

Law and Criminal Justice

Law and Criminal Justice

An Introductory Survey

David R. Lynch

David C. Brody

Michelle Heward

Steven Burge

CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS

Durham, North Carolina

Copyright © 2008
David R. Lynch, David C. Brody, Michelle Heward, Steven Burge
All Rights Reserved

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Law and criminal justice : an introductory survey / by David R. Lynch ...
[et al.].

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 10: 1-59460-437-1

ISBN 13: 978-1-59460-437-9 (alk. paper)

1. Criminal justice, Administration of--United States. 2. Criminal
procedure--United States. I. Lynch, David R. (David Richard) II. Title.

KF9223.L39 2008

345.73'05--dc22

2008005283

Carolina Academic Press
700 Kent Street
Durham, NC 27701
Telephone (919) 489-7486
Fax (919) 493-5668
www.cap-press.com

Printed in the United States of America

Table of Contents

| | |
|---|------|
| Table of Principal Cases | xiii |
| Chapter One Fundamentals of Criminal Law, Part I: What is a Crime?; Constitutional Limitations on Criminalizing “Bad” Conduct; Basic Elements of a Crime | 3 |
| What Is a Crime? | 3 |
| Constitutional Limits on Criminalizing “Bad” Conduct | 5 |
| Cruel and Unusual Punishment (Status Offenses) | 6 |
| <i>Robinson v. California</i> | 6 |
| Offensive Speech | 7 |
| <i>People v. Rokicki</i> | 8 |
| Religion | 9 |
| <i>Reynolds v. United States</i> | 9 |
| <i>Wisconsin v. Yoder</i> | 10 |
| The Right to Privacy | 11 |
| <i>Lawrence v. Texas</i> | 12 |
| The Void for Vagueness Doctrine | 13 |
| <i>Minnesota v. Reha</i> | 14 |
| Equal Protection | 15 |
| <i>Allam v. State</i> | 15 |
| Basic Elements of a Crime | 16 |
| <i>State v. Dalton</i> | 17 |
| <i>Morissette v. United States</i> | 18 |
| Chapter Two Fundamentals of Criminal Law, Part II: Justifications and Excuses for Crimes | 21 |
| Justification Defenses | 22 |
| Self-Defense | 22 |
| Defense of Others | 22 |
| Defense of Property | 23 |
| <i>Bishop v. State</i> | 23 |
| Execution of Public Duties | 23 |
| <i>Tennessee v. Garner</i> | 24 |
| Necessity | 25 |
| <i>Lightner v. State</i> | 25 |

| | |
|--|-----------|
| Resisting Unlawful Arrest | 26 |
| Excuse Defenses | 27 |
| Insanity | 27 |
| <i>State v. Johnson</i> | 29 |
| Mistake | 30 |
| Duress | 31 |
| Entrapment | 32 |
| <i>Jacobson v. United States</i> | 33 |
| Youthful Age | 34 |
| Involuntary Intoxication | 35 |
| <i>United States v. Sewell</i> | 35 |
| Chapter Three Basic Search and Seizure Law | 37 |
| How to Obtain a Warrant | 38 |
| Do All Searches and Seizures Require Warrants? | 39 |
| The Exclusionary Rule | 39 |
| <i>Mapp v. Ohio</i> | 39 |
| <i>United States v. Leon</i> | 41 |
| What Is a Search? | 43 |
| <i>Katz v. United States</i> | 43 |
| <i>California v. Greenwood</i> | 44 |
| Warrantless Searches | 45 |
| Consent Searches | 46 |
| <i>Florida v. Bostick</i> | 46 |
| Automobile Searches | 48 |
| <i>California v. Carney</i> | 48 |
| Plain View | 49 |
| Exigent Circumstances | 50 |
| Frisk for Weapons | 50 |
| <i>Terry v. Ohio</i> | 50 |
| Searches Incident to a Lawful Arrest/Regulatory Searches | 52 |
| Seizures | 53 |
| Investigative Stops | 53 |
| <i>Delaware v. Prouse</i> | 54 |
| Arrests | 55 |
| Arrest Warrants | 56 |
| Chapter Four Self-Incrimination, Right to Counsel, Speedy Jury Trials | 57 |
| Self-Incrimination | 57 |
| <i>Miranda v. Arizona</i> | 58 |
| <i>New York v. Quarles</i> | 60 |
| Right to Counsel | 61 |
| <i>Gideon v. Wainwright</i> | 62 |
| Right to a Speedy Jury Trial | 64 |
| Speedy: A Promise Unfulfilled? | 64 |
| <i>Barker v. Wingo</i> | 65 |

