

**Outsourcing Justice**  
*The Rise of Modern Arbitration  
Laws in America*

Imre Stephen Szalai



CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS  

---

Durham, North Carolina

Copyright © 2013  
Imre Stephen Szalai  
All Rights Reserved

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Szalai, Imre.

Outsourcing Justice: the rise of modern arbitration laws in America / Imre Szalai.

pages cm

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-61163-202-6 (alk. paper)

1. Arbitration and award--United States--History. I. Title.

KF9085.S98 2013

347.73'9--dc23

2013000072

CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS  
700 Kent Street  
Durham, North Carolina 27701  
Telephone (919) 489-7486  
Fax (919) 493-5668  
[www.cap-press.com](http://www.cap-press.com)

Printed in the United States of America

*For the Millions of Americans Who Are Unjustly  
Bound by an Arbitration Agreement*

# Contents

<b>Acknowledgments</b>	xii
<b>Chapter 1 · Introduction</b>	3
Arbitration	7
The Rise of Modern Arbitration Laws During the 1920s	9
Inspiration	12
Organization	13
<b>Chapter 2 · The Cradle, the Chamber, and the Father: 1700s to 1911</b>	15
New York and the Birth of the Chamber	16
The Chamber's Arbitration Committee	17
The Chamber's Court of Arbitration	19
New York and Its Court System at the Turn of the Twentieth Century: A Hotbed of Commercial Activity and a Burdensome, Complex Legal System	21
Charles Leopold Bernheimer, the Father of Commercial Arbitration	25
Pound's Speech to the American Bar Association	26
The Panic of 1907 and Bernheimer's Betrayal and Fascination with Arbitration	27
Bernheimer's Exploration and Discovery Period: 1907 through 1911	31
German Arbitration Law's Influence on Bernheimer	32
Bernheimer's Exploratory Efforts through the Chamber	34
Re-Establishment of the Chamber's Committee on Arbitration	37
<b>Chapter 3 · Rebirth, War, and Victory: 1911 to 1920</b>	41
Julius Henry Cohen, the Chamber's Counselor	41
1911: The Rebirth of the Chamber's Committee on Arbitration	42
1912–1913	48
1912: The Committee's First Formal Arbitration	48
The Committee's Early Educational Efforts	50

Drafting Model Arbitration Legislation	51
Tensions with the Legal Community	51
The Committee's Interest in International Commercial Arbitration	53
Grand Celebration at the Waldorf-Astoria	54
1914–1915	56
The New York Bar Establishes a Committee on Prevention of Unnecessary Litigation	57
The Chamber's 1914 Draft Legislation	58
The First World War	60
The Chamber's Cooperation with the New York Bar	62
The New York Constitutional Convention	63
1916–1917	65
Continued Cooperation Between the Chamber and the New York Bar	66
The Use of Arbitration in Mobilizing for the War	71
1918–1919	72
Joint Presentation at the Conference of State and Local Bar Associations	73
Cohen's Book, "Commercial Arbitration and the Law"	74
Armistice with Germany	76
Contract Cancellations	76
Further Attempts to Lobby the New York Legislature	80
1920: Victory in New York	83
Bernheimer's Summer Expeditions	88
Bernheimer's Motivations and Praise for Bernheimer	91
<b>Chapter 4 · The National Campaign During the 1920s</b>	97
Nationalization, Industrialization, Urbanization, and Progressivism	98
Prohibition	99
1920–1921	100
Bernheimer's Lobbying at the National Level	100
The Chamber's Outreach to the American Bar Association	103
Legal Developments Regarding the New York Arbitration Statute	105
Bernheimer's Continued Lobbying for Federal and State Legislation	107
Secretary of Commerce Herbert Hoover and His Support of Arbitration	108

