Food, Farming, and Sustainability

Readings in Agricultural Law

Susan A. Schneider
Professor of Law
University of Arkansas School of Law

Carolina Academic Press
Durham, North Carolina
Contents

Preface xiii

I • Agriculture and Agricultural Law 3
A. The Agrarian Ideal or the Agrarian Myth? 3
   Anne B. W. Effland, *U.S. Farm Policy: The First 200 Years* 5
B. Agrarianism and the Development of U.S. Agricultural Law 13
C. Industrialization of Agricultural Production 17
   1. Improved Agricultural Production Through Technology 18
   2. The Large Scale Production of a Specialized Product 19
   3. Vertical Integration 20
   4. Industrialization in Animal Agriculture 22
   5. Unanticipated Costs 25
      Notes 27
D. Sustainability 29
   Gail Feenstra, Chuck Ingels, and David Campbell, with contributions from David Chaney, Melvin R. George, Eric Bradford, the staff and advisory committees of the UC Sustainable Agriculture Research and Education Program, *What Is Sustainable Agriculture?* 30
   Mary V. Gold, *Sustainable Agriculture: Definitions and Terms, Background* 38
   Notes 40
E. What is a Family Farm? 41
F. A Survey of Current U.S. Agricultural Production 45
   1. The Number of Farms 45
   2. Agricultural Production 46
   3. Production Expenses 48
   4. Government Farm Program Payments 48
   5. Demographics 48
   6. Off-farm Income and Part-time Farming 48
   7. Organic Farming 49
   8. Structural Trends in Production 49
CONTENTS

James MacDonald, Robert Hoppe, and David Banker,
Growing Farm Size and the Distribution of Farm Payments 49

G. Consumer Awareness and Impact 50

II • Economic Support to Agriculture: The Federal Farm Programs,
Federal Crop Insurance, and Disaster Assistance 53
A. Federal Farm Programs 54
  1. The Statutory Framework: The Farm Bill 56
  2. USDA Implementation of the Farm Bill 59
     a. The Farm Service Agency 59
     b. The Commodity Credit Corporation 60
     c. The National Appeals Division 62
  3. The Price and Income Support Programs Under the 2008 Farm Bill 64
  4. Economic Analysis and the Payment Limitations Debate 79
     a. Limitations on Farm Program Payments 81
     b. An Overview of Farm Program Recipients 88
B. Federal Crop Insurance 93
  1. Introduction to Federal Crop Insurance 94
  2. Types of Insurance Available to Farmers 97
  3. Loss Claims and the Payment of Indemnities 99
C. Disaster Assistance 104
  1. The Non-Insured Disaster Assistance Program (NAP) 104
  2. Ad Hoc Disaster Assistance 108
  3. Supplemental Revenue Assistance Payments (SURE) 112
D. Farm Programs and the Food System 114

III • Agriculture and Environmental Law 119
A. Agriculture’s Environmental Effects 120
  J.B. Ruhl, Farms, Their Environmental Harms, and Environmental Law 120
  Notes 134
B. Exceptions for Agricultural Operations Under Environmental Laws 138
  J.B. Ruhl, Farms, Their Environmental Harms, and Environmental Law 138
C. Unique Aspects of Environmental Law As Applied to Agriculture 164
  1. USDA Conservation Programs 164
     Conservation Policy: Compliance Provisions for Soil and Wetland Conservation 165
     U.S. v. Dierckman 166
     Notes 175
     b. Land Retirement Programs 176
     Conservation Policy: Land Retirement Programs 176
     Notes 178
     c. Working Land Conservation Programs 180
     Conservation Policy: Working-Land Conservation Programs 181
     USDA Issues Final Rule for Conservation Stewardship Program 185
     Notes 186
CONTENTS

d. The Farmland and Grazing Land Protection Programs 187
Conservation Policy: Farmland and Grazing Land Protection Programs 187
Notes 192
2. The Regulation of CAFOs 192
Summary of the Second Circuit’s Decision in the CAFO Litigation 194
Claudia Copeland, Animal Waste and Water Quality: EPA’s Response to the Waterkeeper Alliance Court Decision on Regulation of CAFOs 197
Concentrated Animal Feeding Operations Final Rulemaking— Fact Sheet 199
Notes 200
3. Developing Issues 200
a. Liability for Environmental Harm from CAFOs 201
b. Air Quality 201
c. Effect of Pesticide Use 201
d. Nuisance and Right to Farm Laws 202
e. Sustainability and Conventional Agricultural Practices 203

