

International Human  
Rights and Comparative  
Mental Disability Law

*Carolina Academic Press  
Law Casebook Series  
Advisory Board*



Gary J. Simson, Chairman  
*Dean, Case Western Reserve University School of Law*

Raj K. Bhala  
*University of Kansas School of Law*

John C. Coffee, Jr.  
*Columbia University Law School*

Randall Coyne  
*University of Oklahoma College of Law*

John S. Dzienkowski  
*University of Texas School of Law*

Paul Finkelman  
*University of Tulsa College of Law*

Robert M. Jarvis  
*Shepard Broad Law Center  
Nova Southeastern University*

Vincent R. Johnson  
*St. Mary's University School of Law*

Michael A. Olivas  
*University of Houston Law Center*

Kenneth Port  
*William Mitchell College of Law*

Michael P. Scharf  
*Case Western Reserve University School of Law*

Peter M. Shane  
*Michael E. Moritz College of Law  
The Ohio State University*

Emily L. Sherwin  
*Cornell Law School*

John F. Sutton, Jr.  
*Emeritus, University of Texas School of Law*

David B. Wexler  
*John E. Rogers College of Law  
University of Arizona*

# International Human Rights and Comparative Mental Disability Law

---

## Cases and Materials

**Michael L. Perlin**  
PROFESSOR OF LAW  
NEW YORK LAW SCHOOL

**Arlene S. Kanter**  
PROFESSOR OF LAW  
SYRACUSE UNIVERSITY COLLEGE OF LAW

**Mary Pat Treuthart**  
PROFESSOR OF LAW  
GONZAGA UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW

**Eva Szeli**  
ADJUNCT PROFESSOR OF LAW  
NEW YORK LAW SCHOOL

**Kris Gledhill**  
BARRISTER OF THE INNER TEMPLE, LONDON

CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS  
Durham, North Carolina

Copyright © 2006  
Michael L. Perlin  
Arlene S. Kanter  
Mary Pat Treuthart  
Eva Szeli  
Kris Gledhill  
All Rights Reserved

ISBN 1-59460-210-7  
LCCN 2006924481

CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS  
700 Kent Street  
Durham, North Carolina 27701  
Telephone (919) 489-7486  
Fax (919) 493-5668  
[www.cap-press.com](http://www.cap-press.com)

Printed in the United States of America

To Linda, Julie & Alex: for their love and their laughter, and for  
always keeping the chimes of freedom flashing ...  
(MLP)

To my husband, Steven, and our children, Rachel and Ari,  
the most loving of thanks  
(ASK)

To my parents, Bud and Elaine Treuthart, and to my husband, Dan Webster,  
for their love and encouragement  
(MPT)

To the individuals whose personal stories have been at the heart of  
mental disability rights cases throughout the world  
(ES)

To Alice and Tony, Kath and Eric  
(KG)



# Contents

---

Table of Cases	xxi
Acknowledgments	xxiii
<b>Chapter 1 Introduction</b>	<b>3</b>
About the Authors	10
Conclusion	11
<b>Chapter 2 Constitutional Mental Disability Law</b>	<b>13</b>
A. Involuntary Civil Commitment	13
1. Substantive and Procedural Standards	13
a. Theon Jackson v. State of Indiana	13
b. J.B. O'Connor v. Kenneth Donaldson	22
c. Alberta Lessard et al. v. Wilbur Schmidt et al.	28
Questions	38
d. Frank O'Neal Addington v. State of Texas	39
Questions	45
2. Special Populations	45
a. Juveniles	45
James Parham v. J.R. et al.	45
b. Voluntary Patients	58
Marlus C. Zinermon, et al. v. Darrell E. Burch	58
c. Mental Retardation	65
Leonard Heller v. Samuel Doe, by His Mother and Next Friend, Mary Doe	65
Questions	78
d. Insanity Acquitees	79
1. Michael Jones v. United States	79
2. Terry Foucha v. Louisiana	87
Questions	98
e. Assisted Outpatient Commitment	98
1. Kendra's Law	98
Note	105
Question	105
3. Inter-Institutional Transfers	106
Joseph Vitek, etc., et al. v. Larry D. Jones	106
Questions	113
4. Right to Counsel	113
a. Lessard v. Schmidt	113

