

Mastering Statutory Interpretation

SECOND EDITION

Linda D. Jellum

PROFESSOR OF LAW
MERCER UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW



CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS
Durham, North Carolina

Copyright © 2013
Linda D. Jellum
All Rights Reserved

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Jellum, Linda D.

Mastering statutory interpretation / by Linda Jellum. -- Second Edition.
p. cm. -- (Carolina Academic Mastering Series)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN: 978-1-61163-456-3 (alk. paper)

1. Law--United States--Interpretation and construction. I. Title.

KF425.J455 2013

348.73'2--dc22

2013018729

CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS
700 Kent Street
Durham, NC 27701
Telephone (919) 489-7486
Fax (919) 493-5668
www.cap-press.com

Printed in the United States of America

Contents

Table of Cases	xv
Series Editor's Foreword	xxv
Preface	xxvii
Chapter 1 · Introducing Statutory Interpretation	3
Roadmap	3
A. Introduction to This Chapter	3
B. Statutory Interpretation Defined	4
C. Why Law Works Well Most of the Time	5
D. Is an Ambulance a Motor Vehicle?	7
E. No Motor Vehicles in the Park: A Hypothetical	9
1. Hypothetical Problem Materials	9
2. Some Hypothetical Questions	11
3. More Hypothetical Questions	12
F. Separation of Powers & Statutory Interpretation	13
G. A Note about Civil Law Systems	16
H. Constitutional Interpretation Distinguished	17
I. The Uniform Statute & Rule Construction Act	18
Checkpoints	20
Chapter 2 · The Art of Statutory Interpretation: Sources & Theories	21
Roadmap	21
A. Introduction to This Chapter	21
B. The Art of Statutory Interpretation	22
C. The Evidentiary Sources of Meaning	23
1. Intrinsic Sources	23
2. Extrinsic Sources	24
3. Policy-Based Sources	24
D. The Theories of Interpretation	25

1. Textualism	27
a. The Theory	27
b. Textualism in the States	33
2. Intentionalist-Based Theories	33
a. Intentionalism: The Theory	34
b. Intentionalism in the States	37
c. Imaginative Reconstruction: A Version of Intentionalism	38
d. Purposivism: The Theory	38
e. Purposivism in the States	42
f. Dynamic Statutory Interpretation	44
3. Alaska’s Sliding Scale Approach: A Compromise	45
4. Legislative Process Theories	46
E. Does Theory Matter?	49
F. Mastering This Topic	52
Checkpoints	53
Chapter 3 · The Legislative Process	55
Roadmap	55
A. Introduction to This Chapter	55
B. How a Bill Becomes a Law	55
1. Legislatures & Legislators	56
a. A Bicameral Congress	56
b. The Important Role of Committees	61
c. Staffers & Lobbyists	61
2. The Constitutionally Prescribed Process	63
a. Congress’s Role — Bicameral Passage	63
b. The President’s Role — Presentment & Signing	68
C. The Importance of Procedural Rules	73
D. Direct Democracy: The Referendum and Initiative Process	76
E. Mastering This Topic	77
Checkpoints	78
Chapter 4 · Canons Based on Intrinsic Sources: The Words	79
Roadmap	79
A. Introduction to This Chapter	79
B. The Intrinsic Sources	79
C. The Textual Canons: Words & Syntax	80
1. Looking for Ordinary Meaning	80
a. The Plain Meaning Rule	80

b. The Technical Meaning Rule	85
2. Looking Beyond the Ordinary Meaning of Words	87
a. Ambiguity	87
b. Absurdity (The Golden Rule)	89
c. Scrivener's Error	94
d. The Constitutional Avoidance Doctrine	96
D. Mastering This Topic	98
Checkpoints	100
Chapter 5 · Canons Based on Intrinsic Sources:	
Grammar and Punctuation	103
Roadmap	103
A. Introduction to This Chapter	103
B. The General Punctuation & Grammar Rule	103
C. Special Punctuation Rules	105
1. Commas: The General Rule	105
2. Commas: <i>Reddendo Singula Singulis</i> & the Doctrine of Last Antecedent	107
D. Special Grammar Rules	113
1. The Meaning of "And" & "Or"	114
2. Singular & Plural	116
3. Words with Masculine, Feminine, & Neuter Meaning	117
4. Mandatory & Discretionary	118
E. Mastering This Topic	119
Checkpoints	121
Chapter 6 · Canons Based on Intrinsic Sources:	
The Linguistic Canons	123
Roadmap	123
A. Introduction to This Chapter	123
B. The Linguistic Canons: Our Latin Friends	123
C. The Contemporary Linguistic Canons: Explained	127
1. <i>In Pari Materia</i>	127
a. The Whole Act Aspect of <i>In Pari Materia</i>	128
b. The Whole Code Aspect of <i>In Pari Materia</i>	129
2. The Presumption of Consistent Usage and Meaningful Variation	130
3. The Rule against Surplusage (or Redundancy)	132
4. <i>Noscitur a Sociis</i>	133