| | |
|--|-----|
| The Right to an Impartial Jury | 69 |
| <i>Lockhart v. McCree</i> | 70 |
| The Correct Size of Juries | 71 |
| <i>Williams v. Florida</i> | 71 |
| Chapter Five Law and the Proper Roles of Prosecutors, Defense Attorneys, and Judges | 73 |
| The Prosecutor | 74 |
| Duty to Seek Justice | 74 |
| <i>Miller v. Pate</i> | 76 |
| <i>Kyles v. Whitley</i> | 77 |
| Prosecutorial Discretion and the Charging Decision | 78 |
| <i>Wayte v. United States</i> | 79 |
| <i>Bordenkircher v. Hayes</i> | 81 |
| Defense Attorneys | 81 |
| Right to Counsel | 82 |
| <i>Argersinger v. Hamlin</i> | 82 |
| Effective Assistance of Counsel | 83 |
| <i>Strickland v. Washington</i> | 83 |
| Right to Counsel of One's Choice | 85 |
| <i>U.S. v. Gonzalez-Lopez</i> | 85 |
| Counsel's Duty to the Client | 87 |
| <i>Nix v. Whiteside</i> | 87 |
| Judges | 88 |
| Duty to Promote a Just Trial | 88 |
| <i>Sheppard v. Maxwell</i> | 89 |
| Duty to Remain Neutral and Detached | 90 |
| Conclusion | 92 |
| Chapter Six The Law of Bail, Plea Bargaining, and Guilty Pleas | 93 |
| Bail | 93 |
| History and the Legal Right to Bail | 94 |
| Legitimate and Extra-legal Uses of Bail | 94 |
| <i>Stack v. Boyle</i> | 94 |
| <i>United States v. Salerno</i> | 96 |
| Types of Bail | 98 |
| Legal Rights of Bounty Hunters | 98 |
| Plea Bargaining | 99 |
| The Constitutionality of Plea Bargaining | 100 |
| <i>Santobello v. New York</i> | 100 |
| Types of Plea Bargains | 101 |
| Judicial Participation in Deal-making | 102 |
| <i>State v. Davis</i> | 102 |
| Guilty Pleas | 103 |
| "Voluntarily and Knowingly Entered" Requirement | 104 |

| | |
|---|-----|
| <i>Boykin v. Alabama</i> | 104 |
| <i>Libretti v. United States</i> | 105 |
| Types of Guilty Pleas | 106 |
| <i>North Carolina v. Alford</i> | 107 |
| Withdrawing One's Guilty Plea | 108 |
| Chapter Seven Law of Evidence, Part I: | |
| Categories of Evidence, Relevancy, and Prejudicial Impact | 111 |
| A Forward to Your Study of the Law of Evidence | 111 |
| Categories of Evidence | 112 |
| Direct Evidence | 113 |
| <i>State v. Long</i> | 113 |
| Circumstantial Evidence | 115 |
| <i>People v. Basciano</i> | 116 |
| Real Evidence | 116 |
| <i>Byerly v. Ashley</i> | 117 |
| Documentary Evidence | 118 |
| <i>United States v. Maxwell</i> | 119 |
| Relevancy | 120 |
| <i>United States v. Brown</i> | 121 |
| Prejudicial Impact | 122 |
| <i>United States v. Layton</i> | 123 |
| Prior Records | 124 |
| Offers to Plea Bargain | 125 |
| <i>United States v. Mezzanatto</i> | 125 |
| Rape Shield Laws | 127 |
| <i>United States v. Withorn</i> | 127 |
| Leg Irons and Jail Clothes | 128 |
| <i>United States v. Stewart</i> | 128 |
| Victim Impact Evidence | 130 |
| <i>Commonwealth v. Means</i> | 130 |
| Chapter Eight Law of Evidence, Part II: Competency of Witnesses, Privileged Communications, Opinion Evidence, Hearsay and Its Exceptions | 133 |
| Competency of Witnesses | 133 |
| Personal Knowledge | 134 |
| Oath/Affirmations & Religion | 135 |
| Judges and Jurors | 135 |
| Mental Incapacity and Children | 136 |
| <i>United States of America v. Allen J. (a Juvenile)</i> | 136 |
| Other Categories of Disqualification | 137 |
| Privileged Communications | 137 |
| Attorney/Client | 139 |
| <i>In re Grand Jury Subpoena</i> | 140 |