b. In the Matter of the Mental Health of K.G.F.	113
5. The Right to Expert Assistance in Civil Cases	121
In re Joseph Gannon	121
Questions	122
B. Institutional Rights	123
1. The Right to Treatment	123
a. Wyatt v. Stickney (1971)	123
b. Wyatt v. Stickney (1972)	126
Questions	137
c. Duane Youngberg v. Nicholas Romeo	139
Questions	148
Note	149
2. The Right to Refuse Treatment	149
a. Mark J. Mills et al. v. Rubie Rogers et al.	149
b. John E. Rennie v. Ann Klein (Rennie IV)	152
Questions	158
c. Mark Rivers v. Stephen Katz	159
Questions	163
d. Washington v. Walter Harper	164
e. David Riggins v. Nevada	180
Questions	191
f. Charles Sell v. United States	191
Questions	199
C. Post-Institutional Rights	199
1. William Dixon v. Caspar Weinberger	199
2. Discrimination against Persons with Mental Disabilities	203
a. City of Cleburne, Texas v. Cleburne Living Center	203
Questions	213
b. The Americans with Disabilities Act	214
c. Tommy Olmstead v. L.C., by Jonathan Zimring	214
3. Access to Justice	222
a. Tennessee v. George Lane	222
Questions	227
<b>Chapter 3 Overview of International Human Rights Law</b>	231
I. Introduction	231
A. Human Rights before World War II	231
B. David Weissbrodt, <i>An Introduction to the Sources of International Law</i>	231
Questions	232
II. Human Rights in the Modern Era	233
A. Introduction	233
1. Micheline R. Ishay, <i>History of Human Rights</i>	233
Questions	234
Note	234
B. Conceptual Dichotomies	235
1. Universalism vs. Cultural Relativism	235



a.	Mahmood Monshipouri, <i>Promoting Universal Human Rights: Dilemmas of Integrating Developing Countries</i>	235
b.	Rosalyn Higgins, <i>Problems and Process: International Law and How We Use It</i>	237
2.	Hard vs. Soft Law	237
a.	Jose Alvarez, <i>The New Dispute Settlers: (Half) Truths and Consequences</i>	237
	Questions	239
3.	Peremptory Norms and Derogable vs. Non-Derogable Rights	239
a.	Sara Stapleton, <i>Ensuring a Fair Trial in the International Criminal Court: Statutory Interpretation and the Impermissibility of Derogation</i>	239
	Questions	240
4.	Negative vs. Positive Rights	240
a.	Henry J. Steiner & Philip Alston, <i>International Human Rights in Context: Law, Politics, and Morality</i>	240
	Questions	241
5.	Civil and Political Rights vs. Economic, Social, and Cultural Rights	241
a.	Javaid Rehman, <i>International Human Rights Law: A Practical Approach</i>	242
	Questions	242
III.	The U.N. and Its Mechanisms for Protecting Human Rights	242
A.	The Work of U.N. Bodies	242
	Questions	243
B.	Instruments	244
1.	The Charter of the United Nations	244
2.	The Universal Declaration of Human Rights	244
3.	The International Covenants	245
4.	The International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (ICCPR)	246
5.	First Optional Protocol to the ICCPR	247
6.	International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (ICESCR)	247
7.	Specialized Conventions	248
	Questions	248
IV.	Regional Human Rights Courts and Commissions	249
A.	Introduction	249
1.	Gabriel M. Wilner, <i>Reflections on Regional Human Rights Law</i>	249
B.	The European System	250
1.	Council of Europe, Registrar of the Eur. Ct. of Human Rights	250
2.	Council of Europe, <i>What Is the European Social Charter?</i>	254
3.	Council of Europe, European Committee for the Prevention of Torture and Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment (CPT)	256
C.	The Inter-American System	257

1.	W. Michael Reisman, <i>Practical Matters for Consideration in the Establishment of a Regional Human Rights Mechanism: Lessons from the Inter-American Experience</i>	257
2.	Christina Cerna, <i>International Law and the Protection of Human Rights in the Inter-American System</i>	260
D.	The African System	265
1.	Gabriel M. Wilner, <i>Reflections on Regional Human Rights Law</i>	265
2.	Christof Heyns, <i>The African Regional Human Rights System: The African Charter</i>	265
	Note	273
E.	Asia	274
1.	Seth R. Harris, <i>Asian Human Rights: Forming a Regional Covenant</i>	274
F.	Conclusion	279
1.	Melissa Robbins, <i>Powerful States, Customary Law and the Erosion of Human Rights Through Regional Enforcement</i>	279
	Questions	281
<b>Chapter 4</b>	<b>On Sanism and Pretextuality</b>	283
I.	Some Other Jurisprudential Considerations: Heuristics and “Ordinary Common Sense” (OCS)	283
A.	Heuristics	283
B.	“Ordinary Common Sense” (OCS)	289
II.	On Sanism	290
A.	Introduction	290
B.	Sanist Myths	293
	Michael L. Perlin, “ <i>Where the Winds Hit Heavy on the Borderline</i> ”: <i>Mental Disability Law, Theory and Practice, “Us” and “Them”</i>	293
C.	Sanist Judges	296
	Michael L. Perlin, “ <i>Half-Wracked Prejudice Leaped Forth</i> ”: <i>Sanism, Pretextuality, and Why and How Mental Disability Law Developed as It Did</i>	296
D.	Sanism and Legal Representation	298
	Michael L. Perlin, “ <i>You Have Discussed Lepers and Crooks</i> ”: <i>Sanism in Clinical Teaching</i>	298
1.	Distrust of the Client	299
2.	Trivialization of the Client’s Complaints	300
3.	Effects on the Lawyer-Client Relationship	301
E.	Role of Counsel	302
F.	Counsel’s Role	302
1.	Rights Are Not Self-Executing	303
2.	The Myth of Adequate Counsel	304
3.	Counsel’s Educative Function	305
4.	Implementation of Collateral Rights	306
5.	Other Moral, Social and Political Issues	306
III.	On Pretextuality	307

