

CRIMINAL LAW

LexisNexis Law School Publishing Advisory Board

William Araiza

Professor of Law
Brooklyn Law School

Ruth Colker

Distinguished University Professor & Heck-Faust Memorial Chair in Constitutional Law
Ohio State University Moritz College of Law

Olympia Duhart

Associate Professor of Law
Nova Southeastern University Shepard Broad Law School

Samuel Estreicher

Dwight D. Opperman Professor of Law
Director, Center for Labor and Employment Law
NYU School of Law

David Gamage

Assistant Professor of Law
UC Berkeley School of Law

Joan Heminway

College of Law Distinguished Professor of Law
University of Tennessee College of Law

Edward Imwinkelried

Edward L. Barrett, Jr. Professor of Law
UC Davis School of Law

Paul Marcus

Haynes Professor of Law
William and Mary Law School

Melissa Weresh

Director of Legal Writing and Professor of Law
Drake University Law School

CRIMINAL LAW

Seventh Edition

PAUL MARCUS

Haynes Professor of Law
William and Mary Law School

LINDA A. MALONE

Marshall-Wythe Foundation Professor of Law & Director,
Human Rights and National Security Law Program
William and Mary Law School

GERALDINE SZOTT MOOHR

Alumnae Law Center Professor of Law
University of Houston Law Center

ISBN: 978-0-7698-5287-4 (casebound)

ISBN: 978-0-7698-5305-5 (looseleaf)

ISBN: 978-1-5791-1678-1 (eBook)

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Criminal law / [compiled by] Linda A. Malone, Paul Marcus, Geraldine Szott Moohr -- 7th ed.

p. cm.

Includes index.

ISBN 978-0-7698-5287-4

I. Criminal law--United States. I. Malone, Linda A. II. Marcus, Paul, 1946- III. Moohr, Geraldine Szott.

IV. Cook, Joseph G., 1939- Criminal law.

KF9219.C755 2012

345.73--dc23

2012019544

This publication is designed to provide authoritative information in regard to the subject matter covered. It is sold with the understanding that the publisher is not engaged in rendering legal, accounting, or other professional services. If legal advice or other expert assistance is required, the services of a competent professional should be sought.

LexisNexis and the Knowledge Burst logo are registered trademarks of Reed Elsevier Properties Inc., used under license. Matthew Bender and the Matthew Bender Flame Design are registered trademarks of Matthew Bender Properties Inc.

Copyright © 2012 Matthew Bender & Company, Inc., a member of LexisNexis. All Rights Reserved.

No copyright is claimed by LexisNexis or Matthew Bender & Company, Inc., in the text of statutes, regulations, and excerpts from court opinions quoted within this work. Permission to copy material may be licensed for a fee from the Copyright Clearance Center, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, Mass. 01923, telephone (978) 750-8400.

NOTE TO USERS

To ensure that you are using the latest materials available in this area, please be sure to periodically check the LexisNexis Law School web site for downloadable updates and supplements at www.lexisnexis.com/lawschool.

Editorial Offices

121 Chanlon Rd., New Providence, NJ 07974 (908) 464-6800

201 Mission St., San Francisco, CA 94105-1831 (415) 908-3200

www.lexisnexis.com

MATTHEW  BENDER

Preface

Substantive criminal law has traditionally been a very important part of the first-year curriculum. The course introduces the student to the criminal justice system, raises the question of why and how we punish, and enables instructors to discuss with students the thorny problem of the relationship between the state and the individual. In preparing the latest edition of these materials, we have once again attempted to produce a casebook of reasonable length which can be completely covered in a one semester course. Problems have been developed to demonstrate the difficulties discussed above and many modern issues have been emphasized to stimulate student interest in the course. The authors thank Professor Joseph Cook, one of the original authors, for laying so well the groundwork for the book.

Many fine people assisted us in the preparation of the various editions of these classroom materials, from the College of William and Mary and the University of Houston. We thank them all for their wonderful assistance.

