APPELLATE ADVOCACY: PRINCIPLES AND PRACTICE

Fifth Edition
LexisNexis Law School Publishing Advisory Board

William Araiza
Professor of Law
Brooklyn Law School

Ruth Colker
Distinguished University Professor & Heck-Faust Memorial Chair in Constitutional Law
Ohio State University Moritz College of Law

Olympia Duhart
Associate Professor of Law
Nova Southeastern University Shepard Broad Law School

Samuel Estreicher
Dwight D. Opperman Professor of Law, Director, Center for Labor and Employment Law
NYU School of Law

David Gamage
Assistant Professor of Law
UC Berkeley School of Law

Joan Heminway
College of Law Distinguished Professor of Law
University of Tennessee College of Law

Edward Imwinkelried
Edward L. Barrett, Jr. Professor of Law
UC Davis School of Law

Paul Marcus
Haynes Professor of Law
William and Mary Law School

Melissa Weresh
Director of Legal Writing and Professor of Law
Drake University Law School
APPELLATE ADVOCACY:
PRINCIPLES AND
PRACTICE

Fifth Edition

Ursula Bentele
Professor of Law
Brooklyn Law School

Eve Cary
Associate Professor of Legal Writing
Brooklyn Law School

Mary R. Falk
Associate Professor of Legal Writing
Brooklyn Law School
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The authors express their deep appreciation to the following colleagues, who spent considerable time reviewing the manuscript and provided valuable suggestions that greatly improved this book: Joyce Adolfsen, Stacy Caplow, Maryellen Fullerton, Joel M. Gora, Richard A. Greenberg, and Stanley Neustadter. The Honorable Gabriel Gorenstein, Magistrate Judge in the Southern District of New York, and Kevin Casey, Administrative Law Judge, who have each taught many Brooklyn Law School students how to be better appellate advocates, were especially helpful in suggesting revisions to this fifth edition and providing the new exercises at the end of Chapter 6. Professors Joel Atlas, James T. Jones, Frank Loss, Deborah Rump, and Rosali Vazquez also gave us valuable feedback on possible changes and additions. We are grateful to our research assistants, Brooklyn Law School students Sarah DeStefano, Todd Miller, and Jesse Oppenheim for researching and drafting new sections on en banc panels and amicus briefs, as well as helping to update and cite-check the materials, and to Emily Farquharson.

We also wish to acknowledge with gratitude the support we received while writing this book from the Dean, faculty, and students of Brooklyn Law School.

Finally, we want to thank our alma mater, The Legal Aid Society Criminal Appeals Bureau, New York City, where we first acquired our interest in appellate practice.
EDITORIAL NOTE

Omissions from cases and other materials are indicated either by ellipses ( . . ) or by substitution of new text in brackets, subject to the following exceptions. First, generally textual citations, particularly intra-sentence and intra-paragraph citations, have been deleted without notation. Additionally, most footnotes in cases are deleted without ellipses. Where footnotes from cases have been included, we have retained the original numbering and placed that number in brackets.
DEDICATION

In memory of our beloved friend and colleague, Eve Cary.
We had several goals in writing this book. First, by helping law students to understand the basic principles behind appellate litigation, the book should enhance their study of law in general. Since law school texts in the United States consist primarily of appellate opinions, it is not surprising that law study will be more comprehensible if the student has some understanding of how appellate courts work, and what appellate attorneys must do to have those courts consider the issues that may benefit their clients.

Second, the book focuses on the principles critical to appellate practice, principles that are not covered in any other law school courses. While extensive programs have been developed to teach trial practice, it is somehow assumed that through the study of appellate opinions students will, by osmosis perhaps, gain the necessary knowledge about handling an appeal. While students are exposed to appellate practice through appellate moot court programs, most competitions revolve around the substance of the issues identified by the simulated record, without particular regard to the kinds of questions that intrude regularly in the actual world of appeals, such as whether an issue was adequately preserved, the appropriate standard of review, or the question of harmless error. Similarly, most books addressing the subject of Appellate Advocacy are largely devoted to materials on brief writing and oral argument.

In this fifth edition, in addition to updating the material, we have included several new topics. In Chapter 2, we address briefly the important matter of seeking stays pending appeal, the possibility of en banc review, and alternative dispute resolution in the appellate context. We have expanded the discussion of the preservation doctrine in Chapter 3, including more materials on civil litigation, and augmented our discussion of scope of review to include judicial notice. In Chapter 4, more treatment is provided of review of administrative agency decisions. Chapter 5 provides more detailed discussion of the evolving constitutional harmless error doctrine. We have added some exercises to Chapter 6 to emphasize some of the ethical issues that arise in appellate practice. Chapter 7, on brief-writing, includes new sections on amicus briefs and on persuasive citations. Hearing from teachers using the text that most appellate practice courses cannot cover the material on federal habeas corpus and other avenues of collateral attack on judgments, we have omitted that chapter from this edition. (We are working on a separate text addressing those topics that we hope to have published soon.)

