Human Rights Module

# Human Rights Module

On Crimes Against Humanity, Genocide, Other Crimes Against Human Rights, and War Crimes

### SECOND EDITION

revised extracts from

Paust, Bassiouni, Scharf, Gurulé, Sadat, Zagaris International Criminal Law (3 ed. 2007) *forthcoming* 

> CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS Durham, North Carolina

Copyright © 2006 Jordan J. Paust, M. Cherif Bassiouni, Michael Scharf, Jimmy Gurulé, Leila Sadat, Bruce Zagaris All Rights Reserved

> ISBN 1-59460-285-9 LCCN 2006929439

Carolina Academic Press 700 Kent Street Durham, NC 27701 Telephone (919) 489-7486 Fax (919) 493-5668 www.cap-press.com

Printed in the United States of America

# Contents

## Preface

### PART ONE CASES AND MATERIALS

Chapter 1	Crimes Against Humanity	3
Fictional	Introductory Problem	3
	Burundi v. Bagosora	3
Section 1	Nuremberg and Earlier	4
	Report of Justice Robert H. Jackson to the President of the	
	United States	6
	International Military Tribunal at Nuremberg, Indictment Number 1	6
	Judgment of the International Military Tribunal at Nuremberg	8
	Notes	8
	Control Council Law No. 10, art. II(1)(c)	9
	Telford Taylor, Final Report to the Secretary of the Army on the	
	Nuernberg War Crimes Trials	9
	United States v. Altstoetter, et al. ("The Justice Case")	11
	Notes and Questions	12
Section 2	Eichmann Trial (Israel)	15
	The Attorney General of the Government of Israel v. Adolf, the Son of K	Carl
	Adolf Eichmann	15
	Attorney General of Israel v. Eichmann	16
	Notes and Questions	20
Section 3	Barbie, Touvier and Papon Trials (France)	20
	Matter of Barbie	20
	Notes and Questions	27
	Matter of Touvier	28
	Leila Sadat Wexler, The Interpretation of the Nuremberg Principles	
	by the French Court of Cassation: From Touvier to Barbie and	
	Back Again	28
	Notes and Questions	34
Section 4	Finta and Mugesera Cases (Canada)	35
	R. v. Imre Finta	35

CONTENTS

Questions	42
Mugesera v. Canada	42
Section 5 Newer International Prosecutions	45
A. The International Criminal Tribunals for the Former Yugoslavia and	1
Rwanda	45
J. Paust, Threats to Accountability After Nuremberg: Crimes Against	
Humanity, Leader Responsibility and National Fora	46
Notes and Questions	49
The Prosecutor v. Akayesu	50
The Prosecutor v. Rutaganda	51
The Prosecutor v. Musema	53
Questions	55
The Prosecutor v. Dusko Tadic,	58
B. The Rome Statute for the International Criminal Court	
and its Application	69
Notes and Questions	70
Chapter 2 Genocide	73
Section 1 The Convention	73
<i>Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of</i>	
the Crime of Genocide	73
Questions	74
A. Prosecutions Before the International Criminal Tribunal for Rwand	
The Prosecutor v. Rutaganda	76
The Prosecutor v. Musema	78
Questions	80
B. Prosecutions Before the International Criminal Tribunal	
for Former Yugoslavia	83
Notes and Questions	86
Section 2 Application in Bangladesh	86
Paust & Blaustein, War Crimes Jurisdiction and Due Process: The	
Bangladesh Experience	86
Notes	87
Section 3 Genocide and Politicide	88
J. Paust, Aggression Against Authority: The Crime of Oppression, Pa	oliticide
and Other Crimes Against Human Rights	88
H. Hannum, International Law and Cambodian Genocide: The Sou	nds of
Silence	89
Questions	92
Section 4 U.S. Implementation	93
Senate Committee on Foreign Relations, International Convention of	n the
Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide	93
Questions	97
1986 Lugar/Helms/Hatch Provisos as Approved by the Foreign Relati	ons
Committee	98
Extract: Vol. XII-7 UNA/USA Washington Weekly Report 1-3	99
U.S. Legislation	100
U.N. Human Rights Commission, Res. 1987/25	102
Notes and Questions	102

