LexisNexis Law School Publishing
Advisory Board

William Araiza  
Professor of Law  
Brooklyn Law School

Ruth Colker  
Distinguished University Professor & Heck-Faust Memorial Chair in Constitutional Law  
Ohio State University Moritz College of Law

Olympia Duhart  
Associate Professor of Law  
Nova Southeastern University Shepard Broad Law School

Samuel Estreicher  
Dwight D. Opperman Professor of Law  
Director, Center for Labor and Employment Law  
NYU School of Law

David Gamage  
Assistant Professor of Law  
UC Berkeley School of Law

Joan Heminway  
College of Law Distinguished Professor of Law  
University of Tennessee College of Law

Edward Imwinkelried  
Edward L. Barrett, Jr. Professor of Law  
UC Davis School of Law

Paul Marcus  
Haynes Professor of Law  
William and Mary Law School

Melissa Weresh  
Director of Legal Writing and Professor of Law  
Drake University Law School
DEDICATION

For my wife, Lorraine,
and for our children, Scott and Julia.
PREFACE

Taken in its expansive sense, “environmental and natural resources law” encompasses pollution control law, energy allocation and conservation law, species and habitat protection, common law property rights, regulatory theory, and a host of other areas. In the law school setting, this obviously expansive body of legal material frequently is divided into two courses, an environmental law course focusing mainly on issues of pollution control and a natural resources law course covering the rest. As its title indicates, this textbook combines the two. The combination, I have found, works well, despite the academic challenge a broader examination can portend. For one thing, a panoptic coverage of this sort serves ideally as a platform for students whose plans include future intense study in these areas of law. It goes without saying that providing such a foundation is precisely what an introductory survey course ought to do. Beyond that, exposure to this broad reach of subject matter fosters in students a more rich understanding of generic issues and controversies that animate these areas of law. From the professor’s point of view, a major advantage inures at the course design stage. With more to choose from, instructors can supplement or reduce subject matter coverage as best suits their individual circumstances and the needs of their students.

With those considerations in mind, these materials have as a primary goal the examination of the “structure” of environmental and natural resources regulation. The book is organized to demonstrate how regulatory programs work both in the absolute and in relation to each other. In my view, this goal is more achieved more seamlessly if the book is used in conjunction with a statutory supplement.

Chapters 1 through 3 survey what might be thought of as classic “foundational” material. Chapter 1 presents a thumbnail sketch of the environmental movement that has led to the current array of legal controls, and offers a quick look into the world of administrative agencies and how they operate. Chapter 2 examines how the common law has dealt with pollution and resource allocation problems. This foray is important if only because common law mechanisms remain to this day effective tools for resolving environmental disputes. A review of the strengths and weaknesses of the common law as a method to protect the environment also sheds light on why environmental and natural resources law is now dominated by statute and regulation. Chapter 3 introduces the structure of regulation, in particular the significant interplay of the federal government, on the one hand, and the states, on the other, across this spectrum of law. As it turns out, polluters typically have two governmental masters, and in many instances, those masters disagree on what the polluter should or should not do. Chapter 3 ventures into the constitutional law of takings as well: since virtually every environmental protection and resource regulatory initiative burdens the use and value of real property, takings principles are ever relevant.

Chapters 4 through 8 present the natural resource law coverage. Chapter 4 introduces the National Environmental Policy Act, the federal government’s effort to put its own house in order. Chapter 5 examines the history of and legal regime governing federal lands and the natural resources they so abundantly contain. This coverage is important because fully one-third of land in this nation is titled in the federal government. Chapter 6 discusses the public trust doctrine, a common law principle rooted in history but continually growing in prominence. Chapter 7 shifts the focus to the Endangered Species
PREFACE

Act, one of the most significant resource protection statutes in world history. Chapter 8 concludes this part of the book with an overview the domestic law of water rights. Issues of rights to water are critical to environmental quality, especially in western states, and students are well served by having some familiarity with these legal principles.