Linda Malone, Williamsburg, Virginia
Paul Marcus, Williamsburg, Virginia
Geraldine Szott Moohr, Houston, Texas

March 2012

Table of Contents

Chapter 1	THE PROVINCE AND LIMITS OF THE CRIMINAL LAW	1
§ 1.01	THE DECISION TO CRIMINALIZE	1
	<i>Commonwealth v. Jones</i>	1
	Comments and Questions	3
	<i>D.P. v. State</i>	5
	Comments and Questions	9
	Problem	10
	<i>State v. Mortimer</i>	10
	Comments and Questions	12
	Richards, <i>The Concept of the Public Morality and the Criminal Law</i>	12
	<i>Lawrence v. Texas</i>	15
	Comments and Questions	22
§ 1.02	THE DECISION TO PUNISH	23
	<i>Regina v. Jones</i>	23
	Comments and Questions	26
	<i>Regina v. Dudley & Stephens</i>	26
	Comments and Questions	28
	KANT, THE METAPHYSICAL ELEMENTS OF JUSTICE	29
	<i>United States v. Bergman</i>	30
	Comments	34
	<i>United States v. Jackson</i>	35
	Comments and Questions	37
	Posner, <i>Optimal Sentence for White-Collar Criminals</i>	38
	Richards, <i>Human Rights and the Moral Foundation of the Substantive Criminal Law</i>	40
	Bibliographical Note	44
	<i>Jones v. City of Los Angeles</i>	45
	Comment	59
§ 1.03	MAKING CONDUCT CRIMINAL	60
[A]	The Sources of the Criminal Law	60
[1]	Common Law	60
	PERKINS ON CRIMINAL LAW	60
	<i>State v. Palendrano</i>	63
	Comments	66
	<i>Weishaupt v. Commonwealth</i>	67
	Comment	73
[2]	Statutes	74

Table of Contents

	<i>United States v. Reid</i>	74
	Comments and Questions	79
	Problems	80
	<i>Morissette v. United States</i>	81
	Comments and Questions	85
	<i>Johnson v. State</i>	85
	Comments and Questions	89
	Problem	89
	<i>People v. Turner</i>	89
	Comments and Questions	93
[B]	Constitutional Limitations	94
[1]	Free Expression	94
	<i>People v. Barton</i>	94
	<i>Potts v. United States</i>	97
	Comment and Questions	99
[2]	Equal Protection	99
	<i>Lawrence v. Texas</i>	99
[3]	Due Process	102
	<i>Kolender v. Lawson</i>	102
	Comments	105
	<i>State v. Miranda</i>	106
Chapter 2	THE ACT REQUIREMENT	113
§ 2.01	INTRODUCTION	113
	Actus Reus: Of Acts and Omissions	
	Denno, <i>Crime and Consciousness: Science and Involuntary Acts</i>	113
§ 2.02	THE VOLUNTARY ACT	114
	<i>Kilbride v. Lake</i>	114
	Comments and Questions	118
	<i>State v. Hinkle</i>	119
	Comments and Questions	122
§ 2.03	ACT OF OMISSION	123
	<i>Commonwealth v. Pestinikas</i>	123
	Comment	126
	<i>People v. Campbell</i>	127
	Questions	129
§ 2.04	POSSESSION	129
	<i>People v. Valot</i>	129
	Comments and Questions	131
	<i>Commonwealth v. Buckley</i>	132
	Problems	134

Table of Contents

Chapter 3	THE MENTAL STATE	135
§ 3.01	INTRODUCTION	135
	<i>Morissette v. United States</i>	135
	Comments and Questions	136
	Commentary	137
[A]	Purposefulness	139
	<i>State v. Smith</i>	139
	Comment	143
	<i>People v. Hood</i>	143
[B]	Knowledge	147
	<i>Fabritz v. Traurig</i>	147
	Questions	150
	Comment — Public Welfare Offenses	150
	<i>United States v. International Minerals & Chemical Corp.</i>	151
	Comment	153
	<i>Flores-Figueroa v. United States</i>	154
	Comment	157
	<i>United States v. Bailey</i>	157
	Comments	161
	<i>United States v. Giovannetti</i>	161
	Comments	164
[C]	Recklessness	166
	<i>Commonwealth v. Welansky</i>	166
	Comment	171
	<i>Commonwealth v. Huggins</i>	172
	Comment	175
[D]	Negligence	175
	<i>People v. Howk</i>	175
	<i>State v. Goff</i>	178
	<i>United States v. Hanousek</i>	181
	Comments and Questions	185
§ 3.02	MISTAKE	185
	Commentary	186
[A]	Of Fact	187
	<i>United States v. Short</i>	187
	Problem	190
[B]	Of Law	191
	<i>United States v. Mancuso</i>	191
	<i>United States v. Clegg</i>	194
	<i>Ratzlaf v. United States</i>	196
	Comments	200