vii

Paust, Congress and Genocide	102
Questions	105
Section 5 Additional International Tribunal Prosecutions	106
The Prosecutor v. Jean-Paul Akayesu	106
Notes	112
Chapter 3 Human Rights	113
Section 1 General Human Rights	113
A. The United Nations Charter	113
B. The International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights	114
C. The American Declaration and O.A.S. Charter	116
Section 2 Torture and Other Inhumane Acts	117
Convention Against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman	
or Degrading Treatment or Punishment	117
Questions	117
Section 3 Race Discrimination	124
A. General Discrimination	124
International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms	
of Racial Discrimination	124
Question	124
B. Apartheid	125
International Convention on the Suppression and Punishment	
Crime of "Apartheid", done in New York, Nov. 30, 1973,	01 010
1015 U.N.T.S. 243	125
Notes and Questions	125
Section 4 Hostage-Taking	125
International Convention Against the Taking of Hostages	125
Questions	125
Security Council Resolution Condemning Hostage-Taking	125
Section 5 Disappearances	120
Inter-American Convention on the Forced Disappearance of Perso	
Questions	127
-	
Chapter 4 War Crimes	129
Introductory Note	129
Introductory Problem	130
Sources of International Humanitarian Law	132
Section 1 Applicability	133
U.S. Army Field Manual 27-10, The Law of Land Warfare	133
J. Pictet (ed.), IV Commentary, Geneva Convention Relative to the	he Protec -
tion of Civilian Persons in Time of War	135
Paust & Blaustein, War Crimes Jurisdiction and Due Process: Th	е
Bangladesh Experience	137
Protocol Additional to the Geneva Conventions of 12 August 1	949, and
relating to the protection of victims of international armed	d conflicts
(Protocol I) 8 June 1977	139
Protocol Additional to the Geneva Conventions of 12 August 1	949, and
relating to the protection of victims of non-international a	ırmed con-
flicts (Protocol II), 8 June 1977	139
Notes and Questions	139

CONTENTS

The Geneva Protocols	149
Other Aspects of Internal Versus International Armed Conflicts	151
Section 2 Types of War Crimes	153
A. General	153
U.S. Dep't of Army Field Manual 27-10, The Law of Land Warfare	153
Notes and Questions	154
The Prosecutor v. Dusko Tadic, Decision on the Defence Motion for In	ter -
locutory Appeal on Jurisdiction	156
Notes and Questions	162
B. Conduct of Hostilities and Other Protections	167
U.S. Dep't of Army FM 27-10, The Law of Land Warfare	167
The Declaration of St. Petersburg	168
Hague Declaration No. IV	169
Geneva Protocol of 1925	169
Hague Convention	169
Notes and Questions	169
The Dreierwalde Case	173
United States v. von Leeb, et al., (The High Command Case)	175
United States v. List, et al., (The Southeast [Hostages] Case)	176
Notes and Questions	179
Instructions for the Government of Armies of the United States in the	Field
(the Lieber Code)	181
Geneva Convention Relative to the Protection of Civilian Persons in T	ime of
War	181
Geneva Convention Relative to the Treatment of Prisoners of War	181
Notes and Questions	181
Chapter 5 Sanctions Against Karadzic	191
Section 1 Criminal Sanctions	191
The Prosecutor of the Tribunal v. Radovan Karadzic, Ratko Mladic, In	
ment:	191
Notes and Questions	202
Section 2 Civil Sanctions	202
Alien Tort Claims Act	202
Torture Victim Protection Act	202
Kadic v. Karadzic	203
Notes and Questions	211
Sosa v. Alvarez Machain	212
Notes and Questions	223
PART TWO	

