

Behind the Multilateral Trading System

*Legal Indigenization and the WTO
in Comparative Perspective*

Xing Lijuan



CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS

Durham, North Carolina

Copyright © 2014
Xing Lijuan
All Rights Reserved

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Xing, Lijuan.

Behind the multilateral trading system : legal indigenization and
the WTO in comparative perspective / Xing Lijuan.

pages cm

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-61163-294-1 (permanent paper)

1. World Trade Organization. 2. Foreign trade regulation. 3.
International and municipal law. I. Title.

K4610.X56 2012

343.08'70261--dc23

2012042147

CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS
700 Kent Street
Durham, North Carolina 27701
Telephone (919) 489-7486
Fax (919) 493-5668
www.cap-press.com

Printed in the United States of America

Summary of Contents

Chapter 1 · Review of Literature	13
I. Survey of the Key Sources	13
II. Analysis of the Key Sources	21
Chapter 2 · The Concept of Legal Indigenization	49
I. Responses to a “Problematic” World	49
II. The Concept of Indigenization in the Context of International Law	66
Chapter 3 · Legal Indigenization of WTO Law in China	73
I. International Trade Rule-Making	73
II. International Trade Disputes	83
III. Domestic Legislation on Trade	98
IV. Domestic Adjudication of Trade Issues	103
Chapter 4 · Legal Indigenization of WTO Law in the United States	131
I. International Trade Rule-Making	131
II. International Trade Disputes	146
III. Domestic Legislation on Trade	155
IV. Domestic Adjudication of Trade Issues	162
Chapter 5 · Legal Indigenization of WTO Law in the European Union	173
I. International Trade Rule-Making	173
II. International Trade Disputes	181
III. “Domestic” Legislation on Trade	189
IV. “Domestic” Adjudication of Trade Issues	195
Chapter 6 · Legal Indigenization and the WTO	219
I. Indigenized WTO Agreements and Practices	219
II. Legal Indigenization in the Context of Further Negotiations	232
III. General Implications for the WTO	246

Contents

Abbreviations	xv
Acknowledgments	xvii
Abstract and Overview	xix
Introduction · The Aim, Structure, Conceptual Terminology, and Limitations of This Book	3
Goals	3
Structure and Approach	5
Conceptual Terminology	7
Limitations	11
Chapter 1 · Review of Literature	13
I. Survey of the Key Sources	13
A. WTO Mechanisms	13
1. Overall assessment	14
2. On certain mechanisms	14
3. The WTO and domestic law	15
4. The WTO and international law	15
5. Legal principles and the interpretation of the WTO agreements	16
6. The design of the WTO agreements	16
7. The position of developing countries in the WTO	17
8. Domestic context	17
B. International Negotiation and Rule-Making	17
1. The current round of multilateral trade negotiations	18
2. Power of rule-making	18
3. Strategies or priorities in trade negotiations	18
C. Domestic Legislation and Policy-Making	19
1. Legislation	19
2. Free Trade Agreements	20
3. Domestic (and regional) influences on the international regime	20
D. Participation of Members in Multilateral Disputes Settlement	20
II. Analysis of the Key Sources	21
A. WTO Mechanisms	22
1. Overall assessment	22
2. On certain mechanisms	23
3. The WTO and domestic law	24

