TEACHING TORTS

FIFTH EDITION

A TEACHER'S GUIDE TO
STUDIES IN AMERICAN TORT LAW

VINCENT R. JOHNSON

Professor of Law St. Mary's University San Antonio, Texas

CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS

Copyright © 1995, 1999, 2005, 2009, 2013 by Vincent R. Johnson All Rights Reserved.

Carolina Academic Press 700 Kent Street Durham, North Carolina 27701 (919) 489-7486 FAX (919) 493-5668 www.cap-press.com

Printed in the United States of America

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Preface	V			
Table of Cases	IX			
Acknowledgments	XV			
Chapter 1: An Overview of Modern Tort Liability	1			
Chapter 2: Basic Intentional Torts				
Chapter 3: Defenses and Privileges				
Chapter 4: Damages	95			
Chapter 5: Negligence: Basic Principles				
Chapter 6: Proving Negligence				
Chapter 7: Factual Causation				
Chapter 8: Proximate Causation	215			
Chapter 9: Limited Duty: Failure to Act				
Chapter 10: Limited Duty: Premises Liability	263			
Chapter 11: Limited Duty: Negligent Infliction of Severe				
Emotional Distress	281			
Chapter 12: Limited Duty: Alcohol-Related Injuries	291			
Chapter 13: Torts Involving Conception, Pregnancy, Birth,				
and Adoption	299			
Chapter 14: Strict Liability	305			

Chapter 15: Products Liability	317
Chapter 16: Defenses Based on Plaintiff's Conduct	337
Chapter 17: Joint Tortfeasors	357
Chapter 18: Immunities	371
Chapter 19: Statutes of Limitations	377
Chapter 20: Interference with Possession or Use of Land:	
Trespass and Nuisance	381
Chapter 21: Misrepresentation	395
Chapter 22: Defamation	419
Chapter 23: Invasion of Privacy	443
Exam Annendix	455

PREFACE TO THE FIFTH EDITION

This book is part of a comprehensive, carefully integrated package of materials for teaching first-year torts courses. That package consists of Power Point slides and three books that I have authored for Carolina Academic Press:

- Studies in American Tort Law (5th ed., 2013);
- Teaching Torts: A Teacher's Guide to Studies in American Tort Law (5th ed., 2013); and
- Mastering Torts: A Student's Guide to the Law of Torts (5th ed. 2013).

These three books each follow the same organizational plan laid out in 23 chapters. Both the teacher's manual and the student study guide are cross-referenced to *Studies in American Tort Law* (SATL). Contact me by e-mail for the latest version of my Power Point slides (vjohnson@stmarytx.edu).

As a "guide" for torts professors, *Teaching Torts* has decidedly modest objectives. It is intended to provide neither an exhaustive discussion of prominent theories of tort liability, nor an encyclopedic compilation of references. Rather, *Teaching Torts* seeks to assist torts teachers — particularly new teachers, but experienced ones as well — by assembling a useful mix of information relevant to tasks of recurring importance, including:

- · allocation of course time;
- · stimulation of classroom discussion;
- · clarification and application of existing tort rules;
- exploration of the role of public policy in advocacy, decision making, and legislative reform; and
- preparation of students for examinations.

In my view, these tasks are an indispensable part of being a good law teacher. To be sure, wisdom and proficiency in teaching torts comes not from any teacher's manual, but from plain hard work: re-reading cases before class; consulting treatises and articles; keeping abreast of judicial and legislative developments; thinking about how to teach well; and endeavoring to execute a sound plan each class period. I hope that this book helps to make some of that hard work easier for law professors.

The main part of *Teaching Torts* is Chapters 1 to 23, which correspond to the chapters in SATL. In each chapter of *Teaching Torts*, there is a set of introductory notes, followed by questions and comments relating to each of the principal cases. The notes suggest, in rough terms, how many class sessions may be needed to cover the material in SATL, and which portions of the text may be omitted if time is short. Some thoughts are also offered about which topics deserve the greatest attention (or at least should not be overlooked), and about strategies for efficiently teaching certain groups of cases. Occasionally, an excerpt from a particularly interesting case or article is quoted. Miscellaneous teaching tips, as well as selected references to collateral reading, are also provided. Some of the notes offer an economic analysis of legal questions.

