

**CHILDREN,
TRIBES, AND STATES**

*Adoption and Custody Conflicts
over American Indian Children*

Barbara Ann Atwood
Mary Anne Richey Professor of Law
James E. Rogers College of Law
The University of Arizona

CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS
Durham, North Carolina

Copyright © 2010
Barbara Ann Atwood
All Rights Reserved

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Atwood, Barbara Ann, 1947-

Children, tribes, and states : adoption and custody conflicts over American Indian children / Barbara Ann Atwood.

p. cm.

ISBN 978-1-59460-522-2 (alk. paper)

1. Indian children--Legal status, laws, etc.--United States. 2. Custody of children--Law and legislation--United States. 3. Adoption--Law and legislation--United States. I. Title.

KF8210.C45A98 2010

346.7301'73--dc22

2009048878

CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS
700 Kent Street
Durham, North Carolina 27701
Telephone (919) 489-7486
Fax (919) 493-5668
www.cap-press.com

Printed in the United States of America

To Peter, Aaron, and Charles

Contents

Acknowledgments	xi
Introduction	3
Chapter One • A Child’s Indian Identity	17
Part One. Indian Identity	19
A. Modern Realities	19
B. Tribal Sovereignty — A Preliminary Comment	25
C. The Indian Child as Key to Survival	29
D. Tribal Membership — Evolution, Meaning, Implications	34
Part Two. The Child’s Perspective on Indian Identity	46
Conclusion	54
Chapter Two • Tribal Courts, Tribal Jurisdiction	57
Part One. Tribal Courts	60
Part Two. Tribal Jurisdiction in Family Disputes	71
A. Supreme Court Jurisprudence	72
B. Mapping a Jurisdictional Framework	81
Part Three. Intersystem Recognition — Moving from Comity to Uniform Law	90
A. Comity	90
B. The Impact of Uniform Child Custody Jurisdiction Law	94
Conclusion	109
Chapter Three • Tribal Family Law	113
Part One. The Distinctive Voice of Tribal Courts in Family Disputes	116
A. Sources of Law	116
B. The Parent-Child Relationship	121
C. The Role of Extended Family Members	133

Part Two. Adoption from a Tribal Perspective	142
A. The Anglo-American Approach, in Brief	142
B. Tribal Perspectives	144
Conclusion	150
Chapter Four • The Indian Child Welfare Act — Policies and Controversies	153
Part One. Structure and Operation of Indian Child Welfare Act	155
A. Background	155
B. Overview of ICWA	163
i. Findings and Definitions	163
ii. Jurisdictional Provisions	169
iii. Procedural Protections	174
iv. Placement Preferences	181
C. <i>Mississippi Band of Choctaw Indians v. Holyfield</i>	182
Part Two. Debating ICWA Policy	185
A. The Question of Race and Individual Rights	185
B. Effectiveness of ICWA	193
Conclusion	200
Chapter Five • Flashpoints under ICWA	201
Part One. The Existing Indian Family Exception	204
A. Origin of the Doctrine	204
B. Constitutional Implications	209
C. Policy Concerns	216
Part Two. Good Cause Exception to Placement Preferences	217
A. The Statutory Standard of § 1915 and Children’s “Best Interests”	217
B. Construing § 1915 to Preclude a “Best Interests” Determination	223
Part Three. Looking beyond the Grand Narrative	229
Part Four. Legislative Proposals	241
Conclusion	247
Chapter Six • Permanency Alternatives for Indian Children	251
Part One. The Combined Impact of ICWA and ASFA	253
A. Policies Underlying ASFA	253
B. The Interface of ICWA and ASFA	260
Part Two. Permanency for Indian Children in State Court Proceedings	268
Part Three. Tribal Visions of Permanency	273
Conclusion	280

Chapter Seven • The Voice of the Indian Child	283
Part One. The Child's Right of Participation under ICWA and Other Federal Law	286
Part Two. Indigenous Children's Right of Participation under International Law and Tribal Law	293
Part Three. Promise and Peril of Increasing Children's Participation under ICWA	300
Conclusion	314
Index	317

