# **Civil Procedure**

# Cases, Text, Notes, and Problems

THIRD EDITION

### Larry L. Teply

Professor of Law Creighton University

### Ralph U. Whitten

Senator Allen A. Sekt Professor of Law Creighton University

### Denis F. McLaughlin

Professor of Law & William E. Garland Fellow Seton Hall University

CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS

Durham, North Carolina

Copyright © 2013 Larry L. Teply, Ralph U. Whitten, Denis F. McLaughlin All Rights Reserved

ISBN 978-1-61163-357-3 LCCN 2013939805

Carolina Academic Press 700 Kent Street Durham, North Carolina 27701 Telephone (919) 489-7486 Fax (919) 493-5668 www.cap-press.com

Printed in the United States of America

# **Contents**

| Table of Cases  | xix   |
|---|-------|
| Table of Short Form Citations   | xxvii |
| Preface   | xxix  |
| Chapter 1 • Introduction to Civil Procedure and Practice                    | 3     |
| Section A. The Study of the Subject of "Civil Procedure" and Its Importance | 3     |
| Section B. Court Systems in the United States                               | 4     |
| Section C. The Role of Civil Actions in the Administration of Justice       | 6     |
| 1. The Relationship Between Civil, Criminal, and Administrative Action      | s 6   |
| 2. Limits of Civil Actions in Resolving Disputes                            | 6     |
| Cudahy Junior Chamber of Commerce v. Quirk                                  | 7     |
| Notes and Questions   | 10    |
| Section D. The Adversary System   | 11    |
| Section E. Historical Origins of Civil Procedure                            | 12    |
| 1. Writs and the Forms of Action  | 13    |
| 2. Procedure in the Common-Law Courts                                       | 15    |
| 3. Equity (Chancery) Courts   | 17    |
| 4. Development and Reform of Civil Procedure in the United States           | 19    |
| Section F. An Overview of a Civil Action                                    | 23    |
| 1. Presuit Investigation  | 23    |
| 2. The Plaintiff's Initial Litigation Decisions                             | 24    |
| (a) Choosing a Court Authorized to Hear a Particular Type of Case           |       |
| (Subject-Matter Jurisdiction)   | 25    |
| Problems  | 28    |
| (b) Choosing a Location Where the Particular Defendant May Be               |       |
| Required to Appear and Defend ("Personal Jurisdiction")                     | 29    |
| Problems  | 31    |
| (c) Choosing a Court in the Proper Location ("Venue")                       | 31    |
| Problem   | 32    |
| (d) Choice-of-Law Considerations  | 32    |
| (e) Can the Plaintiff Join Multiple Claims in One Lawsuit?                  | 33    |
| Problem   | 34    |
| (f) Who May (or Must) Be Named as Parties in the Lawsuit?                   | 34    |
| Problem   | 36    |
| (g) Is a Person Who Wants to Commence the Action the                        |       |
| "Real Party in Interest" and Do All the Parties Have the                    |       |
| "Capacity to Sue or Be Sued"?   | 36    |

vi CONTENTS

|     | Problem  | 37 |
|-----|--|----|
| 3.  | Commencement and Service of Process                              | 37 |
| 4.  | The Plaintiff's First Pleading, Remedies, and Amendments         | 37 |
|     | Problems   | 43 |
| 5.  | The Defendant's Response to the Plaintiff's Commencement         |    |
|     | of the Action  | 43 |
|     | (a) Default  | 43 |
|     | (b) Transfer, Forum Non Conveniens, and Removal                  | 44 |
|     | Problems   | 44 |
|     | (c) The Defendant's Basic Responses to the Complaint             | 45 |
|     | Problems   | 47 |
|     | (d) Assertion of Claims by the Defendant Against Other Parties   | 48 |
|     | (e) Good-Faith Requirements                                      | 49 |
|     | Problems   | 50 |
| 6.  | The Plaintiff's Possible Responses to the Defendant's Answer     | 51 |
|     | Problems   | 52 |
| 7.  | Intervention by Parties Outside of the Lawsuit                   | 52 |
|     | Problem  | 52 |
| 8.  | Discovery by Parties to the Action                               | 52 |
|     | (a) Depositions  | 53 |
|     | (b) Interrogatories  | 53 |
|     | (c) Requests for the Production of Documents and Tangible Things | 53 |
|     | (d) Requests for Admission                                       | 53 |
|     | (e) Physical or Mental Examinations                              | 54 |
|     | (f) Mandatory Disclosures  | 54 |
|     | (g) Sanctions  | 54 |
|     | Problems   | 54 |
| 9.  | Pretrial Conferences   | 55 |
| 10. | Disposition of the Action Without Trial                          | 55 |
|     | (a) Judgment on the Pleadings                                    | 55 |
|     | (b) Summary Judgment   | 55 |
|     | (c) Voluntary Dismissal  | 56 |
|     | (d) Involuntary Dismissal  | 56 |
|     | (e) Settlement   | 56 |
|     | Problem  | 57 |
| 11. | Trial  | 57 |
|     | Problems   | 60 |
| 12. | Post-Trial Motions   | 60 |
|     | Problems   | 61 |
| 13. | Judgments and Final Remedies                                     | 62 |
| 14. | Appeals  | 62 |
|     | Problems   | 64 |
| 15. | Finality in Litigation   | 65 |
|     | Problems   | 66 |
| 16. | Alternative Dispute Resolution                                   | 66 |
|     | The Path for Studying Civil Procedure                            | 67 |

CONTENTS vii

| Chapter 2 • Personal Jurisdiction and Related Matters  | 69       |
|--|----------|
|  | 70       |
| -  |          |
|  | 70       |
|  |          |
|  | 71       |
| Section A. "Territorial" Rules of Jurisdiction  1. Personal Jurisdiction Prior to the Adoption of the Fourteenth Amendment  2. Incorporation of the Traditional Territorial Rules into the Due Process Clause of the Fourteenth Amendment Pennoyer v. Neff  Notes and Questions  3. The Operation of the Territorial Rules  (a) In Rem and Quasi in Rem Jurisdiction  Notes and Questions  (b) In Personam Jurisdiction: Physical Presence — Personal Servicupon the Defendant Within the Forum State  (c) In Personam Jurisdiction: Consent, Appearance, and Waiver Notes and Questions  (d) In Personam Jurisdiction: Domicile in the Forum State Section B. The "Minimum Contacts" Test  1. Development of Modern Restrictions on State Court Jurisdiction in International Shoe International Shoe International Shoe Co. v. Washington  Notes and Questions  2. Reaction of the States to the "Minimum Contacts" Test: Enactment of "Long-Arm" Statutes  Notes and Questions  3. Developing the Content of the "Minimum Contacts" Test Notes and Questions  4. In Rem and Quasi in Rem Jurisdiction after International Shoe Shaffer v. Heitner  Notes and Questions  5. Further Refinement of the "Minimum Contacts" Test Notes and Questions  Notes and Questions  Notes and Questions  Section C. The Concepts of Specific and General Jurisdiction  1. Specific Jurisdiction  Burger King Corp. v. Rudzewicz  Notes and Questions  Asahi Metal Industry Co. v. Superior Court  Notes and Questions  J. McIntyre Machinery, Ltd. v. Nicastro  Notes and Questions  Problems  2. General Jurisdiction  Helicopteros Nacionales de Colombia, S.A. v. Hall  Notes and Questions | 71       |
|  | 77       |
|  | 78       |
|  | 78       |
|  | 82       |
|  | 0.2      |
| -  | 83       |
|  | 83       |
|  | 85       |
|  | 86<br>87 |
|  | 0/       |
|  | 87       |
|  | 88       |
|  | 92       |
| · ·  | 92       |
|  | 92       |
| · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·  | 93       |
|  | 94       |
|  | 97       |
|  | 97       |
|  | 98       |
| ••   | 106      |
|  | 108      |
|  | 110      |
|  | 111      |
| · ·  | 115      |
|  | 117      |
|  | 117      |
|  | 118      |
| *  | 118      |
| Notes and Questions  | 128      |
| Asahi Metal Industry Co. v. Superior Court   | 129      |
| Notes and Questions  | 136      |
| J. McIntyre Machinery, Ltd. v. Nicastro  | 138      |
| Notes and Questions  | 150      |
| Problems   | 152      |
|  | 152      |
|  | 153      |
|  | 159      |
| Goodyear Dunlap Tire Operations, S.A. v. Brown   | 160      |