Table of Contents

§ 3.03	STRICT LIABILITY	201
	<i>Staples v. United States</i>	201
	Comment and Question	205
	<i>State v. Miller</i>	206
	Comments	208
§ 3.04	VICARIOUS LIABILITY	208
	<i>Davis v. Peachtree City</i>	208
	Comments	210
	<i>State v. Zeta Chi Fraternity</i>	211
	Comments	213
Chapter 4	PARTIES TO CRIMES	215
§ 4.01	THE OLD	215
	<i>Standefer v. United States</i>	216
	Comments and Questions	219
§ 4.02	THE NEW	220
[A]	The State of Mind	221
[1]	The Proof Problem	221
	<i>State v. Gladstone</i>	221
	Comments and Questions	225
[B]	What Is Enough Aid?	227
[1]	The Proof Problem	227
	<i>United States v. Garguilo</i>	227
	Comments and Questions	231
[2]	Words Alone	233
	<i>United States v. Kelley</i>	233
	Comments and Questions	236
[3]	Facilitation	237
	<i>Commonwealth v. Feinberg</i>	237
	Comments and Questions	239
[C]	The Scope of Responsibility	240
	<i>People v. Poplar</i>	240
	Comments and Questions	242
[D]	No Criminal Responsibility	243
[1]	Withdrawal	243
	<i>State v. Formella</i>	243
	Comments and Questions	246
[2]	Exceptions	247
	<i>Regina v. Tyrell</i>	247
	Comments and Questions	248
[E]	After the Fact Assistance	249

Table of Contents

	<i>People v. Duty</i>	250
	Comments and Questions	253
Chapter 5	PRINCIPAL OFFENSES	255
§ 5.01	THEFT OFFENSES	255
[A]	Larceny	255
[1]	Trespass	255
	<i>Topolewski v. State</i>	255
	<i>Fletcher, The Metamorphosis of Larceny</i>	259
	Comment	262
	<i>Hufstetler v. State</i>	262
	Comments and Questions	263
[2]	Taking	264
	<i>People v. Olivo</i>	264
	<i>People v. Rivera</i>	268
	Question	269
	<i>Thompson v. State</i>	269
[3]	Asportation	270
	<i>Caruso v. State</i>	270
	Comments and Questions	271
[4]	Personal Property	272
	<i>People v. Ashworth</i>	272
	Comments and Questions	274
	<i>Lund v. Commonwealth</i>	275
	Comments and Questions	278
	<i>Regina v. Stewart</i>	279
	Comments and Questions	283
	<i>United States v. Farraj</i>	284
	Questions	285
[5]	Of Another	286
	<i>State v. Cohen</i>	286
	Comments and Questions	287
[6]	Intent to Deprive Permanently	288
	<i>Chadwell v. State</i>	288
	Comment and Questions	289
	<i>State v. McGraw</i>	290
	Comments and Questions	292
[B]	False Pretenses	294
	<i>Brown v. Commonwealth</i>	294
	Question	295
	Problems	295

Table of Contents

	<i>State v. Clermont</i>	296
	Comments and Questions	297
	<i>People v. Whight</i>	297
[C]	Federal Fraud	301
	<i>United States v. Siegel</i>	301
	Comments and Questions	305
	<i>Carpenter v. United States</i>	306
	Comments and Questions	309
	Problem	309
[D]	Embezzlement	310
	<i>Briggs v. State</i>	310
	Comments	311
	<i>Batin v. State</i>	311
	<i>State v. Lough</i>	315
	Problems	318
§ 5.02	ROBBERY	319
	<i>State v. Sein</i>	319
	Comments	322
§ 5.03	EXTORTION	323
	<i>Rendelman v. State</i>	323
	Comments and Questions	331
	<i>State v. Greenspan</i>	331
§ 5.04	BURGLARY	333
§ 5.05	SEX OFFENSES	337
[A]	Rape	337
[1]	Context	337
	<i>State in Interest of M.T.S.</i>	338
	Comments and Questions	341
[2]	By Force	345
	<i>People v. Iniguez</i>	345
	Comments	350
	<i>Commonwealth v. Berkowitz</i>	352
	<i>In the Interest of M.T.S.</i>	354
	Comments and Questions	358
	<i>People v. Thompson</i>	359
	Comments and Questions	362
[3]	By Coercion and Fraud	363
	<i>Commonwealth v. Caracciola</i>	363
	Comments and Questions	365
	<i>State v. Bolsinger</i>	367
	Comments and Questions	370

