

Property and Human Rights

Property and Human Rights

Florence Wagman Roisman

INDIANA UNIVERSITY ROBERT H. MCKINNEY SCHOOL OF LAW

CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS

Durham, North Carolina

Copyright © 2012
Florence Wagman Roisman
All Rights Reserved.

ISBN 978-0-89089-352-4
LCCN 2007008480

Carolina Academic Press
700 Kent Street
Durham, North Carolina 27701
Telephone: (919) 489-7486
Fax: (919) 493-5668
www.cap-press.com

*For Abram, Christa, Rachel, Jason, B.J., Cassandra, Madeline,
Henry, Grace and Michael, in the hope that Cassie, Madeline,
Henry, Grace, Michael, and others of their generation will come to
maturity in a much more just and peaceful world.*

Summary of Contents

Contents	ix
Introduction and Acknowledgments	xiii
I. The Nature of Property	3
II. The Historical Development of Civil Rights Principles in the United States	61
A. Racial Zoning	61
B. Racially Restrictive Covenants	76
C. Federal Housing Programs	103
D. The Civil Rights Act of 1964	114
E. The Civil Rights Act of 1968 and the Reinvigoration of the Civil Rights Act of 1866	128
F. Retrenchment—Civil Rights and Future Interests	168
III. International and Foreign Human Rights Law	183
IV. Housing Rights in the United States	251
A. Tenants' Rights	251
1. Security of Tenure	251
2. Decent, Safe, and Sanitary Conditions	318
3. Freedom from Discrimination	331
4. Proposed Rules	344
B. Landowners' Rights	371
1. Nuisance	371
2. Servitudes	385
3. Eminent Domain	417
4. Zoning	461
5. Inequality	492
6. Foreclosure	511
Table of Authorities	551
Table of Cases	557
Table of Statutes	567
Index	571

Contents

Introduction and Acknowledgments	xiii
I. The Nature of Property	3
<i>Dred Scott, Plaintiff in Error v. John F. A. Sandford</i>	3
Notes	11
<i>Newman v. Sathyavaglswaran</i>	12
<i>Town of Castle Rock, Colorado v. Gonzales</i>	24
Note Re: <i>Town of Castle Rock v. Gonzales</i>	41
<i>Goldberg v. Kelly</i>	42
<i>Washington Legal Clinic for the Homeless v. Barry</i>	49
II. The Historical Development of Civil Rights Principles in the United States	61
A. Racial Zoning	61
<i>In Re Lee Sing</i>	61
<i>Buchanan v. Warley</i>	63
<i>City of Birmingham v. Monk</i>	69
J. Mills Thornton III, DIVIDING LINES: MUNICIPAL POLITICS AND THE STRUGGLE FOR CIVIL RIGHTS IN MONTGOMERY, BIRMINGHAM, AND SELMA	71
B. Racially Restrictive Covenants	76
<i>Shelley v. Kraemer</i>	76
Note	84
<i>Hurd v. Hodge</i>	84
Clement E. Vose, CAUCASIANS ONLY: THE SUPREME COURT, THE NAACP, AND THE RESTRICTIVE COVENANT CASES	87
Lorraine Hansberry, TO BE YOUNG, GIFTED, AND BLACK	93
Lorraine Hansberry, <i>A Raisin in the Sun</i> , in A RAISIN IN THE SUN AND THE SIGN IN SIDNEY BRUSTEIN'S WINDOW	94
Brief for United States as <i>amicus curiae</i> supporting petitioners in <i>Shelley v. Kraemer</i> , 334 U.S. 1 (1948)	97
Mr. J.D. Shelley, <i>I Ain't Moving Nowhere!</i> , in Peter Irons, THE COURAGE OF THEIR CONVICTIONS	99
C. Federal Housing Programs	103
Kenneth T. Jackson, CRABGRASS FRONTIER: THE SUBURBANIZATION OF THE UNITED STATES	103
<i>Levitt and Sons v. Division Against Discrimination in State Department of Education</i>	105
<i>Gautreaux v. Chicago Housing Authority</i>	108
D. The Civil Rights Act of 1964	114

