

Mastering Evidence

Mastering Evidence

Ronald W. Eades

LOUIS D. BRANDEIS SCHOOL OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF LOUISVILLE

CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS
Durham, North Carolina

Copyright © 2008 Ronald W. Eades
All Rights Reserved.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Eades, Ronald W.

Mastering evidence / by Ronald W. Eades.

p. cm. -- (Mastering series)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN-13: 978-1-59460-261-0 (alk. paper)

ISBN-10: 1-59460-261-1 (alk. paper)

1. Evidence (Law)--United States. I. Title. II. Series.

KF8935.E15 2008

347.73'6--dc22

2007043830

Carolina Academic Press
700 Kent Street
Durham, NC 27701
Telephone (919) 489-7486
Fax (919) 493-5668
www.cap-press.com

Printed in the United States of America

Contents

Series Editor's Foreword	xi
Preface	xiii
Chapter 1 · Roles of the Court, Judge, Jury, and Attorneys in Light of Rules of Evidence	3
Roles Roadmap	3
A. Introduction	3
B. Stages of the Trial	4
1. Impaneling the Jury	4
2. Opening Statements	5
3. Plaintiff's (Civil Case) or Prosecution's (Criminal Case) Case in Chief	6
4. Defendant's Case in Chief	7
5. Rebuttal	7
6. Sur-rebuttal	8
7. Closing Statements	8
8. Instructions to the Jury	9
9. Jury Deliberations	9
10. Motions	10
11. Entry of Judgment on Jury Verdict	10
12. Appeals	10
13. Summary of Trial	11
C. Purpose and Application of the Rules of Evidence (Fed. Rules 101, 102)	12
1. Federal Courts (Fed. Rules 1101)	12
2. State Courts	14
3. Application in Bench Trials and Administrative Hearings	15
D. Making and Meeting Objections (Fed. Rules 103, 104)	16
1. General Issues on Objections	16
2. Specific Objections	17

a. Role of Attorneys (Fed. Rule 103)	17
b. Role of Trial Judge (Fed. Rule 104)	20
3. Commonly Heard Objections	21
a. Leading	22
b. Argumentative	22
c. Asked and Answered	22
E. Limited Admissibility and Remainder of Writings (Fed. Rules 105, 106)	23
Checkpoints	24
Chapter 2 · Judicial Notice (201)	25
Judicial Notice Roadmap	25
A. Introduction	25
B. Legislative Facts and Adjudicative Facts (201(a))	26
C. Facts That Can Be Noticed (201(b))	29
D. Procedural Concerns (201(c), (d), (e), (f) & (g))	30
E. Jury's Knowledge	33
F. Jury View	34
Checkpoints	35
Chapter 3 · Burdens of Proof and Presumptions (301, 302)	37
Burdens of Proof and Presumptions Roadmap	37
A. Introduction	37
B. Civil Cases	38
1. Burdens of Proof	38
a. Burden of Production	39
b. Burden of Persuasion	41
2. Presumptions	43
C. Criminal Cases	46
1. Burdens of Proof	46
a. Burden of Production	47
b. Burden of Persuasion	49
2. Presumptions	49
Checkpoints	51
Chapter 4 · Relevance	53
Relevance Roadmap	53
A. Introduction	53
B. General Requirement of Relevance (401, 402, 403)	54
1. The Basic Rule (402)	54

2. The Definition (401)	54
3. A General Exclusion (403)	55
C. Character for the Purpose of Proving Propensity (404, 405)	57
1. Types of Character Evidence (404)	57
2. Method of Proof When Character Evidence Is Admissible (405)	60
D. Habit (406)	63
E. Subsequent Remedial Measures (407)	66
F. Compromises, Offers, Payments and Pleas (408, 409, 410)	70
1. Compromises (408)	70
2. Payment of Medical Expenses (409)	72
3. Pleas in Criminal Cases (410)	73
G. Insurance (411)	74
H. Rape Shield Law (412)	75
1. Background	75
2. The Basic Rule	76
3. Exceptions	77
4. Procedure	78
I. Similar Sex Crimes (413, 414, 415)	79
1. Similar Crimes in Sexual Assault (413)	79
2. Similar Crimes in Child Molestation (414)	80
3. Similar Crimes in Civil Cases (415)	81
Checkpoints	82
Chapter 5 • Privileges	83
Privileges Roadmap	83
A. Introduction	83
B. General Theory of Privileges (501)	84
C. Most Commonly Encountered Privileges	86
1. Attorney-Client	86
2. Spousal	90
3. Priest-Penitent	91
4. Physician-Patient	92
5. Psychotherapist-Patient	92
6. Governmental	93
Checkpoints	93
Chapter 6 • Witnesses, Testimony, and Credibility	95
Witnesses, Testimony, and Credibility Roadmap	95
A. Introduction	95
B. Competency, Oath and Personal Knowledge (601, 602, 603)	95

