Transforming the Education of Lawyers: The Theory and Practice of Clinical Pedagogy

Susan Bryant  
Professor of Law  
City University of New York School of Law

Elliott S. Milstein  
Professor of Law  
American University Washington College of Law

Ann C. Shalleck  
Professor of Law and Carrington Shields Scholar  
American University Washington College of Law

Carolina Academic Press  
Durham, North Carolina
Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Transforming the education of lawyers : the theory and practice of clinical pedagogy / Susan Bryant, Elliott S. Milstein, Ann C. Shalleck. pages cm
KF282.T73 2014
340.071'173--dc23
2014006224

Carolina Academic Press
700 Kent Street
Durham, North Carolina 27701
Telephone (919) 489-7486
Fax (919) 493-5668
www.cap-press.com

Printed in the United States of America
Contents

Preface xv
Dedication and Acknowledgments xix
Contributors xxi

Chapter One · The Whole Is Greater Than the Sum of Its Parts: Clinical Methodologies and Perspectives
Susan Bryant, Elliott Milstein, and Ann Shalleck 3
Four Methodologies and Three Perspectives: A Brief Introduction 4
The Book: Chapter-by-Chapter 6
A. Chapter Two: The Goals of Clinical Education 6
B. Chapters Three, Four, and Five: The Seminar Chapters 6
C. Chapters Six, Seven, and Eight: The Rounds Chapters 7
D. Chapters Nine, Ten, and Eleven: The Supervision Chapters 8
E. Chapters Twelve and Thirteen: The Fieldwork Chapters 10
F. Chapters Fourteen, Fifteen, and Sixteen: Lawyering & Pedagogical Perspectives 11
G. How to Use This Book 11

Chapter Two · Learning Goals for Clinical Programs
Susan Bryant, Elliott Milstein, and Ann Shalleck 13
Introduction 13
The Importance of Goals 13
A. Goal One: Develop a Professional Identity and Practice with Purpose 14
   (1) Integrate Personal and Professional Identities 15
   (2) Connect With and Serve Clients while Respecting Dual Loyalty to the Profession 16
   (3) Exercise Responsibility, Responsibly 16
   (4) Develop a Personal Commitment to Achieving Justice and Providing Access 16
B. Goal Two: Increase Understanding of How Law, the Legal System, and Other Institutions Function in the Lives of People, Particularly the Most Marginalized 17
   (1) Learn Law as an Interpretive Project 17
   (2) Understand the Importance and Malleability of Facts 18
   (3) Develop and Use Critical Insights about How Law Functions 18
   (4) See Clients and Problems in Context 18
C. Goal Three: Improve Capacities to Manage Uncertainty, Exercise Judgment, and Take Action 19
   (1) Law and Facts 19
   (2) Problem Solving 19
D. Goal Four: Develop New Modes of Thinking Like a Lawyer
   (1) Role-Based Legal Analysis
   (2) Narrative Reasoning
   (3) Ends-Means Thinking
   (4) Using and Building Theory through Contextual Thinking
   (5) Critical Thinking
   (6) Creative Thinking
E. Goal Five: Build Lifelong Commitment and Skills to Learn in Professional Settings
   (1) Learn through Reflection
   (2) Use Models Critically
   (3) Engage Peers for Collaborative Learning
   (4) Metacognition: Learning About Learning
F. Goal Six: Develop Skills Associated with the Human Dimensions of Practice
   (1) Understanding the Perspective of Another
   (2) Interpersonal Interactions
   (3) Self-Knowledge and Self-Regulation
G. Goal Seven: Build Lawyering Skills
   (1) Identify and Name Skills
   (2) Integrate Cognitive, Normative, Behavioral, and Affective Dimensions of Learning
   (3) Learn Skills as Part of a Lawyering Process to Promote Transfer
   (4) Select Skills to Focus Learning
Conclusion
CONTENTS

(6) Law 53
(7) Beyond the Lawyering Process—Additional Topics for the Clinical Seminar 54