5. <i>Ejusdem Generis</i>	136
6. I 140	
D. Mastering This Topic	141
Checkpoints	144
Chapter 7 · Canons Based on Intrinsic Sources: The Components	145
Roadmap	145
A. Introduction to This Chapter	145
B. Codification	145
C. The Components and Their Canons	148
1. Heading	148
2. Titles	149
a. Long Titles & Enacting Clauses	150
b. Short Titles	152
c. Section & Code Titles	153
3. Preambles, Purpose Clauses, and Legislative Findings	154
4. The Purview: The Substantive Provisions	157
a. Definitions	158
b. Principal Operating Provisions & Enforcement Provisions	160
c. Severability & Inseverability Provisions	161
d. Effective Date & Saving Provisions	165
e. Sunset Provisions	167
f. Exceptions & Provisos	168
D. Mastering This Topic	169
Checkpoints	170
Chapter 8 · Canons Based on Extrinsic Sources & Legislative Process: Timing	173
Roadmap	173
A. Introduction to This Chapter	173
B. Extrinsic Sources	174
C. Conflicting Statutes	174
1. Specific Statutes Trump General Statutes	175
2. Later Enacted Statutes Trump Earlier Enacted Statutes	179
3. Repeal by Implication Is Disfavored	180
D. Retroactive Statutes	184
E. Statutes from Other Jurisdictions	188
1. Modeled & Borrowed Statutes	188
2. Model and Uniform Acts	189
F. Mastering This Topic	192
Checkpoints	194

Chapter 9 · Canons Based on Extrinsic Sources & Legislative Process: Enactment Context	197
Roadmap	197
A. Introduction to This Chapter	197
B. Using What Occurred Prior to and During Enactment	197
1. Context	197
2. Legislative History	199
a. The Legislative History Hierarchy	199
b. Finding Legislative History	204
c. Using Legislative History	207
d. Criticizing Your Opponent’s Use of Legislative History	210
3. Finding and Using Purpose	222
a. Finding Purpose	223
b. Using Purpose	225
C. Mastering This Topic	230
Checkpoints	231
Chapter 10 · Canons Based on Extrinsic Sources & Legislative Process: Post-Enactment Legislative Context	233
Roadmap	233
A. Introduction to This Chapter	233
B. Using What Occurred Subsequent to Enactment	233
1. Subsequent Judicial Action: Super Strong <i>Stare Decisis</i>	234
2. Subsequent Legislative Action	237
a. “Subsequent Legislative History”	237
b. Testimony by and Affidavits from Legislators and Staff Members	239
c. The Reenactment Canon	240
d. Subsequent Acts	241
e. Legislative Acquiescence	242
C. Mastering This Topic	248
Checkpoints	248
Chapter 11 · Canons Based on Extrinsic Sources & Executive Process: An Introduction to Agencies	251
Roadmap	251
A. Introduction to This Chapter	251
B. Agencies Defined	251
C. Separation of Powers	253

1. Formalism	253
2. Functionalism	256
3. The Delegation Doctrine	261
D. What Agencies Do	265
1. Adjudication	265
2. Rulemaking	268
a. Legislative Rulemaking	268
b. Non-Legislative Rulemaking	269
3. Investigation	271
E. Legislative & Executive Oversight	272
1. Legislative Oversight	272
2. Executive Oversight	273
a. Appointment & Removal	273
b. Signing Statements	274
c. Executive Orders	277
F. Mastering This Topic	281
Checkpoints	281
Chapter 12 · Canons Based on Extrinsic Sources & Executive Process: Deference to Agency Interpretation	283
Roadmap	283
A. Introduction to This Chapter	283
B. The Interpretive Role Agencies Play	284
C. Deference Pre- <i>Chevron</i>	286
D. <i>Chevron</i>	290
E. Deference Post- <i>Chevron</i>	293
1. <i>Chevron</i> Step Zero	293
a. What Did the Agency Interpret?	294
b. Which Agency Interpreted the Statute?	295
c. How Did the Agency Interpret the Statute?	296
d. Can the Agency Interpret the Statute?	302
2. Applying <i>Chevron's</i> Step Zero	306
F. Agency Interpretations that Conflict with Judicial Interpretations	309
G. Mastering This Topic	311
Checkpoints	315
Chapter 13 · Canons Based on Policy-Based Considerations: Constitutional & Prudential	317
Roadmap	317

A. Introduction to This Chapter	317
B. Policy-Based Sources	317
C. Canons Based on the Constitution	318
1. The Constitutional Avoidance Doctrine	321
2. The Rule of Lenity & Penal Statutes	324
3. Ex Post Facto Laws	328
4. Clear Statement Rules	331
a. Federalism	331
b. Preemption	332
c. American Indian Treaty Rights	334
d. Sovereign Immunity	335
D. Canons Based on Prudential Considerations	336
1. Statutes in Derogation of the Common Law	336
2. Remedial Statutes	338
3. Implied Causes of Action & Remedies	339
a. Implied Causes of Action	340
b. Implied Remedies	343
E. Mastering This Topic	345
Checkpoints	347
Conclusion	349
Master Checklist	353
Appendix A · Selected Bibliography	357
Selected Books	357
Selected Articles	358
Appendix B · Glossary	361
Appendix C · Bibliography: Where to Find Federal Legislative History On-Line	369
Appendix D · House Bill 916	375
Appendix E · Companion Senate Bill to H.R. 916	381
Appendix F · Senate Report 110-051	387
Index	393