IV • Financing the Farming Operation 205
A. Distinct Attributes of Farm Finance 205
1. The Nature of Farm Production Inputs 205
2. The Special Risks Associated with Agricultural Production 208
3. The Typical Merger of Personal and Business Assets Associated with Family Farming 209
4. Society’s Basic Need for Food Production 210
B. Overview of Current Farm Finances 210
C. Federal Credit Assistance Provided to the Agricultural Sector 215
1. The Farm Service Agency 216
   a. The History of the USDA’s Lending Programs 216
   b. Farm Service Agency Direct Loans 229
   c. Farm Service Agency Guaranteed Loans 237
2. The Farm Credit System 245
   a. The History and Purpose of the Farm Credit System 246
   b. The Current Structure of the FCS 259
   c. Borrowers’ Rights 263
D. Agricultural Commercial Law: Secured Transactions Involving Farm Assets 268
1. Crop Financing: Defining Crop Proceeds 269
2. Livestock Sales and Purchase Money Security Interests 290

V • “Forty Acres and a Mule”— Discrimination in Agriculture 303
A. History of African American Farmers in the United States 303
   Christopher R. Kelley, Notes on African American Farmers 303
B. USDA Discrimination Against African American Farmers 311
   Pigford v. Glickman 312
   Notes 334
   Tadlock Cowan & Jody Feder, The Pigford Case: USDA Settlement of a Discrimination Suit by Black Farmers 336
C. USDA Discrimination: Native American, Hispanic and Women Farmers 338
1. Native American Farmers 338
2. Hispanic Farmers 339
3. Women Farmers 339

D. Current USDA Policy and Issues 339
   Lisa Shames, *U.S. Department of Agriculture: Recommendations and Options Available to the New Administration and Congress to Address Long-Standing Civil Rights Issues* 340

E. The Face of Agriculture Today 351
   1. African American Farmers 351
   2. Native American Farmers 352
   3. Hispanic Farmers 353
   4. Women Farmers 354

VI • Agricultural Labor Law 357
   A. Who Are America’s Farm Workers? 358
      Notes 372
   B. An Overview of Federal Labor and Employment Law 372
      1. The National Labor Relations Act 372
         *Holly Farms Corporation v. National Labor Relations Board* 374
         Notes 385
         *Departments of Labor, Health and Human Services, and Education, and Related Agencies Appropriations Act, 2006* 385
      2. The Fair Labor Standards Act 386
         Notes 391
         *Pesticides: Improvements Needed to Ensure the Safety of Farmworkers and Their Children* 392
         *Castillo v. Givens* 393
   3. The Migrant and Seasonal Agricultural Worker Protection Act 400
      Susan A. Schneider, *Notes on the Migrant and Seasonal Agricultural Worker Protection Act* 400
      *Charles v. Burton* 405
      *Flores v. Rios* 416
      Notes 426
   C. Current Issues 429
      1. Slavery 429
      2. The “Fair Food” Movement 431

VII • The Regulation of Livestock Sales 433
   A. Introduction to the Packers and Stockyards Act 433
      Christopher R. Kelley, *An Overview of the Packers and Stockyards Act* 433
   B. Structural Trends in the Livestock Industry 454
      Renee Johnson and Geoffrey S. Becker, *Livestock Marketing and Competition Issues* 454
      Notes 459
   C. Unfair, Unjustly Discriminatory, or Deceptive Practices Under the Packers and Stockyards Act 460
      *Picket v. Tyson Fresh Meats, Inc.* 460
      Renee Johnson and Geoffrey S. Becker, *Livestock Marketing and Competition Issues* 474
CONTENTS

Implementation of Regulations Required Under Title XI of the Food, Conservation and Energy Act of 2008; Conduct in Violation of the Act Grain Inspection, Packers and Stockyards Administration 475
Notes 486

VIII • Animal Welfare and Farm Animals Raised for Food 489
A. Efforts to Impose Welfare Standards on Livestock Production 491
1. Citizen Initiatives 492
Notes 495
2. Defining “Humane” by Regulation 495
New Jersey Society for the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals v. New Jersey Department of Agriculture 495
Notes 515
B. Humane Slaughter Standards 517
United States Code, Title 7. Agriculture, Chapter 48. Humane Methods of Livestock Slaughter 518
Lisa Sham es, Humane Methods of Slaughter Act: Actions Are Needed to Strengthen Enforcement 518
Notes 533