Chapter Four · Planning and Teaching the Seminar Class 57
Susan Bryant and Elliott Milstein

Introduction 57
Setting Concrete and Precise Goals 58
Planning and Teaching the Class: Focus on the Beginning and End of Class 61
Planning and Teaching the Class: The Middle Segment 62
A. Homework Assignments and In-Class Activities to Meet Learning Goals 63
B. Planning and Engaging in Classroom Conversations 66
   (1) Conversations of the Whole 67
   (2) Small Group Conversations 69
   (3) Classroom Conversation Challenges 71
Selecting Learning Activities in the Classroom 73
A. Quick-Writes 74
B. Critical Incidents 74
C. Exercises and Role Play 75
D. Simulation 77
Conclusion 80

Chapter Five · Seminar Essays 81
Judgment-Based Lawyering: Structuring Seminar Time in a Non-Litigation Clinic 81
Mark Neal Aaronson
Using the Classroom to Teach Time Keeping, Client Billing, and Ethics 91
Bryan Adamson
One Community Economic Development Clinic’s Seminar and the Challenges in Connecting the Work of the Clinic to the Work of the Client 99
Alicia Alvarez
Reflections on Using Narrative Theory and Storytelling Practice in the Clinic Seminar 107
Carolyn Grose

Chapter Six · Rounds: Constructing Learning From the Experience of Peers 113
Susan Bryant and Elliott Milstein

Introduction 113
Goals and Learning Theory Supporting Rounds 114
A. “Just-In-Time” vs. “Just-In-Case” Learning 117
B. Collaborative Learning 118
C. Reflection 119
Professional Reasoning and Ethical Decision Making 121
A. Moving from the Particular to the General 121
B. Contextualized Thinking 124
C. Parallel Universe Thinking 126
D. Connecting Skills to Role and Values 127
Conclusion

Chapter Seven · Generating Conversations: Planning and Facilitating Rounds
Susan Bryant and Elliott Milstein

Introduction

Five Stages of a Rounds Conversation
A. Stage One: Description of Event(s)
B. Stage Two: Problem Identification or Clarification
C. Stage Three: Goals
D. Stage Four: Lawyering Strategies
E. Stage Five: Lawyering Lessons

Preparation for Rounds
A. Ground Rules
B. Topic Choices
C. Structure
   1. Case Planning
   2. Reflections on Performance
   3. Case/Matter Presentations
   4. Applying Seminar Theory to the Cases
D. Preparation for the Conversation

Faculty Role and Teaching Strategies
A. Choosing Faculty Roles
   1. Facilitator
   2. Coach
   3. Expert
   4. Co-Participant/Collaborator
   5. Observer
   6. Role Not to Play — Supervisor
B. Teacher Interventions: Starting and Keeping the Conversation Going
   1. Questions
   2. Mirroring and Rephrasing
   3. Process Observations
   4. Brainstorming
   5. Role-Playing
   6. Naming, Labeling, and Categorizing
   7. Mini-Lectures
C. Addressing Impediments to Successful Rounds

