Separation of Powers Law

Carolina Academic Press Law Casebook Series Advisory Board



Gary J. Simson, Chairman
Case Western Reserve University School of Law

John C. Coffee, Jr. Columbia University Law School

Randall Coyne University of Oklahoma College of Law

> Paul Finkelman Albany Law School

Robert M. Jarvis Shepard Broad Law Center Nova Southeastern University

Vincent R. Johnson St. Mary's University School of Law

Michael A. Olivas University of Houston Law Center

Kenneth L. Port William Mitchell College of Law

H. Jefferson Powell George Washington University Law School

Michael P. Scharf Case Western Reserve University School of Law

> Peter M. Shane Michael E. Moritz College of Law The Ohio State University

> > Emily L. Sherwin Cornell Law School

John F. Sutton, Jr.
Emeritus, University of Texas School of Law

David B. Wexler James E. Rogers College of Law, University of Arizona University of Puerto Rico School of Law

Separation of Powers Law

Cases and Materials

Third Edition

Peter M. Shane

JACOB E. DAVIS AND JACOB E. DAVIS II CHAIR IN LAW, OHIO STATE UNIVERSITY MORITZ COLLEGE OF LAW

Harold H. Bruff

Charles Inglis Thomson Professor of Law, University of Colorado Law School

CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS

Durham, North Carolina

Copyright © 2011 Harold H. Bruff and Peter M. Shane All Rights Reserved

ISBN: 978-1-59460-741-7

LCCN: 2011922347

Carolina Academic Press 700 Kent Street Durham, North Carolina 27701 Telephone (919) 489-7486 Fax (919) 493-5668 www.cap-press.com

Printed in the United States of America

For Martha and Beth p.m.s.

For Sherry and Annie h.h.b.

Contents

Table of Cases	xix
Preface	xxvii
Chapter 1 • Introduction	3
A. Constitutional History	3
1. Atlantic Legacy	3
2. Government in Colonial America	5
3. Revolutionary State Governments	5
4. The Articles of Confederation	7
5. The Constitutional Convention	8
6. Expounding and Ratifying the Constitution	11
B. Approaches to Separation of Powers Analysis	12
1. Textual	12
2. Original Intent	13
3. Structural/Functional	14
4. Institutional Competence	14
5. Historical Practice	15
6. Values	15
Chapter 1 • Introduction A. Constitutional History 1. Atlantic Legacy 2. Government in Colonial America 3. Revolutionary State Governments 4. The Articles of Confederation 5. The Constitutional Convention 6. Expounding and Ratifying the Constitution B. Approaches to Separation of Powers Analysis 1. Textual 2. Original Intent 3. Structural/Functional 4. Institutional Competence 5. Historical Practice	16
1. Washington	16
2. Jefferson	18
3. Jackson	18
4. Buchanan	19
5. Lincoln	20
6. Wilson on the Post-Civil War Presidency	20
7. Theodore Roosevelt and Taft	21
8. Franklin Roosevelt	22
9. Truman through Carter	23
10. Reagan and Rush 41	24

viii CONTENTS

11. Clinton	24
12. Bush 43	25
13. Obama	25
D. An Institutional Overview	26
1. Congress	26
2. The Executive	28
3. The Judiciary	32
Chapter 2 • Framework: The Separation and Confluence of Powers	35
A. Analytic Framework	35
1. The Executive and the Judiciary	35
Marbury v. Madison	38
Note on Obtaining Judicial Review of Executive Actions	45
2. The Executive and Congress (as Mediated by the Courts)	49
United States v. Midwest Oil Co.	52
Youngstown Sheet & Tube Co. v. Sawyer	59
3. Congress and the Judiciary: Statutory Control of Federal Jurisdiction	78
Ex parte McCardle	80
United States v. Klein	82
4. Judicial Self-Restraint	86
United States v. Richardson	89
Schlesinger v. Reservists Committee to Stop the War	94
B. Combining Powers in the Executive	102
1. Delegation of Legislative Powers	102
Mistretta v. United States	110
Problem: The Limits of Delegated Power	120
2. Presidential "Legislation," or, the Other Side of Delegation: The Role of the Executive Order	122
AFL-CIO v. Kahn	122
Note on Private Enforcement of Executive Orders	129
3. Allocating Adjudicative Power Outside the Judiciary	130
C. Fundamental Checks and Balances	137
1. Veto Powers	137
a. The President's Veto	137
Memorandum for the Heads of Executive Departments and Agencies	146
b. Pocket Vetoes	148
c. "Legislative Vetoes"	151
Immigration and Naturalization Service v. Chadha	153

CONTENTS ix

2. Congress's "Power of the Purse"	169
a. Overview of Budget and Spending Processes	169
b. Congressional Control of Spending	174
Brown v. Califano	177
c. Executive Control of Spending	180
Lincoln v. Vigil	182
Note on Impoundment of Funds	184
d. The Item Veto	188
Clinton v. City of New York	188
3. Amending the Constitution	199
Coleman v. Miller	200
Chapter 3 • Autonomy and Mutual Accountability among the Branches	207
A. Congressional Power over the Membership of the Branches	207
1. Impeachment	207
a. "High Crimes and Misdemeanors"	207
Constitutional Grounds for Presidential Impeachment	209
Impeachment of Richard M. Nixon, President of the United States	215
H. RES. 611, 105th Congress, 2d Session, Report No. 105-830 (1998)	219
Trial Memorandum of the United States House of Representatives	221
Answer of President William Jefferson Clinton to the Articles of Impeachment	224
b. A Judicial Role?	228
Nixon v. United States	229
2. Membership in Congress	235
a. Exclusion and Expulsion	235
Powell v. McCormack	235
b. Term Limits	240
B. Immunities of Government Officers	241
Congressional Immunity	241
Gravel v. United States	243
2. Immunities of Executive Officers from Civil Liability	250
a. The President	250
Nixon v. Fitzgerald	250
Clinton v. Jones	259
b. Other Executive Officers	259
Harlow & Butterfield v. Fitzgerald	267
Mitchell v. Forsyth	272

x CONTENTS

3. Judicial Immunities	276
C. Information and Accountability	277
1. Confidentiality in Congress and the Judiciary	277
2. Executive Privilege	279
a. Courts versus The Executive	279
United States v. Nixon	279
The State Secrets Privilege	290
Mohamed v. Jeppesen Dataplan, Inc.	291
b. Congress versus The Executive	311
1.) Executive Branch Procedure for Invoking Executive Privilege	313
Memorandum for the Heads of Executive Departments and Agencies	313
2.) A Constitutional Requirement of Compromise?	315
3.) Litigating Executive Response to Congressional Subpoenas	316
Committee on the Judiciary, U.S. House of Representatives v. Miers	316
D. Congressional Power to Regulate Accountability	335
1. Regulating the Executive	336
a. Control of Presidential Documents	336
Nixon v. Administrator of General Services	336
b. The Administrative Procedure Act	341
c. Freedom of Information Act	348
Kissinger v. Reporters Committee for Freedom of the Press	348
d. Federal Advisory Committee Act	351
Ass'n of American Physicians and Surgeons v. Clinton	354
Cheney v. United States District Court for the District of Columbia	359
e. Other Statutory Restrictions	366
f. Subjecting Presidential Advisers to Advice and Consent	367
2. Regulating the Judiciary	371
Mistretta v. United States	371
3. Congressional Self-Regulation	376
Chapter 4 • Control of Administration by the Elected Branches	381
A. Personnel	381
1. Appointment of Executive Officers	381
Buckley v. Valeo	381
Note on Presidential Authority and the Civil Service	391
2. Appointment of Judges	393
a. Appointments to the Supreme Court	393
Note on Supreme Court Appointments	393

CONTENTS xi

The Coming Crisis in Recovery and What Can Be Done About It	399
Reorganization of the Federal Judiciary	401
b. Appointments to the Courts of Appeals and District Courts	403
c. Recess Appointments of Judges	405
3. Removals (Herein of Independent Agencies)	408
a. Separation of Powers	408
Myers v. United States	410
Humphrey's Executor v. United States	417
Bowsher v. Synar	422
b. First Amendment Limitations	433
Branti v. Finkel	433
B. Modern Syntheses of Appointment and Removal Powers	436
Morrison v. Olson	436
Free Enterprise Fund v. Public Company Accounting Oversight Board	454
C. Supervision and Coordination of Policymaking	472
1. The President's Power to Manage Administration	472
a. Formative Years: Groping for Principles	472
The Jewels of the Princess of Orange	473
b. The President's Statutory Powers to Manage the Executive Branch	476
c. Participation in Administrative Rulemaking	478
Sierra Club v. Costle	478
d. Coordinating the Regulatory Process	486
Regulatory Organization	488
Memorandum for Honorable David Stockman, Director, Office of Management and Budget	495
2. Congressional Oversight	511
3. A Unitary or Plural Executive? The Special Status of the Independent	
Agencies Revisited	516
D. Inherent Executive Authority in Domestic Affairs?	522
1. Youngstown Revisited: An Inherent Executive 'Protective' Power?	522
United States v. City of Philadelphia	524
2. Refusals to Enforce the Law	533
a. Power to Ignore the Courts?	534
b. Unconstitutional Statutes	536
1.) Implementation	536
Case Study: "Stay" Provisions of the Competition in Contracting Act	538