Table of Cases

- Addison v. HollyHill Fruit Products, Inc., 322 U.S. 607 (1944), 226
- A.L.A. Schechter Poultry Corp. v. United States, 295 U.S. 495 (1935), 262
- Alaska Airlines, Inc. v. Brock, 480 U.S. 678 (1987), 162
- Alexander v. Sandoval, 532 U.S. 275 (2001), 342
- Ali v. Federal Bureau of Prisons, 552 U.S. 214 (2008), 138
- Almendarez-Torres v. United States, 523 U.S. 224 (1998), 322
- Amalgamated Transit Union Local 1309 v. Laidlaw Transit Services, Inc., 435 F.3d 1140 (9th Cir. 2006), 212, 225
- Amalgamated Transit Union Local 1309 v. Laidlaw Transit Services, Inc., 448 F.3d 1092 (9th Cir. 2006), 225
- American Meat Institution v. Barnett, 64 F. Supp. 2d 906 (D. S.D. 1999), 240
- American Mining Congress v. Mine Safety & Health Administration, 995 F.2d 1106 (D.C. Cir. 1993), 298
- American Online, Inc. v. United States, 64 Fed. Cl. 571 (Fed. Cl. 2005), 219
- Anchorage v. Sisters of Providence in Washington, Inc., 628 P.2d 22 (Alaska 1981), 45
- Ass'n of Data Processing Service Organizations Inc. v. Bd. of Governors, 745 F.2d 677 (D.C. Cir. 1984), 286
- Auer v. Robbins, 519 U.S. 452 (1997), **294**, 295, 301, 304, 306
- Babbitt v. Sweet Home Chapter of Communities, 515 U.S. 687 (1995), **126**, 136, 325
- Bailey v. United States, 516 U.S. 137 (1995), 82
- Bank One v. Midwest Bank & Trust Co., 516 U.S. 264 (1996), 158
- Barnhart v. Thomas, 540 U.S. 20 (2003), 111
- Barnhart v. Walton, 535 U.S. 212 (2002), 297, **301**, 302, 306, 307, 313, 314
- Behrens v. Raleigh Hills Hospital, Inc., 675 P.2d 1179 (Utah 1983), 338
- BFP v. Resolution Trust Corp., 511 U.S. 531 (1994), 332
- Biszko v. RIHT Financial Corp., 758 F.2d 769 (1st Cir. 1985), 165
- Blanchard v. Bergeron, 489 U.S. 87 (1989), 212
- Blankfeld v. Richmond Health Care, Inc., 902 So. 2d 296, 305 (Fla. Dist. Ct. App. 2005), 337
- Blitz v. Beth Isaac Adas Israel Congregation, 720 A.2d 912 (Md. 1998), 191

- Bocchino v. Nationwide Mutual Fire Insurance Co., 716 A.2d 883 (Conn. 1998), 244
- Boroughs v. Oliver, 64 So. 2d 338 (Miss. 1953), 336
- Bowles v. Seminole Rock & Sand Co., 325 U.S. 410 (1945), 294
- Bowsher v. Synar, 478 U.S. 714 (1986), 254, **255**, 257, 274
- Brotherhood of Railroad Trainmen v. Baltimore & O. R. Co., 331 U.S. 519 (1947), 154
- Brown v. Arp & Hammond Hardware Co., 141 P.3d 673 (Wyo. 2006), 191
- Brown v. Bd. of Education, 347 U.S. 483 (1954), 234
- Burch v. Secretary of Health & Human Services, No. 99-946V, 2001 WL 180129 (Fed. Cl. Feb. 8, 2001), 335, 339
- Busch v. State, 523 S.E.2d 21 (Ga. 1999), 43
- Bush v. Gore, 531 U.S. 98 (2000), 178
- Calder v. Bull, 3 U.S. (3 Dall.) 386 (1798), 328
- Caminetti v. United States, 242 U.S. 470 (1917), 152
- Cannon v. University of Chicago, 441 U.S. 677 (1979), 341
- Carrisales v. Department of Corrections, 988 P.2d 1083 (1999), 186
- Case of the College of Physicians, 8 Co. Rep. 107a, 77 Eng. Rep. 638 (C.P. 1610), 319
- Case of the Speluncean Explorers (The), 49, 359
- CBOCS West, Inc. v. Humphries, 533 U.S. 442 (2008), 342
- Chemical Waste Management, Inc. v. EPA, 873 F.2d 1477 (D.C. Cir. 1989), 267
- Chevron U.S.A., Inc. v. Natural Resources Defense Council, Inc., 467 U.S. 837 (1984), 210, 267, 285, **290**, 291-310, 312-14
- Chichester v. New Hampshire Fire Insurance Co., 74 Conn. 510 (1902), 244
- Chickasaw Nation v. United States, 534 U.S. 84 (2001), 133
- Chisom v. Roemer, 501 U.S. 380 (1991), 83, 220
- Christian Disposal, Inc. v. Village of Eolia, 895 S.W.2d 632 (Mo. Ct. App. 1995), 119
- Christensen v. Harris County, 529 U.S. 576 (2000), 297
- Church of Scientology v. United States, 612 F.2d 417 (9th Cir. 1979), 226
- Church of the Holy Trinity v. United States, 143 U.S. 457 (1892), **39**, **89**, 90, 91, 93, 151, 200, 210, 214, 224, 225, 227
- Citizens to Preserve Overton Park, Inc. v. Volpe, 401 U.S. 402 (1971), 286
- Citizens United v. FEC, 558 U.S. 310 (2010), 163
- Clearfield Trust Co. v. United States, 318 U.S. 363 (1943), 319
- Cleveland Bd. of Education v. Loudermill, 470 U.S. 532 (1985), 267
- Cleveland v. United States, 329 U.S. 14 (1945), 137

