

Judicial Appointments and Democratic Controls

Judicial Appointments and Democratic Controls

Mitchel A. Sollenberger

ASSISTANT PROFESSOR OF POLITICAL SCIENCE
UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN-DEARBORN

CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS

Durham, North Carolina

Copyright © 2011
Mitchel A. Sollenberger
All Rights Reserved

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Sollenberger, Mitchel A.

Judicial appointments and democratic controls / Mitchel A. Sollenberger.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-59460-785-1 (alk. paper)

1. Judges--Selection and appointment--United States. I. Title.

KF8776.S685 2010

347.73'14--dc22

2010036937

CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS
700 Kent Street
Durham, North Carolina 27701
Telephone (919) 489-7486
Fax (919) 493-5668
www.cap-press.com

Printed in the United States of America

*In Memory of
Bernie and Gary Smith,
beloved uncles*

Contents

Acknowledgments	ix
Introduction	3
Democratic Controls of the Judicial Appointment Process	4
Judicial Independence	11
Additional Features of the Judicial Appointment Process	12
A Broken Process?	12
Organization of the Book	13
Chapter 1 • Congress and the Federal Courts	15
The Authority of Congress to Eliminate Judicial Structure and Judgeships	17
Repeal Act of 1802	17
Reorganization of the D.C. Courts Act of 1863	21
Evarts Act of 1891	26
1913 Abolishment of the U.S. Commerce Court	26
The Federal Courts Today	31
Summary	32
Chapter 2 • Textual Direction	33
Judicial Appointments Clause	33
Recess Appointments Clause	38
Ineligibility Clause	43
Summary	48
Chapter 3 • Statutory Qualifications	51
Statutory Qualifications for Judicial Office	52
Congressional Enforcement of the Residency Requirement	54
Does the Residency Requirement Apply to the District of Columbia?	57
The D.C. Exemption: How One District Judge Changed Federal Law	64
Summary	68
Chapter 4 • The Pre-Nomination Process	69
Initial Administrative Process	70
Contemporary Practice	78
Congressional Consultation	82
Supreme Court Selections	87
House of Representatives and Minority Party Involvement	91
Summary	94

Chapter 5 • The Senate Judiciary Committee	97
Judicial Confirmation Process	98
Blue Slips	99
Committee Investigations	104
Committee Questionnaires and Financial Disclosure Reports	106
Administrative Documents and FBI Reports	109
ABA Rating	111
Courtesy Calls	113
Interest Groups	115
Committee Hearings	118
A Missed Opportunity	121
Reporting a Nominee	123
Summary	126
Chapter 6 • Senate Floor Action	129
Holds	129
Filibusters	135
Floor Votes	145
Rejections and the Practice of Senatorial Courtesy	149
Final Action: Recommitments, Reconsiderations, and Returns	153
Summary	155
Chapter 7 • Reform Proposals	157
Institutional Based Reforms	157
Academic Based Reforms	169
Interest Group Based Reforms	175
Summary	185
Chapter 8 • Conclusions	187
Democratic Controls vs. Executive Governance	188
Majority Rule vs. Minority Rights	195
Concluding Remarks	198
Appendix 1 • White House Personal Data Statement Questionnaire	203
Appendix 2 • Executive Branch Personnel Public Financial Disclosure Report	209
Appendix 3 • Senate Judiciary Committee Questionnaire for Judicial Nominees	215
Appendix 4 • Senate Judiciary Committee Financial Disclosure Report	225
Appendix 5 • Blue Slip	231
Bibliography	233
Table of Cases	251
Index	253

Acknowledgments

I owe many debts for the completion of this book. First, I thank my wife, Julie, for her patience and encouragement. I also thank my parents and family for their love and support. During the research for this book I relied heavily on the library staffs at the University of Michigan-Dearborn, University of Michigan-Ann Arbor, and George Mason University. I am grateful to them for assisting in the retrieval of books and articles that seemed impossible to find. A special appreciation goes to the staff of the Library of Congress Manuscript Reading Room and the National Archives and Records Administration who provided advice and direction in the search for lawmakers' papers and Senate Judiciary Committee documents.

Since joining the faculty at the University of Michigan-Dearborn my colleagues have encouraged and supported my development as a scholar and teacher. I want to in particular thank my department chair, Martin Herschok, who has not only proven to be an excellent leader, but has also made the department a wonderful place to work. A number of current and former colleagues, friends, and scholars have generously provided their time to discuss or read parts of this book for me. These individuals include: Richard B. Bernstein, Elaine Clark, Robert Dudley, Larry Evans, Harold Forsythe, Roger Hartley, Elizabeth Hays, Kevin Kosar, Gerald Moran, Walter Oleszek, Michael Rosano, Mark Rozell, Denis Steven Rutkus, Ronald Stockton, and Paul Sunstein. Louis Fisher remains a valuable advisor. Like many presidency and constitutional scholars, I owe him a huge debt that I feel will never be repaid. Last but not least, I want to express my appreciation of the editors and staff at the Carolina Academic Press, especially Linda Lacy, Kelly Miller, and Zoë Oakes. I value their enthusiasm and kindness in seeing this project through to the end.

I have dedicated this book to the memories of Bernie and Gary Smith. They were model uncles whose love and encouraging words I will always remember. Their loss gives me an even greater appreciation of the support and love of my remaining family members.