A. Introduction	307
B. Pretextuality and Morality	310
Michael L. Perlin, <i>Pretexts and Mental Disability Law:</i>	
<i>The Case of Competency</i>	310
Questions	316
<b>Chapter 5 Mental Disability Law in a Socio-Political Context:</b>	
<b>The Role of Institutional Psychiatry in the Suppression of</b>	
<b>Political Dissent</b>	319
I. Overview	319
A. George Alexander, <i>International Human Rights</i>	
<i>Protection against Political Abuses</i>	319
Note	320
B. Michel Foucault, <i>Madness and Civilization:</i>	
<i>A History of Insanity in the Age of Reason</i>	320
II. In the USSR	323
A. Sidney Bloch & Peter Reddaway, <i>Psychiatrists and</i>	
<i>Dissenters in the Soviet Union</i>	323
B. Richard J. Bonnie & Svetlana v. Polubinskaya,	
<i>Unraveling Soviet Psychiatry</i>	329
Note	337
III. In China	337
A. Robin Munro, <i>Judicial Psychiatry in China and Its Political Abuses</i>	337
IV. In the USSR & China	345
A. Richard Bonnie, <i>Political Abuse of Psychiatry in the</i>	
<i>Soviet Union and in China: Complexities and Controversies</i>	345
V. In Eastern Europe	349
A. Sana Loue, <i>The Involuntary Civil Commitment of Mentally Ill</i>	
<i>Persons in the United States and Romania: A Comparative Analysis</i>	349
B. In Bulgaria	351
1. Krassimir Kanev, <i>State, Human Rights, and Mental</i>	
<i>Health in Bulgaria</i>	351
VI. Following the Revelations	352
A. Angelika C. Moncada, <i>Involuntary Commitment and the</i>	
<i>Use of Seclusion and Restraint in Uruguay:</i>	
<i>A Comparison with the United Nations Principles for the</i>	
<i>Protection of Persons with Mental Illness</i>	352
B. Lawrence Gostin & Lance Gable, <i>The Human Rights of</i>	
<i>Persons with Mental Disabilities: A Global Perspective on the</i>	
<i>Application of Human Rights Principles to Mental Health</i>	353
Questions	353
<b>Chapter 6 Mental Disability Law in an International</b>	
<b>Human Rights Context</b>	355
A. Human Rights Issues Faced by Persons with Mental Disabilities	355
1. Introduction	355
a. Lawrence Gostin and Lance Gable, <i>The Human Rights of</i>	
<i>Persons with Mental Disabilities: A Global Perspective on the</i>	
<i>Application of Human Rights Principles to Mental Health</i>	355
2. Available Protections	356

B. The Declaration on the Rights of Mentally Retarded Persons (MR Declaration)	359
C. Declaration on the Rights of Disabled Persons	360
D. World Programme of Action Concerning Disabled Persons Questions	360 361
E. The U.N. Principles for the Protection of Persons with Mental Illness and the Improvement of Mental Health Care (MI Principles)	361
1. Eric Rosenthal & Leonard S. Rubenstein, <i>International Human Rights Advocacy under the Principles for the Protection of Persons with Mental Illness</i>	361
F. Standard Rules on the Equalization of Opportunities for Persons with Disabilities (Standard Rules)	370
1. Lawrence Gostin & Lance Gable, <i>The Human Rights of Persons with Mental Disabilities: A Global Perspective on the Application of Human Rights Principles to Mental Health Questions</i>	371 372
G. ICESCR General Comments 5 and 14	373
1. Lawrence Gostin & Lance Gable, <i>The Human Rights of Persons with Mental Disabilities: A Global Perspective on the Application of Human Rights Principles to Mental Health Questions</i>	373 376
H. The Intersection of Protections	376
1. Eric Rosenthal & Clarence Sundram, <i>International Human Rights in Mental Health Legislation</i>	376
I. Special Rapporteur on Health: Report on Mental Disability Questions	398 398
J. Proposed Disability Convention: U.N. Resolutions 2000/51 and 56/168	399
1. Summary of the Work of the Ad Hoc Committee	399
K. Conclusion	401
1. Melinda Jones, <i>Can International Law Improve Mental Health? Some Thoughts on the Proposed Convention on the Rights of People with Disabilities</i>	401
2. Enforcement of International Human Rights of Persons with Mental Disabilities	401
a. Excerpts from Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights (OHCHR) Questions	401 402
3. Advocacy and Education	403
a. Advocacy and Other Activities: The U.N. Organizations	403
(1) Excerpt taken from <a href="http://www.un.org/esa/socdev/enable/dismsre3.htm#A">http://www.un.org/esa/socdev/enable/dismsre3.htm#A</a>	404
b. The WHO Resource Book on Mental Health, Human Rights, and Legislation	405
(1) World Health Organization, WHO Resource Book on Mental Health, Human Rights and Legislation	405
c. The Work of NGOs	414