| | |
|--|-----|
| Priest/Penitent Privilege | 142 |
| <i>In re Grand Jury Investigation</i> | 143 |
| Husband/Wife | 144 |
| <i>Trammel v. United States</i> | 144 |
| Other Privileges | 146 |
| Testimonial Evidence | 146 |
| Lay Opinions | 147 |
| Expert Opinion | 148 |
| <i>Kumho Tire Company, Ltd., et al., v. Patrick Carmichael, et al.</i> | 149 |
| Basis for an Expert Opinion | 150 |
| Opinion of the Ultimate Issue | 151 |
| Hearsay | 152 |
| Definition of Hearsay | 153 |
| Exceptions to Hearsay and Non-Hearsay | 155 |
| 1. Prior Statements and Admissions | 155 |
| <i>Michael Nowell v. City of Cincinnati, et al.</i> | 156 |
| 2. Excited Utterances | 157 |
| <i>United States of America v. Jean Brito</i> | 158 |
| 3. Dying Declarations | 160 |
| <i>United States of America v. Melvin Troy Two Shields</i> | 161 |
| 4. Other Exceptions | 162 |
| Chapter Nine Proof beyond a Reasonable Doubt | 163 |
| Guilty or Not Guilty: You Make the Call | 165 |
| Introductory, Non-Technical Definition of Reasonable Doubt | 167 |
| Proof beyond a Reasonable Doubt: A Constitutional Requirement | 168 |
| <i>In re Winship</i> | 169 |
| Attempting to Further Define and Understand | |
| Proof beyond a Reasonable Doubt | 170 |
| A. What Proof beyond Reasonable Doubt Is Not! | 170 |
| B. Defining Proof beyond a Reasonable Doubt through Case Law | 172 |
| <i>Victor v. Nebraska</i> | 173 |
| C. Numerical Quantification | 174 |
| Constitutional Ideals Related to the Burden of Proof | 176 |
| Guilty Pleas Affected by the Reasonable Doubt Standard | 177 |
| Ordeals: Proof of Guilt from a Historical Perspective | 178 |
| <i>Cage v. Louisiana</i> | 180 |
| The Constitutionality of Non-Unanimous Jury Verdicts | 181 |
| <i>Johnson v. Louisiana</i> | 181 |
| Sufficient or Insufficient Evidence? | 182 |
| A. Guilt or Mere Presence at a Crime Scene? | 182 |
| B. Is Mere Flight Enough to Prove Guilt? | 183 |
| C. Mere Confession | 184 |
| <i>Michigan v. McMahan</i> | 184 |
| Conclusion | 185 |

| | |
|--|-----|
| Chapter Ten Criminal Juries and the Law | 187 |
| Limitations on the Right to Trial by Jury | 188 |
| <i>Blanton v. City of North Las Vegas</i> | 188 |
| A Jury of One's Peers | 190 |
| <i>United States v. Shinault</i> | 190 |
| Juries in Death Penalty Cases: The Death Qualified Jury | 192 |
| <i>Wainwright v. Witt</i> | 193 |
| Anonymous Juries | 195 |
| <i>United States v. Ross</i> | 196 |
| Jury Nullification and the Sanctity of Jury Deliberations | 197 |
| <i>United States v. Thomas</i> | 198 |
| Breaking Deadlocked Juries: The Use of Dynamite Charges | 200 |
| <i>United States v. Arney</i> | 200 |
| Conclusion | 202 |
| | |
| Chapter Eleven Law of Sentencing; Cruel and Unusual Punishments | 203 |
| Four Classical Goals of Punishment | 203 |
| <i>Harmelin v. Michigan</i> | 204 |
| Sentencing Guidelines | 206 |
| How Guidelines Work | 206 |
| Mandatory vs. Non-mandatory Guidelines | 207 |
| Constitutionality of Guidelines | 207 |
| <i>Blakely v. Washington</i> and <i>United States v. Booker</i> | 207 |
| Cruel and Unusual Sentences | 209 |
| Torture | 210 |
| <i>Dawson v. State</i> | 210 |
| Shaming | 212 |
| <i>United States v. Gementera</i> | 212 |
| Banishment | 213 |
| <i>Doe v. Miller</i> | 214 |
| Crafting a Sentence | 215 |
| Legal Factors in Crafting a Sentence | 215 |
| <i>United States v. Grayson</i> | 216 |
| Extra-legal Factors in Crafting a Sentence | 218 |
| Sentencing Factors vs. Elements of a Crime | 218 |
| <i>Apprendi v. New Jersey</i> | 218 |
| | |
| Chapter Twelve Inmate Rights | 221 |
| Eighth Amendment Rights | 221 |
| Safe Environment | 222 |
| <i>Farmer v. Brennan</i> | 222 |
| Use of Force | 224 |
| <i>Hudson v. McMillian</i> | 224 |
| Medical Care | 226 |
| <i>Estelle v. Gamble</i> | 226 |

