

Excluding Intellectually Disabled Offenders from Execution

The Continuing Journey to
Implement *Atkins*

Peggy M. Tobolowsky



CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS

Durham, North Carolina

Copyright © 2014
Peggy M. Tobolowsky
All Rights Reserved.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Tobolowsky, Peggy M., 1952-

Excluding intellectually disabled offenders from execution : the continuing
journey to implement Atkins / Peggy M. Tobolowsky.

pages cm

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-61163-563-8 (alk. paper)

1. Capital punishment--United States. 2. Offenders with mental disabilities--Legal status, laws, etc.--United States. I. Title.

KF9227.C2T63 2014

345.73'0773--dc23

2014030843

Carolina Academic Press
700 Kent Street
Durham, NC 27701
Telephone (919) 489-7486
Fax (919) 493-5668
www.cap-press.com

Printed in the United States of America

In loving memory of my parents.

Contents

Table of Cases	xi
Chapter 1 · The Evolution of the Prohibition of the Execution of Intellectually Disabled Offenders: The Journey from <i>Penry</i> to <i>Atkins</i> and Beyond	3
A. The Journey to <i>Penry</i>	3
B. <i>Penry</i> : The Execution of Intellectually Disabled Offenders Is <i>Not</i> Unconstitutional	6
C. From <i>Penry</i> to <i>Atkins</i> : A Growing Movement to Exclude Intellectually Disabled Offenders from Execution	9
D. <i>Atkins</i> : The Execution of Intellectually Disabled Offenders Is Unconstitutional	13
E. The Implementation of the <i>Atkins</i> Constitutional Mandate	18
Chapter 2 · Processes to Identify Intellectually Disabled Offenders and Exclude Them from Execution: The Intellectual Disability Definition	21
A. Introduction	21
B. Court Guidance Regarding the Category of Intellectually Disabled Offenders Excluded from Execution	23
C. Federal and State Intellectual Disability Definitions for <i>Atkins</i> Purposes	36
1. Intellectual Functioning	37
a. Clinical Standards	37
b. Federal and State Intellectual Functioning Standards	38
c. SEM	41
d. Flynn Effect	43
e. Conclusion Regarding the Impact of <i>Hall</i> on the Implementation of the <i>Atkins</i> Intellectual Functioning Criterion	46
2. Adaptive Functioning	47

a. Clinical Standards and Court Guidance	47
b. Federal and State Adaptive Functioning Standards	51
3. Manifestation During the Developmental Period of Life	56
D. Conclusion	59
Chapter 3 · Application Issues Regarding the Intellectual Disability Definition	61
A. Intellectual Disability Assessment Testing-Related Issues	62
B. Intellectual Disability Testimonial-Related Issues	67
C. Application Issues Related to the Types of Evidence Relevant to Intellectual Disability and the Manner in Which They Are Considered	68
D. Conclusion	75
Chapter 4 · Processes to Identify Intellectually Disabled Offenders and Exclude Them from Execution: Procedures to Address <i>Atkins</i> Claims	77
A. Introduction	77
B. Court Guidance Regarding the Key Procedural Aspects of the <i>Atkins</i> Determination	79
1. Burden of Proof and Standard of Proof	79
2. The Fact-Finder and Timing of the Determination	83
C. Federal and State Procedures to Address <i>Atkins</i> Claims	86
1. Pretrial Notice and Preliminary Showing	86
2. Burden of Proof and Standard of Proof	87
3. Fact-Finder for and Timing of the Determination	90
4. Appeals from <i>Atkins</i> Determinations	94
5. Collateral Review of <i>Atkins</i> Determinations	95
D. Conclusion	99
Chapter 5 · Federal Courts' Resolution of Post-<i>Atkins</i> Intellectual Disability Claims by Federal Offenders	101
A. Introduction	101
B. Successful Federal Offender <i>Atkins</i> Claims	105
C. Unsuccessful Federal Offender <i>Atkins</i> Claims	110
D. Conclusion	116
Chapter 6 · State Courts' Resolution of Post-<i>Atkins</i> Intellectual Disability Claims	119
A. Introduction	119