Conclusion
A. Overview 172
B. Thinking Along Two Arcs 174
C. Using Three Frames: The Matter, the Macro, and the Meeting 175
   (1) The Matter 175
      a. The Arc of Client Representation in Supervision of the Matter 176
         (i) Lawyering Activities: Ways of Thinking and Lawyering Skills 176
         (ii) Lawyering as a Process 177
         (iii) The Client’s Experience and Understanding 179
         (iv) Race, Gender, Culture, and Inequality 179
      b. The Arc of Student Learning in Supervision of the Matter 180
         (i) Expanding Learning: From Lawyering Tasks to Ways of Thinking 180
            (a) Uniting Theoretical and Practical Understanding 181
            (b) Promoting Integrative Learning 181
            (c) Understanding in Context 182
         (ii) Expanding Learning: From Lawyering to Professional Identity 182
         (iii) Deepening Learning: Relationships with Clients 183
         (iv) Deepening Learning: Engaging Motivations and Aspirations 184
         (v) Learning Beyond the Formal Curriculum: Lawyering Activities Necessary for Client Representation 185
      c. Aligning the Arcs in Supervision of the Matter 186
   (2) The Overall Experience — The Macro 187
      a. Seeing Patterns while Appreciating Context 187
      b. Exploring Fundamental Values and Ways of Thinking: Relationships with Clients 188
      c. Forming Professional Identity as Process 189
      d. Using Critical Perspectives 190
      e. Developing Student Learning 191
      f. Furthering Transfer 192
   (3) The Meeting 192
      a. Promoting Lawyering and Learning: Immediate Tasks 193
      b. Incorporating Insights from the Frame of the Matter into the Meeting 194
      c. Incorporating Insights from the Macro Frame into the Meeting 195
      d. Realizing Multiple Objectives 195
         (i) Creating Segments in the Meeting 196
            (a) A Segment on Learning 196
            (b) A Segment on the Client 196
            (c) A Segment on Race, Gender, Culture, and Inequality 197
         (ii) Setting the Agenda 197
Gathering Possibilities and Deciding What to Teach: Guideposts 197
A. Insights from Arcs and Frames 197
B. Guideposts 198
   (1) Assess Student Capacity for Client Representation and Learning 198
   (2) Identify Goals for Each Student 200
   (3) Attend to Time 200
C. Using the Guideposts 201
Chart Summarizing Arcs and Frames

Chapter Ten · The Practice of Supervision

Jane H. Aiken and Ann Shalleck

Introduction 205
The Meaning of Effective Supervision 206
Steps in Planning the Learning Experience 207
A. Step One: Identifying Over-Arching Goals Using the Frames of the Matter and the Macro 208
B. Step Two: Setting Goals for Development in a Case or Project 209
C. Step Three: Planning Supervisory Interventions 210
D. Step Four: Determining Success and Ensuring that Learning Transfers 213
Supervision as Problem Solving 213
A. Orienting to Context 213
B. Slow It Down 214
C. Appreciate the Process 214
D. Engage the Alternate Universe 214
E. Take Time to Reflect 216
F. An Example 216
Mantras and Norms 220
Conclusion 221

Chapter Eleven · Supervision Essays

Reflection on Supervision in Feedback Interactions: Reinforcement of Some Fundamental Themes
Beryl Blaustone 223
Combating Decision Fatigue in Supervision
Kristin Henning 233
Supervision Stories: Identifying and Engaging Professional Identity Issues
Donna Lee 242

Chapter Twelve · Fieldwork: The Experience That Sparks the Learning

Susan Bryant and Conrad Johnson

Introduction 251
Learning Goals and Opportunities 252
A. Goal One: Develop a Professional Identity and Practice with Purpose 256
B. Goal Two: Expanded Capacity to Think Like a Lawyer 257
C. Goal Three: Managing Uncertainty, Exercising Judgment, and Taking Action 257
D. Goal Four: Human Dimensions of Practice: Developing Skills in Interpersonal Dynamics, Especially the Capacity to Understand the Perspective of Another and Developing Self-Knowledge about Ways of Working 258
(1) Empathy and Parallel Universe Thinking 258
(2) Self-Knowledge and Self-Regulation 259
E. Goal Five: Understanding How Law and Legal Systems Function in General and in the Lives of Low-Income People 259
F. Goal Six: Learning to Learn 260
CONTENTS

G. Developing Lawyering Skills 260

Design Principles 261
A. Ensure Student Responsibility For Client/Project Matters 261
B. Select Fieldwork to Promote Integration and Transfer 263
C. Limit Fieldwork to Enable Time for Reflection 264
D. Select Fieldwork to Meet Service and Learning Goals That Advance Justice 265

Environmental Factors 265
A. Student Interest and Connection to Careers 266
B. Faculty Preference and Expertise 266
C. Social Justice Needs and Legal Context 267
D. Pragmatic Concerns: Money, Time, and Other Resources 267