#### DOCUMENTS SECTION

Instructions for the Government of Armies of the United States in the Field, G	General
Orders No. 100 (1863) (the 1863 Lieber Code)	229
Hague Convention (No. IV) Respecting the Laws and Customs of War on Lar	nd, and
Annex	233
List of War Crimes Prepared by the Commission on the Responsibility of the	Au-
thors of the War and on Enforcement of Penalties, Presented to the Prelim	inary
Peace Conference 1919	238

viii

### CONTENTS

Geneva Convention Relative to the Treatment of Prisoners of War	
of 12 August 1949	239
Geneva Convention Relative to the Protection of Civilian Persons in Time of Wa	ar of
August 12, 1949	
75 U.N.T.S. 287, 6 U.S.T. 3516, T.I.A.S. No. 3365	249
Protocol Additional to the Geneva Conventions of 12 August 1949, and relating	to
the protection of victims of international armed conflicts (Protocol I)	263
Protocol Additional to the Geneva Conventions of 12 August 1949, and relating	to
the protection of victims of non-international armed conflicts (Protocol II)	276
Charter of the International Military Tribunal at Nuremberg 1945	283
Tokyo Charter for the International Military Tribunal for the Far East (1946)	289
Allied Control Council Law No. 10 (20 Dec. 1945)	293
Principles of the Nuremberg Charter and Judgment (1950)	297
Statute of the International Criminal Tribunal for Former Yugoslavia	
U.N. S.C. Res. 827 (1993)	298
Statute of the International Tribunal for Rwanda	307
Rome Statute of the International Criminal Court	317
Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide	377
International Convention on the Suppression and Punishment	
of the Crime of "Apartheid"	379
International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms	
of Racial Discrimination	381
International Convention Against the Taking of Hostages	388
International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (ICCPR)	392
American Declaration of the Rights and Duties of Man	407
Convention Against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman	
or Degrading Treatment or Punishment	410
Inter-American Convention on the Forced Disappearance of Persons	414
U.N. G.A. Resolution 46/51 U.N. Doc. A/46/654 (9 Dec. 1991)	419
Declaration on Measures to Eliminate International Terrorism	422
Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms While	
Countering Terrorism	425
Human Rights and Terrorism	426
Lawfulness of Detentions by the United States in Guantanamo Bay	428

ix

# Table of Selected Cases

Aboitiz & Co. v. Price, 167

Adra v. Clift, 205

- Agent Orange Product Liability Litig., In re, 155
- Akayesu, The Prosecutor v., 4, 13, 47, 50–55, 78, 81, 106, 110–112, 143, 155–156, 165, 202
- Aksoy v. Turkey, 121, 166
- Al-Saher, United States v., 122, 166
- Alejandre v. Cuba, 115
- Altstoetter, United States v. (The Justice Case), 11, 13, 18
- Alvarez-Machain, United States v., 184, 212–213, 221, 225
- Amerada Hess Shipping Corp. v. Argentine Republic, 205
- Application of the Convention on Genocide (Bosnia and Herzegovina v. Yugoslavia) (I.C.J.), 3–5, 11–16, 19–20, 24, 27–28, 32, 34–35, 42, 46–47, 49, 58, 63, 70, 73–113, 130, 133, 141–142, 159, 183, 185, 193, 197, 204–209, 222, 224, 299, 307–309, 318, 330, 332, 377–379, 394
- Barbie Trial (Matter of), 20–22, 24–29, 31–33, 47, 55
- Barcelona Traction Light & Power Co., (Belgium v. Spain) (I.C.J.), , 88
- bin Laden, et al., United States v., 105
- Black, United States v., 50, 94, 141, 145, 183, 217, 428
- Blagojevic & Jokic, The Prosecutor v., 84