- Clinton v. City of New York, 524 U.S. 417 (1998), 68
- Cobb County v. Robertson, 724 S.E.2d 478 (Ga. App. 2012), 119
- Cockrum v. Fox, 199 S.W.3d 69, 73 (Ark. 2004), 339
- Cohen v. Rubin, 460 A.2d 1046 (Md. Ct. Spec. App. 1983), 338, 339
- Colony, Inc. v. Commissioner, 357 U.S. 28 (1958), 310
- Commodity Futures Trading Commission v. Schor, 478 U.S. 833 (1986), 258, 259
- Commonwealth v. Besch, 674 A.2d 655 (Pa. 1996), 157
- Commonwealth v. Kelly, 58 N.E. 691 (Mass. 1900), 111
- Commonwealth v. Henninger, 25 Pa. 3d 625 (Pa. Ct. Com. Pl. 1981), 117
- Commonwealth v. Gallant, 369 N.E.2d 707 (1977), 147
- Commonwealth v. Plowman, 86 S.W.3d 47 (Ky. 2002), 137, 159
- Commonwealth v. Smith, 728 N.E.2d 272 (Mass. 2000), 130, 146
- Community Nutrition Institute v. Block, 749 F.2d 50 (1984), 129
- Comptroller of Treasury v. Fairchild Industries, Inc., 493 A.2d 341 (Md. 1985), 115
- Conroy v. Anskoff, 507 U.S. 511 (1993), 30
- Consolidated Edison Co. v. NLRB, 305 U.S. 197 (1938), 286, 313
- Consumer Product Safety Commission v. GTE Sylvania, 447 U.S. 102 (1980), 237
- Corkill v. Knowles, 955 P.2d 438 (Wyo. 1998), 339
- Cort v. Ash, 422 U.S. 66 (1975), 340
- DaCosta v. Nixon, 55 F.R.D. 145 (E.D.N.Y. 1972), 275
- Daniel v. United National Bank, 505 S.E.2d 711 (W. Va. 1998), 118
- Des Moines Register & Tribune Co. v. Dwyer, 542 N.W.2d 491 (Iowa 1996), 75
- Dickens v. Puryear, 276 S.E.2d 325 (N.C. 1981), 85, 140
- District of Columbia v. Heller, 554 U.S. 570 (2008), 17
- Dixon v. Florida, 812 So. 2d 595 (Fla. Dist Ct. App. 2002), 80
- Doe v. County of Centre, 242 F.3d 437 (3rd Cir. 2001), 343
- Dominion Energy v. Johnson, 443 F.3d 12 (1st Cir. 2006), 267
- Elliott v. Virginia, 593 S.E.2d 263 (Va. 2004), 164
- Escondido Mutual Water Co. v. LaJolla Indians, 466 U.S. 765 (1984), 118
- Faragher v. Boca Raton, 524 U.S. 775 (1998), 234
- Farrior v. Sodexho, U.S.A., 953 F. Supp. 1301 (N.D. Ala. 1997), 164
- Federal Baseball Club v. National League, 259 U.S. 200 (1922), 236, 243
- Feld v. Roberts & Charles Beauty Salon, 459 N.W.2d 279 (Mich. 1990), 132
- Fink v. City of Detroit, 333 N.W.2d 376 (Mich. Ct. App. 1983), 119
- Flood v. Kuhn, 407 U.S. 258 (1972), 235, 243

