International Dispute Resolution
Carolina Academic Press
Law Advisory Board

Gary J. Simson, Chairman
Dean, Mercer University School of Law

Raj Bhala
University of Kansas School of Law

Davison M. Douglas
Dean, William and Mary Law School

Paul Finkelman
Albany Law School

Robert M. Jarvis
Shepard Broad Law Center
Nova Southeastern University

Vincent R. Johnson
St. Mary’s University School of Law

Peter Nicolas
University of Washington School of Law

Michael A. Olivas
University of Houston Law Center

Kenneth L. Port
William Mitchell College of Law

H. Jefferson Powell
The George Washington University Law School

Michael P. Scharf
Case Western Reserve University School of Law

Peter M. Shane
Michael E. Moritz College of Law
The Ohio State University
International Dispute Resolution

Cases and Materials

Second Edition

Mary Ellen O’Connell
Robert and Marion Short Chair in Law & Research Professor of International Dispute Resolution — Kroc Institute,
University of Notre Dame Law School

Carolina Academic Press
Durham, North Carolina
This book is dedicated to

Sir Elihu Lauterpacht, C.B.E., Q.C.,

an extraordinary teacher and practitioner of international dispute resolution.
# Contents

Table of Cases ......................................................... xiii
Acknowledgments ..................................................... xvii

Chapter One · The Study of International Dispute Resolution  3
   Introduction ................................................................ 3
      What Is International Dispute Resolution? .............. 4
      Related Fields of Inquiry ..................................... 5
   The History of International Dispute Settlement .......... 7
      Howard N. Meyer, *The World Court in Action* ....... 9
   Notes and Questions on the Study of International Dispute Resolution .......... 21

I. Non-Binding Methods

Chapter Two · Negotiation and Consultation  27
   Introduction .......................................................... 27
      Charles Manga Fombad, *Consultation and Negotiation in the Pacific Settlement of International Disputes* ..... 27
      World Trade Organization, Understanding on Rules and Procedures Governing the Settlement of Dispute .................. 34
      Applicability of the Obligation to Arbitrate Under Section 21 of the United Nations Headquarters Agreement of 26 June 1947 .... 34
      Introductory Note to the Fisheries Jurisdiction Case .......... 44
      Fisheries Jurisdiction Case (*United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland v. Iceland*) .................. 45
      Gabčíkovo-Nagymaros Project Case (*Hungary v. Slovakia*) .......... 47
      Notes and Questions on Negotiation and Consultation .......... 48
      The Grand Lake Problem ........................................ 50

Chapter Three · Good Offices and Mediation  53
   Introduction .......................................................... 53
      World Trade Organization, Understanding on Rules and Procedures Governing the Settlement of Disputes .................. 54
      Claire Palley, *The “Good Offices” Framework for Secretariat Action* .................. 54
      Report of the Secretary-General on His Mission of Good Offices in Cyprus .......... 55
      Report of the Secretary-General on His Mission of Good Offices in Cyprus .......... 57
CONTENTS

Chapter Four · Inquiry and Conciliation

Introduction 79

Sven M.G. Koopmans, *The Use of Inter-State Conciliation* 82
United Nations Model Rules for the Conciliation of Disputes between States 83
World Trade Organization, Understanding on Rules and Procedures Governing the Settlement of Disputes 84
ICSID Convention, Convention on the Settlement of Investment Disputes between States and National of Other States 84
The Red Crusader 84
Conciliation Commission on the Continental Shelf Area between Iceland and Jan Mayen: Report and Recommendations to the Governments of Iceland and Norway 92
Sven M.G. Koopmans, *Diplomatic Dispute Settlement: The Use of Inter-State Conciliation* 95
Notes and Questions on Inquiry and Conciliation 97
About ICSID 100
The Warn Territory Dispute 100