viii CONTENTS

| Notes and Questions  | 166        |
|--|------------|
| Problems   | 167        |
| 3. Application of the "Minimum Contacts" Test to Internet Activities Section D. Personal Service in the Forum State — Transient Presence | 168        |
| Jurisdiction after Shaffer   | 169        |
| Burnham v. Superior Court  | 169        |
| Notes and Questions  | 178        |
| Problems   | 180        |
| Section E. Jurisdiction by Necessity   | 180        |
| Notes and Questions  | 181        |
| Problems   | 182        |
| Section F. Due Process Requirements of Notice and Opportunity to Be Heard  | 183        |
| 1. The Constitutional Requirement of Notice  | 183        |
| Notes and Questions  | 187        |
| Problem  | 188        |
| 2. Notice and Opportunity to Be Heard in the Context of  |            |
| Provisional Remedies   | 188        |
| Notes and Questions  | 190        |
| Section G. Statutory and Rule Requirements for Notice and Service  |            |
| of Process   | 192        |
| 1. Methods and Manner of Service   | 192        |
| Notes and Questions  | 194        |
| 2. Waiver of Service   | 194        |
| Problems   | 195        |
| Section H. Special Issues of Amenability to Process and Personal Jurisdiction  |            |
| in Federal Court   | 196        |
| Notes and Questions  | 199        |
| Problems   | 200        |
| Chapter 3 • Venue and Related Matters  | 201        |
| Section A. Transitory and Local Actions  | 202        |
| Notes and Questions  | 203        |
| Problems   | 204        |
| Section B. Venue in the Federal Courts   | 204        |
| 1. The General Venue Statute: 28 U.S.C. § 1391   | 204        |
| 2. Interaction of § 1391(b)(1), (2), and (3)   | 209        |
| Pfeiffer v. Insty Prints   | 209        |
| Problems   | 211        |
| 3. Venue Based on Substantial Events Within the District   | 212        |
| Bates v. C & S Adjusters, Inc.   | 212        |
| Notes and Questions  | 214        |
| Problems   | 216        |
| 4. The "Local Action" Rule and Property-Based Venue in Federal Court   | 217        |
| Problem  | 217        |
| Section C. Transfers of Venue Within a Judicial System   | 218        |
| Notes and Questions<br>Section D. The Doctrine of Forum Non Conveniens   | 220        |
| Piper Aircraft Co. v. Reyno  | 220<br>221 |
| Notes and Questions  | 229        |
| Problems   | 231        |
|  |            |

CONTENTS ix

| Section E. Forum-Selection Clauses   | 231 |
|--|-----|
| Carnival Cruise Lines, Inc. v. Shute   | 232 |
| Notes and Questions  | 234 |
| Notes and Questions  | 235 |
| Section F. Injunctions Against Extrastate Litigation and Stays               |     |
| of Forum Proceedings   | 236 |
| •  |     |
| Chapter 4 • Subject-Matter Jurisdiction                                      | 239 |
| Section A. Overview of the Subject-Matter Jurisdiction of the Federal Courts | 239 |
| 1. The Federal Judicial System   | 239 |
| 2. Federal Courts as Courts of Limited Jurisdiction                          | 240 |
| 3. Subject-Matter Jurisdiction of the U.S. Supreme Court                     | 241 |
| 4. Subject-Matter Jurisdiction of the Lower Federal Courts and the           |     |
| Need for Both Constitutional and Statutory Authority                         | 242 |
| 5. Principal Jurisdictional Categories of Article III                        | 242 |
| 6. Seriousness of a Subject-Matter Jurisdiction Defect                       | 243 |
| 7. Hierarchical Order of Consideration                                       | 243 |
| 8. Effect of a Dismissal for Lack of Subject-Matter Jurisdiction             | 244 |
| 9. Refiling in State Court — Statute of Limitations Tolling                  | 244 |
| Problem  | 245 |
| Section B. Federal Question Jurisdiction                                     | 245 |
| 1. The Scope of the Constitutional Grant                                     | 246 |
| 2. The Scope of the Statutory Grant  | 248 |
| (a) Cases in Which Federal Law Creates the Plaintiff's                       |     |
| Claim for Relief   | 248 |
| (b) Cases in Which Federal Law Is an Essential Element of the                |     |
| Plaintiff's State Law Claim  | 249 |
| (c) The "Well-Pleaded Complaint" Rule  | 249 |
| Louisville & Nashville Railroad Co. v. Mottley                               | 250 |
| Notes and Questions  | 251 |
| (d) Meeting the Requirements for "Arising Under" Jurisdiction in             |     |
| "Category 2" Federal Question Cases  | 253 |
| Grable & Son's Metal Products, Inc. v. Darue Engineering                     |     |
| & Manufacturing  | 253 |
| Notes and Questions  | 258 |
| Gunn v. Minton   | 260 |
| Notes and Questions  | 265 |
| Problem  | 266 |
| 3. Distinguishing Proper Subject-Matter Jurisdiction in a Federal            |     |
| Question Case from Ultimate Success on the Merits                            | 266 |
| 4. Scope of the Statutory Grant in Declaratory Judgment Actions              | 267 |
| Problems   | 270 |
| Section C. Diversity and Alienage Jurisdiction                               | 270 |
| 1. Suits between Citizens of Different States                                | 273 |
| Walls v. Ahmed   | 274 |
| Notes and Questions  | 276 |
| 2. Citizenship of Corporations   | 277 |
| Hertz Corp. v. Friend  | 279 |
| Notes and Questions on Additional Diversity Jurisdiction Issues              | 280 |
| Problems   | 281 |

x CONTENTS

| 3. Alienage Jurisdiction   | 282        |
|--|------------|
| Problems   | 285        |
| 4. Determining the Amount in Controversy                                       | 285        |
| (a) Cases in Which the Plaintiff Requests Money Damages<br>Notes and Questions | 286<br>288 |
| Problems   | 288        |
| (b) Aggregation of Claims  | 289        |
| Notes and Questions  | 289        |
| (c) Relief Other Than Monetary Damages   | 291        |
| Problems   | 292        |
| Section D. Judicial Exceptions to Federal Jurisdiction                         | 292        |
| 1. Domestic Relations Cases  | 292        |
| 2. Probate Cases   | 294        |
| Problems   | 295        |
| Section E. Supplemental Jurisdiction   | 295        |
| 1. Overview  | 295        |
| Notes and Questions  | 297        |
| 2. Meeting the Requirements of § 1367(a)                                       | 297        |
| (a) Determining When Claims Are Part of the Same Article III                   |            |
| "Case or Controversy"  | 297        |
| Notes and Questions  | 298        |
| Problem  | 298        |
| (b) Supplemental Jurisdiction for Claims Involving                             |            |
| Additional Parties   | 299        |
| Problem  | 300        |
| 3. Restrictions Imposed by § 1367(b) in Actions Founded Solely on              |            |
| Diversity of Citizenship   | 300        |
| Exxon Mobil Corp. v. Allapattah Services, Inc.                                 | 304        |
| Notes and Questions  | 310        |
| Note   | 311        |
| Problems   | 311        |
| 4. Discretionary Dismissals Under § 1367(c)                                    | 312        |
| Notes and Questions  | 314        |
| 5. Tolling of the State Statute of Limitations Under § 1367(d)                 | 315        |
| Notes and Questions  | 315        |
| Problems   | 315        |
| Section F. Removal Jurisdiction  | 316        |
| Problems   | 322        |
| Chapter 5 • Sources of Law   | 325        |
| Section A. Overview of the <i>Erie</i> Doctrine                                | 325        |
| 1. Introduction to Source-of-Law Issues in United States Law                   | 325        |
| 2. The <i>Erie</i> Doctrine — Basic Rule                                       | 326        |
| 3. The Rules of Decision Act and the Swift Doctrine                            | 327        |
| 4. The Erie Railroad Co. v. Tompkins Decision                                  | 331        |
| Erie Railroad Co. v. Tompkins  | 332        |
| Notes and Questions  | 335        |
| 5. Klaxon and the Application of Erie to Conflict-of-Laws Issues               | 336        |
| Notes and Questions  | 338        |

