LEXISNEXIS LAW SCHOOL ADVISORY BOARD

Paul Caron
Professor of Law
Pepperdine University School of Law
Herzog Summer Visiting Professor in Taxation
University of San Diego School of Law

Olympia Duhart
Associate Professor of Law
Nova Southeastern University Shepard Broad Law School

Samuel Estreicher
Dwight D. Opperman Professor of Law
Director, Center for Labor and Employment Law
NYU School of Law

Steve Friedland
Professor of Law
Elon University School of Law

Joan Heminway
College of Law Distinguished Professor of Law
University of Tennessee College of Law

Edward Imwinkelried
Edward L. Barrett, Jr. Professor of Law
UC Davis School of Law

Paul Marcus
Haynes Professor of Law
William and Mary Law School

John Sprankling
Distinguished Professor of Law
McGeorge School of Law

Melissa Weresh
Director of Legal Writing and Professor of Law
Drake University Law School
INTRODUCTION TO TAXATION

SIXTH EDITION

WILLIAM D. POPKIN
Walter D. Foskett Professor Emeritus of Law
Indiana University Maurer School of Law
To my children
Carol, Meera, and Lionel
Preface to the Sixth Edition

Incorporation of the 2013 tax law. This sixth edition includes updates to the income tax law that were contained in the American Taxpayer Relief Act of 2012 (ATRA). ATRA was passed to prevent the expiration of the Bush Tax Cuts that were part of the 2001 Tax Law (and later laws) and the sequestering of government expenditures that were scheduled to take effect on January 1, 2013.

Introduction to (not just income) taxation. When I started out teaching at Harvard’s International Tax Program, it was obvious that the subject of taxation was much broader than the income tax. But when I suggested that the basic tax course should reflect the variety of available taxes, it aroused only skepticism. This edition includes my efforts — after some four decades of teaching — to overcome that skepticism. To that end, Part II of the coursebook deals with property taxes, the estate and gift tax, the Social Security (payroll) tax, the taxation of trusts and estates, corporate taxation, international tax issues, and multistate taxation. The treatment (necessarily) provides only a preliminary introduction but it should give the student a sense of the breadth of available taxes and their structure. It should also lay a useful foundation for advanced courses in those subjects. It can be taught at the end of the basic tax course or as a separate two-hour introductory course (or seminar).

Statutory interpretation. The bulk of the material in the coursebook continues to dwell on the income tax, with an emphasis on statutory interpretation. Tax law is the quintessential statutory course, originating solely from the legislative process and unencumbered by a common law tradition. In this respect, it differs from commercial law and criminal law. It is therefore an ideal vehicle for teaching statutory interpretation — either in the first year or in later years of law school.

I have drawn heavily on my own background as a legislation teacher and author of a Legislation casebook to provide the material on statutory interpretation. I do not mean to suggest that a study of tax law should be a substitute for a course in statutory interpretation; only that an understanding of the Internal Revenue Code and its application is vastly enhanced by an awareness of the statutory interpretation issues that recur in the case law. To that end, there are more than 25 separate statutory interpretation notes.

Lawmaking process. I have also tried to present the material in a way that makes the student aware of the lawmaking process in two major respects. First, the code is a document that is constantly changing. Students who are anxious to find some anchor amid the complexity are likely to look at the tax law as a still snapshot rather than as a moving picture and thereby overlook the fact that whatever they learn could become obsolete in the near future. The detail in the book is presented, not so that students can memorize the rules, but to give a rich sense of how Congress is constantly tinkering with the law. The Introduction, as well as subsequent chapters, describes the constant amendment process that has been typical of the income tax law. Second, income tax law is not only made by legislation. It also emerges from a variety of administrative and judicial sources. The book presents this avalanche of legal materials in a way that should make the student aware of their varying persuasive authority.

Pedagogy. This edition straddles the two approaches to teaching tax law. First, it
includes many problems that force the student to work out an answer, usually when the answer is clear but the rules are not easy to read. Even though this is unlikely to involve work that will be done by lawyers, it is still a useful way to provide a window on how the law is structured and how it attempts to solve important policy issues. The phantom tax rates, the earned income credit, and the “child care” credit are illustrations. Second, it presents material that forces the student to worry about the uncertainties in the law — often involving statutory interpretation — that is the traditional stuff of legal work.

This edition also straddles another pedagogical divide. This edition tries to reduce some of the complexity that appeared in earlier editions without oversimplifying the material. Too much complexity can get in the way of a useful introduction to tax law. Too little complexity can give a misleading picture of the challenges and the richness that tax law presents.

Finally, Chapter 6 (dealing with the processes by which income tax law is made) can be taken up as a unit or split into sections. The material discusses the legislative process, administrative rulemaking, adjudication, and the ethical responsibilities of tax practitioners. It follows Chapters 1-5, because the Chapter 6 material makes more sense after the student is exposed to the various sources of income tax law. But it also makes sense to consider a selection of this material immediately after a particular source of law is referenced — e.g., right after Treasury Regulations or Revenue Rulings are cited as legal authority. Either way works.
TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Part I</th>
<th>INCOME TAX</th>
<th>1</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Part I-A</td>
<td>BASIC CONCEPTS</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter 1</th>
<th>TAX BASE, TAX RATES, AND TAXABLE UNITS</th>
<th>5</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>§ 1.01</td>
<td>TAX BASE</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[A]</td>
<td>Taxable Income</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[1]</td>
<td>Standard Deduction</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[2]</td>
<td>Itemized Deductions</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[3]</td>
<td>Horizontal Equity</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[B]</td>
<td>Types of Deductions</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[C]</td>
<td>Deduction for Personal Exemptions</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[D]</td>
<td>Inflation Adjustments</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 1.02</td>
<td>TAX RATES</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[A]</td>
<td>Progressivity; Marginal Tax Rates</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Problem: Computing Taxable Income</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[B]</td>
<td>Effect of Deductions and Credits in a Progressive Tax</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[C]</td>
<td>“Phantom” Marginal Tax Rates</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[1]</td>
<td>In General</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[2]</td>
<td>Phase-out of Personal Exemption Deductions</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Problem: Disappearing Personal Exemption Deductions</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[3]</td>
<td>Itemized Deductions Phase-out</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[D]</td>
<td>Medicare Tax on “Unearned” Income</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 1.03</td>
<td>DEDUCTION FOR DEPENDENTS</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[A]</td>
<td>Dependent Children and the Taxable Unit</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[B]</td>
<td>Defining Support</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Bartsch v. Commissioner</em></td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Questions and Comments</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[C]</td>
<td>Divorced or Separated Parents</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[D]</td>
<td>Note on Statutory Interpretation — Statutory Purpose vs. Statutory Text</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 1.04</td>
<td>MARRIED UNITS</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[A]</td>
<td>History of Taxing Marital Units; Tax on Marriage</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Questions</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[B]</td>
<td>Untaxed Housework</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[C]</td>
<td>Defining “Marriage” for Tax Purposes</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Revenue Ruling 76-255</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Boyter v. Commissioner</em></td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[D]</td>
<td>Note on Statutory Interpretation — Technical Tax Meaning vs. Meaning</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
TABLE OF CONTENTS

Borrowed from Family Law ........................................... 21
[E] Spousal Relief from Tax Liability ............................ 22
[F] Constitutional Issues ............................................. 24
§ 1.05 EARNED INCOME CREDIT ................................... 25
§ 1.06 CHILD TAX CREDIT ............................................ 26
§ 1.07 COMPLEXITY .................................................. 27
§ 1.08 STATE INCOME TAXES ....................................... 28

Chapter 2 WHOSE INCOME IS IT ................................. 31
§ 2.01 INTRODUCTION ............................................... 31
§ 2.02 PERSONAL SERVICES ......................................... 31
Lucas v. Earl ......................................................... 31
Comments and Questions ........................................... 32
§ 2.03 PROPERTY TRANSFERS ....................................... 33
[A] Transfer of Entire Interest ....................................... 33
Blair v. Commissioner ................................................ 33
[B] Retained Control Over Property ............................... 34
[1] Trusts ............................................................. 35
[2] Partnerships ....................................................... 35
§ 2.04 DOMESTIC PARTNERS? ...................................... 36
§ 2.05 TRANSFERRING INCOME TO A CORPORATION ............. 37
Comments and Questions ........................................... 38

Chapter 3 DEFINING INCOME ................................... 41
§ 3.01 GROSS INCOME ............................................. 41
§ 3.02 BASIS ......................................................... 42
[A] Defining Basis — Basis of Property Received ................. 42
[B] Note on Statutory Interpretation — Plain Meaning vs. Tax Term of Art . 43
[C] Recovery of Basis ................................................. 43
Questions: Sale of Part of the Entire Property ................. 44
[D] Inflation .......................................................... 45
§ 3.03 WHAT IS INCOME — REALIZATION, DEFERRAL, AND TIMING . 46
[A] Income as “Realized” Income ................................... 46
Eisner v. Macomber .................................................. 47
Comments ............................................................ 48
[B] Value of Deferral .................................................. 49
[C] Demise of the Constitutional Realization Requirement ....... 50
[1] Expansion of Definition of “Realization” ....................... 50
[2] Statutory Deferral of Realized Income ......................... 51
TABLE OF CONTENTS

   Questions and Comments ........................................ 74
[B] Accessions to Wealth — Loans and Debts ....................... 74
   [a] The Explanation ................................................. 74
   [b] Nontaxation of Loans and the Nondeductibility of Interest ...... 75
   [a] Typical Embezzler ............................................... 76
   [b] White Collar Embezzler ......................................... 77
      Gilbert v. Commissioner ......................................... 77
      Questions ...................................................... 79
[C] Discharge of Indebtedness ......................................... 79
      United States v. Kirby Lumber Co. ............................ 80
   [1] Defer Taxation of Income; Basis Adjustment ..................... 80
   [a] Bankrupt and Insolvent Debtors .................................. 80
   [b] Solvent Debtors ................................................... 81
   [c] Student Loans .................................................... 82
   [2] Discharge of Debt Other Than by a Creditor ..................... 82
   [3] Distinguishing Sales Proceeds from Discharge of Indebtedness ... 82
      Questions ...................................................... 83
§ 3.07 ACCESSION TO WEALTH — PERSONAL CONSUMPTION ........ 84
[A] In-Kind Benefits; Subjective vs. Objective Value ............... 84
   [1] Prizes ......................................................... 84
   [2] Employees and Other Business Contexts ......................... 85
   [3] Trophies; Conversion to an Economic Asset ....................... 86
[B] Imputed Income .................................................... 87
[C] Barter Clubs ....................................................... 87
[D] Homeowners’ Insurance for Meals and Lodging .................... 87
   [1] Section 123 ..................................................... 87
      Questions ...................................................... 87
   [2] Note on Statutory Interpretation and the Political Process ........ 88
      [a] Judicial Interpretation Heading Off Legislation ............... 88
      [b] Prospective Statute and Interpreting Prior Law ............... 88
[E] Compulsive Gambler ................................................. 89

Chapter 4 GIFTS ...................................................... 91
§ 4.01 CASH GIFTS .................................................... 91
§ 4.02 DEFINITION OF GIFT .......................................... 91
[A] Detached and Disinterested ......................................... 91
   [1] Strike Benefits .................................................. 92
## TABLE OF CONTENTS

