

When Nature and Nurture Collide

Early Childhood Trauma, Adult Crime,
and the Limits of Criminal Law

Theodore Y. Blumoff



CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS

Durham, North Carolina

Copyright © 2014
Theodore Y. Blumoff
All Rights Reserved

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Blumoff, Theodore Y., 1947-

When nature and nurture collide : early childhood trauma, adult
crime, and the limits of criminal law / Theodore Y. Blumoff.

pages cm

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-61163-500-3 (alk. paper)

1. Children and violence. 2. Psychic trauma. 3. Crime. 4.
Criminal law. I. Title.

HQ784.V55B58 2013

303.6083--dc23

2013030000

Carolina Academic Press
700 Kent Street
Durham, North Carolina 27701
Telephone (919) 489-7486
Fax (919) 493-5668
www.cap-press.com

Printed in the United States of America

Contents

Acknowledgments	vii
Chapter 1 · The Scars of Childhood Violence	3
Part I The Science	
Chapter 2 · Evolutionary Theory, Neuroscience and the Sources of Legal Norms	29
Chapter 3 · The Developing Brain	51
Chapter 4 · Major Childhood Trauma and Brain Development	83
Part II The Jurisprudence	
Chapter 5 · Dualism and the Assumption of Universal Free Will	115
Chapter 6 · The Settled View: Conditioning, Cognition and Character	155
Chapter 7 · The Problem (and Paradox) of Moral Luck	189
Part III Proposals for Change: Children Do Grow Up	
Chapter 8 · Tending to Wounded Children: A View from Liberal Democracy	209
Chapter 9 · Some Objections	233
Chapter 10 · Rediscovering Compassion	265
Index	293

Acknowledgments

September 28, 2013

This book has been a labor of several years and a number of publications and editors and friends and research assistants to whom I owe a great deal. Frankly, the list is longer than I can remember and from those whom I have forgotten, I ask forgiveness. But some acknowledgments and expressions of thanks are not only in order, but remembered. Portions of this work have appeared in different forms in a number of publications, including the Canadian Journal of Law and Jurisprudence and its editor Richard Bronaugh, who provided wonderful editing for two of my articles, *Justifying Punishment* and *Some Thoughts on the Aesthetics of Retribution*, small parts of which I have reworked here. THE BUFFALO CRIMINAL LAW REVIEW and its editor, Markus Dubber, provided a forum for *A Jurisprudence for Punishing Attempts Asymmetrically*. It too informed this work. Part of Chapter 3 appeared in *How (Some) Criminals Are Made*, which is a chapter in Michael Freeman, ed., 13 CURRENT LEGAL ISSUES: LAW AND NEUROSCIENCE (London: OUP 2011); and a small segment of Chapter 7 came out in *The Problems with Blaming*, in Michael Freeman and Oliver Goodenough, eds. in LAW, MIND, AND BRAIN (London: Ashgate 2009). Sanford Kadish was kind enough to post a manuscript I wrote partially critical of an earlier normative work of his on moral luck, "Comments on Kadish's 'Moral Excess,'" <http://ssrn.com/abstract=285292> (posted Fall 2001). I thank him for his posting and our exchange of notes. The entire staff of Carolina Academic Press has been a pleasure to work with.

I should also express my gratitude to the Gruter Institute for Law and Behavioral Research for taking a chance on my work based on the kind word of one of its fellows, Doug Yarn at Georgia State University; through Doug I have discovered a community of like-minded scholars who are all striving to improve our understanding of human behavior. Thanks too to the Society for the Evolutionary Analysis of Law which has provided fora and wonderful opportunities for the presentation and discussion of my work. Michael Freeman from the Law Faculty at University College London has twice offered me a platform to try out my ideas.

I have benefitted enormously from conversations and suggestions from a number of friends and colleagues including Abigail Baird, Susan Bandes, William Casebeer, Oliver Goodenough, Morris Hoffman, Owen Jones, Stephen Morse, Donald Pfaff, Amanda Pustilnik, Julie Seaman and my Dean, Gary Simson. Jim Walsh, my library liaison, has provided tremendous assistance finding resources and aiding in the task of obtaining permissions for the images in the book. My outstanding student research support includes Megan Boyd, Dodson Strawbridge, Emily Leech, Eleanor Degolian, William Ezzell, Brett Schwartz and Christina Nosari. The students in my Spring seminar, Problems in the Jurisprudence of Criminal Law: Law and Neuroscience, are a joy to interact with and source of never-ending questions.

I have delivered parts of this work in a variety of fora, including several Mercer University Faculty colloquia, the faculty of Georgia State University, at several annual research conferences of the Gruter Institute for Law and Behavioral Research, at University College London's Faculty of Law, at the Society for the Evolutionary Analysis of Law's conferences at Vanderbilt University, the University of Indiana, the College of William and Mary, and Emory University, at a colloquium at the University of Georgia School of Law, and Mercer University's 2010 Symposium, The Brain Sciences in Court. To my colleagues Hal Lewis and Jack Sammons I simply say thanks for your consistent willingness to give time to my endeavors over many years. So too should I thank the many people who have read and commented on the many manuscripts that compose this work, and especially to Robert Audi for his early patience and faith. My genuine gratitude goes to Mercer University and its commitment to my (sometimes apparently disconnected) research agenda, which began with Dean Phil Shelton, was continued by Dean Daisy Floyd, and is enjoying a wonderful new lease on life with Dean Gary Simson.

Last to my family, which includes a phenomenally supportive group of people, some who aren't exactly family. This group includes a terrific attorney, a well-grounded sympathetic critic, and as close to a brother as I will ever have, Mel Tarnopol. It also includes my companions and friends of many years, the late Dr. Karen Kovach and Dr. Sally Gordon, the first a moral philosopher, the second a neuropsychologist. Both asked deeper questions than anyone else I know about how real people with real problems survive. And, finally, it includes my three generous, smart, wonderful and ever-questioning children, who have helped me in their very beings, as well as in the questions and questioning they routinely bring to the table. The book is for them and is dedicated to the memory of my mom, Esther Klamman Blumoff and to KAK.