CONTENTS xi

| Section B. Initial Developments after the <i>Erie</i> Decision        | 338 |
|---|-----|
| 1. Early Post- <i>Erie</i> Decisions                                  | 339 |
| Guaranty Trust Co. v. York  | 340 |
| Notes and Questions   | 343 |
| Problems  | 344 |
| Byrd v. Blue Ridge Rural Electric Cooperative, Inc.                   | 345 |
| 2. The Branching of the <i>Erie</i> Doctrine                          | 349 |
| Hanna v. Plumer   | 349 |
| Notes and Questions   | 356 |
| Problems  | 359 |
| Section C. The Evolution of the Erie "Branches" and the Search        |     |
| for Standards   | 360 |
| Question  | 360 |
| Burlington Northern Railroad Co. v. Woods                             | 360 |
| Notes and Questions   | 363 |
| Notes and Questions   | 365 |
| Notes and Questions   | 367 |
| Notes and Questions   | 368 |
| Problem   | 369 |
| Notes and Questions   | 370 |
| Problems  | 371 |
| Gasperini v. Center for Humanities, Inc.                              | 371 |
| Notes and Questions   | 380 |
| Problems  | 382 |
| Notes and Questions   | 384 |
| Problems  | 385 |
| Shady Grove Orthopedic Associates v. Allstate Insurance Co.           | 385 |
| Notes and Questions   | 401 |
| Problem   | 402 |
| Section E. Determination of State Law                                 | 403 |
| Notes and Questions   | 404 |
| Section F. Federal Common Law   | 406 |
| 1. "Substantive" Federal Common Law                                   | 406 |
| 2. Federal Procedural Common Law in State Courts                      | 409 |
| Notes and Questions   | 412 |
| Chapter 6 • Pleading and Related Matters                              | 415 |
| Section A. Background and Overview                                    | 415 |
| Section B. Stating a "Claim for Relief" in the Complaint and Pleading |     |
| Special Matters   | 418 |
| 1. Degree of Detail Required in the Complaint                         | 418 |
| Leatherman v. Tarrant County Narcotics Intelligence &                 |     |
| Coordination Unit   | 420 |
| Notes and Questions   | 422 |
| Swierkiewicz v. Sorema N. A.  | 422 |
| Bell Atlantic Corp. v. Twombly  | 426 |
| Notes and Questions   | 434 |
| Ashcroft v. Iqbal   | 436 |
| Notes and Questions   | 445 |

xii CONTENTS

| Problem   | 447 |
|---|-----|
| 2. Pleading Special Matters                                       | 447 |
| (a) Fraud and Mistake   | 447 |
| Notes and Questions   | 448 |
| Problem   | 448 |
| (b) Special Damages   | 448 |
| Notes and Questions   | 449 |
| Problems  | 449 |
| (c) Other Special Pleading Requirements                           | 450 |
| Notes and Questions   | 450 |
| 3. Alternative, Hypothetical, and Inconsistent Pleading           | 451 |
| Notes and Questions   | 451 |
| 4. Allocating the Burden of Pleading                              | 452 |
| Section C. Responding to the Complaint                            | 453 |
| 1. Preanswer Motions  | 453 |
| Notes and Questions   | 454 |
| 2. What Does an "Answer" Contain?                                 | 454 |
| 3. The Answer: Admissions and Denials                             | 456 |
|   | 456 |
| Notes and Questions   | 430 |
| 4. Waiver of Defenses by Failing to Include Them in a Preanswer   | 457 |
| Motion or the Answer  | 457 |
| Notes and Questions   | 458 |
| 5. The Answer: Affirmative Defenses                               | 458 |
| Notes and Questions   | 459 |
| Problems  | 459 |
| Section D. Responding to the Answer                               | 461 |
| Problem   | 462 |
| Section E. Amendments   | 463 |
| 1. Amendments Pursuant to Rule 15(a)                              | 463 |
| Hill v. Equitable Bank, N.A.                                      | 463 |
| Notes and Questions   | 466 |
| 2. Trial of Issues by Consent and Amendments at Trial: Rule 15(b) | 467 |
| Problems  | 468 |
| 3. Relation Back of Amendments: Rule 15(c)                        | 468 |
| (a) Relation Back of Amendments in Federal Court Based on         |     |
| State "Relation Back" Law Under Rule 15(c)(1)(A)                  | 469 |
| (b) Amendments Asserting a Claim or Defense Under                 |     |
| Rule $15(c)(1)(B)$  | 469 |
| (c) Amendments Changing the Party Under Rule 15(c)(1)(C)          | 470 |
| Krupski v. Costa Crociere S.p.A.                                  | 470 |
| Question  | 476 |
| Problems  | 476 |
| Section F. Supplemental Pleadings                                 | 478 |
| Notes and Questions   | 478 |
| Problem   | 479 |
| Section G. Good-Faith Pleading                                    | 479 |
| Notes and Questions   | 481 |
| Problems  | 482 |
|   |     |

CONTENTS xiii

| Chapter 7 • Joinder of Claims and Parties                           | 485 |
|---|-----|
| Section A. The "Real Party in Interest" Requirement                 | 487 |
| Schrag v. Dinges  | 488 |
| Notes and Questions   | 490 |
| Problems  | 491 |
| Section B. The "Capacity to Sue or Be Sued" Requirement             | 491 |
| Joseph Muller Corp. Zurich v. Societe Anonyme de Gerance            |     |
| et D'Armement   | 492 |
| Notes and Questions   | 493 |
| Section C. Basic Joinder of Claims by Plaintiffs                    | 493 |
| Notes and Questions   | 494 |
| Section D. Basic Joinder of Claims by Defendants: Counterclaims and | 171 |
| Crossclaims   | 495 |
| 1. Who Is an "Opposing Party"?                                      | 497 |
| Rainbow Management Group, Ltd. v. Atlantis Submarines               | 477 |
| Hawaii, L.P.  | 497 |
| Notes and Questions   | 500 |
| Problems  | 501 |
|   | 501 |
| 2. Claims Not Coming into Existence Until a Judgment Is Rendered    |     |
| Tenneco Oil Co. v. Templin  | 502 |
| Notes and Questions   | 505 |
| Problems  | 507 |
| Section E. Permissive Joinder of Plaintiffs and Defendants          | 507 |
| Lucas v. City of Juneau   | 508 |
| Notes and Questions   | 509 |
| Problems  | 510 |
| Section F. Impleader  | 510 |
| Collini v. Wean United, Inc.  | 512 |
| Notes and Questions   | 513 |
| Problems  | 515 |
| Section G. Interpleader   | 516 |
| Notes and Questions   | 519 |
| Problems  | 520 |
| Section H. Required Joinder of Parties                              | 521 |
| Temple v. Synthes, Ltd.   | 525 |
| Notes and Questions   | 526 |
| Z & B Enterprises, Inc. v. Tastee-Freez International, Inc.         | 527 |
| Notes and Questions   | 532 |
| Problems  | 533 |
| Section I. Intervention   | 533 |
| Sierra Club v. Espy   | 534 |
| Notes and Questions   | 538 |
| Problems  | 539 |
| Section J. Class Actions  | 539 |
| Notes and Questions   | 547 |
| Problems  | 548 |

