

**Freedom's Conditions in the  
U.S.-Canadian Borderlands in  
the Age of Emancipation**



# Freedom's Conditions in the U.S.-Canadian Borderlands in the Age of Emancipation

Edited by  
Tony Freyer  
and  
Lyndsay Campbell

CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS  
Durham, North Carolina

Copyright © 2011  
Tony Freyer and Lyndsay Campbell  
All Rights Reserved

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Freyer, Tony Allan.

Freedom's conditions in the U.S.-Canadian borderlands in the age of emancipation / Tony Freyer, Lyndsay Campbell.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-59460-772-1 (alk. paper)

1. African Americans--Legal status, laws, etc.--History--19th century. 2. Blacks--Legal status, laws, etc.--Canada--History--19th century. I. Campbell, Lyndsay. II. Title.

KF4757.F74 2010  
342.7308'73--dc22

2010030053

CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS  
700 Kent Street  
Durham, North Carolina 27701  
Telephone (919) 489-7486  
Fax (919) 493-5668  
[www.cap-press.com](http://www.cap-press.com)

Printed in the United States of America

# Contents

Acknowledgments	ix
Contributor Biographies	xi
<b>1 • Introduction</b>	
<i>Tony Freyer and Lyndsay Campbell</i>	3
The United States	11
Canada	22
Contributions	28
References	30

## I

### The Shadows of Law: Governance in the Borderlands

<b>2 • Constituting the Free-State Borderlands: New York, Pennsylvania, and Ohio</b>	
<i>Tony Freyer</i>	35
Ambivalent State Sovereignty and States' Rights	36
New York	41
Pennsylvania	47
Ohio	54
Conclusion	58
References	60
Appendix — County Population Maps	65
<b>3 • The State the Slaveholders Made: Regulating Fugitive Slaves in the Early Republic</b>	
<i>Gautham Rao</i>	85
Runaway Regulation: The Public Good	88
“Protecting and Supporting” Private Property Rights	94
Conclusion: Fugitive Slaves and the Early American State	100
References	103

Published Cases and Statutes	108
Unpublished Cases	108
Archival Collections	108
<b>4 • Governance in the Borderlands: Upper Canadian Legal Institutions</b>	
<i>Lyndsay Campbell</i>	109
Upper Canada	111
The Growth of the State	115
Courts	117
Law and Lawyers	120
Institutions of Local Governance	121
Implications for Governance and the Administration of Justice	122
Policing	125
Conclusions: Extradition	130
References	134
<b>5 • British Rights and Liberal Law in Canada's Fugitive Slave Debate, 1833–1843</b>	
<i>Bradley Miller</i>	141
Introduction	141
Imperial Structures and Fugitive Slaves	144
British Justice and British Rights	147
Liberal Law and the Fugitive Slave Question	154
The Imperial and Colonial Reply: Individualism, Liberalism, and Equality	157
Conclusion	165
References	165
<b>II</b>	
<b>Persons, Places</b>	
<b>6 • Constrained Choices: New England Slavery Decisions in the Antebellum Era</b>	
<i>Aviam Soifer</i>	173
Immediate Freedom?	178
Choice of Law Issues	180
Reprise: Betty's Case	188
Conclusion	191
References	191

<b>7 • The Northern Borderlands: Canada West</b>	
<i>Lyndsay Campbell</i>	195
Threads in Legal Historiography	199
The Parameters of Citizenship	204
Education	210
The Criminal Justice System	214
The Impact of Prejudice	220
References	220
<b>8 • The Judicial Construction of Whiteness in the Borderlands of the Northwest Territory, 1803–1860</b>	
<i>Stephen Middleton</i>	227
References	252
<b>9 • <i>Willis v. Jolliffe</i>: Love and Slavery on the South Carolina–Ohio Borderlands</b>	
<i>John Wertheimer, Daphne Fruchtman, et al.</i>	257
Amy and Elijah	258
Elijah’s First Will	260
Dr. Brisbane	262
Cincinnati	263
John Jolliffe	266
Elijah’s Second Will	268
The <i>Jacob Strader</i>	269
In the South Carolina Courts: Round One	270
Round Two	273
Round Three	276
Conclusion	279
References	281
<b>Conclusion</b>	
<i>Tony Freyer and Lyndsay Campbell</i>	285
<b>Index</b>	293