4. The WTO and international law	25
5. Legal principles and the interpretation of the WTO agreements	26
6. The design of the WTO agreements	26
7. The position of developing countries in the WTO	28
8. Domestic context	28
B. International Negotiation and Rule-Making	29
1. Current multilateral negotiations	29
2. Power of rule-making	29
3. Strategies or priorities in trade negotiations	30
C. Domestic Legislation and Policy-Making	30
1. Legislation	30
2. Free Trade Agreements	32
3. Domestic (and regional) influences on the international regime	32
D. Participation of Members in Multilateral Disputes Settlement	32
Summary	33
Appendix 1.1 Extended Survey of the Key Sources	35
Chapter 2 · The Concept of Legal Indigenization	49
I. Responses to a “Problematic” World	49
A. Legal Fragmentation in Trade before World War II	49
B. Legal Globalization as a Response to Fragmentation	51
C. Legal Globalization — Inherent Problems	53
D. Legal Globalization — Acquired Problems	57
1. Surge of sovereign countries	57
2. Self-evolution of the global trading system	58
3. Development of international law	59
E. Legal Indigenization as a Response to Problematic Globalization	64
II. The Concept of Indigenization in the Context of International Law	66
A. Meaning	66
B. Comparisons with Other Relevant Terms	68
Summary	72
Chapter 3 · Legal Indigenization of WTO Law in China	73
I. International Trade Rule-Making	73
A. Review of China’s Proposals	74
1. Special and Differential Treatment in China’s proposals	74
2. Substantive provisions in China’s proposals	75
3. Procedural matters in China’s proposals	75
B. Characteristics of China’s Trade Negotiations	76
1. Special and Differential Treatment	76
2. An inclination for vagueness	76
3. Procedural matters	77
C. Pertinent Aspect of Chinese Legal Tradition and Culture	78
1. Sovereign equality	78
2. Attitude toward international law	81
3. Procedural issues	82
II. International Trade Disputes	83

A. Overview	84
B. Chinese Ideologies Challenged by the DSB Disputes	84
1. Protection of subjects involving illegality	84
2. Publications and public morality	85
3. Trading rights and state control	86
4. Criminal thresholds and the protection of intellectual property rights as civil rights	86
C. Pertinent Aspects of Chinese Legal Tradition and Culture	86
1. Protection of subjects of law involving illegal elements	87
2. Publications and public morality	90
3. Trading rights and state control	91
4. The protection of civil rights through the criminal law	94
5. The protection of intellectual property rights — more fundamental issues	97
III. Domestic Legislation on Trade	98
A. Legal Regime of Trade	98
B. WTO Law in Domestic Context and Characteristics of Domestic Legislation	99
1. WTO law in domestic context	99
2. Characteristics of domestic legislation	100
C. Pertinent Aspects of Chinese Legal Tradition and Culture	101
1. Forms of law in dynastic China	101
2. Contemporary China's legal regime	102
IV. Domestic Adjudication of Trade Issues	103
A. Administrative and Judicial Regimes Relating to Trade	103
B. WTO Law in Domestic Context and Characteristics of Domestic Adjudication	104
1. WTO law in domestic context	104
2. Characteristics of domestic adjudication	105
C. Pertinent Aspects of Chinese Legal Tradition and Culture	109
1. Judicial review on administrative activities	109
2. Direct application of WTO law	111
3. Administrative litigation as a legal remedy	113
4. Competence of intermediate courts to exercise jurisdiction over trade cases	115
Summary	116
Appendix 3.1 Specific Amendments to the Dispute Settlement Understanding — Drafting Inputs from China	119
Appendix 3.2 Dynasties in Chinese History	122
Appendix 3.3 Sentences Requiring Thresholds Prescribed in Chapter III of the Criminal Law	123
Appendix 3.4 Sentences Not Requiring Thresholds Prescribed in Chapter III of the Criminal Law	124

