UNDERSTANDING
EMPLOYMENT LAW
LexisNexis Law School Publishing
Advisory Board

Paul Caron  
Charles Hartsock Professor of Law  
University of Cincinnati College of Law

Olympia Duhart  
Professor of Law and Director of Lawyering Skills & Values Program  
Nova Southeastern University, Shepard Broad Law School

Samuel Estreicher  
Dwight D. Opperman Professor of Law  
Director, Center for Labor and Employment Law  
NYU School of Law

Steve Friedland  
Professor of Law  
Elon University School of Law

Joan Heminway  
College of Law Distinguished Professor of Law  
University of Tennessee College of Law

Edward Imwinkelried  
Edward L. Barrett, Jr. Professor of Law  
UC Davis School of Law

Paul Marcus  
Haynes Professor of Law  
William and Mary Law School

John Sprankling  
Distinguished Professor of Law  
McGeorge School of Law

Melissa Weresh  
Director of Legal Writing and Professor of Law  
Drake University Law School
Dedications

JMH: To Lynn, Noah, and Naomi, with love

PMS: To Mindy, Jake, and Izzy, who continue to provide constant inspiration and support for all my work

RAB: With love to Dennis and Emma
Preface

Barely 30 years ago, what today is known as “employment law” was known as “master-servant law.” The change of nomenclature is telling. Historically, “regulation” of the workplace amounted to little more than market forces and employer whims. The modern workplace, however, is governed by a complex and multifaceted legal framework that is continually evolving both as a result of federal and state statutes and as a result of decisions by state courts.

This book strikes a balance between comprehensiveness and selectivity. It provides the substantive material needed to succeed in practice and in the classroom and on final examinations, without overwhelming the reader with details that are unduly esoteric or tangential. The book begins with common-law employment doctrines such as employment at-will, employment contracts, employment torts, workplace privacy issues, and restrictive covenants. It then turns to federal and state statutory regulation of the workplace, covering topics such as compensation (including wage and hour legislation and unemployment insurance), employee benefits (including leave time, pensions, and health insurance), and workplace safety legislation.
Acknowledgments

The authors wish to acknowledge their intellectual debt to Steven Willborn, Stewart Schwab, John Burton, and Gillian Lester. Their LexisNexis casebook EMPLOYMENT LAW: CASES AND MATERIALS was the foundation upon which much of this UNDERSTANDING book was built.

Professor Bales thanks his co-authors, Jeff Hirsch and Paul Secunda, for their inspiration, gentle prodding, fine editing, and never-ending words of encouragement.

Professor Hirsch thanks his co-authors, Rick Bales and Paul Secunda, for their diligence, great editing, and, most importantly, good cheer throughout this project. He also is indebted to Steven Willborn for providing him the opportunity to take part in this project and to Leslia Caia and Casey Turner for their excellent research assistance.

Professor Secunda thanks his wonderful co-authors, Dean Joseph Kearney for his continual financial and institutional support of my work, and the authors of the Fifth Edition of the Willborn, Schwab, Burton & Lester book for providing a wonderful template for our own work.
# Table of Contents

## Chapter 1

### § 1.01 HISTORICAL OVERVIEW AND THE MULTI-LAYERED NATURE OF EMPLOYMENT LAW

- [A] At-Will Employment ..................................................... 1
- [B] Workers’ Compensation .................................................. 2
- [C] New Deal Federal Legislation .......................................... 2
- [D] Federal Antidiscrimination Legislation .............................. 3
- [E] Federal Legislation Setting Workplace Standards ................. 3
- [F] State Legislation and Common Law ................................... 4

### § 1.02 SCOPE OF THIS BOOK ............................................... 5

## Chapter 2

### § 2.01 EMPLOYEES VERSUS INDEPENDENT CONTRACTORS ............ 7

- [A] Introduction ..................................................................... 7
- [B] The Control Test .............................................................. 8
- [C] The Economic Realities Test .......................................... 10
- [D] Applying the Tests to Employment Laws ......................... 12

### § 2.02 COVERED EMPLOYEES .................................................. 14

- [A] Exclusion by Statute ....................................................... 14
- [B] Exclusion by Contract .................................................... 15
- [C] Contingent Workers ....................................................... 17