Blaskic, The Prosecutor v., 44-45, 56, 72 Brandenburg v. Ohio, 94 Brdanin, The Prosecutor v., 85-86 Brown v. United States, 216-217 Cabello v. Fernandez-Larios, 119 Cargo of the Brig Malek Adhel, United States v., 205 Carr, United States v., 210 Celibici (Celebici), The Prosecutor v., 57 Cesic, The Prosecutor v., 58 Charlton v. Kelly, 50, 72, 93, 183 Charming Betsy, The, 222 Chumney v. Nixon, 210 Church v. Hubbart, 119, 155, 184, 198 Cicippio v. Islamic Republic of Iran, 119 Compton v. State, 5 Cook v. United States, 206 Cory, United Sates v., 35, 42, 44, 48 Cross v. Harrison, 135, 145, 150-151, 154, 239-240, 250-251, 253, 257, 261-262, 274, 281–282, 292, 390, 429 Cyprus v. Turkey, 118 Dachau, Trials at, 7, 25 Dah case, 123–124 Daliberti v. Republic of Iraq, 119 Davis, United States v., 76 Delalic, The Prosecutor v., 54, 118, 122, 140, 145, 166 Demjanjuk v. Petrovsky, 14, 206

xi

### TAB;E OF CASES

Doe v. Islamic Salvation Front, 155, 184

Doe v. Unocal Corp., 211

- Dreierwalde case, 130, 173
- Edwards v. Carter, 88, 209, 219-220
- Eichmann, Att'y Gen. v., 8, 14–16, 20, 28, 47, 50, 55, 62, 75, 87, 222
- Einsatzgruppen Case (United States v. Ohlendorf), 10, 13
- Estate of Marcos, In re, 114, 209, 211, 220, 224
- Estate of Rodriquez v. Drummond Co., 155, 184
- Factor v. Laubenheimer, 39, 58, 68, 78, 109, 305, 315, 408
- Filartiga v. Pena-Irala, 114, 119, 205, 208–211, 217, 219–220
- Finta, R. v., 35-42, 43-45, 62, 65
- Flick, United States v. (Flick Case), 10-11
- Ford v. United States, 184
- Forti v. Suarez-Mason, 119, 126–127, 208–209, 225
- Furlong, United States v., 204
- Furundzija, The Prosecutor v., 54–55, 123, 222
- Galic, The Prosecutor v., 187
- Guantanamo Detainee Cases, In re, 115, 120–123, 127, 142, 144–145, 181, 428–431
- Hadzihasanovic, The Prosecutor v., 163 Hamdan v. Rumsfeld, 140, 145–146, 181
- Hamdi v. Rumsfeld, 142, 181
- Hamilton, United States v., 213
- Hand, United States v., 25–26, 95, 108, 123, 137, 143, 157, 170, 174, 234, 248, 258, 261, 263, 392
- Harmony v. United States, 222-223

Henfield's Case, 224

- Hogan, State v., 5
- Howard, In re Estate of, 129, 132-133
- Hudson & Goodwin, United States v., 212

IMT Nuremberg, 6, 8, 34, 48, 152, 154 Iran v. United States, 119, 170 Ireland v. United Kingdom, 8, 69, 121, 149, 165–166, 171, 283 Iwanowa v. Ford Motor Co., 184 Jackson, United States v., 5-6, 8, 187 Jelisic, The Prosecutor v., 83, 86, 193-194 Johnson v. Eisentrager, 212 Jordan, United States v., 127, 155, 205, 207, 223-225 Jose v. M/V Fir Grove, 212 Kadic v. Karadzic, 114, 119, 155, 180, 183-184, 187, 191-226 Kajelijeli, The Prosecutor v., 82 Kambanda, The Prosecutor v., , 202 Kane v. Winn, 114 Karadzic & Mladic, The Prosecutor v. (Indictment), 180, 183, 187, 191-195, 197-201 Kelly, United States v., 50, 72, 93, 183 Kordic & Cerkez, The Prosecutor v., 55-57, 71-72, 141, 164 Krauch, United States v., (I.G. Farben Case), 10 Krstic, The Prosecutor v., 13–14, 76, 83–84 Krupp, United States v., 10 Kunarac, The Prosecutor v., 44-45, 121-122, 166 Kvocka, The Prosecutor v., 56 Leon, United States v., 132 Letelier v. Republic of Chile, 212 Lilly, State v., 5 Linder v. Portocarrero, 155, 184 Lindh, United States v., 149 List, United States v., (Hostages Case), 13-14, 27, 31, 33, 91, 108, 118, 130, 136, 148–149, 154, 156, 160, 165, 167,