- Florida Department of Highway Safety & Motor Vehicles v. Hernandez, 74 So. 3d 1070 (Fla. 2011), 28, 127
- Florida Department of Revenue v. Piccadilly Cafeterias, Inc., 554 U.S. 33 (2008), 88
- FDA v. Brown & Williamson Tobacco Corp., 529 U.S. 120 (2000), 241, 245, 248, **302-307**
- Fourco Glass Co. v. Transmirra Products Corp., 353 U.S. 222 (1957), 240
- Fowler v. State, 70 P.3d 1106 (Alaska 2003), 166
- Franklin v. Gwinnett County Public Schools, 503 U.S. 60 (1992), 241, 343
- Franklin v. Massachusetts, 505 U.S. 788 (1992), 252
- Gay & Lesbian Law Students Ass'n v. Bd. of Trustees, 673 A.2d 484 (Conn. 1996), 169
- G.C. Timmis & Co. v. Guardian Alarm Co., 662 N.W.2d 710 (Mich. 2003), 135
- Gonzales v. Oregon, 546 U.S. 243 (2006), 295, 303, **304-307**
- Gray v. Powell, 314 U.S. 402 (1941), 286
- Green v. Bock Laundry Machine Co., 490 U.S. 504 (1989), 91, 94, 97
- Guisseppi v. Walling, 144 F.2d 608 (2d Cir. 1944), 38
- Hagen v. Utah, 510 U.S. 399 (1993), 334
- Hamdan v. Rumsfeld, 548 U.S. 557 (2006), 203, 212, 275, 303, **305-307**
- Hamdi v. Rumsfeld, 542 U.S. 507 (2004), 305
- Harrisburg v. Franklin, 806 F. Supp. 1181 (M.D. Pa. 1992), 202
- Harrison v. PPG Industries, Inc., 446 U.S. 578 (1980), 219
- Heydon's Case, 76 Eng. Rep. 637 (Ex. 1584), 223
- Holiday Inns, Inc. v. Olsen, 692 S.W.2d 850 (Tenn. 1985), 190
- Homebuilders Ass'n v. Scottsdale, 925 P.2d 1359 (Ariz. Ct. App. 1996), 116
- Hurtado v. California, 110 U.S. 516, 531 (1884), 319
- INS v. Cardoza-Fonseca, 480 U.S. 421 (1987), 30
- INS v. Chadha, 462 U.S. 919 (1983), 60, 253, 255
- In re Adamo, 619 F.2d 216 (2d Cir. 1980), 96
- In re Compensation of Williams, 635 P.2d 384 (Or. Ct. App. 1981), 118
- In re Forfeiture of 1962 Ford Bronco, 673 P.2d 1310 (N.M. 1983), 109
- In re Idalski, 123 B.R. 222 (Bankr. E.D. Mich. 1991), 208
- In re Littlefield, 851 P.2d 42 (Cal. 1993), 77
- In re Macke International Trade, Inc., 370 B.R. 236 (9th Cir. 2007), 107
- In the Matter of Sinclair, 870 F.2d 1340 (7th Cir. 1989), 200, 208
- In re Virtual Network Service Corp., 98 B.R. 343 (Bankr. N.D. Ill. 1989), 202
- Jama v. Immigration & Customs Enforcement, 543 U.S. 335 (2005), 113
- Jackson v. Birmingham Bd. of Educ., 544 U.S. 167 (2005), 341

- Jensen v. Elgin, Joliet & Eastern Railway Co., 182 N.E.2d 211 (Ill. 1962), 131
Jersey City v. State Bd. of Tax Appeals, 43 A.2d 799 (N.J. Sup. Ct. 1945), 119
J.I. Case Co. v. Borak, 377 U.S. 426 (1964), 340
Johnson v. Edgar, 680 N.E.2d 1372 (Ill. 1997), 73
J.W. Hampton, Jr., & Co. v. United States, 276 U.S. 394 (1928), 261
Kentucky Off-Track Betting, Inc. v. McBurney, 993 S.W.2d 946 (Ky. 1999),
228
Keeler v. Superior Court, 470 P.2d 617 (Cal. 1970), 327
Keystone Ins. Co. v. Houghton, 863 F.2d 1125, 1128 (3d Cir. 1988), 328
Koons Buick Pontiac GMC, Inc. v. Nigh, 543 U.S. 50 (2004), 210-11
Koshkonong v. Burton, 104 U.S. 668 (1881), 254
Kruse v. Wells Fargo Home Mortgage, Inc., 383 F.3d 49 (2d Cir. 2004), 302
Krzalic v. Republic Title Co., 314 F.3d 875 (7th Cir. 2002), 302
Landgraff v. USI Film Products, 511 U.S. 244 (1994), 184
Lawrence v. Texas, 539 U.S. 558 (2003), 181
Lessee v. Irving, 3 U.S. (3 Dall.) 425 (1799), 329
LeFever v. State, 877 P.2d 1298 (Alaska Ct. App. 1994), 45
Lorrillard v. Pons, 434 U.S. 575 (1978), 188
Lynch v. Washington, 145 P.2d 265 (Wash. 1944), 77
Maddox v. Florida, 862 So. 2d 783 (Fla. Dist. Ct. App. 2003), 81
Maddox v. State, 923 So. 2d 442 (2006), 81
Marbury v. Madison, 5 U.S. (1 Cranch) 137 (1803), 13, 319
Mathews v. Eldridge, 424 U.S. 319 (1976), 267
Mayer v. Spanel International Ltd., 51 F.3d 670 (7th Cir. 1995), 133
Mayor of Lansing v. Michigan Public Service Commission, 680 N.W.2d 840
(Mich. 2004), 88
McBoyle v. United States, 283 U.S. 25 (1931), 7
McClung v. Employment Development Department, 99 P.3d 1015 (Cal. 2004),
186
MCI Telecommunications Corp. v. American Telephone & Telegraph Co., 512
U.S. 218 (1994), 83
McKinney v. Robbins, 892 S.W.2d 502 (Ark. 1995), 137
McNally v. United States, 483 U.S. 350 (1987), 14, 324
Medellín v. Texas, 552 U.S. 491 (2008), 258
Michigan Ave. National Bank v. County of Cook, 191 Ill. 2d 493 (2000), 154
Michigan v. Schaeffer, 703 N.W.2d 774 (Mich. 2005), 330
Mississippi Poultry Ass'n, Inc. v. Madigan, 992 F.2d 1359 (5th Cir. 1993), 84,
221
Mistretta v. United States, 488 U.S. 361 (1989), 260