xii CONTENTS

Presidential Authority to Decline to Execute Unconstitutional	
Statutes	542
2.) Defending Congress in Court	545
Representation of Congress and Congressional Interests in Court	545
Note on Congressional Standing	548
Raines v. Byrd	548
c. Laws "Unjustified" in Fact	557
Note: Commonwealth of Pennsylvania v. Lynn	557
Case Study: Enforcing the Statutory Exclusion of Alien Homosexuals	559
3. Conducting Litigation	563
a. Civil Litigation and Faithful Execution of the Laws	563
b. Enforcing the Criminal Law	568
Memorandum to All United States Attorneys and All Heads	
of Offices, Divisions, Bureaus and Boards of the Department	570
of Justice	
4. Pardons and Reprieves	572
Chapter 5 • Foreign Policy and National Security	583
A. Analytic Framework: Sorting the Elected Branches' Claims to Power	584
Letters of Pacificus, No. I	584
Note: The History of National Security Powers	590
United States v. Curtiss-Wright Corp.	593
Note: The Logan Act and the Federal Government's Monopoly in Foreign Policy	602
B. Executive Claims to Inherent and Exclusive Powers	603
1. Treaty Processes	603
a. Overview of Treaty Powers	603
b. Presidential Treaty Implementation	609
Medellín v. Texas	609
c. Presidential Treaty Termination	620
Goldwater v. Carter	620
Goldwater v. Carter	631
2. Executive Agreements	636
Note: International Non-Treaty Agreements	636
Memorandum Opinion for the United States Trade Representative: Whether Uruguay Round Agreements	(27
Required Ratification as a Treaty	637
United States v. Pink	644
Dames & Moore v. Regan	652

CONTENTS	X11

3. Control of Sensitive Information	668
New York Times Co. v. United States	669
Problem: Applying New York Times after September 11	680
Snepp v. United States	682
Note on Classification of Government Documents	689
4. Power to Conduct Investigations (Herein, of Foreign Intelligence Surveillance)	693
a. Electronic Surveillance, Executive Power and the Fourth Amendment Prior to FISA	693
Foreign Intelligence Surveillance Act of 1977	693
United States v. United States District Court (Keith)	695
b. The Foreign Intelligence Surveillance Act, 1978–2001	702
c. FISA After September 11 and the Wall of Separation Problem	708
d. The Terrorist Surveillance Program and Warrantless Surveillance under Bush 43	713
1.) The Scope of the Program	714
Jeffrey W. Seifert, Data Mining and Homeland Security: An Overview	714
2.) The Administration's Legal Defense	716
Unclassified Report on the President's Surveillance Program	717
Letter from William E. Moschella, Assistant Attorney General in Charge of the Office of Legislative Affairs, U.S. Department of Justice, to Hon. Pat Roberts, Chairman, Senate Select Committee on Intelligence, et al.	719
3.) Replying to the Administration's Case	722
January 9, 2006 Letter from Scholars and Former Government Officials to Congressional Leadership in Response to	726
Justice Department Letter of December 22, 2005	722
4.) Evaluating the Justice Department as Legal Advisor	727
5.) Congressional Responses	732
6.) Litigation and Accountability	734
C. Congress's Role in Regulating Foreign Policy	736
1. Direct Regulation of Foreign Affairs and National Security Policy	736
 a. Presidential and Congressional Oversight of CIA and FBI Intelligence Gathering 	736
Samuel J. Rascoff, Domesticating Intelligence	742
b. The Iran-Contra Affair	754
c. Iran-Contra and Congressional Oversight of Covert Operations	760
Title 50, Chapter 15 — National Security	761

xiv CONTENTS

2. Foreign Policy and Foreign Commerce	770
a. The International Emergency Economic Powers Act	770
b. Trade Expansion Act	772
Independent Gasoline Marketers Council v. Duncan	772
3. Immigration and Foreign Policy	776
4. Regulatory Programs Affecting Foreign Policy	779
Westinghouse Electric Corp. v. U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission	779
Note: CAB Review of Air Carrier Acquisitions	785
D. Judicial Review and Foreign Policy	789
Haig v. Agee	790
Chapter 6 • War Powers	805
A. Power to Commit Troops—From the Founding to Vietnam	806
1. Scope of the Commander in Chief Clause: Early Views	806
The Federalist, No. 69 (Hamilton)	806
Little v. Barreme	807
The Prize Cases	809
Note: The Prize Cases and September 11	818
Authorization for the Use of Force	818
2. The Vietnam Watershed	819
a. Debating Executive Claims to Power	819
Meeker, The Legality of United States Participation in the Defense of Viet-Nam	819
National Commitments	824
Notes and Questions on Vietnam	838
b. Judicial Reluctance to Intervene	840
Mora v. McNamara	841
c. Congress's Efforts to Limit the President's Authority to Commit Troops: The War Powers Resolution	844
War Powers Resolution	844
President Nixon's Veto of the War Powers Resolution	847
War Powers: A Test of Compliance—Relative to the Danang Sealift, the Evacuation of Phnom Penh, the Evacuation of Saigon, and the Mayaguez Incident	849
Explanation by Senator Jacob Javits of the Conference Report	850
Questions on the War Powers Resolution	850
Note: Covert Warmaking and the Neutrality Act	852
Note: War Powers and Impeachment	853

CONTENTS xv

Β.	. Unilateral Presidential Initiative after the War Powers Resolution	856
	1. Presidential War-Making in the Post-Vietnam Era	856
	a. Rescuing Americans	858
	President Carter's Report to Speaker O'Neill Concerning the Abortive Rescue Attempt in Iran	859
	Legal Opinion by Lloyd Cutler, President's Counsel, on War Powers Consultation Relative to the Iran Rescue Mission (May 9, 1980)	860
	b. Stabilizing Other Governments in Furtherance of American Foreign Policy	861
	c. Retaliation for Attacks on United States Persons	864
	d. Protecting U.S. Persons and Property	865
	e. Humanitarian Intervention	866
	f. Antiterrorism Operations	867
	g. International Peacekeeping	868
	Memorandum for the Attorney General Re: Authorization for Continuing Hostilities in Kosovo	872
	2. Judicial Review of Presidential War-Making	879
	Campbell v. Clinton	879
	3. Reform of the War Powers Resolution	894
	Robert F. Grimmett, The War Powers Resolution: After Thirty-Six Years	894
C.	. Congressionally Authorized Wars after Vietnam: The Persian Gulf and Iraq Wars	900
	1. The Persian Gulf War: A New Watershed?	901
	a. Managing the Crisis under Presidential Authority Alone	901
	Letter to the Speaker of the House and the President Pro Tempore of the Senate on the Deployment of United States Armed Forces to Saudi Arabia and the Middle East	901
	Letter to the Speaker of the House and the President Pro Tempore of the Senate on Additional Economic Measures Taken with Respect to Iraq and Kuwait	902
	b. The United Nations Authorizes Force	904
	United Nations Security Council Resolution 678	904
	c. Congress Acts (and the President Responds)	905
	Authorization for Use of Military Force against Iraq Resolution	905
	Statement on Signing the Resolution Authorizing the Use of Military Force Against Iraq	906
	d. The Conduct of the War	907
	2. The Iraq Invasion of 2003	908
	a. From the Persian Gulf War to the 2003 Invasion	909
	b. Constitutional War Powers and International Law	913

xvi CONTENTS

David Ackerman, International Law and the Preemptive Use of Force against Iraq	913
Mary Ellen O'Connell, UN Resolution 1441: Compelling Saddam, Restraining Bush	914
c. The Necessity and Scope of Congressional Authorization	917
Authorization for Use of Military Force Against Iraq	
Resolution of 2002	917
Doe v. Bush	921
D. Presidential Wartime Powers Off the Battlefield	935
1. Civil Liberties	935
a. The Uncertain Legacy of Milligan and Korematsu	935
Ex parte Milligan	936
Korematsu v. United States	942
Notes and Questions on Japanese Internment and Its Aftermath	956
b. Wartime Powers during the "War" on Terror	958
Stephen J. Shapiro, et al., Report of the Bar of the City of New York	959
Notice, Detention, Treatment, and Trial of Certain Non-Citizens in the War against Terrorism	960
Hamdi v. Rumsfeld	965
Harold H. Bruff, Bad Advice: Bush's Lawyers in the War on Terror	988
Hamdan v. Rumsfeld	995
Boumediene v. Bush	1010
Notes and Questions on the Guantanamo Detainee Cases	1023
Note: Government Lawyering, September 11 and the Iraq War	1029
Harold H. Bruff, Bad Advice: Bush's Lawyers in the War on Terror	1031
2. Mobilization and Regulation of the Economy	1050
Note: Presidential Economic Controls During World War II	1050
Powers of the President under the War Labor Disputes Act to Seize Properties Affected by Strikes	1053
E. Peace Time Authority to Use Troops for Law Enforcement ("Posse Comitatus")	1055
President's Power to Use Federal Troops to Suppress Resistance to	
Enforcement of Federal Court Orders—Little Rock, Arkansas	1056
F. Federalism and War Powers	1063
Chapter 7 • Power and Institutional Design: The Case of the Presidency	1065
A. Presidential Elections	1066
1. The Role of States in Presidential Selection	1066
a. The Mechanics of the Electoral College: A Primer	1066
1.) The Constitutional Basics	1066
2.) The Statutory Framework	1067