| | |
|--|-----|
| Conditions of Confinement | 227 |
| <i>Wilson v. Seiter</i> | 228 |
| Fourth Amendment Rights | 229 |
| <i>Hudson v. Palmer</i> | 229 |
| First Amendment Right to Religious Exercise | 230 |
| <i>Spratt v. Rhode Island Department of Corrections</i> | 231 |
| Conclusion | 233 |
| Chapter Thirteen Death Penalty Law | 235 |
| The Spotlight and Infamy through Execution | 235 |
| General Overview and Data on the Death Penalty | 237 |
| Pros and Cons | 239 |
| Why the Death Penalty Is Right (Hypothetical Argument for Study) | 240 |
| Why the Death Penalty Is Wrong (Sample Argument for Study) | 241 |
| Historical Background for the Death Penalty | 242 |
| The Eighth Amendment | 243 |
| <i>Wilkinson v. Utah</i> | 244 |
| Proportionality and Cruel and Unusual Punishment | 245 |
| Abolishment and Re-Birth of the Death Penalty | 245 |
| <i>Furman v. Georgia</i> | 245 |
| <i>Gregg v. Georgia</i> | 246 |
| Race and the Death Penalty | 247 |
| Mentally Disabled Subjects and the Death Penalty | 248 |
| <i>Atkins v. Virginia</i> | 249 |
| The Execution of Juvenile Murderers | 249 |
| <i>Stanford v. Kentucky</i> | 250 |
| <i>Roper v. Simmons</i> | 250 |
| Death Penalty for Rape as | |
| Cruel and Unusual Punishment | 252 |
| <i>Coker v. Georgia</i> | 252 |
| Errors and the Death Penalty | 253 |
| Conclusion | 253 |
| Chapter Fourteen Juvenile Law | 255 |
| Part I: Development and Evolution | 255 |
| Common Law through 19th Century | 255 |
| Houses of Reform | 256 |
| State Establishment of Juvenile Courts | 256 |
| Due Process Era | 257 |
| A. Treatment of Juveniles as Adults | 258 |
| <i>Kent v. United States</i> | 258 |
| B. Due Process Rights during Adjudication | 259 |
| <i>In re Gault</i> | 259 |
| Deinstitutionalization Era | 261 |
| “Get Tough” Era—Waiver, Certification and Automatic Transfer | 262 |

| | |
|--|-----|
| Age | 262 |
| Characteristics of Waiver Statutes | 264 |
| Part II: Current Juvenile Justice System | 265 |
| Jurisdiction | 265 |
| Terminology | 268 |
| Processing through the Juvenile Justice System | 269 |
| Specialty Courts | 271 |
| Adjudication Rights of Juveniles | 272 |
| A. Preventative Pretrial Detention | 272 |
| <i>Schall v. Martin</i> | 272 |
| B. Burden of Proof | 273 |
| <i>In re Winship</i> | 273 |
| C. Right to a Jury Trial | 274 |
| <i>McKeiver v. Pennsylvania</i> | 274 |
| D. Double Jeopardy | 274 |
| <i>Breed v. Jones</i> | 274 |
| E. Death Penalty | 275 |
| Conclusion | 276 |
| | |
| Chapter Fifteen Appellate Law | 277 |
| Purposes of an Appeal | 277 |
| Error Correction | 278 |
| A. Error Correction: Double Jeopardy | 279 |
| <i>Ashe v. Swenson</i> | 280 |
| B. Error Correction: Lawyer's Duty to Object and the Plain Error Doctrine | 281 |
| <i>United States v. Young</i> | 282 |
| <i>Commonwealth v. Clair</i> | 283 |
| C. Error Correction: The Harmless Error Doctrine | 285 |
| <i>State v. Campbell</i> | 285 |
| <i>Arizona v. Fulminante</i> | 286 |
| Policy Review | 288 |
| A. Policy Review: The Historic Case of <i>Marbury v. Madison</i> | 289 |
| <i>Marbury v. Madison</i> | 289 |
| B. Policy Review: Strict Construction vs. "Living Constitution" | 290 |
| C. Policy Review: The <i>Stare Decisis</i> Doctrine | 292 |
| <i>Planned Parenthood of Southeastern Pennsylvania v. Casey</i> | 293 |
| Mechanics of an Appeal | 294 |
| Appeals of Right vs. Discretionary Appeals | 295 |
| Right to Counsel in Appeals of Right | 296 |
| <i>Douglas v. California</i> | 296 |
| Anders Briefs and the Frivolous Appeal | 297 |
| | |
| Index | 299 |

