Comparative Law of Contracts
Carolina Academic Press
Comparative Law Series

Michael Louis Corrado
Series Editor

Comparative Constitutional Review
Cases and Materials
Michael Louis Corrado

Comparative Law: An Introduction
Vivian Grosswald Curran

Comparative Consumer Bankruptcy
Jason Kilborn

Comparative Law of Contracts
Alain Levasseur

Comparative Criminal Procedure, Second Edition
Stephen C. Thaman

Comparative Human Rights Law, Vol. 1:
Expression, Association, Religion
A. Mark Weisburd

Comparative Human Rights Law, Vol. 2:
Detention, Prosecution, Capital Punishment
A. Mark Weisburd
Comparative Law of Contracts

Cases and Materials

Alain A. Levasseur
Hermann Moyse, Sr. Professor of Law
Director, European Studies
LSU Law Center

Carolina Academic Press
Durham, North Carolina
for
Francis, Gabriel, John Paul, Libby Kate
Contents

Acknowledgments and Permissions xv

Introduction xvii

Abbreviations and Materials Cited xix

Chapter One  Historical Survey 3
   A. Roman Law Origins 3
   B. Historical Survey of Contract at Civil Law and
      Contracts at Common Law 8
      1. Civil Law 8
      2. Common Law 9
         Slade’s Case 11

Chapter Two  Juridical Acts and Contracts 13
   A. Juridical Acts 13
   B. Notion of “Contract” at Civil Law 15
   C. Notion of “Contract” at Common Law 16
      English Common Law 16
      William Blackstone: Commentaries on the Laws of England 16
      Lord Diplock 16
      G.H. Treitel, Q.C., The Law of Contract 17
      United States Law 17
      Restatement, 2d 17
      E. Allan Farnsworth: Contracts 18
   D. International/Multinational 18
      Principles of European Contract Law, Parts I and II
      Edited by Ole Lando and Hugh Beale 19
   E. Courts’ Decisions 19
      1. Civil Law Courts 19
         Fr. Cour de cassation 19
Chapter Three  Types of Contracts

The Civil Law and the Common Law Contrasted  27
   A: Bilateral Contracts and Unilateral Contracts  28
      1. At Civil Law  28
         a: Concepts  28
         b: Illustrations  29
      2. At Common Law  30
         G.H. Treitel  30
         E. Allan Farnsworth  31
         Restatement, 2d  31
   B: Onerous Contracts and Gratuitous Contracts  32
      1. At Civil Law  32
         a: Concepts  32
         b: Illustrations  32
      2. At Common Law  33
         Wm. Blackstone, Commentaries on the Laws of England  33
         P.S. Atiyah, An Introduction to The Law of Contract  34
         G.H. Treitel  34
         Restatement, 2d  34
         E. Allan Farnsworth  35
Part I
Formation of Contracts

Chapter Four  Offer and Acceptance  39
§ 1 When Is an Offer, an “Offer” in a Legal Sense?  40
A: Civil Law  40
B: Common law  42
   Restatement, 2d  42
   E. Allan Farnsworth  43
   G.H. Treitel  43
   Butterworths  44
C: International/Multinational  44
§ 2 When Is an Acceptance, an “Acceptance” in a Legal Sense?  45
A: Civil Law  45
B: Common Law  47
   G.H. Treitel  47
   Butterworths  48
   Restatement, 2d  49
   E. Allan Farnsworth  50
C. International/Multinational  51
§ 3. Meeting of the Minds; Consensus ad idem  52
A: Forms of Acceptance  53
   1. Civil Law  53
   2. Common Law  54
      G.H. Treitel  54
      Butterworths  55
      Restatement, 2d  56
      E. Allan Farnsworth  58
   3. International/Multinational  59
B: Meeting of the Minds: Revocable or Irrevocable Offer  60
   1. Civil Law  60
   2. Common Law  61
      G.H. Treitel  61
      Butterworths  62
      Restatement, 2d  63
      E. Allan Farnsworth  64
   3. International/Multinational  65
C. Courts’ Decisions  68
   1. Civil Law Cases  68
      Louisiana  68
CONTENTS

Ever-Tite Roofing Corporation v. Green 68
Québec 70
Construction Polaris Inc. c.