IMT Far East IMT Tokyo), 49, 154

171–172, 175–176, 179–180, 182,

xii

#### TAB;E OF CASES

186-187, 238, 243, 301, 305, 312, 315, 334, 337, 370, 376, 384, 400-401 Lobue v. Christopher, 100, 144 Loizidou v. Turkey, 118 Louis, Le, 139 Martin v. Mott, 163, 189 Martinez, United States v., 225 Medina, United States v., 29 Mehinovic v. Vuckovic, 119, 184, 225 Milch, United States v., 10 Mile Mrksi, The Prosecutor v., 59 Miller v. The Ship Resolution, 87 Milosevic, The Prosecutor v., 75 Minnesota v. Gut, 103 Mladic, The Prosecutor v. (Indictment), 180, 183, 187, 191-195, 197-201 Moore v. Macduff, 129 Morris v. United States, 183 Mucic, The Prosecutor v., 140 Mudd, Ex parte, 155 Mugesera v. Canada, 42-45 Muhimana, The Prosecutor v., 58 Musema, The Prosecutor v., 53, 78, 80-81, 155-156, 164, 182 N., Prosecutor v., 124 Nahimana, The Prosecutor v., 58, 81 Naletilic & Martinovic, The Prosecutor v., 55-57, 122, 140, 164, 166 Nathan v. Commonwealth of Virginia, 29 Neurath case, 9 Nicaragua v. United States (I.C.J.), 140, 150, 225 Nikolic, The Prosecutor v., 49, 68, 194 Nivitegeka, The Prosecutor v., 81, 93 Norris v. Newton, 5 Ohlendorf, United States v. (Einsatzgruppen Trial), 188 Oliver v. Kauffman, 216 O'Loughlin v. People, 5

- Padilla v. Hanft, 142
- Papon v. France, 20, 35, 55
- Paquete Habana, The, 184, 209, 214, 219–220, 224
- Pinochet, Ex parte, 93, 119, 127
- Plavsic, The Prosecutor v., 85
- Pohl Case (United States v.), 10
- Presbyterian Church of Sudan v. Talisman Energy, Inc., 119, 155, 184
- Prize Cases, The, 141
- Proposal for a Formal Request for Deferral to the Competence of the Tribunal (re: Karadzic, et al.), 10, 64, 298, 300, 308, 311
- Prosecutor v. [see other party], 4, 13–14, 36, 47, 49–51, 53, 55–59, 61, 63, 68, 71–72, 75–76, 78, 81–85, 93, 97, 104, 106, 108, 112, 118, 121–124, 131, 140–141, 143, 145, 154–157, 163–164, 166, 180, 182, 186–188, 191, 202, 222, 285–287, 301–303, 305–306, 311, 313–316, 324–328, 332–333, 335, 337–348, 350–352, 354–355, 357–360, 366–367, 369, 373
- Quirin, Ex parte, 141
- Rasul v. Bush, 142, 181
- Regina (or Rex or R.) v. [see other party], 170
- Reid v. Covert, 97
- Republic of Philippines v. Marcos, 114, 126, 209, 211, 220, 224
- Respublica v. Cobbett, 215
- Respublica v. De Longchamps, 215
- Rodriguez v. State, 184, 206
- RUSHA Case (United States v. Greifelt), 10
- Rutaganda, The Prosecutor v., 51, 55, 57, 76, 81, 143, 155–156
- Rwamakuba, The Prosecutor v., 82
- Santissima Trinidad, The, 212
- Scilingo case, 15, 124

xiii

#### TAB;E OF CASES

Semanza, The Prosecutor v., 81–82

Sikirica, The Prosecutor v., 83, 193-194

Smith, United States v. (1806), 113

Smith, United States v. (1820), 204–205, 220, 222

Sosa v. Alvarez-Machain, 184, 212–214, 220–221, 223, 225–226

Stakic, The Prosecutor v., 57

Strassheim v. Daily, 90, 120, 194

Streicher, case against (IMT), 9, 154

T & V v. United Kingdom, 5, 13, 18, 49, 57, 62, 73, 75, 82, 84, 88, 91, 106, 114–115, 117, 119, 121–124, 141–142, 145–146, 149–150, 156–157, 163–164, 166–167, 180–185, 206, 211–212, 215–216, 219–220, 223