Chapters 9 through 12 present the major federal pollution control and remediation programs. Chapters 9, 10, and 11 review the Clean Air Act, the Clean Water Act, and the Resource Conservation and Recovery Act, respectively. Chapter 12 presents the book’s coverage of the significant “Superfund law,” formally known as the Comprehensive Environmental Response, Compensation, and Liability Act (“CERCLA”). This statute is the federal government’s pathbreaking effort at remediation of hazardous waste contamination. CERCLA has taken on infamous importance in the regulatory world because of its far-reaching liability structure.

This subject matter coverage necessarily brings into play issues of administrative law. Administrative law, briefly described, is the law of government agencies and how they operate. Administrative law is part and parcel of our course; indeed, many of the cases in this book were decided on administrative grounds. As you might expect, administrative law cannot be systematically examined in this course, due to time limitations. (For what is may be worth, administrative law should not be finely probed here — an academic discipline in its own right, it is better learned in a separate course devoted exclusively to the topic.) Nonetheless, for purposes of orientation, and to facilitate a better appreciation of the primary course material, this book offers, in addition to the commentary in the introductory chapter, see supra, four “Notes on Administrative Law” at various points in the text.

Not covered in the book, obliquely or otherwise, is environmental litigation. Courses on environmental litigation typically deal with an array of issues involving civil procedure, trial tactics, and federal court practice. This material, like administrative law, is essential groundwork for environmental lawyers, or at least those who expect to enter the courtroom, but is best left to a course devoted exclusively to those purposes.

Eric Pearson
May 2012
# Table of Contents

## Chapter 1 INTRODUCTION

- A. SOME BACKGROUND AND PERSPECTIVE ............................. 1
- B. ISSUES OF THE REGULATORY STATE ............................. 6
- C. ISSUES OF REGULATION ............................................. 9
  1. The Regulated Community ........................................... 9
  2. Assessing Risk ..................................................... 10
  3. The Derivative Nature of Environmental and Natural Resources Law .. 16

## Chapter 2 COMMON LAW CONSIDERATIONS .......................... 19

- A. INTRODUCTION ..................................................... 19
- B. PROPERTY LAW .................................................... 20
  1. The Law of Waste ................................................. 20
  2. Conservation and Preservation Servitudes .......................... 21
- C. TORT LAW: THE LAW OF NUISANCE ............................. 23
     *Morgan v. High Penn Oil Co.* ........................................ 23
     Notes ........................................................................ 26
     *Weinhold v. Wolff* ...................................................... 27
     Notes and Questions .................................................... 36
     A Note on Reserve Mining ............................................ 38

## Chapter 3 CONSTITUTIONAL CONSIDERATIONS ..................... 41

- A. INTRODUCTION ..................................................... 41
- B. ENUMERATED AND SOVEREIGN POWERS ......................... 42
     *Garcia v. San Antonio Metropolitan Transit Authority* .......... 43
     Notes and Questions .................................................... 44
     *Gibbs v. Babbitt* ...................................................... 45
     Notes and Questions .................................................... 54
- C. CONSIDERATIONS OF FEDERALISM ............................. 56
  1. The Tenth Amendment ............................................... 56
     *New York v. United States* .......................................... 56
     Notes and Questions .................................................... 67
  2. Preemption .......................................................... 68
     *Feikema v. Texaco, Inc.* ............................................ 68
     Notes and Questions .................................................... 76
  3. Dormant Commerce Clause .......................................... 78
     *United Haulers Association, Inc. v. Oneida-Herkimer Solid Waste*
Table of Contents

Management Authority .................................................. 78
Notes and Questions .................................................... 87

D. RIGHTS OF INDIVIDUALS ........................................... 91
   1. Eminent Domain .................................................... 91
      Kelo v. City of New London ....................................... 92
      Notes and Questions ............................................. 99
   2. The Takings Clause ............................................... 100
      a. Total Takings .................................................. 103
         Lucas v. South Carolina Coastal Council .................. 103
         Notes and Questions ......................................... 111
      b. Less Than Total Takings ...................................... 112
         Penn Central Transportation Co. v. New York City ... 112
         Notes and Questions ......................................... 116

