

LANDSCAPE, HERITAGE, AND CONSERVATION

FARMING ISSUES IN THE EUROPEAN UNION

Edited by
Pamela J. Stewart and Andrew Strathern

CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS

Durham, North Carolina

Copyright © 2010
Pamela J. Stewart, Andrew Strathern
All Rights Reserved

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Landscape, heritage, and conservation : farming issues in the European Union / edited by Pamela J. Stewart and Andrew Strathern.

p. cm. -- (European anthropology series)

ISBN 978-1-59460-774-5 (alk. paper)

1. Agriculture--Economic aspects--Scotland. 2. Agriculture--Economic aspects--European Union countries. 3. Agriculture and state--Scotland. 4. Agriculture and state--European Union countries. I. Stewart, Pamela J. II. Strathern, Andrew. III. Title. IV. Series.

HD1930.S4L36 2010

338.1'84--dc22

2009049131

Front cover photo: Sheep resting in shade of tree, near the Reelan River, County Donegal, Republic of Ireland. This is an in-bye area with out-bye areas beyond it up hill. July 12, 2009. (Photo: Pamela J. Stewart/Andrew Strathern Archive)

Back cover photo: Tributary stream running into the Isla River near Forter, Glen Isla, Perthshire, Scotland. Mountain streams are an important part of LFA ecosystems, providing pasture for stock and habitats for wildlife. June 24, 2009. (Photo: Pamela J. Stewart/Andrew Strathern Archive)

CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS
700 Kent Street
Durham, North Carolina 27701
Telephone (919) 489-7486
Fax (919) 493-5668
www.cap-press.com

Printed in the United States of America

We dedicate this book to all of the farming families who have opened their homes to us, sharing their stories, their scones, and their vitality for life.

PJS and AJS, Editors

LIST OF FIGURES AND MAPS

Figure 1.1.	Farm steading and sheep at head of Glen Afton, Ayrshire, Scotland.	2
Figure 1.2.	Drumderg Wind Farm, near Alyth, Perthshire, Scotland.	10
Figure 1.3.	Sheep with prize rosettes on display.	16
Figure 1.4.	View of Glen Isla, Perthshire, Scotland.	19
Figure 1.5.	Old Rowantree in berry, near Dalvanie, Glen Isla, Perthshire, Scotland.	21
Figure 2.1.	The River Ayr at Catrine, Ayrshire, Scotland.	27
Figure 2.2.	Blacksidend Hill.	37
Figure 2.3.	Ayrshire dairy cow.	40
Figure 2.4.	Friesian/Holstein cattle lined up for inspection.	41
Map 3.1.	Geographical Distribution of LFAs in Europe based on Council Directive 268/75.	49
Map 3.2.	Teviotdale (showing the location of hill sheep farms).	52
Figure 3.1.	Population of Teviothead, 1850–1950.	53
Figure 3.2.	Teviotdale Landscapes (A–F).	55
Map 3.3.	Less favoured areas (LFAs) and areas of European nature conservation interest (EECONET) in the EU.	66
Map 3.4.	Initial Estimate of distribution of HNV farmland in Europe (EU-15). (Potential HNV farmland according to minimum Corine selection.)	67
Map 5.1.	Cairngorms National Park Boundaries.	108
Figure 5.2.	Stalker and Ghillie at Glenlivet.	125
Figure 5.3.	Hillwalkers on a day out.	125
Map 5.2.	Cairngorms National Park Boundary Proposed Expansion.	136
Figure 7.1.	Agricultural area in use as a percentage of total land area, by county, 2007.	172
Figure 7.2.	Development in policy design in Norway.	178
Figure 7.3.	Development in policy design in the EU.	178