### § 2.03 COVERED EMPLOYERS ................................................ 18

- [A] Statutory Exemptions ..................................................... 18
  - [1] Certain Types of Employers ........................................ 18
- [B] Joint Employees ............................................................ 19
- [C] Leased Employees ......................................................... 20

## Chapter 3

### § 3.01 ENGLISH ORIGINS .................................................... 23

### § 3.02 HORACE WOOD’S TREATISE ........................................ 25

- [A] Contrasting Approaches ................................................. 25
- [B] Flexibility ..................................................................... 25
- [C] As Legal Scholarship ..................................................... 26
- [D] Explanations for the Rule .............................................. 26

### § 3.03 HISTORICAL APPLICATION ......................................... 27
Table of Contents

§ 3.04 MODERN APPLICATION .............................................. 28
§ 3.05 EVALUATING THE AT-WILL RULE ................................. 29

Chapter 4 CONTRACT EROSIONS OF EMPLOYMENT AT WILL ......... 31
§ 4.01 EXPRESS MODIFICATION OF AT-WILL CONTRACTS, WRITTEN AND ORAL ......................................................... 31
[A] Definite-Term Contracts .................................................. 31
[B] Oral Contracts ................................................................ 33
[C] Statute of Frauds .............................................................. 35
§ 4.02 PROMISSORY ESTOPPEL .................................................. 36
§ 4.03 RELIANCE AND IMPLIED-IN-FACT CONTRACTS ............... 39
[A] Disclaimers .................................................................. 40
[B] Amendments ................................................................. 42
§ 4.05 CONTRACT DAMAGES .................................................... 45

Chapter 5 TORT EROSIONS OF EMPLOYMENT AT WILL ........... 47
§ 5.01 INTRODUCTION .............................................................. 47
§ 5.02 WRONGFUL DISCHARGE IN VIOLATION OF PUBLIC POLICY .... 48
[A] Defining Public Policy ....................................................... 48
[B] Pigeonholing Public Policy Claims ....................................... 49
[1] Refusing to Commit an Unlawful Act ..................................... 49
[2] Exercising a Statutory Right ................................................ 50
[3] Fulfilling a Public Obligation ............................................... 50
[4] Whistleblowing ............................................................... 51
[a] Source of Legal Protection ................................................ 51
[b] Scope of Legal Protection ................................................. 52
[c] Burdens of Proof ........................................................... 53
[d] The Sarbanes-Oxley Act of 2002 ....................................... 53
[e] Whistleblowing Lawyers .................................................. 55
§ 5.03 INTENTIONAL INFLICTION OF EMOTIONAL DISTRESS ....... 56
[A] Introduction ................................................................. 56
[B] Elements ................................................................ 57
[1] Extreme and Outrageous Conduct ..................................... 57
[2] Severe Emotional Distress ............................................... 59

Chapter 6 GOOD FAITH AND FAIR DEALING ............................. 61
§ 6.01 IMPLIED COVENANT OF GOOD FAITH AND FAIR DEALING ...... 61
[A] Good Faith Not Applicable to At-Will Employment .............. 61
Table of Contents

[C] Good Faith Requires General Fairness ................................ 63
[D] The Restatement Approach ............................................. 64

Chapter 7  THE FUTURE OF WRONGFUL DISCHARGE LAW . . . 65
§ 7.01 A BRIEF REPRISE OF THE AT-WILL RULE .................... 65
§ 7.02 DEFENDING THE AT-WILL RULE ................................ 66
§ 7.03 CRITICIZING THE AT-WILL RULE .............................. 67
§ 7.04 ALTERNATIVES TO THE AT-WILL RULE ................. 68
§ 7.05 DISMISSAL STANDARDS IN OTHER COUNTRIES .......... 69