CONTENTS	XV11

3.) 1.	ne Nature of the Elector's Office	1068
b. The	Merits of the Electoral College: A Debate	1068
	Direct Popular Election of the President and Vice President of the United States	1069
	J. A. Best, Prepared Statement on "The Case for the Electoral College"	1076
2. Bush v.	Gore and the Constitutional Law of Presidential Elections	1083
	Peter M. Shane, Disappearing Democracy: How <i>Bush v. Gore</i> Undermined the Federal Right to Vote for Presidential Electors	1084
	Bush v. Palm Beach County Canvassing Board	1089
	Bush v. Gore [I]	1095
	Bush v. Gore [II]	1097
	Coda: Bush v. Gore in Historical Perspective	1130
	Edward B. Foley, Bush v. Gore in Historical Perspective	1130
B. Presidentia	al and Vice-Presidential Succession	1134
	R. Celada, Presidential Continuity and Vice Presidential Vacancy Amendment	1134
	Note: Reagan-Bush Temporary Power Transfer	1138
C. Redesignir	ng the President's Political Role	1139
1. Diagnos	sis One: Presidents Can Accomplish Too Little	1140
	Lloyd N. Cutler, To Form a Government	1140
2. Diagnos	sis Two: "The Most Dangerous Branch"	1142
	Sanford Levinson and Jack M. Balkin, Constitutional Dictatorship: Its Dangers and Its Design	1144
	Garrett Epps, The Ill-Made Prince: A Modest Proposal for a New Article II	1149
Appendix	Selected Statutes and Presidential Documents	1155
	United States Code—Selected Provisions	
	Title 2—The Congress	1156
	Title 3—The President	1160
	Title 5—Government Operations and Employees	1161
	Title 18—Crimes and Criminal Procedure	1161
	Title 22 — Foreign Relations and Intercourse	1164
	Title 28 — Judiciary and Judicial Procedure	1164
	Title 31 — Money and Finance	1185
	Title 40—Public Buildings, Property, and Works	1189
	Title 44—Public Printing and Documents	1190
	Title 50—War and National Defense	1194
	Title 50, Appendix — War and National Defense	1197

xviii CONTENTS

	January 1, 1863 By the President of the United States of America: A Proclamation	1201
	Exec. Order No. 10340 April 10, 1952, 17 F.R. 3139 Directing the Secretary of Commerce to Take Possession of and Operate the Plants and Facilities of Certain Steel Companies	1202
	Exec. Order No. 11615 August 17, 1971, 36 F.R. 15727 Providing for Stabilization of Prices, Rents, Wages, and Salaries	1204
	Exec. Order No. 12092 Nov. 1, 1978, 43 F.R. 51735 Prohibition Against Inflationary Procurement Practices	1206
	Exec. Order No. 12866 Sep. 30, 1993, 58 F.R. 51735 Regulatory Planning and Review	1207
	Constitution of the United States	1218
	Amendments to the Constitution	1226
Index		1233

