

# COURTS CROSSING BORDERS



# COURTS CROSSING BORDERS

---

*Blurring the Lines of Sovereignty*

Mary L. Volcansek  
TEXAS CHRISTIAN UNIVERSITY

John F. Stack, Jr.  
FLORIDA INTERNATIONAL UNIVERSITY

CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS  
Durham, North Carolina

Copyright © 2005  
Mary L. Volcansek, John F. Stack, Jr.  
All Rights Reserved

**Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data**

Volcansek, Mary L., 1948-  
Courts crossing borders : blurring the lines of sovereignty / by Mary L.  
Volcansek, John F. Stack, Jr.-- 1st ed.  
p. cm.  
Includes bibliographical references.  
ISBN 1-59460-055-4 (alk. paper)  
1. International courts. 2. Judge-made law. 3. Sovereignty. I. Stack,  
John F. II. Title.

KZ6250.V65 2005  
341.5'5--dc22

2005001656

Carolina Academic Press  
700 Kent Street  
Durham, North Carolina 27701  
Telephone (919) 489-7486  
Fax (919) 493-5668  
E-mail: [cap@cap-press.com](mailto:cap@cap-press.com)  
[www.cap-press.com](http://www.cap-press.com)

Printed in the United States of America

*For Our Dearest Friends:  
Mimi, Eva, Peggy, Kasha, Bella, Kotiti, Amanda, Amy, and Fitzy*



# CONTENTS

Acknowledgments	xi
Chapter 1 Courts Crossing Borders	3
Chapter 2 Judicialization and Sovereignty	11
Sovereignty	12
Judicialization of Transnational Politics	15
Transnational Courts	17
Chapter 3 Courts and Regional Trade Agreements	23
Crossing Borders	24
Institutionalization	26
Rise of Dispute Settlement Systems	29
Cases of Economic Dispute Regulation	33
Courts, Institutionalization, and Trade	39
Chapter 4 Sovereignty in Europe: The European Court of Justice and the Creation of a European Political Community	43
Sovereignty in Europe: Constitutionalization and Europeanization	44
Constitutionalization	44
Europeanization	48
Becoming Sovereign: How Was It Possible?	49
Competitive Sovereignty	54
The Limits of Judicial Constitutionalization	58

Judicial Preferences	59
The Consequences of Pluralism	59
The Nature of the Challenge to Sovereignty	61
<b>Chapter 5 Natural, Economic, and Political Borders: Trade and Environmental Protection Before the European Court of Justice</b>	<b>63</b>
Nature, Economy, and Polity: The Complexity of Borders	64
Courts Crossing Borders in the European Union	65
Neofunctionalism	66
Intergovernmentalism	67
The Evidence	67
Aggregate Evidence	67
Doctrinal Analysis	73
Conclusion	83
<b>Chapter 6 How Rights Evolve: The Case of Non-Discrimination in the European Court of Human Rights</b>	<b>85</b>
The European Court of Human Rights	86
Judges on Rights	88
The Institutional Setting for European Human Rights	91
Tailoring Demand to the Court's Resources	95
The Parameters of Judicial Concern	95
How Article 14 Jurisprudence Grows	98
Conclusion	102
<b>Chapter 7 Constructing Human Rights in the Americas: Institutional Development and Practice in the New World</b>	<b>105</b>
Constructing a Human Rights Regime	106
American Hegemony and Cold War Anticommunism	109
The Inter-American Commission: Instrumental Adaptation and Strategic Bargaining	112



The Inter-American Court: Constructing Human Rights	116
Advisory Jurisdiction	118
Contentious Jurisdiction	123
“Promises to Keep”: The Quest for Institutionalization and Habitualization in the Inter-American System	129
<b>Chapter 8 Dispute Resolution under NAFTA and the Emergence of Transnational Quasi-Courts</b>	137
An Overview of NAFTA’s Dispute Resolution System	139
Quasi-Courts and Dispute Resolution under Chapter 19 of NAFTA	141
Jurisdiction	142
Selection and Composition of Binational Panels	143
Dispute Resolution Process	144
Appeals: The Extraordinary Challenge Procedure	147
Disputes and Decisions under Chapter 19 of NAFTA	148
Conclusion	157
<b>Chapter 9 Sovereignty, Transnational Constraints, and Universal Criminal Jurisdiction</b>	159
Meanings of Sovereignty	160
Transnational Constraints: The British Experience	164
Universal Criminal Jurisdiction	168
Precedents from the Past Relative to Universal Jurisdiction	169
Contemporary Developments	173
Ad Hoc Tribunals	174
The Pinochet Case	174
The Hissène Habré Case	175
The Belgian Example	176
Prospects: The International Criminal Court	178
Conclusion: Sovereignty, Globalization, and the Princeton Principles	179

<b>Chapter 10 Bringing Her Out of the Shadows: An Empirical Analysis of Sentences in Rape Cases before the International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia</b>	183
International Gender Justice for All? Armed Conflict and Mass Rape	186
Conflict in the Former Yugoslavia: The Establishment of the ICTY Statute and Tribunal	192
Doing Justice: Theory, Data and Method	197
Dependent Variable: Sentence	199
Command and Control Power	200
The ICTY Articles and Rape	201
Total Number of Counts Charged	204
Discussion	204
Conclusion	211
<b>Bibliography</b>	213
<b>List of Contributors</b>	233
<b>Table of Cases</b>	237
<b>Index</b>	243

## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

We are pleased to acknowledge the assistance of several colleagues who made this volume possible. Dr. Thomas A. Breslin, former vice president for research at Florida International University (FIU), conceived of a series of conferences on contemporary public policy and provided financial support for eight conferences that led to the publication of six books, with the final two volumes now nearing production.

Thanks are due for the support of Dr. Mark B. Rosenberg, FIU's Provost and Executive Vice President of Academic Affairs, Dr. Ralph S. Clem, Director of the Center for Transnational and Comparative Studies, and Dr. Nicol Rae, Chair of the Department of Political Science. We are grateful to Professor Thomas E. Baker, Professor Michael Fischl, and Dr. Louis Fisher, who urged us to consider Carolina Academic Press, and for the support of Dr. Robert Conrow, our acquisitions editor at CAP. Our appreciation is also sent to Mr. Nicholas Eliopoulos, who copyedited the manuscript with care.

This work would not have been possible without the support of the Jack D. Gordon Institute for Public Policy and Citizenship Studies at Florida International University and the tireless assistance of Ms. Elaine Dillashaw. We also wish to thank Dr. Harry Antrim, who dutifully read and commented on much of the manuscript.