(1) Hurst Hannum, <i>Implementing Human Rights: An Overview of NGO Strategies and Available Procedures</i>	415
Note	417
Questions	417
<b>Chapter 7 Comparative Mental Disability Law</b>	419
A. Introduction	419
1. Larry Gostin, <i>Human Rights of Persons with Mental Disabilities: The European Convention of Human Rights</i>	419
B. Europe As a Case Example	422
Note	422
1. The Scholarly Literature	423
a. Lawrence O. Gostin & Lance Gable, <i>The Human Rights of Persons with Mental Disabilities: A Global Perspective on the Application of Human Rights Principles to Mental Health</i>	423
b. David Kingdon et al, <i>Protecting the Human Rights of People with Mental Disorder: New Recommendations Emerging from the Council of Europe</i>	427
c. David Hewitt, <i>Do Human Rights Impact on Mental Health Law?</i>	432
d. Gerard Quinn, <i>Civil Commitment and the Right to Treatment under the European Convention on Human Rights</i>	434
e. Bruce J. Winick, <i>Therapeutic Jurisprudence and the Treatment of People with Mental Illness in Eastern Europe: Construing International Human Rights Law</i>	440
Note	446
f. Nicola Ferencz & James McGuire, <i>Mental Health Review Tribunals in the UK: Applying a Therapeutic Jurisprudence Perspective</i>	446
Note	451
2. The Case Law	451
a. Introduction to the European Convention Cases	451
b. Civil Commitment and Release	455
(1) Procedural Commitment Issues	455
(a) Necessity for Procedures; Adherence to Procedures	455
1) Winterwerp v. Netherlands	455
2) Wassink v. Netherlands	469
3) Sean Croke v. Ireland	475
4) HL v. UK	487
(b) Right to Hearing	499
1) Van der Leer v. Netherlands	499
2) Rakevich v. Russia	503
3) R (MH) v. (1) Secretary of State for Health (2) Mental Health Review Tribunal (Court of Appeal)	510
4) R (MH) v. (1) Secretary of State for Health (2) Mental Health Review Tribunal (House of Lords)	518
(c) Jurisdictional Limits	522
1) Aerts v. Belgium	522
2) R (A) v. Harrow Crown Court	527
(d) Time Limits	529

1) E v. Norway	529
2) R (RA) v. Home Secretary	539
(e) Burden of Proof	542
1) R (H) v. Mental Health Review Tribunal, North and East London Region	542
(f) Transfer Issues	545
1) R (LH) v. (1) Mental Health Review Tribunal (2) Secretary of State for Health	545
(g) Right to Appeal; habeas corpus	547
1) X v. UK	547
2) Varbanov v. Bulgaria	560
3) Vodenicarov v. Slovakia	564
(2) Substantive Commitment Issues	567
(a) Anderson, Reid and Doherty v. Scottish Ministers and Advocate General for Scotland	567
(b) Reid v. UK	582
(3) Questions of Discharge	588
(a) Johnson v. UK	588
(b) R (H) v. Ashworth Hospital Authority	595
(c) R (IH) v. (1) Home Secretary (2) Secretary of State for Health	601
(d) R (Home Secretary) v. Mental Health Review Tribunal	609
(e) R (SC) v. (1) Mental Health Review Tribunal (2) Secretary of State for Health (3) Home Secretary	610
(4) Review of Detention	615
(a) Luberti v. Italy	615
(b) W v. Sweden	621
(c) R (K) v. Camden and Islington Health Authority	623
(d) R (T) v. Mental Health Review Tribunal	630
(e) Rutten v. Netherlands	631
(f) R (Home Secretary) v. Mental Health Review Tribunal	636
(g) R (Von B) v. (1) East London and the City Mental Health NHS Trust and (2) Snazell	639
(h) Kolanis v. UK	644
(i) Access to Counsel	649
1) Megyeri v. Germany	649
2) Aerts v. Belgium	652
3) DN v. Switzerland	652
4) R (S) v. Mental Health Review Tribunal	657
c. Institutional Care Issues	659
(1) Security; Institutional Conditions	659
(a) Ashingdane v. UK	659
(b) Herczegfalvy v. Austria	672
(2) Right to Refuse Treatment	685
(a) Petition of WM	685
(b) R (Munjaz) v. Mersey Care NHS Trust; R (S) v. Airedale NHS Trust	694
(c) R (PS) v. (1) Dr G (RMO) (2) Dr W (SOAD)	701