Structures 269
A. Clinics Organized Around Lawyering Tasks: General Practice 269
B. Subject Matter Clinics 270
C. Membership in Group and Holistic Representation 272
D. Community Lawyering and Human Rights Clinics 273
E. Hybrid Clinics 275

“Doing The Math”: Connecting Fieldwork to Goals, Environmental Factors and Design Principles 275
A. Process 276
B. An Example 277
C. Illustration 278
D. Doing the Math 279

Conclusion 279

Chapter Thirteen · Design Essays 283

The Hybrid Clinic: Bringing the In-House Clinic to the Field
Claudia Angelos 283

Fieldwork and the Political
Sameer M. Ashar 288

Reflections from the Middle Ground: Clinic Design in Context
Juliet M. Brodie 296

Lawyering in the Digital Age
Conrad Johnson 308

The Evolving Design of a First Generation Clinic
Wallace J. Mlyniec 320

Chapter Fourteen · Learning to Be a Lawyer: Embracing Indeterminacy and Uncertainty 327

Introduction 327
A. The Indeterminacy of Law 328
B. The Indeterminacy of Facts 332
C. The Indeterminacy of the Lawyer-Client Relationship 335
D. The Indeterminacy of Problem Solving 337
E. The Indeterminacy of Skills 341

Conclusion 345
Chapter Fifteen · Reflecting on the Habits: Teaching about Identity, Culture, Language, and Difference
Susan Bryant and Jean Koh Peters

Introduction                                                                                                                       349
Looking Back: Reflecting on Five Habits of Cross-Cultural Lawyering                    350
A. The Habits in Summary                                                                                        350
B. Teaching the Habits                                                                                                352
(1) Teaching the Habits as a Group and Culture and Language                                                                                       353
(2) Teaching the Habits One by One                                                                                                                        355
a. Teaching Habit One                                                                            355
b. Teaching Habit Two                                                                            357
c. Teaching Habit Three                                                                         358
d. Teaching Habit Four                                                                          359
e. Teaching Habit Five                                                                            360
C. Teaching about Working with Interpreters                                                         361
Moving Ahead: Methodological Belief, Methodological Doubt, and the Doubting/ Believing Scale 364
A. Elbow's Concepts of Methodological Doubt and Belief                                   365
B. The Doubting and Believing Scale                                                                       366
C. How Do Methodological Doubt and Methodological Belief, and the Doubting and Believing Scale, Relate to Cross-Cultural Lawyering? 367
D. Concrete Uses of Methodological Doubt and Belief and the Doubting and Believing Scale in the Law School Clinic 368
(1) With the Client                                                                                         368
a. Client Interviewing                                                                             368
b. Mooting                                                                                               369
(2) In the Classroom                                                                                      369
a. Introduction of New Theory                                                             370
b. Case Rounds                                                                                        370
(3) In Supervision                                                                                          370
E. How Doubting and Believing Connect to the Other Habits                            371
Conclusion                                                                                                                         372

Chapter Sixteen · Talking about Race
Jean Koh Peters and Susan Bryant

Introduction                                                                                                                       375
Readying the Garden: Removing the Rocks                                                                  378
A. Practice Nonjudgment                                                                                           378
B. Recognize and Overcome Resistance                                                                   380
C. Remove Distrust by Building a Learning Community                                     381
Readying the Garden: Sowing the Seeds of Constructive Conversations about Race                          382
A. Inviting the Conversation Early: “We will be discussing race.”                                      383
B. Normalizing the Question: “What role does race play in our work?”                                      383
C. Building Conceptual Understanding for Twenty-First Century Race Discussions 384
(1) Microaggression, Privilege, and Power                                                                  384
(2) Implicit Bias                                                                                               387
Preface

Clinical Legal Education started in response to the failure of traditional legal education to prepare students to engage in the craft of being a lawyer. Modern clinical legal education began with the belief that having law students represent real clients in underserved communities was important, both to teach students the skills and values necessary to their careers as lawyers and to improve justice for clients. From its beginning, clinical education has been a reform movement, one intended to transform the content and methods of the legal academy.

