

Crime Victim Rights and Remedies

Crime Victim Rights and Remedies

Second Edition

Peggy M. Tobolowsky
Mario T. Gaboury
Arrick L. Jackson
Ashley G. Blackburn

CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS
Durham, North Carolina

Copyright © 2010
Peggy M. Tobolowsky, Mario T. Gaboury,
Arrick L. Jackson, Ashley G. Blackburn
All Rights Reserved

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Crime victim rights and remedies / Peggy M. Tobolowsky ... [et al.]. -- 2nd ed.

p. cm.

Rev. ed. of: Crime victim rights and remedies / Peggy M. Tobolowsky.
c2001.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-59460-578-9 (alk. paper)

1. Victims of crimes--Legal status, laws, etc.--United States. I. Tobolowsky, Peggy M., 1952- II. Tobolowsky, Peggy M., 1952- Crime victim rights and remedies. III. Title.

KF9763.T63 2010
344.7303'288--dc22

2009039191

CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS
700 Kent Street
Durham, North Carolina 27701
Telephone (919) 489-7486
Fax (919) 493-5668
www.cap-press.com

Printed in the United States of America

*Dedicated to our families
and to our colleagues at
the University of North Texas
and the University of New Haven.*

Contents

Preface	xiii
Chapter 1 • The Return of Crime Victim Rights and Remedies	3
Introduction	3
The Crime Victim in Ancient and Pre-Modern Times	4
The Initial Role of the Crime Victim in the United States	5
The Renewal of Interest in Crime Victims	6
The Emergence of the Victims' Movement	8
The President's Task Force on Victims of Crime	10
Crime Victim Rights and Remedies: Then and Now	11
Chapter 2 • Crime Victim Rights of Participation in the Criminal Justice Process: An Introduction	15
The Definition of a "Victim"	16
The Definition of a "Crime"	19
Conclusion	21
Chapter 3 • The Right to Notice of Proceedings and Outcomes in the Criminal Justice Process	23
Notice of the Existence of Victim Rights	23
Constitutional and Legislative Action	23
Judicial Interpretation	25
Implementation and Analysis of the Right	26
Notice of Important Proceedings and Outcomes in the Criminal Justice Process	28
President's Task Force and <i>New Directions from the Field</i> Recommendations	28
Constitutional and Legislative Response	29
Judicial Interpretation	34
State Cases	34
Federal Cases	40

Implementation and Analysis of the Right	43
Conclusion	46
Chapter 4 • The Right to Be Present at Criminal Justice Proceedings	49
Introduction	49
President's Task Force and <i>New Directions from the Field</i>	
Recommendations	50
Constitutional and Legislative Response	52
Judicial Interpretation	56
State Cases	56
Federal Cases	59
Implementation and Analysis of the Right	62
Conclusion	64
Chapter 5 • The Right to Be Heard Regarding Charging Decisions and Pleas	65
The Right to Be Heard Regarding the Initiation or Dismissal of a Charge	66
President's Task Force and <i>New Directions from the Field</i>	
Recommendations	66
Constitutional and Legislative Response	67
Judicial Interpretation	69
Overview	69
State and Federal Cases	70
Implementation and Analysis of the Right	74
Conclusion	76
The Right to Be Heard Regarding Plea Negotiations and Agreements	76
President's Task Force and <i>New Directions from the Field</i>	
Recommendations	77
Constitutional and Legislative Response	77
Judicial Interpretation	80
State Cases	80
Federal Cases	82
Implementation and Analysis of the Right	84
Conclusion	89
Chapter 6 • The Right to Be Heard Regarding Sentencing and Parole	91
The Right to Be Heard Regarding Sentencing	91
President's Task Force and <i>New Directions from the Field</i>	
Recommendations	91

Constitutional and Legislative Response	93
Judicial Interpretation	95
Capital Cases	96
Noncapital State Cases	100
Noncapital Federal Cases	104
Implementation and Analysis of the Right	108
Utilization of the Right	108
Impact on Criminal Justice System Administration and Efficiency	111
Impact on Sentencing Outcome	112
Impact on Victim Satisfaction	117
Conclusion	118
The Right to Be Heard Regarding Parole	119
President's Task Force and <i>New Directions from the Field</i>	
Recommendations	119
Constitutional and Legislative Response	120
Judicial Interpretation	123
Implementation and Analysis of the Right	124
Conclusion	129
Chapter 7 • Remedies for Victim Rights Violations	131
Constitutional and Legislative Action	132
Federal Provisions	132
State Provisions	134
Judicial Interpretation	138
State Cases	138
Federal Cases	143
Implementation and Analysis	145
Conclusion	149
Chapter 8 • Restitution	151
Introduction	151
President's Task Force and <i>New Directions from the Field</i>	
Recommendations	153
Constitutional and Legislative Response	155
Judicial Interpretation	160
Federal Cases	160
State Cases	163
Implementation and Analysis of the Remedy	165
Recovery of Victim Economic Loss	167