Chapter 4 THE NATIONAL ENVIRONMENTAL POLICY ACT . . 125
   A. INTRODUCTION .................................................... 125
      Twentieth Annual Report of the Council on Environmental Quality . 126
      Calvert Cliffs' Coordinating Committee, Inc. v. U.S. Atomic Energy Commission ............................................. 129
      Notes and Questions ............................................. 138
      NEPA at 19: A Primer on an “Old” Law with Solutions to “New” Problems .................................................. 140
   B. EXCEPTIONS TO APPLICABILITY ................................ 143
   C. WHETHER TO PREPARE AN ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT STATEMENT ............................................................. 145
      City of Dallas, Texas v. Hall ...................................... 148
      Notes and Questions ............................................. 156
      Note on Administrative Law #1 ................................ 159
   D. ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT STATEMENTS ....................... 161
      1. The Role of EISs in Decisionmaking .......................... 161
         Robertson v. Methow Valley Citizens Council ................ 162
         Note .............................................................. 171
         A Note on Environmental Justice .............................. 172
      2. EIS Content and Availability Requirements .................. 175
         Notes .............................................................. 179
         A Note on NEPA § 102(1) ..................................... 181

Chapter 5 FEDERAL LANDS ................................................. 183
   A. INTRODUCTION .................................................... 184
   B. HISTORICAL BACKGROUND .................................... 184
      1. Acquisition of the Public Lands .............................. 184

viii
### Table of Contents

*Illinois Central Railroad v. Illinois* .......................... 261
Notes and Questions ............................................. 267

C. **THE PUBLIC TRUST DOCTRINE IN STATE LAW** .......................... 269
*National Audubon Society v. Superior Court of Alpine County* ........ 269
Notes and Questions ............................................. 277

**Chapter 7 ENDANGERED SPECIES ACT** .......................... 279

A. **INTRODUCTION** ............................................ 279
Karen P. Sheldon, *Overview of Wildlife Law* ........................ 280

B. **SECTION 4** ................................................. 287
1. The Listing Process ........................................... 287
   *Northwest Ecosystem Alliance v. U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service* 287
   Note .......................................................... 294
   Note on Administrative Law #2 ................................. 295
   *Southwest Center for Biological Diversity v. Babbitt* ........ 296
   Notes .......................................................... 299
2. Designation of Critical Habitat .................................. 301
   *Natural Resources Defense Council v. United States Department of Interior* 301
   Note .......................................................... 307
   *New Mexico Cattle Growers v. United States Fish and Wildlife Service* 308
   Notes .......................................................... 314

C. **SECTION 7** ................................................. 314
*Tennessee Valley Authority v. Hill* ............................... 315
Notes and Questions ............................................. 329

D. **SECTION 9** ................................................. 332
*Babbitt v. Sweet Home Chapter of Communities for a Great Oregon* 332
Notes and Questions ............................................. 338

E. **STATUTORY FLEXIBILITY INITIATIVES** .......................... 339
*Loggerhead Turtle v. County Council of Volusia County, Florida* 341
Notes and Questions ............................................. 349

F. **ADMINISTRATIVE FLEXIBILITY INITIATIVES** ...................... 351
*Spirit of the Sage Council v. Kempthorne* ......................... 352
Notes and Questions ............................................. 360
A Note on the Animal Welfare and Animal Rights Movements ........... 360

**Chapter 8 WATER RIGHTS** ................................. 363

A. **INTRODUCTION** ............................................ 363

B. **SURFACE WATERS** ........................................ 365
1. Riparianism .................................................. 365
# Table of Contents

Notes ........................................................................................................ 366

Stop the Beach Renourishment, Inc., v. Florida Department of
Environmental Protection ................................................................. 367

2. Prior Appropriation ........................................................................ 373

Irwin v. Phillips ................................................................................... 374

Notes and Questions .......................................................................... 376

A Note on Diffuse Waters .................................................................. 377

C. GROUNDWATER ........................................................................... 377

A Note on Interstate Allocation .......................................................... 379

