

International Issues in Animal Law

*Carolina Academic Press
Law Advisory Board*



Gary J. Simson, Chairman
Dean, Mercer University School of Law

Raj Bhala
University of Kansas School of Law

Davison M. Douglas
Dean, William and Mary Law School

Paul Finkelman
Albany Law School

Robert M. Jarvis
*Shepard Broad Law Center
Nova Southeastern University*

Vincent R. Johnson
St. Mary's University School of Law

Peter Nicolas
University of Washington School of Law

Michael A. Olivas
University of Houston Law Center

Kenneth L. Port
William Mitchell College of Law

H. Jefferson Powell
Duke University School of Law

Michael P. Scharf
Case Western Reserve University School of Law

Peter M. Shane
*Michael E. Moritz College of Law
The Ohio State University*

International Issues in Animal Law

**The Impact of International
Environmental and Economic Law
upon Animal Interests and Advocacy**

Peter L. Fitzgerald

PROFESSOR OF LAW

STETSON UNIVERSITY COLLEGE OF LAW

CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS

Durham, North Carolina

Copyright © 2012
Peter L. Fitzgerald
All Rights Reserved

ISBN: 978-1-59460-770-7
LCCN: 2012938086

Carolina Academic Press
700 Kent Street
Durham, North Carolina 27701
Telephone (919) 489-7486
Fax (919) 493-5668
www.cap-press.com

Printed in the United States of America

*For Susan—
along with “Paddles”, “Hamish”, “Ceilidh”, “Duncan” and “Dora”—
World Travelers All!*

Summary of Contents

Preface and Acknowledgments	xiii
Chapter 1 • Introduction to Animal Law as an International Topic	3
Chapter 2 • Animals and International Environmental Obligations: Managing Invasive Species under the Convention on Biological Diversity	33
Chapter 3 • Cross Border Trade in Animals and the Internet: The Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species	71
Chapter 4 • Exploitation, Conservation, or Preservation?: The International Convention for the Regulation of Whaling and Conflicts over Science, Culture, and Morality	105
Chapter 5 • Global and Regional Approaches to Advancing Animal Interests: UDAW, the OIE, and the EU	137
Chapter 6 • Stopping Cruelty at the Border: Trade Barriers, the WTO, and the GATT Article XX General Exceptions	171
Chapter 7 • Genetically Modified Animals, Health, Pests, and Food: The WTO Sanitary and Phytosanitary Measures Agreement	207
Chapter 8 • Humane or “Animal Safe” Product Labeling Programs: The WTO Technical Barriers to Trade Agreement	247
Table of Cases	287
Index	289

Contents

Preface and Acknowledgments	xiii
Chapter 1 • Introduction to Animal Law as an International Topic	3
Introduction and Overview	3
Basic Introduction to International Law	9
Readings and Materials	13
Sands; <i>Turtles and Torturers: The Transformation of International Law</i>	13
Park & Singer; <i>The Globalization of Animal Welfare</i>	
<i>More Food Does Not Require More Suffering</i>	30
Resources	31
Questions for Discussion	32
Chapter 2 • Animals and International Environmental Obligations: Managing Invasive Species under the Convention on Biological Diversity	33
Introduction and Overview	33
Readings and Materials	34
Miller & Gunderson; <i>Biological and Cultural Camouflage: The Challenges of Seeing the Harmful Invasive Species Problem and Doing Something About It</i>	34
IUCN; <i>A Guide to Designing Legal and Institutional Frameworks on Alien Invasive Species</i>	40
Convention on Biological Diversity; <i>Decision X/2 Strategic Plan for Biodiversity 2011–2020</i>	48
Convention on Biological Diversity; <i>Decision X/38 Invasive Alien Species</i>	50
AHTEG; <i>Addressing the Risks Associated with the Introduction of Alien Species as Pets, Aquarium and Terrarium Species, and as Live Bait and Live Food</i>	51
Perry & Perry; <i>Improving Interactions Between Animal Rights Groups and Conservation Biologists</i>	62
Raffles; <i>Mother Nature’s Melting Pot</i>	66
Resources	68
Questions for Discussion	68
Chapter 3 • Cross Border Trade in Animals and the Internet: The Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species	71
Introduction and Overview	71
Readings and Materials	72