[B] Preventing Double Tax Benefit ........................................ 93

§ 4.03 APPRECIATED PROPERTY ........................................... 93

[A] Gain Property .............................................................. 93
   *Taft v. Bowers* ......................................................... 93
   Comment ................................................................. 94

[B] Loss Property ............................................................... 95
   [1] Sale of Loss Property Received as Gift ............................ 95
   [2] Note on Statutory Drafting ......................................... 95
   [3] Sale of Loss Property to Family Member .......................... 95

§ 4.04 DEATH ................................................................. 96

[A] Date-of-death Value as Basis ......................................... 96

[B] Diverging from Value Used for Estate Tax ............................ 96

[C] Income in Respect of a Decedent .................................... 97


[E] Gift Tax ................................................................. 97

§ 4.05 CARVED OUT INCOME INTEREST ................................. 98

[A] Gift of Carved Out Income Interest, Remainder to Another ... 98
   *Irwin v. Gavit* .......................................................... 98

[B] Carved Out Income Interest; Economic Reality .................... 99
   Question ................................................................. 101

[C] Note on Statutory Interpretation .................................... 101
   [1] Whole Text ........................................................... 101
   [2] Substantive Canons of Interpretation .............................. 101

[D] Gift of Carved Out Income Interest, with Retained Remainder 102
   [1] The *Horst* Decision ............................................... 102
   [3] Property vs. Personal Services ................................... 104
   [4] Interest Free Loans .................................................. 104

§ 4.06 SPLIT UNITS .......................................................... 105

[A] Splitting Income? .......................................................... 105

[B] Old Case Law ............................................................... 105
   [1] Alimony ................................................................. 105
   [2] Property Transfers .................................................... 106

[C] Statutory Rules ............................................................ 106
   Problem ................................................................. 108

Chapter 5 TAXABLE YEAR ................................................... 109

§ 5.01 INTRODUCTION ....................................................... 109

§ 5.02 NET OPERATING LOSSES ........................................... 110

§ 5.03 “TAX BENEFIT” RULE ................................................. 111

[A] Case Law ................................................................. 111
TABLE OF CONTENTS

| [B] | The Statutory “Tax Benefit” Rule | 111 |
| [C] | Note on Statutory Interpretation — Linguistic Canons (Expressio Unius); Statutory Analogy | 112 |
| § 5.04 | “TAX DETRIMENT” RULE | 113 |
| | Dominion Resources, Inc. v. U.S. | 113 |
| | Comments and Questions | 116 |
| § 5.05 | INCOME AVERAGING | 117 |

Chapter 6: LEGISLATIVE PROCESS, ADMINISTRATIVE RULEMAKING, THE ADJUDICATION SYSTEM, AND PROFESSIONAL ETHICS | 119 |
| § 6.01 | LEGISLATIVE PROCESS | 120 |
| [A] | The Origination Clause | 120 |
| [B] | How Congress Legislates Tax Law | 120 |
| [1] | The Legislative Process | 120 |
| [2] | Legislative History; Committee Reports | 121 |
| [C] | The Problem of Tax Expenditures | 122 |
| [1] | Definition | 122 |
| [D] | Tax Breaks, Equal Protection, and the Political Process | 128 |
| | Apache Bend Apartments, Ltd. v. United States | 128 |
| | Questions and Comments | 131 |
| [E] | Tax Breaks, the Political Process, and the Line Item Veto | 132 |
| § 6.02 | AGENCY RULEMAKING | 133 |
| [A] | Regulations | 133 |
| [1] | Can Taxpayers Rely on Revenue Rulings? | 137 |
| [3] | Revenue Rulings Interpreting Regulations | 139 |
| [4] | Other Agency Rulings | 140 |
| [C] | Letter Rulings; TAMs | 140 |
| [D] | Other Agency Guidance | 142 |
| § 6.03 | TAX LAW ADJUDICATION | 143 |
| [A] | Agency Level | 143 |
| [B] | Court Level | 145 |
| § 6.04 | ETHICAL RESPONSIBILITIES OF A REPRESENTATIVE | 147 |
| [A] | ABA Rules | 148 |
| [B] | Related Penalties | 149 |
| [1] | Substantial Understatement Penalty | 149 |
TABLE OF CONTENTS

[2] Return Preparer Penalty ........................................ 151
[C] Treasury Rules .................................................. 151

Part I-B PERSONAL CONSUMPTION AND BUSINESS EXPENSES ........................................ 153

Chapter 7 INCOME IN-KIND ........................................ 155

§ 7.01 MEALS AND LODGING ...................................... 155
[A] Case Law Background and Statutory Amendment; § 119 .... 155
[B] Business Premises .............................................. 157
  Lindeman v. Commissioner ........................................ 157
  Questions .......................................................... 159
[C] Convenience of Employer ..................................... 160
  Comments and Questions ....................................... 160
[D] Condition of Employment .................................... 161
[E] Cash vs. In-kind .................................................. 162
  Sibla v. Commissioner ........................................... 162
  Questions and Comments ....................................... 163
[F] Note on Statutory Drafting and Interpretation ............ 163

§ 7.02 EMPLOYEE FRINGE BENEFITS .............................. 164
[A] Legislative Background ....................................... 164
[B] Valuation .......................................................... 165
[C] The Statutory Exclusion Rules ............................... 165
  [1] No Additional Cost ........................................... 165
    Question .......................................................... 168
  [3] Parking .......................................................... 169
  [5] Employer Discounts .......................................... 169
  [8] Frequent Flyer Benefits ..................................... 170
[D] Nondiscrimination Rules ...................................... 171
[E] Cafeteria Plans .................................................. 172

§ 7.03 INTEREST-FREE LOANS .................................... 173

§ 7.04 PREPAID CONSUMPTION ................................ 174
[A] Prepayment for Fixed Dollar Value ........................ 174
[B] Prepayment for Uncertain Dollar Value .................... 175
[C] Prepaid Tuition Plans; § 529 ................................. 177
TABLE OF CONTENTS

Chapter 8  DEDUCTIONS FROM INCOME  ....................... 179

§ 8.01  INTRODUCTION  ........................................... 179
[A]  Statutory Rules  ............................................ 179
[B]  Exclusion vs. Deduction  ................................. 182

§ 8.02  DEFINING DEDUCTIBLE BUSINESS EXPENSES  .... 182
[A]  Two Cases: Child Care; Work Clothing ................. 183
    Smith v. Commissioner  ................................... 183
    Pevsner v. Commissioner  ............................... 184
[B]  “But For” Tests  ............................................ 186
    Question  .................................................. 187
[C]  Origin Test  ................................................ 187
    United States v. Gilmore  ............................... 187
    Questions and Comments  ............................... 191

§ 8.03  DEPENDENT CARE  ...................................... 192
[A]  Modern Statutory Rules  ................................. 192
    Questions and Comments  ............................... 192
[B]  Modern Case Law Evolution  ............................. 193
[1]  Canada  .................................................... 193
[2]  Note on Statutory Interpretation — The Impact of a Detailed Statute  .......... 194

§ 8.04  TRAVELING EXPENSES  ................................ 195
[A]  Meals and Lodging  ....................................... 195
[1]  Statutory Structure  ....................................... 195
    Rosenspan v. United States  .......................... 195
[2]  Note on Statutory Interpretation — Ordinary Usage  .... 200
[3]  Temporary Worker  ........................................ 201
[4]  Overnight  .................................................. 203
[5]  Introductory Language of § 162(a)  ...................... 204
[6]  Two Permanent Businesses  ............................... 207
[7]  Luxury Travel  ............................................. 207
[8]  50% of Meals Expenses Deductible  .................... 208
    Questions and Comments  ............................... 208
[B]  Transportation  ............................................. 209
[1]  Commuting  ............................................... 209
[2]  No Home  .................................................. 210
[5]  Foreign Travel  ........................................... 211
[6]  Travel as Education  ........................................ 211
[C]  Moving Expenses  ......................................... 212

§ 8.05  ENTERTAINMENT EXPENSES  ......................... 212
## TABLE OF CONTENTS

[A] Statutory Rules .................................................. 212
[B] Reimbursements .................................................. 215

§ 8.06 RECORDKEEPING .......................................... 215
[A] Application of Recordkeeping Requirements to Reimbursed Employees .................................................. 216
[B] Wage Withholding from Certain Reimbursements .................................................. 216

§ 8.07 HOME OFFICES ............................................. 216

§ 8.08 ESTATE PLANNING AND TAX DETERMINATION EXPENSES ............................................. 218
[A] Expenses with Multiple Purposes ............................................. 218
[B] Burden of Proof ............................................. 218
[C] Professional Ethics ............................................. 220

§ 8.09 BUSINESS AS PLEASURE ...................................... 220
[A] In General ............................................. 220
   Comments and Questions ............................................. 220
[B] An Artist ............................................. 221
   *Churchman v. Commissioner* ............................................. 221

Chapter 9 PERSONAL INSURANCE PROTECTION AND PERSONAL LOSSES ............................................. 225

§ 9.01 INSURANCE PROTECTION ...................................... 225
[A] Premiums Paid for Insurance ...................................... 225
[B] Employer-Purchased Insurance ...................................... 226
   [1] Life Insurance .................................................. 226
   [2] Medical and Disability Insurance .................................. 226
   [3] Self-Employed .................................................. 227

§ 9.02 PERSONAL LOSSES .............................................. 228
[A] Background .................................................. 228
[B] Uncompensated Losses .............................................. 229
   [1] Medical Expenses .................................................. 229
   [2] Medical Savings Accounts and Health Savings Accounts .................................................. 233
[C] Compensated Losses .............................................. 234
   [1] Loss of Life .................................................. 234
   [2] Medical Expenses .................................................. 235
   [4] Looking at Insurance Protection and Compensation Together .................................................. 236
      Questions .................................................. 236

§ 9.03 TORT RECOVERIES .............................................. 237
[A] Physical and Nonphysical Injury ...................................... 237
   [1] Nonphysical Injuries .................................................. 237
TABLE OF CONTENTS

[B] Telling the Jury that the Award Is Not Taxable? ........................................ 239
[C] Does an Unwanted Physical Touching Lead to a “Physical Injury?” ........ 239
   Private Letter Ruling 200041022 ......................................................... 240
[D] Punitive Damages ................................................................. 241
   [1] Current Law ................................................................. 241
   [2] Note on Statutory Interpretation — Drafting History ...................... 241
[E] Interest ................................................................. 242
[F] Wage Replacement .......................................................... 242
[G] Allocation of Damage Awards .................................................. 244
[H] Deduction of Plaintiff’s Attorneys’ Fees ........................................ 247
   [1] Are the Attorneys’ Fees Deductible at All? .............................. 247
   [2] Are Deductible Attorneys’ Fees Miscellaneous Itemized
       Deductions? ................................................................................. 247
   [3] Are the Attorneys’ Fees the Plaintiff’s Income in the First Place? . 248
[I] Recovery by Holocaust Victims .................................................. 248

Chapter 10 CHARITY ................................................................. 251

§ 10.01 CHARITABLE DEDUCTIONS .............................................. 251
[A] Rationale ................................................................................. 251
[B] Deductions as the Incentive Mechanism ....................................... 252
[C] Mechanics .............................................................................. 252
[D] Working for Nothing ............................................................ 254
[E] Charitable Giving and the Assignment of Income Doctrine ............... 255

