

# Schools of Jurisprudence



# Schools of Jurisprudence

**Robert E. Rodes, Jr.**

PAUL J. SCHIERL/FORT HOWARD CORPORATION  
PROFESSOR OF LEGAL ETHICS  
UNIVERSITY OF NOTRE DAME LAW SCHOOL

CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS

Durham, North Carolina

Copyright © 2011  
Robert E. Rodes, Jr.  
All Rights Reserved

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Rodes, Robert E.  
Schools of jurisprudence / Robert E. Rodes, Jr.  
p. cm.  
ISBN 978-1-59460-960-2 (alk. paper)  
1. Jurisprudence. I. Title.

K320.R63 2010  
340--dc22

2010043263

CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS  
700 Kent Street  
Durham, North Carolina 27701  
Telephone (919) 489-7486  
Fax (919) 493-5668  
[www.cap-press.com](http://www.cap-press.com)

Printed in the United States of America

*Dominae Nostrae a Lacu  
Omnibusque apud eam  
Ventis atque Venturis  
Jus Discere aut Docere  
Ejus sub Aegide*



# Contents

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| Acknowledgments                                     | ix  |
| Introduction  | 3   |
| <b>I • The Internal Account</b>                     | 7   |
| A. Society, the Efficient Cause                     | 8   |
| B. Social Control, the Material Cause               | 11  |
| C. Institutions and Procedures, the Formal Cause    | 18  |
| D. People, the Final Cause                          | 23  |
| <b>II • Law and ...</b>                             | 27  |
| A. Philosophy                                       | 27  |
| B. Politics   | 31  |
| C. Sociology and Economics                          | 35  |
| D. History  | 39  |
| E. Literature                                       | 44  |
| F. Theology   | 46  |
| <b>III • The Values</b>                             | 49  |
| A. Personal Values                                  | 50  |
| B. Participatory Values                             | 57  |
| C. Social Values                                    | 63  |
| <b>IV • Schools of Jurisprudence in General</b>     | 71  |
| <b>V • Schools Centered on the Internal Account</b> | 77  |
| A. Analytical Positivism                            | 77  |
| B. American Legal Realism                           | 84  |
| C. Scandinavian Realism                             | 94  |
| D. The Legal Process Movement                       | 101 |
| E. Postmodern Jurisprudence                         | 106 |

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| <b>VI • Schools Centered on Other Disciplines</b> | 111 |
| A. The Sociological School                        | 111 |
| B. The Historical School                          | 117 |
| C. Law and Economics I: The Coase Theorem         | 122 |
| <b>VII • Schools Centered on Values</b>           | 129 |
| A. Natural Law                                    | 129 |
| B. Utilitarianism                                 | 140 |
| C. Law and Economics II: Wealth Maximization      | 150 |
| D. Marxism  | 159 |
| E. The Critical Legal Studies Movement            | 164 |
| F. The Constituency Jurisprudences                | 168 |
| G. Liberation Jurisprudence                       | 179 |
| <b>VIII • Toward a Synthesis</b>                  | 185 |
| A. The Values Gap                                 | 185 |
| B. The Internal Account                           | 190 |
| C. Other Disciplines                              | 195 |
| D. Values   | 197 |
| <b>Table of Cases</b>                             | 201 |
| <b>Index</b>                                      | 203 |



# Acknowledgments

Of the books I have used in writing this, three deserve special mention. *Jurisprudence: Text and Readings on the Philosophy of Law*, by George C. Christie and Patrick H. Martin (2d ed. St. Paul, West, 1995), *Jurisprudence Classical and Contemporary: From Natural Law to Postmodernism*, by Robert L. Hayman, Jr., Nancy Levit, and Richard Delgado (2d ed., St. Paul, West, 2002), and *Lloyd's Introduction to Jurisprudence* by Lord Lloyd of Hampstead and M.D.A. Freeman (6th ed., London, Sweet & Maxwell, 1994) were always within reach and much of the time open. The thought and erudition that have gone into assembling and criticizing the material deployed in these works have brought home to me with particular force the old saying about standing on the shoulders of giants.

I am doubly grateful to Professor George C. Christie of the Duke University Law School, who, in addition to being the senior editor of one of these books, was kind enough to review the manuscript for me. He made valuable suggestions, and saved me from a couple of serious gaffes. For critical and helpful reading of the manuscript, I am also grateful to Vinodh Jaichand of the Irish Centre for Human Rights, to John Robinson and Thomas L. Shaffer of the Notre Dame Law School, and to Paul H. Titus of the Pittsburgh bar.

I also owe, as usual, a debt of thanks to Patti Ogden, research librarian *par excellence*, for whom no reference is too esoteric. I had only to mention Norton I, Emperor of America, in an e-mail, and she had two articles about him on my desk.