Acknowledgments

No academic book project is ever a solitary endeavor, and this work is no exception. I am indebted to many people who committed time and thought to helping me sharpen the writing and clarify my thinking. I thank my colleagues Jim Anaya, Paul Bennett, Ellen Bublick, Robert Glennon, Kenney Hegland, Robert Hershey, James Hopkins, Jane Korn, Kay Kavanagh, Andy Silverman, Melissa Tatum, Brent White, and Robert Williams for conversation and extremely helpful feedback on drafts of chapters and earlier works that have been revised for the book. Former Dean Toni Massaro was a source of steady encouragement and an inspiration by example.

I have had great luck in hiring talented student research assistants that helped immensely with various aspects of this project. They include Izetta Chambers, Sarah Collier, Guadalupe Gutierrez, Celeste Hall, Meaghan Kramer, Leslie Lorenzano, Deborah Moulton, Rebecca Stahl, Kara Thompson, and Sam Young. Leslie Lorenzano deserves special thanks for her steadfast reading of every chapter. I have also benefitted enormously from the skill and generous assistance from expert reference librarians at the James E. Rogers College of Law, including especially Maureen Garmon and Alexandra Delgado. Sean Crane and Shaun Esposito also were terrific in responding to targeted research requests. Carol Ward, Barb Lopez, and Judith Parker provided skillful (and cheerful) word processing and editing assistance.

In addition, I appreciate the insights about tribal court jurisprudence and Native ways of viewing the world that I've received from numerous tribal judges, including Hon. Lucilda Valenzuela of the Tohono O'odham Tribal Judiciary, Hon. Fred Lomayesva of the Hopi Tribal Court, Hon. Violet Lui Frank of the San Carlos Apache Tribal Court, and Hon. Carol Redcherries, of the Northern Cheyenne Tribal court.

I presented many of the ideas expressed in this book at colloquia and conferences over a number of years, including the Fourth Annual Wells Conference on Adoption Law at Capital University in Columbus, Ohio, in 2008; the 2008 North American Regional Conference of the International Society of Family Law in Vancouver, Canada; the 2008 Annual Conference of South-

western Indian Law Clinics, in Albuquerque, New Mexico; the 4th World Congress on the Rights of the Child in Capetown, South Africa, in 2005; the Robert N. Endries Distinguished Faculty Workshop at Syracuse University College of Law in 2002; the 2001 North American Regional Conference of the International Family Law Society in Kingston, Ontario; and the Annual Tribal-State Judges Forum in 1999, in Phoenix, Arizona. I always benefitted from the comments and suggestions of participants at these events.

The book builds on a series of related articles that I've authored in the last two decades, and I am grateful to the law reviews for permission to publish portions of those articles in substantially revised form. Deep appreciation goes to the *Arizona Law Review*,¹ *Nebraska Law Review*,² *UCLA Law Review*,³ *Minnesota Law Review*, *Emory Law Journal*,⁴ and *Capital Law Review*.⁵

I am deeply grateful to Keith Sipe and Carolina Academic Press for publishing this book. Among the various people who worked on the project, Karen Clayton deserves special praise for her professionalism and patience throughout the editing and production process.

Finally, I thank my husband Peter Eisner, a true partner in all that I do. His rock-solid strength, energy, and creative vision never cease to amaze me.

1. *Voice of the Indian Child: Strengthening the Indian Child Welfare Act Through Children's Participation*, 50 *ARIZ. L. REV.* 127 (2008).

2. *Tribal Jurisprudence and Cultural Meanings of the Family*, 79 *NEB. L. REV.* 577 (2000).

3. *Fighting Over Indian Children: The Uses and Abuses of Jurisdictional Ambiguity*, 36 *UCLA L. REV.* 1051 (1989).

4. *Flashpoints under the Indian Child Welfare Act: Toward a New Understanding of State Court Resistance*, 51 *EMORY L.J.* 587 (2002).

5. *Achieving Permanency for American Indian and Alaska Native Children: Lessons from Tribal Traditions*, 37 *CAP. U. L. REV.* 239 (2008).