§ 10.02 TAX-EXEMPT ORGANIZATIONS .................................... 256
[A] In General ................................................................................. 256
[B] Limits ....................................................................................... 256
   [1] Profitmaking; Unrelated Business Income .................................. 256
       [a] In General ............................................................................. 256
       [b] Advertising Income ............................................................ 257
   [2] For the Benefit of an Individual .............................................. 258
   [3] Political Activity ................................................................. 259
[C] Section 501(c)(3) — Defining “Charitable” .................................... 259
   [1] Public Policy ............................................................................. 259
       Bob Jones University v. United States ......................................... 259
       Questions and Comments ...................................................... 263
   [2] Note on Statutory Interpretation .............................................. 264
       [a] Literal Language vs. Plain Purpose ..................................... 264
       [b] Historical Context and Evolving Meaning ......................... 264
       [c] Legislative Inaction ............................................................ 265
       [d] Legislative History ............................................................ 265
       [e] Statutory Analogies ............................................................ 266

xvi
TABLE OF CONTENTS

§ 10.03 DEFINING “GIFTS” ...................................................... 266
[A] The “Quid Pro Quo” Test .............................................. 266
[1] What Is a Quid Pro Quo? ............................................. 266
Questions ................................................................. 267
[2] Payment More Than Quid Pro Quo ......................... 268
[B] Donor Control Over Gift; Donor Relation to Donee .... 268
[C] The Religious Quid Pro Quo ....................................... 270
[1] The Church of Scientology ......................................... 270
Hernandez v. Commissioner .......................................... 270
Comments and Questions .............................................. 272
§ 10.04 NONCASH GIFTS .................................................... 274
[A] Appreciated Property ............................................... 274
Problems ................................................................. 274
[B] Bargain Sale to Charity ............................................. 276
[C] Untaxed Property Given to Charity ......................... 276
Comments and Questions .............................................. 277

Part I-C SAVINGS ........................................................... 279

Chapter 11 DEPRECIATION ................................................. 281
§ 11.01 DEPRECIATION THEORY ......................................... 281
[A] Depreciable Assets .................................................. 281
[B] Computing Depreciation .......................................... 281
[C] Basis Adjustment ..................................................... 283
[D] Annuities — A Simple Example of Straight Line Depreciation 283
Questions ................................................................. 284
[E] Decelerated Depreciation ........................................... 284
[F] Property Purchased from a Spouse ............................ 285
§ 11.02 DEPRECIATION UNDER THE STATUTE ................ 285
[1] Pre-1981 .............................................................. 286
[C] Reasonable Method of Depreciation ....................... 289
[D] Intangibles; § 197 .................................................... 289
[E] Critique of Accelerated Depreciation as Economic Incentive 292
[1] Uniform Incentives? ............................................... 292
[2] Inflation ................................................................. 292
[F] When Does Depreciation Begin ............................... 293
[G] Collector-Antique Items Used in Business ............... 293
## TABLE OF CONTENTS

### Chapter 13  CAPITAL EXPENDITURE vs. CURRENT EXPENSE  . . 315

§ 13.01  INTRODUCTION .................................................. 315

§ 13.02  ACQUISITION COSTS ........................................... 316

[A]  Prepaid Expenses .................................................. 316

  Commissioner v. Boylston Market Ass’n .......................... 316

  [1]  Prepayment and Explicit Statutory Authority for Deduction 317

  [2]  Prepayment and Dissolution of Business ...................... 317

[B]  Tangible Property — Acquisition and Production Costs ........ 318

  [1]  Supreme Court .................................................. 318

    Commissioner v. Idaho Power Co. ............................... 318

    Comments ....................................................... 320

  [2]  Regulations ..................................................... 320

  [3]  Defending Title ................................................ 321


[C]  Intangible Property — Acquisition and Production Costs ........ 322

  [1]  The INDOPCO Case .............................................. 322

    INDOPCO, Inc. v. Commissioner ................................. 322

  [2]  The Reaction to INDOPCO; The New Regulations .............. 324

    [a]  Introduction ................................................ 324

    [b]  INDOPCO Regulations ..................................... 326

      [i]  Amounts Paid to Acquire or Create Intangibles; Treas. Reg. § 1.263(a)-4 .................. 326

      [ii]  Facilitating Acquisition of Trade or Business or Change in Capital Structure; Treas. Reg. § 1.263(a)-5 .................. 328


    [a]  In General .................................................. 330

    [b]  Elective Amortization — Section 195 ...................... 331

    [c]  Research and Development ................................ 332


§ 13.03  TANGIBLE PROPERTY — REPAIR/MAINTENANCE EXPENSES vs. COSTS FOR IMPROVEMENTS AND ACQUISITIONS ............ 333

[A]  What Is the Unit? .................................................. 333

[B]  Criteria for Distinguishing Deductible Repair Expenses from Capital Improvement Costs ........................................... 334

    [1]  Betterment .................................................. 334

    [2]  Restoration .................................................. 336

    [3]  Adapt to New Use .......................................... 337


§ 13.04  EDUCATION EXPENDITURES ................................... 339
### TABLE OF CONTENTS

[A] Trade or Business Expenses? ........................................... 339
  *Sharon v. Commissioner* .............................................. 340
  Comments ....................................................................... 341
[3] Prebusiness Expenses .................................................... 342
[4] Amortization ................................................................ 343
[5] Employer Fringe Benefit ................................................ 343
[B] Scholarships ................................................................. 344
[1] Services Required as a Condition of Scholarship .................. 344
  Comments ....................................................................... 345
[2] Qualified Tuition Reduction .............................................. 345
[3] A Closer Look at the Graduate Student ............................... 345
[C] Education Tax Subsidies .................................................. 346
[1] Hope Scholarship and Lifetime Learning Credits; Section 25A .... 347
[2] Coverdell Education Savings Accounts; Section 530 .............. 347
[3] Deduction for Qualified Higher Education Expenses; Section 222 . 348
[4] Preventing Multiple Tax Breaks ........................................ 349

Part I-D  LIMITS ON DEDUCTIONS .......................................... 351

Chapter 14  PUBLIC POLICY .................................................. 353

§ 14.01 ORDINARY, NECESSARY, REASONABLE, LAVISH ......... 353
[A] “Ordinary and Necessary” ................................................. 353
[1] “Extraordinary” as an Independent Limitation ....................... 353
  *Welch v. Helvering* ...................................................... 353
  Comment ....................................................................... 355
  Revenue Ruling 76-203 .................................................... 355
[2] Note on Statutory Interpretation — Substantive Canons of
   Interpretation .................................................................. 357
[3] “Reasonable” .................................................................. 357
[4] Note on Statutory Interpretation — Statutory Surplusage ........ 358
[B] Excessive Compensation — Reasonable Salary ..................... 359
[1] Note on Statutory Interpretation — Legislative History and Statutory
   Language .................................................................... 359
[2] Employees and Owners .................................................... 359
   [a] Multi-Factor Test ...................................................... 360
   [b] Section 162(m) ......................................................... 362
   [c] Compensation Paid by Health Insurance Providers .......... 362
[C] Lavish or Extravagant ....................................................... 362

§ 14.02 ILLEGAL ACTIVITY .................................................. 363
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

[A] "Tax Fines" ........................................................................ 363
[1] Policy ........................................................................... 363

[B] Expenses — Case Law .................................................... 363

[C] 1969 Legislation ............................................................... 364
[1] Illegal Payments, Etc. ..................................................... 365
   Comments and Questions ................................................. 365
   Comments and Questions ................................................. 367

[D] Expenses — Case Law .................................................... 363

[E] 1969 Legislation ............................................................... 364
[1] Illegal Payments, Etc. ..................................................... 365

[F] Illegal Payments, Etc. ..................................................... 365

§ 14.03 POLITICAL EXPENDITURES .................................... 371

[A] Nondeductible Business Expenses .................................. 371

[B] Getting Elected vs. Staying in Office .............................. 371
   Revenue Ruling 71-470 .................................................. 372
   Comments and Questions ................................................. 372

[C] Doing Your Political Job vs. Getting Elected .................... 373

[D] Lobbying ........................................................................ 373
[1] In General ...................................................................... 373
   [a] Legislative Lobbying .................................................. 373
   [b] Grass Roots Lobbying ................................................. 374
   [c] Administrative Lobbying ............................................. 374
   [d] Internal Costs ............................................................ 374
   [e] Preventing Avoidance of Business Expense Deduction Limits through Use of a Conduit .................................................. 375

[E] Charitable Deductions ..................................................... 375
[1] Election-Related ............................................................. 375
[2] Lobbying ........................................................................ 376
[3] Defining “Grass Roots” Lobbying ..................................... 376
   [a] Advocacy Groups ...................................................... 377
   [b] Action Groups .......................................................... 378

[F] Taxing Political Recipients and Organizations .................. 380
[1] Gifts to Political Campaign ............................................. 380
[2] Taxing Political Organizations ......................................... 380
   [a] Section 527 Organizations ........................................... 380
TABLE OF CONTENTS

Comment — Section 501(C) Organizations .......................... 380
[b] Defining “Exempt Function” ................................. 380

Chapter 15 EXPENSES TO PRODUCE TAX EXEMPT INCOME . 383
§ 15.01 GENERAL PRINCIPLE .................................. 383
§ 15.02 IS DEPRECIATION AN “EXPENSE”? .................... 384
[A] Section 212 vs. Section 167 ................................. 384
Manufacturers Hanover Trust Co. v. Commissioner ................. 384
[B] Note on Statutory Interpretation — Statutory Structure ...... 385
§ 15.03 “ALLOCABLE” TO EXEMPT INCOME ................. 385
Hughes v. Commissioner .......................................... 385
Comments ......................................................... 387
§ 15.04 EXEMPT REIMBURSEMENTS ............................. 388
Manocchio v. Commissioner ........................................ 388
Comments and Questions .......................................... 389

Chapter 16 LIMITING THE INTEREST DEDUCTION .......... 391
§ 16.01 PERSONAL LOANS ..................................... 391
[A] Background .................................................. 391
[B] Loans to Buy Personal Assets ............................... 391
[1] Renter ....................................................... 391
[4] Dilemma ..................................................... 392
[C] Statutory Rules ............................................... 393
[1] Qualified Residence Interest ............................... 393
[a] Education That Is Personal ............................ 394
[b] Employee Business? .................................. 394
[c] Interest on Income Tax Deficiencies ....................... 394
[3] Student Loans .............................................. 394
§ 16.02 INTEREST EXPENSE TO EARN TAX-EXEMPT INTEREST .... 395
[A] Section 265(a)(2) ........................................ 395
Revenue Procedure 72-18 .................................. 396
Questions and Comments ...................................... 399
[B] Critique of Disallowing Interest Deduction ................ 400
§ 16.03 LOANS FOR INVESTMENT PURPOSES ............. 401
[A] Statutory Rules .............................................. 401
[B] Tracing ....................................................... 402
[C] Carryover Limits? ........................................ 402
TABLE OF CONTENTS

[D] Global vs. Schedular Tax? .......................................................... 403
§ 16.04 ECONOMIC REALITY ......................................................... 404
[A] Case Law Limits ..................................................................... 404
    Goldstein v. Commissioner ...................................................... 404
    Comment — Out-of-Pocket Loss .............................................. 408
[B] Note on Statutory Interpretation — Tax Avoidance ................. 408
[C] Legislating the Economic Substance Rule ............................... 409