Figure 7.4.	Agricultural area in Norway, total and by main crops, 1959–2007.	180
Figure 7.5.	Number of holdings in operation, total labour input (as man-years) in agriculture and working hours per holding, 1959–2007.	180
Figure 7.6.	Relative composition of total net family income 1996–2005.	181
Figure 7.7	Relative composition of total net family income by farm type in 2005.	182
Figure 7.8.	Subsidies to agriculture in 2005.	183
Figure 7.9.	Proportion of residents with access to recreational areas by counties in 2004.	188
Figure 11.1.	View of valley area near Finntown, County Donegal, Republic of Ireland.	276
Figure 11.2.	Friesian/Holstein dairy cattle grazing in large field.	283
Figure 11.3.	Young Charollais cattle in field near Convoy, County Donegal, Republic of Ireland.	284
Figure 11.4.	Sheep on a rainy day, near Eastertown Farm.	289
Figure 11.5.	Large multi-purpose tractor in field near Gilmilnscroft, Sorn, Ayrshire, Scotland.	291

CONTENTS

List of Figures of Maps	vii
About the Editors	xiii
Series Editors' Preface	xvii
Acknowledgments	xix
Chapter 1 • Overview: Policies, Practices, and Perspectives on Farming and Conservation	
<i>Pamela J. Stewart and Andrew Strathern</i>	3
References	22
Chapter 2 • Heritage, Farming, Conservation and Displacements in Scotland	
<i>Andrew Strathern and Pamela J. Stewart</i>	25
I. Overview: Topics and Issues	25
II. Conservation and Farming: Some Dimensions of Analysis	32
Notes	42
References	43
Chapter 3 • Less Favoured Areas in the European Union: Pretty and [Un]Economic Landscapes in the Scottish Borders	
<i>John Gray</i>	45
Landscape	45
Imagined Landscapes: Common Agricultural Policy and the Less Favoured Area Scheme 1975 to Early 1990s	47
Practical Landscapes: Hill Sheep Farming in the Scottish Borders	51
Topography, Weather, Livestock and Forms of Tenure	51
Landscape	54
Sculpting Productive Landscape: Appropriation of LFA and CAP Policies	58

Price Support Schemes	58
Structural Measures: Improvement and Development Grants	59
Less Favoured Area Compensatory Payments	60
Intensification and Diversification of Hill Sheep Farms and Landscapes	61
Toward Experienced Landscapes: Less Favoured Areas in Agenda 2000 and Beyond	62
MacSharry Reforms	63
Agenda 2000 and LFA Reforms	64
Rural Development Regulation	65
Landscape Futures: From the Agricultural to the Rural	65
Conclusion	68
References	70
 Chapter 4 • Pastoralism, Predation and Politics in the French Pyrenees	
<i>Bryan Cummins</i>	75
Pastoralism: Historical Overview of Land Tenure	75
Brown Bear Predation and Pyrenean Response	78
The Politics of Bear Reintroduction	79
Compensation for Livestock Damage	93
The Patou and Prevention of Predation	99
A Balanced Eco-system with Large Predators?	102
Conclusion	104
Note	105
References	105
 Chapter 5 • Place, Politics and Power in the Cairngorms National Park: Landscape, Heritage and Conservation	
<i>Kathy Rettie</i>	107
The Meaning of Place	110
Power and Process	124
Drawing Boundaries	129
Conclusion	135
References	137
 Chapter 6 • From an Agricultural to a Rural Policy in Europe: Changing Agriculture, Farm Households, Policies and Ideas	
<i>John M. Bryden</i>	141
Overview	141

Changes in Farming, Agricultural Employment, and Incomes in Western Europe	145
Changing Farm Structures	146
Agricultural Incomes	148
Upstream and Downstream Industries	149
Farm Family Survival and Development Strategies	151
Individual Strategies	151
Alternative Agriculture as a Dimension of Pluriactivity	153
Collective Strategies	154
Multifunctionality	154
Policy and Institutional Issues	156
Conclusions	157
References	160
Tables	163
 Chapter 7 • Multifunctional Agriculture and Rural Development — A Story from Norway	
<i>Karen Refsgaard</i>	169
The Importance of Rurality for the Norwegian Development	169
The Rural and Agricultural Landscape of Norway	170
Farmland, Farms, Farmers and Multifunctionality	171
Rural and Agricultural Policies	173
Agricultural Policies	174
Changes in Policy Design	177
Farmers' Conditions under These Policy Regimes	178
Change in the Agricultural Resource Base	179
The Economic Situation in Agriculture	181
The Rural-Urban Linkages in Norway	184
The Link to the Urban Communities	186
Discussion	190
References	190
 Chapter 8 • Euroliberal Pastoralism and Rural Development in Southern Spain	
<i>Richard Maddox</i>	195
Rural Development, Euroliberal Pastoralism, and Southern Spain	197
The Countryside	200
The Town	204
Public Enterprise, Cultural Transformation, and Local Society	208

