Crime Victim Rights
and Remedies
Crime Victim Rights and Remedies

Second Edition

Peggy M. Tobolowsky
Mario T. Gaboury
Arrick L. Jackson
Ashley G. Blackburn

Carolina Academic Press
Durham, North Carolina
Dedicated to our families
and to our colleagues at
the University of North Texas
and the University of New Haven.
Contents

Preface xiii

Chapter 1 • The Return of Crime Victim Rights and Remedies 3
    Introduction 3
    The Crime Victim in Ancient and Pre-Modern Times 4
    The Initial Role of the Crime Victim in the United States 5
    The Renewal of Interest in Crime Victims 6
    The Emergence of the Victims’ Movement 8
    The President’s Task Force on Victims of Crime 10
    Crime Victim Rights and Remedies: Then and Now 11

Chapter 2 • Crime Victim Rights of Participation in the Criminal Justice Process: An Introduction 15
    The Definition of a “Victim” 16
    The Definition of a “Crime” 19
    Conclusion 21

Chapter 3 • The Right to Notice of Proceedings and Outcomes in the Criminal Justice Process 23
    Notice of the Existence of Victim Rights 23
        Constitutional and Legislative Action 23
        Judicial Interpretation 25
        Implementation and Analysis of the Right 26
    Notice of Important Proceedings and Outcomes in the Criminal Justice Process 28
        President’s Task Force and New Directions from the Field 28
            Recommendations 28
        Constitutional and Legislative Response 29
        Judicial Interpretation 34
            State Cases 34
            Federal Cases 40

vii
CONTENTS

Implementation and Analysis of the Right 43
Conclusion 46

Chapter 4 · The Right to Be Present at Criminal Justice Proceedings 49
Introduction 49
President’s Task Force and New Directions from the Field
Recommendations 50
Constitutional and Legislative Response 52
Judicial Interpretation 56
State Cases 56
Federal Cases 59
Implementation and Analysis of the Right 62
Conclusion 64

Chapter 5 · The Right to Be Heard Regarding Charging Decisions and Pleas 65
The Right to Be Heard Regarding the Initiation or Dismissal of a Charge 66
President’s Task Force and New Directions from the Field
Recommendations 66
Constitutional and Legislative Response 67
Judicial Interpretation 69
Overview 69
State and Federal Cases 70
Implementation and Analysis of the Right 74
Conclusion 76

The Right to Be Heard Regarding Plea Negotiations and Agreements 76
President’s Task Force and New Directions from the Field
Recommendations 77
Constitutional and Legislative Response 77
Judicial Interpretation 80
State Cases 80
Federal Cases 82
Implementation and Analysis of the Right 84
Conclusion 89

Chapter 6 · The Right to Be Heard Regarding Sentencing and Parole 91
The Right to Be Heard Regarding Sentencing 91
President’s Task Force and New Directions from the Field
Recommendations 91
CONTENTS ix

Constitutional and Legislative Response 93
Judicial Interpretation 95
   Capital Cases 96
   Noncapital State Cases 100
   Noncapital Federal Cases 104
Implementation and Analysis of the Right 108
   Utilization of the Right 108
   Impact on Criminal Justice System Administration and Efficiency 111
   Impact on Sentencing Outcome 112
   Impact on Victim Satisfaction 117
Conclusion 118
The Right to Be Heard Regarding Parole 119
   President's Task Force and New Directions from the Field
      Recommendations 119
Constitutional and Legislative Response 120
Judicial Interpretation 123
Implementation and Analysis of the Right 124
Conclusion 129

Chapter 7 • Remedies for Victim Rights Violations 131
Constitutional and Legislative Action 132
   Federal Provisions 132
   State Provisions 134
Judicial Interpretation 138
   State Cases 138
   Federal Cases 143
Implementation and Analysis 145
Conclusion 149

Chapter 8 • Restitution 151
Introduction 151
   President's Task Force and New Directions from the Field
      Recommendations 153
Constitutional and Legislative Response 155
Judicial Interpretation 160
   Federal Cases 160
   State Cases 163
Implementation and Analysis of the Remedy 165
   Recovery of Victim Economic Loss 167
Chapter 9 • Crime Victim Compensation

Introduction
President’s Task Force and New Directions from the Field
  Recommendations
Constitutional and Legislative Response
Judicial Interpretation
Implementation and Analysis of the Remedy
  Utilization of the Remedy
  Low Visibility of the Remedy
  Limited Program Staff and Funding
  Victim Cooperation and Satisfaction
Conclusion