(d) R (Wilkinson) v. (1) The RMO, Broadmoor Hospital (2) The SOAD, Mental Health Act Commission (3) Secretary of State for Health	712
d. Other Institutional Rights	722
(1) Herczegfalvy v. Austria	722
(2) Valle v. Finland	722
(3) R (N) v. Ashworth Hospital and Secretary of State for Health	723
(4) R (RH) v. Ashworth Hospital Authority	724
(5) R (E) v. Ashworth Hospital Authority	737
(6) Nowicka v. Poland	741
e. Institutional Resources	745
(1) R (F) v. (1) Oxfordshire Mental Healthcare NHS Trust (2) Oxfordshire NHS Health Authority	745
(2) R (KB and Others) v. Mental Health Review Tribunal	747
f. Closure of Facilities	755
(1) R (C) v. Lincolnshire Health Authority	755
(2) R (C and Others) v. Brent, Kensington and Chelsea and Westminster Health NHS Trust	756
(3) R (H and another) v. The Leonard Cheshire Foundation	758
g. Right to Bring Civil Action	760
h. Forensic Cases	760
(1) Kudla v. Poland	760
(2) Benjamin and Wilson v. UK	765
(3) R (M) v. Nottinghamshire Health Care NHS Trust, 2. Home Secretary, 3. Governor HMP Full Sutton	768
(4) R (IR) v. (1) Dr G Shetty (2) Home Secretary	770
(5) R (IR) v. (1) Dr G Shetty (2) Home Secretary (No 2)	780
i. Other Issues	782
(1) Bensaid v. UK	782
C. Latin America As a Case Example	789
Note	789
1. On the Inter-American System	789
Christina Cerna, <i>The Inter-American System for the Protection of Human Rights</i>	789
Note	792
2. Disability Law Policies	793
Christian Courtis, <i>Disability Rights in Latin America and International Cooperation</i>	793
3. On the Need for Legislative Reform	802
Angelika C. Moncada, <i>Involuntary Commitment and the Use of Seclusion and Restraint in Uruguay: A Comparison with the United Nations Principles for the Protection of Persons with Mental Illness</i>	802
Note	803
4. More Recent Developments	803
Alison A. Hillman, <i>Protecting Mental Disability Rights: A Success Story in the Inter-American Human Rights System</i>	803
5. The Role of Litigation	809
In the Matter of Victor Rosario Congo	809

D. Asia as a Case Example	823
Note	823
1. Political Background	823
2. China	823
a. Robin Munro, <i>Judicial Psychiatry in China and Its Political Abuses</i>	823
b. Randall Peerenboom, <i>Assessing Human Rights in China: Why the Double Standard?</i>	827
Note	827
3. Japan	828
a. Arlene S. Kanter, R. Blake Chisam & Christopher Nugent, <i>The Right to Asylum and Need for Legal Representation of People with Mental Disabilities in Immigration Proceedings</i>	828
b. Pamela Schwartz Cohen, <i>Psychiatric Commitment in Japan: International Concern and Domestic Reform</i>	828
Note	838
4. India	838
E. Africa as a Case Example	838
Mashood A. Baderin, <i>Recent Developments in the African Regional Human Rights System</i>	838
Note	841
<b>Chapter 8 Universal Factors</b>	843
A. Introduction	843
B. An Overview	844
1. Bruce Winick, <i>Therapeutic Jurisprudence and the Treatment of People with Mental Illness in Eastern Europe: Construing International Human Rights Law</i>	844
2. Press Release: <i>Shaky Mental Health Rules Fuel Abuse of Patients' Rights: WHO</i>	846
3. Jennifer Fischer, <i>A Comparative Look at the Right-to-Refuse Treatment for Involuntarily Hospitalized Persons with a Mental Illness</i>	846
C. The Core Factors	849
1. Lack of Comprehensive Legislation to Govern the Commitment and Treatment of Persons with Mental Disabilities, and Failure to Adhere to Legislative Mandates	849
a. Joanna Rymaszewska & Stanislaw Dabrowski, <i>Rules and Regulations for Involuntary Placement or Treatment of Mentally Ill Persons—Results from a Structured Survey Instrument in 12 European Countries, and Results from a Quality Assurance Project on Involuntary Placement/Treatment in Poland</i>	849
b. Amnesty International, <i>Romania: Memorandum to the Government Concerning Inpatient Psychiatric Treatment</i>	849
Note	855
c. Mental Disability Advocacy Center, <i>Mental Health Law of the Kyrgyz Republic and Its Implementation</i> (2004) (report prepared	



