confucianism Plus "Correlative Cosmology" 88
   III.C.4. The Han Code 91
      III.C.4.a. Sources of Information 91
      III.C.4.c. Structure, Size, and Organization of the Code 92
      III.C.4.d. Statutes, Ordinances, and Other Legal Stipulations 93
      III.C.4.e. Confucianist Teachings As Sources of Law 96
   III.C.4.f. Punishments 98
   III.C.4.g. Other Aspects of the Administration of Justice 101
III.C.5. Rules of Behavior Outside the Code 102

Chapter IV The Tang Code 105
IV.A. From the Fall of the Han Dynasty to the Rise of the Tang Dynasty 106
   IV.A.1. The Period of Division 106
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CONTENTS</th>
<th>vii</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>IV.A.1.a.</td>
<td>Neo-Daoism and Buddhist Influence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV.A.1.b.</td>
<td>Codification and Confucianism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV.A.2.</td>
<td>The Sui Dynasty</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV.A.2.a.</td>
<td>The Beginning of Reunification</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV.A.2.b.</td>
<td>The Kaihuang Code</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV.B.</td>
<td>The Tang Code and Its Setting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV.B.1.</td>
<td>The Tang Dynasty</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV.B.2.</td>
<td>Background to the Tang Code of 653</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV.B.3.</td>
<td>Central Aims and Themes of the Code</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV.B.3.a.</td>
<td>Law, Li, and Cosmic Harmony</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV.B.3.b.</td>
<td>The Five Punishments</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV.B.3.c.</td>
<td>The Ten Abominations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV.B.4.</td>
<td>Structure and Content of the Code</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV.B.4.a.</td>
<td>The General Principles: Coverage</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV.B.4.c.</td>
<td>The Specific Articles</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV.B.5.</td>
<td>Other Aspects of Tang Law</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV.B.5.a.</td>
<td>Other Sources of Law</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV.B.5.b.</td>
<td>Rules Outside the Imperial Law</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Chapter V** Reenactment, Displacement, Revival:

**Codification in the Song and Yüan Dynasties**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CONTENTS</th>
<th>vii</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>V.A.</td>
<td>Law in the Song Dynasty</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V.A.1.</td>
<td>Historical Overview—750 Years from Tang through Yüan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V.A.2.</td>
<td>From Tang to Song</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V.A.3.</td>
<td>The Song Code and Its Supplements</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V.A.4.</td>
<td>The Song Code in Operation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V.B.</td>
<td>Law in the Yüan Dynasty</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V.B.1.</td>
<td>The Mongol Conquest of China</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V.B.2.</td>
<td>Law in the Yüan Era</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V.B.2.a.</td>
<td>From Mongol Law to Chinese Law</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V.B.2.b.</td>
<td>The “Codes” of 1291 and 1331</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V.B.2.c.</td>
<td>Mongol Influence on the Legal System</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Chapter VI** Codification Reaches Maturity:

**The Ming and Qing Dynasties**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CONTENTS</th>
<th>vii</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>VI.A.</td>
<td>Law in the Ming Dynasty</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI.A.1.</td>
<td>Rise of the Ming Dynasty</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI.A.2.</td>
<td>The Ming Code</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
vi CONTENTS

VI.A.2.a. Restoration and Contradiction 179
VI.A.2.b. The Da Ming Lü of 1389 180
VI.A.2.c. Zhu Yuanzhang's Legacy 187
VI.A.3. Other Legal Developments 189
   VI.A.3.a. Other Legislation 190
   VI.A.3.b. Confucianist Influences and the Examination System 191
VI.B. The Qing Code and Its Application 192
   VI.B.1. Establishment of the Qing Dynasty 192
   VI.B.2. Building on the Ming Code 199
   VI.B.3. Sub-Statutes and the 1740 Version of the Qing Code 205
   VI.B.4. Commentaries and the Presentation of the Code 207
   VI.B.5. Other Features of Qing Law 212
      VI.B.5.a. The Imposition of Punishment 212
      VI.B.5.b. The District Magistrate 215
      VI.B.5.c. Administration through Caselaw 217
      VI.B.5.d. Civil Law or Criminal Law? 219

Chapter VII Concluding Observations: Codification and Chinese Legal History 227
   VII.A. Codes and Continuity 227
      VII.A.1. Qin Unification 228
      VII.A.2. Continuity and Legal Conservatism 228
      VII.A.3. Codes as Cultural Constitutions 229
   VII.B. Codes and the Rejection of Challengers 231
   VII.C. Dynastic Codes and Contemporary Issues 233
      VII.C.1. Judicial Discretion and Political Control 233
      VII.C.2. Legal Complexity and Constitutional Simplicity 234
      VII.C.3. Ethics in Law and Government 235
      VII.C.4. Government Control over Law 236