Chapter 17 LOANS, BASIS, AND TAX SHELTERS ......................... 413
§ 17.01 LOANS AND BASIS ............................................................. 413
[A] Debt Included in Basis ............................................................. 413
    Crane v. Commissioner .......................................................... 414
    Comments and Questions ....................................................... 417
[B] Note on Statutory Interpretation — Dictionaries and Statutory
    Structure ............................................................................. 421
§ 17.02 CRITIQUE OF INCLUDING BORROWED FUNDS IN BASIS ...... 422
[A] Tax Exempt Bond Analogy ....................................................... 422
[B] Tax Shelter Computations ....................................................... 423
[C] Policy Concerns Specific to Tax Shelter Borrowing ................. 425
§ 17.03 DEBT NOT INCLUDED IN BASIS ....................................... 426
[A] Contingent Debt .................................................................... 426
[B] Value Less Than Nonrecourse Debt ........................................ 426
    Estate of Franklin v. Commissioner ........................................ 426
    Comments and Questions ....................................................... 430
§ 17.04 TAX OWNERSHIP ............................................................... 430
[A] In General ............................................................................. 431
[B] Cases ..................................................................................... 431
    Frank Lyon Co. v. United States .............................................. 432
    Comment — Tax-Exempt Seller-Tenant ................................ 438
[C] Critique of Sale-Leasebacks as Tax Expenditures .................... 438
[D] Note on Statutory Interpretation — Technical Tax Meaning and Tax
    Administration ..................................................................... 439
§ 17.05 STATUTORY LIMITS ON A TAX OWNER’S TAX BENEFITS .... 439
[A] Limiting Deductible Net Losses to Financial Stake .................... 439
[B] Limiting Deductible Net Losses if Losses are “Passive” .......... 442
    Schaefer v. Commissioner ..................................................... 444
[C] Vacation Homes ..................................................................... 445
### TABLE OF CONTENTS

[D] Profit-Making Purpose? — Section 183 .................. 446

§ 17.06 NONSUBSTANTIVE LAW ATTACKS ON TAX SHELTERS .......... 447

[A] Penalties, Etc. ........................................... 447

[B] Ethical Rules ............................................. 447

[1] American Bar Association .................................. 447

Questions ...................................................... 448


§ 17.07 APPENDIX; TAX SHELTER EXAMPLE ................. 450

---

**Part I-E**

**THE ALTERNATIVE MINIMUM TAX** ................. 453

#### Chapter 18

**ALTERNATIVE MINIMUM TAX** ....................... 455

§ 18.01 THE GENERAL IDEA ......................... 455

§ 18.02 MECHANICS .................................. 455

[A] Tax Rates ........................................... 455

[B] Tax Base ............................................. 456

[1] Individuals and Corporations ............................... 456

[2] Individuals ........................................... 456

Comment .................................................... 457

[3] Corporations ........................................... 457


[5] Long-Term Capital Gains; Dividends ..................... 458

[C] Exemptions — Section 55(d) .............................. 458

[1] Amounts ............................................... 458

[2] Phase-Out ............................................. 458


[D] Credits ................................................. 459

[E] Tax Planning .......................................... 459

[F] The Problem of Deferral Tax Preferences .................. 459

[G] Impact on Incentives ................................ 460

§ 18.03 AMT “TRAPS” .................................. 460

Question ..................................................... 462

---

**Part I-F**

**APPRECIATION** ..................................... 463

#### Chapter 19

**NONRECOGNITION OF REALIZED GAIN** .............. 465

§ 19.01 INTRODUCTION ................................ 465

§ 19.02 NONRECOGNITION — MECHANICS ............... 465

Problems .................................................... 465

§ 19.03 LIKE-KIND EXCHANGES ......................... 466

xxiv
TABLE OF CONTENTS

[A] Statutory Coverage ........................................ 466
  Questions and Comments .................................. 467
[B] Administrative Rules ................................... 467
[1] In General ............................................... 467
[2] Realty ..................................................... 467
[3] Personalty ............................................... 468
[C] Sale vs. Exchange ....................................... 469
  Carlton v. United States ................................. 469
  Question ................................................... 471
[D] Note on Statutory Interpretation — Statutory Purpose; “Equity of the
    Statute” .................................................. 471
[E] Deferred Receipt of Like-Kind Property .............. 472
[F] Losses .................................................... 472
  [1] Sale-Leasebacks ....................................... 472
  [2] Sale or Loan ........................................... 473

§ 19.04 OTHER NONRECOGNITION PROVISIONS ............. 474
[A] Sale of Principal Residence; Exemption vs. Deferral ... 474
[B] Involuntary Conversions; Section 1033 .................. 474
[C] Corporation Organizations ............................... 476
[D] Miscellaneous ........................................... 477

Chapter 20 CAPITAL GAINS AND LOSSES — DEFINITION ...... 479

§ 20.01 PRIMARILY FOR SALE IN THE ORDINARY COURSE OF
  BUSINESS .................................................. 479
[A] Cases ....................................................... 479
  Biedenharn Realty Co. v. United States .................. 479
  Questions and Comments .................................. 487
  International Shoe Machine Corp. v. United States .... 487
  Comments .................................................. 489
[B] Note on Statutory Interpretation — Statutory Structure ...... 490

§ 20.02 TAXPAYER’S PERSONAL EFFORTS CREATE PROPERTY .... 490
[A] Copyright, Etc. ......................................... 490
[B] Blood, Etc. ............................................... 490
  [2] Property — Ordinary or Capital? ..................... 490
    Comments and Questions ................................ 491

§ 20.03 SECTION 1231 .......................................... 491
  Problems .................................................. 491

§ 20.04 SALE OF ENTIRE BUSINESS ........................ 492

§ 20.05 CAPITAL vs. ORDINARY LOSSES ..................... 493
[A] “Integral Part of the Business”? ....................... 493
**TABLE OF CONTENTS**

[B] Bad Debts .............................................. 494
[C] Transactional Approach ................................ 495
   Questions and Comments ................................ 495
§ 20.06 CASE LAW LIMITS ON CAPITAL GAINS ................. 496
   [A] Original Issue Discount/Market Discount ............. 497
   [B] Already Earned Income .................................. 497
   [C] Contract Rights ........................................ 498
      *Bisbee-Baldwin Corp. v. Tomlinson* .................... 498
      Comments and Questions .................................. 500
[D] Note on Statutory Interpretation — Technical Tax Meaning vs. Meaning
   Borrowed from Property Law .............................. 501
[E] Sale of Lottery Winnings ................................ 502
   Comments .................................................. 503
§ 20.07 “SALE OR EXCHANGE” ................................ 504
   [A] In General ............................................. 504
   [B] Close Cases ............................................. 505
      *Nahey v. Commissioner* ................................. 505
      Questions and Comments ................................ 507
§ 20.08 HOLDING PERIOD .................................... 508
   [A] Tacking ................................................ 508
   [B] Short Sales ............................................. 509

Chapter 21 DEFERRED PAYMENTS ................................. 511
§ 21.01 TIMING OF GAIN .................................... 511
   [A] Installment Method .................................... 511
      [3] Charge Interest for Tax Deferral .................. 513
      [5] Loans Secured by Installment Claims ............ 514
   [B] Closed Transaction; Equivalent of Cash ............. 514
   [C] Open Transaction ...................................... 515
   [D] Regulation — Installment Method Not Used ........ 515
      Comments ................................................ 516
§ 21.02 ORDINARY INCOME OR CAPITAL GAIN ..................... 517
§ 21.03 DISTINGUISHING SALES PROCEEDS FROM INTEREST .... 518
   [A] Section 1274 .......................................... 518
      [1] Actual Value ......................................... 518
      [2] Present Value Formula .............................. 519
   [B] Section 483 ............................................ 519
§ 21.04 CONTINGENT PAYMENTS ................................. 520
### TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>[A]</td>
<td>Contingent Payments and Installment Method</td>
<td>520</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[B]</td>
<td>Contingent Payments and Capital Gain</td>
<td>521</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[C]</td>
<td>Contingent Payments and Imputed Interest</td>
<td>521</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**§ 21.05** DEFERRAL, CAPITAL GAINS, AND PERSONAL SERVICE INCOME

- [A] Restricted Property                                          | 522  |
- [B] Options                                                      | 523  |
- [C] Incentive Stock Options                                      | 524  |
- [D] Carried Interests                                            | 524  |

**Chapter 22** CARVED OUT INCOME INTERESTS

- **§ 22.01** THE PROBLEM                                          | 525  |
- **§ 22.02** THE SOLUTIONS                                       | 527  |
- [A] Sale of Income Interest — Retained Remainder                 | 527  |
- [B] Income and Remainder Interests Acquired by Gift              | 531  |
- [1] Depreciation of Income Interest?                             | 531  |
- [2] Sale of Income Interest                                      | 531  |
- [C] Other Carve Out Situations                                   | 532  |
- [1] Statutory Provision — Section 167(e) (No Depreciation)        | 532  |
- [D] Gift of Income Interest — Retained Remainder                 | 534  |
- [E] Section 1286                                                 | 534  |
- **§ 22.03** SELLING “LESS THAN ALL”                              | 535  |
- *Hort v. Commissioner*                                           | 535  |
- Comments and Questions                                          | 536  |

**Part I-G** TIMING

**Chapter 23** INTRODUCTION TO ACCOUNTING METHODS; WHAT IS AT STAKE

- **§ 23.01** CASH AND ACCRUAL; CLEARLY REFLECT INCOME              | 539  |
- [A] Cash                                                         | 539  |
- [B] Accrual — Accession to Wealth                                | 539  |
- [C] Clearly Reflect Income                                      | 540  |
- **§ 23.02** MANDATORY USE OF ACCRUAL ACCOUNTING                  | 540  |
- [A] Which Taxpayers Must Accrue                                  | 540  |
- [1] In General                                                  | 540  |
- [2] Farming                                                     | 540  |
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

§ 24.06 QUALIFIED RETIREMENT PLANS ........................................ 562
  [A] Introduction ........................................... 562
  [B] No Tax Now; Taxable Later ....................................... 563
  [1] Qualified Retirement Plans ...................................... 563
  [2] Traditional IRAs ........................................... 563
  [3] Cash or Deferred Arrangement (CODA) .......................... 564
  [4] Medical Savings Accounts (MSAs) .............................. 564
  [5] Qualified Charitable Distributions from IRAs .................. 565
  [C] Nondeductible Now; Exempt Later .............................. 565
  [1] Roth IRAs .............................................. 565
  [2] Rollovers into Roth IRA ...................................... 566

Chapter 25 ACCRUAL METHOD ............................................. 567

§ 25.01 INCOME ......................................................... 568
  [A] Before Cash Is Received ....................................... 568
     Continental Tie & Lumber Co. v. United States ................ 568
     Globe Corporation v. Commissioner ............................... 570
     Comments and Questions ....................................... 570
  [B] When Cash Is Received ....................................... 572
     [1] Case Law .............................................. 573
        American Automobile Ass’n v. United States ............... 573
     [2] Post-AAA Developments .................................... 574
        [a] Case Law ............................................ 575
        [b] Statute ............................................. 575
        [c] Agency Rules ......................................... 575
           [i] Personal Services .................................. 575
           [ii] Other Prepaid Income ............................... 576
              Comments and Questions .............................. 576

§ 25.02 DEDUCTIONS ..................................................... 579
  [A] When Cash Is Paid ........................................... 579
     Comment ................................................... 579
  [B] Before Cash Is Paid ........................................... 579
     [1] Case Law .............................................. 579
        United States v. General Dynamics Corp. ................ 580
        Comment .............................................. 581
     [2] The Problem and Possible Solutions ....................... 581

