Human Rights Module

On Crimes Against Humanity, Genocide, Other Crimes Against Human Rights, and War Crimes

THIRD EDITION

including revised extracts from

Paust, Bassiouni, Scharf, Sadat, Gurulé, Zagaris
International Criminal Law (4 ed. 2013)
Contents

PART ONE · CASES AND MATERIALS

Chapter 1 · Human Rights Law

Section 1 Nature and Sources of International Law

Introduction

A. Obligatio Erga Omnes and Jus Cogens

Human Rights Committee, General Comment on Issues Relating to Reservations Made Upon Ratification or Accession to the Covenant and Optional Protocols, U.N. Doc. CCPR/c/21/rev.1/add.6, General Comment No. 24, Para. 8 (Nov. 2, 1994).

Johann Bluntschli, Modern Law of Nations of Civilized States (1867)

B. Additional Consideration of Customary International Law


C. Constitutional Bases and Status


Historic Reach of the Law of Nations

Forms of Incorporation of International Law

Notes

Ex parte Quirin, 317 U.S. 1, 27–30 (1942)

Note


Note

Section 2 Individual Responsibility

An Introduction to General Types of Responsibility

Resolution of 1781, 21 Journals of the Continental Congress 1136-37

Opinion and Judgment of the International Military Tribunal at Nuremberg, (October 1, 1946)

Principles of the Nuremberg Charter and Judgment, Formulated by the International Law Commission, and adopted by G.A.
The Prosecutor v. Blagojevic & Jokic, IT-02-60-T (Trial Chamber, Judgement on Motions for Acquittal Pursuant to Rule 98 bis) (5 April 2004) 21
Notes and Questions 22
Section 3 General Human Rights 28
A. The United Nations Charter 29
B. The International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights 30
C. The American Declaration and O.A.S. Charter 32
D. Torture and Other Inhumane Acts
   Convention Against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment, Dec. 10, 1984, 1465 U.N.T.S. 85 33
Questions 33
E. Race Discrimination 42
   1. General Discrimination 42
   Question 42
   2. Apartheid 43
   Notes and Questions 43
F. Hostage-Taking 43
   International Convention Against the Taking of Hostages, 1316 U.N.T.S. 205 (1979) 43
   Questions 43
G.Disappearances 44
   Inter-American Convention on the Forced Disappearance of Persons, done in Belen, Brazil, June 9, 1994 45
   Questions 45

Chapter 2 · Crimes Against Humanity 49
Fictional Introductory Problem 49
Burundi v. Bagosora, Indictment # 3-19-97, in the Trial Court of Burundi 49
Motion to Dismiss the Indictment 50
Section 1 Nuremberg and Earlier 50
The Prosecutor v. Akayesu, ICTR-96-4-T (2 Sept. 1998) 51
CONTENTS

Report of Justice Robert H. Jackson to the President of the United States, released June 7, 1945 52
International Military Tribunal at Nuremberg, Indictment Number 1 53
Judgment of the International Military Tribunal at Nuremberg (1946) 55
Notes 55
Control Council Law No. 10, art. II(1)(c) (1945) 56
United States v. Altstoetter, et al. (“The Justice Case”) 58
Notes and Questions 59
Section 2 Eichmann Trial (Israel)
The Attorney General of the Government of Israel v. Adolf, the Son of Karl Adolf Eichmann, Criminal Case No. 40/61 (1961) 62
Notes and Questions 66
Section 3 Barbie, Touvier and Papon Trials (France)
Matter of Barbie 67
Notes and Questions 73
Matter of Touvier 74
New French Criminal Code 80
Notes and Questions 80
Section 4 Mugesera Case (Canada)
Note 85
Section 5 Newer International Prosecutions
A. The International Criminal Tribunals for the Former Yugoslavia and Rwanda and the Special Court for Sierra Leone 86
Notes and Questions 89
The Prosecutor v. Rutaganda, ICTR-96-3-T (6 Dec. 1999) 91
Questions 95
B. The Rome Statute for the International Criminal Court and its Application 98
Notes and Questions 100
Notes and Questions 110
Chapter 3 · Genocide