by Dr. Arman Vardanyan, Deborah A. Dorfman and Craig Awmiller)	855
d. Jose Miguel Caldas de Almeida & Javier Vasquez, <i>The Pan-American Health Organization's (PAHO) Advocacy Strategies for the Promotion and Protection of the Human Rights of Persons with Mental Disabilities and Their Family Members</i> (2002)	856
e. Angelika C. Moncada, <i>Involuntary Commitment and the Use of Seclusion and Restraint in Uruguay: A Comparison with the United Nations Principles for the Protection of Persons with Mental Illness</i>	857
f. Oliver Lewis, "Mental Disability Law in Central and Eastern Europe: Paper, Practice, Promise"	857
Note	858
2. Lack of Independent Counsel and Lack of Consistent Judicial Review Mechanisms Made Available to Persons Facing Commitment and Those Institutionalized	859
a. Mental Disability Advocacy Center, <i>Mental Health Law of the Kyrgyz Republic and Its Implementation</i> (2004) (report prepared by Dr. Arman Vardanyan, Deborah A. Dorfman and Craig Awmiller)	859
b. Oliver Lewis, <i>Mental Disability Law in Central and Eastern Europe: Paper, Practice, Promise</i>	862
Note	863
c. Larry Gostin, <i>Human Rights in Mental Health: A Proposal for Five International Standards Based upon the Japanese Experience</i>	864
d. Oliver Lewis, <i>Protecting the Rights of People with Mental Disabilities: The European Convention on Human Rights Questions</i>	865 866
3. A Failure to Provide Humane Care to Institutionalized Persons	867
a. Mental Disability Advocacy Center: PRESS RELEASE	867
b. Mental Disability Rights International (MDRI)	868
c. Mental Disability Rights International, <i>Human Rights and Mental Health: Mexico</i> (2000)	868
d. Oliver Lewis, <i>Mental Disability Law in Central and Eastern Europe: Paper, Practice, Promise</i>	870
Questions and Notes	871
4. Lack of Coherent and Integrated Community Programs As an Alternative to Institutional Care	872
a. Mental Disability Rights International (MDRI)	872
b. Mental Disability Advocacy Center, <i>Mental Health Law of the Kyrgyz Republic and Its Implementation</i> (report prepared by Dr. Arman Vardanyan, Deborah A. Dorfman and Craig Awmiller)	872
c. Angelika C. Moncada, <i>Involuntary Commitment and the Use of Seclusion and Restraint in Uruguay: A Comparison with the United Nations Principles for the Protection of Persons with Mental Illness</i>	872

d. Oliver Lewis, <i>Mental Disability Law in Central and Eastern Europe: Paper, Practice, Promise</i>	873
e. Eric Rosenthal & Eva Szeli, <i>Not on the Agenda: Human Rights of People with Mental Disabilities in Kosovo</i>	874
f. Eric Rosenthal and Arlene S. Kanter, <i>The Right to Community Integration: Protections under United States and International Law</i>	875
5. Failure to Provide Humane Services to Forensic Patients	881
a. Press Release	881
b. Harvey Weinstein, Ira Burnim and Robert Okin, <i>Protecting the Mentally Disabled</i>	882
c. Amnesty International, Romania: <i>Memorandum to the Government Concerning Inpatient Psychiatric Treatment</i>	883
d. Mental Disability Advocacy Center, <i>Mental Health Law of the Kyrgyz Republic and Its Implementation (2004)</i> (report prepared by Dr. Arman Vardanyan, Deborah A. Dorfman and Craig Awmiller)	884
e. Oliver Lewis, <i>Mental Disability Law in Central and Eastern Europe: Paper, Practice, Promise</i>	885
Questions	885
<b>Chapter 9 Trends in Comparative Mental Health Legislation</b>	887
A. Introduction	887
B. WHO Comparative Mental Health Legislation Research	889
Note	890
C. Criticism of the Manual	891
D. The Role of International Human Rights in Domestic Mental Health Legislation	894
Note	897
E. Compulsory Community Treatment-Outpatient Commitment	898
1. Lawrence O. Gostin & Lance Gable, <i>The Human Rights of Persons with Mental Disabilities: A Global Perspective on the Application of Human Rights Principles to Mental Health</i>	898
2. Arlene Kanter & Uri Aviram, <i>Israel's Involuntary Outpatient Commitment Law: Lessons from the American Experience</i>	899
Note	915
<b>Chapter 10 A Global Perspective on Mental Disability Rights</b>	917
A. Introduction	917
B. Arlene Kanter, <i>The Globalization of Disability Rights Law</i>	918
C. Lee Ann Bassar, <i>The Globalization of Disability Rights Law: The Impact in Australia</i>	939
Note	952
D. Recent U.N. Developments	952
E. Lawrence Gostin & Lance Gable, <i>The Human Rights of Persons with Mental Disabilities: A Global Perspective on the Application of Human Rights Principles to Mental Health</i>	952
Note	955

