UNDERSTANDING JUVENILE LAW
LexisNexis Law School Publishing
Advisory Board

Paul Caron
Professor of Law
Pepperdine University School of Law
*Herzog Summer Visiting Professor in Taxation*
University of San Diego School of Law

Olympia Duhart
Professor of Law and Director of Lawyering Skills & Values Program
Nova Southeastern University, Shepard Broad Law School

Samuel Estreicher
*Dwight D. Opperman Professor of Law*
Director, Center for Labor and Employment Law
NYU School of Law

Steven I. Friedland
Professor of Law and Senior Scholar
Elon University School of Law

Joan Heminway
*College of Law Distinguished Professor of Law*
University of Tennessee College of Law

Edward Imwinkelried
*Edward L. Barrett, Jr. Professor of Law*
UC Davis School of Law

Paul Marcus
*Haynes Professor of Law*
William and Mary Law School

John Sprankling
*Distinguished Professor of Law*
McGeorge School of Law

Melissa Weresh
Director of Legal Writing and Professor of Law
Drake University Law School
UNDERSTANDING JUVENILE LAW

FOURTH EDITION

Martin R. Gardner
Steinhart Foundation Professor of Law
University of Nebraska, College of Law
DEDICATION

In memory of my goodly parents.

Martin R. Gardner
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The author wishes to express appreciation for the generous support made available through the Ross McCollum Research Fund at the University of Nebraska College of Law; for the superb research and editorial assistance provided by Megan Bischoff; for the excellent secretarial service performed by Vida Eden; and, most of all, for the patience and encouragement of his wife, Anne.
PREFACE

This text examines the topic of juvenile law. The book addresses issues of children and the law in the context of common law doctrine, federal constitutional principles, and statutory enactments.

The book discusses these various bodies of law in relation to a fundamental issue permeating the entire field of juvenile law: the extent to which the law should protect young people rather than recognize them as autonomous persons. While the law traditionally adopted a protectionist posture, recent legal developments appear to recognize autonomy rights of adolescents in certain contexts. These developments are praised by some commentators who advocate wholesale rejection of the paternalistic model in favor of a system that treats adolescents as full-fledged persons under the law. This book does not advocate any particular resolution of the current debate about the nature of the rights of young people; rather, it suggests that sensitivity to the issues and arguments entailed in that debate is essential to any true understanding of the present state of juvenile law.

With these concerns in mind, the text begins with a general discussion of the nature of the rights of juveniles and the perception that young people constitute a unique class under the law. This theoretical introduction will serve as a background for subsequent discussion of juvenile law doctrine. The discussion separates aspects of juvenile law arising outside the juvenile justice system (defined in this text as the system of separate courts organized to deal with “delinquents” and “status offenders”) from those arising within that system. This division is created as a useful means of organizing the doctrinal material, given the extensive body of rules that govern the juvenile justice system. Moreover, this organization permits the juvenile justice section to stand by itself as an independent text for students in courses that cover only that aspect of juvenile law.

Finally, for readers interested in single sources providing broader attention to juvenile law issues than provided in this text, two multi-volume sources may be useful starting points. Donald Kramer’s three-volume second edition to Legal Rights of Children offers a well organized treatment of a host of legal issues affecting young people. In addition, the various volumes of Juvenile Justice Standards from the Institute of Judicial Administration and the American Bar Association Joint Commission provide useful commentary on a variety of juvenile law issues. Finally, for a treatment of the juvenile justice system, the second edition of Samuel Davis’s Rights of Juveniles provides an excellent source.

1 A separate section (Part Three) is devoted to the delinquency/status offense aspects of juvenile law under the label “juvenile justice system.” Sometimes this label is used more broadly to include abuse and neglect jurisdiction or any other matter handled in a separate juvenile court. The label “juvenile justice system” always includes, however, and is often limited to, that system of courts created to deal with delinquents and status offenders.
# Table of Contents