Table of Principal Cases

- Allam v. State, 15
Apprendi v. New Jersey, 218
Argersinger v. Hamlin, 82
Arizona v. Fulminante, 286
Ashe v. Swenson, 280
Atkins v. Virginia, 249
Barker v. Wingo, 65
Bishop v. State, 23
Blakely v. Washington, 207
Blanton v. City of North Las Vegas, 188
Bordenkircher v. Hayes, 81
Boykin v. Alabama, 104
Breed v. Jones, 274
Byerly v. Ashley, 117
Cage v. Louisiana, 180
California v. Carney, 48
California v. Greenwood, 44
Coker v. Georgia, 252
Commonwealth v. Clair, 283
Commonwealth v. Means, 130
Dawson v. State, 210
Delaware v. Prouse, 54
Doe v. Miller, 214
Douglas v. California, 296
Estelle v. Gamble, 226
Farmer v. Brennan, 222
Florida v. Bostick, 46
Furman v. Georgia, 245
Gideon v. Wainwright, 62
Gregg v. Georgia, 246
Harmelin v. Michigan, 204
Hudson v. McMillian, 224
Hudson v. Palmer, 229
In re Gault, 259
In re Grand Jury Investigation, 143
In re Grand Jury Subpoena, 140
In re Winship, 169
In re Winship, 273
Jacobson v. United States, 33
Johnson v. Louisiana, 181
Katz v. United States, 43
Kent v. United States, 258
Kumho Tire Company, Ltd., et al., v. Patrick Carmichael, et al., 149
Kyles v. Whitley, 77
Lawrence v. Texas, 12
Libretti v. United States, 105
Lightner v. State, 25
Lockhart v. McCree, 70
Mapp v. Ohio, 39
Marbury v. Madison, 289
McKeiver v. Pennsylvania, 274
Michael Nowell v. City of Cincinnati, et al., 156
Michigan v. McMahan, 184
Miller v. Pate, 76
Minnesota v. Reha, 14
Miranda v. Arizona, 58
Morissette v. United States, 18
New York v. Quarles, 60
Nix v. Whiteside, 87
North Carolina v. Alford, 107
People v. Basciano, 116
People v. Rokicki, 8
Planned Parenthood of Southeastern Pennsylvania v. Casey, 293
Reynolds v. United States, 9
Robinson v. California, 6
Roper v. Simmons, 250
Santobello v. New York, 100

- Schall v. Martin, 272
Sheppard v. Maxwell, 89
Spratt v. Rhode Island Department of Cor-
rections, 231
Stack v. Boyle, 94
Stanford v. Kentucky, 250
State v. Campbell, 285
State v. Dalton, 17
State v. Davis, 102
State v. Johnson, 29
State v. Long, 113
Strickland v. Washington, 83
Tennessee v. Garner, 24
Terry v. Ohio, 50
Trammel v. United States, 144
U.S. v. Gonzalez-Lopez, 85
United States of America v. Allen J. (a Ju-
venile), 136
United States of America v. Jean Brito, 158
United States of America v. Melvin Troy
Two Shields, 161
United States v. Arney, 200
United States v. Booker, 207
United States v. Brown, 121
United States v. Gementera, 212
United States v. Grayson, 216
United States v. Layton, 123
United States v. Leon, 41
United States v. Maxwell, 119
United States v. Mezzanatto, 125
United States v. Ross, 196
United States v. Salerno, 96
United States v. Sewell, 37
United States v. Shinault, 190
United States v. Stewart, 128
United States v. Thomas, 198
United States v. Withorn, 127
United States v. Young, 282
Victor v. Nebraska, 173
Wainwright v. Witt, 193
Wayte v. United States, 79
Wilkerson v. Utah, 244
Williams v. Florida, 71
Wilson v. Seiter, 228
Wisconsin v. Yoder, 10