For each principal case, there is a brief statement about the point of the case or the holding of the court, followed by questions about the decision or related notes. Some of the proffered questions are obvious and elementary, others are more complex. Some inquire into the holding of the case or the opinion's relation to other decisions; others explore issues of public policy; and still others vary the facts of the case or present related hypothetical queries. While many of these questions might be used verbatim in class, they are probably more valuable simply as a list that a professor can look over in advance of class to begin thinking about issues that might be explored in dialogue with students. That is precisely how I get ready for class. I read over

the lists and fill my head with questions in order to prepare for my part in the "Socratic dialogue."

In some instances, "answers" to the listed questions are offered in *Teaching Torts*. In many cases, however, answers have been omitted. This is not because the questions are difficult, but because the lists of questions will often be used by experienced law teachers to whom the answers (or the ways to arrive at answers) will be readily apparent.

Law schools vary widely in how many credit hours they devote to the basic course(s) in torts (typically four, five, or six credit hours) and in how those credit hours are scheduled (such as fifty, sixty, or seventy-five minute class sessions). Mindful of these numerous variations, the teacher's manual does not include a sample syllabus. However, the material in SATL is relatively even in its complexity throughout the book. It is generally safe to assume that a fifteen to twenty page assignment will be both manageable for students and sufficiently rich for classroom discussion. If you would like a copy of my own syllabus for a five-credit course, e-mail me at the address listed above.

The Exam Appendix contains several essay questions that I have used in past torts classes. The general scope of each essay question (e.g., "negligence and simple intentional torts" or "defamation and privacy") has been noted. Professors are invited to use these questions in any way and for any purpose that seems desirable. One possibility is to distribute the questions to students, or place them on reserve, for use as practice problems. If you consider using one of these questions on a final exam, be sure to vary the facts substantially because these questions are in the public domain.

Alan Gunn, now an emeritus member of Notre Dame Law School faculty, was my excellent co-author on the first three editions of *Studies in American Tort Law* and *Teaching Torts*. Alan's contributions to the text are still very much a part of this book, particularly the law and economics comments.

Valuable assistance for the fifth edition of *Teaching Torts* was provided by several law students at St. Mary's University School of Law. I am grateful to Chad Christenson, Eric Campolo, Leo R. Morales, Brandon Clem, and Bruce A. Minor. The generous efforts of Leslie McCombs, James Alexander Smith, Taylor Jenkins, and Maggie Langley substantially eased the burdens of proof reading and editing. Amy Bresnen, Jennifer Bruning, Karen A. Oster, and Melinda Uriegas went far beyond the call of duty and were a pleasure to work with in every respect.

I am deeply grateful to St. Mary's University School of Law for supporting this project. Frequent discussions with my faculty colleague, Professor Chenglin Liu, have enriched the text of this book.

I hope that this book is useful to you. Please give me your suggestions for future editions of *Teaching Torts*.

Vincent R. Johnson San Antonio, Texas May 16, 2013

TABLE OF CASES

Albritton v. Neighborhood
Ctrs. Ass'n for Child Dev., 375
Altamuro v. Milner Hotel, Inc., 231
Anderson v. Minneapolis, St. P.
& S.S. M. Ry. Co., 191
Anderson v. Sears, Roebuck &
Co., 96
Andrushchenko v. Silchuk, 269
Anjou v. Boston Elevated Ry.
Co., 172

Bailey v. Lewis Farm, Inc., 234
Banker v. McLaughlin, 267
Baptist Mem. Hosp. Sys. v.
Sampson, 311
Barker v. Kallash, 92
Biomet Inc. v. Finnegan
Henderson, LLP, 132
Bird v. Jones, 49
Bonney v. Canadian Nat'l
Ry. Co., 263
Borrack v. Reed, 253
Boyce v. Brown, 134
Boyd v. Racine Currency Exch.,

Inc., 276
Boyles v. Kerr, 288
Breunig v. American Family
Ins. Co., 130
Brochner v. Western Ins. Co., 363
Bruckman v. Pena, 360
Brudney v. Ematrudo, 32
Burr v. Board of County
Comm'rs of Stark City, 303

Campbell v. Weathers, 271
Cast Art Industries, LLC v. KPMG,
LLP, 416
Chapman v. Milford Towing &
Service, Inc., 229
Chicago, B & Q. R. R. Co. v.
Krayenbuhl, 124
Coffee v. McDonnell-Douglas
Corp., 254
Cohen v. Petty, 9
Coleman v. Ramada Hotel
Operating Co., 342
CompuServe Inc. v.
CyberProductions, Inc., 58

