

Complementary and Alternative Medicine and the Law

Complementary and Alternative Medicine and the Law

Lucinda E. Jesson

HAMLIN UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW

Stacey A. Tovino

WILLIAM S. BOYD SCHOOL OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF NEVADA, LAS VEGAS

CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS

Durham, North Carolina

Copyright © 2010
Lucinda E. Jesson
Stacey A. Tovino
All Rights Reserved

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Jesson, Lucinda E.

Complementary and alternative medicine and the law / Lucinda E. Jesson and Stacey
A. Tovino.

p. cm.

ISBN 978-1-59460-767-7 (alk. paper)

1. Medical laws and legislation 2. Alternative medicine--Law and legislation--United
States. I. Tovino, Stacey A. II. Title.

KF3821.J47 2010

344.7304'1--dc22

2009051502

Carolina Academic Press
700 Kent Street
Durham, North Carolina 27701
Telephone (919) 489-7486
Fax (919) 493-5668
www.cap-press.com

Printed in the United States of America

Contents

Acknowledgments	xi
Chapter One • Introduction to Complementary and Alternative Medicine	3
I. The Increased Presence of Complementary and Alternative Medicine in the United States	3
A. Evidence of Increased Use and Attention	3
B. Why Are More People Using CAM?	5
II. What Is Complementary and Alternative Medicine?	6
A. Definitions	6
B. Overview of CAM Modalities	9
Osteopathy	9
Chiropractic	11
Massage Therapy	12
Homeopathy	13
Naturopathy	14
Dietary and Herbal Supplements	14
Spirituality	15
Acupuncture	16
Midwifery	17
C. CAM in Cultural Context	18
III. Continued Tension between CAM and Conventional Medicine	19
Marcia Angell, M.D., Jerome P. Kassirer, M.D., <i>Alternative Medicine</i> — <i>The Risks of Untested and Unregulated Remedies</i> (1983)	21
Notes and Questions	24
IV. Legal Considerations	26
A. State Police Powers: Protecting Health and Safety	26
<i>Jacobson v. Massachusetts</i>	26
Notes and Questions	30
B. Overview of the Book	30
Chapter Two • The Gatekeeper Role of Licensure	33
I. Introduction to Licensure and the Practice of Medicine	33
A. The Status of Medical Practice in the Nineteenth Century	33
B. The Flexner Report: Expanding Physician Control over Health Care through Medical School Reform	35
C. Defining the Practice of Medicine	36
D. The Ongoing Struggle to Distinguish between Providers: A Role for Regulators, Patients, or the Professions?	37
Maxwell J. Mehlman, <i>Quackery</i>	37
Notes and Questions	39

II. The Licensed Provider's Use of Complementary and Alternative Medicine	40
<i>In re George A. Guess, M.D.</i>	42
<i>State Board of Medical Examiners of Florida, v. Robert J. Rogers, M.D.</i>	45
<i>Robert C. Atkins, M.D. v. C. Maynard Guest, M.D., as Executive Secretary of the New York State Board for Professional Conduct</i>	47
Notes and Questions	50
Comment: Complaint and Investigation Process	51
Notes and Questions	53
Problem	55
III. Unlicensed Providers and the Practice of Medicine	56
A. From Prayer to Healing Touch	57
<i>Curley v. State of Florida</i>	58
<i>Board of Medical Quality Assurance v. Arthur Andrews</i>	60
Notes and Questions	63
Michael H. Cohen, <i>Healing at the Borderland of Medicine and Religion: Regulating Potential Abuse of Authority by Spiritual Healers</i>	64
Problem	65
B. Midwifery	65
Stacey A. Tovino, <i>American Midwifery Litigation and State Legislative Preference for Physician-Controlled Childbirth</i>	66
<i>The People of the State of Illinois Ex Rel. Leonard A. Sherman, Director of Professional Regulation v. Yvonne Cryns</i>	67
<i>The State Board of Nursing and State of Kansas Ex Rel. State Board of Healing Arts v. E. Michelle Ruebke</i>	71
Notes and Questions	74
Opening Statement of the Prosecutor in the Trial of a Midwife	77
Opening Statement of the Defense Lawyer	78
Problem	79
Chapter Three • Scope of Practice	81
I. Scope of Practice Disputes Outside the Courtroom	83
A. Legislative Halls	83
Maura Lerner, <i>A Bitter Fight Over Who Can Be Called "Doctor"</i>	84
Notes and Questions	85
B. Attorney General Opinions	86
Nebraska Attorney General Opinion	87
Recent Attorney General Scope of Practice Formal Opinions	88
Comment: Statutory Interpretation	90
II. Scope of Practice Disputes in the Courtroom	91
<i>Foster v. Georgia Board of Chiropractic Examiners</i>	91
<i>Crees v. California State Board of Medical Examiners</i>	95
Problem	99
Notes and Questions	100
Problem	101
Chapter Four • Malpractice	103
I. Standards of Care	103
A. Common Law	103
<i>Kerkman v. Hintz</i>	103
Notes and Questions	111