While this book can be helpful in a variety of contexts, it is designed primarily for use in a comprehensive appellate practice course. It includes exercises revolving around the most important principles of appellate practice that can be used as assignments. Ideally, it would be supplemented by a full, actual trial transcript which would constitute the record on appeal for which the students would prepare an appellate brief and, if time permits, conduct an oral argument.

Most appellate practitioners have access to trial transcripts suitable for that purpose; in addition, the American Bar Association’s Committee on Appellate Practice of the Appellate Judges Conference in 1988 established an appellate record library for use in law schools.

The book does not cover in detail the rules of appellate practice in any particular jurisdiction; the practitioner must study those rules carefully before embarking on an appeal.
PREFACE

The concept of the book is, rather, to provide a basic understanding of the most fundamental principles of appellate litigation, using examples from the federal system as well as several illustrative states. For convenience, the parties on appeal are referred to as appellant and respondent, regardless of the terms that might be used in any particular court for a specific kind of an appeal.

April, 2012
Ursula Bentele
Mary R. Falk
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

## Chapter 1  INTRODUCTION .................................................. 1

I.  THE FEDERAL COURT SYSTEM ............................................. 3  
II.  STATE COURT SYSTEMS .................................................... 5

## Chapter 2  CROSSING THE THRESHOLD TO APPELLATE REVIEW ....... 7

I.  APPEALS AS OF RIGHT: THE NOTICE OF APPEAL AND STANDING .... 8  
   A.  The Notice of Appeal ................................................. 8  
   B.  Standing ............................................................... 8  
       *Marino v. Ortiz* ..................................................... 9  
       *Devlin v. Scardelletti* .......................................... 10
   II.  APPEALS BY PERMISSION ............................................... 12  
       A.  Request for Leave to Appeal in State Court .................... 12  
           *Leave To Appeal Letter* ....................................... 13  
       B.  Discretionary Review in Federal Courts ...................... 14
       C.  Petition for Writ of Certiorari to the United States Supreme Court ........................................... 15
           *Exercise* ......................................................... 17
   III.  HURRY! HURRY! TIMELY FILING ..................................... 18  
       *Bowles v. Russell* .................................................. 19  
       *Notes* .............................................................. 24
   IV.  BUT BE PATIENT! THE FINALITY RULE ............................ 25  
       A.  Statutory Exceptions to the Finality Rule ....................... 26  
           1.  Interlocutory Appeals ......................................... 26  
               a.  Injunctions .................................................. 27  
               b.  Controlling Questions of Law ............................. 28  
           2.  Writs of Mandamus and Prohibition .......................... 28  
       B.  Judicial Interpretations of the Finality Requirement .......... 30  
           *Cohen v. Beneficial Industrial Loan Corp.* ................... 30  
           *Notes* .......................................................... 32  
           *Flanagan v. United States* .................................... 32  
           *Notes* .......................................................... 38  
           *Mohawk Industries, Inc. v. Carpenter* ....................... 41  
       C.  Other Approaches .................................................. 47  
           *Note* ............................................................. 49
   V.  APPEALS BY THE PROSECUTION ...................................... 49  
       A.  Appeals from Final Judgments .................................... 49  
           *United States v. Wilson* ....................................... 49  
           *Notes* .......................................................... 53
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

B. Interlocutory Appeals by the Prosecution ........................................... 56
   1. Suppression Orders ................................................................. 56
   2. Orders Setting Bail ............................................................... 56

VI. CERTIFICATIONS ............................................................................. 57

VII. ALTERNATIVE DISPUTE RESOLUTION ............................................. 58

Chapter 3 SCOPE OF REVIEW AND THE PRESERVATION
   REQUIREMENT .................................................................................. 59

