Courts Crossing Borders
Courts Crossing Borders

Blurring the Lines of Sovereignty

Mary L. Volcansek
Texas Christian University

John F. Stack, Jr.
Florida International University

Carolina Academic Press
Durham, North Carolina
For Our Dearest Friends:
Mimi, Eva, Peggy, Kasha, Bella, Kotiti, Amanda, Amy, and Fitzy
# Contents

Acknowledgments xi

Chapter 1 Courts Crossing Borders 3

Chapter 2 Judicialization and Sovereignty 11

Sovereignty 12
Judicialization of Transnational Politics 15
Transnational Courts 17

Chapter 3 Courts and Regional Trade Agreements 23

Crossing Borders 24
Institutionalization 26
Rise of Dispute Settlement Systems 29
Cases of Economic Dispute Regulation 33
Courts, Institutionalization, and Trade 39

Chapter 4 Sovereignty in Europe: The European Court of Justice and the Creation of a European Political Community 43

Sovereignty in Europe: Constitutionalization and Europeanization 44
Constitutionalization 44
Europeanization 48
Becoming Sovereign: How Was It Possible? 49
Competitive Sovereignty 54
The Limits of Judicial Constitutionalization 58
Chapter 5  Natural, Economic, and Political Borders: 
Trade and Environmental Protection Before 
the European Court of Justice  
Courts Crossing Borders in the European Union 65  
Neofunctionalism 66  
Intergovernmentalism 67  
The Evidence 67  
Aggregate Evidence 67  
Doctrinal Analysis 73  
Conclusion 83

Chapter 6  How Rights Evolve: The Case of Non-Discrimination 
in the European Court of Human Rights  
The European Court of Human Rights 86  
Judges on Rights 88  
The Institutional Setting for European Human Rights 91  
Tailoring Demand to the Court’s Resources 95  
The Parameters of Judicial Concern 95  
How Article 14 Jurisprudence Grows 98  
Conclusion 102

Chapter 7  Constructing Human Rights in the Americas: 
Institutional Development and Practice in the New World 105  
Constructing a Human Rights Regime 106  
American Hegemony and Cold War Anticommunism 109  
The Inter-American Commission: Instrumental Adaptation 
and Strategic Bargaining 112
The Inter-American Court: Constructing Human Rights  116
Advisory Jurisdiction  118
Contentious Jurisdiction  123
“Promises to Keep”: The Quest for Institutionalization and Habitualization in the Inter-American System  129

Chapter 8  Dispute Resolution under NAFTA and the Emergence of Transnational Quasi-Courts  137
An Overview of NAFTA’s Dispute Resolution System  139
Quasi-Courts and Dispute Resolution under Chapter 19 of NAFTA Jurisdiction  141
Selection and Composition of Binational Panels  143
Dispute Resolution Process  144
Appeals: The Extraordinary Challenge Procedure  147
Disputes and Decisions under Chapter 19 of NAFTA  148
Conclusion  157

Chapter 9  Sovereignty, Transnational Constraints, and Universal Criminal Jurisdiction  159
Meanings of Sovereignty  160
Transnational Constraints: The British Experience  164
Universal Criminal Jurisdiction  168
   Precedents from the Past Relative to Universal Jurisdiction  169
Contemporary Developments  173
   Ad Hoc Tribunals  174
   The Pinochet Case  174
   The Hissène Habré Case  175
   The Belgian Example  176
   Prospects: The International Criminal Court  178
Conclusion: Sovereignty, Globalization, and the Princeton Principles  179
## Contents

Chapter 10  Bringing Her Out of the Shadows: An Empirical Analysis of Sentences in Rape Cases before the International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia 183

International Gender Justice for All? Armed Conflict and Mass Rape 186

Conflict in the Former Yugoslavia: The Establishment of the ICTY Statute and Tribunal 192

Doing Justice: Theory, Data and Method 197
   Dependent Variable: Sentence 199
   Command and Control Power 200
   The ICTY Articles and Rape 201
   Total Number of Counts Charged 204
   Discussion 204
   Conclusion 211

Bibliography 213

List of Contributors 233

Table of Cases 237

Index 243
Acknowledgments

We are pleased to acknowledge the assistance of several colleagues who made this volume possible. Dr. Thomas A. Breslin, former vice president for research at Florida International University (FIU), conceived of a series of conferences on contemporary public policy and provided financial support for eight conferences that led to the publication of six books, with the final two volumes now nearing production.

Thanks are due for the support of Dr. Mark B. Rosenberg, FIU’s Provost and Executive Vice President of Academic Affairs, Dr. Ralph S. Clem, Director of the Center for Transnational and Comparative Studies, and Dr. Nicol Rae, Chair of the Department of Political Science. We are grateful to Professor Thomas E. Baker, Professor Michael Fischl, and Dr. Louis Fisher, who urged us to consider Carolina Academic Press, and for the support of Dr. Robert Conrow, our acquisitions editor at CAP. Our appreciation is also sent to Mr. Nicholas Eliopoulos, who copyedited the manuscript with care.

This work would not have been possible without the support of the Jack D. Gordon Institute for Public Policy and Citizenship Studies at Florida International University and the tireless assistance of Ms. Elaine Dillashaw. We also wish to thank Dr. Harry Antrim, who dutifully read and commented on much of the manuscript.