Development and Local Politics	213
Cultural Politics: Neocommunalism, the Pueblo That No Longer Exists, and Euroliberalism	215
References: Documents	221
References: Books and Articles	221
 Chapter 9 • Contesting Consumption: Changing Meanings of Landscape in Northern Italy	
<i>Jaro Stacul</i>	225
Introduction	225
Whose Landscape?	228
The Material and Symbolic Cultivation of Landscape	233
Conclusion	237
Notes	239
References	239
 Chapter 10 • The <i>Einheimischenmodelle</i> in Bavaria	
<i>Francesca Merlan</i>	243
Introduction	244
Problems Exemplified: Garmisch-Partenkirchen at the Foot of the Alps	247
Regulation and Planning: Comparative Notes	249
Active Preservation: The <i>Einheimischenmodelle</i>	250
Planning Process	254
Planning and Belonging: Interlocking Levels and Key Issues	256
U.S. Comparison	269
Conclusion	273
References	273
 Epilogue • Bureaucracy, Crisis, and the Question of Survival	
<i>Andrew Strathern and Pamela J. Stewart</i>	277
Envoi: Language, Culture, Farming	290
References	295
 Appendix	297
 List of Contributors	309
 Index	311

ABOUT THE EDITORS

Pamela J. Stewart and Andrew Strathern are a wife and husband research team with a long history of joint publications and research. They are based in the Department of Anthropology, University of Pittsburgh and are also Visiting Research Fellow and Visiting Professor, Department of Anthropology, University of Durham; Visiting Research Fellows in the Research Institute of Irish and Scottish Studies, University of Aberdeen; and have been Visiting Research Fellows, at the Institute of Ethnology, Academia Sinica, Taipei, Taiwan over many years. They have published many books and articles on their research in the Pacific region and in Europe (Scotland and Ireland), and in Asia (Taiwan and China). They are the editors of the *Ritual Studies Series*, and the *Medical Anthropology Series* with Carolina Academic Press. Their coauthored books include: *Witchcraft, Sorcery, Rumors and Gossip* (Cambridge University Press, 2004); and *Empowering the Past, Confronting the Future* (Palgrave Macmillan, 2004). Their co-edited books include: *Asian Ritual Systems: Syncretisms and Ruptures* (Carolina Academic Press, 2007); *Exchange and Sacrifice* (Carolina Academic Press, 2008); *Religious and Ritual Change* (Carolina Academic Press, 2009); and *Ritual* (Ashgate Publishing, forthcoming, 2010). A list of their recent writings can be found at (<http://www.pitt.edu/~strather/sandspublicat.htm>).

We often find that we are writing our manuscripts while “in the field” or as Visiting Scholars in various institutions around the world. Parts of the present book have been completed in the summer of 2009 during stays in a small place, Catrine, near to Mauchline and Kilmarnock, in Ayrshire, Scotland. Parts have also benefited greatly from our most recent 2009 field stay in Carnowen near Convooy and Raphoe, County Donegal, Ireland.

We have been visiting these and other field areas in Scotland and Ireland for many years. In Scotland there is a long time-frame of connection and history for both of us. For one of us, AJS, Catrine and Sorn are the places where some earliest years were spent, looked after partly by an eldest sister, Margaret, and an aunt (mother’s sister, Elizabeth, always known as Betty), as well as his maternal grandparents. Ancestral roots run at least four generations deep in