Appendix 3.5 Sentences of Fixed-Term Imprisonment of Not More than Three Years or Criminal Detention Prescribed in Chapter III of the Criminal Law	125
Appendix 3.6 Sentences of Fixed-Term Imprisonment of Not Less than Three Years but Not More than Seven Years Prescribed in Chapter III of the Criminal Law	128
Appendix 3.7 A List of Departmental Rules Issued by the Ministry of Commerce on Anti-dumping Issues	130
Chapter 4 · Legal Indigenization of WTO Law in the United States	131
I. International Trade Rule-Making	131
A. Overview	131
1. Multilateral trade negotiations	131
2. Negotiations for free trade agreements	134
B. Characteristics of the United States' Trade Negotiations	134
1. Series of proposals	134
2. Cautiousness toward Special and Differential Treatment	136
3. Reforms of the WTO mechanisms	136
4. The international rule of law	137
5. Procedural justice	137
6. U.S. practices and experiences	138
7. Selective partners in free trade agreements	138
8. Out-reform in trading partners	140
C. Pertinent Aspects of U.S. Legal Tradition and Culture	141
1. Procedural fairness in the common law tradition	141
2. Leadership in the WTO	142
3. Reciprocity and Special and Differential Treatment	143
4. The international rule of law	144
5. Segmentation of power and trade issues	145
II. International Trade Disputes	146
A. Overview	147
B. U.S. Ideologies Challenged by the DSB Disputes	148
1. Sovereignty or unilateralism	148
2. The extra-territorial application of American law	150
C. Pertinent Aspects of U.S. Legal Tradition and Culture	150
1. Origins of "unilateralism"	151
2. The extra-territorial application of American law	154
III. Domestic Legislation on Trade	155
A. WTO Law in Domestic Context and Characteristics of Domestic Legislation	155
1. WTO law in domestic context	156
2. Characteristics of domestic legislation	156
B. Pertinent Aspects of U.S. Legal Tradition and Culture	159
1. The civil law and common law traditions	159
2. Fluctuation of trade policies	160
3. Subordination of international law to domestic law	161
IV. Domestic Adjudication of Trade Issues	162

A. Overview: The Main Agencies, Courts, and Statutory Provisions	162
B. Characteristics of Domestic Adjudication	163
1. Administrative segmentation	163
2. Judicial review	164
3. Specialized courts and judicial segmentation	165
C. Pertinent Aspects of U.S. Legal Tradition and Culture	165
1. “Expertise” deference	166
2. Administrative deference	166
3. The extra-territorial application of American law	168
Summary	168
Appendix 4.1 Further Contribution of the United States to the Improvement of the Dispute Settlement Understanding of the WTO Related to Transparency — Revised Legal Drafting	171
Chapter 5 · Legal Indigenization of WTO Law in the European Union	173
I. International Trade Rule-Making	173
A. Overview	174
B. Characteristics of the EU’s Trade Negotiations	174
1. An emphasis on overall goals of the WTO mechanisms	174
2. A unique perspective on constituents of the DSB	175
3. A fixed style of proposals	175
4. A focus on development, sustainability, and Special and Differential Treatment	175
5. Proposed texts accompanying discussions	176
6. An emphasis on regional issues	177
7. A heavy reliance on principles and guidelines	177
8. Status of independent experts in trade disputes settlement	177
C. Pertinent Aspects of EU Legal Tradition and Culture	178
1. Role of judges	179
2. Principles and doctrines	179
3. Jurists in the civil law tradition	180
4. Sustainable development	180
II. International Trade Disputes	181
A. Overview	182
B. EU Ideologies Challenged by the DSB Disputes	183
1. Approaches of interpreting the WTO agreements	183
2. Multilateralism and trade preferences in FTAs	184
3. The application of legal principles in arguments	185
C. Pertinent Aspects of EU Legal Tradition and Culture	186
1. The interpretation of international agreements	186
2. The relationship between trade preferences and multilateralism	188
3. The status of legal principles	189
III. “Domestic” Legislation on Trade	189
A. Overview	190
B. WTO Law in “Domestic” Context and Characteristics of “Domestic” Legislation	191
1. WTO law in “domestic” context	191