Section 1 The Convention


Questions


Notes and Questions

The Prosecutor v. Rutaganda, ICTR-96-3-T (6 Dec. 1999)


B. Prosecutions Before the International Criminal Tribunal for Former Yugoslavia

Notes and Questions

Section 2 Application in Bangladesh


Notes

Section 3 Genocide and Politicide


Questions

Section 4 U.S. Implementation


Questions

1986 Lugar/Helms/Hatch Provisos as Approved by the Foreign Relations Committee


U.S. Legislation


Notes and Questions

Paust, Congress and Genocide

Questions

Chapter 4 · War Crimes

Introductory Note

Introductory Problem

Indictment of Fawaz Hussein

Sources of International Humanitarian Law
CONTENTS

Section 1 Applicability

J. Pictet (ed.), IV Commentary, Geneva Convention Relative
to the Protection of Civilian Persons in Time of War (1958) 161
Paust & Blaustein, War Crimes Jurisdiction and Due Process: The
Protocol Additional to the Geneva Conventions of 12 August 1949,
and relating to the protection of victims of international armed
conflicts (Protocol I) 8 June 1977 165
Protocol Additional to the Geneva Conventions of 12 August 1949,
and relating to the protection of victims of non-international
armed conflicts (Protocol II) 8 June 1977 165
Notes and Questions 165
The Geneva Protocols 177
Other Aspects of Internal Versus International Armed Conflicts 179
Section 2 Types of War Crimes

A. General 181
U.S. Dep’t of Army Field Manual 27-10, The Law of Land
Warfare (1956) 181
Notes and Questions 182
The Prosecutor v. Dusko Tadic, Decision on the Defence Motion
for Interlocutory Appeal on Jurisdiction, ICTY Appeals
Chamber, IT-94-1-AR72 (2 Oct. 1995) 184
Notes and Questions 190
B. Conduct of Hostilities and Other Protections 195
The Declaration of St. Petersburg, (1868) (extract) 196
Hague Declaration No. IV, July 29, 1899, para. 3 197
Geneva Protocol of 1925, (Protocol prohibiting the use in War
of Asphyxiating, Poisonous or other Gases, and of
Bacteriological Methods of Warfare), done in Geneva
17 June 1925, L.N.T.S. 1929 No. 2138, 26 U.S.T. 571,
T.I.A.S. No. 8061 197
Hague Convention (No. IV) Respecting the Laws and Customs
of War (1907) 197
Notes and Questions 197
The Dreierwalde Case  Trial of Karl Amberger (Formerly
Oberfeldwebel), Case No. 7, BRITISH MILITARY COURT,
WUPPERTAL, 11th—14th March, 1946 from U.N. War Crimes
Commission, Law Reports of Trials of War Criminals, 81,
86–87 (1947) 205
United States v. von Leeb, et al., 10 Trials of War Criminals 3,
11 Trials of War Criminals 528–29, 562–63 (1948)
(The High Command Case) 206
United States v. List, et al., 11 Trials of War Criminals 757,
1248–49, 1250, 1252–54, 1270–71 (1948)
(The Southeast [Hostages] Case) 208
Notes and Questions 211
Notes and Questions 211
Chapter 5: Civil Sanctions

A. The Right of Access and to a Remedy


General Comment No. 24, U.N. Doc. CCPR/c/21/rev.1/add/6 (Nov. 2, 1994)

Notes and Questions

B. U.S. Federal Statutes

Alien Tort Claims Act (ATCA or ATS), 28 U.S.C. § 1350

Torture Victim Protection Act (TVPA), Public Law 102-256, 106 Stat. 73 (1992)

The Antiterrorism Act (ATA), 18 U.S.C. §§ 2331-2337

Notes and Questions

C. Cases

Filartiga v. Pena-Irala, 630 F.2d 876 (2d Cir.1980)