Part II TAXES OTHER THAN INDIVIDUAL INCOME TAXES .......................... 585

Part II-A TAXATION OF PROPERTY ........................................ 587
## TABLE OF CONTENTS

| § 26.01   | HISTORICAL NOTE ......................................... | 589 |
| § 26.02   | COMPUTING THE TAX ...................................... | 590 |
| § 26.03   | VALUATION DISPARITIES ................................ | 591 |
| [A]       | Full Value vs. Fractional Assessment .................. | 591 |
| [B]       | Fractional Assessment Varies Among and Within Classes | 591 |
| [C]       | Why Is Fractional Assessment So Common? .............. | 591 |
|           | [1] Intra-Unit Variation ................................ | 591 |
|           | [2] Increased State Aid ................................ | 591 |
|           | [3] Tax Preferences ................................... | 592 |
|           | [4] Inertia ............................................. | 592 |
|           | [6] Difficulty in Getting a Taxpayer Remedy ......... | 593 |
| § 26.04   | STATE LAW ABOUT NONUNIFORM TAXATION ................ | 593 |
| [A]       | Full Value ............................................ | 593 |
|           | _Hellerstein v. Assessor of the Town of Islip_ ........ | 593 |
| [B]       | Unequal Fractional Assessments and State Uniformity Clauses | 596 |
|           | [1] An Example ......................................... | 596 |
|           | [2] Doing the Math .................................... | 597 |
|           | Comment ................................................ | 598 |
| [C]       | Permitting Some Nonuniform Tax Preferences — Low Income Taxpayers, Homeowners, and Farmers | 599 |
|           | [1] Progressivity; Circuit Breakers .................. | 599 |
|           | [2] Homestead Exemption or Credit .................... | 599 |
| § 26.05   | FEDERAL CONSTITUTIONAL RULES ........................ | 600 |
| [A]       | Interstate Issues ..................................... | 600 |
| [B]       | Federal Uniformity Clause ............................ | 600 |
| [C]       | Equal Protection ...................................... | 601 |
|           | _Nordlinger v. Hahn_ .................................. | 601 |
|           | Comments .............................................. | 603 |
| § 26.06   | VALUATION METHODS ................................. | 604 |
| [A]       | Sales Price ........................................... | 605 |
|           | [1] Comparable Sales .................................. | 605 |
|           | [2] Highest and Best Use ............................ | 606 |
|           | [1] “Specialty” Property ............................ | 606 |
|           | Comments and Questions ............................ | 609 |
| [C]       | Capitalize Income .................................... | 610 |
TABLE OF CONTENTS

[D] Property Subject to Burdens ........................................... 610
[1] Leases and Mortgages .................................................. 610
[3] Easements ............................................................... 611

Chapter 27 ................................................................. 615

§ 27.01 A BRIEF EXPLANATION ........................................... 615
[A] History ................................................................. 615
[B] Exemptions ............................................................ 616
[C] Marital Deduction ..................................................... 616
[D] Politics of Estate Tax Repeal ......................................... 617
[E] Tax on Property Transfer ............................................. 617

§ 27.02 GIFT TAX .......................................................... 618
[A] Purpose ................................................................. 618
[B] Unified Rate Structure ................................................ 618
[C] Exclusions ............................................................. 618

§ 27.03 ESTATE TAX BASE ............................................... 619
[A] Ownership ............................................................. 619
[B] Retaining Control ...................................................... 619
[C] Valuation ............................................................... 621
[1] The Relevant Date ..................................................... 621
[2] Determining Value .................................................... 621
[a] Buy-out Option ....................................................... 621
   Estate of Godley v. Commissioner ................................ 622
[b] Marketability Discount .............................................. 623
[c] Minority Discount ................................................... 623
   Estate of Godley v. Commissioner ................................ 623
[d] Estate “Freezes” ...................................................... 626
[D] Deductions ............................................................ 627
[1] Marital Deduction ..................................................... 627
[2] Charitable Deduction ................................................ 628

§ 27.04 GENERATION-SKIPPING TAX .................................. 628
§ 27.05 A TAX ON NET WEALTH? ...................................... 628

Part II-B ................................................................. 631

Chapter 28 ................................................................. 633

§ 28.01 IN GENERAL ....................................................... 633
§ 28.02 “WAGES” .......................................................... 634
[A] In-Kind Remuneration ............................................... 634
### TABLE OF CONTENTS

Questions and Comments ............................................... 635

[B] Severance Payments for Teachers ................................. 636
   Appoloni v. United States .................................. 636
   Comments and Questions .................................. 639

§ 28.03 “EMPLOYEE” .................................................. 640

[A] Common Law Standard ........................................... 640
   [1] 20 Factors .................................................. 641
      Revenue Ruling 87-41 ........................................ 641
      [a] Secretaries ............................................. 644
         [i] Employee of Law Firm .................................. 644
            Private Letter Ruling 8606030 ......................... 644
         [ii] Employee of Agency .................................. 645
      [b] Nurses .................................................. 646
         [i] Licensed or Registered Nurse as Independent Contractor .... 646
         [ii] Unlicensed Nurse’s Aides as Employee ......... 647
            Question .............................................. 647
         [iii] Licensed Nurse as Employee of Referring Agency ....... 647
            Revenue Ruling 75-101 ................................ 647
      [c] Models — As Independent Contractors; or as Employees of Referring Agency .......................... 649
      [d] Babysitters ............................................. 649
         [i] Is the Babysitter an Employee of the Parents? ......... 649
         [ii] Is the Babysitter an Employee of the Referring Agency? .... 650
      [e] Adult entertainment booth performers .................. 651
[B] Employer’s Consistent and Reasonable Treatment as Non-Employee ........ 651
[C] Are Medical Residents Eligible for “Student” Exception? ........ 652

Part II-C TAXES ON CONSUMPTION ............................... 653

Chapter 29 SALES TAX ............................................. 655

§ 29.01 THE TAXPAYER AND TAX RATES ......................... 655
§ 29.02 TAXING JURISDICTION .................................. 655
§ 29.03 TAX BASE .................................................. 656
   [A] Primarily Tangible Personal Property ..................... 656
      [1] Real Estate ............................................. 656
      [2] Services .............................................. 656
      [3] Intangibles ............................................. 657
      [4] Lease or Rental ........................................ 657
   [B] Business Inputs ........................................... 657
**TABLE OF CONTENTS**

[C] Fringe Benefits .............................................. 658
[D] Consumer Durables ........................................... 659
[1] Present Value of Future Consumption ......................... 659
[2] Casualty Loss .................................................. 659
[3] Trade-In ......................................................... 659
[E] Interstate Problems ............................................. 660

§ 29.04 TAXABLE SALES OF TANGIBLE PERSONAL PROPERTY .... 661
[A] Tangible Personal Property vs. Services ......................... 661
[1] Some Tests .................................................... 661
[a] True Object; Dominant Purpose; Essence of Transaction .... 661
[b] Inconsequential Materials ..................................... 662
[c] Common Understanding ......................................... 662
[2] Some Factual Settings .......................................... 663
[a] Relevance of Custom-Made? ................................. 663
   *Southern Bell Tel. & Tel. Co. v. Department of Revenue* ...... 663
   Comments ...................................................... 666
[b] Services and Product Separate .............................. 666

[B] Tangible or Intangible Personal Property ....................... 667

§ 29.05 USE TAX AND CONSTITUTIONAL LAW .................. 676
[A] Avoiding Double Taxation .................................. 676
[B] Collection Problems — Interstate Issues ..................... 676
[1] In General .................................................... 676
   *Quill Corp. v. North Dakota* ................................ 677
[2] Use of Independent Contractors ............................. 683
   *Amazon.com LLC v. New York State Dept. of Taxation and Finance* ... 684

Chapter 30 VALUE ADDED TAX ................................. 687

§ 30.01 THE TAXPAYER AND THE TAX BASE ..................... 687
§ 30.02 A BRIEF HISTORY OF THE VAT ......................... 687
§ 30.03 METHODS OF COMPUTING THE TAX ..................... 688
[A] Credit Method ............................................... 688
[1] Credit Method Helps Administration? ....................... 689
TABLE OF CONTENTS

[B] Subtraction Method ........................................ 689
[C] Addition Method — Michigan .............................. 690

§ 30.04 TAX BASE ISSUES .................................... 690
[A] Capital Goods .................................................. 690
[B] Personal Consumption ...................................... 691
[1] Fringe Benefits .............................................. 691
[2] Hobbies ......................................................... 691
[C] Residential Use ............................................... 692
[1] The Income Tax ............................................... 692
[D] Consumer Durables .......................................... 693
[E] Trade-Ins and Sales to Dealers .............................. 693

§ 30.05 ZERO-RATING AND EXEMPTIONS .................... 694
[A] Zero-Rating (and Multiple Rates) ......................... 694
[B] Exemptions .................................................... 695
[1] Scope of Exemptions ......................................... 695
[a] Product or Service .......................................... 695
[b] Entity .......................................................... 695
[c] Size of Provider .............................................. 695
[2] Impact of Exemptions ........................................ 695
[a] Exemption Before Taxable Sales ........................... 696
[b] Exemption Between Taxable Sales ......................... 696
[c] Exemption of the Last Taxable Sale ....................... 697
[C] Accounting Allocations ..................................... 697
[1] Inputs .......................................................... 697
[2] Sales Price ..................................................... 697

§ 30.06 TIMING ..................................................... 698

§ 30.07 FINANCIAL SERVICES ................................ 698

Chapter 31 CONSUMPTION TAX ............................ 701

§ 31.01 BACKGROUND ........................................ 701
§ 31.02 EX ANTE OR EX POST? .............................. 702
[A] Ex Ante Might Equal Ex Post .............................. 702
[B] Sometimes Ex Ante Is Best — Homes and Consumer Durables 703
[1] Gain .......................................................... 703
[3] Reinvestment .................................................. 704
§ 31.03 AVERAGING ............................................. 705
§ 31.04 BUSINESS vs. PERSONAL USE ................. 705

xxxiv
TABLE OF CONTENTS

[A] Fringe Benefits; Personal Expenses ............................... 705
[B] Dual Personal and Business or Investment Assets .............. 706
§ 31.05 LOANS .................................................. 706
§ 31.06 GIFTS .................................................. 707
§ 31.07 PRESERVING TAX INCENTIVES .............................. 707
[A] Business or Investment Activities ............................... 707
[1] Exempt Income ............................................. 708
[2] Credits? .................................................... 709
[B] Tax-preferred Personal Expenses ............................... 709
§ 31.08 CORPORATE TAXATION ................................... 710
§ 31.09 TRANSITION ............................................. 710