## Part One  INTRODUCTION  .............................................. 1

### Chapter 1  MINORITY AS A LEGAL STATUS  .................. 3

§ 1.01  OVERVIEW  ........................................... 3

§ 1.02  DISTINGUISHING MINORS FROM ADULTS  .............. 4

[A]  Chronological Age Rules  ................................... 4

[B]  Individualized Standards for Assessing Maturity  ....... 5

[C]  Modern Statutes: Different Ages for Different Contexts . 4

[D]  Social Science and the Process of Maturation: The Nature of Adolescence . 6

## Chapter 2  THE RIGHTS OF JUVENILES  .................... 9

§ 2.01  OVERVIEW  ........................................... 9

§ 2.02  THE PROTECTIONIST THEORY  ........................ 11

[A]  Theoretical Premises  ..................................... 11

[B]  Overview of Private Law  .................................. 11

[C]  The State as *Parens Patriae*  .......................... 12

§ 2.03  THE PERSONHOOD THEORY  .......................... 13

[A]  Overview  .................................................. 13

[B]  Personhood Rights and Current Law  ...................... 14

§ 2.04  ACCOMMODATION OF PROTECTIONIST AND PERSONHOOD THEORIES  .................. 14

## Part Two  OUTSIDE THE JUVENILE JUSTICE SYSTEM ........ 17

### Chapter 3  THE CHILD AND THE FAMILY  .................. 19

§ 3.01  GENERAL BACKGROUND  ................................ 19

§ 3.02  SUPPORT AND MAINTENANCE  ......................... 20

[A]  “Necessary” Support  ..................................... 21

[B]  Education  ................................................. 22

[C]  Medical Care  ............................................. 24

[D]  Parental Objections on Religious Grounds ............... 25
Table of Contents

[b] Objections on Grounds of Parental Autonomy ......................... 25
[c] Handicapped Newborns ................................... 26
[d] Consent by the Juvenile: The “Mature Minor” Exception ............ 27
[4] Unborn Children ........................................ 28
[B] Duration of Support ..................................... 29
[1] Emancipation ............................................ 29
[2] Disobedience to Parents .................................. 31
[3] Death of Parent or Child .................................. 31
[C] Theoretical Implications .................................. 31
§ 3.03 PARENTAL NEGLECT ..................................... 32
[A] Parental Tort Liability .................................... 32
[B] State Intervention ....................................... 34
[1] Criminal Actions ......................................... 34
[2] Parens Patriae Limitations on Parental Authority ................. 34
[4] Foster Care .............................................. 38
§ 3.04 ADOPTION ................................................ 41
§ 3.05 INHERITANCE ............................................ 42
§ 3.06 CHILD CUSTODY ......................................... 44
[A] Disputes Between Natural Parents .......................... 44
[1] The Tender Years Presumption ............................... 45
[B] Disputes Between Parents and Non-Parents .................... 50
[C] Jurisdictional Issues ....................................... 51
[D] Theoretical Implications .................................. 54

Chapter 4 CHILD ABUSE ............................................ 55
§ 4.01 OVERVIEW ................................................ 55
§ 4.02 CHILD ABUSE LEGISLATION .............................. 56
[A] Defining Child Abuse ...................................... 56
[1] Constitutional Attacks ..................................... 59
[2] Policy Implications ........................................ 61
[B] Duty to Report ............................................. 62
[1] Persons Obligated to Report ................................ 62
[2] Civil Liability for Failure to Report or Investigate .......... 64
[3] Policy Implications ........................................ 64
§ 4.03 THE JUDICIAL PROCESS .................................. 66
[A] Expert Testimony .......................................... 66
Table of Contents

[1] Battered Child Syndrome .................................................. 67
[2] Other “Syndrome” Evidence .................................................. 68
  [a] Munchausen Syndrome by Proxy ....................................... 70
  [b] Battering Parent Syndrome ............................................. 72
[3] Policy Implications ........................................................... 73

[B] Children’s Testimony ....................................................... 73
[1] Competency to Testify ....................................................... 73
[2] The Traumatic Effects of Testifying ...................................... 75
  [a] Face to Face Confrontation? .......................................... 76
  [b] Hearsay Exceptions ...................................................... 78
[3] Policy Implications ........................................................... 84

[C] Other Evidentiary Issues .................................................. 86
[1] Testimonial Privileges ...................................................... 86

§ 4.04 CRIMINAL OR CIVIL ALTERNATIVES? ............................. 86

Chapter 5  PRIVATE LAW ISSUES OUTSIDE THE FAMILY ................. 89

§ 5.01 OVERVIEW ................................................................. 89
§ 5.02 LITIGATION ISSUES ..................................................... 89
  [A] Parties ............................................................................. 89
  [B] Statutes of Limitations ..................................................... 91
§ 5.03 CONTRACTS ................................................................. 92
  [A] The Common Law Infancy Doctrine .................................... 92
    [1] The Necessaries Exception .............................................. 93
    [4] Ratification ................................................................... 96
      [a] Failure to Make a Timely Disaffirmance ......................... 97
      [b] Express Ratification .................................................. 97
      [c] Conduct ..................................................................... 97
    [6] Non-Necessary Medical Expenses ................................... 98
  [B] Statutory Innovations ....................................................... 99
  [C] Policy Implications .......................................................... 101
§ 5.04 TORTS ..................................................................... 102
  [A] Intentional Torts ............................................................ 102
    [1] Punitive Damages ......................................................... 103
    [2] Parental Liability Statutes .............................................. 104
  [B] Negligence .................................................................. 105
  [C] Policy Implications .......................................................... 106
§ 5.05 PROPERTY ................................................................. 106
Table of Contents