xiv CONTENTS

| Chapter 8 • Discovery   | 551        |
|---|------------|
| Section A. Basic Discovery Scope and Methods  | 552        |
| 1. The General Scope of Discovery: Rule 26(b)(1)                                      | 552        |
| Anderson v. Hale  | 554        |
| Notes   | 557        |
| 2. Limitations on Discovery Under Rule 26   | 557        |
| Behler v. Hanlon  | 558        |
| Problem   | 561        |
|   | 562        |
| 3. The Mechanics of Discovery Exchange  | 562        |
| (a) Introduction (b) Proving Disclosures Puls 26(a)(1) (2)                            | 564        |
| (b) Required Disclosures: Rule 26(a)(1)-(3)   |            |
| Problems  | 568        |
| (c) The Traditional Methods of Discovery: Depositions                                 | 569        |
| Problems  | 576        |
| (d) Interrogatories Under Rule 33   | 579        |
| Notes and Questions   | 581        |
| (e) Production of Documents and Tangible Things: Rule 34                              | 581        |
| (f) Requests for Admission: Rule 36   | 583        |
| Problems  | 585        |
| (g) Compulsory Physical and Mental Examinations: Rule 35                              | 586        |
| Notes and Questions   | 588        |
| Problems  | 589        |
| 4. Pretrial Conferences and Orders: Rule 16   | 590        |
| 5. Discovery Certifications and Sanctions: Rules 26(g) and 37                         | 591        |
| Notes and Questions   | 593        |
| Section B. Special Considerations in the Discovery of Electronically Stored           | 502        |
| Information ("E-Discovery")   | 593        |
| W.E. Aubuchon Co. v. BeneFirst, LLC   | 595        |
| Notes and Questions   | 600        |
| Section C. Additional Discovery Standards: Privilege, Work Product,                   | 601        |
| and Expert Witnesses  |            |
| 1. Privilege  | 601        |
| Problem   | 603        |
| (a) Privilege Against Self-Incrimination  | 603        |
| (b) Attorney-Client Privilege   | 604        |
| Upjohn Co. v. United States   | 605        |
| Notes and Questions  2. "Work Product" and Trial Proposation Materials, Pule 26(b)(2) | 609        |
| 2. "Work Product" and Trial Preparation Materials: Rule 26(b)(3)                      | 610        |
| (a) The "Work Product" Doctrine   | 610        |
| Hickman v. Taylor   | 611        |
| Notes and Questions (b) "Oninion" World Drudwat                                       | 617        |
| (b) "Opinion" Work Product<br>Problems  | 620<br>621 |
|   |            |
| (c) Contention Interrogatories and Work Product Protection                            | 622        |
| Alta Health Strategies, Inc. v. Kennedy   | 622        |
| Note 3. Discovery Concerning Exports  | 623<br>624 |
| 3. Discovery Concerning Experts  (a) Discovery as to Experts Who May Testify at Trial | 624        |
|   | 024        |
| (b) Discovery as to Experts Who Are Not Expected to Testify at Trial                  | 626        |
| icomy at inai   | 020        |

CONTENTS xv

| Bank Brussels Lambert v. Chase Manhattan Bank, N.A.  | 627        |
|--|------------|
| Notes and Questions  | 631        |
| Problem  | 632        |
| Chapter 9 • Disposition of the Action without Trial  | 633        |
| Section A. Default Judgments   | 633        |
| Pretzel & Stouffer v. Imperial Adjusters, Inc.   | 635        |
| Notes and Questions  | 639        |
| Problems   | 639        |
| Section B. Judgment on the Pleadings   | 640        |
| Problems   | 641        |
| Section C. Summary Judgment  | 641        |
| Celotex Corp. v. Catrett   | 643        |
| Notes and Questions  | 646        |
| Problems   | 648        |
| Section D. Voluntary and Involuntary Dismissals  | 649        |
| 1. Voluntary Dismissals  | 649        |
| Lake at Las Vegas Investors Group, Inc. v. Pacific Malibu  |            |
| Development Corp.  | 650        |
| Notes and Questions  | 652        |
| Problems   | 653        |
| 2. Involuntary Dismissals  | 653        |
| (a) Meaning of "Lack of Jurisdiction" in Rule 41(b)  | 654        |
| Costello v. United States  | 654        |
| Notes and Questions  | 657        |
| Problem  (b) Manying of "Adia disertion on the Manite" in Puls 41/b)                                   | 657        |
| (b) Meaning of "Adjudication on the Merits" in Rule 41(b)  | 657        |
| Problem Section E. Daviese to Engayrage Settlement   | 659<br>659 |
| Section E. Alternative Dispute Peculution  | 661        |
| Section F. Alternative Dispute Resolution  1. Arbitration  | 662        |
| Note and Questions   | 664        |
| 2. Mediation   | 664        |
| Notes and Questions  | 665        |
| 3. Summary Jury Trial  | 665        |
| Notes and Questions  | 666        |
| 4. Early Neutral Evaluation  | 666        |
| 5. Mini-Trial  | 666        |
|  | 667        |
| Chapter 10 • Trial   | 667        |
| Section A. Selecting the Trier of Fact   | 667        |
| <ol> <li>Trial by Jury or by the Court</li> <li>The Right to a Trial by Jury in Civil Cases</li> </ol> | 667<br>668 |
| (a) Introduction   | 668        |
| (a) Introduction (b) Sources of the Right to a Trial by Jury: Constitutional                           | 000        |
| and Statutory  | 669        |
| (c) The Right to a Trial by Jury Under the Seventh Amendment:  |            |
| General Principles   | 669        |
| (d) Development and Evolution of the Modern Federal Approach   | 671        |
| Beacon Theatres, Inc. v. Westover  | 671        |

xvi CONTENTS

| Notes and Questions                                       | 675        |
|---|------------|
| Problems  | 679        |
| (e) Comparing the Right to a Trial by Jury in Federal and |            |
|   | 680        |
|   | 682        |
|   | 683        |
| 1 0 ,   | 684        |
|   | 684        |
|   | 687        |
|   | 688        |
|   | 688        |
| · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·                     | 689        |
| •   | 689        |
|   | 691        |
|   | 691        |
|   | 691        |
|   | 693        |
|   | 694        |
| · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·                     | 695        |
|   | 695<br>695 |
| ` '   | 696        |
|   | 696        |
|   | 697        |
| ·   | 697        |
|   | 698        |
| Problems  | 699        |
|   | 704        |
|   | 704        |
| · ·   | 704        |
|   | 705        |
| · ·   | 705        |
|   |            |
|   |            |
|   | 707        |
|   | 707        |
| · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·                     | 707        |
|   | 707        |
|   | 710        |
| · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·                     | 711        |
|   | 712        |
| **  | 712        |
| * **  | 712        |
|   | 713        |
|   | 713<br>714 |
|   | /14        |
|   | 714        |
|   | 714        |
| 3. The Thial Judgment Rule and its exceptions             | /10        |

| CONTENTS | xvii |
|----------|------|
|          |      |

| (a) The "Final Judgment" Rule                                    | 716 |
|--|-----|
| Gagnon v. Allstate Insurance Co.                                 | 716 |
| Notes and Questions  | 717 |
| Problem  | 718 |
| (b) Cases Involving Multiple Claims or Parties                   | 718 |
| Notes and Questions  | 718 |
| Problem  | 719 |
| (c) The "Collateral Order" Exception                             | 719 |
| Problems   | 720 |
| (d) Pendent Appellate Jurisdiction                               | 721 |
| (e) The Rejected "Death Knell" Doctrine                          | 721 |
| (f) Interlocutory Appeals  | 721 |
| Notes and Questions  | 722 |
| Problems   | 722 |
| (g) Review by Extraordinary Writs                                | 723 |
| Notes and Questions  | 723 |
| Section C. Extraordinary Relief from a Judgment                  | 723 |
| Notes and Questions  | 724 |
| Problem  | 724 |
| Chapter 12 • Finality in Litigation                              | 725 |
| Section A. Introduction  | 725 |
| Section B. Claim Preclusion                                      | 728 |
| 1. Basic Principles  | 728 |
| 2. Applying the Requirements of Claim Preclusion                 | 731 |
| Powder Basin Psychiatric Associates, Inc. v. Ullrich             | 731 |
| Thibeault v. Brackett  | 735 |
| Notes and Questions  | 737 |
| Problems   | 737 |
| 3. Exceptions to the General Rule of Claim Preclusion            | 737 |
| Problems   | 738 |
| 4. Counterclaims, Crossclaims, Third-Party Claims, and Claims by |     |
| Intervenors and Rule 19 Parties                                  | 740 |
| United-Bilt Homes, Inc. v. Sampson                               | 741 |
| Notes and Questions  | 742 |
| Problems   | 744 |
| Section C. Issue Preclusion                                      | 744 |
| 1. Basic Principles  | 744 |
| 2. The Essential Elements of Issue Preclusion                    | 747 |
| Cycles, Ltd. v. Navistar Financial Corp.                         | 747 |
| Notes and Questions  | 749 |
| Holtman v. 4-G's Plumbing & Heating, Inc.                        | 750 |
| Hebden v. Workmen's Compensation Appeal Board                    | 752 |
| Notes and Questions  | 754 |
| Malloy v. Trombley   | 757 |
| Notes and Questions  | 761 |
| Problems   | 762 |
| 3. Exceptions to Issue Preclusion                                | 763 |
| Problems   | 765 |