2. Characteristics of “domestic” legislation	191
C. Pertinent Aspects of EU Legal Tradition and Culture	193
1. Different concepts of law	193
2. The relationship between EU law and national law	194
IV. “Domestic” Adjudication of Trade Issues	195
A. Overview	195
1. Administrative organs	195
2. Courts	196
B. Characteristics of “Domestic” Adjudication	197
1. The form of determinations on trade defense	197
2. Judicial protection of individual rights	197
3. Types of actions	198
4. The application of legal principles	199
5. Procedural rights	200
6. The style of judgments	200
7. Case law	200
8. Opinions of Advocates General	201
9. The application of the WTO agreements	201
C. Pertinent Aspects of EU Legal Tradition and Culture	202
1. Judicial review	202
2. The style of judgments	203
3. The application of legal principles in EU jurisprudence	204
4. The centrality of the person and the protection of fundamental rights	208
5. The principle of due process	209
6. The system of Advocate General	209
Summary	210
Appendix 5.1 EU Emphasis on Principles, as Illustrated in Proposals on Special and Differential Treatment and Environmental Goods	212
Appendix 5.2 Independent Group of Experts for the Enforcement of Initiation Standards	215
Appendix 5.3 Illustrations of EU Basic Regulations on Trade	217
Chapter 6 · Legal Indigenization and the WTO	219
I. Indigenized WTO Agreements and Practices	219
A. The United States and the Multilateral Anti-dumping Mechanism	219
1. History of U.S. anti-dumping legislation	220
2. Article VI of the GATT 1947	221
3. The Kennedy Code	222
4. The Tokyo Code	224
5. Anti-dumping Agreement 1994	224
B. Rules for Applying the Notion of “Legitimate Expectations”	226
1. Case of Japan — Film	227
2. Case of EC — Computer Equipment	228
3. Case of EC — Asbestos	229
4. Rules for applying the notion of “legitimate expectations”	231

C. Admissibility of Amicus Curiae Submissions	231
II. Legal Indigenization in the Context of Further Negotiations	232
A. Competing (Indigenized) Views on Special and Differential Treatment	232
1. China	233
2. The United States	234
3. The EU	235
B. Competing (Indigenized) Views on Trade and the Environment	237
1. China	237
2. The United States	238
3. The EU	239
C. Competing (Indigenized) Views on Fisheries Subsidies	240
1. China	241
2. The United States	241
3. The EU	241
D. Competing (Indigenized) Views on Reform of the DSB	242
1. China	242
2. The United States	243
3. The EU	244
III. General Implications for the WTO	246
A. In the Short Term	246
1. Overview of the Trade Policy Review Mechanism	248
2. The Trade Policy Review Mechanism and legal indigenization	248
3. Concerns regarding the Trade Policy Review Mechanism	249
B. In the Long Term	250
Summary	250
Conclusion · The Context, Concept, and Significance of Legal Indigenization	253
Legal Indigenization and China	253
Legal Indigenization and the United States	254
Legal Indigenization and the EU	255
Legal Indigenization and the WTO	255
Bibliography	257
About the Author	271
Index	273

Abbreviations

AD	Anti-dumping
ADA	Anti-dumping Agreement
ASCM	Agreement on Subsidy and Countervailing Measures
ASEAN	Association of Southeast Asian Nations
CAFC	Court of Appeals for the Federal Circuit
CAP	Common Agricultural Policy
CARIFORUM	Caribbean Forum of African, Caribbean and Pacific States
CBP	Customs and Border Protection
CCL	Commerce Control List
CCP	Common Commercial Policy
CISADA	Comprehensive Iran Sanctions, Accountability, and Divestment Act
CIT	Court of International Trade
COP	Conference of the Parties
CTD	Committee on Trade and Development
CVD	Countervailing Duties
DDA	Doha Development Agenda
DOA	Department of Agriculture
DOC	Department of Commerce
DSB	Dispute Settlement Body
DSU	Dispute Settlement Understanding
EAR	Export Administration Regulations
EC	European Community or European Communities
EC Treaty	Treaty Establishing the European Community
ECJ	European Court of Justice
EEC Treaty	Treaty Establishing the European Economic Community
EEZ	Exclusive Economic Zones
EU	European Union
FTA	Free Trade Agreement
G20	The Group of Twenty Finance Ministers and Central Bank Governors
GATS	General Agreement on Trade in Services
GATT	General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade
GSP	Generalized System of Preference
IMF	International Monetary Fund
IPR	Intellectual Property Rights
ISA	Iran Sanctions Act