B. Successful State Offender <i>Atkins</i> Claims	132
C. Unsuccessful State Offender <i>Atkins</i> Claims	140
D. Conclusion	148
Chapter 7 · Challenges for State Offenders Pursuing <i>Atkins</i> Claims through Federal Collateral Review	149
A. Introduction	149
B. The Application to <i>Atkins</i> Claims of the AEDPA’s Restrictions Regarding Federal Collateral Relief for State Offenders	150
1. Barriers to Federal Review of State Offenders’ <i>Atkins</i> Claims	151
2. Deferential Federal Review of <i>Atkins</i> Claims Considered on the Merits	158
C. The Substantive Standards for Federal Court Review of State Offender <i>Atkins</i> Claims	165
D. Conclusion	167
Chapter 8 · Federal Courts’ Resolution of Post-<i>Atkins</i> Intellectual Disability Claims by State Offenders	169
A. Introduction	169
B. Successful State Offender <i>Atkins</i> Claims	174
C. Unsuccessful State Offender <i>Atkins</i> Claims	184
D. Conclusion	191
Chapter 9 · “Appropriate Ways” to Enforce the <i>Atkins</i> Execution Exclusion for Intellectually Disabled Offenders	195
A. Introduction	195
B. “Appropriate Ways” to Define Intellectual Disability for <i>Atkins</i> Purposes	197
C. “Appropriate Ways” to Procedurally Implement <i>Atkins</i>	214
D. “Appropriate Ways” to Implement <i>Atkins</i> Pursuant to the AEDPA	232
E. Conclusion	241
Chapter 10 · The Continuing Journey to Implement <i>Atkins</i>	243
Appendix · <i>Atkins</i> Statutory Provisions or Interim Judicial Procedures	255
Index	257

Table of Cases

- Abad v. United States, 103
Abdul-Kabir v. Quarterman, 213, 252
Addington v. Texas, 217-18
Allen v. Buss, 149, 165, 175, 181
Allen v. State, 70
Allen v. Wilson, 181
Amador v. Dretke, 153
Anderson v. Harless, 151
Anderson v. State, 95
Andrews v. Scott, 149
Apprendi v. New Jersey, 83-84
Atkins v. Commonwealth, 13, 36
Atkins v. Virginia, 4, 5, 9, 13-18, 21, 24, 25-27, 33, 34, 36, 37, 48, 56-57, 77, 84, 85, 100, 166, 191, 195, 196, 201, 212, 214, 232, 240, 243, 246, 247, 248, 249, 250-51, 253
Bailey v. Alabama, 226
Basham v. United States, 41, 69, 96, 113
Beaty v. Schriro, 155, 236
Bell v. Cockrell, 19, 151
Bell v. Cone, 163
Bell v. State, 12
Bennett v. United States, 157
Black v. Bell, 42, 51, 149, 164
Blonner v. State, 70, 92
Blue v. Thaler, 161, 162, 167, 189
Bobby v. Bies, 27-28, 34, 48, 57, 191, 195, 243
Borden v. State, 132
Bowling v. Commonwealth, 36, 45
Bradford v. Cockrell, 151
Branch v. Epps, 175
Brewer v. Quarterman, 213, 252
Bridgers v. Quarterman, 160
Briseno v. Dretke, 189, 190
Brumfield v. Cain, 39, 162, 164, 167, 175, 178-79
Burgess v. State, 12
Carroll v. Secretary, 164
Chase v. State, 19, 37, 91
Cherry v. State, 29
Chester v. Cockrell, 203
Chester v. Quarterman, 52, 206
Chester v. Texas, 205
Chester v. Thaler, 52, 203, 207-11, 213
Clark v. Quarterman, 29, 42, 51, 190, 207
Coker v. Georgia, 15
Coleman v. State, 45, 53, 55
Coleman v. Thompson, 153
Commonwealth v. Bracey, 96
Commonwealth v. DeJesus, 55
Commonwealth v. Miller, 19, 53, 98
Commonwealth v. Sanchez, 19, 22, 88, 91, 93, 94