Clinicians provide students their first moment of responsibility for clients, a role that requires them to take actions that have consequences in the real world. Doing this under the tutelage of faculty members ensures that the lessons that come from that profound moment are ones that express the highest aspirations of the legal profession. To teach students engaged in practice requires thoughtful pedagogy. Clinical teachers from around the country and now around the world have worked together to develop and improve that pedagogy. Over more than four decades, the clinical community has gathered at conferences (most importantly, the annual Association of American Law Schools Clinical Teachers’ Conference), written articles and textbooks, created teaching materials, and participated in small intellectual networks, all to create the methods and content of the clinical curriculum.

This community has from the beginning developed innovative ways to teach both new and experienced teachers. Because clinical education is part of legal education reform in many parts of the world, that teaching is now an international phenomena. The need for law schools to teach students to understand the complexity of law as it takes shape through practice and to prepare students to undertake the responsibilities of practice has meant that the cadre of clinicians who are able to do this important work continues to expand.

As we write and edit this book, legal education is in a period of transition, responding partly to critical evaluations of legal education from many voices, but also to current transformation in the nature of law practice. As we write, we do not know where these shifts will take the legal profession and what society will need and expect from lawyers. Thus, we prepare students for a changing practice and, at the same time, identify and teach enduring norms about what being a lawyer means. In the current terminology, many legal educators have embraced a goal of making students more “practice ready,” but clinical education has since its inception been committed to the broader goals of ensuring that law schools educate students in the complex ways of thinking and acting required of lawyers to fulfill their critical roles in society.

Legal education that includes faculty-supervised practice enables law schools to educate lawyers with the capacity to adapt to change and be agents in reshaping law and the profession. In the book, we describe clinical education’s transformative potential to create ethical, skilled, thoughtful practitioners imbued with professional values of seeking justice and serving clients. We are convinced that educating students in a faculty-supervised
practice community enables deep, expansive, and enduring learning about how to practice and how to continue to learn. The book illustrates the vibrant learning potential of these practice communities as well as the methodologies teachers have to realize the potential of clinical education.

While the main audience for the book is the faculty who teach and supervise in these law-school sponsored practice communities located in the United States, we hope the book will prove valuable for all teachers, here and abroad, who teach about practice and professional identity. The book’s examples of how to teach come from faculty-supervised clinical programs and illustrate the depth and vibrancy of learning that is grounded in students’ experiences, guided by faculty, of exercising responsibility for clients. The pedagogical theories we identify for learning the necessary practice skills, ways of thinking, and perspectives on the legal system, as well as the suggestions we offer for how to use these theories apply to a broad range of experiential learning courses. In addition to identifying how students learn, the book, explicitly and implicitly through our examples, identifies how a teacher sets priorities for what students learn.

The book articulates an ambitious agenda for student learning and therefore for teachers who facilitate this learning. The chapters on the four clinical methodologies—fieldwork, supervision, seminar, and rounds—identify a variety of choices teachers face in designing each one. We know these lists of possible choices can be overwhelming, especially as one is beginning to teach. Indeed, in our own professional development, we focus on different aspects of our teaching or lawyering in different years to manage this feeling. The book is written in a way that allows a reader to focus on particular chapters without reading the whole at one time. We hope those in fellowship programs and other beginners will find the book a welcoming introduction to becoming a clinical teacher and that it will be resource for future development. We hope the book’s varied frameworks and approaches resonate with our experienced colleagues’ practices of good teaching, renew commitments to intentional teaching, organize thinking about established ways of approaching our educational activities, and offer new ideas.

The changing nature of professional work provides opportunities for teachers to explore anew innovative approaches to practice, to achieving justice, and to inspiring a new generation of lawyers. Evolving approaches to practice signal the need for careful thought about how and what to teach. In this book, we have aspired to do what we intend to do in our teaching: to provide concrete ideas for handing the work that is before us and create theories and frameworks for guiding our current and future work.