ITC	International Trade Commission
ITO	International Trade Organizations
LDCs	Least-Developed Countries
MEA	Multilateral Environmental Agreement
MFN	Most-Favored-Nation
MOC	Ministry of Commerce
NAFTA	North American Free Trade Agreement
NPC	National People's Congress
OCT	Overseas Countries and Territories
PRC	People's Republic of China
S&D treatment	Special and Differential Treatment
SDS	Sustainable Development Strategy
SIAs	Sustainability Impact Assessments
SPC	Supreme People's Court
SPS Agreement	Agreement on the Application of Sanitary and Phytosanitary Measures
STO	Special Trade Obligation
TBT Agreement	Agreement on Technical Barriers to Trade
TEU	Treaty on European Union
TPRM	Trade Policy Review Mechanism
TRIPs	Agreement on Trade-Related Aspects of Intellectual Property Rights
TWEA	Trading With the Enemy Act
UN	United Nations
URAA	Uruguay Round Agreements Act
USTR	Office of the United States Trade Representative
WTO	World Trade Organization
WWII	World War II

Acknowledgments

Any honest author realizes that his or her work draws strength and guidance from many sources. In my case, much of that strength and guidance can be traced to the University of Kansas. In particular, Professor John W. Head has been an enduring inspiration in my work. Serving as my supervisor and the Chairperson of my Dissertation Committee, Professor Head has provided constant guidance and support to me in the past three years, in such various forms as reading, editing, discussing, and critiquing my work as well as training and honing my skills in advanced legal research and writing. I am deeply indebted to Professor Head, and therefore, begin my acknowledgments with sincere respect and genuine thanks to him.

A big note of appreciation also goes to Professor Raj Bhala of the University of Kansas School of Law, Professor Virginia Harper Ho of the University of Kansas School of Law, Professor Tailan Chi of the University of Kansas School of Business, and Ms. Ashly LoBurgio Basgall, the Faculty Services Senior Researcher of the University of Kansas School of Law, for their invaluable comments on the manuscript.

I am also grateful for the excellent study and research environment of the University of Kansas School of Law as well as moral support from its whole faculty. All these made every step of my writing an easier and more interesting task.

As will be obvious from footnote references and from the Bibliography, I have relied heavily on many authorities with far broader expertise than I could possibly bring to bear on this subject myself. I offer acknowledgments and expressions of gratitude to them collectively.

A special mention is warranted for Lucia Orth, who has generously given her encouragement and personal assistance to me from the outset. Finally, but distinctly not least, I thank my family for their constant support and inexhaustible love.

Abstract and Overview

This book offers a new perspective from which to view and understand the World Trade Organization (WTO) regime and its participants. The central feature of this new perspective is the concept of legal indigenization. The term “legal indigenization” generally refers to the process or ideology with which domestic authorities make and implement international or domestic rules in a way appealing to their native characteristics (especially legal traditions), as responses to globalization led by a defective global legal system. The core thesis of the book is that the key elements of the legal tradition and culture of a country or a region inevitably and fundamentally influence the ways in which it participates in WTO activities and implements its WTO obligations. These ways, however, have not been adequately explored and explained in the extensive literature relating to developing and implementing international trade rules.

In developing and elaborating on that core thesis, this book has six chapters, following an *Introduction* that summarizes the significance, structure and approach, and conceptual terminology of the book.

Chapter 1, *Review of Literature*, comprises two parts. The first part surveys the key academic, professional, and official literature regarding a range of issues pertinent to this book. These include such topics as (1) the general character and structure of the WTO regime, (2) specific trade mechanisms, (3) the relationship between WTO law and domestic law, (4) the relationship between WTO law and general international law, (5) legal principles and the interpretation of the WTO agreements, (6) the position of developing countries in the multilateral trading system, (7) strategies pursued by individual members in international trade negotiations, (8) examinations of domestic trade legislation, (9) Free Trade Agreements (FTAs), (10) the WTO dispute settlement mechanism, and (11) domestic adjudication of trade issues. The second part of the chapter offers the main findings of the literature introduced in the first part. It is those findings, of course, that serve as the foundation as well as the starting point for further research as reflected in this book. The findings of pertinent literature have helped me formulate two assumptions of the book. One is that the deficiencies of the current WTO legal regime have made it possible, and even necessary, for a WTO member to indigenize WTO law by resorting to its own legal tradition and culture. The other assumption is that some WTO members’ practices in dealing with the WTO have demonstrated their willingness and efforts to indigenize WTO law.