II. Binding Methods

A. Arbitration

Chapter Five · Arbitration

Introduction 105

International Law Commission 107
Model Rules on Arbitral Procedure 107
Southern Bluefin Tuna Case (*Australia and New Zealand v. Japan*) 109
Case Concerning the Air Services Agreement of 27 March 1946 (*United States v. France*) 125
Notes and Questions on Arbitration 136

Chapter Six · Interim Orders in Arbitration

Introduction 139

William Wang, *International Arbitration: The Need for Uniform Interim Measures of Relief* 139
RCA Globcom Communications, Inc., et al., Claimants v. The Islamic Republic of Iran, et al., Respondents 142
### Chapter Ten · Jurisdiction and Admissibility

#### Introduction
259

- Case Concerning United States Diplomatic and Consular Staff in Tehran (*United States of America v. Iran*) 261
- Case Concerning Military and Paramilitary Activities in and against Nicaragua (*Nicaragua v. United States of America*) 272
- Notes and Questions on Jurisdiction and Admissibility 291

#### Notes and Questions on Jurisdiction and Admissibility
291

### Chapter Eleven · Provisional Measures

#### Introduction
293

- United States Diplomatic and Consular Staff in Tehran (*United States of America v. Iran*) 293
- LaGrand (*Germany v. United States of America*) 300
- Request for Interpretation of the Judgment of 31 March in *Avena and Other Mexican Nationals* (*Mexico v. United States*) 312
- Request for Interpretation of the Judgment of 31 March in *Avena and Other Mexican Nationals* (*Mexico v. United States*) 318
- Mary Ellen O’Connell, *The Failure to Observe Provisional Measures of Protection in the Case of Bosnia v. Yugoslavia* 320
- Notes and Questions on Provisional Measures 322

### Chapter Twelve · Intervention and Indispensable Parties

#### Introduction
325

- A. Intervention
325
  - J.M. Ruda, *Intervention before the International Court of Justice* 325
- Case Concerning Military and Paramilitary Activities in and against Nicaragua (*Nicaragua v. United States of America*) 335
- Territorial and Maritime Dispute Application of Costa Rica for Permission to Intervene (*Nicaragua v. Colombia*) 341

- B. Indispensable Parties
343
  - Case Concerning East Timor (*Portugal v. Australia*) 344
  - Notes and Questions on Intervention and Indispensable Parties 352

### Chapter Thirteen · Compliance and Enforcement

#### Introduction
355

- ICJ Statute 355
- United Nations Charter 356
- Avena and other Mexican Nationals (*Mexico v. United States of America*) 367
- Request for Interpretation of the Judgment of 31 March in *Avena and Other Mexican Nationals* (*Mexico v. United States*) 369
- Mary Ellen O’Connell, *The Prospects for Enforcing Monetary Judgments of the International Court of Justice: A Study of Nicaragua’s Judgment against the United States* 374
- Notes and Questions on Compliance and Enforcement in Judicial Settlement 384
- The Cilantro Island Problem 386
II. Binding Methods

B. Judicial Settlement

2. National Courts

Chapter Fourteen · National Courts

Introduction

A. Jurisdiction

The Case of the S.S. “Lotus” (France v. Turkey)

B. Immunity from Jurisdiction

1. Sovereign Immunity

The Federal Republic of Germany et al. v. United States et al.

M. Flatow v. The Islamic Republic of Iran

David P. Stewart, Samantar v. Yousuf: Foreign Official Immunity under Common Law

2. International Organization Immunity

Jan Klabbers, Privileges and Immunities

Note on the "Oil for Food" Dispute

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA

Notes and Questions on National Courts

Chapter Fifteen · Issues Arising in the Course of National Court Dispute Resolution

Introduction

A. Proper Law

United States v. The Palestine Liberation Organization

Comegys & Pettit v. Vasse

Dames & Moore v. Regan

Committee of U.S. Citizens Living in Nicaragua v. Reagan

Medellín v. Texas

B. Other Issues

1. Political Question

Case Concerning Certain Property (Liechtenstein v. Germany)