D. FEDERAL WATER RIGHTS ................................................................. 379

1. Federal Legislation and Water Projects ........................................... 379

California v. Federal Energy Regulatory Commission ..................... 380

Notes ................................................................................................ 383

2. The Navigational Servitude ................................................................. 387

United States v. Cherokee Nation of Oklahoma .................................. 388

Notes and Questions .......................................................................... 391

Chapter 9 THE CLEAN AIR ACT ............................................................. 395

A. INTRODUCTION ........................................................................ 395

B. THE 1970 ACT ............................................................................ 398

1. Regulation of Criteria Pollutants ...................................................... 398

a. National Ambient Air Quality Standards ..................................... 398

Lead Industries Ass’n, Inc. v. U.S. Environmental Protection
Agency .......................................................................................... 401

Notes and Questions .......................................................................... 405

b. Emissions Limitations ................................................................... 406

Notes and Questions .......................................................................... 409

2. New Source Performance Standards .............................................. 410

a. Applicability ................................................................................ 410

Potomac Electric Power Co. v. U.S. Environmental Protection
Agency .......................................................................................... 410

Note .................................................................................................. 416

Note on Administrative Law #3 ......................................................... 417

b. Operation ....................................................................................... 418

Lignite Energy Council v. U.S. Environmental Protection
Agency .......................................................................................... 418

Notes and Questions .......................................................................... 421

3. Hazardous Air Pollutants ................................................................. 421

C. THE 1977 AMENDMENTS ................................................................. 423

1. Nonattainment .............................................................................. 424

In the Matter of NJPDES Permit No. NJ 0055247 ............................ 424
Table of Contents

North Baton Rouge Environmental Association et al. v. Louisiana
  Department of Environmental Quality .......................... 429
  Notes and Questions .............................................. 435

2. Prevention of Significant Deterioration ........................ 435
  Environmental Defense v. Environmental Protection Agency .... 436
  Notes ................................................................. 443
  A Note on “Modification” ........................................... 444
  A Note on Emissions Trading ...................................... 446

D. THE 1990 AMENDMENTS ........................................... 447
  1. National Ambient Air Quality Standards ...................... 448
  2. Hazardous Air Pollutants ...................................... 448
  3. Acid Deposition Control ....................................... 450
     Senate Report No. 101-228 .................................... 450
  4. Permits ............................................................ 455
  5. Stratospheric Ozone Protection .............................. 455

E. CLIMATE CHANGE ............................................... 456
  Notes ................................................................. 470

Chapter 10 THE CLEAN WATER ACT .............................. 473

A. INTRODUCTION .................................................. 473

B. ISSUES OF APPLICABILITY ........................................ 477
  South Florida Water Management District v. Miccosukee Tribe of
  Indians ............................................................... 477
  Notes ................................................................. 483
  The National Cotton Council of America v. United States Environmental
  Protection Agency .................................................. 485
  Notes and Questions .............................................. 495

C. POINT SOURCE REGULATION .................................... 496
  1. Effluent Limitations ........................................... 496
     a. Best Practicable Technology (BPT) ......................... 501
        Note .............................................................. 502
     b. Best Available Technology (BAT) ......................... 503
        Kennecott v. U.S. Environmental Protection Agency .... 503
        Notes and Questions ........................................ 511
     c. Best Conventional Technology (BCT) ..................... 512
        American Paper Institute v. Environmental Protection Agency .. 512
        Notes ............................................................ 518
  2. Water Quality Standards ...................................... 519
     Natural Resources Defense Council v. United States Environmental
     Protection Agency .............................................. 519
# Table of Contents

Note ................................................................................................................. 525

*American Wildlands v. Browner* ............................................................ 527

Note ................................................................................................................. 531

3. **Section 401: Certification** ............................................................... 532

   *American Rivers, Inc. v. Federal Energy Regulatory Comm’n* ........ 532

   Notes and Questions .................................................................................. 537

4. **The National Pollutant Discharge Elimination System** ............... 538

   *American Forest and Paper Association v. U.S. Environmental Protection Agency* ............................................................... 539