Chapter 8  EMPLOYEE FREE SPEECH AND POLITICAL
PROTECTIONS ................................................................. 71
§ 8.01 INTRODUCTION ...................................................... 71
§ 8.02 THE PUBLIC WORKPLACE ....................................... 72
[A] Public Employee Equal Protection Claims ...................... 73
[B] Public Employee Political Affiliation Protections ............ 75
[C] Public Employee Free Speech: The Connick/Pickering/Garcetti Line of
Cases ................................................................. 76
§ 8.03 THE PRIVATE WORKPLACE ....................................... 78
Political Protection ..................................................... 79
[B] Private Sector Employee Free Speech, the National Labor Relations Act,
and Off-Duty Conduct Statutes ........................................ 80

Chapter 9  EMPLOYEE PRIVACY PROTECTIONS ..................... 83
§ 9.01 INTRODUCTION ...................................................... 83
§ 9.02 PRIVACY CLAIMS ON-THE-JOB ............................... 84
[A] Public Employment ................................................... 84
[B] The Tort of Invasion of Privacy .................................... 87
[C] Wiretap Act and Electronic Communication and Privacy Act (ECPA) .... 88
§ 9.03 PRIVACY CLAIMS OFF-THE-JOB .............................. 91
[A] Legal Off-Duty Conduct ............................................. 91
[1] Common Law Protections ............................................ 91
[2] The Union Context .................................................. 92
[B] Romantic Relationships ............................................. 93
[C] Public Employee Sexual Privacy Claims in Light of
Lawrence v. Texas ..................................................... 94
§ 9.04 DRUG TESTING .................................................... 95
# Table of Contents

[A] Public Employees and the Fourth Amendment ........................................ 95
[B] Private Employees and Invasion of Privacy ........................................ 97
§ 9.05 POLYGRAPHS AND HONESTY TESTING ........................................... 99
[A] Polygraph Testing ................................................................. 100
[B] Honesty Testing ................................................................. 100
§ 9.06 GENETIC TESTING .............................................................. 102

Chapter 10 DEFAMATION AND EMPLOYMENT REFERENCES .......................... 105

§ 10.01 INTRODUCTION ................................................................. 105
§ 10.02 THE TORT OF DEFAMATION ................................................. 105
[A] The Basic Framework ............................................................. 105
[1] False and Defamatory Statement .................................................. 106
[2] Publication and Self-Publication .................................................. 106
[4] Special Harm ..................................................................... 107
[B] Conditional Privileges and Abuse of Privilege ................................. 108
[C] False Light Claims ................................................................. 109
§ 10.03 EMPLOYMENT REFERENCES .................................................. 109
§ 10.04 INVASION OF PRIVACY CLAIMS ............................................ 111

Chapter 11 THE DUTY OF LOYALTY, TRADE SECRETS,
COVENANTS NOT TO COMPETE, AND EMPLOYEE INVENTIONS .............. 113

§ 11.01 INTRODUCTION ................................................................. 113
§ 11.02 THE THEORY: OF HUMAN CAPITAL AND HIGH VELOCITY MARKETS ................................................................. 114
[A] Rubin and Shed on Human Capital ............................................... 114
[B] Hyde on High-Velocity Markets .................................................. 115
§ 11.03 THE DUTY OF LOYALTY AND THE MISAPPROPRIATION OF TRADE SECRETS ................................................................. 116
[A] Common Law Duty of Loyalty .................................................... 116
[B] The Tort of Misappropriation of Trade Secrets ............................... 118
§ 11.04 COVENANTS NOT TO COMPETE ........................................... 122
[A] Factors to Consider for Enforceability ......................................... 123
[1] Employer’s Legitimate Interest and Employee Unique Skills .......... 123
[2] Duration of Covenant ............................................................. 124
[3] Geographic Scope of Covenant .................................................. 125
[4] Adequate Consideration ............................................................ 126
[B] Special Issues Under Covenants Not to Compete Law .................... 126
[1] Employees Who Are Terminated ................................................. 126
### Table of Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>[2]</td>
<td>Blue-Penciling and Other Responses to Overbroad Covenants</td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[3]</td>
<td>Confidentiality and Non-Solicitation Agreements</td>
<td>128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[4]</td>
<td>Covenants in Employee Severance Agreements</td>
<td>128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[5]</td>
<td>Employer Suits Against Subsequent Employers</td>
<td>128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 11.05</td>
<td>EMPLOYEE INVENTIONS</td>
<td>129</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[B]</td>
<td>Contractual Agreements</td>
<td>130</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[C]</td>
<td>Statutory Law: The Case of California</td>
<td>131</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Chapter 12  REGULATION OF COMPENSATION AND LEAVE TIME  133