xviii CONTENTS

| 4. Nonmutual Preclusion   | 765 |
|---|-----|
| Hunter v. City of Des Moines  | 766 |
| Notes and Questions   | 769 |
| Problems  | 771 |
| Section D. Preclusion of Nonparties   | 773 |
| Notes and Questions   | 774 |
| Problems  | 775 |
| Section E. Preclusion of Coparties  | 776 |
| Problem   | 776 |
| Section F. Preclusion of Subject-Matter and Personal Jurisdiction Questions | 776 |
| Notes and Questions   | 778 |
| Problems  | 779 |
| Section G. Complications of the Federal System                              | 779 |
| 1. Enforcement of State Judgments   | 779 |
| Notes and Questions   | 781 |
| Problems  | 783 |
| 2. Enforcement of Federal Judgments   | 784 |
| Notes and Questions   | 786 |
| Problems  | 788 |
| 3. Enforcement of Foreign Nation Judgments                                  | 789 |
| Note  | 789 |
| Problems  | 790 |
| Index   | 791 |
|   |     |

### Table of Cases

Principal cases are listed in bolded capital typeface. References are to pages of the casebook. Bold page numbers indicate the location of reprinted cases. Cases cited in principal cases and within other quoted materials are not included in this Table of Cases.

Abernathy v. Abernathy, 179 Bank of the United States v. Planters' Bank, Adam v. J.B. Hunt Transp., Inc., 367 247 Agent Orange, In re, 629 Barber v. Barber, 293 Ager v. Jane C. Stormont Hosp., 626, 632 BATES v. C & S ADJUSTERS, INC., 212 Alexander v. Sandoval, 249 Batson v. Kentucky, 692 Allen v. McCurry, 781 Baxter v. Palmigiano, 604 ALTA HEALTH STRATEGIES, INC. v. BEACON THEATRES, INC. v. WEST-KENNEDY, 622 OVER, 671, 684 Amchem Prods., Inc. v. Windsor, 544 BEHLER v. HANLON, 556, 558 America Online, Inc. v. Superior Court, 235 BELL ATLANTIC CORP. v. TWOMBLY, American Med. Sys., In re, 543 425, 426, 445-47 American Nat'l Red Cross v. S.G., 247 Bell v. Hood, 267 American Well Works Co. v. Layne & Bowler BELL v. VANLANDINGHAM, 689 Co., 248 Beneficial Nat'l Bank v. Anderson, 318 ANDERSON v. HALE, 554 Bergeron v. Boyle, 202 Anderson v. Liberty Lobby, Inc., 647 Bernhard v. Bank of Am. Nat'l Trust & Sav. Ankenbrandt v. Richards, 292 Ass'n, 345, 766 ASAHI METAL INDUS. CO. v. SUPE-BG Real Estate Servs., Inc. v. American Eq-RIOR COURT, 129, 151 uity Ins. Co., 557 ASHCROFT v. IQBAL, 425, 434-35, 436 Bivens v. Six Unknown Named Agents of Ashbury Hosp. v. Cass Cnty., 278 Fed. Bureau of Narcotics, 248, 408 ASX Inv. Corp. v. Newton, 649 Blackmer v. United States, 86 Atlantic Marine Constr. Co., In re, 235, 365 Blonder-Tongue Labs., Inc. v. University of Atlas Roofing Co. v. Occupational Safety & Ill. Found., 785 Health Rev. Comm'n, 679 Bradbury v. GMAC Mortgage, LLC, 404 Avco Corp. v. Aero Lodge No. 735, 318 Bremen, M/S v. Zapata Off-Shore Co., 232 Breon v. Coca-Cola Bottling Co., 554 Baker v. General Motors Corp., 621 Brinkley v. Harbour Recreation Club, 459 Baker ex rel. Thomas v. General Motors Bromley v. Michigan Educ. Ass'n-NEA, 479 Corp., 782 Brown v. Western Ry. Co., 410 Bangor Punta Operations, Inc. v. Bangor BURGER KING CORP. v. RUDZEWICZ, A. & R.R. Co., 547 118, 137, 150, 196 BANK BRUSSELS LAMBERT v. CHASE BURLINGTON NORTHERN R.R. CO. v.

WOODS, 360

MANHATTAN BANK, N.A., 627

BURNHAM v. SUPERIOR COURT, 78, 83, 169

#### BURNS v. LAWTHER, 684

Business Guides, Inc. v. Chromatic Communications Enters., Inc., 369

BYRD v. BLUE RIDGE RURAL ELEC. COOP., INC., 345

Cabello v. Fernandez, 575

Cadent Ltd. v. 3M Unitek Corp., 577

Calder v. Jones, 116, 137, 168

Candlewood Timber Group, LLC v. Pan Am. Energy, LCC, 203

Cannon v. University of Chi., 249

Carden v. Arkoma Assocs., 280

CARNIVAL CRUISE LINES, INC. v. SHUTE, 232

Castano v. American Tobacco Co., 543

Caterpillar Inc. v. Lewis, 277, 322

Caterpillar, Inc. v. Williams, 318

Catrett v. Johns-Manville Sales Corp., 646

CELOTEX CORP. v. CATRETT, 643

Central R.R. & Banking Co. v. Pettus, 547

Chambers v. NASCO, Inc., 367

Chauffeurs, Teamsters & Helpers, Local No. 391 v. Terry, 678

Chris-Craft Indus. Prods. Inc. v. Kuraray Co., 578

Churchill Corp. v. Third Century, Inc., 236 Cincinnati Ins. Co. v. Flanders Elec. Motor Serv., Inc., 404

