

**CLASSIC PROBLEMS  
OF JURISPRUDENCE**



# CLASSIC PROBLEMS OF JURISPRUDENCE

Robert E. Rodes, Jr.  
UNIVERSITY OF NOTRE DAME LAW SCHOOL

CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS  
Durham, North Carolina

Copyright © 2005  
Robert E. Rodes, Jr.  
All Rights Reserved

**Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data**

Rodes, Robert E.  
Classic problems of jurisprudence / by Robert E. Rodes, Jr.-- 1st ed.  
p. cm.  
ISBN 1-59460-133-X (alk. paper)  
1. Jurisprudence. I. Title.

K230.R6215A33 2005  
340--dc22

2005012864

Carolina Academic Press  
700 Kent Street  
Durham, North Carolina 27701  
Telephone (919) 489-7486  
Fax (919) 493-5668  
[www.cap-press.com](http://www.cap-press.com)

Printed in the United States of America

*Almae matri  
Scholae Juris  
Harvardianae*



# CONTENTS

Acknowledgments	xi
Introduction	3
I. Definition	5
CASES	
1. The Bribed Judge (hypothetical)	15
2. The King's Forged Signature (hypothetical)	16
3. The Dissed Draftee (news item)	18
4. New Laws and Old ( <i>Halse v. Warwick</i> , 1931 C.P.D. 233)	19
5. The Dutiful Driver ( <i>McDevitt v. Stokes</i> , 192 S.W. 681 (Ky. 1917))	20
6. Church Bingo (local history)	21
7. The Scofflaw Mother (news item)	21
8. The Bad Checks (hypothetical)	22
9. The Body Corporate (hypothetical)	23
10. The Teachers' Strike (hypothetical)	25
II. Law and Morality	27
CASES	
10. The Teachers' Strike (continued)	38
11. The Filial Insider (news item)	39
12. Religious Marriage (hypothetical)	39
13. The Underage Grantor (hypothetical from <i>Doctor             and Student</i> )	40

14. The Tax Loophole (hypothetical from Richard Wasserstrom)	41
15. The Double Payment (hypothetical from <i>Doctor and Student</i> )	42
16. Barred Claims (hypotheticals)	42
17. The Persecuted Plaintiff (hypothetical)	43
18. The Battered Wife (hypothetical)	44
19. Abortion in Germany (German Constitutional Court, 1993)	45
20. The Man on the Rock (hypothetical)	46
21. The Asylum Seeker (hypothetical)	47
22. The Expropriated Painting (hypothetical)	49
23. The Woman who Turned in her Husband (German court, 1949)	50
24. Nuremberg (International Military Tribunal, 1946)	51
25. Supporting the Constitution (personal experience)	53
<b>III. Language and Meaning</b>	56
CASES	
26. The City Gates (hypothetical from St. Thomas Aquinas)	65
27. The Memorial Truck (hypothetical from Lon Fuller)	65
28. The Sleepers (hypothetical from Lon Fuller)	66
29. The Similar Case ( <i>Devereux v. Tuchet</i> , 20 Selden Soc. 16 (1310))	66
30. The Geese ( <i>Nashville &amp; K.R. Co. v. Davis</i> , 78 S.W. 1030 (Tenn. 1902))	67
31. The Wetback Rector ( <i>Church of the Holy Trinity v. United States</i> , 143 U.S. 457 (1902))	68
32. The Stolen Airplane ( <i>McBoyle v. United States</i> , 283 U.S. 25 (1931))	70
33. The Gangster Act ( <i>Lanzetta v. New Jersey</i> , 306 U.S. 451 (1939))	71
34. The Friendly Fire ( <i>Youse v. Employers Fire Ins. Co.</i> , 238 P.2d 472 (Kan. 1951))	72
35. The Intolerable Knives (hypothetical)	73



36. The Base Born Brother (problem in medieval law)	74
37. The Mill Race ( <i>Crakehall v. Anon.</i> , 36 Selden Soc. 76 (1313))	76
38. The Drowning Rescuer ( <i>O'Leary v. Brown-Pacific-Maxon</i> , 340 U.S. 504 (1951))	77
39. The Chevron Case ( <i>Chevron U.S.A. v. Natural Resources Defense Council</i> , 467 U.S. 837 (1984))	78
<b>IV. Rights and Remedies</b>	<b>80</b>
CASES 40. The Flouted Franchise ( <i>Ashby v. White</i> , 92 Eng. Rep. 126 (1703))	93
41. The Prisoner Bride ( <i>Regina v. Jackson</i> , 1 Q.B. 671 (1891))	94
42. A Woman Scorned ( <i>Nanda v. Nanda</i> , [1968] p. 351)	96
43. The Slighted Grievance ( <i>Vaca v. Sipes</i> , 386 U.S. 171 (1967))	97
44. The Uninsured Motorist ( <i>Reitz v. Mealey</i> , 314 U.S. 33 (1941); <i>Kesler v. Utah Dep't of Pub. Safety</i> , 369 U.S. 153 (1962); <i>Perez v. Campbell</i> , 402 U.S. 637 (1971))	101
45. Employment Agencies ( <i>Adams v. Tanner</i> , 244 U.S. 590 (1916))	104
46. The Prisoner Plaintiff ( <i>J.R. v. M.P.</i> , Y.B. 6 Hen. 6, Hil. 3 (1459))	106
47. Celebratory Waste (hypothetical)	107
48. The Taro Trader ( <i>Hong Hoon v. Lum Wai</i> , 26 Haw. 546 (1922))	110
49. The Old Mill Stream ( <i>Storm v. Manchaug Co.</i> , 95 Mass. 10 (1866))	111
50. The Strip Miner ( <i>Barker v. Mintz</i> , 215 P. 534 (Colo. 1923))	114
<b>V. Instrumental and Didactic Applications of Law</b>	<b>117</b>
CASES 51. The Runaway Magistrates (Theodosian Code 12:1:16)	131
52. Quia Emptores (18 Edw. 1, Stat. 1 (1290))	131

53. The Short Form of Slum Clearance (current problem)	133
54. Drugs for Addicts (hypothetical)	134
55. Cannabis in Canada (Committee reports)	135
56. The Man in the House ( <i>King v. Smith</i> , 392 U.S. 309 (1968))	136
57. The Adulterers ( <i>Commw. v. Stowell</i> , 449 N.E.2d 357 (Mass. 1983))	140
58. The Casual User ( <i>Newsweek</i> article, 7/2/02)	141
59. Abscam ( <i>U.S. v. Janotti</i> , 673 F.2d 578 (3d Cir. 1982) and other cases)	142
60. Hate Crimes (New York and other legislation; <i>Wisconsin v. Mitchell</i> , 508 U.S.476 (1993))	143
61. The Fire Exits (hypothetical based on <i>Commw. v. Welansky</i> , 55 N.E.2d 902 (Mass. 1944))	145
62. The Fender Bender (personal experience)	146
63. The Merry Widow (anecdote)	147
<b>Conclusion</b>	148
<b>Index</b>	153
<b>Table of Cases</b>	161

## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Between first and second drafts of these chapters, I have had the benefit of valuable suggestions from John Finnis, G. Randy Lee, Walter F. Pratt, Jr., John H. Robinson, and Thomas L. Shaffer. Especial thanks are due to Tom Shaffer, who has been giving generous, meticulous and critical attention to my drafts for nearly forty years.

Much of the work of turning academic reminiscences into proper citations has been done by my research assistant, the erudite and resourceful Thomas Bruder of our 2005 Law School class. And where he and I have both failed, that paragon of research librarians, Patti Ogden, has succeeded.