Bibliography 239
   Works in English and French 239
   Works in Chinese 244

Index 245

About the Authors 261
# List of Maps and Boxes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Map</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Map 1</td>
<td>Modern China, with key rivers and neighboring lands</td>
<td>xv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Map 2</td>
<td>Modern China, with provinces and neighboring lands</td>
<td>xvi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Map 3</td>
<td>Ancient Dynasties</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Map 4</td>
<td>Principal States in the Latter Portion of the Warring States Period</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Map 5</td>
<td>China under the Han Dynasty</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Map 6</td>
<td>The Reach of the Tang Empire, ca. 750</td>
<td>117</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Map 7</td>
<td>China under the Song Dynasty in 1005</td>
<td>143</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Map 8</td>
<td>The Yuan Empire under Khubilai Khan, 1279</td>
<td>153</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Map 9</td>
<td>China under the Ming Dynasty, ca. 1415</td>
<td>179</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Map 10</td>
<td>China under the Qing Dynasty, ca. 1760</td>
<td>197</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Box I-1</td>
<td>Chinese Dynasties and Periods</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Box I-2</td>
<td>Chinese Legal History—Highlights</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Box I-3</td>
<td>Chinese Legal Terms and Concepts</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Box I-4</td>
<td>Chinese Language—Pinyin versus Wade-Giles (examples)</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Box II-1</td>
<td>Confucianist and Legalist Views—A Comparison</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Box II-2</td>
<td>Tripod vessels</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Box III-1</td>
<td>The Qin-Han Period—Key Names and Dates</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Box IV-1</td>
<td>The Tang Code—Article 1</td>
<td>128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Box V-1</td>
<td>The Mongol Era—“Codes” and Other Legal Documents</td>
<td>158</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Box VI-1</td>
<td>The Ming Dynasty—Codification Efforts</td>
<td>181</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Box VI-2</td>
<td>The Qing Dynasty—Codification Efforts</td>
<td>200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Box VI-3</td>
<td>The Qing Code—Simplified Sample Layout of a Page</td>
<td>210</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Preface

I began writing this book to fill a gap. In my study of Chinese law, largely in the context of teaching a course called “Comparative Law” for about a dozen years, I have found no adequate English-language legal history of China that aims at telling the entire story in a nutshell. In hopes of conveying to my students some of the peculiar grandeur of that story, and to learn it better myself, I embarked on the adventure that eventually became this book.

It proved to be a more challenging adventure than I anticipated. More than once I nearly concluded that the sheer length and complexity of Chinese legal history made it impossible to capsulize in a single book, except perhaps in a way that would be too shallow to be useful.

Fortunately, I hit upon two strategies to make the task manageable. First, I enlisted the help of my former student and now colleague, Ms. Yanping Wang. She is one of the very few people in the world who have earned full law degrees both in the United States and in China and have engaged in extensive legal practice in both countries. Her knowledge of Chinese legal history as revealed through Chinese language sources has given this book an authenticity that would have eluded me working alone. In addition, her cross-cultural legal training has served as a valuable corrective influence; she has ferreted out exaggerations or sloppy scholarship in both the Chinese-language and the English-language sources on which we have relied—yielding, we hope, a book that sacrifices nothing in the way of accuracy by striving for brevity.

My second strategy for overcoming the seeming impossibility of summarizing the whole of Chinese legal history in a one-volume book has been to select a single centralizing theme—codification—and to tie the entire story to it. This theme appeals to me for several reasons. For one thing, I am engaged in a more general research program to examine the role of legal codification in various countries and cultures, partly in order to illuminate why the experience with legal codification differs so much from one legal tradition to another.*

* A product of that research program takes the form of a recently published article comparing selected codes in Chinese law, civil law, and common law. See John W. Head,
More importantly, legal codification is a natural theme to use in studying China. Legal codes have played a central role in Chinese law for at least two and a half millennia, although it has been a dramatically different role from that played by codes in the civil law tradition, such as Justinian’s Code of the sixth century or Napoleon’s of the nineteenth century. And, happily for researchers in this area, the 1990s saw important new discoveries and scholarship in the area of Chinese dynastic law codes, including the publication in English of the two most important such codes—those of the Tang dynasty, as translated by Professor Wallace Johnson of the University of Kansas, and of the Qing dynasty, as translated by Professor William Jones of Washington University in St. Louis.

Accordingly, it has seemed appropriate to Ms. Wang and me that we focus on legal codification as a central element of Chinese legal history. In doing so, we have adopted a straightforward chronological approach. The story starts with the Zhou dynasty (beginning in the 11th or 12th century BCE) and ends with the collapse of the Qing dynasty at the beginning of the twentieth century. (For reasons that have been explained elsewhere, the central contours of China’s legal system, including the role of codification, still survive today in the People’s Republic of China, so it would be a mistake to regard a study of dynastic Chinese legal history as anachronistic or irrelevant.)

In telling this abbreviated story of Chinese legal history, Ms. Wang and I have drawn liberally from a broad range of scholarship by experts whose work, based in their study of primary materials, vastly outshines ours. However, our aim is different from theirs. We seek breadth, not depth. Our goal is to paint a simple picture of the majestic sweep of China’s legal tradition—allowing it to “emerge from the works of many scholars when surveyed and connected by a single pair of observers,” to paraphrase the words of one of the authors we have relied on in writing this book. And in striving to meet that goal, Ms. Wang and I have drawn also on our own legal training and experience in several different legal systems to give us a perspective that is different from those of others on whose work we have relied, most of whom are not lawyers. (Like Ms. Wang, I also have studied and practiced law in more than one country.)

Ms. Wang and I wish to express our gratitude to several friends and colleagues who have provided valuable assistance to us in bringing this book to completion and publication. These include in particular Professor Wallace

Johnson, Professor Raj Bhala, and Rob Mead at the University of Kansas, Professor R. Randle Edwards of the George Washington University, and Professor William Jones of Washington University in St. Louis. Our thanks also go to several research assistants who have devoted considerable time to this project, including Mikas Kalinauskas, Alison Rans on Anway, and Jeffrey Li. We also appreciate the help and patience that our families have shown while we worked to prepare this book (with a special thanks to my son Austin for helping me with the maps). Research funding support from the University of Kansas is also gratefully acknowledged.

J.W.H.
8 March 2005
Map 1—Modern China, with key rivers and neighboring lands

Map 2—Modern China, with provinces and neighboring lands


xvi