<b>Chapter 11 Other Disability Rights Issues</b>	957
A. Specialized Populations	957
1. Women	957
a. Women in General	957
(1) Louis Henkin et al. (eds.), <i>Human Rights</i>	957
b. Women with Disabilities Specifically	960
(1) Eva Szeli and Dea Pallaska, <i>Violence against Women with Mental Disabilities: The Invisible Victims in CEE/NIS Countries</i>	960
2. Children	962
a. Generally	962
b. Alison Brysk, <i>Human Rights and Private Wrongs</i>	962
c. Children with Mental Disabilities Specifically	964
(1) United Nations Press Release SG/SM/8919 OBV/379	964
Questions	964
Note	965
B. Selected Mental Disability Rights Issues: Death Penalty, Asylum and Sterilization	965
1. Death Penalty	965
a. Harold Hongju Koh, <i>Different but Equal, The Human Rights of Persons with Intellectual Disabilities</i>	965
Questions and Problems	972
2. Asylum for People with Disabilities	972
a. Introduction	972
(1) Arlene Kanter & Kristin Dadey, <i>The Right to Asylum for People with Disabilities</i>	973
(2) More Recent Developments	990
Victoria Tchoukhrova, Dmitri Tchoukhrova, and Evgueni Tchoukhrova v. Alberto R. Gonzales	990
Question	999
Note	999
3. Sterilization	999
a. Buck v. Bell	999
b. In re Eve	1001
c. Other Developments: India and the U.S.	1008
4. Some Concluding Thoughts	1010
Stanley S. Herr, <i>The International Significance of Disability Rights</i>	1010
Index	1013



# Table of Cases

---

- R (A) v. Harrow Crown Court, 527  
R (RA) v. Home Secretary, 339  
Frank O' Neal Addington v. State of Texas, 39  
Aerts v. Belgium, 432, 453, 522, 578, 764  
Anderson, Reid and Doherty v. Scottish Ministers and Advocate General for Scotland, 567  
Ashingdane v. UK, 432, 454, 496, 533, 572, 576, 580, 659, 773  
R (KB and Others) v. Mental Health Review Tribunal, 747  
Benjamin and Wilson v. UK, 765  
Bensaid v. UK, 775, 782  
Buck v. Bell, 999, 1008  
R (C) v. Lincolnshire Health Authority, 755  
R (SC) v. (1) Mental Health Review Tribunal (2) Secretary of State for Health (3) Home Secretary, 610  
R (C and Others) v. Brent, Kensington and Chelsea and Westminster Health NHS Trust, 756  
City of Cleburne, Texas v. Cleburne Living Center, 203  
Sean Croke v. Ireland, 475  
William Dixon v. Caspar Weinberger, 199  
E v. Norway, 433, 452, 496, 529  
R (E) v. Ashworth Hospital Authority 737  
In re Eve, 1000, 1001  
Terry Foucha v. Louisiana, 87  
R (F) v. (1) Oxfordshire Mental Healthcare NHS Trust (2) Oxfordshire NHS Health Authority, 745  
In re Joseph Gannon, 121  
R (H) v. Ashworth Hospital Authority, 595  
R (H) v. Mental Health Review Tribunal, North and East London Region, 542  
R (IH) v. (1) Home Secretary (2) Secretary of State for Health, 601  
R (LH) v. (1) Mental Health Review Tribunal (2) Secretary of State for Health, 545  
R (MH) v. (1) Secretary of State for Health (2) Mental Health Review Tribunal (Court of Appeal), 510  
R (MH) v. (1) Secretary of State for Health (2) Mental Health Review Tribunal (House of Lords), 518  
R (RH) v. Ashworth Hospital Authority, 724  
R (H and another) v. The Leonard Cheshire Foundation, 758  
Leonard Heller v. Samuel Doe, by His Mother and Next Friend, Mary Doe, 65  
Herczegfalvy v. Austria, 394, 432, 454, 577, 672, 703, 720, 739, 815  
R (Home Secretary) v. Mental Health Review Tribunal, 609  
Theon Jackson v. State of Indiana, 13  
Johnson v. UK, 433, 452, 493, 577–578, 585, 588, 603, 626, 641, 646, 658  
Michael Jones v. United States, 79  
R (K) v. Camden and Islington Health Authority, 623  
In the Matter of the Mental Health of K.G.F., 113, 302  
Kolanis v. UK, 452, 629, 644  
Kudla v. Poland, 760  
HL v. UK, 453, 487, 514  
Alberta Lessard et al. v. Wilbur Schmidt et al., 28  
Luberti v. Italy, 426, 493, 576, 591, 615, 627  
R (M) v. Nottinghamshire Health Care NHS Trust, 2. Home Secretary, 3. Governor HMP Full Sutton, 768  
Megyeri v. Germany, 453, 486, 649  
Mark J. Mills et al. v. Rubie Rogers et al., 149  
R (Munjaz) v. Mersey Care NHS Trust, 694  
R (S) v. Airedale NHS Trust, 694  
R (N) v. Ashworth Hospital and Secretary of State for Health 723  
DN v. Switzerland, 453, 652, 767  
Nowicka v. Poland, 454, 741  
J.B. O'Connor v. Kenneth Donaldson, 22