  Conseil de bande Micmacs de Gesgapegia 70
Germany 70
BGH XII ZR 214/00, XII. Civil Senate, XII ZR 214/00 70

2. Common Law Cases 73
U.K. 73

Carlill v. Carbolic Smoke Ball Company 73
Entores Ld. v. Miles Far East Corporation 74
U.S.A. 75
Rhode Island Tool Company v. United States 76

Chapter Five  Cause and Consideration 79
A: Civil Law Systems 79

  Planiol et Ripert, Treatise on the Civil Law Vol. 2 Part 1 81
  Philippe Malaurie, Laurent Aynès, Philippe Stoffel-Munck 83
B. Common Law Systems: Consideration 83

  1. English Common Law 83
     Blackstone; Commentaries: Book II the Rights of Things 83
     P.S. Atiyah 84
     G.H. Treitel 85
  2. United States Common Law 87
     Restatement, 2d 87
     O.W. Holmes, Jr., The Common Law 89
     E. Allan Farnsworth 90
C. Courts' Decisions 92

  1. Civil Law Cases 92
     France 92
     Cour de Cassation (Ch.civ., 1re sect.) 92
     Louisiana 93
     Davis-Delcambre Motors, Inc. v. Martin Simon 93
     Québec 94
     James Hutchison v. The Royal Institution for the Advancement of Learning 94
  2. Common Law Cases 96
     U.K. 96
     Esso Petroleum Co. Ltd v. Customs and Excise Commissioners 96
     U.S.A. 97
     Danby v. Osteopathic Hospital Ass’n of Delaware 97
Chapter Six  Contracts: Good Faith, Estoppel . . .

A: “Good Faith” in the Civil Law
   Planiol et Ripert Vol. VI Obligations LGDJ
   Malaurie, Aynès et Stoffel-Munck
   Fredrich Kessler and Edith Fine,
      Culpa In Contraehendo, Bargaining In Good Faith,
      And Freedom Of Contract: A Comparative Study

B: “Good Faith” in the Common Law: Consideration,
   Estoppel, Reliance, Good Faith . . .
   1. Law of the United Kingdom
      P.S. Atiyah
      Butterworths
   2. United States Law
      Restatement, 2d
      John D. Calamari and Joseph M. Perillo
      E. Allan Farnsworth

C: “Good Faith” in International/Multinational Law

D. Courts’ Decisions
   1. Civil Law Cases
      France
      Société Alain Manoukian c. Consorts Wajsfisz
      Québec
      National Bank of Canada c. Dame Soucisse and others
      Germany
      BGHZ 69, 53, VIII. Civil Senate
   2. Common Law Cases
      U.K.
      Interfoto Picture Library Ltd. v.
      Stiletto Visual Programmes Ltd.
      U.S.A.
      Market Street Associates Limited Partnership v.
      Dale Frey, et. al.

Part II
Effects of Contracts

Chapter Seven  Performance-Damages

A: A Comparative Law Perspective
CONTENTS

B: Performance-Damages in Civil Law 128
   Philippe Malaurie, Laurent Aynès, Philippe Stoffel-Munck 132
C. Performance-Damages in Common Law 133
   Restatement, 2d 133
   G.H. Treitel, Q.C. 136
   Butterworths 140
   E. Allan Farnsworth 141
D. Performance-Damages in International/Multinational Law 144
E. Courts' Decisions 147
   1. Civil Law 147
      Louisiana 147
      J. Weingarten, Inc. v. Northgate Mall, Inc. 147
      France 149
      Cass.-civ. March 14, 1900 149
      Québec 150
      La Compagnie de Construction Belcourt Ltée c.
      Golden Griddle Pancake House Limited 150
      Association des Professeurs de Lignery (A.P.L.),
      Syndicat Affilié à la C.E.Q. c. Florence Alveta-Comeau 153
      Germany 154
      BGH NJW 1977, 35, VIII Civil Senate 154
   2. Common Law 156
      U.S.A. 156
      Delchi Carrier SpA v. Rotorex Corporation 156
      Jacob & Youngs, Inc. v. Kent 158
      U.K. 160
      Hadley and Another v. Baxendale and Others 160
      Ruxley Electronics Ltd. Forsyth (H.L. (E)) 161

Chapter Eight  Justifiable/Justified Non-Performance 165
A. Civil Law 166
   1. Roman Law 166
      S.P. Scott, A.M., The Civil Law including…. 166
      The Enactments of Justinian…. 166
   2. Contemporary Civil Law 167
      Marcel Planiol, Georges Ripert, Traité Pratique
de Droit Civil Français 171
      Ph. Malaurie, L. Aynès, Ph. Stoffel-Munck 172
B. Common Law 173