In writing this book we worked together with many wonderful colleagues from around the country. They have generously served as chapter co-authors or have written essays that add additional examples of the methodologies. We are grateful to them. They are a diverse group, all committed to the innovation and experimentation that characterize clinical education. Our work with them reminds us how much we have influenced each other in our thinking about clinical teaching. We are fortunate to be part of a community of law teachers who learn from each other about teaching students, representing clients, and achieving justice. We are indebted to this community for our development as teachers and for this book. Our field is an on-going collaboration among people who are passionate and thoughtful about the privilege we have to be clinical teachers.

Many clinicians whose voices are not heard directly in this book have contributed to what we know and have given feedback or offered suggestions for improving this project. We thank them for being willing and effective participants in this intellectual community.
that taught us all so much. Finally, the book is not a research project so the footnotes and bibliography are minimal. In the endnotes to chapters, we acknowledge thinkers whose work is precisely necessary for understanding particular ideas we are developing and identify a few specific sources for this learning. We, therefore, leave for another day references to the many who have influenced our thinking.

Sue, Elliott & Ann
Dedication and Acknowledgments

Throughout our long and joyous careers in clinical education, we have been part of a community of committed lawyer-teacher-scholars who have worked together to understand and teach lawyering. These colleagues and friends have created a new field of inquiry. Together they have generated knowledge about the work of lawyers, the role of lawyering in law and society, and the education of lawyers. They have sought to inspire students, improve legal education and the legal profession, and promote justice. We cherish them and hope that this book honors all who have shared their ideas with us, taught us, and learned with us.

The book is a collaborative effort, a demonstration of the collective tradition of clinical legal education. Our chapter co-authors, Jane Aiken, Robert Dinerstein, Conrad Johnson, and Jean Koh Peters, shaped our thinking and helped us realize our aspirations for this project.

Our essayists joined us in making it possible for this book to contain wisdom produced through the contributions of many.

The colleagues with whom we work every day, the faculties of American University Washington College of Law and CUNY School of Law, especially our clinical colleagues, are the first line of intellectual exchange in our lives. We are proud of our association with them.

We thank our law schools for supporting our work and providing research assistance over the life of the project.

We dedicate this book to all of these colleagues and friends. But most of all, we dedicate it to all those we love for supporting us and sustaining us over the long life of this project.

We gratefully thank Dorothy Matthews for her tireless, effective, and efficient help in getting our manuscript to print.
Contributors

Chapter Co-Authors

Jane Aiken, Professor of Law and Associate Dean for Experiential Education, Georgetown University Law Center
Robert D. Dinerstein, Professor of Law and Associate Dean for Experiential Education, American University Washington College of Law
Conrad Johnson, Clinical Professor of Law, Columbia University Law School
Jean Koh Peters, Sol Goldman Clinical Professor of Law and Supervising Attorney, Yale Law School

Essayists

Mark Neal Aaronson, Emeritus Professor of Law, University of California Hastings College of the Law
Bryan Adamson, Associate Professor of Law, Seattle University School of Law
Alicia Alvarez, Clinical Professor of Law, University of Michigan School of Law
Claudia Angelos, Clinical Professor of Law, New York University Law School
Sameer M. Ashar, Clinical Professor of Law, University of California Irvine School of Law
Beryl Blaustone, Professor of Law, CUNY School of Law
Juliet M. Brodie, Professor of Law, Associate Dean for Clinical Education, Stanford University Law School
Elizabeth B. Cooper, Associate Professor of Law, Fordham University School of Law
Deborah Epstein, Professor of Law, Georgetown University Law Center
Carolyn Grose, Professor of Law, William Mitchell College of Law
Kristin Henning, Professor of Law, Georgetown University Law Center
Conrad Johnson, Clinical Professor of Law, Columbia University Law School
Donna Lee, Professor of Law, CUNY Law School
Wallace J. Mlyniec, Professor of Law, Georgetown University Law Center