Cities Serv. Oil Co. v. Dunlap, 339

City of Minneapolis v. Fisher, 406

City of Monterey v. Del Monte Dunes Ltd., 678

Clarke v. Clarke, 79

Cleveland v. Policy Mgmt. Sys. Corp., 727

Coca-Cola Co. v. Harmar Bottling Co., 338

Cohen v. Beneficial Indus. Loan Corp., 345, 719

Colby v. Umbrella, 447

Cold Metal Process Co. v. United Eng'g & Foundry Co., 718

Colgrove v. Battin, 682, 694

COLLINI v. WEAN UNITED, INC., 512

Comcast Corp. v. Behrend, 541

Conference Am., Inc. v. Q.E.D. Int'l, Inc., 319

Conley v. Gibson, 418

Connecticut v. Doehr, 189

Continental Bank, N.A. v. Meyer, 457

Coopers & Lyrand v. Livesay, 721

COSTELLO v. UNITED STATES, 654

Coventry Sewage Assocs. v. Dworkin Realty Co., 288

Cronkite v. Fahrbach, 575

#### CUDAHY JUNIOR CHAMBER OF COM-MERCE v. QUIRK, 7, 10

Cullen v. Auto-Owners Ins. Co., 447

Cunningham v. Hamilton Cnty., 720

Curran v. Price, 482

Curtiss-Wright Corp. v. General Elec. Co., 719

Cybersell, Inc. v. Cybersell, Inc., 168 CYCLES, LTD. v. NAVISTAR FIN. CORP., 747

D'Arcy v. Ketchum, 71

Dairy Queen, Inc. v. Wood, 675

Daniel v. American Bd. of Emergency Medicine, 214

Day & Zimmermann, Inc. v. Challoner, 337

Deford v. Soo Line R.R. Co., 318

Delta Air Lines, Inc. v. August, 659

Dennis Garberg & Assocs. v. Pack-Tech Int'l Corp., 778

Denver & Rio Grande W.R.R. Co. v. Brotherhood of R.R. Trainmen, 206

Department of Transp. v. City of Atlanta, 664

Derienzo v. Harvard Indus., Inc., 469

Dice v. Akron, Canton & Youngstown R.R. Co., 410, 681

Digital Equip. Corp. v. Desktop Direct, Inc., 720

Dimick v. Schiedt, 711

Doe v. FBI, 491

Dudnikov v. Chalk & Vermilion Fine Arts, Inc., 168

Duplan Corp. v. Moulinage et Retorderie de Chavanoz, 620

Edmondson & Gallagher v. Alban Towers Tenants Ass'n, 313

Edmonson v. Leesville Concrete Co., 313, 692

Eisen v. Carlisle & Jacquelin, 542

Empire HealthChoice Assurance, Inc. v. McVeigh, 260

England v. Louisiana Bd. of Med. Exam's, 782

Erickson v. Pardus, 435

ERIE R.R. CO. v. THOMPKINS, 325, 327, 331, 332, 336-37, 787

Evans v. Evans, 7

Executive Software N. Am., Inc. v. United States District Court, 313

# EXXON MOBIL CORP. v. ALLAPATTAH SERVS., INC., 296, 304

Factors Etc., Inc. v. Pro Arts, Inc., 406 Fall v. Eastin, 80

Fayemi v. Hambrecht & Quist, Inc., 593

Felder v. Casey, 410

Feltner v. Columbia Pictures Television, Inc., 678

Felzen v. Andreas, 714

Ferens v. John Deere Co., 218, 365

FGS Constructors, Inc. v. Carlow, 466

Finley v. United States, 299

Fowler v. UPMC Shadyside, 445

Franchise Tax Bd. v. Construction Laborers Vacation Trust, 269

Fuentes v. Shevin, 188

#### GAGNON v. ALLSTATE INS. CO., 716

Garcia v. General Motors Corp., 771 Gardynski-Leschuck v. Ford Motor Co., 288 GASPERINI v. CENTER FOR HUMANI-TIES, INC., 371, 380

Geisinger Med. Ctr. v. Gough, 497 Georgia High Sch. Ass'n v. Waddell, 7, 10 Getter v. Wal-Mart Stores, Inc., 691

Gill v. Gulfstream Park Racing Ass'n, Inc., 557

Gilstrap v. Amtrak, 403, 405

Goldlawr, Inc. v. Heiman, 219

Gonzales v. Centro Espirita Beneficente Uniao Do Vegtal, 191

Gonzalez v. Reno, 293

GOODYEAR DUNLAP TIRE OPERA-TIONS, S.A. v. BROWN, 160

GRABLE & SONS METAL PRODS., INC. v. DARUE ENG'G & MFG., 253

Gray v. American Radiator & Standard Sanitary Corp., 9

Green *ex rel*. Green v. Lewis Truck Lines, Inc., 588

Griffin v. McCoach, 337, 517

Grupo Dataflux v. Atlas Global Group, L.P., 277

Grupo Mexicano de Desarrollo, S.A. v. Alliance Bond Fund, Inc., 343

GUARANTY TRUST CO. v. YORK, 331, 340, 469

GUNN v. MINTON, 260

#### HANNA v. PLUMER, 339, 349, 360

Hanson v. Denckla, 95, 108

Haring v. Prosise, 781-82

Harris v. Balk, 81-82, 107

Harris v. Secretary, 459

#### HEBDEN v. WORKMEN'S COMP. AP-PEAL BD., 752

Heiser v. Woodruff, 785

HELICOPTEROS NACIONALES DE COLOMBIA, S.A., v. HALL, 117, 153, 181

Henderson *ex rel*. Hartsfield v. Alabama Power Co., 683

Henderson v. United States, 370

Herremans v. Carrera Designs, Inc., 289

HERTZ CORP. v. FRIEND, 279, 280

Hess v. Pawloski, 88

Hetzel v. Prince William Cnty., 711

HICKMAN v. TAYLOR, 552, 611

#### HILL v. EQUITABLE BANK, N.A., 463

Hilton v. Guyot, 789

Hinderlider v. La Plata River & Cherry Creek Ditch Co., 406

Hodgson v. Bowerbank, 283

Hoffman v. Blaski, 218

Hoffman v. United States, 604

Holliger, K-Mart Corp., State *ex rel.* v., 93 Holmgren v. State Farm Mut. Auto. Ins.

Co., 621

#### HOLTMAN v. 4-G'S PLUMBING & HEAT-ING, INC., 750

Housing Fin. & Dev. Corp. v. Ferguson, 680 HUNTER v. CITY OF DES MOINES, 766 Hurd v. Pittsburg State Univ., 694

Iannacchio v. Ford Motor Co., 446 *In re* (see name of the party)

Insurance Corp. of Ireland, Ltd. v. Compagnie des Bauxites de Guinee, 115, 197

# INTERNATIONAL SHOE CO. v. WASH-INGTON, 88, 150, 168

International Software Sys., Inc. v. Amplicon, Inc., 236

Iqbal v. Hasty, 434

J.E.B. v. Alabama *ex rel*. T.B., 692 Jackson v. Birmingham Bd. of Educ., 249 James Daniel Good Real Prop., United States v., 189

James-Dickinson Farm Mortgage Co. v. Harry, 178

Japanese Elecs. Prods. Antitrust Litig., *In* re, 683

Jennings v. AC Hydraulic A/S, 168 Jinks v. Richland Cnty., 315

#### J. MCINTYRE MACH., LTD. V. NICAS-TRO, 138

Johnson v. Fankell, 410 Jones v. Bock, 425

Jones v. Flowers, 183

#### JOSEPH MULLER CORP. ZURICH v. SO-CIETE ANONYME DE GERANCE ET D'ARMEMENT, 492

Kampa v. White Consol. Indus., Inc., 381 Karahalios v. National Fed'n of Fed. Employees, 249

Keeton v. Hustler Magazine, Inc., 116, 137 Kerr-Selgas v. American Airlines, Inc., 704 Kimbrough v. Holiday Inn, 663

Klaxon Co. v. Stentor Elec. Mfg. Co., 336, 406

Klein v. AIG Trading Group, Inc., 557 K-Mart Corp., State *ex rel.* v. Holliger, 93 Kramer v. Caribbean Mills, Inc., 281 Kremer v. Chemical Constr. Corp., 781

KRUPSKI v. COSTA CROCIERE S.p.A., 470

Kulko v. Superior Court, 107 Kurczi v. Eli Lilly & Co., 405

#### LAKE AT LAS VEGAS INVESTORS GROUP, INC. v. PACIFIC MALIBU DEV. CORP., 650

Lawhorne v. Employers Ins. Co., 519

Leary v. Daeschner, 466

#### LEATHERMAN v. TARRANT CNTY. NARCOTICS INTELLIGENCE & CO-ORDINATION UNIT, 420

Lehman Bros. v. Schein, 404

Lexecon, Inc. v. Milberg Weiss Bershad Hynes & Lerach, 220

## LOUISVILLE & NASHVILLE R.R. CO. v. MOTTLEY, 253

Loveall v. Employer Health Servs., Inc., 470 LUCAS v. CITY OF JUNEAU, 508

M&C Corp. v. Erwin Behr GmbH & Co., 578

M/S Bremen v. Zapata Off-Shore Co., 232 Mace v. Van Ru Credit Corp., 363

MALLOY v. TROMBLEY, 757

Marek v. Chesny, 660

Maritz, Inc. v. CyberGold, Inc., 168

Markman v. Westview Instruments, Inc., 684

Marrese v. American Academy of Orthopaedic Surgeons, 779

Marshall v. Marshall, 294

Maryland Cas. Co. v. W.R. Grace & Co., 281

Mason v. American Emery Wheel Works, 404

Mastondrea v. Occidental Hotels Mgmt. S.A., 138

Matshshita Elec. Indus. Co. v. Epstein, 780 Matsushita Elec. Indus. Co. v. Zenith Radio Corp., 647