Notes and Questions


Notes and Questions


Question


Notes and Questions


Notes and Questions


Note


Notes and Questions


Notes and Questions

Notes and Questions
PART TWO · DOCUMENTS SECTION

United States Constitution 313
Y.B.U.N. 1043 (June 26, 1945) 315
Declaration on Principles of International Law Concerning Friendly
Relations and Co-operation Among States in Accordance with the
Universal Declaration of Human Rights, U.N. G.A. Res. 217A,
International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, (ICCPR) 999
U.N.T.S. 171 (Dec. 9, 1966) 330
American Declaration of the Rights and Duties of Man, OAS Res.
No. 36 (1969), 144 U.N.T.S. 123 349
Convention Against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or
Degrading Treatment or Punishment, 1465 U.N.T.S. 85
(Dec. 10, 1984) 359
Instructions for the Government of Armies of the United States
in the Field, General Orders No. 100 (1863) (the 1863 Lieber Code) 363
Hague Convention (No. IV) Respecting the Laws and Customs of War on
Land, and Annex, done at The Hague, Oct. 18, 1907, 36 Stat. 2277,
T.S. No. 539, 1 Bevans 631 368
List of War Crimes Prepared by the Commission on the Responsibility of the
Authors of the War and on Enforcement of Penalties, Presented to the
Preliminary Peace Conference, Paris, 29 March 1919 (members: Belgium,
British Empire, France, Greece, Italy, Japan, Poland, Roumania, Serbia,
United States) 373
Geneva Convention Relative to the Treatment of Prisoners of
No. 3364 375
Geneva Convention Relative to the Protection of Civilian Persons
in Time of War of August 12, 1949 (GC) 385
Protocol Additional to the Geneva Conventions of 12 August 1949, and
relating to the protection of victims of international armed conflicts
(Protocol I), 8 June 1977 400
Protocol Additional to the Geneva Conventions of 12 August 1949, and
relating to the protection of victims of non-international armed
conflicts (Protocol II), 8 June 1977 414
Charter of the International Military Tribunal at Nuremberg,
Tokyo Charter for the International Military Tribunal for the Far East (1946),
as amended by General Orders No. 20 (26 April 1946), T.I.A.S. No. 1589 428
Allied Control Council Law No. 10 (20 Dec. 1945), Control
Council for Germany, Official Gazette 50 (Jan. 31, 1946) 433


Statute of the International Tribunal for Rwanda, U.N. S.C. Res. 955 (8 Nov. 1994) 446


International Convention Against the Taking of Hostages, 1316 U.N.T.S. 205 (1979) 532


Inter-American Convention on the Forced Disappearance of Persons, done in Belen, Brazil, June 9, 1994 551


Lawfulness of Detentions by the United States in Guantanamo Bay, Parliamentary Assembly, Council of Europe, Resolution 1433 (26 April 2005) 559
Preface

The Human Rights Module has been prepared for those teaching human rights courses or seminars who wish to supplement whatever other materials they are using in order to assure adequate, up-to-date exploration of the nature and sources of human rights, human rights litigation in the U.S., and “core” international crimes most often associated with human rights infractions. “Core” crimes addressed here include attention to crimes against humanity, genocide, other crimes against human rights (such as torture, criminalized race discrimination, apartheid, hostage-taking, and disappearances), and war crimes. The Module should also prove useful as supplemental material for other international law courses or seminars where a focus on crimes against humanity, genocide, and other crimes against human rights, and/or war crimes is desired—perhaps a course or seminar on counter-terrorism addressing the law of war and human rights in particular. The Module is self-contained, providing needed cases and materials as well as a separate Documents Section in Part Two of the Module.

Some who use the Human Rights Module might prefer to concentrate on Chapters 1–3 and avoid inclusion of Chapter 4 on war crimes. Others might prefer to use the first four chapters and not Chapter 5 (which addresses civil sanctions) and some might prefer to use all five chapters in their course or seminar. Especially after the first AALS Workshop on Human Rights, held in 1999, it is our understanding that most law professors who teach human rights courses or seminars supplement assigned textbooks with other materials or find that present textbooks preclude adequate or more detailed and up-to-date attention to areas of special interest, such as those reflected in the special focus of the Module. The Module was prepared in part to meet such needs and to provide a self-contained set of cases, materials and documents that can be used in a few or several weeks.

We hope that you find the Module especially useful and we are eager to receive your comments and suggestions for improvement.

The Editors
2013