Table of Contents

	Problem	371
[4]	Consent and Mistake	371
	<i>Commonwealth v. Lopez</i>	371
	<i>Commonwealth v. Fischer</i>	376
	Comments and Questions	380
[5]	Post-Penetration Rape	380
	<i>State v. Robinson</i>	380
	<i>State v. Bunyard</i>	384
	Comment	387
[B]	Statutory Rape	388
	<i>People v. Hernandez</i>	389
	Comments	391
	<i>Garrison v. Elo</i>	392
[C]	Prostitution	394
	<i>Commonwealth v. Dodge</i>	394
	Comments and Questions	397
	<i>State v. Kittilstad</i>	399
§ 5.06	HOMICIDE	403
[A]	The Killing of a Human Being	403
	<i>State v. Fierro</i>	403
	Comments and Questions	406
	<i>Washington v. Glucksberg</i>	409
	<i>Vacco v. Quill</i>	417
	Comments and Questions	419
	<i>Keeler v. Superior Court</i>	422
	Comments and Questions	428
[B]	Murder	430
[1]	Malice Aforethought	430
[a]	Intent to Kill	431
	<i>State v. Myers</i>	431
	Notes and Questions	434
[b]	Intent to Inflict Great Bodily Harm	435
	<i>State v. Thompson</i>	435
	Comments and Questions	437
	<i>People v. Geiger</i>	438
	Comments and Questions	440
[c]	Abandoned and Malignant (or Depraved) Heart	441
	<i>People v. Knoller</i>	441
	Comments and Questions	445
	<i>State v. Hemphill</i>	447
	Comments and Questions	450

Table of Contents

[2]	Felony Murder	453
[a]	Which Felonies	454
	<i>People v. Howard</i>	454
	Comments and Questions	457
	<i>Barnett v. State</i>	459
	Comments and Questions	463
[b]	During the Commission of a Felony	465
	<i>People v. Johnson</i>	465
	Comments and Questions	468
	<i>State v. Maudlin</i>	471
	Comments and Questions	473
[c]	The Extent of Responsibility	475
	<i>Jackson v. State</i>	475
	Comments and Questions	479
[d]	The Dissenting View	484
	<i>People v. Aaron</i>	484
	Comments and Questions	493
[3]	The Degrees of Murder	494
	<i>Austin v. United States</i>	494
	Comments and Questions	500
[4]	The Corpus Delicti	505
	<i>People v. Scott</i>	505
	Comments and Questions	511
[C]	Manslaughter	513
[1]	Voluntary Manslaughter	513
	<i>State v. Soto</i>	513
	Comments and Questions	516
	<i>People v. Najera</i>	518
	Comments and Questions	522
	<i>State v. Faulkner</i>	528
	Comments and Questions	530
[2]	Involuntary Manslaughter	531
	<i>Commonwealth v. Welansky</i>	531
	Comments and Questions	531
	<i>Commonwealth v. Konz</i>	536
	Comments and Questions	541
	<i>People v. Nelson</i>	545
	Comments and Questions	548
[D]	Causation	550
	<i>Commonwealth v. Root</i>	550
	Comments and Questions	554