# Acknowledgments

Many debts are incurred in the creation of such a collection. Lyndsay Campbell and Tony Freyer acknowledge the contribution of Harry N. Scheiber and his seminal scholarship on shared sovereignty and federalism as working systems. Our paths first crossed at a conference in honour of Harry at Boalt Hall, at the University of California, Berkeley. Harry, therefore, deserves some credit, but surely no blame, for the existence of this project. We are delighted to dedicate the book to him. We also must thank the American Society for Legal History for the opportunity to assemble the panel in Ottawa in 2008 that brought together many of the various scholars here for the first time and led us to the others.

Over the last couple of years, ongoing conversations have improved the collection and deepened our understandings of the various threads running through this complex material. We have both gained from the insights others have supplied into our seemingly endless chapter revisions. Lyndsay owes a considerable debt to Tony Freyer, Constance Backhouse, Brad Miller, Gautham Rao, Mary Stokes, and Patrick Connor for their thoughtful feedback on drafts of parts or all of her chapters, and for their guidance on key issues—and especially to Mary for her quick and detailed responses to questions about local government. Stephen Middleton caused Lyndsay to think not only about what she was saying but about how she was saying it. Lyndsay would also like to thank Jim Phillips for the opportunity to present an earlier version of the chapter on Upper Canadian legal institutions at a meeting of his Toronto legal history group in January 2010: the feedback from that illustrious assemblage of minds was invaluable. Tony is grateful to Lyndsay Campbell for patient and probing readings of his contribution to their book; he also thanks Gautham Rao for an invaluable critique, Jon Ray for research, and Walter Nugent for a helpful reading of an early draft of his chapter.

Thanks must also be addressed to the University of Calgary for supporting Lyndsay's travel to the Archives of Ontario and to the 2009 meeting of the American Society for Legal History in Dallas, where the themes of this volume became clear. For time to write Tony acknowledges the sabbatical for fall 2009, authorized by the University of Alabama's College of Arts and Science Dean, Robert F. Olin; History Department Chairperson, Michael Mendle;

and Vice President-Provost, Judy L. Bonner. For financial support he thanks Law School Dean Kenneth C. Randall, University of Alabama Law School Foundation, and the Edward Brett Randolph Fund. We also thank Keith Sipe for his patient support of the project through bad economic times. Finally, Lyndsay wishes to thank Cullen, Naomi, and Rory for their patient tolerance of this project and its many demands. The passage of time heightens Tony's gratitude to Edward F. Sherman, whose leadership first revealed the U.S.-Canadian borderlands as places more removed from the shadows of war.

Lyndsay Campbell, Calgary  
and  
Tony Freyer, Tuscaloosa  
Summer 2010

# Contributor Biographies

**Lyndsay Campbell** is an Assistant Professor at the University of Calgary in western Canada. She teaches in the undergraduate program in Law and Society and in the Faculty of Law. She holds law degrees from the University of British Columbia, where she practiced briefly and clerked for the B.C. Court of Appeal. She did her doctoral work at the University of California, Berkeley, under the supervision of Harry N. Scheiber. Her dissertation explored the legal and extralegal regulation of expression in Massachusetts and Nova Scotia in the 1820s and 1830s. Recent work has appeared in the *Dalhousie Law Review* and in *The Grand Experiment: Law & Legal Culture in British Settler Societies*, edited by Hamar Foster, Ben Berger, and Andrew Buck (UBC Press, 2008).

**Tony Freyer** is University Research Professor of History and Law at the University of Alabama. He received the Ph.D. in 1975 from Indiana University. His publications include eleven authored, co-authored, or edited books, including *Antitrust and Global Capitalism, 1930–2004* (Cambridge, 2006), and about sixty refereed book chapters, journal articles, and reviews. He received the University of Alabama's 1991 Distinguished Faculty Award; the Hughes-Gossett Award for the best article in the 2008 *Journal of Supreme Court History*; and the 2008 Best Book Award from the Arkansas Historical Association for *Little Rock on Trial: School Desegregation and Cooper v. Aaron (1958)* (Kansas, 2008). He has taught at the London School of Economics; the University of California, Los Angeles; the University of Arkansas at Little Rock; and Warsaw University. He held senior Fulbright Awards for the United Kingdom (1986), Australia (1993), and Poland (2000); an Abe Award (1994–96) for research in Japan; the Harvard-Newcomen Award, 1975–76, at the Harvard Business School; and a Research Fellowship Award, 1981–82, at the Charles Warren Center, Harvard University.