Table of Cases

States, 107 Abbott Laboratories v. Gardner, 342 Adams v. Richardson, 177 AFL-CIO v. Kahn, 122 Agee v. Muskie, 792 Airline Pilots Ass'n Int'l v. Civil Aeronautics Board, 788 Al-Haramain Islamic Foundation, Inc. v. Bush, 309, 734 Al-Kidd v. Ashcroft, 987 Al-Maqaleh v. Gates, 1028 Alaska Airlines, Inc. v. Brock, 167 Alden v. Maine, 13 Alderman v. United States, 701 Allen v. Wright, 88, 550 American Federation of Government Employees v. Reagan, 128 American Insurance Co. v. Canter, 131 American Int'l Group v. Islamic Republic of Iran, 655, 656, 665 Ameron, Inc. v. United States Army Corps of Engineers, 543 Anaconda Copper Co. v. Andrus, 58 Andrus v. Sierra Club, 366 Barclays Bank PLC v. Franchise Tax Bd. of Cal., 616 Barnes, v. Kline, 150, 555, 887 Barr v. Matteo, 245 Bas v. Tingy, 838, 884, 890 Beckstrom v. Volusia County Canvassing Bd., 1107 Belk v. United States, 664 Berger v. New York, 696, 697 Bernstein v. N.V. Nederlandsche- Amerikaansche Stoomwaart- Maatschappij, 651 Berry v. Reagan, 431 Biddle v. Perovich, 572 Bivens v. Six Unknown Named Agents of Federal Bureau of Narcotics, 250, 258, 275, 525 Black v. McGuffage, 1128 Board of Regents of State Colleges v. Roth, 665 Boardman v. Esteva, 1105 Bob Jones University v. United States, 180 Boehner v. Anderson, 200 Bouie v. City of Columbia, 1104, 1115 Boumediene v. Bush, 1010
Adams v. Richardson, 177 AFL-CIO v. Kahn, 122 Agee v. Muskie, 792 Airline Pilots Ass'n Int'l v. Civil Aeronautics Board, 788 Al-Haramain Islamic Foundation, Inc. v. Bush, 309, 734 Al-Kiidd v. Ashcroft, 987 Al-Maqaleh v. Gates, 1028 Alaska Airlines, Inc. v. Brock, 167 Alden v. Maine, 13 Aldlen v. Wright, 88, 550 American Federation of Government Employees v. Reagan, 128 American Int'l Group v. Islamic Republic of Iran, 655, 656, 665 Ameron, Inc. v. United States Army Corps of Engineers, 543 Anderson v. Celebrezze, 1103 Andrus v. Sierra Club, 366 Barnes v. Kline, 150, 555, 887 Barr v. Matteo, 245 Bas v. Tingy, 838, 884, 890 Beckstrom v. Volusia County Canvassing Bd., 1107 Belk v. United States, 664 Berger v. New York, 696, 697 Bernstein v. N.V. Nederlandsche-Amerikaansche Stoomvaart-Maatschappij, 651 Berry v. Reagan, 431 Biddle v. Perovich, 572 Bivens v. Six Unknown Named Agents of Federal Bureau of Narcotics, 250, 258, 275, 525 Black v. McGuffage, 1128 Board of Regents of State Colleges v. Roth, 665 Boardman v. Esteva, 1105 Bob Jones University v. United States, 180 Bouie v. City of Columbia, 1104, 1115 Boumediene v. Bush, 1010
AFL-CIO v. Kahn, 122 Agee v. Muskie, 792 Airline Pilots Ass'n Int'l v. Civil Aeronautics Board, 788 Al-Haramain Islamic Foundation, Inc. v. Bush, 309, 734 Al-Kidd v. Ashcroft, 987 Al-Maqaleh v. Gates, 1028 Alaska Airlines, Inc. v. Brock, 167 Alden v. Maine, 13 Alderman v. United States, 701 Allen v. Wright, 88, 550 American Federation of Government Employees v. Reagan, 128 American Insurance Co. v. Canter, 131 American Int'l Group v. Islamic Republic of Iran, 655, 656, 665 Ameron, Inc. v. United States Army Corps of Engineers, 543 Anderson v. Celebrezze, 1103 Andrus v. Sierra Club, 366 Barnes v. Kline, 150, 555, 887 Barr v. Matteo, 245 Barr v. Matteo, 245 Barr v. Matteo, 245 Barr v. Matteo, 245 Bas v. Tingy, 838, 884, 890 Beckstrom v. Volusia County Canvassing Bd., 1107 Belk v. United States, 664 Berger v. New York, 696, 697 Bernstein v. N.V. Nederlandsche- Amerikaansche Stoomvaart- Maatschappij, 651 Berry v. Reagan, 431 Berry v. Reagan, 431 Berry v. Reagan, 431 Biddle v. Perovich, 572 Bivens v. Six Unknown Named Agents of Federal Bureau of Narcotics, 250, 258, 275, 525 Black v. McGuffage, 1128 Board of Regents of State Colleges v. Roth, 665 Boardman v. Esteva, 1105 Bob Jones University v. United States, 180 Boehner v. Anderson, 200 Bouie v. City of Columbia, 1104, 1115 Boumediene v. Bush, 1010
Agee v. Muskie, 792 Airline Pilots Ass'n Int'l v. Civil Aeronautics Board, 788 Al-Haramain Islamic Foundation, Inc. v. Bush, 309, 734 Al-Kidd v. Ashcroft, 987 Al-Maqaleh v. Gates, 1028 Alaska Airlines, Inc. v. Brock, 167 Alden v. Maine, 13 Alderman v. United States, 701 Allen v. Wright, 88, 550 American Federation of Government Employees v. Reagan, 128 American Insurance Co. v. Canter, 131 American Int'l Group v. Islamic Republic of Iran, 655, 656, 665 Ameron, Inc. v. United States Army Corps of Engineers, 543 Anderson v. Celebrezze, 1103 Andrus v. Sierra Club, 366 Barr v. Matteo, 245 Bas v. Tingy, 838, 884, 890 Beckstrom v. Volusia County Canvassing Bd., 1107 Belk v. United States, 664 Berger v. New York, 696, 697 Bernstein v. N.V. Nederlandsche- Amerikaansche Stoomvaart- Maatschappij, 651 Berry v. Reagan, 431 Biddle v. Perovich, 572 Bivens v. Six Unknown Named Agents of Federal Bureau of Narcotics, 250, 258, 275, 525 Black v. McGuffage, 1128 Board of Regents of State Colleges v. Roth, 665 Boardman v. Esteva, 1105 Boehner v. Anderson, 200 Bouie v. City of Columbia, 1104, 1115 Boumediene v. Bush, 1010
Airline Pilots Ass'n Int'l v. Civil Aeronautics Board, 788 Al-Haramain Islamic Foundation, Inc. v. Bush, 309, 734 Al-Kidd v. Ashcroft, 987 Al-Maqaleh v. Gates, 1028 Alaska Airlines, Inc. v. Brock, 167 Alden v. Maine, 13 Alderman v. United States, 701 Allen v. Wright, 88, 550 American Federation of Government Employees v. Reagan, 128 American Insurance Co. v. Canter, 131 American Int'l Group v. Islamic Republic of Iran, 655, 656, 665 Ameron, Inc. v. United States Army Corps of Engineers, 543 Anderson v. Celebrezze, 1103 Andrus v. Sierra Club, 366 Bas v. Tingy, 838, 884, 890 Beckstrom v. Volusia County Canvassing Bd., 1107 Belk v. United States, 664 Berger v. New York, 696, 697 Bernstein v. N.V. Nederlandsche- Amerikaansche Stoomvaart- Maatschappij, 651 Berry v. Reagan, 431 Biddle v. Perovich, 572 Bivens v. Six Unknown Named Agents of Federal Bureau of Narcotics, 250, 258, 275, 525 Black v. McGuffage, 1128 Board of Regents of State Colleges v. Roth, 665 Boardman v. Esteva, 1105 Bob Jones University v. United States, 180 Bouie v. City of Columbia, 1104, 1115 Boumediene v. Bush, 1010
tics Board, 788 Al-Haramain Islamic Foundation, Inc. v. Bush, 309, 734 Al-Kidd v. Ashcroft, 987 Al-Maqaleh v. Gates, 1028 Alaska Airlines, Inc. v. Brock, 167 Alden v. Maine, 13 Alderman v. United States, 701 Allen v. Wright, 88, 550 American Federation of Government Employees v. Reagan, 128 American Insurance Co. v. Canter, 131 American Int'l Group v. Islamic Republic of Iran, 655, 656, 665 Ameron, Inc. v. United States Army Corps of Engineers, 543 Anderson v. Celebrezze, 1103 Andrus v. Sierra Club, 366 Beckstrom v. Volusia County Canvassing Bd., 1107 Belk v. United States, 664 Berger v. New York, 696, 697 Bernstein v. N.V. Nederlandsche- Amerikaansche Stoomvaart- Maatschappij, 651 Berry v. Reagan, 431 Berry v. Reag
Al-Haramain Islamic Foundation, Inc. v. Bush, 309, 734 Al-Kidd v. Ashcroft, 987 Al-Maqaleh v. Gates, 1028 Alaska Airlines, Inc. v. Brock, 167 Alden v. Maine, 13 Alderman v. United States, 701 Allen v. Wright, 88, 550 American Federation of Government Employees v. Reagan, 128 American Hospital Ass'n v. NLRB, 183 American Int'l Group v. Islamic Republic of Iran, 655, 656, 665 Ameron, Inc. v. United States Army Corps of Engineers, 543 Anaconda Copper Co. v. Andrus, 58 Andrus v. Sierra Club, 366 Berger v. New York, 696, 697 Bernstein v. N.V. Nederlandsche- Amerikaansche Stoomvaart- Maatschappij, 651 Berry v. Reagan, 431 Berry v. Reagan, 431 Berry v. Reagan, 431 Biddle v. Perovich, 572 Bivens v. Six Unknown Named Agents of Federal Bureau of Narcotics, 250, 258, 275, 525 Black v. McGuffage, 1128 Board of Regents of State Colleges v. Roth, 665 Boardman v. Esteva, 1105 Boehner v. Anderson, 200 Bouie v. City of Columbia, 1104, 1115 Boumediene v. Bush, 1010
Bush, 309, 734 Al-Kidd v. Ashcroft, 987 Al-Maqaleh v. Gates, 1028 Alaska Airlines, Inc. v. Brock, 167 Alden v. Maine, 13 Alderman v. United States, 701 Allen v. Wright, 88, 550 American Federation of Government Employees v. Reagan, 128 American Insurance Co. v. Canter, 131 American Int'l Group v. Islamic Republic of Iran, 655, 656, 665 Ameron, Inc. v. United States Army Corps of Engineers, 543 Anderson v. Celebrezze, 1103 Al-Kidd v. Ashcroft, 987 Berry v. New York, 696, 697 Bernstein v. N.V. Nederlandsche- Amerikaansche Stoomvaart- Maatschappij, 651 Berry v. Reagan, 431 Biddle v. Perovich, 572 Bivens v. Six Unknown Named Agents of Federal Bureau of Narcotics, 250, 258, 275, 525 Black v. McGuffage, 1128 Board of Regents of State Colleges v. Roth, 665 Boardman v. Esteva, 1105 Boardman v. Esteva, 1105 Boehner v. Anderson, 200 Bouie v. City of Columbia, 1104, 1115 Boumediene v. Bush, 1010
Al-Kidd v. Ashcroft, 987 Al-Maqaleh v. Gates, 1028 Alaska Airlines, Inc. v. Brock, 167 Alden v. Maine, 13 Alderman v. United States, 701 Allen v. Wright, 88, 550 American Federation of Government Employees v. Reagan, 128 American Hospital Ass'n v. NLRB, 183 American Insurance Co. v. Canter, 131 American Int'l Group v. Islamic Republic of Iran, 655, 656, 665 Ameron, Inc. v. United States Army Corps of Engineers, 543 Anaconda Copper Co. v. Andrus, 58 Anderson v. Celebrezze, 1103 Andrus v. Sierra Club, 366 Bernstein v. N.V. Nederlandsche- Amerikaansche Stoomvaart- Maatschappij, 651 Berry v. Reagan, 431 Biddle v. Perovich, 572 Bivens v. Six Unknown Named Agents of Federal Bureau of Narcotics, 250, 258, 275, 525 Black v. McGuffage, 1128 Board of Regents of State Colleges v. Roth, 665 Boardman v. Esteva, 1105 Bob Jones University v. United States, 180 Boehner v. Anderson, 200 Bouie v. City of Columbia, 1104, 1115 Boumediene v. Bush, 1010
Al-Maqaleh v. Gates, 1028 Alaska Airlines, Inc. v. Brock, 167 Alden v. Maine, 13 Alderman v. United States, 701 Allen v. Wright, 88, 550 American Federation of Government Employees v. Reagan, 128 American Hospital Ass'n v. NLRB, 183 American Insurance Co. v. Canter, 131 American Int'l Group v. Islamic Republic of Iran, 655, 656, 665 Ameron, Inc. v. United States Army Corps of Engineers, 543 Anaconda Copper Co. v. Andrus, 58 Anderson v. Celebrezze, 1103 Andrus v. Sierra Club, 366 Bernstein v. N.V. Nederlandsche- Amerikaansche Stoomvaart- Maatschappij, 651 Berry v. Reagan, 431 Biddle v. Perovich, 572 Bivens v. Six Unknown Named Agents of Federal Bureau of Narcotics, 250, 258, 275, 525 Black v. McGuffage, 1128 Board of Regents of State Colleges v. Roth, 665 Boardman v. Esteva, 1105 Boehner v. Anderson, 200 Bouie v. City of Columbia, 1104, 1115 Boumediene v. Bush, 1010
Alaska Airlines, Inc. v. Brock, 167 Alden v. Maine, 13 Alderman v. United States, 701 Allen v. Wright, 88, 550 American Federation of Government Employees v. Reagan, 128 American Hospital Ass'n v. NLRB, 183 American Insurance Co. v. Canter, 131 American Int'l Group v. Islamic Republic of Iran, 655, 656, 665 Ameron, Inc. v. United States Army Corps of Engineers, 543 Anaconda Copper Co. v. Andrus, 58 Anderson v. Celebrezze, 1103 Andrus v. Sierra Club, 366 American Intil Group v. Brock, 167 Amerikaansche Stoomvaart- Maatschappij, 651 Berry v. Reagan, 431 Biddle v. Perovich, 572 Bivens v. Six Unknown Named Agents of Federal Bureau of Narcotics, 250, 258, 275, 525 Black v. McGuffage, 1128 Board of Regents of State Colleges v. Roth, 665 Boardman v. Esteva, 1105 Bob Jones University v. United States, 180 Boehner v. Anderson, 200 Bouie v. City of Columbia, 1104, 1115 Boumediene v. Bush, 1010
Alden v. Maine, 13 Alderman v. United States, 701 Allen v. Wright, 88, 550 American Federation of Government Employees v. Reagan, 128 American Hospital Ass'n v. NLRB, 183 American Insurance Co. v. Canter, 131 American Int'l Group v. Islamic Republic of Iran, 655, 656, 665 Ameron, Inc. v. United States Army Corps of Engineers, 543 Anaconda Copper Co. v. Andrus, 58 Anderson v. Celebrezze, 1103 Andrus v. Sierra Club, 366 Berry v. Reagan, 431 Beiddle v. Perovich, 572 Bivens v. Six Unknown Named Agents of Federal Bureau of Narcotics, 250, 258, 275, 525 Black v. McGuffage, 1128 Board of Regents of State Colleges v. Roth, 665 Boardman v. Esteva, 1105 Bob Jones University v. United States, 180 Boehner v. Anderson, 200 Bouie v. City of Columbia, 1104, 1115 Boumediene v. Bush, 1010
Alderman v. United States, 701 Allen v. Wright, 88, 550 American Federation of Government Employees v. Reagan, 128 American Hospital Ass'n v. NLRB, 183 American Insurance Co. v. Canter, 131 American Int'l Group v. Islamic Republic of Iran, 655, 656, 665 Ameron, Inc. v. United States Army Corps of Engineers, 543 Anaconda Copper Co. v. Andrus, 58 Anderson v. Celebrezze, 1103 Andrus v. Sierra Club, 366 Berry v. Reagan, 431 Biddle v. Perovich, 572 Bivens v. Six Unknown Named Agents of Federal Bureau of Narcotics, 250, 258, 275, 525 Black v. McGuffage, 1128 Board of Regents of State Colleges v. Roth, 665 Boardman v. Esteva, 1105 Boehner v. Anderson, 200 Bouie v. City of Columbia, 1104, 1115 Boumediene v. Bush, 1010
American Federation of Government Employees v. Reagan, 128 American Hospital Ass'n v. NLRB, 183 American Insurance Co. v. Canter, 131 American Int'l Group v. Islamic Republic of Iran, 655, 656, 665 Ameron, Inc. v. United States Army Corps of Engineers, 543 Anaconda Copper Co. v. Andrus, 58 Anderson v. Celebrezze, 1103 Andrus v. Sierra Club, 366 Bivens v. Six Unknown Named Agents of Federal Bureau of Narcotics, 250, 258, 275, 525 Black v. McGuffage, 1128 Board of Regents of State Colleges v. Roth, 665 Boardman v. Esteva, 1105 Bob Jones University v. United States, 180 Boehner v. Anderson, 200 Bouie v. City of Columbia, 1104, 1115 Boumediene v. Bush, 1010
American Federation of Government Employees v. Reagan, 128 American Hospital Ass'n v. NLRB, 183 American Insurance Co. v. Canter, 131 American Int'l Group v. Islamic Republic of Iran, 655, 656, 665 Ameron, Inc. v. United States Army Corps of Engineers, 543 Anaconda Copper Co. v. Andrus, 58 Anderson v. Celebrezze, 1103 Andrus v. Sierra Club, 366 Bivens v. Six Unknown Named Agents of Federal Bureau of Narcotics, 250, 258, 275, 525 Black v. McGuffage, 1128 Board of Regents of State Colleges v. Roth, 665 Boardman v. Esteva, 1105 Bob Jones University v. United States, 180 Boehner v. Anderson, 200 Bouie v. City of Columbia, 1104, 1115 Boumediene v. Bush, 1010
ployees v. Reagan, 128 American Hospital Ass'n v. NLRB, 183 American Insurance Co. v. Canter, 131 American Int'l Group v. Islamic Republic of Iran, 655, 656, 665 Ameron, Inc. v. United States Army Corps of Engineers, 543 Anaconda Copper Co. v. Andrus, 58 Anderson v. Celebrezze, 1103 Andrus v. Sierra Club, 366 Federal Bureau of Narcotics, 250, 258, 275, 525 Black v. McGuffage, 1128 Board of Regents of State Colleges v. Roth, 665 Boardman v. Esteva, 1105 Bob Jones University v. United States, 180 Boehner v. Anderson, 200 Bouie v. City of Columbia, 1104, 1115 Boumediene v. Bush, 1010
American Insurance Co. v. Canter, 131 American Int'l Group v. Islamic Republic of Iran, 655, 656, 665 Ameron, Inc. v. United States Army Corps of Engineers, 543 Anaconda Copper Co. v. Andrus, 58 Anderson v. Celebrezze, 1103 Andrus v. Sierra Club, 366 Black v. McGuffage, 1128 Board of Regents of State Colleges v. Roth, 665 Boardman v. Esteva, 1105 Bob Jones University v. United States, 180 Boehner v. Anderson, 200 Bouie v. City of Columbia, 1104, 1115 Boumediene v. Bush, 1010
American Insurance Co. v. Canter, 131 American Int'l Group v. Islamic Republic of Iran, 655, 656, 665 Ameron, Inc. v. United States Army Corps of Engineers, 543 Anaconda Copper Co. v. Andrus, 58 Anderson v. Celebrezze, 1103 Andrus v. Sierra Club, 366 Black v. McGuffage, 1128 Board of Regents of State Colleges v. Roth, 665 Boardman v. Esteva, 1105 Bob Jones University v. United States, 180 Boehner v. Anderson, 200 Bouie v. City of Columbia, 1104, 1115 Boumediene v. Bush, 1010
of Iran, 655, 656, 665 Ameron, Inc. v. United States Army Corps of Engineers, 543 Anaconda Copper Co. v. Andrus, 58 Anderson v. Celebrezze, 1103 Andrus v. Sierra Club, 366 Roth, 665 Boardman v. Esteva, 1105 Bob Jones University v. United States, 180 Boehner v. Anderson, 200 Bouie v. City of Columbia, 1104, 1115 Boumediene v. Bush, 1010
Ameron, Inc. v. United States Army Corps of Engineers, 543 Anaconda Copper Co. v. Andrus, 58 Anderson v. Celebrezze, 1103 Andrus v. Sierra Club, 366 Boardman v. Esteva, 1105 Bob Jones University v. United States, 180 Boehner v. Anderson, 200 Bouie v. City of Columbia, 1104, 1115 Boumediene v. Bush, 1010
Corps of Engineers, 543 Anaconda Copper Co. v. Andrus, 58 Anderson v. Celebrezze, 1103 Andrus v. Sierra Club, 366 Bob Jones University v. United States, 180 Boehner v. Anderson, 200 Bouie v. City of Columbia, 1104, 1115 Boumediene v. Bush, 1010
Anaconda Copper Co. v. Andrus, 58 Anderson v. Celebrezze, 1103 Andrus v. Sierra Club, 366 Boehner v. Anderson, 200 Bouie v. City of Columbia, 1104, 1115 Boumediene v. Bush, 1010
Anderson v. Celebrezze, 1103 Andrus v. Sierra Club, 366 Bouie v. City of Columbia, 1104, 1115 Boumediene v. Bush, 1010
Andrus v. Sierra Club, 366 Boumediene v. Bush, 1010
Ange v. Bush, 883 Boutilier v. INS, 560
Aptheker v. Secretary of State, 797 Bowsher v. Synar, 171, 194, 422, 431,
Arizona v. California, 118 457, 539, 784
Armstrong v. Executive Office of the Pres- Bradley v. Fisher, 276
ident, 351 Branti v. Finkel, 433
Ashcroft v. Iqbal, 275 Brawer v. Horowitz, 530
Ass'n of American Physicians and Sur- Breard v. Greene, 611
geons v. Clinton, 354 Brown v. Board of Education, 178, 1056
Atlee v. Laird, 839 Brown v. Califano, 177, 758
Bain Peanut Co. of Tex. v. Pinson, 1109 Brown v. Carr, 1121
Baker v. Carr, 87, 229, 281, 554, 632-634, Brown v. United States, 569, 886
925 Buckley v. Valeo, 155, 197, 379, 381, 428,
450, 456, 522, 545, 547