Part II-D  ENTITY TAXATION ................................. 713

Chapter 32  PARTNERSHIPS, TRUSTS AND ESTATES ............ 715

§ 32.01 PARTNERSHIPS ............................................. 715
[A] Organization ............................................... 715
[B] Pass-Through Entity ....................................... 715
[1] Character of Items, Including Capital Gains ................... 716
[2] Basis Adjustments ......................................... 716
[3] Contributed Property with Inherent Gain or Loss ............ 716
[5] Net Operating Losses ....................................... 717
[6] Distribution of Inventory ..................................... 718
[7] Publicly Traded Partnerships .................................. 718
[C] Accounting Issues ........................................... 718
[1] Taxable Year ............................................... 718
[2] Accounting Methods — Partnership Not Always a Conduit ... 719
[D] Partner Dealing with Partnership ............................... 719
[1] Nonpartner Capacity ........................................ 719
[a] In General ................................................. 719
[b] Employee Fringe Benefits .................................. 720
[E] Income Shifting ............................................... 720
[F] Disposition of a Partnership Interest ......................... 721
[1] Sale ......................................................... 721
[2] Like-Kind Exchange ........................................ 721
[3] Distributions in Liquidation of a Partner’s Interest ......... 721
[4] Abandonment or Worthless Interest ........................... 722
§ 32.02 TRUSTS AND ESTATES ................................. 722
[A] Computing Trust and Estate Income ........................... 722
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>[B]</td>
<td>Tax Rates</td>
<td>723</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[C]</td>
<td>Taxing Beneficiaries on Distributions</td>
<td>723</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[1]</td>
<td>Trusts</td>
<td>723</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[a]</td>
<td>“Simple Trusts”</td>
<td>723</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[b]</td>
<td>“Complex Trusts”</td>
<td>725</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[2]</td>
<td>Estates</td>
<td>726</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Chapter 33 CORPORATE INCOME TAX

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>§ 33.01</td>
<td>COMPUTING THE CORPORATE TAX</td>
<td>727</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[A]</td>
<td>Taxable Income</td>
<td>727</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[B]</td>
<td>Tax Rates</td>
<td>728</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[C]</td>
<td>Alternative Minimum Tax</td>
<td>728</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[D]</td>
<td>Effective U. S. Corporate Tax Rates</td>
<td>729</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 33.02</td>
<td>DOUBLE TAXATION OF DISTRIBUTED PROFITS</td>
<td>729</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[A]</td>
<td>An Example</td>
<td>729</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[B]</td>
<td>Some Further Complexities</td>
<td>730</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[C]</td>
<td>Does the Corporation Have a Taxpaying Capacity?</td>
<td>731</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[D]</td>
<td>Corporate Shareholders</td>
<td>731</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[E]</td>
<td>Accumulated Earnings Tax</td>
<td>731</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[F]</td>
<td>Identifying a Dividend</td>
<td>731</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[G]</td>
<td>Providing Use of an Asset</td>
<td>732</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 33.03</td>
<td>PREVENTING DOUBLE TAXATION</td>
<td>732</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[A]</td>
<td>Self-Help — Shareholders Receive Deductible Payments</td>
<td>732</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[B]</td>
<td>Subchapter S Election</td>
<td>734</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[C]</td>
<td>Proposals to Relieve Double Taxation</td>
<td>736</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 33.04</td>
<td>DEFINING A “CORPORATION” vs. A PASS-THROUGH ENTITY</td>
<td>738</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 33.05</td>
<td>CONVERTING DIVIDENDS TO CAPITAL GAINS</td>
<td>738</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[A]</td>
<td>Complete Liquidation</td>
<td>739</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[B]</td>
<td>Redemption of Stock</td>
<td>739</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[1]</td>
<td>Similar to a Dividend</td>
<td>739</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[2]</td>
<td>Dividend to Non-Redeemed Shareholder</td>
<td>740</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 33.06</td>
<td>CONTRIBUTIONS TO CAPITAL</td>
<td>741</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[A]</td>
<td>Contribution as Shareholder</td>
<td>742</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[B]</td>
<td>Contribution in Nonshareholder Capacity</td>
<td>742</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[1]</td>
<td>Taxable vs. Nontaxable</td>
<td>742</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[2]</td>
<td>Nontaxable</td>
<td>743</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 33.07</td>
<td>CORPORATE REORGANIZATIONS</td>
<td>744</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[A]</td>
<td>In General</td>
<td>744</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[B]</td>
<td>Acquisitive Reorganization</td>
<td>745</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[C]</td>
<td>Divisive Reorganization</td>
<td>747</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[1]</td>
<td>Business Purpose; Tax Avoidance</td>
<td>747</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## TABLE OF CONTENTS

*Helvering v. Gregory* ........................................ 747
Comments .................................................. 749

**Part II-E**

MULTI-JURISDICTIONAL ISSUES ................. 753

**Chapter 34**

INTERNATIONAL TAXATION ..................... 755

§ 34.01 TAXING THE WORLDWIDE INCOME OF “RESIDENTS” ........ 755
[B] Avoiding Double Tax; Foreign Tax Credit (FTC) ............ 756
  [1] Mechanics; Limitation on FTC .......................... 757
    [a] Limitation Fraction ............................... 757
    [b] Different Baskets ................................. 758
    [c] Allocation of Deductions ......................... 760
    [a] Carryovers ....................................... 760
    [b] Deductible Foreign Taxes; FTC is Elective ......... 760
    [c] Foreign and U.S. Losses ......................... 760
    [d] Alternative Minimum Tax ........................... 761
    [a] Is it a Tax? ....................................... 761
    [b] Is it an “Income” Tax? ............................. 761
    [c] “In Lieu of” Income Taxes ......................... 762
    [d] Soak-Up Tax ....................................... 762
  [4] Indirect FTC ....................................... 762
  [5] Check-a-Box and the Foreign Tax Credit ................... 763
[C] Avoiding Double Tax; Exempting Foreign Income ............ 763
  [1] European Practice .................................. 763
  [2] U.S. Practice; Foreign Subsidiaries .................... 764
  [3] U.S. Practice; Exemption ............................. 764
  [4] Preventing U.S. corporations from “migrating” abroad .... 764

§ 34.02 TAXING NONRESIDENTS ON INCOME ARISING WITHIN THE TAXING JURISDICTION ..................... 765
[A] Effectively Connected with a U.S. Trade or Business ........ 765
  [1] U.S. Trade or Business ............................. 765
    [a] Sale of Inventory ................................ 765
    [b] Agent ............................................. 766
  [2] Effectively Connected ............................. 766
    [a] U.S. Office ..................................... 766
    [b] “Force of Attraction” ............................. 767
    [c] Investment-Type Business Income .................. 767
**TABLE OF CONTENTS**

- [3] Real Estate ............................................. 767
- [4] Personal Services ..................................... 767
- [5] Treaties ................................................ 768
  - [a] Business Income; Permanent Establishment ............... 768
  - [b] Personal Services .................................... 769
- [B] Nonbusiness Investment Income ................................ 769
  - [1] Interest Income ....................................... 769
  - [2] Dividends ............................................. 770
  - [3] Rents and Royalties ................................... 770
  - [5] Income from Sale of Intangible Property ................. 770
  - [6] Scholarships ........................................... 771
- \$ 34.03 UNDERTAXING INTERNATIONAL INCOME ..................... 771
  - [A] Treaty Shopping ....................................... 771
  - [B] Intercompany Pricing .................................. 771
  - [C] Tax Havens ............................................. 773
    - [1] Taxing Shareholders of Controlled Foreign Corporations (CFCs) on Imputed Dividend Income ....................... 773
      - [a] Foreign Base Company Sales Income .................... 774
      - [b] Foreign Base Company Services Income ............... 776
      - [c] Foreign Personal Holding Company Income .......... 776
    - [D] None or All Income Treated as Tax Haven Income .......... 776
    - [E] More on Investment Income ................................ 777
    - [F] “Foreign Tax Credit Splitting Event” ................... 777
- Chapter 35 INTERSTATE TAXATION ................................. 779
  - \$ 35.01 STATE LEGISLATIVE FRAMEWORK — INCOME TAX .......... 779
    - [A] Allocation/ Apportionment ................................ 779
    - [B] Apportionment Formula ................................ 779
    - [C] Overtaxation Potential ................................ 780
    - [D] Applying the Apportionment Factors ..................... 780
      - [1] Sales ............................................... 780
      - [2] Property ........................................... 780
      - [3] Payroll ............................................. 781
    - [E] Undertaxation; Throwback and Throwout Rules .......... 781
    - [F] Discretion to Depart from Apportionment Formula ....... 782
  - \$ 35.02 FEDERAL CONSTITUTIONAL LIMITS ....................... 782
    - [A] Introduction; The Due Process/Commerce Clause Framework ................................ 782
      - [1] Congressional Power .................................. 782
      - [2] Constitutional Requirements — Connection/Nexus;
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subject</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Nondiscrimination</td>
<td>782</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[a] The Quill and Complete Auto Cases</td>
<td>782</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[i] Connection; Sales vs. Income Tax</td>
<td>783</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[ii] Three More Prongs</td>
<td>784</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[b] Judicial Power — Practical Limits and the Dormant Commerce Clause</td>
<td>785</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[B] Fair Apportionment; Internal and External Consistency</td>
<td>785</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[1] Income Tax</td>
<td>786</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Container Corp. of America v. Franchise Tax Bd.</td>
<td>786</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comments on Unitary Business</td>
<td>792</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comments on Apportionment</td>
<td>793</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comment on Throwout Rule and External Consistency</td>
<td>795</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oklahoma Tax Comm’n v. Jefferson Lines, Inc.</td>
<td>797</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comments and Questions</td>
<td>799</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[C] Discrimination</td>
<td>800</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[1] Gross Receipts Tax</td>
<td>800</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tyler Pipe Indus. v. Washington State Dep’t of Revenue</td>
<td>800</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Questions and Comments</td>
<td>801</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[2] Severance Taxes</td>
<td>803</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[3] Sales/Use Taxes</td>
<td>804</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Halliburton Oil Well Cementing Co. v. Reily</td>
<td>804</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comment</td>
<td>806</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table of Cases ................................................................. TC-1

Table of Statutes .............................................................. TS-1

Table of Agency Decisions .................................................... TAD-1

Index ................................................................. I-1
INTRODUCTION

[A] A BRIEF HISTORY OF U.S. TAXATION

[1] Federal Taxation

The federal government does not have to depend solely on taxes to raise revenue. It can borrow funds and print money. It can sell public land. It can also charge customers for buying or using government property, in which case the payment is for a benefit received, not a tax; for example, federal lands are sometimes leased for oil and gas exploration; and charges are imposed for entry into national parks and for use of toll roads. This introduction (and the course book) deal only with taxes.

[a] Before the Civil War

Until 1863 (when the Civil War changed the fiscal landscape), more than 90% of federal revenue came from customs duties — that is, tariffs imposed on imported goods. In other words, the revenue source was “external,” not “internal.” Sale of public lands contributed a significant percentage of the remaining federal revenue.

A few other federal taxes — primarily excise taxes on specific goods — produced a small amount of revenue before the Civil War, but gained a lot of attention. First, an excise tax on liquor in the 1790s led to the Whiskey Rebellion, during which a tax collector’s home was burned. The rebellion was suppressed with federal troops sent by President Washington. (Other excise and stamp taxes, such as those on legal instruments and bonds, did not produce a similar reaction.)

Second, a 1791 tax on carriages led to an important Supreme Court decision. *Hylton v. United States*, 3 U.S. 171 (1796), held that the carriage tax was not a direct tax. This holding was important because the U.S. Constitution (in Article I, sec. 2, cl. 3) requires “direct” taxes to be apportioned among the states according to population. This requirement prevents populous states from voting in favor of a federal tax on real estate, which will fall mostly on people living in property-rich, low-population states.

As is often the case in the history of taxation, the need for military expenditures produced an expansion of the tax base. The undeclared naval war with France led (in 1798) to a direct tax apportioned among the states by population on houses, land, and slaves. And a death tax was imposed by the Stamp Act of 1797. Neither of these taxes survived the end of the military confrontation and was repealed at the beginning of the nineteenth Century.