1. Common Law in the U.K. 173
   P.S. Atiyah 174
   G.H. Treitel 175
   Butterworths 176

2. Common Law in the U.S.A. 178
   Restatement, 2d 178
   E. Allan Farnsworth 180
   Transatlantic Financing Corporation v. United States of America 182

C. International/Multinational 183

D. Courts’ Decisions 187

1. Civil Law 187
   France 187
   Cour de cassation, 1ère Civ. 8 décembre 1998 187
   Cour de cassation, ass. plén. 14 avril 2006 188
   Québec 189
   Canit Construction Québec Limited et Janin & Compagnie Limitée v. The Foundation Company of Canada Ltd. 189

   Germany 190
   BGHZ 60, 14, VII. Civil Senate 190
   BGH NJW 1984, 1746, VIII. Civil Senate 193

2. Common Law 196
   U.S.A. 196
   American Trading and Production Corporation v. Shell International Marine Ltd. 196
   Mishara Construction Company, Inc. v. Transit-Mixed Concrete Corp. 198
   U.K. 200
   Taylor and Another v. Caldwell and Another 200
   Krell v. Henry 201
   Staffordshire Area Health Authority v. South Staffordshire Waterworks Co. 203

3. International/Multinational: CISG 204
   Nuova Facinati S.p.A. v. Fondmetal International A.B. Tribunale Civile di Monza 204

Index 207
Acknowledgments and Permissions

We are grateful to the following publishers for their permission to reprint excerpts from the following:


Introduction

Comparative law of contract or Comparative law of contracts? What difference does the letter “s” bring to the alternative? Actually, this single letter “s” is, to a large extent, illustrative of the different approaches of the common law system and of the civil law system to one and the same legal concept of “obligation,” or bond of law, created by human will. Whereas, on the one hand, the civil law system has developed or built a “theory of contract” and, thus, a “law of contract” in the singular, as an all encompassing legal framework elaborated on the logic of an inductive reasoning process based on a variety of existing contracts, be they to give, to do or not to do something..., on the other hand the common law system still refers to “contracts,” hence the “law of contracts.” In a way, therefore, the common law is not concerned with the possible existence of a single or universal legal concept of “contract,” as an abstract entity, responding to its own legal features which would then be common to all “contracts.”

Yet both the common law of contracts and the civil law of contract can trace their “roots” to the law of contracts in Roman law. In the course of history the two systems will part ways and adopt, here and there, different legal approaches to solving, however, the same practical issues created by the same need to regulate all sorts of transactions arising from the interactions of men whether they operate in a common law system or in a civil law system. If the civil law has taken more a legislative and regulatory approach, under the form of codification, harmonization and legislation, the common law has taken a more praetorian approach as reflected in the jurisprudence of the courts of common law. Still, there is no harmonized or uniform contract law gathering together the civil law jurisdictions, even within the European Union, under one single civil law of contract. As we shall see in the following chapters there exist differences between civil law jurisdictions and between the latter and the common law jurisdictions. Reconciliations between all these jurisdictions is still a long way in the distant future! Yet many of the solutions to the legal problems are the same.
We will attempt, first, to illustrate these two fundamentally different approaches of the civil law and the common law by comparing some identical elements required for the formation of a binding contract in both legal systems. (Part I). In a second Part, we will focus on some effects of contracts and some remedies available in the event of a breach of a contract. (Part II). However, a brief historical survey of the law of contract or contracts in Roman law, in the civil law and in the common law and a survey of the concepts of “juridical acts” and “contracts” are a necessary preliminary step in this comparative analysis.
Abbreviations

Louisiana Revised Statutes: La. R. S. [West Publishing Company]
French Civil Code: Fr. Civ. C. [Code Dalloz]
Civil Code of QC: C.C.Q. [Wilson & Lafleur Ltée]
German Civil Code: BGB [juris GmbH, Saarbrücken]
Restatement of the Law Second Contracts 2d: Restatement, 2d [The American Law Institute]
Uniform Commercial Code: UCC [Foundation Press]
The Unidroit Principles in Practice: UNIDROIT Principles [Transnational Publishers]
Swiss Civil Code: Sw. Civ. C. [ReMaK Verlag Zürich]

Materials Cited

E. Allan Farnsworth, Contracts, Fourth Edition, Aspen 2004