- Tommy Olmstead v. L.C., by Jonathan Zimring, 214
- James Parham v. J.R. et al., 45
- R (IR) v. (1) Dr G Shetty (2) Home Secretary, 770
- R (IR) v. (1) Dr G Shetty (2) Home Secretary (No 2), 780
- Rakevich v. Russia, 503, 519
- Reid v. UK, 453, 493, 496, 582
- John E. Rennie v. Ann Klein (Rennie IV), 152
- David Riggins v. Nevada, 180
- Mark Rivers v. Stephen Katz, 159
- Rutten v. Netherlands, 587, 631
- R (S) v. Mental Health Review Tribunal, 657
- R (PS) v. (1) Dr G (RMO) (2) Dr W (SOAD), 701
- Charles Sell v. United States, 191
- R (T) v. Mental Health Review Tribunal, 630
- Tennessee v. George Lane, 222
- Valle v. Finland, 722
- Van der Leer v. Netherlands, 451, 499, 508, 579, 680, 887–888
- Varbanov v. Bulgaria, 560, 848, 858
- Joseph Vitek, etc., et al. v. Larry D. Jones, 106
- Vodenicarov v. Slovakia, 564
- R (Von B) v. (1) East London and the City Mental Health NHS Trust and (2) Snazell, 639
- W v. Sweden, 433, 621
- Washington v. Walter Harper, 164
- Wassink v. Netherlands, 469, 486, 494, 508, 591, 650, 680, 752
- R (Wilkinson) v. (1) The RMO, Broadmoor Hospital (2) The SOAD, Mental Health Act Commission (3) Secretary of State for Health, 712
- Winterwerp v. Netherlands, 353, 426, 433, 442, 451, 455, 484–485, 507, 524, 544, 574, 576, 589, 598, 614, 651, 680, 687, 887
- Wyatt v. Stickney, 30, 56, 123, 126, 128, 138, 149, 301, 303, 312, 437, 969
- X v. UK, 432, 452, 485, 496–497, 501, 521, 524–525, 533–534, 547, 617, 619, 624, 626, 634, 641, 650, 653, 656, 661, 665
- Duane Youngberg v. Nicholas Romeo, 139
- Marlus C. Zinermon, et al. v. Darrell E. Burch, 58

# Acknowledgments

---

I wish to thank my research assistants Jackie Halpern, Danny Gershburg, and Carra Greenberg for their impeccable work, their willingness to always help, their time, and their good humor, and my faculty assistant Joeleen Grant, for her herculean work (far beyond the call-of-duty) in helping produce the final draft of this manuscript. I also wish to thank New York Law School Dean Richard Matasar and Associate Dean Stephen Ellmann for their support and encouragement, and for granting me the sabbatical that allowed me to do the research for this work. (MLP)

I wish to thank Wendy Scott, Associate Director of Faculty Services at the Barclay Law Library, Syracuse University College of Law for her research assistance, my wonderful and thorough student research assistants, Nevhiz Calik (SUCOL '05), Julie Morse (SUCOL '05), Tarini Arogyaswamy (SUCOL '06), and Eric Rosenthal, Executive Director of Mental Disability Rights International for his work in bringing our attention to these issues. (ASK)

I am especially grateful to my current research assistant Gonzaga third year law student Anne McLaughlin for her enthusiasm about the subject matter, her hard work, and her diligent attention to detail. I appreciate the in-depth background research provided by 2005 Gonzaga graduate and attorney Delian Deltchev who worked cheerfully with only limited guidance and oversight in the initial phases of this project. Finally, I am indebted to my faculty assistant Robbie McMillian, for her nonpareil ability to handle everything with grace. (MPT)

My thanks to Sean Kilpatrick for his research assistance, and to Robbie McMillian for her extensive work in creating a supplement to this casebook which is certain to be an invaluable resource for students and mental disability rights advocates around the world. My appreciation to Rod Wellens, Eric Rosenthal, and Michael Perlin, for their mentorship over the years, and Mary Pat Treuthart for her support and encouragement during this project. And finally, my deepest gratitude to Moylan Ryan, for simply being himself. (ES)