§ 5.06 MAKING A WILL ........................................... 108
§ 5.07 EMPLOYMENT .............................................. 108
[A] State Legislation ............................................. 108
[B] Federal Legislation .......................................... 111
[C] Policy Implications .......................................... 114

Chapter 6 CONSTITUTIONAL RIGHTS ......................... 117
§ 6.01 OVERVIEW .................................................. 117
§ 6.02 THE EARLY CASES: MEYER AND PIERCE .............. 118
§ 6.03 THE FIRST AMENDMENT .................................. 120
[A] The Religion Clauses ........................................ 120
[1] The Establishment Clause and the Public Schools .......... 120
[a] School Prayer ............................................... 120
[b] Accommodating Student Religious Belief .................. 122
[B] Free Speech .................................................. 127
[1] In School .................................................... 127
[2] Outside School ................................................ 133
§ 6.04 THE FOURTH AMENDMENT ............................... 137
§ 6.05 THE EIGHTH AMENDMENT ............................... 147
[A] In School: Corporal Punishment ............................ 147
[B] Outside School: Punishment as an Adult .................. 148
§ 6.06 THE FOURTEENTH AMENDMENT ....................... 153
[A] Due Process .................................................. 153
[1] Substantive Rights ........................................... 153
[a] Reproductive Freedom ...................................... 153
[b] Education ................................................... 158
[c] Corporal Punishment ........................................ 159
[d] Marriage ....................................................... 160
[e] Curfews ....................................................... 160
[2] Procedural Rights ............................................. 161
[a] School Discipline ............................................ 161
[b] Mental Health Commitments ................................ 163
[B] Equal Protection .............................................. 165
[1] Childhood as a Suspect Class? ............................. 165
[2] Illegitimacy .................................................... 166
§ 6.07 SUMMARY .................................................. 170
Table of Contents

Part Three THE JUVENILE JUSTICE SYSTEM ................ 173

Chapter 7 THE JUVENILE COURT MOVEMENT ............ 175
§ 7.01 OVERVIEW ........................................ 175
§ 7.02 THE EMERGENCE OF JUVENILE COURTS .......... 176
[A] The Common Law .................................... 176
[B] Statutory Reform .................................... 177
§ 7.03 SUPREME COURT OVERSIGHT ...................... 181
[A] The Pre-
Gault Era ............................................ 181
[B] In re Gault ............................................ 184
[C] Gault’s Progeny ..................................... 187
[D] Summary .............................................. 191

Chapter 8 JURISDICTION ................................. 193
§ 8.01 OVERVIEW ........................................ 193
§ 8.02 AGE ................................................. 194
[A] Maximum Age ........................................ 194
[1] Generally ............................................. 194
[2] Gender Distinctions .................................. 194
[3] Age at the Time of Offense or at the Commencement of
Proceedings? ........................................... 196
[B] Minimum Age ........................................ 197
§ 8.03 DELINQUENCY ..................................... 198
[A] Exclusive Jurisdiction ................................ 199
[B] Concurrent Jurisdiction ............................. 200
[C] Waivers of Jurisdiction ............................. 200
[1] Judicial Waivers .................................... 201
[2] Legislative Waivers ................................... 201
[a] Statutes Excluding Gang Activity .................. 202
[b] Policy Considerations ............................... 204
§ 8.04 STATUS OFFENSES ............................... 204
[A] Noncriminal Misconduct ........................... 205
[B] Undesirable Status Conditions ..................... 206
[C] Constitutional Issues ............................... 206
[1] Equal Protection Challenges ....................... 206
[a] Discrimination Against Juveniles ................. 206
[b] Discrimination Against Females .................. 207
[D] Policy Implications ................................. 209
## Table of Contents