B. Statutes	112
Notes and Questions	113
C. Scope of Practice Statutes, Unprofessional Conduct Statutes, and Malpractice Standards of Care	114
<i>Wengel v. Herfert</i>	114
II. Breach	116
A. Foregoing Conventional Care	116
<i>Charell v. Gonzalez</i>	117
<i>Charell v. Gonzalez</i>	120
Notes and Questions	121
B. Failure to Refer	122
<i>Mostrom v. Pettibon</i>	122
<i>Salazar v. Ehmann</i>	127
C. Not Amenable to CAM Care	128
<i>Tschirhart v. Pethtel</i>	128
D. Negligent Performance of a CAM Procedure	129
<i>Hinthorn v. Garrison</i>	130
E. Failure to Diagnose; Incorrect Diagnosis	131
<i>Wilcox v. Carroll</i>	131
Notes and Questions	137
<i>Sell v. Shore</i>	138
Notes and Questions	140
III. Causation	141
A. Causal Link	141
<i>Ireland v. Eckerly, M.D.</i>	141
<i>White v. Jones</i>	142
Notes and Questions	144
B. Expert Testimony Regarding Causation	144
<i>Morgan v. Hill</i>	144
IV. Malpractice Defenses	146
A. Two Schools of Thought	146
<i>Jones v. Chidester</i>	146
Notes and Questions	151
B. Assumption of the Risk	152
<i>Schneider v. Revici</i>	152
<i>Charell v. Gonzalez</i>	154
Chapter Five • Informed Consent	157
I. Introduction	157
A. Early Foundations	157
<i>Schloendorff v. The Society of New York Hospital</i>	157
Note and Questions	159
B. The Patient Standard	160
<i>Canterbury v. Spence</i>	160
Notes and Questions	172
C. The Professional Standard	174
<i>Culbertson v. Mernitz</i>	174
II. Informed Consent in the CAM Context	178
A. Failure to Disclose Risks of Foregoing Conventional Medical Care	179
<i>Charell v. Gonzalez</i>	179

<i>Schneider v. Revici</i>	183
Notes and Questions	189
B. Failure to Inform the Patient of the Availability of CAM Care	190
<i>Moore v. Baker</i>	190
Notes and Questions	192
C. Failure to Inform of the Risks of CAM Care	195
Problem	195
Chapter Six • Regulation of Dietary Supplements by the Food and Drug Administration	197
I. Introduction	197
II. Organization and Authority of the Food and Drug Administration	198
A. Overview	198
Notes and Questions	199
B. Regulation of Food	199
1. Label Requirements	201
2. Label Options	201
C. Regulation of Drugs	202
1. Definition	202
2. Safety and Efficacy	202
3. Over the Counter Drugs	203
III. Regulation of Dietary Supplements	204
A. Is It a Drug or a Food?	204
<i>United States v. Nutrition Service, Inc.</i>	204
Notes and Questions	206
B. The Dietary Supplement Health and Education Act of 1994 (DSHEA)	206
1. Definition	206
2. Safety Standards	207
<i>Nutraceutical Corporation v. Von Eschenbach</i>	208
Notes and Questions	211
Problem	212
3. Labeling	212
<i>Pearson v. Donna E. Shalala, Secretary, United States Department of Health and Human Services</i>	214
Summary Regarding Qualified Health Claims: B Vitamins & Vascular Disease	217
Notes and Questions	218
IV. Rethinking the Regulation of Dietary Supplements	219
Dietary Supplements: FDA Should Take Further Actions to Improve Oversight and Consumer Understanding	219
Chapter Seven • Antitrust	223
I. Introduction	223
A. Overview	223
Department of Justice, Antitrust Division, Overview	223
B. Federal and State Antitrust Authorities	224
C. Antitrust Defenses	226
D. A Policy Argument	227
Caitlin Slessor, <i>The Right to Choose in Childbirth: Regulation of Midwifery in Iowa</i>	227
Notes	229