- Modern Muzzleloading, Inc. v. Magaw, 18 F. Supp. 2d 29 (D.C. 1998), 326
- Mohasco Corp. v. Silver, 447 U.S. 807 (1980), 127, 198
- Montana Wilderness Ass'n v. U.S. Forest Service, 655 F.2d 951 (9th Cir.), 238
- Monterio v. American Home Assurance Co., 177 Conn. 281 (1979), 244
- Morrison v. Olson, 487 U.S. 654 (1988), 273
- Morton v. Mancari, 417 U.S. 535 (1974), 181, 183
- Moskal v. United States, 498 U.S. 103 (1990), 326
- Murray v. The Charming Betsy, 6 U.S. (2 Cranch) 64 (1804), 321
- Myers v. United States, 272 U.S. 52 (1926), 257, 274
- National Cable & Telecommunications Ass'n v. Brand X Internet Services, 545 U.S. 967 (2005), 309
- National Petroleum Refiners Ass'n v. FTC, 482 F.2d 672 (D.C. Cir. 1973), 141
- National Railroad Passenger Corp., v. Boston & Maine Corp., 503 U.S. 407 (1992), 83
- NationsBank of North Carolina v. Variable Annuity Life Insurance Co., 513 U.S. 251 (1995), 297
- Nix v. Hedden, 149 U.S. 304 (1893), 86
- Nixon v. Administrator of General Services, 433 U.S. 425 (1977), 261
- Nixon v. Fitzgerald, 457 U.S. 731 (1982), 260
- NLRB v. Catholic Bishop, 440 U.S. 490 (1979), 201, 323
- NLRB v. Hearst Publications, Inc., 322 U.S. 111 (1944), 286, 288
- Northern Pipeline Construction Co. v. Marathon Pipe Line Co., 458 U.S. 50 (1982), 259
- Ober United Travel Agency, Inc. v. U.S. Department of Labor, 135 F.3d 822 (D.C. Cir. 1998), 339
- Office Planning Group, Inc. v. Baraga-Houghton-Keweenaw Child Development Bd., 697 N.W.2d 871 (Mich. 2005), 227
- O'Hara v. Luchenbach Steamship Co., 269 U.S. 364 (1926), 86
- Ohio Division of Wildlife v. Clifton, 692 N.E.2d 253 (Ohio Mun. Ct. 1997), 94
- O'Kelly v. Perdue, 75No. 2004CV 93434, 2006 WL 1350171 (Ga. Super. Ct. May 16, 2006), 75
- O'Leary v. Brown-Pacific-Maxon, Inc., 340 U.S. 504 (1951), 287
- Orloff v. Los Angeles Turf Club, Inc., 180 P.2d 321 (Cal. 1947), 344
- O'Sullivan v. Rhode Island Hosp., 874 A.2d 179, 183 (R.I. 2005), 339
- Overseas Education Ass'n, Inc., v. Federal Labor Relations Authority, 876 F.2d 960 (D.C. Cir. 1989), 202
- Palm Beach County Canvassing Bd. v. Harris, 772 So. 2d 1220 (Fla. 2000)176, 318

- Panama Refining Co. v. Ryan, 293 U.S. 388 (1935), 262
- Pandazides v. Virginia Bd. of Education, 13 F.3d 823 (4th Cir. 1994), 344
- Patrie v. Area Coop. Educ. Service, 37 Conn. L. Rptr. 470 (Conn. Super. Ct. 2004), 84
- Pennsylvanians Against Gambling Expansion Fund, Inc. v. Commonwealth, 877 A.2d 383 (Pa. 2005), 74
- Perdue v. O’Kelly, 632 S.E.2d 110 (Ga. 2006), 75
- People v. Avery, 38 P.3d 1 (Cal. 2002), 324
- People v. Ditta, 422 N.E.2d 515 (N.Y. 1981), 327
- People v. Fields, 105 Cal. App. 3d 341 (1980), 138
- People v. Leroy, 828 N.E.2d 786 (Ill. App. Ct. 2005), 329
- People v. Superior Court, 926 P.2d 1042 (Cal. 1996), 327
- People v. Vasquez, 631 N.W.2d 711 (Mich. 2001), 134
- Peterson v. Midwest Security Insurance Co., 636 N.W.2d 727 (Wis. 2001), 106
- Pileri Industries, Inc. v. Consolidated Industries, Inc., 740 So. 2d 1108 (Ala. Civ. App. 1999), 190
- Plaut v. Spendthrift Farm, Inc., 514 U.S. 211 (1995), 256
- Plessy v. Ferguson, 163 U.S. 537 (1896), 234
- Powell v. McCormack, 395 U.S. 486 (1969), 59
- PRB Enterprises, Inc. v. South Brunswick Planning Bd., 518 A.2d 1099 (N.J. 1987), 156
- Public Citizen v. U.S. Department of Justice, 491 U.S. 440 (1989), 90
- RadLAX Gateway Hotel, LLC v. Amalgamated Bank, 132 S. Ct. 2065 (2012), 175
- Rapanos v. United States, 547 U.S. 715 (2006), 332
- Rapaport v. U.S. Dep’t of the Treasury, 59 F.3d 212 (D.C. Cir. 1995), 295
- Regina v. Ojibway, 8 Crim. L.Q. (Can.) 137 (Sup. Ct. 1965), 159
- Reno v. Koray, 515 U.S. 50 (1995), 296, 326
- Rhyne v. K-Mart Corp., 594 S.E.2d 1 (N.C. 1994), 129
- Riegel v. Medtronic, Inc., 552 U.S. 312 (2008), 333
- Robbins v. Chronister, 402 F.3d 1047 (10th Cir. 2005), 91
- Robinson v. City of Lansing, 782 N.W.2d 171 (2010), 113, 131
- Romer v. Evans, 517 U.S. 620 (1996), 77
- Seminole Tribe v. Florida, 517 U.S. 44 (1996), 319
- Schuetz v. Banc One Mortgage Corp., 292 F.3d 1004 (9th Cir. 2002), 302
- Shaw v. Merchants’ National Bank, 101 U.S. (11 Otto) 557 (1879), 337
- Shine v. Shine, 802 F.2d 583 (1986), 95
- Skidmore v. Swift & Co., 323 U.S. 134 (1944), **288**-93, 294-302, 304-08, 311, 314