#### Matter of (see name of party)

McCurry v. Chevy Chase Bank, 446 McDonald v. John P. Scripps Newspaper, 7 McElreath v. McElreath, 203 McGee v. International Life Ins. Co., 94,

151

McKenzie v. Hawaii Permanente Med. Group, Inc., 358

Meredith v. City of Winter Haven, 405 Mesa v. California, 317

Metropolitan Life Ins. Co. v. Taylor, 318 Migra v. Warren City Sch. Dist. Bd. of Educ., 781

Milliken v. Meyer, 86, 783

Mills v. Duryee, 71, 779

Mississippi Publishing Corp. v. Murphree, 344

Mitchell v. W.T. Grant Co., 188

Morin v. Nationwide Fed. Credit Union, 578

Mottley v. Louisville & Nashville R.R. Co., 253

Mullane v. Central Hanover Bank & Trust Co., 94, 181, 183

Murphy Bros. v. Michetti Pipe Stringing, Inc., 321

Nashville, Chattanooga & St. Louis Ry, v. Wallace, 268

Natale v. Town of Ridgefield, 721

National Hockey League v. Metropolitan Hockey Club, 592

New York Life Ins. Co. v. Dunlevy, 81-82, 517 Nike, Inc. v. Commercial Iberica de Exclusivas Deportivas, S.A., 281

NLO, Inc., In re, 665

North Ga. Finishing, Inc. v. Di-Chem, Inc., 189

Northwest Forest Res. Council v. Dombeck, 406

Norwood v. Kirkpatrick, 218

O'Brien v. International Bhd. of Elec. Workers, 580

Ohio Cellular Prods. Corp. v. Adams USA, Inc., 505

One 1981 Chevrolet Monte Carlo, State v., 680

Operative Plasterers' & Cement Masons' Int'l Ass'n v. Benjamin, 577

Oppenheimer Fund, Inc. v. Sanders, 600 Ortiz v. Fibreboard Corp., 544

Osborn v. Bank of the United States, 246, 295 Owen Equip. & Erection Co. v. Kroger, 301

Palmer v. Hoffman, 339 Parklane Hosiery Co. v. Shore, 677, 785 Peile v. Skelgas, Inc., 220 Pelfrey v. Bank of Greer, 681 PENNOYER v. NEFF, 71, 77-78, 97, 150,

197, 578

Derolto v. Heights Med. Ctr. Inc. 635

Peralta v. Heights Med. Ctr., Inc., 635 Perkins v. Benguet Consol. Mining Co., 94 PFEIFFER v. INSTY PRINTS, 209 PGA Tour, Inc. v. Martin, 10 Phillips Petroleum Co. v. Shutts, 182 PIPER AIRCRAFT CO.v. REYNO, 221 Pohlmann v. Bil-Jax, Inc., 778 Poloron Prods., Inc. v. Lybrand Ross Bros.,

POWDER BASIN PSYCHIATRIC ASSOCIATES, INC. v. ULLRICH, 731

Powers v. Ohio, 692

649

PRETZEL & STOUFFER v. IMPERIAL AD-JUSTERS, INC., 635

Provident Tradesmens Bank & Trust Co. v. Patterson, 523

Ragan v. Merchants Transfer & Warehouse Co., 345, 360

Railroad Co. v. Stout, 668

Railroad Comm'n v. Pullman Co., 782

Railway Labor Executives Ass'n v. Pittsburgh & Lake Erie R.R. Co., 318

RAINBOW MGMT. GROUP, LTD. v. AT-LANTIS SUBMARINES HAWAII, L.P., 497

Rates Tech. Inc. v. Nortel Networks Corp., 458

Raygor v. Regents of the Univ. of Minn., 315

Reasor-Hill Corp. v. Harrison, 203 Republic of Panama v. BCCI Holdings (Lux-

embourg) S.A., 197 Republic of Philippines v. Pimentel, 533

Robbins v. Oklahoma, 436

Rockwell Int'l Corp v. United States, 590

Rosenbaum v. MacAllister, 714 Ross v. Bernhard, 680, 683

Ross v. Oklahoma, 694

Rowe Entm't, Inc. v. William Morris Agency, Inc., 594

Ruhrgas AG v. Marathon Oil Co., 244 Rush v. Savchuk, 107

Salve Regina College v. Russell, 405

Sanchez v. Turner, 556

San Remo Hotel, L.P. v. City of San Francisco, 782

Sanyo Laser Prods., Inc. v. Arista Records, Inc., 557

Schlagenhauf v. Holder, 587

SCHRAG v. DINGES, 488

Sea-Roy Corp. v. Sunbelt Equip. & Rentals, Inc., 619

Sears Roebuck & Co. v. Mackey, 718 SEC v. Parkersburg Wireless Ltd. Liab. Co., 604

Seider v. Roth, 107

SELGAS v. AMERICAN AIRLINES, INC.,

Semtek Int'l Inc. v. Lockheed Martin Corp., 382, 657, 784

Serafino v. Hasbro, Inc., 604

SHADY GROVE ORTHOPEDIC ASSOCS. v. ALLSTATE INS. CO., 385

SHAFFER v. HEITNER, 81, 98, 137, 169, 179, 181

Shamrock Oil & Gas. Corp. v. Sheets, 318 Shields v. Barrow, 522

Sibbach v. Wilson & Co., 339, 356

Sieglock v. Burlington N. Santa Fe Ry. Co., 543

#### SIERRA CLUB v. ESPY, 534

Silvestri v. General Motors Corp., 601 Simler v. Conner, 670

Skelly Oil Co. v. Phillips Petroleum Co., 268 Slocum v. New York Life Ins. Co., 707 Smith v. Kansas City Title & Trust Co., 258

Sniadach v. Family Fin. Corp., 188 Snyder v. Harris, 303

Spectator Mgmt. Group v. Brown, 290

St. Paul Mercury Indem. Co. v. Red Cab Co., 27, 286

St. Paul Reins. Co. v. Commercial Fin. Corp., 591

Standard Fire Ins. Co. v. Knowles, 546 State *ex rel.* v. (see opposing party and relator)

State Farm Fire & Cas. Co. v. Tashire, 271, 517

#### State v. (see opposing party)

Steel Co. v. Citizens for a Better Env't, 243 Steinlage v. Mayo Clinic Rochester, 277 Stevens v. Blevins, 220

Stewart Organization v. Ricoh Corp., 235, 364

Strawbridge v. Curtiss, 27, 271, 301, 310 Studiengesellschaft Kohle, m.b.H. v. Shell Oil Co., 590

Stutz v. Minnesota Mining & Mfg. Co., 547 Sun Oil Co. v. Wortman, 182 Supreme Tribe of Ben-Hur v. Cauble, 303 Swaim v. Fogle, 358

SWIERKIEWICZ v. SOREMA N.A., 422

Swift v. Dairyland Ins. Co., 726

Swift v. Tyson, 327-31, 335-36, 403, 409 Swindler & Berlin v. United States, 605 Swint v. Chambers Cnty. Comm'n, 721

Swiss Am. Bank, Ltd., United States v., 199

Tank v. Chronister, 277

Taylor v. Sturgell, 778

Telamerica Media, Inc. v. AMN Television Mktg., 216

TEMPLE v. SYNTHES, LTD., 512, 525

TENNECO OIL CO. v. TEMPLIN, 502

Textile Workers Union of Am. v. Lincoln Mills, 408

THIBEAULT v. BRACKETT, 735

Thomas v. Barton Lodge II, Ltd., 514

Ticor Title Ins. Co. v. Brown, 543

Tobjy v. Tobjy, 203

Tongkook Am., Inc., v. Shipton Sportswear Co., 287

Troxel v. Granville, 293

Tull v. United States, 670, 677, 682

Tutu Wells Contamination Litig., *In re*, 593 Tyler v. Judges of the Court of Registration, 78

