

Courtroom Use and Misuse of Mathematics, Physics and Finance

Cases, Lessons and Materials

Ashley Saunders Lipson

PROFESSOR OF LAW

UNIVERSITY OF LAVERNE COLLEGE OF LAW



CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS

Durham, North Carolina

Copyright © 2013
Ashley Saunders Lipson
All Rights Reserved

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Lipson, Ashley S.

[Mathematics, physics and finance for the legal profession]

Courtroom use and misuse of mathematics, physics and finance : cases, lessons and materials / Ashley Saunders Lipson.

pages cm

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-61163-376-4 (alk. paper)

1. Evidence, Expert--United States. 2. Forensic statistics--United States. 3. Forensic accounting--United States. 4. Forensic sciences--United States. 5. Physics--Popular works. 6. Mathematics--Popular works. 7. Lawyers--United States--Handbooks, manuals, etc. I. Title.

KF8961.L57 2013

347.73'6--dc23

2013009773

Carolina Academic Press
700 Kent Street
Durham, North Carolina 27701
Telephone (919) 489-7486
Fax (919) 493-5668
www.cap-press.com

Printed in the United States of America

*Dedicated to:
Rene Descartes, Sir Isaac Newton, Albert Einstein, and Cupcake*

Contents

Preface	xiii
Acknowledgments	xv
Chapter 1 • Introducing Numbers to the Legal Profession	3
§ 1.10 Numbers for the Lay Public	6
§ 1.20 Numbers for the Judiciary	6
§ 1.21 Judicial Notice	6
<i>Alldread v. Mills</i>	8
<i>Hunter v. New York, Ontario & W. Ry. Co.</i>	11
Notes and Problems	16
<i>Schenk v. Lane</i>	17
Notes and Problems	19
<i>Searcy v. Sellers</i>	19
Notes and Problems	26
§ 1.22 Expert Evidence	26
<i>Daubert v. Merrell Dow Pharmaceuticals, Inc.</i>	27
Notes and Problems	35
§ 1.23 Legal Arithmetic	37
<i>Pendley v. Union Bankers Ins. Co.</i>	37
Notes and Problems	38
§ 1.30 Numbers for the Legislature	39
§ 1.31 Statutory Gymnastics	39
<i>Regina v. Ojibway</i>	40
Notes and Problems	41
§ 1.32 Legalized Mathematics	42
Notes and Problems	42
§ 1.40 Numbers for the Practitioner	43
§ 1.41 Contracts and Negotiations	43
§ 1.42 Litigious Numerics	45
§ 1.43 Quantitative Ethics	46
§ 1.50 Numbers for Sale	48
§ 1.60 Numbers for Deception	48
§ 1.70 Numbers for Law Professors	49

Chapter 2 • Math Basics	51
§ 2.10 Impressive Symbolism	51
§ 2.11 The Nouns and Verbs of Mathematics	52
§ 2.12 Special Numbers	54
§ 2.20 Number Foundations	57
§ 2.21 Simple Arithmetic	57
§ 2.22 Ordinality v. Cardinality	59
Notes and Problems	59
§ 2.23 The Metric System	60
§ 2.24 Dimensional Conversions	61
<i>Drake v. Holstead</i>	62
Notes and Problems	65
§ 2.30 The Significance of Equality	66
§ 2.31 The Equalities That Changed the World	66
§ 2.32 Claiming Ownership of Equations	66
<i>Gottschalk v. Benson</i>	67
<i>Diamond v. Diehr</i>	70
Notes and Problems	76
§ 2.40 The Meaning of Inequality	76
Notes and Problems	78
§ 2.50 Determining the Unknown	78
§ 2.60 Analyzing Shapes and Configurations	79
§ 2.61 Keep Your Distance	79
<i>People v. Robbins</i>	80
Notes and Problems	81
§ 2.62 Respecting Boundaries	82
<i>Pennsylvania Electric Company v. Waltman</i>	84
Notes and Problems	89
§ 2.70 The Calculus	90
§ 2.80 Further Exploration	93
Chapter 3 • Logic and Set Theory	95
§ 3.10 Fundamental Logic	95
§ 3.11 Basic Definitions	97
<i>Terry v. Ohio</i>	100
Notes and Problems	110
§ 3.12 Symbolic Logic	111
Notes and Problems	112
§ 3.13 De Morgan's Laws	113
§ 3.14 Truth Tables	114
Notes and Problems	117
<i>State v. Burkhardt</i>	117
Notes and Problems	120
§ 3.20 Set Theory	121
§ 3.21 Basic Definitions	121
§ 3.22 Subsets and Supersets	122
<i>Matter of Fordham</i>	124
Notes and Problems	127
§ 3.23 Unions, Intersections and Compliments	128
§ 3.40 Tying It All Together	129
§ 3.50 Venn Diagrams	130

