

Louis D. Brandeis's
MIT Lectures on Law (1892–1894)

CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS
Legal History Series
H. Jefferson Powell, Series Editor



LOUIS D. BRANDEIS'S MIT LECTURES ON LAW (1892–1894)
Robert F. Cochran, Jr., editor

LAW IN WAR, WAR AS LAW
*Brigadier General Joseph Holt and the Judge Advocate General's Department
in the Civil War and Early Reconstruction, 1861–1865*
Joshua E. Kastenber

GENTLEMEN OF THE GRAND JURY
*The Surviving Grand Jury Charges from Colonial, State,
and Lower Federal Courts Before 1801*
Stanton D. Krauss, editor

A VIEW OF THE CONSTITUTION OF THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA
Second Edition
William Rawle with Foreword, Introduction,
and Notes by H. Jefferson Powell

COMMENTARIES ON THE CONSTITUTION OF THE UNITED STATES
Joseph Story with Introduction by
Ronald D. Rotunda and John E. Nowak

OUR CHIEF MAGISTRATE AND HIS POWERS
William Howard Taft with Foreword, Introduction,
and Notes by H. Jefferson Powell

THE FETHA NAGAST
The Law of the Kings
Abba Paulos Tzadua, translator, and Peter L. Strauss

Louis D. Brandeis's
MIT Lectures on Law (1892–1894)

Edited by

Robert F. Cochran, Jr.

LOUIS D. BRANDEIS PROFESSOR OF LAW
DIRECTOR, HERBERT & ELINOR NOOTBAAR INSTITUTE ON
LAW, RELIGION, AND ETHICS
Pepperdine University

CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS
Durham, North Carolina

Copyright © 2012
Robert F. Cochran, Jr.
All rights reserved.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Brandeis, Louis Dembitz, 1856-1941.

Louis D. Brandeis's MIT lectures on law (1892-1894) / [edited by] Robert F. Cochran, Jr.

p. cm. -- (Legal history series)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-59460-849-0 (alk. paper)

I. Law--United States. I. Cochran, Robert F., 1951- II. Massachusetts Institute of Technology. III. Title. IV. Title: MIT lectures on law (1892-1894). V. Series.

KF213.B68 C63 2011
349.73--dc23

2011029824

CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS
700 Kent Street
Durham, North Carolina 27701
Telephone (919) 489-7486
Fax (919) 493-5668

www.cap-press.com

Printed in the United States of America

Contents

Acknowledgments	vii
Editor's Introductory Essay	ix
Editorial Practices	xxxix
Brandeis's Introductions to the Course	3
[Original]* Introduction	3
[New] Introduction	4
[I. Government Regulation of Business and Labor]	7
Lecture One—Legal Limits of Business Combinations	9
Lecture Two—Legal Limits of Labor Combinations	33
Lecture Three—Legislative Regulation of Labor	51
Lecture Four—Legal Limits of Competition	63
Lecture Five—Legislative Regulation of Business	87
Lecture Six—Taxation	113
[II. The Nature and Origin of Law]	123
Lecture Seven—The Nature and Origin of Law	125
The Common Law	126
Equity	139
Common Law re Civil Law	141
Written Law	142
Unconstitutional Statutes	144
The Referendum	153
Sphere of Written Law	155
Codification	162
[Rights and the Scope of Law]	167

* The headings or portions of headings that are in brackets here and within the text were not in the original lecture notes, but have been added to clarify the lectures' content and organization.

[III. Litigation and the Lawyer]	169
Lecture Eight—Modes of Trial	171
Lecture Nine—The Machinery of the Law	187
Lecture Ten—Judicial Evidence	195
Lecture Eleven—Criminal Law [and Procedure]	207
Lecture Twelve—The Lawyer	237
[IV. Private Business Law]	249
Lecture Thirteen—Partnership	251
Lecture Fourteen—Corporations	255
Lecture Fifteen—Contracts [and Bankruptcy]	273
Lecture Sixteen—Negotiable Paper	287
Appendix One—Table of Contents and Explanatory Note from the 1907 Compilation of the Lectures	293
Appendix Two—Internal Evidence of the MIT Lectures’ Order	295
Appendix Three—Theories Regarding Homestead, the MIT Lectures, and Brandeis’s “Conversion”	301
Appendix Four—Brandeis’s 1895–96 Casebook Outlines	309
Appendix Five—Course Examinations	315
Appendix Six—Additional MIT Lecture Notes	321
Appendix Six (a)—Introduction [Predecessor to Lecture Seven]	321
Appendix Six (b)—Trusts [Predecessor to Lecture One]	329
Appendix Six (c)—The Legal Limits of Monopoly [Covered in Lecture One Herein]	342
Appendix Six (d)—Handwritten Notes on Witnesses from Lecture Ten, “Judicial Evidence”	345
Case Index	347
General Index	353