The 1921 Draft of the Federal Bill	109
Department of Commerce Conference and Advisory Committee	110
1922–1923	112
Moses H. Grossman and a Threat to the Chamber	112
Bernheimer’s Work Toward International Arbitration Treaties	117
The Arbitration Society of America	117
Bernheimer’s Continued Cooperation with the American Bar Association	118
The 1922 Draft of the Federal Bill	118
Bernheimer Meets with Secretary of State Charles Evan Hughes	120
The Chamber Approves of the 1922 Draft	121
Federal Lobbying: Bernheimer and Representatives from the American Bar Association Go to Washington	122
Introduction of Arbitration Bills in Congress and Bernheimer’s Continued, Intensive Lobbying	126
Concerns Regarding Labor	131
The 1923 Congressional Hearing	135
“Hoover’s” Letter	144
Bernheimer’s Continued Lobbying	145
The End of the Sixty-Seventh Congress	150
The Labor Issue Revisited	152
New Jersey	154
Bernheimer’s Continued Interest in International Arbitration Treaties	156
The 1923 Draft of the Federal Bill	158
Introduction of the Arbitration Bills in the Sixty-Eighth Congress	159
1924–1925	160
The 1924 Joint Congressional Hearing	160
The First World War	161
A Broader Movement for Procedural Reform	166
Progressivism	173
Bernheimer’s Lobbying Efforts	179
The Federal Arbitration Bills before the First Session of the Sixty-Eighth Congress	180
The Federal Arbitration Bills before the Second Session of the Sixty-Eighth Congress	183
Celebration at Astor’s Fifth Avenue Mansion	184

<b>Chapter 5 · Concluding Observations Based on the History of the Reform Movement</b>	187
The Federal Arbitration Act as Landmark Legislation	188
The Supreme Court Has Erred When Interpreting the Federal Arbitration Act	191
Employment Arbitration	191
Consumer Arbitration	192
A New Age of Reform for America’s Arbitration Laws?	199
<b>Notes</b>	203
Chapter 1	203
Chapter 2	209
Chapter 3	219
Chapter 4	240
Chapter 5	276
<b>Index</b>	281

# Acknowledgments

I owe a special debt of gratitude to Columbia University for permitting access to the New York Chamber of Commerce and Industry collection in Columbia's Rare Book & Manuscript Library.

Portions of this book discussing the movement for procedural reform and the First World War's impact on arbitration reform are based on two of my prior articles, *An Obituary for the Federal Arbitration Act: An Older Cousin to Modern Civil Procedure*, 2010 J. DISP. RESOL. 391, and *Modern Arbitration Values and the First World War*, 49 AM. J. LEG. HIST. 355 (2007). I would like to thank the American Journal of Legal History, the Journal of Dispute Resolution, and the University of Missouri-Columbia School of Law for granting permission to incorporate and reprint parts of these articles in this book.

I also wish to express my deep appreciation to Loyola University New Orleans College of Law, the late Dean Brian Bromberger, Interim Dean Kathryn Venturatos Lorio, and Dean María Pabón López for their financial support during the writing of this book. I also wish to thank my research assistants, Meagan Conway, Jeffrey Emberton, and Kevin Micale, for all their hard work. I also would like to thank Etheldra Scoggin of Loyola's Law Library for her invaluable assistance in tracking down sources.

I owe a special debt of gratitude to my sister, Marcella Szalai, Esq., who helped me with her intensive research efforts and painstaking review of the documents of the reformers in New York City.

To my mother, Carmen Szalai, I also owe a tremendous amount of gratitude. She gave up everything to give me a better life, and her patience, gentleness, and love I will never forget.

I also wish to thank my father, Imre Szalai, who is one of my greatest inspirations. He grew up in a communist country and desired freedom so badly that he risked his life and gave up everything to make a dramatic escape to come to America. While I was writing this book, which at times is critical of the Supreme Court of the United States, my father reminded me of the freedoms Americans have.



To my dearest children, Ella, Ethan, and Evan, whom I adore with all my heart, you are the most wonderful children a dad could ever ask for.

To my beautiful wife, Andrea, words cannot express the gratitude I have for you. You hold me together, and with your smile and laugh, you make all worries melt away. Through your selfless love, you constantly inspire me to be a better person, and I cannot imagine my life without you.

Finally, I thank God, who has jurisdiction over all. The love you have shown me has been overwhelming. *Ad majorem Dei gloriam.*