I. SCOPE OF REVIEW ............................................................................. 59

II. ERROR PRESERVATION ..................................................................... 61
   A. Rationale .................................................................................... 61
      *Dilliplaine v. Lehigh Valley Trust Company* ........................................ 62
      Notes .......................................................................................... 66
      *People v. Udzinski* ...................................................................... 66
   B. Recognizing Preserved Error ......................................................... 69
      1. Objections to Rulings and Orders .............................................. 69
         a. Adequacy of Objection ........................................................... 69
            *Stone v. Morris* ................................................................... 70
            Note ...................................................................................... 72
         b. Theory of Objection ............................................................... 73
            Note ...................................................................................... 76
      2. Objections to Jury Charge Errors .............................................. 76
         *People v. Hoke* ...................................................................... 76
   C. Unpreserved Errors Warranting Appellate Review ....................... 80
      1. Lack of Jurisdiction .................................................................. 80
         *Day v. Payne* ........................................................................... 80
      2. Structural Errors ...................................................................... 82
      3. Futility of Objection .................................................................. 83
      4. Plain Error ................................................................................ 85
         *United States v. Marcus* .............................................................. 87
         Notes ........................................................................................ 92
         *Bird v. Glacier Elec. Coop., Inc.* ............................................... 93
      5. Interest of Justice Jurisdiction .................................................. 99
         *People v. Cornish* ................................................................. 100
         *Vollmer v. Luety* ................................................................. 101

III. NEW ISSUES .................................................................................... 104
    *In Re Morris* .............................................................................. 104
    Exercise ....................................................................................... 106
### TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter 4</th>
<th>STANDARDS OF REVIEW</th>
<th>109</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I.</td>
<td>DE NOVO REVIEW OF QUESTIONS OF LAW</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Cooper Industries, Inc. v. Leatherman Tool Group, Inc.</td>
<td>111</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Notes</td>
<td>117</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Exercise</td>
<td>119</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II.</td>
<td>APPELLATE REVIEW OF THE FACTS</td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A.</td>
<td>Jury Trials</td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Civil Cases</td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Laxton v. Gap, Inc.</td>
<td>121</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Notes</td>
<td>130</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Criminal Cases</td>
<td>131</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Legal Sufficiency</td>
<td>131</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Jackson v. Virginia</td>
<td>131</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Notes</td>
<td>139</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mikes v. Borg</td>
<td>140</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Exercise</td>
<td>145</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Langston v. Smith</td>
<td>146</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Note</td>
<td>153</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Exercise</td>
<td>153</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Weight of the Evidence</td>
<td>154</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Tibbs v. Florida</td>
<td>155</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>People v. Bleakley</td>
<td>160</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Notes</td>
<td>162</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Exercise</td>
<td>162</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B.</td>
<td>Trials by the Court: Appellate Courts May Set Aside Only “Clearly Erroneous” Factual Findings</td>
<td>164</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>United States v. United States Gypsum Co.</td>
<td>164</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Notes</td>
<td>166</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Pullman-Standard v. Swint</td>
<td>166</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Notes</td>
<td>176</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Exercise</td>
<td>178</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III.</td>
<td>APPELLATE REVIEW OF MIXED QUESTIONS OF LAW AND FACT</td>
<td>178</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV.</td>
<td>REVIEW OF MATTERS WITHIN TRIAL COURT’S DISCRETION</td>
<td>184</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A.</td>
<td>Procedural Conduct of the Trial</td>
<td>184</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Review of Discretionary Rulings</td>
<td>184</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>National Hockey League v. Metropolitan Hockey Club</td>
<td>185</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Zervos v. Verizon New York, Inc.</td>
<td>187</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Notes</td>
<td>190</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>The Failure to Exercise Discretion</td>
<td>191</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Note</td>
<td>193</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### TABLE OF CONTENTS

**Chapter 5**  
**THE HARMLESS ERROR DOCTRINE**  

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>B.</td>
<td>Substantive Rulings</td>
<td>193</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Admissibility of Evidence</td>
<td>193</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Old Chief v. United States</em></td>
<td>194</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Note</td>
<td>199</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Other Rulings Affecting Substance</td>
<td>200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>In Re Commitment of Hill</em></td>
<td>200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V.</td>
<td>REVIEW OF ADMINISTRATIVE AGENCY DECISIONS</td>
<td>202</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Allentown Mack Sales And Service, Inc. v. National Labor Relations Board</em></td>
<td>204</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Federal Communications Commission v. Fox Television Stations, Inc.</em></td>
<td>214</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Notes</td>
<td>222</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Chapter 6**  
**THE ROLE OF APPELLATE COUNSEL**  

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I.</td>
<td>EFFECTIVE ASSISTANCE OF APPELLATE COUNSEL</td>
<td>264</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Evitts v. Lucey</em></td>
<td>264</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Table of Contents