[b] From the Civil War to the Sixteenth Amendment

INTRODUCTION

The Civil War also spawned a new tax — the first income tax, which became effective in 1862. An early version of the law imposed progressive tax rates in the 3%-5% range with a $600 exemption; these rates rose to 5%-10% by the end of the War. An inheritance and a gift tax were also adopted at this time. However, by 1872, these taxes had expired and would not be revived for many decades.

After the Civil War and until the first modern income tax in 1913, customs duties continued to be the major source of federal revenue. Internal revenue, primarily in the form of excise taxes on alcohol and tobacco, usually produced between 40-50% of federal revenue and occasionally exceeded customs duties.

In 1894, political pressure from labor, farmers, and small businesses led to adoption of the first modern income tax, but it was vigorously opposed by Eastern financial interests (whose income from intangibles, such as stocks and bonds, would now be taxed). They insisted that the 2% tax on income amounted to “socialism” and “communism.” And, in Pollock v. Farmers’ Loan & Trust Co., 157 U.S. 429 (1895), they won a judicial victory after losing in Congress. The tax on income from property was deemed an unconstitutional unapportioned direct tax, despite a number of judicial precedents to the contrary. The constitutional part of the tax on personal service income was found to be inseverable from the unapportioned direct tax, and it fell along with the unconstitutional tax on property income. An estate tax, which was adopted by the War Revenue Act of 1898 and lasted until 1902, did better in the courts; the tax was deemed an indirect tax on the transfer of property in Knowlton v. Moore, 178 U.S. 41 (1900). Similarly, the corporate income tax (adopted in 1909) was upheld as an indirect tax on doing business in Flint v. Stone Tracy Co., 220 U.S. 107 (1911).

[c] The Modern Era

[i] New Taxes

But the political forces favoring an income tax proved too strong to resist. The Sixteenth Amendment to the Constitution, adopted in 1913, removed the apportionment obstacle for taxes on income from property. Although you sometimes hear statements that this Amendment permitted taxes on income, an income tax is authorized elsewhere in the Constitution, by Article I, sec. 8, cl. 1: “The Congress shall have Power To lay and collect Taxes, Duties, Imposts and Excises, to pay the Debts and provide for the common Defence and general Welfare of the United States; but all Duties, Imposts and Excises shall be uniform throughout the United States.” The 16th Amendment only removed the apportionment requirement.

In 1913, Congress took advantage of its new power and passed an income tax, with progressive rates ranging from 1%-6% on individuals (with a $1,000 exemption), as well as a 1% tax on corporate income. The income tax fell primarily on the wealthy, reaching only about 5% of the population in 1920. On the judicial front, the Court turned back an objection that the tax was not uniform, relying on precedent which established that the U.S. Constitution’s Uniformity Clause (Art. I, sec. 8, cl. 1, quoted above) required only geographic uniformity; Brushaber v. Union Pacific Railroad Co., 240 U.S. 1 (1916).

An estate tax was adopted in 1916, which also fell mainly on the wealthy. It left open a major loophole — which was the taxpayer’s ability to make lifetime gifts free of tax. Consequently, a gift tax was adopted temporarily from 1924-1926, and became permanent in 1932.
The next important fiscal development occurred during the Depression — to finance new social insurance programs: specifically, Social Security for the aged and Unemployment Insurance. These programs were financed through payroll taxes on personal service income. In the case of Social Security, employers and employees each paid one half of the Social Security tax, but most economists assume that the employer’s tax is shifted to employees in the form of lower wages. (The only prior federal experience with a social insurance program provided retirement and disability benefits for Civil War Union veterans.) At present, the Social Security tax exceeds the income tax for many lower-income workers, although a refundable earned income credit provided by the income tax reduces the impact of this burden.

Despite the importance of the income tax after passage of the 16th Amendment, this tax did not become a mass tax until World War II (no longer falling primarily on the wealthy). Exemptions were reduced to $500, top tax rates rose to a high of 50%, and taxes on wages were collected through withholding. Rates decreased after the end of World War II and increased during the Korean War in the early 1950s. Top individual tax rates went as high as 91%, but they have been steadily lowered in the past few decades. At one time, when the top rate was 70%, the maximum rate on personal service income was limited to 50%.

An interesting feature of federal taxation is the absence of a general sales tax (which falls on the sale of most tangible personal property and not just on selected items, such as a federal tax on alcohol and gasoline). Occasional suggestions that the U.S. adopt such a tax have failed, in part because it is viewed as regressive (falling disproportionately on those with lower incomes); and, since the 1930s, because the general sales tax has been adopted by many states which fear that federal use of this tax base would displace state reliance on this revenue source.

[ii] Data

The adoption of the income tax in 1913 began a major shift in the sources of federal revenue. Customs duties, which had been the mainstay of nineteenth-century federal taxation, hovered around 10-20% of federal revenue in the 1920s and dipped below 10% during most of the 1930s; thereafter, it produced only around 1-2% of federal revenue. Tariffs are now important only for trade policy.

The contribution of excise taxes — the other significant source of federal revenue in the nineteenth century — has also declined. These taxes sometimes equaled or exceeded that of the income tax during the Depression — for example, the contributions to federal revenue of excise taxes and income taxes in 1934 were 46% and 26% respectively, but the balance shifted in 1937 to 35% and 39%. With the end of the Depression and the expansion of the income tax during World War II, excise taxes produced an increasingly insignificant percentage of federal revenue. The dollar amounts of excise taxes on selected goods and services, such as alcohol, tobacco, gasoline and diesel fuel, and airplane travel, are still significant (about $88 billion in 2013), but only about 3-4% of federal revenue.

Estate and gift taxes, despite being politically important, have been a small contributor to federal taxes throughout their history — in recent years, contributing less than 2% of federal revenue, declining to less than 1% with recently adopted high exemptions.

The individual income tax began to be a significant source of federal revenue in the 1920s, but its contribution to federal revenue was cut almost in half during the
Depression. Since becoming a mass tax during World War II, and despite fluctuations in legislatively enacted tax rates, the individual income tax has annually produced between 45-48% of federal revenue.

The percentage contribution of the corporate income tax to federal revenue has gradually declined from around 30% just after World War II to about 10-12% or less today — in part, because business tax breaks are more pervasively available to corporations and because foreign corporate income (which has become more important with globalization) is not usually taxed until it is brought back to the United States.

The other major contributor to federal revenue is Social Security taxes. These taxes (expanded to include Medicare in 1965) now raise a significant percentage of federal revenue — gradually rising from less than 10% prior to 1958 to about 33% today.

The pattern of wartime increases and peacetime decreases in income tax rates continued until recently. Despite the need to finance military actions in the first decade of the twenty-first century, the President and Congress have agreed on income tax reductions, primarily on the theory that this would provide economic incentives and, eventually, increase revenue. Lower taxes resulted not only from lower progressive tax rates, but also from a maximum 15% tax rate on long-term capital gains and dividends and the provision of numerous deductions and credits that lower the effective tax rate on a broad-based definition of income.

The other major feature of the current income tax — which has exploded since the 1960s — has been its use to address nearly every major economic and social problem. Tax breaks for all sorts of activities — from investing in machinery and environmental clean-up to social programs such as child care, education, retirement, and medical expenditures — have proliferated in the tax code. This has resulted in large part from the political difficulty that Congress encounters in spending money directly, with a resulting reliance on tax breaks to achieve specific goals. Legislators are able to say that they did something about a problem, without worrying too much about whether it is the best way to achieve their objectives.

The result of using the tax law for many nontax purposes has been an immensely complex income tax law, which contains provisions that have nothing to do with raising revenue. The complexity of the current legislation has deprived the income tax of whatever clarity it might once have had and, incidentally, created a pedagogical nightmare. It is fair to say that there are very few income tax specialists any more. Instead there are practitioners who specialize in the taxation of particular industries and activities — natural resources, real estate, the entertainment industry, retirement planning, etc. Moreover, tax law practice has yielded significant ground to accountants, who are better trained to deal with the kind of jigsaw-puzzle complexity that yields a clear answer after negotiating the statutory maze. Lawyers are better able to deal with the application of general and uncertain principles to complex fact situations than they are with rules for which complex algorithms provide answers. Indeed, tax preparers using computer programs are often better able to provide answers to complex tax problems than tax practitioners.

Among the most distracting features of current law, which results in part from the need to make federal deficits less daunting, is the adoption of some tax breaks with a statutory expiration date. The 2001 Tax Law (Economic Growth and Tax Relief Reconciliation
INTRODUCTION

Act of 2001) contained numerous such provisions and a series of subsequent statutes dealt, among other things, with the need to revisit these provisions. The following partial list of these laws suggests how much legislative time was taken in addressing these issues: Job Creation and Worker Assistance Act of 2002; Jobs and Growth Tax Relief Reconciliation Act of 2003; Working Families Tax Relief Act of 2004; American Jobs Creation Act of 2004; Katrina Emergency Tax Relief Act of 2005; Tax Increase Prevention and Reconciliation Act of 2005; Small Business and Work Opportunity Tax Act of 2007 (a subtitle of Pub. L. 110-28); and Tax Relief, Unemployment Insurance Reauthorization and Job Creation Act of 2010. Finally, the American Taxpayer Relief Act of 2012 (Public Law 112-240) (ATRA) made many (but not all) of these tax breaks permanent. Some tax breaks are extended only through 2013, requiring Congress to revisit these rules periodically. This political process makes it very difficult to say what the law is or will be in the near future.

The complexity of the modern income tax — riddled as it is with special tax breaks — has also called into question its status as the fairest tax. Polling data show that the percentage of people ranking the income tax as the fairest way to raise revenue has sharply declined. Feeding this view has been a loss of confidence in the tax administration from two diverse perspectives. Anecdotes about an overbearing agency lead many to believe that the tax falls unfairly on the “little” individual. At the same time, expensive tax advisors are able to exploit weaknesses in the tax law and an overburdened agency is unable to successfully catch tax evasion or litigate whether tax avoidance schemes are legal, leading to the view that the law benefits the rich.

[2] State and Local Taxation

Our knowledge of nineteenth-century state and local taxation is hampered by inadequate data. We know that states borrowed heavily until the depression in the early 1840s; and that, thereafter, property taxes increasingly dominated state and local tax sources. Data for the twentieth century are more reliable and they provide us with an insight into the shifting role of different revenue sources at the state and local level. Keep in mind that the following discussion aggregates data for all state and local jurisdictions and that there are significant variations among states and localities. In addition, the percentages are of government revenue from its own sources, not intergovernmental (especially federal) grants.

[a] State Taxes

Around 1900, property taxes were the major source of state tax revenue, but the property tax was in trouble. Taxpayers did not report intangible property (such as stocks and bonds), which had become a significant source of wealth; in addition, few taxpayers reported their tangible personal property, such as furniture, watches, etc. States therefore began to leave the property tax to local governments and to rely on other sources of revenue. Consequently, property taxes lost their importance at the state level during the twentieth century. In 1902, property taxes produced a little more than 50% of total state tax revenue, after which this percentage declined, as follows: 1922 (37%); 1934 (14%); 1950 (4%). Since 1969, property taxes produce less than 2% of state revenues.