- Commonwealth v. Vandivner, 36, 147
 Commonwealth v. Williams, 43, 55, 70, 71-72
 Conaway v. French, 167
 Conner v. Hall, 154
 Cooper v. Oklahoma, 81-83, 89, 218-20
 Crump v. McDaniel, 151
 Cullen v. Pinholster, 150, 152, 159, 160, 192
 Davis v. Humphrey, 239
 Davis v. Norris, 157
 Doss v. State, 66
 Dretke v. Haley, 153, 154
 Dufour v. State, 69, 73
 Eldridge v. Quarterman, 161
 Engram v. State, 98, 99
 Enmund v. Florida, 8, 15
Ex parte Alabama, 19, 91
Ex parte Blue, 99, 251
Ex parte Briseno, 19, 54, 55, 69, 97, 98, 144, 197-99, 246
Ex parte Chester, 203-05
Ex parte Hearn, 42, 54, 189, 198
Ex parte Hood, 252
Ex parte Maldonado, 191
Ex parte Matamoros, 191
Ex parte Modden, 55, 199
Ex parte Moreno, 252
Ex parte Nelson, 252
Ex parte Perkins, 19, 74
Ex parte Royall, 151
Ex parte Smith, 66, 68, 71, 74-75
Ex parte Sosa, 199, 203
Ex parte Thomas, 190
Ex parte Woods, 99, 251
 Felker v. Turpin, 237
 Ferrell v. Head, 225
 Fleming v. Zant, 12, 97, 220-21
 Ford v. Wainwright, 7, 8, 15, 16, 21, 77-79, 100, 166, 191, 195, 209, 214-15, 232, 243, 249, 253
 Foster v. State, 19, 68, 97
 Franklin v. Maynard, 19, 93
 Franqui v. Florida, 152
 Frazier v. Bobby, 154, 165
 Fults v. Upton, 192
 Gallo v. State, 198, 199
 Gavin v. State, 121
 Goodin v. State, 66, 133-34
 Goodwin v. Roper, 87
 Green v. Johnson, 39, 152
 Gregg v. Georgia, 8-9, 15
 Hall v. Florida, 4, 20, 22-23, 29-36, 42, 43, 46-47, 57, 59-60, 64, 100, 166, 195-96, 241, 246-53
 Hall v. State, 19
 Hall v. Thaler, 29, 200, 203
 Harrington v. Richter, 150
 Harris v. State, 120
 Harris v. Thaler, 45, 213
 Harris v. United States, 84
 Head v. Ferrell, 12, 99
 Head v. Hill, 89, 226
 Head v. Stripling, 225
 Hearn v. Quarterman, 151-52
 Hearn v. Thaler, 167
 Hedrick v. True, 154
 Henderson v. Thaler, 154, 156, 236-37, 251
 Herrera v. Collins, 238, 239, 240
 Hill v. Anderson, 192
 Hill v. Hall, 223-24
 Hill v. Head, 222-23
 Hill v. Humphrey, 87, 217, 222, 224-27, 228, 230
 Hill v. Schofield, 224
 Hill v. Turpin, 221