194

Gorsuch, 565

Clark v. Williard, 648

Volpe, 342

mill, 1023

Citizens for a Better Environment v.

City of Indianapolis v. Edmond, 721

Citizens to Preserve Overton Park, Inc. v.

City of New Haven v. United States, 187

Cleveland Board of Education v. Louder-

Burdick v. United States, 572 Clinton v. City of New York, 188, 548, Burke v. Barnes, 150, 555 Burroughs v. United States, 1103 Bush v. Gore, 926, 1083, 1084, 1089, 1095, 1097, 1110, 1124-1133, 1139 Bush v. Palm Beach County Canvassing Board, 1089, 1092 Butte City Water Co. v. Baker, 55 Butz v. Economou, 252, 268, 271 Campbell v. Clinton, 872, 879 Carlson v. Green, 525 Cascade Natural Gas Corp. v. El Paso Natural Gas Co., 564 Center for National Security Studies v. U.S. Department of Justice, 680 Central Union Telephone Co. v. Edwardsville, 1114 Chamber of Commerce of the United States v. Reich, 129 Champlin Refining Co. v. Corporation Comm'n, 156 Charlton v. Kelly, 625 Chas. T. Main Int'l, Inc. v. Khuzestan Water & Power Authority, 655, 656, Cheney v. United States District Court for the District of Columbia, 333, 359 Chenoweth v. Clinton, 880, 888, 890 Cherokee Nation v. Southern Kansas R. Co., 663 Chevron U.S.A. Inc. v. Natural Resources Defense Council, 43, 342, 514, 747, 802, 1114 Chicago & Southern Airlines, Inc. v. Waterman Steamship Corp., 600 Christian Knights of the Ku Klux Klan v. District of Columbia, 889 CIA v. Sims, 690 Cincinnati Soap Co. v. United States, 181,

