

Is the American Constitution Obsolete?

Is the American Constitution Obsolete?

Edited By
Thomas J. Main

CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS
Durham, North Carolina

Copyright © 2013
Thomas J. Main
All Rights Reserved

ISBN: 978-1-59460-958-9
LCCN: 2011052593

Carolina Academic Press
700 Kent Street
Durham, North Carolina 27701
Telephone (919) 489-7486
Fax (919) 493-5668
www.cap-press.com

Printed in the United States of America

Contents

Preface	ix
PART ONE: INTRODUCTION	
Chapter 1 • Veneration and Criticism of the American Constitution	5
<i>Thomas J. Main</i>	
The Progressive Critique	6
The Antifederalist Critique	9
The Abolitionist Critique	10
Constitutional Criticism Today	11
PART TWO: THE CONSTITUTION: PRO AND CON	
Chapter 2 • Democracy and the Constitution	15
<i>Daniel Lazare</i>	
The Limits of Pragmatism	17
The Political Implications	19
End Times, Anyone?	21
Chapter 3 • We Should Preserve, Protect and Defend the Constitution — Not Trash It	25
<i>Jeremy Rabkin</i>	
Why Fix It if It's Not Broke?	26
The Authority of the Second Best	29
Too Much Constitutional Reform Will Undo the Constitution	31
A Fixed Constitution Must Sometimes Be a Flexible Constitution	35
The Most General Case for Constitutional Conservatism	37
PART THREE: RACE AND THE CONSTITUTION	
Chapter 4 • Slavery's Constitution: The Creation of America's Covenant with Death	43
<i>Paul Finkelman</i>	
Slavery in the Constitutional Structure	45
Slavery and Congressional Representation	48
Slavery and the Executive Branch	57
Commerce and Slavery: The Dirty Compromise	57
Toward Sectional Harmony	65
The Proslavery Compact	66

Chapter 5 • Planned Obsolescence? The Constitution and Slavery	69
<i>Mark A. Graber</i>	
In the Beginning	72
Framing	72
Ratification	75
Slavery and the Northern Ratification Debates	75
Southern Ratification Conventions	77
Obsolescence Over Time	79
The Southern Perception	80
Northern Perceptions	81
Contemporary Lessons?	82
PART FOUR: THE ELECTORAL COLLEGE: END IT OR MEND IT?	
Chapter 6 • Why the U.S. Needs Direct Election of the President	87
<i>George C. Edwards III</i>	
Constitutional Consistency	88
Defending Interests	89
Attention to State Interests	92
Fragmenting the Party System	95
Preserving Federalism	98
Protecting Non-State-Based Minority Interests	100
Why Not Elect Everyone by the Same Rules?	100
Campaigns under Direct Election	101
Conclusion	102
Chapter 7 • The Electoral College: Mend It, Don't End It	105
<i>Larry A. Sabato</i>	
The Founding of a College	106
Advantages of the Electoral College	107
Concerns with the Current Electoral College	108
Reforms That Abolish the Electoral College	109
Reforms That Mend the Electoral College... but Have Unintended Consequences	110
Reform Approaches That Mend the Electoral College... and Can Work	113
PART FIVE: THE CONSTITUTION AND GRIDLOCK	
Chapter 8 • Thinking about Gridlock	121
<i>Sanford Levinson</i>	
Chapter 9 • Does the Constitution Encourage Gridlock?	135
<i>R. Shep Melnick</i>	
From Stalemate to Gridlock	137
Where's the Beef?	139
From Veto Points to Opportunity Points	143
Compared to What?	146

PART SIX: JUDICIAL REVIEW AND DEMOCRACY**Chapter 10 • Against Judicial Review 151***Mark Tushnet*

The Positive Component	152
The Negative Component	154
Justice-Related Justifications	155
Democracy-Related Justifications	157
Redundancy Justifications	159
Conclusion	160

Chapter 11 • In Defense of Judicial Review 163*Stephen Macedo*

Majoritarian vs. Constitutional Conceptions of Democracy	164
Constitutional Democracy	165
Majoritarianism Reexamined	166
Constitutional Democracy and Judicial Review	170
Democracy-Enhancing Judicial Review: From Theory to Practice	172
Judicial Review, Popular Constitutional Choice, and Global Constitutionalism	174
Is the American Constitution Ideal?	176
Conclusion	177

PART SEVEN: AN IMPERIAL PRESIDENCY?**Chapter 12 • The Imperial Presidency, or “Who Doesn’t Belong and Why?”:
Lincoln, FDR, Bush 43 and Obama 181***Richard M. Pious*

Lincoln’s Constitutional Dictatorship	184
FDR’s “Dr. Win the War” Prerogatives	188
Surveillance Authority	191
Status of Enemy Combatants	191
Indefinite Detention of American Citizens	192
Interrogation of Unlawful Combatants	193
Military Tribunals	194
Denial of Habeas Corpus and Counsel to American Citizens	196
Partial Separation of Powers	197
Partial Separation and Parallel Governance	197
Congress and Interbranch Collaborative Frameworks	201
Ending Judicial Evasion	202
In sum...	204

Chapter 13 • Vindicating the Presidency in a Time of Terror 207*Marc Landy*

President and Congress	208
Judicial Supremacy	212
Partisanship and Foreign Policy	216
Iran Contra	217
The False Peace	220
9/11, the War Metaphor and the Rebirth of Foreign Policy Partisanship	220

The War on Terror	222
Acquitting Bush	223
Coercive Interrogation	225
Conclusion	228
PART EIGHT: SUMMARY	
Chapter 14 • Conclusions and Further Questions	233
<i>Akhil Reed Amar</i>	
We the People	233
Remember the States	236
Remember the Amendments	238
Imagine	240
Notes	245
About the Authors	291
Index	295

Preface

Americans revere their Constitution but are disturbed by growing signs of political dysfunction. We have placed in the White House candidates who have not won a majority of the popular vote. In time of war and terrorism, fears of an imperial presidency persist. Gridlock prevents reform in immigration, public finance and other vital areas. An economic crisis generates fears that the system may not be able to respond effectively. Can we solve the problems we face under the current Constitution or does the 21st Century call for a new Magna Carta?

This volume had its origin in a conference to debate the strengths and weaknesses of the American Constitution sponsored by the Free Institutions Program of the City University of New York and held at Baruch College on May 4-5 2008. Contributions to the conference were organized to present the pros and cons of several important features of the Constitution. We hope that this volume will contribute to more and better discussion and understanding of the American Constitution.