Chapter 2, *The Concept of Legal Indigenization*, develops the fundamental concept of this book—legal indigenization. The chapter starts in Section I by reviewing legal fragmentation in international trade before World War II (WWII). The disaster of world war, which is said to be brought about by legal fragmentation, necessitated international responses to such fragmentation. The responses made subsequently by international participants resulted in the globalization of trade. Then, the section proceeds into the exploration of the inherent and acquired problems of that globalization, explaining the need of a WTO member to rely on legal indigenization. Section II of the chapter defines the concept of “legal indigenization,” based on the various concepts of “indigenization”

that exist in different contexts and dissects the concept of “legal indigenization” for further understanding. In that same vein, the latter part of the section compares this central term with two other relevant terms—“globalization” and “localization.”

Based on the concept of “legal indigenization” defined in Chapter 2, the three succeeding chapters proceed to apply this concept to the specific actions adopted by China, the United States, and the European Union (EU) regarding their interactions with the WTO. Chapter 3, *Legal Indigenization of WTO Law in China*, examines four aspects of legal indigenization within China. Section I focuses on China’s participation in international trade rule-making. It explains how China emphasizes Special and Differential (S&D) treatment as well as discussing substantive and procedural issues in the Chinese proposals submitted to the WTO. The sources of pertinent features of the Chinese proposals submitted to the WTO are located, partially, in Chinese legal tradition and culture. Section II of Chapter 3 finds that China’s participation in international trade dispute settlement has designated the Chinese ideologies challenged by its trading partners. Those ideologies bear on such issues as (1) whether legal protection is to be provided for subjects of law involving illegal elements, (2) the relationship between publications and public morality, (3) state control of trading rights, and (4) the necessity of criminal thresholds regarding the protection of intellectual property rights (IPR). The section examines how these features have taken shape, based on Chinese legal tradition and culture. Section III examines key characteristics of the overall trade legislation in China, such as (1) the degree of specification of laws at different levels, (2) the use of “temporary” legislation, and (3) a focus on “management.” The section explains these features from the perspective of Chinese legal tradition, focusing specifically on various forms of law in dynastic China and China’s contemporary legal system. Section IV examines domestic adjudication of trade disputes arising within China. It reviews administrative and judicial regimes relating to trade issues. Although China has complied with its WTO obligation to provide judicial review of administrative determinations relating to trade issues, it still treats adjudication of trade issues as having unique characteristics that other members of the WTO might find odd or objectionable, which reflects deeply-rooted elements of Chinese legal tradition and culture.

Chapter 4, *Legal Indigenization of WTO Law in the United States*, examines the process of legal indigenization (again, relating to trade law) taking place within that country. Section I explores several aspects of U.S. proposals submitted to the WTO on both substantive and procedural issues, as well as S&D treatment. It also gives some attention to U.S. FTA negotiations. The section characterizes U.S. proposals to the WTO from several perspectives and points out the preference of the United States for (1) submitting a series of proposals, (2) exhibiting cautiousness toward S&D treatment, (3) addressing institutional reform, (4) emphasizing the international rule of law, (5) pursuing procedural justice, etc. The section traces these practices to their roots in U.S. legal tradition and culture, specifically (1) the emphasis on procedural fairness in the common law tradition, (2) the U.S. leadership in the WTO, (3) U.S. reliance on reciprocity, (4) its belief in the rule of law, and (5) segmentation of power in its political regime. Section II examines international trade disputes involving the United States as respondent and reveals certain U.S. ideologies challenged by its trading partners, such as the relationship between sovereignty and unilateralism and the extra-territorial application of U.S. domestic law. The section also attributes these features to U.S. legal tradition and culture, especially to vestiges of unilateralism. Section III explores domestic legislation on trade within the United States and highlights some of its key characteristics, such as the urge for comprehensive content and codification as well as a subordinate status of international trade agreements. The origins of these characteristics in U.S. legal tradition and culture mainly involve (1) a mixture of the civil law and common law traditions, (2) the fluctuation