II. Applying Antitrust Law	230
A. An Antitrust Victory	230
<i>Wilk v. American Medical Association</i>	230
Notes	241
B. An Antitrust Loss	241
<i>Solla v. Aetna Health Plans of New York, Inc.</i>	242
Notes	247
Problem	247
III. Antitrust Allegations in Other Contexts	248
A. Denials of Clinical Privileges	248
<i>Welchlin v. Tenet Healthcare Corporation</i>	248
Notes and Problems	254
B. Denial or Cancellation of Malpractice Insurance	254
<i>Nurse Midwifery Associates v. Hibbett</i>	254
C. Reimbursement Caps and Disparities in Reimbursement Rates	257
<i>American Chiropractic Association v. Trigon Healthcare, Inc.</i>	258
D. CAM Practitioners as Antitrust Defendants	260
<i>In the Matter of The Connecticut Chiropractic Association, The Connecticut Chiropractic Council, and Robert L. Hirtle, Esq.</i>	261
Chapter Eight • Innovations in CAM Regulation	267
I. Medical Freedom Acts	268
Notes and Questions	269
<i>Gonzalez v. New York State Dept. of Health</i>	270
Notes and Questions	271
II. Striving for a Middle Ground on Regulation: Creation of Offices to Govern Unlicensed CAM Practitioners	273
A. Defining CAM	274
B. Establishing Minimal Standards of Conduct	274
C. Creating a Bill of Rights	275
Complementary and Alternative Health Care Client Bill of Rights	275
Notes and Questions	277
III. Rethinking the Need for Regulation	279
Index	281

Acknowledgments

Lucinda Jesson would like to thank Jessica Kracl, a 2009 graduate of Hamline University School of Law, for her amazing research and writing assistance for Chapters One and Six of this text. In addition, she thanks Abigail Kozel and Maria Breu, Hamline University School of Law 2010 graduates, for their exemplary (and tactful) editing suggestions. Finally, Professor Jesson thanks Hamline University for the research stipend, which helped support the writing of this text.

Stacey Tovino would like to thank Heather Elliot-Heath, a December 2008 graduate of Hamline University School of Law, and Miguel Puentes, a May 2010 graduate of Drake University Law School, for their outstanding research assistance. Heather assisted in the preparation of six volumes of background material relating to complementary and alternative medicine and Miguel prepared an exceptional manuscript entitled, “Fundamental Difficulties with Antitrust Litigation Pertaining to Complementary and Alternative Health: An Overview,” from which much of the material in Chapter Seven was drawn.

Chapter One: Introduction to Complementary and Alternative Medicine

Expert from Anemona Hartocollis, *In Once Section of Beth Israel Hospital, Some Patients are Saying “Om,” Not “Ah”*, N.Y. TIMES, Oct. 29, 2008, at A31. Copyright © 2008. Reprinted with permission of the New York Times.

Excerpts from ANNE FADIMAN, *THE SPIRIT CATCHES YOU AND YOU FALL DOWN* (Farrar, Straus, & Giroux, LLC 1997). Copyright ©1997 by Anne Fadiman. Reprinted by permission of Farrar, Straus and Giroux, LLC.

Marcia Angell, M.D., Jerome P. Kassirer, M.D., *Alternative Medicine—The Risks of Untested and Unregulated Remedies*, 339 NEW ENG. J. MED. 83 (1998). Copyright © 1998. Reprinted with permission by the New England Journal of Medicine.

Jill Mallory, M.D., *The Practice of Integrative Medicine*. Printed with permission by Jill Mallory, M.D.

Chapter Two: The Gatekeeper Role of Licensure

Maxwell J. Mehlman, *Quackery*, 31 AM. J.L. & MED. 349 (2005). Copyright © 2005. Reprinted with permission of the American Journal of Law & Medicine.

Stacey A. Tovino, *American Midwifery Litigation and State Legislative Preference for Physician-Controlled Childbirth*, 11 CARDOZO WOMEN’S L.J. 61 (2004). Copyright © 2004. Reprinted with permission by the Cardozo Women’s Law Journal.

Excerpts from CHRIS BOHJALIAN, *MIDWIVES* (Random House 1997). Copyright © 1997. Reprinted with permission by Random House.

Chapter Three: Scope of Practice

Maura Lerner, *A Bitter Fight Over Who Can Be Called “Doctor”*, MINN.-S.P. STAR TRIB., June 8, 2008. Copyright © 2008. Reprinted with permission by Star Tribune.

Chapter Seven: Antitrust

Caitlin Slessor, *The Right to Choose in Childbirth: Regulation of Midwifery in Iowa*, 8 J. GENDER RACE & JUST. 511 (2004–05). Copyright © 2004–05. Reprinted with permission from the Journal of Gender, Race and Justice.