IX • Biotechnology and Agricultural Law 535
A. An Introduction to Agricultural Biotechnology and its Regulation 535
Tadlock Cowan & Geoffrey S. Becker, Agricultural Biotechnology: Background and Recent Issues 535
Rebecca Bratspies, Some Thoughts on the American Approach to Regulating Genetically Modified Organisms 541
Notes 549
B. The Patenting of Genetically-Engineered Seeds 550
1. Patenting Live, Human-made Organisms 551
Diamond v. Chakrabarty 551
J.E.M. Ag Supply, Inc. v. Pioneer Hi-bred International, Inc. 559
3. Enforcing Patent Rights in Seed 573
Monsanto v. David 574
Notes 581
Donald L. Barlett and James B. Steele, Investigation: Monsanto’s Harvest of Fear 582
4. Consolidation in the Seed Industry 584
Notes 587
C. Challenge to the Approval Process for New Genetically Engineered Seeds 588
Geertson Seed Farms v. Johanss 588
Notes 597
D. The Labeling of Genetically Engineered Food Products 601
1. General Principles 601
Notes 608
2. Case Study: Bovine Somatotropin 609
Notes 610
E. International Trade and Genetically Engineered Products 611
CONTENTS

Tadlock Cowan & Geoffrey S. Becker, Agricultural Biotechnology: Background and Recent Issues 611

X • Food and Agriculture 617

A. Food Safety 617
1. The Structure of Government Regulation 617
   Geoffrey S. Becker, The Federal Food Safety System: A Primer 617
   David M. Walker, Federal Oversight of Food Safety: High-Risk Designation Can Bring Needed Attention to Fragmented System 623
   Geoffrey S. Becker, Meat and Poultry Inspection: Background and Selected Issues 627
2. Limited Authority 638
   Supreme Beef Processors, Inc. v. U.S. Dept. of Agriculture 638
   Notes 644

B. The Regulation of Organic Food 646
1. Introduction 646
   Catherine Greene, Carolyn Dimitri, Biing-Hwan Lin, William McBride, Lydia Oberholtzer, and Travis Smith, Emerging Issues in the U.S. Organic Industry 648
2. Maintaining the Integrity of the Organic Label 651
   Notes 658
3. Changing Perspectives 659
   Catherine Greene, Carolyn Dimitri, Biing-Hwan Lin, William McBride, Lydia Oberholtzer, and Travis Smith, Emerging Issues in the U.S. Organic Industry 660

C. The Local Food Movement 664
   Steve Martinez, Michael Hand, Michelle Da Pra, Susan Pollack, Katherine Ralston, Travis Smith, Stephen Vogel, Shellye Clark, Luanne Lohr, Sarah Low, and Constance Newman, Local Food Systems: Concepts, Impacts, and Issues 664

D. Food for the Future 696
1. Food Security 696
   Mark Nord, Margaret Andrews, and Steven Carlson, Household Food Security in the United States, 2008 697
   Notes 698
2. The Obesity Epidemic 699
   Dietary Guidelines for Americans 699
3. Food Deserts 706
   Michele Ver Ploeg, Vince Breneman, Tracey Farrigan, Karen Hamrick, David Hopkins, Phil Kaufman, Biing-Hwan Lin, Mark Nord, Travis Smith, Ryan Williams, Kelly Kinnison, Carol Olander, Anita Singh, and Elizabeth Tuckerman, Access to Affordable and Nutritious Food—Measuring and Understanding Food Deserts and Their Consequences 706
   Notes 709
4. The Role of Agriculture and the Way Forward 710

Index 713
Preface

Agricultural law and policy, once of concern only to agricultural economists, farm commodity group lobbyists, and a handful of congressional aids is now a topic of everyday discussion. And, to be certain, it is a controversial topic.

After years of claiming responsibility for “feeding the world,” farmers are caught between advice that their operations must be bigger, more efficient, and produce a more uniform product and criticism that they are too big and their practices unsustainable.

Some farm groups vigorously oppose any type of regulation; others clamor for additional regulatory protection.

Everyday news stories contrast the iconic image of the family farm with pictures of sheds that house tens of thousands of animals, manure lagoons, and watersheds threatened with runoff. Animal welfare advocates with secret video cameras film scenes that horrify the public. Food safety recalls seem common.

Our food system — with perhaps the cheapest and most abundant supply of a wide variety of food products in the world — is now linked to obesity and related diseases.

How can U.S. farm policy assure an adequate and healthy food supply in a manner that can be sustained for generations to come?

Food, Farming, and Sustainability: Readings in Agricultural Law attempts to make sense of these controversies by providing an issues-based study of some of the complex topics that make up the body of agricultural law. Each is presented in the context of one or more current policy issues. The readings raise difficult questions, provide contrasting information, and leave readers with the task of developing solutions for the future.

Because of the extent and variety of the legal issues involved in agricultural law today, many important issues are not included. These readings provide only a first step in an analysis that affects us all.

From its initial discussion of “agricultural exceptionalism” to its concluding remarks on food and agriculture, the book is written to spark thoughtful dialogue.

Some citations and footnotes have been eliminated from the original source in the editing process. Full original source citation is provided so that readers can view the original document in its complete form is so desired.