   Note ................................................................................................................. 542

   *Atlantic States Legal Foundation v. Eastman Kodak Co.* .............. 542

   Notes ................................................................................................................. 546

D. **NONPOINT SOURCE REGULATION** ............................................ 548

   Note ................................................................................................................. 551

E. **SECTION 404** ....................................................................................... 552

   *United States v. Riverside Bayview Homes, Inc.* ......................... 554

   Note ................................................................................................................. 556

   *Solid Waste Agency v. U.S. Army Corps of Engineers ("SWANCC")* .................. 557

   Note ................................................................................................................. 560

   *Rapanos v. United States* ............................................................... 561

   Note ................................................................................................................. 571

   *National Mining Ass’n v. U.S. Army Corps of Engineers* ........ 572

   Notes and Questions .................................................................................. 575

---

# Chapter 11

**THE RESOURCE CONSERVATION AND RECOVERY ACT** .................. 579

A. **INTRODUCTION** .................................................................................. 579

   *American Mining Congress v. U.S. Environmental Protection Agency ("AMC I")* ............................................................... 580

   Notes ................................................................................................................. 583

B. **SUBCHAPTER IV — SOLID WASTE REGULATION** ................. 586

   Note ................................................................................................................. 589

C. **SUBCHAPTER III — HAZARDOUS WASTE REGULATION** ...... 590

   1. Applicability .......................................................................................... 590

      *Mobil Oil Corp. v. U.S. Environmental Protection Agency* ........ 590

      Notes and Questions .................................................................................. 593

   2. Regulatory Structure .......................................................................... 594

      Note ................................................................................................................. 596

   3. Hazardous and Solid Waste Amendments of 1984 .................... 597

      a. Land Disposal Restrictions ................................................................ 598

      *Chemical Waste Management, Inc. v. U.S. Environmental Protection...* 

         xiii
### Table of Contents

**Agency** .................................................. 599

**Notes** .................................................... 605

b. Corrective Action .......................................... 606
c. Underground Storage Tanks ................................. 608

### Chapter 12 THE COMPREHENSIVE ENVIRONMENTAL RESPONSE,
COMPENSATION AND LIABILITY ACT
(“CERCLA”) ...................................................... 613

A. INTRODUCTION ................................................. 613

Environmental Protection Agency, National Priorities List .......................... 617

Note on Administrative Law #4 .................................. 621

*United States v. Alcan Aluminum Corp.* .................................. 623

Notes and Questions ............................................... 627

B. PERSONAL LIABILITY .............................................. 629

1. Prima Facie Liability ........................................... 629

a. Owners and Operators ......................................... 629

  *City of Los Angeles v. San Pedro Boat Works* .................. 630

  Notes and Questions .......................................... 638

  *United States v. Gurley* ...................................... 640

  *United States v. Bestfoods* .................................. 644

  Notes and Questions .......................................... 653

  A Note on the Special Case of Lenders ......................... 654

b. Arrangers ....................................................... 655

  *Burlington Northern & Santa Fe Railway Co. v. United States* 656

  Notes and Questions .......................................... 658

c. Transporters .................................................... 659

  *United States v. Western Processing Co.* ..................... 659

  Note ......................................................... 662

2. Defenses .......................................................... 662

  *Westwood Pharmaceuticals, Inc. v. National Fuel Gas Distribution Corp.* 663

  Notes .......................................................... 670

  A Note on the Bona Fide Prospective Purchaser (“BFPP”) Defense ........ 670

C. ISSUES OF LIABILITY AND DAMAGES ....................... 671

Notes and Questions ............................................... 673

*Bell Petroleum Services, Inc. v. U.S. Environmental Protection Agency* 673

Notes and Questions ............................................... 681

A Note on CERCLA and Comprehensive General Liability Insurance ........ 685

One Cleanup Program ............................................. 686
Table of Contents

Appendix One  ACRONYMS ............................................. 689

Appendix Two  CANONS OF STATUTORY INTERPRETATION ....... 695

Table of Cases .......................................................... TC-1

Index ................................................................. I-1