- Hines v. Thaler, 52, 164, 203
Hodges v. State, 53, 140-42
Holladay v. Allen, 175, 184
Holladay v. Campbell, 184
Holland v. Florida, 155, 229, 234,
235-36, 251
Holsey v. Hall, 225
Hooks v. Workman, 45, 51, 69, 162,
164, 192
Hope v. United States, 158
Howell v. State, 55
Howell v. Workman, 69, 87, 185-86
Hughes v. Epps, 167, 175
Ibarra v. Thaler, 152
In re Bowling, 42, 157
In re Campbell, 87
In re Davis, 238-39
In re Hawthorne, 40, 53, 96, 97
In re Hearn, 156
In re Hill, 155, 157, 158, 227, 228-31,
233-35, 240, 251
In re Holladay, 157, 158
In re Johnson, 90, 225
In re Lewis, 155
In re Mathis, 158, 233
In re Morris, 149, 157, 158
In re Webster, 104, 115-16, 158,
233-35
In re Wilson, 156, 236
In re Winship, 217
Jackson v. Norris, 161
Jackson v. United States, 103
Johnson v. State, 36
Jones v. State, 11, 46, 66, 70, 247
Jones v. Tucker, 39, 90, 161
King v. Epps, 167, 175
King v. State, 19, 225
Kuhlman v. Wilson, 232
Lambert v. State, 68, 70, 71, 72-73,
97
Lane v. State, 12, 147
Larry v. Branker, 39
Ledford v. Head, 164, 184-85, 217,
225
Leland v. Oregon, 89, 218
Lewis v. Thaler, 162, 186, 189, 203
Lizcano v. State, 144-47, 201-02
Lockyer v. Andrade, 163
Lynch v. Hudson, 186-88
Maldonado v. Thaler, 52, 62, 203
Matamoros v. Thaler, 190-91
Mathis v. Thaler, 156
McCarver v. North Carolina, 13
McCleskey v. Zant, 153
Medina v. California, 79, 81, 219
Miller-El v. Cockrell, 163
Minor v. State, 121
Moore v. Dretke, 179, 180
Moore v. Quarterman, 42, 179-80,
190
Moorman v. Schriro, 58
Moreno v. Dretke, 179, 207
Morris v. Dretke, 152
Morrison v. State, 40, 53, 69
Mosher v. State, 11, 216, 222
Mullaney v. Wilbur, 80
Murphy v. Ohio, 164
Murphy v. State, 18, 92
Murray v. Carrier, 153
Myers v. Workman, 90
Neal v. State, 199
Nicholson v. Branker, 175, 176
Ochoa v. Sirmons, 157
Ochoa v. State, 59
Ochoa v. Workman, 58, 167
Ortiz v. United States, 71, 103,
104-05

- O'Sullivan v. Boerckel, 151
Pace v. DiGuglielmo, 155
Panetti v. Quarterman, 78, 166, 213,
215–16, 229, 234, 240, 251
Patterson v. New York, 79–80
Penry v. Johnson, 213
Penry v. Lynaugh, 4, 5–9, 10, 24–25,
213, 252
Penry v. State, 6
People v. Smith, 93
People v. Vasquez, 89
People v. Vidal, 40, 45–46, 53, 95,
140
Perkins v. Quarterman, 192
Phillips v. State, 66
Pickens v. State, 135–36
Pizzuto v. Blades, 41
Pizzuto v. Hardison, 161, 164
Pizzuto v. State, 59
Powell v. Allen, 58
Price v. Vincent, 163
Pruitt v. State, 11, 36, 88–89, 95, 147,
250
Pruitt v. Wilson, 45
Rankin v. State, 11, 12, 42, 247
Rhines v. Weber, 152
Richardson v. Branker, 45, 164
Richardson v. State, 11, 12
Ring v. Arizona, 83–84
Rivera v. Delaware, 80
Rivera v. Quarterman, 165, 180–81
Rocha v. Thaler, 154
Rogers v. State, 11, 40, 95
Rondon v. State, 11, 53
Rosales v. Quarterman, 164, 203
Rose v. Lundy, 151
Sasser v. Hobbs, 87, 165
Sasser v. Norris, 152
Sawyer v. Whitley, 153, 228, 232
Schofield v. Holsey, 225
Schriro v. Landrigan, 150, 159–60,
163, 192
Schriro v. Smith, 27, 28, 84–85, 100,
191, 195, 216, 243
Simpson v. Norris, 154, 175
Smith v. Ryan, 58
Smith v. State, 11, 45, 70
Smith v. Texas, 213, 252
Speiser v. Randall, 226
Stallings v. Bagley, 188
State v. Arellano, 97
State v. Backus, 88, 95
State v. Boyston, 68, 70, 74
State v. Dann, 140
State v. Dunn, 40, 45, 70, 71, 74, 96
State v. Flores, 86, 93, 94
State v. Grell, 89, 93, 139
State v. Gumm, 140
State v. Jimenez, 19, 93, 94
State v. Laney, 93
State v. Lee, 142–44
State v. Lott, 19, 28, 48, 57, 91, 97, 98
State v. Maestas, 91
State v. McManus, 40, 53, 66
State v. Pruitt, 91
State v. Rizzo, 88
State v. Smith, 53
State v. Strode, 95
State v. Vela, 59
State v. Victor, 12
State v. Were, 70, 91
State v. White, 137–39
State v. Williams, 18, 93
Stephens v. State, 12
Stewart v. Martinez-Villareal, 229,
234, 251
Stripling v. State, 11, 89
Tarver v. Thomas, 165, 175–76