2. Act of State

Banco Nacional de Cuba v. Sabbatino

3. Forum Non Conveniens

4. Standing

Mary Ellen O’Connell, Litigating Enforcement

Note on International Organizations before National Courts

August Reinisch, Avoidance Techniques

Notes and Questions on Issues Arising in National Court Dispute Resolution

The Confiscated Painting Case

Annex

1. United Nations Charter, 1945

2. Statute of the International Court of Justice, June 26, 1945
| 3.  | ILC Model Rules on Arbitral Procedure, 1956 | 495 |
| 4.  | ICSID Convention on the Settlement of Investment Disputes Between States and National of Other States, 1966 | 502 |
| 7.  | Rules of the International Court of Justice, 1978 | 534 |
| 9.  | IBA Model Rules on Ethics for International Arbitrators, 1987 | 583 |
| 11. | United Nations Model Rules for the Conciliation of Disputes between States, 1995 | 607 |

**Index**

637
Table of Cases


Aegean Sea Continental Shelf (Greece v. Turkey), 1978 I.C.J. 3 (Dec. 19), 33

Air Services Agreement of 27 March 1946 (U.S. v. Fr.) 18 R.I.A.A. 417 (1978), 125

Anglo-Iranian Oil Co. (U.K. v. Iran) 1951 I.C.J. 89 (July 5), 322, 355

Anglo-Iranian Oil Co. (U.K. v. Iran) 1952 I.C.J. 93 (July 22), 322


Arbitral Award Made by the King of Spain on 23 December 1906 (Hond. v. Nicar.) 1960 I.C.J. 192 (Nov. 18), 160, 175, 185, 192, 196, 199, 256, 275, 278, 279


Asylum Case (Colombia v. Peru) 1950 I.C.J. 266 (Nov. 20), 249, 315, 333, 371–72


Request for Interpretation of the Judgment of 31 March in Avena and Other Mexican Nationals (Mexico v. United States) Request for Provisional Measures 2008 I.C.J. (Order of July 16), 312

Request for Interpretation of the Judgment of 31 March in Avena and Other Mexican Nationals (Mexico v. United States) 2009 I.C.J. (Judgment of Jan. 19), 318, 369


Barcelona Traction, Light and Power Co., Ltd. (Belg. v. Spain) 1970 I.C.J. 3 (Feb. 5), 277, 390


Broadbent v. Organization of American States, 628 F.2d 27 (D.C. Cir. 1980), 411

Certain German Interests in Polish Upper Silesia (Ger. v. Pol.) 1925 P.C.I.J. (ser. A) No. 6 (Aug. 25), 29