Crisci v. Security Ins. Co. of New Haven, 14

Davies v. Butler, 70

Davis v. Devereux Foundation, 310

De May v. Roberts, 74

De Vera v. Long Beach Public Transp. Co., 242

Del Lago Partners, Inc. v. Smith, 294

Derdiarian v. Felix Contracting Corp., 227

Dillard Department Stores, Inc. v. Silva, 87

Doe v. Archdiocese of Cincinnati, 303

Doe v. Roe, 6

Drabek v. Sabley, 80

Economopoulos v. A.G. Pollard Co., 426

Elbaor v. Smith, 369

Enright v. Groves, 53

Escola v. Coca Cola Bottling Co. of Fresno, 317

Eskin v. Bartee, 285

Farley v. Sartin, 302 Feltmeier v. Feltmeier, 45 F.G. v. MacDonnell, 288 Foster v. Costco Wholesale Corp., 274

Garratt v. Dailey, 3 Gavcus v. Potts, 381 Gertz v. Robert Welch, Inc., 430 Gipson v. Kasey, 157 Goar v. Village of Stephen, 233 Goddard v. Boston & M.R. Co., 171 Goins v. The Clorox Co., 329 Gonzalez v. New York City Hous. Auth., 104 Goss v. Allen, 128 Grant v. Reader's Digest Ass'n, 420 Gross v. Sweet, 344 Gulf Refining Co. v. Williams, 121

Harris v. Anderson County Sheriff's Office, 11
Harris v. Jones, 39
Helfend v. Southern California
Rapid Transit Dist., 102
Helling v. Carey, 153
Henson v. Reddin, 60
Herman v. Wesgate, 207
Hilen v. Hays, 341
Hoyal v. Pioneer Sand Co., Inc., 106
Humphrey v. Twin State Gas & Elec. Co., 266

Inkel v. Livingston, 273 In re Marriage of Tigges, 448 Italian Cowboy Partners, Ltd. v.

Hymowitz v. Eli Lilly and Co., 205

In re Marriage of Tigges, 448
Italian Cowboy Partners, Ltd. v.
Prudential Ins. Co., 411

Jaillet v. Cashman, 417 John Doe BF v. Diocese of Gallup, 138

John Doe No. v. Archdiocese of Milwaukee, 397

John R. v. Oakland Unified Sch. Dist., 308

Johnson v. Barnes & Noble Booksellers, Inc., 55

Johnson v. Jacobs, 230

Johnson v. Minnesota, 241

Johnson v. New York, 283

Jones v. Secord, 247

Kaneko v. Hilo Coast
Processing, 355
Katko v. Briney, 82
Keel v. Hainline, 27
Kelly v. Gwinnell, 292
(Kinsman No. 1), Petition of
Kinsman Transit Co., 222
(Kinsman No. 2), Petition of
Kinsman Transit Co., 223
Koeppel v. Spiers, 448
Kramer Serv., Inc. v. Wilkins, 189
Kremen v. Cohen, 66

Leung v. Verdugo Hills Hospital, 366 Lewis v. Westinghouse Elec. Corp., 282 Lickteig v. Kolar, 374 Linden v. CNH America, LLC, 322 Low v. Park Price Co., 169 Lozoya v. Sanchez, 287

Lussier v. Bessette, 210

Lambertson v. United States, 20

Mahowald v. Minnesota Gas
Co., 176
Mangual v. Berezinsky, 178
Martin v. Herzog, 162
Matsuyama v. Birnbaum, 194
Matthews v. Amberwood
Associates Ltd., 278
McCahill v. New York Transp.
Co., 219
McGuire v. Almy, 25
McKenna v. Straughan, 257
McKernan v. Aasheim, 299
McNamara v. Freedom

Newspapers, Inc., 445

Merhi v. Becker, 220 Meyer ex rel. Coplin v. Fluor Corp., 101 Michie v. Great Lakes Steel Div. Nat'l Steel Corp., 359 Miglino v. Bally Total Fitness of Greater New York, Inc., 160 Milkovich v. Lorain Journal Co., 433 Miller v. HCA, Inc., 72 Minnich v. Med-Waste, Inc., 352 Mobil Chemical Co. v. Bell, 174 Montgomery v. Royal Motel, 164 Moore v. El Paso Chamber of Commerce, 35 Morales v. Lee, 52

NAACP v. Acusport, Inc., 387 National Conversion Corp. v. Cedar Building Corp., 410 New York Times Co. v. Sullivan, 428 Noble v. Louisville Transfer Co., 33 Nussbaum v. Lacopo, 119