Acknowledgments

My love of legal history began when I was a law student at the University of Virginia with the lectures of Thomas F. Bergin and Calvin Woodard. My interest in Louis D. Brandeis began when Thomas L. Shaffer of Notre Dame Law School introduced me to readings on Brandeis the lawyer. One of my fields of study is legal ethics and I admired the moral influence Brandeis had with his clients and his ability to resolve disputes creatively. My admiration for Brandeis led me to Stephen W. Baskerville's *Of Law and Limitations: An Intellectual Portrait of Louis Dembitz Brandeis* and to the MIT lectures. The lectures give insight into both the progressive Brandeis was to become in the years immediately following the lectures and to the conservative he was to remain for the rest of his life.

This project could not have been completed without the assistance of many wonderful people. Scott Campbell, the Archivist of the University of Louisville School of Law's Brandeis Papers helped me find my way through those papers and Brandeis's lecture notes, deciphered many of Brandeis's hand-written notes, and located the early picture of Brandeis. Zoë Oakes and Kelly Miller of Carolina Academic Press provided expert editorial assistance. Sarah Shoemaker at Brandeis University and Diane Pierce-Williams at Milton Academy found pictures of Brandeis, his family, Samuel Warren, and Alice Grady. Michael J. Bohnen of Brandeis's law firm, now known as Nutter, McClennen & Fish in Boston, helped me understand the firm's internal practices and located a picture of the firm building at the time of the MIT lectures. Nora Murphy and Myles Crowley of the MIT Archives provided the 1892–93 MIT catalogue and Gerard Swope's student notes and picture. Don Buffaloe of the Pepperdine University School of Law library tirelessly tracked down resources related to the MIT lectures. To all of these, many thanks for your resourcefulness and attention to my needs.

Throughout Brandeis's career, as lawyer, MIT lecturer, and Supreme Court Justice, he had the joy of working with bright young people. I have shared a similar experience in this project with my student research assistants, some of whom are already serving as Brandeis-like counselors-at-law. The following provided invaluable research assistance in this project: John Ceglia, Will

Glaser, Jeff Hassler, Mary Huebert, Shannon Miller, Kelsey Stapler, Janelle White, Amy Wingfield, and Jeff Wyss.

Thanks as well to Rebecca Carpenter, Donna Green, and Sophia Sipsas for their careful attention to detail as they transcribed the lectures and performed other textual tasks. And thanks to my son Robbie Cochran for doing a marvelous job editing and placing the pictures used in the text and cover.

The photographs on the cover and within the text were provided by the following:

Portrait of Brandeis on page xv: Louis D. Brandeis School of Law at the University of Louisville.

Rich Building in Boston on page xiv: Courtesy of the Bostonian Society/Old State House Museum, Boston Streets Collection.

Portrait of Samuel D. Warren on page xiv: Reprinted with permission of Milton Academy.

Portrait of Francis Amasa Walker on page xiv: The Warren J. Samuels Portrait Collection at Duke University.

Portrait of Gerard Swope on page xv: Public domain from the 1895 MIT Yearbook.

Rogers Hall at MIT on page xv and the back cover: Courtesy of the Bostonian Society/Old State House Museum, Boston Streets Collection.

The front cover picture of Brandeis and all remaining pictures herein: Robert D. Farber University Archives & Special Collections Department, Brandeis University.

I am grateful to faculty colleagues who provided valuable insight at workshops sponsored by the University of Virginia's Law and Humanities Committee and the Pepperdine University School of Law. Thanks to Ken Abraham, Kerry Abrams, Barb Armacost, Charles Barzun, Barry Cushman, Dave Douglas, Ken Elzinga, Gordon Hylton, Ed Kitch, Jeff Powell, Bob Pushaw, Mark Scarberry, Rich Schragger, Paul Stephan, Walter Wadlington, and Ted White for comments on early drafts of these materials. Thanks to Dean Ken Starr and Interim Dean Tom Bost of Pepperdine University School of Law for granting me a sabbatical and financial support for this project and to Dean Paul Mahoney of the University of Virginia for hosting me during my sabbatical.

Finally, a special thanks to Herb and Elinor Nootbaar for funding the Nootbaar Institute on Law, Religion, and Ethics, which provided support for this project.