In the first few decades of the twentieth century, a significant minority of states adopted income taxes, influenced by federal precedent and by the fact that a tax on income could reach interest and dividends accruing to intangible wealth. Wisconsin led the way by demonstrating that the tax could be effectively administered by professional
INTRODUCTION

civil servants and through the reporting of wages paid by employers and dividends and interest paid by businesses. As of 1922, 13 states had adopted an income tax, producing around 11% of state revenue.

However, during the Depression, the income tax became unreliable as a revenue source despite its widespread adoption. By the end of the 1930s, two-thirds of the states had adopted an income tax, but that tax still produced only about 11% of state tax revenue. States therefore turned increasingly to sales taxes, imposed both on sales generally and on selected items (such as gasoline). By the end of the 1930s, 23 states had adopted general sales tax (fewer than the income tax), but this tax accounted for more state revenue than the income tax. Sales taxes (both general and selective) continued to dominate as a revenue source during and after World War II, although the percentage contribution declined — 1950 (59%); 1964 (57%); 1969 (57%). Since 1966, the percentage has been about 48-49%. In 1969, revenue from general sales taxes exceeded excise taxes on selected items for the first time, and that pattern has continued ever since.

Income taxes on individuals and corporations also became a more important source of state tax revenue after the Depression, although the percentage contribution was at first much less than sales taxes — 1934 (7%); 1950 (17%); 1964 (21%); 1969 (26%). Since 1996, the percentage has been about 39%. In 1973, for the first time, income tax revenue exceeded general sales tax revenue (but not general sales taxes and excise taxes on selected items combined), and that remains the contemporary pattern. The vast majority of states now rely on both income and sales taxes.

[b] Local Taxes

At the beginning of the twentieth century (and unlike today), local tax revenues greatly exceeded state tax revenues — by approximately a five-to-one ratio. About 90% of local taxes came from the property tax (which was rapidly becoming just a tax on real property).

Today, the mix of local revenue has changed, but the property tax still produces well over 50% of local tax revenue. The change has been in the increase in local government use of sales and income taxes.

[B] CRITERIA FOR A SUCCESSFUL TAX

A successful tax must satisfy a number of criteria. First, the tax base must be broad enough to provide significant revenue. That is one reason why wars and economic depressions are usually the occasion for significant changes in the tax laws.

Second, a tax must be administrable without too much difficulty. Concerns about administration shape the tax law — for example: in limiting the current property tax base to real property; in relying on withholding from wages to support an income tax; and in deciding whether a sales tax can be reliably collected. The current global economy places tremendous strains on tax administration, as businesses are able to shift income around among geographic locations (either legally or illegally), and governments are hard-pressed to keep up with astute tax planners.

Third, the impact of a tax on behavior must be considered. No tax is ever completely neutral. For example, an income tax burdens wage work more than untaxed “leisure” and self-performed services (such as housework). It also burdens savings by taxing the income that generates the savings and the income from savings (such as dividends and interest). This burden is one reason that some people advocate greater reliance on taxes.
INTRODUCTION

that fall on consumption (such as a sales tax). However, sales taxes have their own imperfections — some sales tax regimes do not tax services, which is a major omission in our service economy; and sales taxation sometimes burdens purchases by businesses as well as personal consumption, which can distort both business and personal consumption.

Moreover, within the boundaries of any tax base, there is an opportunity to influence behavior. Particular industries and specific expenditures can be encouraged — for example, through special depreciation deductions under the income tax or by property tax holidays. Social values can also be advanced — for example, the income tax law provides incentives for retirement, education, and medical expenditures; and taxes on personal consumption typically exempt education and hospital services and some food.

Fourth, the tax must satisfy some notion of fairness, at least in a political democracy. Tax fairness is often measured by something referred to as “ability to pay,” a criterion that is remarkably fuzzy when examined closely but which remains clear enough in its popular conception. The idea is that taxation should treat equals equally with respect to their economic well-being (horizontal equity).

Another and more controversial notion of equity taxes people with more of the tax base at progressively higher tax rates (vertical equity). For example, in an income tax, it is not just that some people with $100,000 income pay more taxes than someone with $50,000 income; a flat rate tax would do that. Vertical equity calls for taxing someone with higher income at a higher tax rate. Thus, the first $50,000 of income might be taxed at 15%, but the next $50,000 at 25%. If only consumption were taxed, vertical equity calls for taxing higher consumption at higher tax rates.

[C] CONTEMPORARY POLICY ISSUES

This review of the evolution of taxation in the United States focuses attention on several contemporary policy issues. A law course is not going to make any serious attempt to address questions of public finance, such as whether taxes should or should not be raised to deal with future budget deficits. But there are a number of important policy issues that shape current debates about taxation that we will consider in this course.

[1] Progressivity

Progressive tax rates have long been an intrinsic part of United States taxation — sometimes praised as a positive “equity” feature or vilified as evidence of socialism or a threat to economic expansion.

Progressive income taxation is sometimes defended on the “scientific” notion that people with more income have a lesser preference for higher amounts of income than for lower amounts of income, but such psychological observations give progressive income taxation a scientific veneer that cannot be sustained. (Who knows how badly someone craves their particular lifestyle? It often depends on their social and economic background and on whether they are going up or down the income scale.) See generally Blum & Kalven, THE UNEASY CASE FOR PROGRESSIVE TAXATION (1952).

The best defense of progressive tax rates rests on the “political” value of wealth. As people have more and more wealth, the relative value of that extra wealth to society as a whole goes up in relation to its private value — or at least that is one political point of view. When the argument is made that progressive taxes are bad because they take an individual’s wealth, that is an indirect way of asserting that the relative value of public and private expenditures disfavors public over private spending. Put differently, instead
of taxes being the price we pay for civilization, as Oliver Wendell Holmes, Jr. once put it, the argument is that progressive taxes undermine the economic initiatives and political freedoms that are valuable in our society. An electorate that has lost faith in the government’s public spending is not likely to embrace Holmes’s aphorism.

The debate over the political value of wealth is not limited to the income tax. It also underlies disputes over whether an estate tax is a good idea. Proponents of the estate tax argue that inherited wealth lacks social value in the hands of those who inherit it. Opponents of the tax label it a “death” tax and describe it as an unfair burden on the wealth that someone has struggled to acquire.

Taxes on personal consumption can also be tailored to fall more heavily on those with higher income or consumption — by fiddling with the tax rates (higher rates on luxury goods) and exemptions (no tax on groceries).

[2] Flat Tax

In recent years, proposals have been floated for a flat tax, usually around the low 20% range. These proposals might seem to derive much of their impetus from objections to progressive tax rates, but that would misread their political attraction. The most important feature of a flat tax is that it would fall on a greatly simplified tax base — an income tax without many of the tax breaks that now dot the tax code. In other words, the flat tax is defended primarily as economically efficient (because the tax would fall neutrally on different types of economic activities) and as administratively simple (making it easier for taxpayers to fill out returns and for the agency to audit those returns).

Although a flat tax has had some political traction, its lack of success may result from the fact that the tax rate on lower income taxpayers would have to be higher than the current rate to raise enough revenue to replace the current income tax. In addition, many taxpayers benefit from the tax breaks in the current law (such as the deduction of interest on some home loans, retirement savings, some state and local taxes, and charitable contributions), some of which would have to be eliminated by a flat tax rate on a simplified tax base.

[3] Greater Reliance on Consumption Taxes?

Within the boundaries of some general notion of ability to pay, there is a modern debate about whether the tax base should be income and/or consumption. There are several types of consumption taxes. First, there is a sales tax imposed (usually) at a single point — retail sales. Second, a value-added tax is imposed at each step of the production and distribution chain, which (in theory) adds up to the same total as a single-point retail sales tax. Third, a consumption tax is imposed on income minus savings; it would be administered like an income tax but with a deduction for all savings. A consumption tax is likely to have a broader tax base than other taxes on consumption. For example, unlike typical retail sales taxes, it would not exempt most services.

The debate about income and consumption taxes is usually about the proper mix of these tax bases, not replacement of the income tax with a tax on consumption. Some observers suggest use of consumption taxes, supplemented by an income tax on those with higher incomes to preserve a measure of progressivity. Lower income taxpayers would be subject to a flat consumption tax, which would amount to a flat tax on income if they consumed all of their income.

Consumption taxes are sometimes defended on the ground that they tax what someone
takes out of the economy rather than what they earn. Income equals consumption plus savings and (so the argument goes) people should not be taxed on the savings they leave in the economy. Moreover, a better measure of ability to pay is lifetime consumption, which tends to smooth out fluctuations in income — because taxpayers save when they are young and consume their savings when they retire. A consumption tax is neutral regarding when consumption occurs but an income tax favors earlier consumption because current savings and the return on those savings (such as interest) are included in the tax base.

Taxes on consumption are also said to encourage savings, which many observers think is inadequate in the United States. And some taxes on consumption — specifically, retail sales and value added taxes — are easier to rebate to the seller than income taxes when sales occur outside the country, thereby encouraging exports.

Consumption taxes have attracted support from such varied political philosophers as Adam Smith, Thomas Hobbes, and John Stuart Mill. A recent discussion in the legal literature rejects arguments that the consumption tax is regressive and inefficient, and concludes that its Achilles’ heel is its implementation; see Bankman & Weisbach, *The Superiority of an Ideal Consumption Tax over an Ideal Income Tax*, 58 STAN. L. REV. 1413 (2006).

[4] Tax Levels

Underlying the discussion of tax policy is the fundamental question of the overall tax level, regardless of the tax base. When taxpayers are suspicious of government, they do not trust public sector spending and are more reluctant to permit the purchase of goods and services by the government — leading to objections to taxes in general. When a bridge collapses, there is a public outcry for more spending on infrastructure, but the enthusiasm fades when the legislature considers whether or not to raise taxes for this purpose. We seem especially unwilling to tax ourselves to help others — viz., medical insurance — even if the benefits are financed by payroll taxes. An economic reason for this reluctance may be that taxes (especially payroll taxes, which increase the cost of labor) might encourage taxpayers to move their operations abroad in our global economy.

[D] OUTLINE OF THE BOOK

Although there is now serious doubt about whether the federal income tax is the fairest tax, it continues to be the primary source of federal revenue. My guess is that a “better” income tax would still pass muster as our best tax. Consequently, Part I of this book follows the usual practice in law school courses of emphasizing the income tax on individuals.

Nonetheless, because of doubts about the current individual income tax, it is appropriate for an introductory tax course to include material about other taxes as well — including the following:

— state and local taxes — especially property and sales taxes;
— payroll taxes — especially Social Security taxes, which have increased considerably in recent years;
— taxes on consumption — including not only the sales tax but also the tax on value added (used widely in Europe), and proposals for a consumption tax (much talked about but rarely adopted);
INTRODUCTION

— the estate and gift tax — which is a flash point for liberal and conservative politics (the estate tax actually expired in 2010 but was later revived with high exemption levels);

— entity taxation — the income tax rules regarding partnerships, trusts, estates, and corporations; and

— inter-jurisdictional issues — international taxation and the problems of allocating the tax base to different states.

To that end, Part II of the book deals with the following taxes.

— Taxation of property
  — Property tax
  — Estate and gift tax

— Payroll taxes
  — Social Security tax

— Taxes on consumption
  — Sales tax
  — Value added tax
  — Consumption tax

— Entity taxation
  — Pass-thru entities; Partnerships, Trusts, and Estates
  — Corporate income tax

— Multi-jurisdictional issues
  — International taxation
  — Interstate taxation