Chapter 4 • Probability Theory	131
§ 4.10 Basic Rules and Terminology	131
§ 4.11 Basic Definitions	131
§ 4.12 Axioms	132
§ 4.13 Calculating the Odds	134
§ 4.14 Algebraic Rules	135
§ 4.20 Measuring Event Probability	135
§ 4.21 Single Trials	136
Notes and Problems	138
<i>People v. Mountain</i>	141
§ 4.22 Multiple Trials	143
<i>Wilson v. State</i>	145
<i>People v. Collins</i>	153
Notes and Problems	162
Notes and Problems	164
<i>Kammer v. Young</i>	165
Notes and Problems	171
§ 4.30 Probability Expectation	171
§ 4.31 The Zero Sum Game	172
§ 4.32 Calculating Expectations	173
<i>Fennell v. Southern Maryland Hosp. Center, Inc.</i>	174
Notes and Problems	182
§ 4.40 Combinatorics	183
Notes	185
§ 4.50 Forensic Misuse of Probabilistic Theory	186
§ 4.51 Dazzling Numbers for the Jury	186
§ 4.52 The Prosecutor's Transposition Fallacy	188
§ 4.53 The Criminal Defendant's Favorite Fallacy	189
§ 4.54 False Conclusions	190
§ 4.55 False Positives	190
§ 4.56 False Explanations	190
<i>U.S. v. Massey</i>	191
§ 4.57 The 50% Fallacy	196
§ 4.58 The Picker Scam	197
Chapter 5 • Statistics	199
§ 5.10 Descriptive Statistics	200
§ 5.11 Central Tendency	200
Notes and Problems	203
§ 5.12 Dispersion	204
<i>Castaneda v. Partida</i>	208
Notes and Problems	220
<i>Tagatz v. Marquette University</i>	220
Notes and Problems	225
§ 5.20 Inferential Statistics	227
§ 5.21 Correlation	228
§ 5.22 Regression Analysis	232
<i>Ottaviani v. State University of New York at New Paltz</i>	233
§ 5.30 Misuse of Statistical Theory	244
§ 5.31 Correlation v. Causation	245
§ 5.32 Semantic Gymnastics	246

§ 5.33 Biased Sampling	246
<i>In re Estate of Marcos Human Rights Litigation</i>	247
§ 5.34 Extraneous Variables	255
§ 5.35 The Least Integer Principle	255
§ 5.36 Small Sample Scams	256
§ 5.37 Sample Switching	257
§ 5.38 Detached Logic	257
§ 5.39 Mathematical Manipulation	258
Notes and Problems	258
§ 5.40 Challenging Statistical Testimony	259
§ 5.41 Computerized Hijacking	260
Notes and Problems	260
Chapter 6 • Graphs and Diagrams	263
§ 6.10 General Admissibility	263
§ 6.20 Graphs	264
<i>Terra Securities Asa Konkursbo v. Citigroup, Inc.</i>	264
§ 6.21 Selective Deception	272
<i>Pfizer, Inc. v. Merial Ltd.</i>	278
§ 6.22 Slanted Perspectives	282
<i>Haller v. AstraZeneca Pharmaceuticals LP</i>	284
§ 6.23 Tasteless Pies	285
Notes and Problems	288
§ 6.24 Cheaters' Checklist	288
§ 6.30 Diagrams	290
<i>Stenger v. Germanos</i>	290
<i>Libby v. Hill</i>	291
Notes and Problems	292
<i>Ladeburg v. Ray</i>	293
Notes and Problems	295
Chapter 7 • Classical Physics	297
§ 7.10 Newton's Laws of Motion	297
§ 7.11 Measuring Up	299
§ 7.12 The Gravity of the Situation	299
<i>Gavoni v. Dobbs House, Inc.</i>	300
Notes and Problems	302
§ 7.13 Moving Objects	303
<i>Algeo v. Pittsburgh Rys. Co.</i>	307
<i>Winterberg v. Thomas</i>	308
<i>State v. Holzapfel</i>	313
<i>Addison v. Moss</i>	317
§ 7.14 There Shall Be Friction	320
<i>People v. Herman</i>	321
Notes and Problems	326
<i>Hoffman v. Oakley</i>	328
Notes and Problems	332
§ 7.20 Thermodynamics	334
§ 7.21 The First Law: The Conservation of Energy	334
§ 7.22 The Second Law: Entropy	335