Table of Contents

	<i>Brckett v. Peters</i>	558
	Comments and Questions	561
Chapter 6	THE INCHOATE OFFENSES	567
§ 6.01	SOLICITATION	567
	<i>Dickerson v. City of Richmond</i>	568
	Comments and Questions	571
	<i>People v. Gordon</i>	574
	Comments and Questions	577
	<i>People v. Latsis</i>	579
	Comments and Questions	581
	<i>People v. Rubin</i>	581
	Comments and Questions	585
§ 6.02	ATTEMPT	588
[A]	The Mental State	588
	<i>State v. Casey</i>	590
	Comments and Questions	596
	Problem	600
[B]	The Act Requirement	601
	<i>United States v. Lee</i>	602
	Comments and Questions	609
	<i>People v. Mahboubian</i>	610
	Comments and Questions	617
	<i>People v. Brown</i>	620
	Comments and Questions	622
[C]	The Completed Offense	626
	<i>Lightfoot v. State</i>	626
	Comments and Questions	629
[D]	Abandonment	632
	<i>People v. Staples</i>	632
	Comments and Questions	635
[E]	Impossibility	637
	<i>Commonwealth v. Henley</i>	638
	Comments and Questions	641
	<i>People v. Dlugash</i>	642
	<i>People v. Dlugash</i>	643
	Comments and Questions	646
	<i>United States v. Oviedo</i>	648
	Comments and Questions	652
§ 6.03	CONSPIRACY	655
[A]	The Mental State	656

Table of Contents

	<i>People v. McChristian</i>	656
	Comments and Questions	659
	<i>United States v. Feola</i>	662
	Comments and Questions	667
	<i>United States v. Bruno</i>	667
	Comments and Questions	668
[B]	The Agreement	670
	<i>Direct Sales Co. v. United States</i>	670
	Comments and Questions	675
	<i>State v. St. Christopher</i>	679
	Comments and Questions	683
[C]	Object of the Agreement	686
	<i>Commonwealth v. Donoghue</i>	686
	Comments and Questions	688
[D]	The Completed Offense	689
	<i>Albernaz v. United States</i>	689
	Comments and Questions	694
	<i>Pinkerton v. United States</i>	696
	Comments and Questions	700
Chapter 7	DEFENSES	707
§ 7.01	PRIVILEGES TO DEFEND	707
[A]	Self-Defense	707
	<i>People v. Goetz</i>	707
	Comments and Questions	712
	<i>State v. Rupp</i>	715
	Comments and Questions	720
	<i>Commonwealth v. Shaffer</i>	721
	Comments and Questions	723
	<i>Bechtel v. State</i>	726
	Comments and Questions	738
	<i>State v. Pride</i>	746
	Comments and Questions	748
	<i>People v. Cherry</i>	750
	Comments and Questions	755
[B]	Defense of Others	757
	<i>State v. Fair</i>	757
	Comments and Questions	760
[C]	Defense of Property	761
	<i>People v. Ceballos</i>	761
	Comments and Questions	764

Table of Contents

[D]	Defense of Habitation	766
	C. Carpenter, <i>Of the Enemy Within, the Castle Doctrine, and Self-Defense</i>	766
	Comments and Questions	769
[E]	Prevention of Crime	772
	<i>Tennessee v. Garner</i>	772
	Comments and Questions	780
§ 7.02	DURESS AND NECESSITY	781
	Problems	781
	<i>State v. Metcalf</i>	781
	Comments and Questions	783
	<i>United States v. Bailey</i>	785
	Comments and Questions	795
	<i>State v. Warshow</i>	798
	Comments and Questions	802
§ 7.03	ENTRAPMENT	805
	<i>Sherman v. United States</i>	805
	Comments and Questions	812
	<i>United States v. Russell</i>	813
	Comments and Questions	820
	<i>Jacobson v. United States</i>	821
	Comments and Questions	831
§ 7.04	INTOXICATION	832
	<i>Heideman v. United States</i>	832
	Comments and Questions	834
	<i>State v. Stasio</i>	836
	Comments and Questions	844
§ 7.05	THE INSANITY DEFENSE	846
[A]	The Formulations	847
	<i>M’Naghten’s Case</i>	847
	Comments and Questions	851
	<i>State v. Johnson</i>	858
	Comments and Questions	865
	<i>United States v. Brawner</i>	866
	Comments and Questions	873
[B]	Raising the Question	877
	<i>Freundak v. United States</i>	877
	Comments and Questions	882
[C]	Diminished Capacity	884
	<i>State v. Joseph</i>	884
	Comments and Questions	889

Table of Contents

[D]	Competency to Stand Trial	894
	<i>State v. Vannatta</i>	894
	Comments and Questions	899
	TABLE OF CASES	TC-1
	INDEX	I-1