| § 12.01 | INTRODUCTION                                      | 134  |
| § 12.02 | FAIR LABOR STANDARDS ACT                        | 134  |
| [A]     | Coverage                                         | 135  |
| [B]     | Child Labor                                      | 138  |
| [C]     | Minimum Wage                                     | 140  |
| [D]     | Overtime                                         | 142  |
| [1]     | Salary Basis Test                                | 143  |
| [2]     | Duties Test                                      | 145  |
| [a]     | Executive Exemption                              | 146  |
| [b]     | Administrative Exemption                         | 148  |
| [c]     | Professional Exemption                           | 150  |
| [E]     | Determining Wage Rates                           | 152  |
| [F]     | Enforcement                                      | 156  |
| § 12.03 | WAGE PAYMENT LAWS                                | 157  |
| [A]     | Overview                                         | 157  |
| [B]     | Form of Wage Payment                             | 157  |
| [C]     | Wage Payment After Separation                    | 158  |
| [D]     | Restrictions on Assignment and Garnishment      | 158  |
| [E]     | Tips                                             | 160  |
| § 12.04 | FAMILY AND MEDICAL LEAVE ACT                     | 161  |
| [A]     | Coverage                                         | 162  |
| [B]     | FMLA Rights                                      | 162  |
| [1]     | Leave and Restoration                            | 163  |
| [3]     | Interference and Retaliation Prohibitions        | 165  |
| [C]     | Serious Health Condition                         | 166  |
| [D]     | Notice and Certification Requirements            | 168  |
| [E]     | Enforcement                                      | 171  |
### Table of Contents

#### Chapter 13  UNEMPLOYMENT AND WARN  

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>§ 13.01</td>
<td>INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>175</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 13.02</td>
<td>UNEMPLOYMENT INSURANCE</td>
<td>176</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[A]</td>
<td>History and Overview of Unemployment Insurance in the United States</td>
<td>176</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[B]</td>
<td>Disqualifications from Benefits</td>
<td>178</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[1]</td>
<td>Voluntary Separation</td>
<td>178</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 13.03</td>
<td>WORKER ADJUSTMENT AND RETRAINING NOTIFICATION ACT OF 1988 (WARN)</td>
<td>183</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[A]</td>
<td>Coverage and Notice Requirement</td>
<td>184</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[B]</td>
<td>Exceptions</td>
<td>186</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[1]</td>
<td>Faltering Company</td>
<td>186</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[3]</td>
<td>Natural Disaster</td>
<td>188</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[C]</td>
<td>Enforcement</td>
<td>188</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Chapter 14  EMPLOYEE BENEFIT PLANS UNDER ERISA  

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>§ 14.01</td>
<td>INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>192</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 14.02</td>
<td>EMPLOYEE RETIREE INCOME SECURITY ACT OF 1974 (ERISA)</td>
<td>194</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[A]</td>
<td>Statutory Structure</td>
<td>194</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[B]</td>
<td>ERISA Plans</td>
<td>195</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[1]</td>
<td>Types of ERISA Plans</td>
<td>195</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[2]</td>
<td>Plans Exempt from ERISA</td>
<td>196</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[C]</td>
<td>Plan Documents, Trust Requirements, and Plan Amendments</td>
<td>196</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[D]</td>
<td>Summary Plan Description (SPD) and Reporting and Disclosure Requirements</td>
<td>197</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 14.03</td>
<td>RETIREMENT PLANS</td>
<td>198</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[A]</td>
<td>Types of Retirement Plans</td>
<td>198</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[1]</td>
<td>Defined Benefit Plans</td>
<td>198</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[2]</td>
<td>Defined Contribution Plans</td>
<td>199</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[B]</td>
<td>Participation and Vesting Standards</td>
<td>201</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[1]</td>
<td>Minimum Participation Standards</td>
<td>201</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[C]</td>
<td>Plan Termination Issues and the PBGC</td>
<td>203</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[1]</td>
<td>Distress Terminations with Insufficient Assets</td>
<td>203</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[2]</td>
<td>Standard Terminations with Sufficient Assets</td>
<td>204</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 14.04</td>
<td>HEALTH AND WELFARE PLANS</td>
<td>205</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**Table of Contents**