O'Brien v. Cunard S.S. Co., 71 O'Shea v. Riverway Towing Co., 105 Oltmer v. Zamora, 404 Orthmann v. Apple River Campground, Inc., 277

Pachunka v. Rogers
Construction Inc., 353
Palsgraf v. Long Island R.R. Co.,
116
Pannu v. Land Rover North America, Inc., 323

Parker v. St. Lawrence County Public Health Department, 374 Peck v. Counseling Serv. of Addison County, Inc., 250 Peterson v. Sorlien, 56 Picard v. Barry Pontiac-Buick, Inc., 34 Ploof v. Putnam, 91 Prah v. Maretti, 383

Ranard v. O'Neil, 163
Ranson v. Kitner, 24
Remsburg v. Docusearch, Inc., 246
Reynolds v. Texas & Pac. Ry.
Co., 188
Richard v. A. Waldman and
Sons, Inc., 414
Richetta v. Stanley Fastening Systems, L.P., 325
Riss v. City of New York, 258
Rose v. Daily Mirror, Inc., 423
Rousey v. Rousey, 372
Russell-Vaughn Ford, Inc. v.
Rouse, 64
Russo v. Griffin, 133

Saelzler v. Advanced Group, 190
Sall v. T's, Inc., 256
Schramm v. Lyon, 379
Scott v. Bradford, 135
Sepaugh v. LaGrone, 373
Sharyland Water Supply Corp. v.
City of Alton, 331
Sheehan v. Roche Brothers
Supermarkets, Inc., 172
Sidis v. F-R Publishing Corp., 433
Silas v. Bowen, 77
Sindell v. Abbott Labs., 202
Slocum v. Food Fair Stores of
Florida, Inc., 43

Smith v. Cote, 301 Smith v. Durden, 433 Smith v. Jersey Central Power & Light Co., 386 Smith v. Lannert, 306 Sorichetti v. City of New York, 260 Sovereign Pocohontas v. Bond, 398 Spur Industries, Inc. v. Del E. Webb Dev. Co., 390 Stachniewicz v. Mar-Cam Corp., Starr v. Hill, 314 State Farm Mutual Automobile Insurance Co. v. Campbell, 107 State v. Lead Industries Association, Inc., 388 Stout v. Warren, 313 Summers v. Tice, 199 Surocco v. Geary, 88

Tanner v. Ebbole, 450
Tessier v. Rockefeller, 407
The T.J. Hooper, 168
Thompson v. Kaczinski, 224
Trammell Crow Central Texas,
Ltd. v. Gutierrez, 275
Trevio v. Ortega, 183
Trupia v. Lake George Central
School District, 351
Turcotte v. Fell, 349
Tyson v. Tyson, 378

United States v. Carroll Towing Co., 122

Vassiliades v. Garfinckel's, Brooks Bros., 446 Vincent v. Lake Erie Transp. Co., 90 Vosburg v. Putney, 2 W.J.A. v. D.A., 432

(Wagon Mound No. 1), Overseas Tankship (U.K.) Ltd. v. Morts Dock & Engineering Co., Ltd., 218

(Wagon Mound No. 2), Overseas Tankship (U.K.) Ltd. v. Miller Steamship Co., 218

Wegner v. Milwaukee Mut. Ins. Co., 89

Weintraub v. Krobatsch, 400

West v. East Tennessee Pioneer Oil Co., 297

West v. Media General Convergence, Inc., 450

Western Union Tel. Co. v. Hill, 37

Western Union Tel. Co. v. Hoffman, 338

Williams v. Bright, 126

Williams v. Steves Indus., Inc., 186

Winget v. Winn Dixie Stores, Inc., 385

Wolfe v. MBNA America Bank, 249

Wyeth v. Levine, 333

Ybarra v. Spangard, 179 Young v. Clark, 124

Zeni v. Anderson, 163 Zimmerman v. Ausland, 103

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Excerpts from the various Restatements of the Law cited in the book are reproduced with the permission of the American Law Institute, which holds the copyrights to those works. Those works include:

- Restatement, Second, Torts. Copyright 1965, 1977, and 1979 by The American Law Institute. Reprinted with permission. All rights reserved.
- Restatement, Third, Torts: Liability for Physical and Emotional Harm. Copyright 2010 and 2012 by The American Law Institute. Reprinted with permission. All rights reserved.
- Restatement, Second, Agency. Copyright 1959 by The American Law Institute. Reprinted with permission. All rights reserved.