 Certain Property (Liecht. v. F.R.G.) 2001 I.C.J. 565 (June 28), 292, 440, 461

Chorzów Factory (Ger. v. Pol.) 1927 P.C.I.J. (ser. A) No. 12 (Nov. 21), 29, 47, 205, 214, 230, 289, 297, 312, 314, 368, 371
Comegys v. Vasse, 26 U.S. (1 Pet.) 193 (1828), 422, 429, 437, 438
Commission v. Ireland, Case C-459/03, 2006 E.C.R. I-4635, 157
Committee of U.S. Citizens Living in Nicaragua v. Reagan, 859 F.2d 929 (D.C. Cir. 1988), 381, 432, 460
Continental Shelf between Libya and Malta (Libya v. Malta) 1985 I.C.J. 13 (June 3), 327-328, 330, 331
Continental Shelf between Tunisia and Libya (Tuns. v. Libya), 1982 I.C.J. 18 (Feb. 24), 326, 327
East Timor (Port. v. Austl.), 1995 I.C.J. 90 (June 30), 344, 444
Fisheries Jurisdiction, (U.K. v. Ice.) 1974 I.C.J. 3 (July 25), 34, 44, 45, 375
Gabcíkovo-Nagymaros Project (Hung./Slovk.), 1997 I.C.J. 7 (Sept. 25), 47, 48
Garden Contamination Cases, 80 I.L.R. 367 (Provincial Court of Bonn 1987) (F.R.G.), 457
Haya de la Torre, (Colom. v. Peru) 1951 I.C.J. 71 (June 13), 333, 340
Interhandel (Switz. v. U.S.), 1959 I.C.J. 6 (Mar. 21), 50, 282
Iran Aircraft Industries and Iran Helicopter Support and Renewal Company v. Avco Corp., 980 F.2d 141 (2d Cir. 1992), 221
Iran-United States Claims Tribunal v. AS, 94 I.L.R. 320 (Hoge Raad der Nederlanden 1985), 411
The Islamic Republic of Iran v. The United States of America, Case No. A27, Iran-United States Claims Tribunal, June 5, 1998, 226, 240, 384, 402, 403
The Islamic Republic of Iran v. The United States of America, Request for Revision, Cases Nos. A3, A8, A9, A14, B61, Iran-United States Claims Tribunal, July 1, 2011, 233
Jurisdictional Immunities of the State (Germany v. Italy), Application Instituting Proceedings (Dec. 28, 2008), 352, 399
LaGrand (F.R.G. v. U.S.), 2001 I.C.J. 466 (June 27), 139, 293, 300, 316, 322, 367–69, 401–02
Legality of Use of Force (Yugo. v. Belg.), 1999 I.C.J. 124 (June 2), 322
M. Flatow v. The Islamic Republic of Iran, 74 F. Supp. 2d 18 (S.D.N.Y. 1999), 403, 419
Monetary Gold Removed from Rome in 1943 (Italy v. Fr., U.K., U.S.), 1954 I.C.J. 19 (June 15), 286, 348, 349, 351, 383
Northern Cameroons (Cameroon v. United Kingdom), 1963 I.C.J. 15 (Dec. 2), 33, 39, 347, 443


Optant's Case, Francis Deak, The Hungarian-Rumanian Land Dispute (1928), 376

Perfecture of Voitia v. Federal Republic of Germany, Case No. 11/2000, Aerios Pagos (Hellenic Supreme Court), May 4, 2000, 400

Phosphates in Morocco, (Italy v. Fr.) 1938 P.C.I.J. (ser. A/B) No. 74, at 10 (June 14), 31, 445–48

Prosecutor v. Tadić, Judgment, No. IT-94-1-A, Appeals Chamber Judgment (July 15, 1999), 256

Rainbow Warrior (N.Z. v. Fr.) 20 R.I.A.A. 217 (1990), 107, 201, 240

RCA Globcom Communications, Inc. v. The Islamic Republic of Iran, Case No. 160, Award No. ITM29-160-1, Oct. 31, 1983, 142, 156

The Red Crusader, 35 I.L.R. 485 (Commission of Enquiry Den.-U.K. 1962), 80, 84

Republic of Austria v. Maria V. Altmann, 541 U.S. 677 (2004), 401, 419

Rhodopia Forest Case, 28 Am. J. Int'l L. 760 (1934), 376

The S.S. Lotus (Fr. v. Turk.) 1927 P.C.I.J. (ser. A) No. 10 (Sept. 7), 390


Schooner Exchange v. McFaddon, 11 U.S. 116 (1812), 399


South West Africa Cases (Eth. v. S. Afr.) (Liber. v. S. Afr.), 1966 I.C.J. 6 (July 18), 32, 39


Tacna-Arica Arbitration (Chile v. Peru) 2 R.I.A.A. 921 (1925), 49

Temple of Preah Vihear (Cambodia v. Thailand) 1962 I.C.J. Rep. 6 (June 15), 76, 279, 323, 385


United States Diplomatic and Consular Staff in Tehran (U.S. v. Iran) 1979 I.C.J. 7 (Dec. 15), 287, 293


Acknowledgments

In preparing this second edition, I am very grateful for the exceptional research assistance of Emily Follas and Jolie Schwarz and the invaluable office assistance of Leslie Berg, Nicole Bourbon, and Regina Gesicki. Mary Cowsert and Patti Ogden of the Kresge Law Library provided, as always, great support.