Sawyer & Sawyer; <i>Lessons from the Mist: What Can International Environmental Law Learn from Gorilla Conservation Efforts?</i>	72
Zimmerman; <i>The Black Market for Wildlife: Combating Transnational Organized Crime in the Illegal Wildlife Trade</i>	79
Beardsley; <i>Poachers with PCs: The United States' Potential Obligations and Ability to Enforce Endangered Wildlife Trading Prohibitions against Foreign Traders Who Advertise on eBay</i>	86
Izzo; <i>PC Pets for a Price: Combating Online and Traditional Wildlife Crime through International Harmonization and Authoritative Policies</i>	91
CITES WORLD; Issue Number 19, February 2010	95
CITES; <i>Decisions of the Conference of the Parties to CITES in Effect after Its 15th Meeting</i>	98
Boorstin; <i>Promoting Free Trade for the Internet Economy</i>	99
Google; <i>Enabling Trade in the Era of Information Technologies: Breaking Down Barriers to the Free Flow of Information</i>	100
Resources	102
Questions for Discussion	102
Chapter 4 • Exploitation, Conservation, or Preservation?: The International Convention for the Regulation of Whaling and Conflicts over Science, Culture, and Morality	105
Introduction and Overview	105
Readings and Materials	107
Carlarne; <i>Saving the Whales in the New Millennium: International Institutions, Recent Developments and the Future of International Whaling Policies</i>	107
Firestone & Lilley; <i>An Endangered Species: Aboriginal Whaling and the Right to Self-Determination and Cultural Heritage in a National and International Context</i>	120
Nishi; <i>Dolphins, Whales, and the Future of the International Whaling Commission</i>	129
Resources	134
Questions for Discussion	134
Chapter 5 • Global and Regional Approaches to Advancing Animal Interests: UDAW, the OIE, and the EU	137
Introduction and Overview	137
Readings and Materials	139
WSPA; <i>Universal Declaration on Animal Welfare</i>	139
Draeger; <i>More Than Property: An Argument for Adoption of the Universal Declaration on Animal Welfare</i>	141
Vapnek & Chapman; LEGISLATIVE AND REGULATORY OPTIONS FOR ANIMAL WELFARE	145
World Organisation for Animal Health, <i>Fifth Strategic Plan: 2011–2015</i>	150

Vapnek & Chapman; LEGISLATIVE AND REGULATORY OPTIONS FOR ANIMAL WELFARE	153
<i>Consolidated Version of the Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union</i>	157
European Commission; <i>European Union Strategy for the Protection and Welfare of Animals 2012–2015</i>	159
Resources	168
Questions for Discussion	168
Chapter 6 • Stopping Cruelty at the Border: Trade Barriers, the WTO, and the GATT Article XX General Exceptions	171
Introduction and Overview	171
Readings and Materials	173
World Trade Organization; UNDERSTANDING THE WTO	173
Vapnek & Chapman; LEGISLATIVE AND REGULATORY OPTIONS FOR ANIMAL WELFARE	178
Fitzgerald; <i>“Morality” May Not Be Enough to Justify the EU Seal Products Ban: Animal Welfare Meets International Trade Law</i>	180
Howse & Langille; <i>Permitting Pluralism: The Seal Products Dispute and Why the WTO Should Permit Trade Restrictions Justified by Non-Instrumental Moral Values</i>	200
Resources	204
Questions for Discussion	204
Chapter 7 • Genetically Modified Animals, Health, Pests, and Food: The WTO Sanitary and Phytosanitary Measures Agreement	207
Introduction and Overview	207
Readings and Materials	209
World Trade Organization; UNDERSTANDING THE WTO THE WTO AGREEMENTS SERIES, SANITARY AND PHYTOSANITARY MEASURES	210
U.S. Trade Representative; <i>2011 Annual Report on Sanitary and Phytosanitary Measures</i>	213
Taylor; <i>Impossible Cases: Lessons from the First Decade of WTO Dispute Settlement</i>	217
Peel; <i>A GMO by Any Other Name . . . Might Be an SPS Risk!: Implications of Expanding the Scope of the WTO Sanitary and Phytosanitary Measures Agreement</i>	232
Israeli Ministry of Industry Trade and Labor, Foreign Trade Administration; <i>Import Policy</i>	239
Israeli Ministry of Industry Trade and Labor, Foreign Trade Administration; <i>Import Prohibitions</i>	239
WTO Trade Policy Review Body; <i>Trade Policy Review: Israel</i>	239
U.S. Trade Representative; <i>2009 National Trade Estimate Report on Foreign Trade Barriers</i>	240
WTO Trade Policy Review Body; <i>Trade Policy Review: Malaysia</i>	241