this part of Ayrshire on both AJS's mother's side (Sharps) and his father's side (Stratherns). These roots provide multiple connections with local farms and families throughout the surrounding countryside. One such farm is Blacksidend, whose steading is on a dominant hill that overlooks Catrine, Sorn, and many other places. It is a hillside farm, backing onto the great grassy-gray mass of Blacksidend hill behind it, and surrounded by a small number of in-bye fields that can be exploited for pasture and hay-making. We have described the Blacksidend Hill in a previous publication (Strathern and Stewart 2001: 83-85). We have learned recently (in 2009) that this farm at one time belonged to an old-established estate in the area, Gilmilnscroft. We also learned in an earlier year of research that one previous farmer in Blacksidened had run the farm in conjunction with a farm on the Sorn estate, Smiddyshaw, wintering stock in Smiddyshaw when the weather was too harsh on the hill. Details of this kind fit both into a broader picture we have been gaining of the ecology of farming and changes in estate sizes over the years, and into the personal genealogical connections we have referred to above. Other such farms in the area, for example, include Blackbriggs, Blindburn, South Blairkip, Brocklar, Kenstey, and Whiteflat, as well as Mossgiel, High and Laigh Tarbeg, and Blairmulloch. Names of this kind are the very stuff of local landscapes and history. Artifacts and possessions that have come to us one way and another are also a locus of history and genealogy: for example, books, a set of agate stones (from the Burn Ann [Awn]), a violin (said to be a great-grandparental object), and photographs (of persons and kin from the past and the present). We value all of these things, places, and people connected with them, woven together in the intricate mesh of heritage and identity, coupled with the innovations, changes, and movements in time and space that are equally a part of the history of Scotland and Ireland.

October 2009

Pamela J. Stewart (Strathern) and Andrew Strathern
Cromie Burn Research Unit
University of Pittsburgh

Reference

- Strathern, Andrew and Pamela J. Stewart (2001) *Minorities and Memories: Survivals and Extinctions in Scotland and Western Europe*. Durham, N.C.: Carolina Academic Press.



Old Farmall International tractor at Alyth Farm Show, Perthshire, Scotland, with P. J. Stewart, June 20, 2009.

(Photo: Pamela J. Stewart/Andrew Strathern Archive)



Old Allis Chalmers tractor at Alyth Farm Show, June 20, 2009, with A. Strathern. Displays of old tractors, restored and repainted, are a part of the competitions for prizes at such shows in both Scotland and Ireland.

(Photo: Pamela J. Stewart/Andrew Strathern Archive)

SERIES EDITORS' PREFACE

Pamela J. Stewart and Andrew Strathern
University of Pittsburgh

This set of studies is presented as a part of our European Anthropology Series with Carolina Academic Press, a Series which we had sought for many years to be able to develop. The aim of the Series is to publish contemporary anthropological work on topical issues in Europe, often with reference to the European Union but also maintaining traditions of fieldwork and ethnographic writings on this region of the world. Three earlier studies have appeared: (1) *Minorities and Memories: Survivals and Extinctions in Scotland and Western Europe*, Andrew Strathern and Pamela J. Stewart, 2001 (now incorporated into this Series); (2) *Bear Country: Predation, Politics, and the Changing Face of Pyrenean Pastoralism*, by Bryan Cummins, 2009, and (3) *Believing in Belfast: Charismatic Christianity after the Troubles*, by Liam Murphy, 2010.

We are grateful, as always, to Keith Sipe and everyone at Carolina Academic Press for accepting to work with us on this Series. Ethnographic scholarship on Europe has a long tradition, one that is vital to maintain given the growing importance of an enlarged Europe in the global sphere, and the enduring significance in it of what Thomas Hylland Eriksen has so aptly called "Small Places, Large Issues" (Eriksen 2001).

October 2009
Cromie Burn Research Unit
PJS and AJS

Reference

Eriksen, Thomas Hylland 2001. *Small Places, Large Issues. An Introduction to Social and Cultural Anthropology*. London: Pluto Press.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

We wish to thank the contributors to this volume for their efforts in exploring the topic of this book with us. We thank the Office of Dean N. John Cooper, Faculty and School of Arts and Sciences, at the University of Pittsburgh for long-standing support of our research and publication work. Special thanks go also to the European Union Center of Excellence in the University Center of International Studies, its Director Professor Alberta Sbragia and its efficient and friendly staff, for support, also over many years, and in regard to the March 2008 Academic Conference on the topic of this book which the Center kindly sponsored and we Co-Organized. Thanks go to Ms Catherine Rodgers for typographic assistance on sections of this volume. We also thank everyone at Carolina Academic Press for their assistance and efforts in the production of this book.