- Taylor v. Quarterman, 189, 190
 Teague v. Lane, 6
 Tennard v. Dretke, 206, 213, 252
 Tharpe v. Humphrey, 160
 Thomas v. Allen, 42, 45, 175, 181–84
 Thomas v. Quarterman, 161, 188–90
 Thompson v. Oklahoma, 8, 15
 Thorson v. State, 42, 45, 247
 Tison v. Arizona, 8
 Townsend v. Sain, 160
 Trop v. Dulles, 7
 Turpin v. Hill, 12, 97, 99, 221
 Tyler v. Cain, 156, 228
 United States v. Beckford, 102
 United States v. Bourgeois, 38, 44, 51, 57–58, 66, 71, 96, 111–12, 117
 United States v. Candelario-Santana, 44, 51, 57, 66, 68, 69, 71, 90, 104, 111, 117
 United States v. Cisneros, 38, 90, 103
 United States v. Davis, 38, 39, 44, 51, 66, 69, 70, 90, 107–08
 United States v. Hardy, 38, 39, 41, 44, 57, 65, 66, 69, 70, 71, 90, 104, 105–06
 United States v. Jimenez-Bencevi, 44, 57, 87, 104, 110–11
 United States v. Johnson, 38, 96, 102, 113
 United States v. Lewis, 44, 57, 66, 90, 107
 United States v. Nelson, 41, 44, 57, 66, 68, 69, 109
 United States v. Northington, 103
 United States v. Roane, 96, 102, 104, 113
 United States v. Sablan, 87, 103
 United States v. Salad, 51, 57, 86, 113, 246
 United States v. Shields, 41, 44, 57, 66, 71, 87, 108–09
 United States v. Smith, 39, 44, 57, 66, 104, 106–07
 United States v. Webster, 66, 70, 87, 90, 96, 102, 104, 115
 United States v. Wilson, 38, 41, 44, 57, 65, 70, 86, 87, 90, 112–13
 Van Tran v. State, 12, 55
 Vasquez v. Hillery, 152
 Waddy v. Robinson, 152, 162
 Wainwright v. Sykes, 153, 232
 Walker v. Kelly, 165
 Walker v. Martin, 153
 Walker v. True, 152, 161
 Walton v. Arizona, 83
 Webster v. United States, 96, 113–15, 116
 Wiggins v. Smith, 163
 Wiley v. Epps, 39, 51, 161, 164, 167, 176–78
 Williams v. Cahill, 22, 36, 246
 Williams v. Dixon, 149
 Williams v. Dretke, 160
 Williams v. Mitchell, 58, 161
 Williams v. Norris, 156, 157
 Williams v. Quarterman, 52
 Williams v. State, 198
 Williams v. Taylor, 159, 163, 232
 Winston v. Pearson, 162, 192
 Wood v. Allen, 164
 Woodall v. Simpson, 41, 154
 Woodby v. Immigration and Naturalization Service, 218
 Woods v. Buss, 155, 157, 158
 Woods v. Quarterman, 206
 Yarborough v. Alvarado, 163
 Ybarra v. State, 40, 53