Tachiona v. Mugabe, 126, 225

Tadic, The Prosecutor v., 44–45, 49–50, 56, 58, 69–70, 84, 140, 143, 149, 151, 154, 156–157, 163–165

Talbot v. Janson, 224

Taylor, R. v., 9, 13, 179, 207

Tel-Oren v. Libyan A rab Republic, 209–210, 218–220, 223

- Touvier, Matter of, 20, 24, 28–33, 35, 47, 55
- Turner (U.S. ex rel.) v. Williams, 129
- United States v. [see opposing party], 11, 73, 113, 115, 126, 140, 149, 167, 172, 175–176, 180, 187–189, 204, 206, 210, 212, 218, 220, 222–224, 431
- Universal Jurisdiction (Austria) Case, 4, 15–16, 20, 69, 75, 88, 104–105, 124, 157, 159, 162, 222–223

von Hagenbach, trial of, 5

von Leeb, United States v. (The High Command Case), 130, 167, 175–176

Ware v. Hylton, 214

- Weisshaus v. Swiss Bankers Ass'n, 155, 184
- Weizsaecker, United States v. (The Ministries Case), 10

Wessels (U.S. ex rel.) v. McDonald, 189

White, United States v., 217, 281

Wilkinson v. People, 5, 225

Wilson, United States v., 214, 224

Wiwa v. Royal Dutch Petroleum Co., 225

- Xuncax v. Gramajo, 119, 126–127, 209, 212, 225
- Yamashita, In re, 207

Yunis, United States v., 126

Zubeda v. Ashcroft, 122, 166

xiv

## Preface

The Human Rights Module has been prepared for those teaching human rights courses or seminars who wish to supplement whatever other materials they are using in order to assure adequate, up-to-date exploration of the "core" international crimes most often associated with human rights infractions. "Core" crimes addressed here include attention to crimes against humanity, genocide, other crimes against human rights (such as torture, criminalized race discrimination, apartheid, hostage-taking, and disappearances), and war crimes. There is also a separate chapter on Sanctions Against Karadzic that provides attention to application of many of the core crimes in both criminal and civil sanctions arenas (before the International Criminal Tribunal for Former Yugoslavia and U.S. federal courts) with respect to one setting, the conflict in Bosnia-Herzegovina. The Module should also prove useful as supplemental material for other international law courses or seminars where a focus on crimes against humanity, genocide, and other crimes against human rights, and/or war crimes is desired - perhaps a course or seminar on counter-terrorism addressing the law of war and human rights in particular. The Module is self-contained, providing needed cases and materials as well as a separate Documents Section in Part Two of the Module.

Some who use the Human Rights Module might prefer to concentrate on Chapters 1-3 and avoid inclusion of Chapter 4 on war crimes. Others might prefer to use the first four chapters and not Chapter 5 (which addresses both criminal and civil sanctions against former Bosnian-Serb leader Karadzic and the first Supreme Court case to address the Alien Tort Claims Act) and some might prefer to use all five chapters in their course or seminar. Especially after the first AALS Workshop on Human Rights, held in 1999, it is our understanding that most law professors who teach human rights courses or seminars supplement assigned textbooks with other materials or find that present textbooks preclude adequate or more detailed and up-to-date attention to areas of special interest, such as those reflected in the special focus of the Module. The Module was prepared in part to meet such needs and to provide a self-contained set of cases, materials and documents that can be used in a few weeks.

We hope that you find the Module especially useful and we are eager to receive your comments and suggestions for improvement.

The Editors 2006