U.S.I. Props. Corp. v. M.D. Constr. Co., 281 United Mine Workers v. Gibbs, 296, 313 United States Fidelity & Guar. Co. v. A & S Mfg. Co., 281

United States Fin. Sec. Litig., In re, 683

United States v. (see opposing party)

United Steelworkers of Am. v. R.H. Bouligny, Inc., 280

UNITED-BILT HOMES, INC. v. SAMP-SON, 741

Unitherm Food Sys., Inc. v. Swift, 709 UPJOHN CO. v. UNITED STATES, 604, 605, 620

Van Dusen v. Barrack, 348, 365

Vandenbark v. Owens-Illinois Glass Co.,

Verlinden B.V. v. Central Bank of Nigeria, 284

# W.E. AUBUCHON CO. v. BENEFIRST, LLC, 595

Walker ex rel. Walker v. Norwest Corp., 481

Walker v. Armco Steel Corp., 360

WALKER v. KAZI, 712, 713

Wallis v. Pan Am. Petroleum Corp., 408

Wall-Mart Stores, Inc. v. Dukes, 540

WALLS v. AHMED, 274

Weesner v. Weesner, 204

Will v. Hallock, 720

Williams v. Florida, 682

Williams v. Lakeview Co., 116

Williams v. WMX Techs., 448

Wilton v. Seven Falls Co., 520

Wolde-Meskel v. Vocational Instruction Project Community Servs., Inc., 289

Woods v. Interstate Realty Co., 345, 493 WORLD-WIDE VOLKSWAGEN CORP. v. WOODSON, 110, 111, 116

Wyman v. Newhouse, 83

York v. Texas, 85 Youren v. Tintic Sch. Dist., 590

Z & B ENTERS., INC. v. TASTEE FREEZ INT'L, INC., 527

Zahn v. International Paper Co., 303

Zippo Mfg. Co. v. Zippo Dot Com, Inc., 169

Zubulake v. UBS Warburg, LLC, 594, 601 Zuk v. Eastern Pa. Psychiatric Inst. of the Med. Coll., 482

### **Table of Short Form Citations**

- CHEMERINSKY = ERWIN CHEMERINSKY, FEDERAL JURISDICTION (5th ed. 2007).
- CLARK = CHARLES E. CLARK, HANDBOOK OF THE LAW OF CODE PLEADING (2d ed. 1947).
- [vol.] Dobbs = Dan B. Dobbs, Law of Remedies (2d practitioner's ed. 1993).
- Federal Form = Federal Forms in the Appendix of Forms to the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure.
- KOFFLER & REPPY = JOSEPH H. KOFFLER & ALISON REPPY, HANDBOOK OF COMMON LAW PLEADING (1969).
- Teply & Whitten = Larry L. Teply & Ralph U. Whitten, Civil Procedure (5th ed. 2013).
- [title] U.S.C. = UNITED STATES CODE (with varying dates).
- Wright & Kane = Charles A. Wright & Mary K. Kane, The Law of Federal Courts (7th ed. 2011).
- [vol.] Wright et al. = Charles A. Wright, Arthur R. Miller & Edward H. Cooper, Federal Practice and Procedure (3d ed., vols. 13, 15-16, 18-19, with varying dates).
- [vol.] Wright et al. = Charles A. Wright, Arthur R. Miller, Edward H. Cooper & Joan E. Steinman, Federal Practice and Procedure (3d ed., vol. 14, with varying dates).
- [vol.] Wright et al. = Charles A. Wright, Arthur R. Miller & Mary Kay Kane, Federal Practice and Procedure (3d ed., vols. 6-7C, 10-11A, with varying dates).
- [vol.] Wright et al. = Charles A. Wright, Arthur R. Miller & Richard L. Marcus, Federal Practice and Procedure (3d ed., vols. 8-8A, 12, with varying dates).
- [vol.] Wright & Miller = Charles A. Wright & Arthur R. Miller, Federal Practice and Procedure (3d ed., vols. 4-5B, 9-9A, with varying dates).

### **Preface**

This third edition of *Civil Procedure: Cases, Text, Notes, and Problems* continues the philosophy and fundamental features of the first two editions. We have updated this edition to reflect all current amendments of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure as well as federal statutes, including the "Federal Courts Jurisdiction and Venue Clarification Act of 2011." The new edition also includes the latest decisions of the U.S. Supreme Court on subject-matter and personal jurisdiction, the Erie Doctrine, class actions, pleadings, joinder, and preclusion. The new edition also continues to cover all Federal Civil Procedure bar examination topics.

At the level of introductory Civil Procedure, law school curricula typically provide from three to six credit hours within which to cover the wide range of topics relevant to civil litigation. We have constructed this casebook to accommodate the demands and opportunities presented by "short" and "long" courses alike. It carefully integrates both basic and more complex issues of federal and state civil procedure. This material is presented in a "user friendly" format. Throughout the book, explanatory text has been interwoven with illustrative cases, notes, questions, and figures to make the presentation of the material more efficient for the professor and more understandable for the student. As an additional teaching feature, all of the chapters contain carefully drafted problems following each topic section. The problems are designed to provide maximum teaching flexibility—enabling a professor to utilize the problems in each section to teach all or part of the material.

The casebook is also organized to facilitate a variety of teaching approaches. Chapter 1 provides background and introduction to all topics germane to the civil litigation process. Professors then have the option to commence more in-depth treatment beginning with Jurisdiction and Venue in Chapters 2 through 4 or with Pleadings and Joinder in Chapters 6 and 7.

In all of the chapters, we have selected cases with regard to each topic that will optimize students' understanding of the important issues pertaining to the topic. We have included traditional cases when we believe they are the best vehicles with which to produce a clear understanding of a topic. However, we include a significant number of recent cases when they are better learning tools.

The text, notes, and questions accompanying the cases are designed to help students read the cases effectively and critically. The explanatory text also provides historical material that bears on the evolution of the procedures being studied when necessary for a clear understanding of the topic. The notes and questions accompanying the cases raise other matters related to the issues explored in the cases. The notes and questions also address other issues of real concern in the general procedural area under study, but which may be a step beyond the material directly covered by the case. This array of material thus allows individual professors to select the best way in which to achieve comprehension of the subject of Civil Procedure.

xxx PREFACE

As is true with virtually all Civil Procedure casebooks, the materials primarily focus on federal practice, especially the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure. However, we have also included materials on state practice and highlighted the contrast with federal practice when it is important for a full understanding of particular procedural topics. The traditional mainstays of Civil Procedure—personal and subject-matter jurisdiction, the Erie doctrine, pleadings, and joinder—receive comprehensive treatment. Furthermore, with the ever-increasing emphasis in modern practice on pre-trial litigation, special treatment is afforded discovery, including "e-discovery."

We owe a significant debt to the people who supported and encouraged us in the preparation of this third edition. Particular mention should be made of the support provided by Creighton University School of Law and Seton Hall University School of Law. Professors Teply and Whitten wish to thank Creighton law librarian, Kay Andrus, and the staff of the Klutznick Law Library for their research support. They also wish to thank the efficient and helpful secretarial assistance provided by Pat Andersen and Pam Flint as well as the copying services provided by Colleen Kelly-Firmature.

Professor McLaughlin wishes to thank his research assistant, Nicole M. Magdziak, and Seton Hall reference librarian, Jeanne O'Connor, for their invaluable assistance.

Special thanks are also due to our Civil Procedure students at Creighton and Seton Hall for their helpful comments and suggestions. We also appreciate the excellent assistance of Joellen Craft and Tim Colton of Carolina Academic Press.

Finally, more than thanks is due to our families who have suffered through multiple editions of this casebook. Professor Teply wishes to dedicate this casebook to his grand-children: Anna Louisa Teply, Nicholas Benjamin Teply, Lydia Beatrice Teply, and Clara Elizabeth Teply. Professor McLaughlin also wishes to dedicate this casebook in loving memory of his parents, Marie and William McLaughlin, and with heartfelt thanks to his wife, Barbara, and his children, Kathleen and Kevin.

Larry L. Teply Ralph U. Whitten Denis F. McLaughlin June 2013