[A] Introduction ............................................. 205
[B] Insured vs. Self-Insured Health Plans .................. 205
[C] Health Savings Accounts and High-Deductible Health Plans .... 206
[D] Retiree Health Care Issues .......................... 207
[E] COBRA and Continuation of Health Coverage .............. 208
[F] Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act (HIPAA) ... 209
[G] Patient Protection and Affordable Care Act of 2010 (PPACA) .... 210

§ 14.05 COMMON ISSUES TO RETIREMENT AND WELFARE PLANS .... 212
[A] Fiduciary Duties Under ERISA ........................ 212
[1] The Definition of an ERISA Fiduciary .............. 212
[2] Responsibilities of ERISA Fiduciaries .............. 214
[a] Basic Fiduciary Duties .......................... 214
[b] Co-Fiduciary Liability and Prohibited Transactions .... 215
[a] Early Retirement Plan Cases ...................... 216
[b] Participant Communication Cases .............. 217

[B] ERISA Preemption ........................................... 217
[1] Section 514 “Relates To” Language .............. 218
[3] The Deemer Clause ................................ 221

[C] ERISA Civil Enforcement Actions .................... 221
[1] Overview and Jurisdictional Issues .............. 222
[3] Claims for Fiduciary Breaches Under Section 502(a)(2) ...... 225
[4] Claims for Equitable Relief Under the Catch-All Provision .. 226
[5] Discrimination Claims Under Section 510 ........... 228

Chapter 15 SAFETY AND HEALTH .......................... 231

§ 15.01 INTRODUCTION ........................................ 231
§ 15.02 OCCUPATIONAL SAFETY AND HEALTH ACT (OSHA) ........ 232
[A] Coverage .............................................. 232
[B] OSHA Administration ................................ 232
[C] General Duty Clause ................................ 233
[D] OSHA Standards .................................. 234
[1] Promulgation of Standards .......................... 234
[2] Interim Standards ................................ 235
[4] Permanent Standards ................................ 236
[5] Variances ............................................. 238
[a] Technological Feasibility .................. 239
Table of Contents

[b] Economic Feasibility ............................................. 240
[c] Benefit to Employees’ Health and Safety ....................... 241
[d] Cost-Benefit Analysis ........................................... 243
[E] Employee Rights .................................................. 244
[F] Employer Responsibilities ....................................... 246
[G] Enforcement ...................................................... 247
[1] Procedures ........................................................ 248
[2] Recordkeeping and Inspections .................................. 249
[3] Penalties ........................................................... 250
[4] Imminent Danger .................................................. 251
[5] State Regulation of Safety and Health ......................... 252

Chapter 16 ENFORCEMENT OF EMPLOYMENT RIGHTS ......... 255
§ 16.01 REMEDIES .................................................... 255
§ 16.02 CHOICE OF ENFORCEMENT FORUM — AGENCIES OR COURTS ........................................... 256
[A] Administrative Agencies ......................................... 256
[1] Compensation versus Fines ...................................... 256
[2] Agency versus Court Adjudication ............................... 257
[B] Individual Enforcement .......................................... 257
[C] Hybrid Enforcement ............................................. 258

Chapter 17 ARBITRATION OF EMPLOYMENT DISPUTES ...... 259
§ 17.01 ARBITRATION GENERALLY ................................ 259
§ 17.02 A BRIEF HISTORY OF ARBITRATION IN LABOR AND EMPLOYMENT LAW ........................................ 260
§ 17.03 EMPLOYMENT ARBITRATION LAW TODAY ............. 262
§ 17.04 CURRENT ISSUES IN EMPLOYMENT ARBITRATION 264
§ 17.05 THE ADVANTAGES AND DISADVANTAGES OF EMPLOYMENT ARBITRATION ........................................ 266

Table of Cases ........................................................ TC-1

Index ................................................................. I-1