- Smith v. Brown, 35 F.3d 1516, 1525 (Fed. Cir. 1994), 338
Smith v. Doe, 538 U.S. 84 (2003), 329
Smith v. United States, 508 U.S. 223 (1993), 32, 81
Snapp v. Unlimited Concepts, Inc., 208 F.3d 928 (11th Cir. 2000), 345
Solem v. Bartlett, 465 U.S. 463 (1984), 334
South Dakota Education Ass'n v. Barnett, 582 N.W.2d 386 (S.D. 1998), 239
State Ethics Commission v. Evans, 855 A.2d 364 (Md. 2004), 185
State ex rel. Helman v. Gallegos, 871 P.2d 1352 (N.M. 1994), 29
State ex rel. Kalal v. Circuit Court, 681 N.W.2d 110 (Wis. 2004), 87
State v. Brown, 551 S.E.2d 773 (Ga. Ct. App. 2001), 44
State v. Bussey, 463 So. 2d 1141 (Fla. 1985), 154
State v. Courchesne, 816 A.2d 562 (Conn. 2003), 26
State v. Guzek, 906 P.2d 272 (Or. 1995), 77
State v. Grunke, 752 N.W.2d 769 (Wis. 2008), 28
State v. Muller, 829 S.W.2d 805 (Tex. Ct. Crim. App. 1992), 43
State v. One 1970 Chevrolet Pickup, 857 P.2d 44 (N.M. Ct. App. 1993), 109
State v. Peters, 263 Wis.2d 475 (2003), 123
State v. Phillips, 560 S.E.2d 852 (N.C. Ct. App. 2002), 148
State v. Van Woerden, 967 P.2d 14 (Wash. Ct. App. 1998), 136
St. Clair v. Commonwealth, 140 S.W.3d 510 (Ky. 2004), 86
Stebbens v. Wells, No. Civ.A. NC95-0324, 2001 WL 1255079 (R.I. Super. Ct. Oct. 12, 2001), 136
Stephan v. United States, 319 U.S. 423 (1943), 147
Stern v. Marshall, 131 S. Ct. 2594 (2011), 256
Stiens v. Fire & Police Pension Ass'n, 684 P.2d 180, 184 (Colo. 1984), 165
Stryker Corp. v. Director, Division of Taxation, 773 A.2d 674 (N.J. 2001), 136
Sullivan v. Finkelstein, 496 U.S. 617 (1990), 238
Sullivan v. Little Hunting Park, Inc., 396 U.S. 229 (1969), 343
Sutton v. United Air Lines, Inc., 527 U.S. 471 (1999), 156
Taylor v. Inhabitants of Town of Caribou, 67 A. 2 (Me. 1907), 103
Tennessee Valley Authority v. Hill, 437 U.S. 153 (1978), 182, 198, 272
Toolson v. New York Yankees, Inc., 346 U.S. 356 (1953), 236, 243
Touche Ross & Co. v. Remington, 442 U.S. 560 (1979), 342
United States v. American Trucking Ass'ns, Inc., 310 U.S. 534 (1940), 93
United States v. Bass, 404 U.S. 336 (1971), 109, 324
United States v. Bd. of Commissioners, 435 U.S. 110 (1978), 241
United States v. Brady, 26 F.3d 282 (2d Cir. 1994), 329
United States v. Coatoam, 245 F.3d 553 (6th Cir. 2001), 94
United States v. Falvey, 676 F.2d 871 (1st Cir. 1982), 198