557, 882, 926 Clinton v. Jones, 217, 259, 267, 332, 459 Cohens v. Virginia, 47 Cole v. Young, 798 Coleman v. Miller, 200, 550, 555, 633, Committee on Judiciary, U.S. House of Representatives v. Miers, 556 Commodity Futures Trading Commission v. Schor, 133, 431 Common Cause v. Jones, 1128 Common Cause v. Nuclear Regulatory Commission, 366 Commonwealth of Pa. v. Lynn, 557 Contractors Ass'n of Eastern Pennsylvania v. Secretary of Labor, 125 Conyers v. Reagan, 889 Cooper v. Aaron, 1056, 1062, 1115 Crockett v. Reagan, 844, 883 Crowell v. Benson, 131, 135 D.C. Federation of Civic Ass'ns v. Volpe, 511 Dalton v. Specter, 197, 346, 600 Dames & Moore v. Regan, 59, 615, 652, 653, 664-668, 720, 770, 886 Darby v. State ex rel. McCollough, 1120 Davis v. Passman, 250, 525 DCP Farms v. Yeutter, 514 Defenders of Wildlife v. Chertoff, 121 Dellums v. Bush, 883, 894 Dellums v. Smith, 853 Department of Commerce v. United States House of Representatives, 101 Detroit Free Press v. Ashcroft, 681 Dillon v. Gloss, 202, 204 Disconto Gesellschaft v. Umbreit, 648 Doe v. Bush, 921, 923 Doe v. McMillan, 249 Dole v. Carter, 642 Dombrowski v. Eastland, 241 Dornan v. U.S. Secretary of Defense, 759 Dred Scott v. Sandford, 537, 817 Duncan v. Kahanamoku, 942, 998 Durand v. Hollins, 591, 860 Durousseau v. The United States, 81 E-Systems Inc. v. United States, 665 E. I. du Pont de Nemours & Co. v. Collins, 793

Eastland v. United States Servicemen's Fund, 325 Edmond v. United States, 389, 462, 471 Edwards v. Carter, 607, 639 El-Masri v. United States, 295 Ellsberg v. Mitchell, 307 Elrod v. Burns, 433, 434 Employers Group v. National War Labor Board, 1052 Ex parte Medellín, 223 S.W.3d 315, 322-323 (Tex.Crim.App.2006), 611 Ex parte Merryman, 935 Ex parte Milligan, 79, 843, 935-939, 941, 942, 971, 977-979, 998, 999 Ex parte Mitsuye Endo, 946 Ex parte Quirin, 942, 965, 968, 969, 971, 972, 975, 979, 998-1001 Executive Business Media v. U.S. Department of Defense, 564 Fairfax's Devisee v. Hunter's Lessee, 1115 Farkas v. Texas Instruments, 125 Farmer v. Philadelphia Electric Co., 124 FDA v. Brown & Williamson Tobacco Corp., 485 FEA v. Algonquin, 773 Federal Election Commission v. Akins, 567 Federal Election Commission v. NRA Political Victory, 389, 538, 539 Field v. Clark, 103, 112, 191, 193 Finnegan v. Matthews, 536 Fiore v. White, 1115 First National City Bank v. Banco Nacional de Cuba, 651 Flast v. Cohen, 89, 90, 550 Fleming v. Mohawk Wrecking & Lumber Co., 872 Fletcher v. Peck, 512, 874 Fleuti v. Rosenberg, 560 Fong Yue Ting v. United States, 596 Forrester v. White, 277 Forsythe v. Longboat Key Beach Erosion Control Dist., 1093 Foster v. Neilson, 608, 628 Franklin v. Massachusetts, 343, 600 Franklin Savings Association v. Director of the Office of Thrift Supervision, 390 Free Enterprise Fund v. Public Company Accounting Oversight Board, 454

Friends of the Earth v. Laidlaw Environmental Services, 567 Frothingham v. Mellon, 89, 90 General Motors Corp. v. Romein, 1114 Gilligan v. Morgan, 925 Goldberg v. U.S. Dept. of State, 689 Goldwater v. Carter, 87, 620, 630, 631, 636, 640, 789, 924 Gore v. Harris, 1097, 1098, 1107, 1112-1114, 1120 Gorin v. United States, 673 Granfinanciera, S.A. v. Nordberg, 136 Gravel v. United States, 243, 268, 271 Gray v. Sanders, 1100 Greenham Women Against Cruise Missiles v. Reagan, 885 Griffin v. Wisconsin, 726 Grisar v. McDowell, 54 Guaranty Trust Co. v. United States, 646, Haig v. Agee, 59, 118, 659, 662, 718, 721, 790, 802, 804 Halderman v. Pennhurst State School and Hospital, 530 Halkin v. Helms, 301, 305, 306 Halperin v. Kissinger, 274 Hamdan v. Rumsfeld, 605, 613, 802, 995-1007, 1009, 1010, 1024, 1043 Hamdi v. Rumsfeld, 720, 721, 724, 965-973, 975-978, 980-983, 985, 986, 1010, 1016, 1021, 1023, 1029, 1127 Hampton v. Mow Sun Wong, 117, 956 Harlow & Butterfield v. Fitzgerald, 267 Harper v. Virginia Bd. of Elections, 1099 Harrington v. Schlesinger, 556 Hechinger v. Metropolitan Washington Airports Authority, 433 Heckler v. Chaney, 183, 537, 568 Heckler v. Lopez, 536 Hepting v. AT & T, 303 Hill v. Immigration and Naturalization Service, 562 Hines v. Davidowitz, 650 Hirabayashi v. United States, 943, 948, 957 Hohri v. United States, 957 Hollingsworth v. Virginia, 199 Holtzman v. Schlesinger, 556, 843, 883 Humphrey v. Baker, 556

Humphrey's Executor v. United States, 337, 385-387, 417, 421, 422, 442, 450, 455, 457, 461, 470, 472, 476, 519, 623 Hutchinson v. Proxmire, 248, 269 Illinois v. McArthur, 721 Imbler v. Pachtman, 252, 435, 571 Immigration and Naturalization Service v. Chadha, 153 In re All Matters Submitted to the Foreign Intelligence Surveillance Court, 710, In re Cheney, 360, 364 In re Debs, 50, 71, 529, 674, 676, 1058, In re Directives Pursuant to Section 105B of the Foreign Intelligence Surveillance Act, 713 In re Election of U.S. Representative for Second Congressional Dist., 1121 In re Grand Jury Proceedings, 288 In re Grand Jury Subpoena Duces Tecum, 288 In re Green, 1103 In re Lindsey, 289 In re National Security Agency Telecommunications Records Litigation, 309, 734 In re Neagle, 50–52, 57, 71, 72, 76, 523, 570, 592, 852, 860 In re Olson, 438 In re Sealed Case (Espy), 288 In re Sealed Case, 288, 289, 710, 711, 713, 719, 721, 726 In re Stacy, 978 In re Surface Mining Regulation Litigation, 129 In re Territo, 972 In re The Attorney General of the United States, 48 In the Matter of Longstaff, 562 Independent Gasoline Marketers Council v. Duncan, 772 Independent Meat Packers Ass'n v. Butz, 130 INS v. Chadha, 139, 152–155, 158–161, 163–169, 181, 184, 187, 190, 198, 340, 352, 379, 387, 422, 424, 426, 432, 477, 519, 545, 840, 850, 893, 896, 926, 1065

INS v. St. Cyr, 1011

International Paper Co. v. Ouelette, 723

Itek Corporation v. First National Bank of Boston, 665 J. W. Hampton, Jr. & Co. v. United States, 104, 112, 114 J.E.M. Ag. Supply, Inc. v. Pioneer Hi-Bred Int'l, 724 Japan Whaling Ass'n v. American Cetacean Soc'y, 893 Johnson v. Eisentrager, 843, 964, 965, 1004, 1013–1015, 1022, 1029 Jones v. Clinton, 217, 259, 267, 332, 459 Jones v. United States, 180, 596 Judicial Watch, Inc. v. U. S. Senate, 404 Katz v. United States, 272, 694, 696-698, 720, 726 Kendall v. United States ex rel. Stokes, 47, 181, 475 Kennedy v. Sampson, 150, 888 Kent v. Dulles, 790, 793, 799 Kilbourn v. Thompson, 241, 242 Kissinger v. Reporters Committee for Freedom of the Press, 348 Kiyemba v. Obama, 1028 Kleindienst v. Mandel, 778 Koniag, Inc. v. Andrus, 514 Korematsu v. United States, 935, 942, 946, 949, 953–957, 973, 974, 984 Krivanek v. Take Back Tampa Political Committee, 1106 Lawrence v. Texas, 562 Lear Siegler v. Lehman, 543 Lebron v. National Railroad Passenger Corporation, 456 Lehman Brothers v. Schein, 1115 Lincoln v. Vigil, 182 Linda R. S. v. Richard D., 571 Little v. Barreme, 46, 591, 592, 599, 807, 886 Livingston v. Jefferson, 258 Logan v. Zimmerman Brush Co., 1113 Long v. Ansell, 243 Lopez v. Heckler, 536 Louisiana ex rel. Guste v. Verity, 130 Loving v. United States, 262, 460 Lowry v. Reagan, 883 Ludecke v. Watkins, 1053 Lujan v. Defenders of Wildlife, 99, 550, 554 M'Connell v. Hampton, 971, 978 Madsen v. Kinsella, 999