Recovery of Victim Psychological Loss and Victim Satisfaction	174
Reduced System Intrusiveness and Offender Recidivism	176
Reduced System Costs and Enhanced System Credibility	179
Conclusion	181
Chapter 9 • Crime Victim Compensation	183
Introduction	183
President's Task Force and <i>New Directions from the Field</i>	
Recommendations	184
Constitutional and Legislative Response	186
Judicial Interpretation	190
Implementation and Analysis of the Remedy	192
Utilization of the Remedy	193
Low Visibility of the Remedy	197
Limited Program Staff and Funding	199
Victim Cooperation and Satisfaction	201
Conclusion	204
Chapter 10 • Civil Litigation	205
Introduction	205
Constitutional and Legislative Action	207
Judicial Interpretation	209
Intentional Tort and Related Direct Actions	209
Third Party Actions	213
Special Relationships Creating Duties of Reasonable Care	214
Duty to Control or to Warn of the Conduct of Others	220
Implementation and Analysis of the Remedy	223
Conclusion	225
Chapter 11 • The Future of Crime Victim Rights and Remedies	227
Introduction	227
Visions of the Future	228
Conclusion	234
Appendix 1 • President's Task Force on Victims of Crime Action	
Recommendations	235
Proposed Executive and Legislative Action at the Federal and State Levels	235
Recommendations for Federal and State Action	235
Proposed Federal Action	237

Proposed Action for Criminal Justice System Agencies	238
Recommendations for Police	238
Recommendations for Prosecutors	238
Recommendations for the Judiciary	239
Recommendations for Parole Boards	240
Recommendations for Other Organizations	240
Recommendations for Hospitals	240
Recommendations for the Ministry	241
Recommendations for the Bar	241
Recommendations for Schools	241
Recommendations for the Mental Health Community	242
Recommendations for the Private Sector	242
A Proposed Amendment to the Constitution	242
Appendix 2 • Proposed Federal Victim Rights Constitutional Amendment	245
Appendix 3 • State Victim Rights Constitutional Provisions	247
Alabama	247
Alaska	247
Arizona	248
California	249
Colorado	254
Connecticut	255
Florida	255
Idaho	256
Illinois	257
Indiana	257
Kansas	258
Louisiana	258
Maryland	259
Michigan	259
Mississippi	260
Missouri	260
Montana	261
Nebraska	262
Nevada	262
New Jersey	263
New Mexico	263
North Carolina	264

Ohio	265
Oklahoma	266
Oregon	266
Rhode Island	270
South Carolina	271
Tennessee	272
Texas	273
Utah	274
Virginia	274
Washington	275
Wisconsin	276
Notes	277
Table of Cases	339
Index	347

Preface

In 1982, President Ronald Reagan convened a Task Force on Victims of Crime. The recommendations made by this national Task Force have served as a guide for the development of crime victim rights and remedies in this country. In 2001, the initial edition of this text was published. It brought together a multifaceted set of materials reflecting the evolution of crime victim rights and remedies in the approximately twenty years since the Task Force's recommendations were published. The initial text described the applicable constitutional and statutory provisions addressing crime victim rights and remedies, as well as leading judicial opinions that interpreted them. In addition to presenting the current state of the law in this area, the text described the status of implementation of these rights and remedies, relevant empirical research, and a sampling of the pertinent policy analysis. This comprehensive portrait of the past and then current status of crime victim rights and remedies in this country was designed to inform the continued evolution of law and practice in this area.

In the years since the publishing of the initial edition of this text, the constitutional and statutory law in this area and judicial interpretation of it have continued to evolve, as well as the empirical research analyzing its development and implementation. Of particular note is the enactment of the federal Crime Victims' Rights Act of 2004, reflecting a significant expansion of federal statutory victim rights, and the federal court decisions that have begun to interpret it. Thus, this new edition of the text extends and expands the comprehensive description of crime victim rights and remedies provided in the initial edition. Now, almost thirty years since the President's Task Force issued its recommendations, progress in their implementation can once again be measured.

It is hoped that this new edition of the text will further facilitate the study of victim rights and remedies, and will serve as a general resource for those interested in victim rights and remedies in this country.