- United States v. Florida East Coast Railway, Co., 410 U.S. 224 (1973), 269
- United States v. Granderson, 511 U.S. 39 (1994), 95
- United States v. Gonzalez, 407 F.3d 118, 125 (2d Cir. 2005), 324, 326
- United States v. Home Concrete & Supply, 132 S. Ct. 1836 (2012), 310
- United States v. Klein, 80 U.S. (13 Wall.) 128 (1871), 256
- United States v. Locke, 471 U.S. 84 (1985), 95
- United States v. Marshall, 908 F.2d 1312, 1335 (7th Cir. 1990), 322
- United States v. Mead Corp., 533 U.S. 218 (2001), 297, **299-302**, 306-08
- United States v. Pabon-Cruz, 391 F.3d 86 (2d Cir. 2004), 202
- United States v. Palmer, 3 Wheat. 610 (1818), 105
- United States v. Ron Pair Enterprises, Inc., 489 U.S. 235 (1989), 105
- United States v. Salim, 287 F. Supp. 2d 250 (S.D.N.Y. 2003), 200
- United States v. Scheer, 729 F.2d 164 (2nd Cir. 1984), 94
- United States v Stevens, 559 U.S. 460 (2010), 275
- United States v. Universal C.I.T. Corp., 344 U.S. 218 (1952), 325
- United States v. Vowell, 9 U.S. (5 Cranch) 368, 371 (1810), 285
- United Steelworkers v. Weber, 443 U.S. 193 (1979), 36, 51, 201, 203, **213-214**,
217-18
- U.S. National Bank of Oregon v. Independent Insurance Agents of America,
Inc., 508 U.S. 439 (1993), 94, 104, 147
- U.S. Term Limits, Inc. v. Thornton, 514 U.S. 779 (1995), 59
- Van Horn v. William Blanchard Co., 438 A.2d 552 (N.J. 1981), 116, 189
- Vermont Yankee Nuclear Power Corp. v. Natural Resource Defense Council, Inc.,
435 U.S. 519 (1978), 269
- Vincent v. Mutual Reserve Fund Life Ass'n, 74 Conn. 684 (1902), 244
- Wagner Seed Co. v. Bush, 946 F.2d 918 (D.C. Cir. 1991), 295
- Warren v. Mayor & Aldermen of Charlestown, 68 Mass. (2 Gray) 84 (1854),
162
- Watson v. United States, 552 U.S. 74 (2007), 82
- Whitman v. American Trucking Ass'n, 531 U.S. 457 (2001), 264
- Whittner v. State, 492 S.E.2d 777 (S.C. 1977), 327
- Williams v. Kentucky, 829 S.W.2d 942 (Ky. Ct. App. 1992), 176, 179
- Wisconsin Public Intervenor v. Mortier, 501 U.S. 597 (1991), 211
- Wyeth v. Levine, 555 U.S. 555 (2009), 333
- Youngstown Sheet & Tube Co. v. Sawyer, 343 U.S. 579 (1952), **255**, 258, 278
- Zerbe v. State, 583 P.2d 845 (Alaska 1978), 188

Series Editor's Foreword

The Carolina Academic Press Mastering Series is designed to provide you with a tool that will enable you to easily and efficiently “master” the substance and content of law school courses. Throughout the series, the focus is on quality writing that makes legal concepts understandable. As a result, the series is designed to be easy to read and is not unduly cluttered with footnotes or cites to secondary sources.

In order to facilitate student mastery of topics, the Mastering Series includes a number of pedagogical features designed to improve learning and retention. At the beginning of each chapter, you will find a “Roadmap” that tells you about the chapter and provides you with a sense of the material that you will cover. A “Checkpoint” at the end of each chapter encourages you to stop and review the key concepts, reiterating what you have learned. Throughout the book, key terms are explained and emphasized. Finally, a “Master Checklist” at the end of each book reinforces what you have learned and helps you identify any areas that need review or further study.

We hope that you will enjoy studying with, and learning from, the Mastering Series.

-Russell L. Weaver

Professor of Law & Distinguished University Scholar
University of Louisville, Louis D. Brandeis School of Law

Preface

Preface to the Second Edition

This edition is dedicated to all of my students during the last few years, but especially to the students in the Connecticut University Law School's 2012 externship program in Washington, D.C. With their help and Professor Bernard Bell's willingness to share a problem he crafted, I have added a section to each chapter called Mastering This Topic, which is based on a running hypothetical involving an ordinance prohibiting vehicles in the park. I believe the new section will greatly aid your mastery of the subject.

I would also like to thank my research assistants, Ashley Turner and Dianna Lee, for all their invaluable help and great senses of humor.

Finally, I could not have made it through this very difficult year without the help of a few very special people: Professor Dorothy Brown, Professor Nancy Levit, Terry Smith, Esq., Mary Cullen, Yuichi Miyoshi, and my husband, children, and family members. Chris, camp is finally over!

Linda D. Jellum
Bethesda, Maryland
April 2013

Preface to the First Edition

This book is dedicated to my husband and children, who have not seen as much of me this year as they would have preferred, and to my parents, who have been there to guide and advise me for so many years.

I would like to thank the following for their insightful comments and helpful suggestions, endless review of draft chapters, and other assistance: Professor Michael Dimino, Professor Brian Slocum, Professor Steven Johnson, Professor David Ritchie, Professor Spencer Clough, Denise Gibson, Barbara Churchwell, Susan Wilson, Jamanda Turner, Chris Featherstun, Java Joe's in Hilton Head, and Mercer Law School (for research support). Each individual

has made this text better with his or her involvement. Any remaining errors are mine alone.

Special thanks are due to my colleague and former co-author, Professor David Hricik. This project would have been infinitely more difficult without the foundation I gained from our earlier project. I also would like to thank Professor Russell Weaver for asking me to be involved in the Mastering Series and for supporting me in so many ways over the years.

Linda D. Jellum
Macon, Georgia
April 2008