C. Special Problems with Competency	97
1. Judges (605)	97
2. Jurors (606)	98
3. Interpreters (604)	99
D. General Issues of Impeachment (607)	99
1. Impeachment by Bias	100
2. Impeachment by Capacity	102
3. Impeachment by Character (608)	103
4. Impeachment by Crimes (609)	105
5. Collateral Matters	110
6. Rehabilitation and Refreshing Memory (608, 612)	111
7. Religious Beliefs (610)	114
8. Prior Inconsistent Statements (613)	115
E. Presentation of Witnesses (611)	116
1. Control by Judge	117
2. Cross examination	118
3. Leading Questions	120
4. Judge Called Witnesses (614)	121
F. Sequestration of Witnesses—The Rule (615)	122
Checkpoints	124
Chapter 7 · Opinion Evidence and Expert Witnesses	125
Opinion Evidence and Expert Witnesses Roadmap	125
A. Introduction	125
B. Opinions by Lay Witnesses and First-Hand Knowledge Recap (701)	126
C. Opinions by Experts (702)	128
1. Qualifications	129
2. Frye and Daubert	130
3. Bases of Opinions (703, 705)	132
4. The Ultimate Facts (704)	135
D. Court Appointed Experts (706)	137
Checkpoints	138
Chapter 8 · Hearsay and Exceptions	139
Hearsay and Exceptions Roadmap	139
A. Introduction	139
B. The Hearsay Rule and Underlying Purpose (802)	140
C. What Is Hearsay? (801)	141

1. The Definition	141
2. Common Examples of What is Not Hearsay?	143
a. To Prove Notice	143
b. “Verbal Acts”	144
c. State of Mind	146
d. Non-Verbal Conduct and Implied Assertions	148
3. Defined as Not Being Hearsay	150
a. Statements of Witnesses	151
b. Admission by Party Opponent	153
D. Exceptions	159
1. Availability of Declarant Immaterial (803)	159
a. Present Sense Impression and Excited Utterance— Time (1, 2)	159
b. Mental State (3)	162
c. Medical Diagnosis and Treatment (4)	164
d. Past Recollection Recorded (5)	166
e. Business Records (6, 7)	167
f. Public Records (8, 9, 10)	171
g. Other Records (11, 12, 13, 14, 15, 17)	172
h. Ancient Documents Rule (16)	173
i. Learned Treatises (18)	174
j. Character Issues (19, 20, 21, 22, 23)	175
2. Declarant Unavailable (804)	175
a. Unavailable defined (a)	176
b. Former Testimony (b1)	178
c. Dying Declaration (b2)	179
d. Statement Against Interest (b 3)	181
e. Personal or Family History (b 4)	182
f. Forfeiture by Wrongdoing (b 6)	182
3. Residual Exception (807)	183
4. Hearsay Within Hearsay (805)	183
5. Credibility of Declarant (806)	183
E. Constitutional Issues with Hearsay	184
Checkpoints	186
Chapter 9 · Authentication and Proper Foundations	187
Authentication and Proper Foundations Roadmap	187
A. Introduction	187
B. Real and Demonstrative Evidence	188

C. General Requirements of Authentication	191
D. Most Common Examples (901)	192
1. Handwriting	192
2. Voice	193
3. Photos and Videos	195
4. Other Examples	196
E. Self Authentication (902)	197
Checkpoints	198
Chapter 10 · Best Evidence Rule	199
Best Evidence Rule Roadmap	199
A. Introduction	199
B. The Best Evidence Rule (1002)	199
C. Originals, Duplicates and Copies (1001, 1003)	202
D. Exceptions (1004)	204
E. Summaries and Other Methods of Proof (1005, 1006, 1007, 1008)	205
Checkpoints	207
Mastering Evidence Checklist	209
About the Author	213
Index	215

Series Editor's Foreword

The Carolina Academic Press Mastering Series is designed to provide you with a tool that will enable you to easily and efficiently “master” the substance and content of law school courses. Throughout the series, the focus is on quality writing that makes legal concepts understandable. As a result, the series is designed to be easy to read and is not unduly cluttered with footnotes or cites to secondary sources.

In order to facilitate student mastery of topics, the Mastering Series includes a number of pedagogical features designed to improve learning and retention. At the beginning of each chapter, you will find a “Roadmap” that tells you about the chapter and provides you with a sense of the material that you will cover. A “Checkpoint” at the end of each chapter encourages you to stop and review the key concepts, reiterating what you have learned. Throughout the book, key terms are explained and emphasized. Finally, a “Master Checklist” at the end of each book reinforces what you have learned and helps you identify any areas that need review or further study.

We hope that you will enjoy studying with, and learning from, the Mastering Series.

Russell L. Weaver
Professor of Law & Distinguished University Scholar
University of Louisville, Louis D. Brandeis School of Law

Preface

This book is intended to be a companion work to a basic course in evidence. Students will ordinarily be assigned a case book or problem book and a copy of the Federal Rules of Evidence as required texts for a course. This work should provide a nice supplemental reading to help the student understand those other class materials.

Since it is assumed that most students will have a copy of the Federal Rules of Evidence, this book encourages those students to keep that copy of the Federal Rules close at hand while studying. Nothing can surpass the importance of a close reading and re-reading of those Federal Rules. When a student is reading and studying this work, a copy of the Federal Rules of Evidence should be open. This book will cite and discuss the Federal Rules of Evidence. It will not attempt, however, to give the full text of the rules. The student needs to review the full text when reading each section. This work will, however, cite to the correct rule in order to make it easy for the student to find the appropriate rule.

With all of the mention of the Federal Rules of Evidence, a student may wonder about state rules of evidence. This book will comment on the state rules of evidence when appropriate. It will, however, primarily be a book about the Federal Rules of Evidence. Since there are 50 state jurisdictions applying state rules of evidence, making general states about those principles is difficult. In addition, most faculty members teach evidence as a Federal Rules of Evidence course. Finally, the Federal Rules of Evidence are the primary source for bar examinations questions nationwide. For all of those reasons, this work will be concerned with the Federal Rules of Evidence. State rules of evidence will be noted, however, where they offer interesting alternative methods of dealing with problems.

Ronald W. Eades
Professor of Law
Louis D. Brandeis School of Law
University of Louisville
Louisville, Kentucky