**Daphne Fruchtman** graduated from Davidson College in 2009. She majored in History.

**Stephen Middleton** is Professor of History and Director of African American Studies at Mississippi State University. He earned the Doctor of Philosophy degree in American Constitutional History from Miami University (Ohio). He completed the first year of law school at New York University School of

Law where he was a Samuel I. Golieb Fellow in Legal History. His research interest involves race and the American legal system. He received the Otto A. Rothert Best Article Award in 1993 from the Filson Club Historical Society for his essay on “Law and Ideology in Ohio and Kentucky: The Kidnapping of Jerry Phinney.” He is the author or editor of four books and several scholarly articles. His latest book is entitled *The Black Laws: Race and the Legal Process in Ohio, 1787–1860* (2005). He is currently working on a project entitled “Traces of Blood: The Construction of Whiteness in Antebellum America.”

**Bradley Miller** is a Ph.D. candidate in the Department of History at the University of Toronto. His dissertation focuses on international fugitives in Canada, 1810–1910, and explores the development of international law and the politics of extradition and state-sanctioned kidnapping. His work has appeared in the *Canadian Historical Review*, the *Journal of the Canadian Historical Association*, and the *International Journal of Legal Information*. An article he co-authored with Jim Phillips is forthcoming in the *Law and History Review*.

**Gautham Rao** received his Ph.D. in History, with Distinction, from the University of Chicago, in 2008. He is an Assistant Professor of History at Rutgers University-Newark and the New Jersey Institute of Technology. His recent article, “The Federal *Posse Comitatus* Doctrine: Slavery, Compulsion, and Statecraft in Mid-Nineteenth Century America,” published in the *Law and History Review* (2008), won both the 2007–8 Kathryn Preyer Award and the 2009 Surrency Prize from the American Society for Legal History. His dissertation, “The Creation of the American State: Customhouses, Law, and Commerce in the Age of Revolution,” is presently being revised for publication.

**Aviam Soifer**, Dean and Professor, William S. Richardson School of Law, University of Hawai‘i, received his law degree from Yale Law School in 1972, where he served as an editor of the Yale Law Journal and director of the Law School Film Society. He was also a director of the Legal Services Organization and helped to found the C.V.H. Project, representing people in the state’s largest mental hospital. He clerked for Federal Judge Jon O. Newman in 1972–73. Soifer began his law teaching career at the University of Connecticut in 1973, received a Law and Humanities Fellowship at Harvard University, and taught at Boston University for thirteen years. From 1993–98, he served as dean at Boston College Law School, where he continued to teach until 2003, when he became Dean of the William S. Richardson School of Law at the University of Hawai‘i. He was given Boston College’s Distinguished Senior Research Award and was appointed as a Distinguished Scholar at the University of Wisconsin’s Legal Studies Institute. His book *Law and the Company We Keep* (Harvard University Press, 1995) received the Alpha Sigma Nu Triennial National Jesuit Book Prize in professional studies. He teaches constitutional law, legal history, legal

writing, and law and humanities, and he has an extensive record of scholarly publications and public service activities.

**John Wertheimer** is Professor of History at Davidson College. His publications include one book, *Law and Society in the South: A History of North Carolina Court Cases* (University Press of Kentucky, 2009), and about twenty-five refereed journal articles, book chapters, and reviews about southern legal history, constitutional history, Latin American legal history, and history teaching. At Davidson College, he won the Hunter-Hamilton Love of Teaching Award in 2008 and the Omicron Delta Kappa Teaching Award in 2004. In 2007, he co-won the American Society for Legal History's Surrency Prize for the best article published in the *Law and History Review* in 2006. He was a Samuel I. Golieb Fellow in Legal History at New York University School of Law in 1989–90. He currently serves on the Executive Committee of the Board of Directors of the American Society for Legal History.