Chapter 10 • Civil Litigation

Introduction
Constitutional and Legislative Action
Judicial Interpretation
  Intentional Tort and Related Direct Actions
  Third Party Actions
    Special Relationships Creating Duties of Reasonable Care
    Duty to Control or to Warn of the Conduct of Others
Implementation and Analysis of the Remedy
Conclusion

Chapter 11 • The Future of Crime Victim Rights and Remedies

Introduction
Visions of the Future
Conclusion

Appendix 1 • President’s Task Force on Victims of Crime Action
  Recommendations
  Proposed Executive and Legislative Action at the Federal and State Levels
  Recommendations for Federal and State Action
  Proposed Federal Action
## CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Proposed Action for Criminal Justice System Agencies</th>
<th>238</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Recommendations for Police</td>
<td>238</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recommendations for Prosecutors</td>
<td>238</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recommendations for the Judiciary</td>
<td>239</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recommendations for Parole Boards</td>
<td>240</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recommendations for Other Organizations</td>
<td>240</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recommendations for Hospitals</td>
<td>240</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recommendations for the Ministry</td>
<td>241</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recommendations for the Bar</td>
<td>241</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recommendations for Schools</td>
<td>241</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recommendations for the Mental Health Community</td>
<td>242</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recommendations for the Private Sector</td>
<td>242</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A Proposed Amendment to the Constitution</td>
<td>242</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Appendix 2 • Proposed Federal Victim Rights Constitutional Amendment

### Appendix 3 • State Victim Rights Constitutional Provisions

- Alabama                                             | 247 |
- Alaska                                              | 247 |
- Arizona                                              | 248 |
- California                                           | 249 |
- Colorado                                             | 254 |
- Connecticut                                          | 255 |
- Florida                                              | 255 |
- Idaho                                                | 256 |
- Illinois                                             | 257 |
- Indiana                                              | 257 |
- Kansas                                               | 258 |
- Louisiana                                            | 258 |
- Maryland                                             | 259 |
- Michigan                                             | 259 |
- Mississippi                                          | 260 |
- Missouri                                             | 260 |
- Montana                                              | 261 |
- Nebraska                                             | 262 |
- Nevada                                               | 262 |
- New Jersey                                           | 263 |
- New Mexico                                           | 263 |
- North Carolina                                        | 264 |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>State</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ohio</td>
<td>265</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oklahoma</td>
<td>266</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oregon</td>
<td>266</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rhode Island</td>
<td>270</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South Carolina</td>
<td>271</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tennessee</td>
<td>272</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Texas</td>
<td>273</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Utah</td>
<td>274</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Virginia</td>
<td>274</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Washington</td>
<td>275</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wisconsin</td>
<td>276</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Notes 277

Table of Cases 339

Index 347
Preface

In 1982, President Ronald Reagan convened a Task Force on Victims of Crime. The recommendations made by this national Task Force have served as a guide for the development of crime victim rights and remedies in this country. In 2001, the initial edition of this text was published. It brought together a multifaceted set of materials reflecting the evolution of crime victim rights and remedies in the approximately twenty years since the Task Force’s recommendations were published. The initial text described the applicable constitutional and statutory provisions addressing crime victim rights and remedies, as well as leading judicial opinions that interpreted them. In addition to presenting the current state of the law in this area, the text described the status of implementation of these rights and remedies, relevant empirical research, and a sampling of the pertinent policy analysis. This comprehensive portrait of the past and then current status of crime victim rights and remedies in this country was designed to inform the continued evolution of law and practice in this area.

In the years since the publishing of the initial edition of this text, the constitutional and statutory law in this area and judicial interpretation of it have continued to evolve, as well as the empirical research analyzing its development and implementation. Of particular note is the enactment of the federal Crime Victims’ Rights Act of 2004, reflecting a significant expansion of federal statutory victim rights, and the federal court decisions that have begun to interpret it. Thus, this new edition of the text extends and expands the comprehensive description of crime victim rights and remedies provided in the initial edition. Now, almost thirty years since the President’s Task Force issued its recommendations, progress in their implementation can once again be measured.

It is hoped that this new edition of the text will further facilitate the study of victim rights and remedies, and will serve as a general resource for those interested in victim rights and remedies in this country.