<i>Heart of Atlanta Motel, Inc. v. United States</i>	114
<i>Katzenbach v. McClung</i>	123
E. The Civil Rights Act of 1968 and the Reinvigoration of the Civil Rights Act of 1866	128
<i>Jones v. Mayer</i>	128
42 U.S.C. §§ 1981, 1982, and 1983	137
Title VIII of the Civil Rights Act of 1968	138
Timeline with Respect to <i>Jones v. Mayer</i> and the Enactment of Title VIII	147
Report of the National Advisory Commission on Civil Disorders	148
Rev. Dr. Martin Luther King, Jr., <i>I See the Promised Land</i> , in A TESTAMENT OF HOPE: THE ESSENTIAL WRITINGS OF MARTIN LUTHER KING, JR.	149
Gwendolyn Brooks, <i>The Ballad of Rudolph Reed</i> , in BLACKS	155
Toi Derricotte, THE BLACK NOTEBOOKS: AN INTERIOR JOURNEY	157
CBOCS West, Inc. v. Hedrick G. Humphries	164
F. Retrenchment—Civil Rights and Future Interests	168
<i>Evans v. Abney</i>	168
<i>Hermitage Methodist Homes v. Dominion Trust Co.</i>	178
Jonathan L. Entin, <i>Defeasible Fees, State Action, and the Legacy of Massive Resistance</i>	181
III. International and Foreign Human Rights Law	183
Universal Declaration of Human Rights	183
International Covenant on Economic, Social, and Cultural Rights	187
International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination	193
International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women	197
<i>Government of Republic of South Africa and Others v. Grootboom and Others</i>	202
<i>Occupiers of 51 Olivia Road, Berea Township, and 197 Main Street, Johannesburg, Applicants v. City of Johannesburg, et al.</i>	226
Helen Hershkoff, <i>Transforming Legal Theory in the Light of Practice: The Judicial Application of Social and Economic Rights to Private Orderings</i> , in COURTING SOCIAL JUSTICE: JUDICIAL ENFORCEMENT OF SOCIAL AND ECONOMIC RIGHTS IN THE DEVELOPING WORLD	238
A Dream Denied: The Criminalization of Homelessness in U.S. Cities	243
Maria Foscarinis, Brad Paul, Bruce Porter, and Andrew Scherer, <i>The Human Right to Housing: Making the Case in U.S. Advocacy</i>	244
IV. Housing Rights in the United States	251
A. Tenants' Rights	251
1. Security of Tenure	251
<i>Edwards v. Habib</i>	251
Note to <i>Edwards v. Habib</i>	264
<i>Serreze v. YWCA of Western Massachusetts, Inc.</i>	264
<i>Cotton v. Alexian Brothers Bonaventure House</i>	267
<i>Thomas v. Cohen</i>	276
<i>Burke v. Oxford House</i>	284

<i>AIMCO Properties, LLC v. Dziewisz</i>	288
<i>U.S. v. Rucker</i>	292
<i>Dartmouth/Halifax County Regional Housing Authority v. Sparks</i>	297
<i>Carter v. Maryland Management Co.</i>	307
Notes and Questions	316
2. Decent, Safe, and Sanitary Conditions	318
<i>Altz v. Leiberson</i>	318
<i>Javins v. First National Realty Corp.</i>	319
Note	328
Timeline with Respect to Development of the Implied Warranty of Habitability	329
3. Freedom from Discrimination	331
<i>Jancik v. Department of Housing and Urban Development</i>	331
<i>DiCenso v. Cisneros</i>	335
Note	340
<i>Krueger v. Cuomo</i>	340
4. Proposed Rules	344
Department of Housing and Urban Development 24 CFR Part 100 Fair Housing Act Regulations Amendments Standards Governing Sexual Harassment Cases	344
<i>Wisconsin ex rel. Sprague v. City of Madison</i>	349
<i>Levin v. Yeshiva University</i>	352
<i>Giebeler v. M & B Associates</i>	357
B. Landowners' Rights	371
1. Nuisance	371
<i>Armory Park Neighborhood Association v. Episcopal Community Services in Arizona</i>	371
<i>City of Gary, Indiana v. Smith & Wesson Corp.</i>	378
2. Servitudes	385
<i>Hill v. Community of Damien of Molokai</i>	385
<i>Simovits v. The Chanticleer Condominium Association</i>	390
<i>Lobato v. Taylor</i>	401
3. Eminent Domain	417
<i>Berman v. Parker</i>	417
<i>County of Wayne v. Hathcock</i>	421
<i>Kelo v. City of New London, Connecticut</i>	426
<i>Norwood v. Horney</i>	440
4. Zoning	461
<i>City of Edmonds v. Oxford House, Inc.</i>	461
<i>Southern Burlington County N.A.A.C.P. v. Township of Mount Laurel</i>	467
<i>Huntington Branch, N.A.A.C.P. v. Town of Huntington</i>	475
<i>Larkin v. State of Michigan Department of Social Services</i>	487
5. Inequality	492
Melvin Oliver and Thomas Shapiro, BLACK WEALTH/WHITE WEALTH: A NEW PERSPECTIVE ON RACIAL INEQUALITY	492
Spencer Overton, RACIAL DISPARITIES AND THE POLITICAL FUNCTION OF PROPERTY	500
6. Foreclosure	511
<i>Associates Home Equity Group, Inc. v. Troup</i>	511