U.S. Trade Representative's Office Press Release; <i>Ambassador Marantis Discusses U.S.-Malaysia Economic Relations in Kuala Lumpur</i>	242
FDA News Release; <i>FDA Issues Final Guidance on Regulating Genetically Engineered Animals</i>	242
Resources	243
Questions for Discussion	244
Chapter 8 • Humane or “Animal Safe” Product Labeling Programs:	
The WTO Technical Barriers to Trade Agreement	247
Introduction and Overview	247
Readings and Materials	249
Ming Du; <i>Domestic Regulatory Autonomy under the TBT Agreement: From Non-Discrimination to Harmonization</i>	249
World Trade Organization; <i>Environment: Issues—Labelling</i>	258
Low, Marceau, & Reinaud; <i>The Interface between the Trade and Climate Change Regimes: Scoping The Issues</i>	259
WSPA; <i>Eat Humane: U.S. Food Labels</i>	266
U.S. Trade Representative; <i>2011 Annual Report on Technical Barriers to Trade</i>	269
Pruzin; <i>Appellate Body Overturns Key Panel Findings on U.S. Tuna-Dolphin Labeling Requirements</i>	276
Pruzin; <i>WTO Panel Final Decision Rejects U.S. COOL Labeling Rules for Meats</i>	279
Resources	283
Questions for Discussion	283
Table of Cases	287
Index	289

Preface and Acknowledgments

In an era where the forces and effects of globalization are constantly being discussed in the news, online, in social media, and even in popular entertainment, it is striking that there is not more interaction between the international community and those seeking to advance animal interests on the domestic or national level. Presumably this is due to the traditional notion that the legal issues affecting animal interests are primarily matters of local or national concern rather than among the topics addressed at the international level—a notion that fails to fully reflect today’s world. As a result, animal advocates, international environmentalists, and international trade specialists are often unfamiliar with the sophistication and complexity of the issues that each faces. The idea behind this volume is to help bridge that gap for those studying animal law or a variety of international subjects, in order to contribute to more effective and comprehensive advocacy in the future.

The work on this volume was partially conducted while serving as a Visiting Fellow at Cambridge University’s Lauterpacht Centre for International Law, and as a MacCormick Fellow at the University of Edinburgh, and with the support of the Stetson University College of Law in Florida. I would like to express my appreciation for the thoughts and comments on this project and the manuscript which were so generously offered by so many colleagues at each of those institutions and elsewhere. I would especially like to thank Peter Stevenson and Sarah Stewart for their thoughtful comments, Dianne Oeste for her support with the production process for the manuscript, my wife Susan, who is also my primary editor, and many many others who were kind enough to discuss the myriad intersections that exist between international law and animal law.