<i>A.B. Chapman v. Redwine</i>	336
<i>In re Speas</i>	342
§ 7.23 The Third Law: Absolute Zero	343
§ 7.30 Electromagnetic Energy	343
§ 7.31 Maxwell's Laws	344
<i>Reynard v. NEC Corp.</i>	345
§ 7.32 Ohm's Law	351
§ 7.33 Shocking Information	352
<i>Coughlin v. Great Western Power Co.</i>	352
Notes and Problems	362
§ 7.34 Current Ownership	362
§ 7.35 Radar and Lidar	363
<i>State v. Wojtkowiak</i>	365
§ 7.36 Chaos	374
Chapter 8 • Modern Physics	377
§ 8.10 Einstein	378
§ 8.11 The First Paper: The Birth of Quantum Mechanics	378
§ 8.12 The Second Paper: The Theory of Special Relativity	379
§ 8.13 The Third Paper: Brownian Movement	383
§ 8.14 General Relativity	384
Notes and Problems	385
§ 8.20 Quantum Mechanics	387
Notes and Problems	390
§ 8.30 Going Nuclear	390
<i>Allen v. United States</i>	391
Notes and Problems	437
<i>Johnston v. U.S.</i>	441
Notes and Problems	457
§ 8.40 Tomorrow	458
Chapter 9 • Accounting and Finance	459
§ 9.10 The Cost of Money	460
§ 9.11 Simple Interest	460
§ 9.12 Compound Interest	461
<i>Lunaas v. United States</i>	462
Notes and Problems	465
<i>White v. Sweeney</i>	466
Notes and Problems	467
§ 9.13 Annuities	468
§ 9.14 Present Value of Future Payments	469
§ 9.20 Basic Accounting	470
§ 9.21 The Balance Sheet	470
Notes and Problems	472
§ 9.22 The Income Statement	473
<i>Art Buchwald v. Paramount Pictures Corporation</i>	474
<i>Batfilm Productions, Inc. v. Warner Bros., Inc.</i>	484
Notes and Problems	488
§ 9.30 Tracing	489
<i>In re Marriage of Marsden</i>	490

Notes and Problems	501
§ 9.40 Financial Indicators	501
§ 9.41 Liquidity	501
§ 9.42 Activity	503
§ 9.43 Leverageability	504
§ 9.44 Profitability	505
Notes and Problems	507
§ 9.45 Valuing The Business	508
<i>In re Watt and Shand</i>	511
Notes and Problems	516
§ 9.50 Tax Accounting	518
§ 9.51 The Mathematics of Taxation	519
§ 9.52 The Complexity of Taxation	521
Notes and Problems	521
Notes and Problems	523
§ 9.60 Damages	524
§ 9.61 Employment Related Damages	524
§ 9.62 Punitive Damages	526
§ 9.63 Liquidated Damages	527
§ 9.64 Pain And Suffering	528
§ 9.65 Hedonic Damages	528
Notes and Problems	528
About the Author	529
Index	531

Preface

The subject matter can be deceiving, not with respect to content, which is quite clear from the title, but rather with respect to difficulty and tediousness. Moreover, the book is designed to take an important trio of crucial topics and spoon feed them as comfortably as possible to the people who need them the most but like them the least—law students. Many jokingly state that they became law students because they couldn't handle numbers in college. A rude awakening, however, confronts them in practice, where numbers become the primary focus of what they do.

As the first pedagogical book combining the subjects of Mathematics, Physics, Finance and Law, this treatise is built on the notion that lawyers are ill prepared to face the world dominated by numbers and the multitudes who know how to distort and misrepresent them. Thieves such as Bernie Madoff, who managed to deceive the entire legal staff of the Securities and Exchange Commission for decades, were not merely flukes.

Using a similarly named course (“*Mathematics, Physics and Numbers for Lawyers*”), I experimented with the cases and subjects in order to best determine how to capture and maintain the students' interest, while at the same time building confidence in skills that are otherwise foreign to law school curricula. Nearly every chapter of the book contains some material that lawyers must possess; some of the information is indispensable. Like it or not, we all live in a scientific world, a digital world—one that is ruled by numbers, equations, formulas and statistics.

The chapter headings and subtitles present some of the most complex and baffling subjects that confront today's scientists. Students are urged not to be afraid. The book provides the softest approaches possible.

Cases have been edited, some severely due to size constraints. Where it was to possible to do so seamlessly, I have omitted annoying ellipses, asterisks and “*citations omitted*” messages.

Acknowledgments

Thanks must be directed to Kenneth Settle, Eric Kelly, Deborah Zexter, Dean Emeritus Randall Rubin, Kevin Marshall, Josh Effron and Rea Belk, in addition to my lovely wife Anna and the students at the University of La Verne School of Law for their comments and assistance.

I also want to thank Linda Lacy, Chris Harrow, Tim Colton and the other outstanding employees of Carolina Academic Press for their continued assistance and valuable advice.