<i>U.S. Bank National Association v. Ibañez</i>	522
<i>The Bank of New York Mellon v. De Meo</i>	532
<i>Landmark National Bank v. Kesler</i>	535
<i>Coleman v. Hoffman</i>	544
Table of Authorities	551
Table of Cases	557
Table of Statutes	567
Index	571

Introduction and Acknowledgments

Property and Human Rights (PHR) is designed to be used either independently or with any Property casebook to enhance consideration of issues of racism, poverty, international human rights, other forms of discrimination and segregation, and related issues.

I am grateful to Ms. Mary Ruth Deer for years of meticulous assistance and to a series of research assistants who have helped to put this material into publishable condition. Among the research assistants are Katie Orton, Janis Sims, Andrea Bonds, Vicki Déak, Monica Doerr, Marissa Florio, Paul Jefferson, Tami Hart, April Meade, Steve LeClere, Ravinder Deol, Victoria Leigh, Aida Ramirez, and Christopher Pottratz. I am especially grateful to Aida Ramirez for preparing the indices. I appreciate very much the support that the Indiana University Robert H. McKinney School of Law always has provided for me.

Many deletions have been made; often, these are not indicated by ellipses or asterisks. Although I have tried to eliminate all errors, it is not likely that I have succeeded. I apologize for any mistakes, and hope that readers will inform me of these so that I may correct them in future editions.

Florence Wagman Roisman
William F. Harvey Professor of Law
Indiana University Robert H. McKinney School of Law
Chancellor's Professor
froisman@iupui.edu
March 21, 2012

Permissions

Excerpts from the following are reprinted with permission:

A Dream Denied: The Criminalization of Homelessness in U.S. Cities. A Report by the National Coalition for the Homeless and the National Law Center on Homelessness and Poverty (2006).

Charles Abrams, *Forbidden Neighbors: A Study of Prejudice in Housing* (Harper Collins 1955).

Gwendolyn Brooks, *The Ballad of Rudolph Reed*, from *Blacks* (Third World Press 1991).

Toi Derricotte, *The Black Notebooks: An Interior Journey* (W.W. NORTON & Co. 1997).

D.E. Fehrenbacher, *Dred Scott Case: Its Significance in American Law and Politics* (Oxford University Press 2001).

Jonathan L. Entin, *Defeasible Fees, State Action, and the Legacy of Massive Resistance*, 34 *Wm. & Mary L. Rev.* 769 (1993).

Maria Foscarinis, Brad Paul, Brucke Porter, and Andrew Scherer, *The Human Right to Housing: Making the Case in U.S. Advocacy*, 38 *Clearinghouse Rev. J. of Pov. L. and Policy* 97 (2004).

Lorraine Hansberry, *A Raisin In The Sun* (Vintage 1958).

Lorraine Hansberry, *To Be Young, Gifted and Black* (Vintage 1969).

Helen Hershkoff, *Transforming Legal Theory in the Light of Practice: The Judicial Application of Social and Economic Rights in the Developing World* (Cambridge University Press 2008).

Langston Hughes, *Harlem (2)*, from *The Collected Poems of Langston Hughes* (Random House 1994).

Kenneth T. Jackson, *The Suburban Home as the Answer to Middle-Class Hopes and Fears*, from *Crabgrass Frontier: The Suburbanization of The United States* (Oxford University Press 1985).

Martin Luther King, Jr., *I See the Promised Land*, in *A Testament of Hope: The Essential Writings of Martin Luther King, Jr.* (Harper Press 1968).

Melvin Oliver and Thomas Shapiro, *Black Wealth/White Wealth: A New Perspective on Racial Inequality* (Routledge 1995).

Spencer Overton, *Racial Disparities and the Political Function of Property*, 49 *UCLA L. Rev.* 1553 (2002).

- J.D. Shelley, *I Ain=t Moving Nowhere!* In Peter Irons, *The Courage of Their Convictions* (Free Press 1988).
- J. Mills Thornton III, *Dividing Lines: Municipal Politics and the Struggle for Civil Rights in Montgomery, Birmingham, and Selma* (University of Alabama Press 2002).
- Clement E. Vose, *Caucasians Only: The Supreme Court, the NAACP, and the Restrictive Covenant Cases* (University of Calif. Press 1959).