Among the many people whom we have come to know and to benefit from their conversation and their insights, observations, hospitality, and activities in both Scotland and Ireland, we would like to thank in particular the following: in the Glens area of Scotland, Anne and Charlie Simpson of Mains of Creuchies, Alyth; Jean and Brian Ruffhead of Arndean, Linross, Glamis; Hector and Jean MacLean of Balnaboth, Glen Prosen; Bob Alexander of Dalvanie and Glenshee Pottery, Glen Isla; Moira and David Clark and Alan and Morag Clark of Purgavie Farm, Glen Isla; Veronica and Norman Clark of the Hillocks, Glen Isla; “Mattie” of Caderg, Dalvanie, Glen Isla; and Lorna Davidson and her family of Meikle Forter, Glen Isla.

In Ayrshire our acquaintances, friends, and informants are very numerous. Over the years we have been helped particularly by Miss Betty Sharp (Aunt Betty, who passed away in January 2009) of 15A Newton Terrace, Catrine (see Stewart and Strathern 1997, for a poem that we wrote in partial appreciation of our time with her); Myra and Hugh Watson (Myra also died in 2009); Hugh Watson Jr. and his wife Moira of Laigh Tarbeg; Jim Watson and his wife Brenda of High Tarbeg; Alec and Nancy Wyllie of Mossgiel farm, Mauchline; Sandy Anderson of Smiddyshaw; Lindsay and Morag Clark, previously of Daldilling Farm; Matt and Yvonne Mitchell of Whatriggs Farm, with whom we became

acquainted first in 2000 and have continued to visit ever since; Margaret and Reid Sloan of Beech Cottage near Blairmulloch, Sorn (Reid now passed away); Annie and William Boyd, previously of Lanfine (Anne has been much missed since her death several years ago now); Terry Harrison, an avid collector of postcards and photographs, who first introduced us to Annie Boyd; Margaret and David Templeton, who have enthusiastically discussed farming history and kindly researched and provided us with much genealogical information; Scott Henderson of Lowhaddin beside High Brocklar; Kenny Baird and his family of Sorn; the Borland family of Mossbog form; and in Catrine, Susan Kerr, Bob Meikle, and Eric and Nancy McAdam, good neighbors.

In Ireland, County Donegal, we thank particularly Jean and Mervyn McKean of The Hall Green, Porthall, Lifford, with whom we have stayed in their historical home, and have regularly visited since; Liz and Ralph Sheppard of Carnowen, near Convoys, with whom we have enjoyed conversations of the *longue durée* since first staying with them some years ago now; Dereck Reaney and Audrey Freen of the Ulster Scots Agency in Raphoe, also Jim Devenney of Newton Cunningham and Gerald Wallace of Manor Cunningham; Bertie Bryce of Inch Island, Ulster-Scots reciter; Ian McCracken of Ardagh for many discussions on EU sponsored cross-community projects between Donegal and Northern Ireland; William McClure, a unique local “worthy” of Carnowen, whose knowledge of the area was deep and laced with humor, and whose passing in 2008 is much regretted; Bryan Wallace of Powderly farm, Carnowen, who brought to us a version of the famous Ballad of Stumpie’s Brae and is well informed on the local landscape; Samuel Fletcher of Glenmaquin, bibliophile, farmer, and poet, who introduced us to pieces of writing we had not seen before and informed us what the term “spenshil” means; and the Kelly family of Waterwheel Farm, Liscooly, who advised us about many aspects of dairy farming and history in Donegal; and, most recently (2009) Gretta and Joe Maxwell and family, of Carrickbrack, near Convoys and Carnowen, for conversations on cattle and language. It was Gretta who asked us in July 2009 to “think about us in Donegal sometimes.” We do indeed.

There are, of course, many others who have helped us over the years and we thank them all here.

Reference

- 1997 Stewart, Pamela J. and Andrew J. Strathern. Aunt Betty and Co. (Poem). *Anthropology and Humanism* 22 (2), pp 188-189.

PJS and AJS, Editors