Notes ........................................... 269

"Gray v. Greer" ................................... 270
"Tyler v. State" .................................. 273
"Eagle v. Linahan" ............................... 273
Notes ........................................... 278

II. SPECIAL CONCERNS OF ASSIGNED APPELLATE COUNSEL ........... 279

A. The No-Merit Appeal .......................... 279
   "Anders v. California" ......................... 279
   Note .......................................... 281
   "McCoy v. Court of Appeals of Wisconsin, District 1" .................. 282
   Notes ........................................... 292

B. Who Decides What Issues to Raise on Appeal? ...................... 294
   "Jones v. Barnes" ................................ 294
   Notes ........................................... 304
   "People v. Vasquez" ............................ 305
   Note .......................................... 306

C. "Pro Se" Representation on Appeal ................................. 306
   "Martinez v. Court of Appeals of California, Fourth Appellate District" .... 306
   Notes ........................................... 310
   Exercises ...................................... 311

Chapter 7 THE APPELLATE BRIEF ................................. 313

I. KNOW YOUR AUDIENCE .......................... 314

II. PREPARING TO WRITE APPELLANT’S BRIEF ....................... 316

A. Identifying Issues for Appeal ............................. 316
   1. Assembling the Record ........................ 316
   2. Annotating the Transcript .................... 316
   3. Listing Possible Issues ...................... 317

B. Selecting Issues for Appeal ...................... 318
   1. Identifying the Strongest Issues ............ 319
   2. Connecting the Issues ...................... 319
   C. Ordering the Issues .......................... 320

III. PREPARING TO WRITE RESPONDENT’S BRIEF .................... 321

IV. WRITING THE BRIEF .............................. 321

A. Statement of the Issues ............................ 322
   1. Circumstances of the Case .................... 322
   2. No Unnecessary Detail ....................... 323
   3. Short ....................................... 324
   4. Avoid Argumentation and Repetition (but don’t be neutral) ........ 324
TABLE OF CONTENTS

5. Match Question to Argument .................................. 325
B. The Statement of Facts ........................................... 326
   1. Function ....................................................... 326
   2. Fact Selection and Organization ............................. 327
      a. Fact Emphasis ............................................ 331
      b. Techniques for Presenting Facts Favorably ............ 332
         i. Sentence and Paragraph Structure .................. 332
         ii. Sub-headings .......................................... 332
         iii. Word Choice .......................................... 332
   C. Summary of Argument ........................................ 333
   D. The Argument .................................................. 334
      1. Substantive Arguments ..................................... 335
         a. Structure of a Doctrinal Argument .................. 335
            i. The Thesis Paragraph ............................... 335
            ii. The Body of the Argument ....................... 336
            iii. Dealing with Counter-argument ................. 337
         b. Structure of a Fact-Centered Argument ............... 338
         c. Respondent’s Arguments ............................... 340
   E. Reply Briefs .................................................... 341
F. Supplemental Briefs ............................................. 341
V. AMICUS BRIEFS .................................................... 342
VI. PRINCIPLES OF GOOD BRIEF WRITING ....................... 343
   A. Clarity ......................................................... 343
   B. Diction and Tone ............................................. 344
   C. Citations ....................................................... 344
      1. Form ......................................................... 344
      2. Creativity and Candor .................................... 345
      3. Non-precedential Decisions ............................... 345
VII. EXAMPLES ......................................................... 346
   A. Statement of Facts ........................................... 346
   B. Standard of Review Argument .............................. 349
   C. Argument Regarding Failure to Exercise and Abuse of Discretion ........................................ 350
   D. Harmless Error Arguments .................................. 351

Chapter 8  ORAL ARGUMENT ......................................... 355
I. PREPARATION ....................................................... 356
   A. Know the Rules ............................................... 356
   B. Know the Record and the Law ............................... 356
TABLE OF CONTENTS

C. Select the Points for Oral Argument .......................... 357
D. Anticipate Difficult Questions ................................. 357
E. Update the Research ............................................. 358
F. Know the Court; Know the Judges .............................. 358
G. Outline the Argument .............................................. 359
H. Practice the Argument ............................................ 360
II. PRESENTATION ...................................................... 360
   A. Getting Started ................................................ 361
   B. Demeanor ...................................................... 361
   C. Answering Questions ......................................... 362
   D. Concessions ................................................... 362
   E. Finishing Up .................................................. 363
   F. Rebuttal ....................................................... 363
III. RESPONDENT’S ARGUMENT ....................................... 364
IV. FORGOING ARGUMENT ........................................... 364

Table of Cases ...................................................... TC-1

Index ................................................................. I-1