of trade policies in U.S. legal history, and (3) dualism adopted by the country with respect to the relationship between international law and domestic law. Section IV examines domestic adjudication of trade issues arising within the United States. After reviewing pertinent administrative agencies and judicial bodies relating to trade adjudication, the discussion emphasizes certain characteristics of domestic adjudication of trade issues within the country, such as the use of administrative segmentation and specialized courts. U.S. legal tradition and culture can help explain these characteristics, for example, deference to “expertise” in U.S. courts.

Chapter 5, *Legal Indigenization of WTO Law in the European Union*, analyzes the process of legal indigenization of WTO law within the EU. Section I examines how the EU has participated in international trade rule-making and explains the EU’s emphasis on certain topics, such as (1) constituents of the Dispute Settlement Body (DSB), (2) the style of proposals, (3) the importance of sustainable development and S&D treatment, (4) the establishment of principles guiding negotiations of specific rules, and (5) the role of independent experts in the multilateral dispute settlement mechanism. The origins of the special attention accorded to these topics by the EU can be found in the EU’s legal tradition and culture, particularly in (1) the role of judges in the civil law tradition, (2) the center stage given to general principles, (3) a high status given to jurists, and (4) the great importance attached to sustainable development. Section II discusses international trade disputes involving the EU as respondent. On the grounds of a review of pertinent cases, the section identifies some EU ideologies that seem conflicting with those of its trading partners, such as (1) its various approaches of interpreting the WTO agreements, (2) its attitude toward the relationship between multilateral principles and trade preferences in FTAs, and (3) the application of general principles of law in its arguments. Some of the factors contributing to the formulation of these features appear also in continental European legal tradition and culture, especially in the civil law’s approach of interpreting international agreements. Section III of the chapter explores the “domestic” trade legislation within the EU.¹ Based on an overview of its trade legislation, the section points out some EU-specific approaches to trade legislation. These approaches find their roots in continental European legal tradition and culture, especially in the concept of law as adopted by the civil law tradition and in theories about the relationship between EU law and the domestic laws of its Member States. Section IV, after reviewing pertinent administrative agencies and courts involved in adjudication of trade issues within the EU, characterizes such “domestic” adjudication of trade issues as giving special emphasis to (1) the judicial protection of individual rights, (2) the application of general principles of law, (3) procedural justice, and (4) direct application of the WTO agreements. Once again, the shared corpus of legal tradition and culture that predominates in the EU can partially account for these features, as explained at the end of Chapter 5.

Chapter 6, *Legal Indigenization and the WTO*, explores legal indigenization of WTO law from an integrated perspective. Its aim is to explain how, at the multilateral level, the WTO provisions have been indigenized by each of these three individual members’ legal traditions and cultures. Section I reviews how existing WTO provisions and practices were influenced by the legal traditions and cultures of certain members. It does this by studying three examples: (1) the United States and the multilateral anti-dumping (AD) mechanism, (2) rules developed by the DSB for applying the principle of “legitimate expectations,” and (3) the admissibility of amicus curiae submissions in the DSB. Section II focuses on legal indigenization in the context of negotiations for prospective multilateral

1. For a discussion of reasons for describing EU legislation and adjudication as “domestic” in this book, see *infra* Chapter 5.

rules. The section examines competing (indigenized) views from three participants—China, the United States, and the EU — on S&D treatment, environmental issues, fisheries subsidies, and reform of the DSB. Section III addresses the general implications of legal indigenization for the WTO both in the short term and in the long run.

The text of the book closes with a *Conclusion* that summarizes the main findings of all the above chapters.