Manhattan-Bronx Postal Union v. Gronouski, 130 Marbury v. Madison, 35-38, 40, 42-47, 78, 79, 87, 90, 92, 100, 242, 263, 281, 286, 415, 420, 541, 552, 553, 601, 633, 893, 1014 Marcus v. Search Warrant, 698 Martin v. Hunter's Lessee, 1115 Massachusetts v. Laird, 839, 924 Mathews v. Eldridge, 980, 982, 983, 1127 McCulloch v. Maryland, 19, 161, 286, 385, 534 McDermott v. Harris, 1087 McDonnell Douglas Corp. v. United States, 539 McGrain v. Daugherty, 325 McInnis-Misenor v. Maine Medical Center, 925 McPherson v. Blacker, 1090, 1099, 1103, 1108, 1119 Medellín v. Cockrell, 611 Medellín v. Dretke, 611 Medellín v. Texas, 609 Meese v. Keene, 804 Melcher v. Federal Open Market Committee, 556 Metropolitan Washington Airports Authority v. Citizens for the Abatement of Aircraft Noise, 432 Meyer v. Bush, 350, 357 Michel v. Anderson, 380 Midwest Oil, 52, 53, 57, 59, 63, 71, 73, 76, 532, 652, 662 Minnesota v. National Tea Co., 1091 Mireles v. Waco, 277 Mississippi v. Johnson, 48, 79 Missouri v. Holland, 607 Missouri Highway Commission v. Volpe, 186 Missouri Pacific Ry. Co. v. Kansas, 137 Mistretta v. United States, 110, 113, 116, 197, 371, 372, 376, 519, 984 Mitchell v. Forsyth, 272 Mitchell v. Laird, 839, 883, 887, 891 Mitchell v. United States, 841 Mohamed v. Jeppesen Dataplan, 291, 310 Moore v. Ogilvie, 1100 Moore v. United States House of Representatives, 555 Mora v. McNamara, 841

Morales v. TWA, 723 Morrison v. Olson, 288, 352, 356-358, 376, 436, 438, 449–451, 453, 455, 458, 468, 471, 493, 497, 519, 520, 539, 566, 568, 571, 605, 606, 926, 1029 Morton v. Mancari, 724 Moscow Fire Ins. Co. v. Bank of New York & Trust Co., 645 Mountain States Legal Foundation v. Bush, 58 Mullaney v. Wilbur, 1104 Murphy v. Ramsey, 1014 Murray's Lessee v. Hoboken Land & Improvement Co., 133 Muskrat v. United States, 88 Myers v. United States, 63, 157, 163, 383, 410, 417, 419, 422-424, 441, 442, 451, 455, 457, 470, 495, 519, 520, 540, 623, 667, 992 N. River Ins. Co., Inc. v. Stefanou, 303 NAACP v. Alabama ex rel. Patterson, 1104, 1115 NAACP v. Bell, 570 NAACP v. Levi, 569 Nader v. Saxbe, 570 Nardone v. United States, 693 National Broadcasting Co. v. United States, 113 National Cable Television Ass'n v. United States, 117 National Council of Community Mental Health Centers, Inc. v. Weinberger, National Insurance Co. v. Tidewater Co., National Security Archive v. Archivist of United States, 351 National Socialist Party of America v. Skokie, 1096 Natural Resources Defense Council v. Costle, 565 Near v. Minnesota, 670, 671, 676, 798 Neely v. Henkel, 628 New York Times Co. v. United States, 530, 669 New York v. United States, 530, 645, 646, 669, 679, 697, 927 Ng Fung Ho v. White, 132 Nixon v. Administrator of General Services, 160, 336, 352, 372, 427, 468

Nixon v. Fitzgerald, 250, 257, 260, 265, 271, 331, 362 Nixon v. Freeman, 340 Nixon v. Sirica, 48, 283, 325 Nixon v. United States, 48, 160, 229, 254, 257, 263, 279, 285, 286, 317, 324, 328, 337-341, 357, 360-363, 376, 439, 541, 633, 729, 925, 1124 NLRB v. Jones & Laughlin Steel Corp., North Jersey Media Group v. Ashcroft, Northern Pipeline Construction Co. v. Marathon Pipe Line Co., 132 Northern Securities Co. v. United States, 675 Oetjen v. Central Leather Co., 650 Ohio Valley Water Co. v. Ben Avon Borough, 132 Olympic Federal Savings & Loan v. Director, Office of Thrift Supervision, 389 Orlando v. Laird, 839 Orvis v. Brownell, 657 Ozonoff v. Berzak, 643 Padilla v. Rumsfeld, 965, 975, 986, 987 Palestine Information Office v. Schultz, 608 Palm Beach County Canvassing Bd. v. Harris, 1087-1090, 1101, 1110, 1114 Pan American World Airways, Inc. v. Civil Aeronautics Board, 788 Panama Refining Co. v. Ryan, 106, 593, 598 Parhat v. Gates, 1028 Patti v. Schweiker, 536 Pennhurst State School v. Halderman, 530, 533 Pennsylvania v. Wheeling Bridge Company, 84 Petite v. United States, 571 Pierson v. Ray, 252 Pillsbury Co. v. FTC, 513 Plaut v. Spendthrift Farm, 85 Plessy v. Ferguson, 1132 Portland Audubon Soc'y v. Endangered Species Committee, 481 Powell v. McCormack, 87, 95, 101, 229, 235, 241, 376, 550 Process Gas Consumers Group v. Con-

sumer Energy Council of America, 167

Propper v. Clark, 657 Public Citizen v. Burke, 538 Public Citizen v. U.S. Department of Justice, 351 Pullen v. Mulligan, 1096 Rainbow Navigation, Inc. v. Department of the Navy, 601 Raines v. Byrd, 101, 548, 557, 880, 885, Ramirez de Arellano v. Weinberger, 843 Rasul v. Bush, 964, 1020 Ray v. Blair, 1068 Raymond v. Thomas, 942 Regan v. Wald, 790 Reid v. Covert, 606, 999 Reno v. Flores, 726 Reservists Committee to Stop the War v. Laird, 94 Reyes v. U.S. Department of Immigration and Naturalization, 128 Reynolds v. Sims, 1096, 1099, 1109, 1131, 1133 Richmond Newspapers v. Virginia, 681 Riegle v. Federal Open Market Committee, 556 Riley v. St. Luke's Episcopal Hospital, 566 Rivers v. Roadway Express, 1110 Rizzo v. Goode, 532 Roberts v. United States, 46 Robertson v. Seattle Audubon Soc'y, 85 Rochin v. California, 1035 Roe v. Alabama, 1131, 1132 Russian Volunteer Fleet v. United States, 648 Rutan v. Republican Party of Illinois, 436 Saenz v. Roe, 1116 Sanchez-Espinoza v. Reagan, 843, 853, Sanchez-Llamas v. Oregon, 609 Sanitary Dist. of Chicago v. United States, Schechter Poultry v. United States, 107, 109, 110, 417, 421, 593 Schenck v. United States, 671 Scheuer v. Rhodes, 252, 268 Schlesinger v. Councilman, 997 Schlesinger v. Reservists Committee to Stop the War, 94 Senate Select Committee on Presidential Campaign Activities v. Nixon, 316

Service v. Dulles, 281 **UAW-Labor** Employment and Training Shanghai Power Co. v. United States, 664 Corp. v. Chao, 129 Sibbach v. Wilson & Co., 115, 373 U.S. v. Carpenter, 564 Siegel v. Lepore, 1097, 1109 U.S. v. Curtiss-Wright, 109, 593, Sierra Club v. Costle, 478, 497, 515, 784 598-600, 624, 625, 629, 634, 649, 681, Skinner v. Mid-America Pipeline Co., 117 784, 793 Smith v. Jackson, 538 U.S. v. Khan, 852 Smith v. Reagan, 668 U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Smith v. Shaw, 971, 978 Development ex rel. Givler v. Smith, Smith v. United States, 569, 789 449 Snepp v. United States, 682-688, 691, 791 U.S. House of Representatives v. FTC, 167 Soucie v. David, 358 U.S. Term Limits v. Thornton, 240, 241 South Puerto Rico Sugar Co. Trading Underhill v. Hernandez, 650 Corp. v. United States, 643 United States ex rel. Accardi v. Shaugh-Southern Pacific Terminal Co. v. ICC, 889 nessy, 280 Spalding v. Vilas, 251, 252, 268 United States ex rel. Kelly v. Boeing Co., Springer v. Philippine Islands, 383, 655, 927 United States v. Allocco, 406 St. Joseph Stock Yards Co. v. United United States v. American Bell Telephone States, 132 Co., 529 Standard Oil Co. of New Jersey v. United United States v. American Telephone & States, 115 Telegraph Co., 315 Sterling v. Constantin, 950 United States v. Bank of New York & Steuart & Bro. v. Bowles, 1051 Trust Co., 645 Steward Machine Co. v. Davis, 126 United States v. Batchelder, 571 Stewart v. Blackwell, 1128 United States v. Belmont, 642, 646, 649 Stone v. Powell, 1114 United States v. Booker, 116 Stuart v. Laird, 79 United States v. Brand Jewelers, 530 Stump v. Sparkman, 252, 277 United States v. Bryan, 330 Sumner v. Mata, 1114 United States v. Burr, 46, 256, 258, 263, Swidler & Berlin v. United States, 289 283, 284, 853 Synar v. United States, 423 United States v. Butler, 169, 1124 Talbot v. Seeman, 891 United States v. California, 529 Taylor v. Beckham, 1132, 1133 United States v. City of Philadelphia, 524, Tenet v. Doe, 293 526 Tennessee Valley Authority v. Hill, 128, United States v. Cox, 569 United States v. Duggan, 721 183 Tenney v. Brandhove, 241, 252 United States v. El Paso Natural Gas Co., Terry v. Ohio, 699 564 The Jewels of the Princess of Orange, 473 United States v. Freytag, 388 Thomas v. Union Carbide Agricultural United States v. Germaine, 383, 439 Products Co., 133 United States v. Guy W. Capps, 643, 650 Todok v. Union State Bank, 649 United States v. Helmy, 803 Totten v. United States, 290, 293 United States v. Hohri, 957 Touby v. United States, 116 United States v. House of Representatives Touchston v. McDermott, 1097 of the United States, 335 Train v. City of New York, 186, 195 United States v. Isa, 707 Tulare County v. Bush, 58 United States v. Johnson, 241, 247, 249, 410, 423

United States v. Kagama, 640 United States v. Klein, 82, 85, 352, 572-574 United States v. Lovasco, 571 United States v. Lovett, 544, 546 United States v. Marchetti, 683 United States v. McDonnell Douglas Corp., 539 United States v. Midwest Oil Co., 52, 57, 59, 63, 71, 73, 662 United States v. Munoz-Flores, 926 United States v. New, 115, 187, 530, 645, 646, 669, 679, 697, 885, 927 United States v. Nixon, 48, 160, 229, 254, 257, 263, 279, 285, 286, 317, 324, 328, 337-341, 357, 360-363, 376, 439, 541, 633, 729, 925, 1124 United States v. Noriega, 866 United States v. North, 287, 760 United States v. Padelford, 83, 572 United States v. Palestine Liberation Organization, 608 United States v. Percheman, 608, 628 United States v. Perkins, 455 United States v. Pink, 616, 644, 650, 659, 660, 664, 789 United States v. Poindexter, 287, 760 United States v. Posey, 707 United States v. Progressive, 679, 680 United States v. Rayburn House Office Building, Room 2113, Washington, D.C. 20515, 247 United States v. Reynolds, 283, 290, 291, 293, 301 United States v. Richardson, 89, 96, 552 United States v. Russell, 950 United States v. San Jacinto Tin Co., 529 United States v. SCRAP, 97 United States v. Smith, 569, 789 United States v. Solomon, 530 United States v. Sperry Corporation, 664 United States v. Truong Dinh Hung, 711 United States v. United States District Court (Keith), 272, 695 United States v. Will, 78, 387, 455, 646

United States v. Wilson, 572 United States v. Woodley, 390, 405 United States v. Yoshida International, Universal Shipping Co. v. United States, Urtetiqui v. D'Arcy, 794 Vermont Agency of Natural Resources v. United States, 100, 449, 566 Veronia School Dist. 47J v. Acton, 718 Victor v. Nebraska, 1109 Vitarelli v. Seaton, 281 W.S. Kirkpatrick & Co. v. Environmental Tectonics Corp., 651 Walker v. Cheney, 101, 290, 366 Walsh v. Brady, 804 Wayman v. Southard, 103, 115, 373 Wayte v. United States, 571 Weaver v. United States Information Agency, 688 Weinberger v. Catholic Action of Hawaii/Peace Education Project, 294 Weinberger v. Rossi, 643 Westinghouse Electric Corp. v. U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission, 779 Whitman v. American Trucking Ass'ns, Inc., 118 Whitney v. Robertson, 608 Wiener v. United States, 421 Wilson v. C.I.A., 688 Wilton v. Seven Falls, 327 Wood v. Strickland, 269 Woodley, 390, 405 Woods v. Cloyd W. Miller Co., 1052, 1053 Wright v. United States, 149 Yakus v. United States, 109, 110, 113 Young v. United States ex rel. Vuitton et Fils S.A., 449 Youngstown Sheet & Tube Co. v. Sawyer, 57, 59, 160, 254, 375, 485, 495, 634, 652, 655, 676, 720, 724, 725, 774, 886, 927, 977 Zemel v. Rusk, 118, 790, 792, 799 Zweibon v. Mitchell, 726

Preface

When we published our 1988 text, The Law of Presidential Power: Cases and Materials, which has since morphed into what are now three editions of Separation of Powers Law: Cases and Materials, it is safe to say we had no idea of what the next decades would witness in our particular research and teaching domain. "Far-fetched" does not begin to capture how we would have described the ideas that Congress might impeach a President for lying about a sexual affair, that the Supreme Court would intercede in a state vote recount in a way that would effectively decide a presidential election, or that the executive branch would claim inherent authority to hold U.S. citizens indefinitely, and without counsel or hearing, as "enemy combatants." Neither could we have imagined the horrific events of September 11, 2001, whose impact on the nation's constitutional thinking is still unfolding, even as we approach the attacks' tenth anniversary. Each of these events has now become part of the separation of powers landscape. The apparent willingness of each branch to test the limits of its authority beyond what had been conventional boundaries has certainly led us to rethink earlier assumptions and conclusions.

That having been said, we have been satisfied — as have colleagues using the book at other institutions—that our structure and source selection is well designed to permit lawyers, law students and political scientists a comprehensive review of the issues involved in the application of law to the allocation of power among President, Congress, and judiciary. To our 1988 book, we added enough additional material in 1996 on the congressional perspective and on judicial power to make the book a true survey of separation of powers issues. The major structural innovations over the years have occurred within Chapter Six, on war powers, and Chapter Seven, on presidential election and succession. The latter were occasioned, of course, by *Bush v. Gore*. The former were necessitated in part by the events of September 11, 2001 and by our invasion of Iraq, but more generally by the sheer number of occasions on which the United States has deployed military force abroad since the Vietnam War. An entirely chronological approach became impossible; a more thematic framework was required.

We continue to regard this work as innovative for law schools because its subject matter is not well covered by the mainstream curriculum. We regard it as innovative for undergraduate and graduate courses on the Presidency and Congress because of its emphasis on primary materials at the expense of discursive secondary text.

As law teachers, we have found the value of this project for our students to be at least twofold. First, despite the ever-increasing importance of all aspects of public law in our national life, legal curricula tend to focus predominantly on the operation of the courts. These materials, we hope, afford readers a clearer picture of how the elected branches of government operate and of how complex are the processes of national policymaking and execution of the laws. Although bits and pieces of the overall picture may appear in courses on constitutional law, administrative law, international law, and legislation, we

xxviii PREFACE

find that a systematic overview of the elected branches better highlights and puts into context such processes as law enforcement, program administration, budgeting and accounting, and the implementation of foreign and military policy.

Second, as the ever-increasing number of legal cases involving separation of powers attests, the subject of this work has become and is likely to remain a central national concern. The Nixon Presidency precipitated a major shift in legal attitude towards judicial oversight of the separation of powers. The nearly four decades since have by no means seen any contrary trend. The burden that the executive branch shoulders for solving domestic and foreign problems requires citizens to concern themselves ever more with the issues surrounding executive effectiveness and accountability. Persistent political and institutional competition between President and Congress—plus the public's increasingly strident distrust of government generally—likewise require citizens to focus on complex issues surrounding the scope and implementation of Congress's proper roles. These materials help to prepare students of law and political science to participate in these debates more knowledgeably.

Teachers who prefer in their courses a continued stress on Presidential issues will find that this volume still permits that approach. Indeed, a thorough exploration of the applicability of law to either Congress's or the President's functions has an additional advantage. It highlights the crucial non-litigative role of legal counsel that, in all fields, legal curricula tend to underemphasize. Perhaps because most discussion materials in law school classes consist of reported cases, the impression is created that law is determined primarily in the courtroom and that arguing cases is what "real lawyers" do. Most hard legal questions facing Congress or the President must be decided, at least in the first instance, within each respective branch and on the basis of relatively little prior judicial guidance. In exploring each branch's view of things, the following materials rely substantially on sources other than judicial opinions to which the presidential or congressional lawyers would resort in order to solve a difficult problem. We have also tried to raise on a number of occasions what we take to be critical ethical questions that face public lawyers who engage in the counseling function. The most ambitious of these is a section on the "torture memos" that appears in Chapter Six.

Three final notes on style: First, although we try to avoid using a masculine generic to describe all people, we continue to use "he" as an occasional pronoun for "the President" because of the historical circumstance that this country has not yet elected a woman to the Presidency. Second, although we have marked textual deletions in the excerpted materials, we often omit, without any printed signal, footnote material and citations to cases or other authorities that may appear in the excerpts. Third, in citing relevant secondary literature, we use forms of citation that are conventional among legal academics, but which may be unusual for political scientists and their students.

This work has owed a great deal over the years to many research and production assistants. We are especially indebted, for the current volume, to Ashley Carter '12, Yasmine Harik '12, and Benjamin Wilhelm '11, all of the Moritz College of Law at The Ohio State University. We are also grateful to three faithful "adopters," who have graciously shared with us their suggestions and reactions over a period of many years—Marshall Breger, at Catholic University; David Martin, at the University of Virginia; and William Marshall, at the University of North Carolina-Chapel Hill. We are thankful for their friendship and insights.

Peter M. Shane, Columbus, Ohio Harold H. Bruff, Boulder, CO March, 2011