### Chapter 9  THE PRE-ADJUDICATION PROCESS  ..................................  211

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>§ 9.01</td>
<td>OVERVIEW .........................................</td>
<td>211</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 9.02</td>
<td>POLICE INVESTIGATION .............................</td>
<td>211</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[A]</td>
<td>Searches and Seizures ...........................</td>
<td>211</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[1]</td>
<td>Taking into Custody ............................</td>
<td>212</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[a]</td>
<td>Caselaw .......................................</td>
<td>212</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[b]</td>
<td>Statutes ......................................</td>
<td>218</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[2]</td>
<td>Searches and Seizures of Evidence ..............</td>
<td>219</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[3]</td>
<td>Consensual Searches and Seizures ..............</td>
<td>220</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[a]</td>
<td>Consent While in Custody ....................</td>
<td>222</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[b]</td>
<td>Third Party Consent ..........................</td>
<td>222</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[B]</td>
<td>Interrogations ................................</td>
<td>226</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[1]</td>
<td>Fourteenth Amendment Due Process .............</td>
<td>226</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[2]</td>
<td>Sixth Amendment Right to Counsel ..............</td>
<td>228</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[a]</td>
<td><em>Fare v. Michael C.</em> .........................</td>
<td>231</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[b]</td>
<td>State Law Protections ........................</td>
<td>233</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[c]</td>
<td>Policy Implications ..........................</td>
<td>234</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[C]</td>
<td>Lineups ......................................</td>
<td>235</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 9.03</td>
<td>INTAKE AND DIVERSION ..........................</td>
<td>236</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 9.04</td>
<td>DETENTION AND BAIL ............................</td>
<td>237</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[A]</td>
<td>Preventive Detention ..........................</td>
<td>238</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[1]</td>
<td><em>Schall v. Martin</em> ............................</td>
<td>239</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[B]</td>
<td>Bail .........................................</td>
<td>241</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 9.05</td>
<td>JUDICIAL WAIVER OF JURISDICTION ...............</td>
<td>243</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[A]</td>
<td>Criteria for Waiver ..........................</td>
<td>243</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[2]</td>
<td>Applying the Criteria .......................</td>
<td>244</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[B]</td>
<td>Procedures ...................................</td>
<td>245</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Chapter 10  ADJUDICATION  ...........................................  249

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>§ 10.01</td>
<td>OVERVIEW .......................................</td>
<td>249</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 10.02</td>
<td>DELINQUENCY .................................</td>
<td>249</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[A]</td>
<td>Procedural Aspects ..........................</td>
<td>249</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[1]</td>
<td>Notice ......................................</td>
<td>250</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[2]</td>
<td>Discovery ...................................</td>
<td>252</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[3]</td>
<td>Counsel .....................................</td>
<td>253</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[a]</td>
<td>Rules of Evidence ...........................</td>
<td>254</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table of Contents

[b] Standard of Proof ........................................... 255
[c] Self-Incrimination, Confrontation, and Cross Examination .... 256
[6] Speedy Trials ............................................. 258
[7] Public Trials .............................................. 258
[a] Rights of Juveniles ....................................... 258
[b] Rights of the Press ........................................ 259
[8] Policy Implications ........................................ 261
[B] Affirmative Defenses ........................................ 262
[1] Competency to be Adjudicated ............................ 263
[6] Policy Implications ........................................ 269
§ 10.03 STATUS OFFENSES ..................................... 270
[A] Procedural Aspects ......................................... 270
[1] Constitutional Protections ................................. 270
[2] Notice ....................................................... 272
[3] Discovery .................................................. 273
[4] Counsel ...................................................... 273
[5] Evidentiary Issues .......................................... 274
[a] Rules of Evidence ......................................... 274
[b] Standard of Proof ......................................... 275
[c] Self-Incrimination ......................................... 276
[7] Policy Implications ........................................ 277
[B] Affirmative Defenses ........................................ 277

Chapter 11 DISPOSITIONS ........................................ 279

§ 11.01 OVERVIEW ............................................. 279
§ 11.02 HEARING PROCEDURES .............................. 280
[A] Right to a Hearing .......................................... 280
[B] Right to Counsel ........................................... 281
[C] Rules of Evidence ......................................... 281
§ 11.03 DELINQUENCY CASES ................................. 282
[A] The Traditional Theory: Promoting the Child’s Interests .... 282
[1] Distinguishing Punishment and Rehabilitation ............ 287
# Table of Contents

[3] Legal Consequences of Punitive Dispositions ............................. 289  
[C] Dispositional Alternatives .................................................... 291  
[1] Probation .............................................................................. 291  
[a] Conditions of Probation ....................................................... 292  
[b] Probation Revocation ............................................................ 293  
[c] Rehabilitation or Punishment? ............................................... 294  
[a] Procedural Requirements ...................................................... 297  
[b] Rehabilitation or Punishment? ............................................... 298  
[3] Community Service ............................................................... 298  
[4] Community-Based Institutionalization ..................................... 300  
[a] Foster Care .......................................................................... 301  
[b] The Problem of Runaways .................................................... 302  
[5] Secure Confinement ............................................................... 303  
[a] The Right to Rehabilitation .................................................. 304  
[b] Cruel and Unusual Punishment .............................................. 306  
[i] General Conditions of Confinement ...................................... 307  
[ii] Disciplinary Regimens .......................................................... 308  
[D] Boot Camps .......................................................................... 310  
[E] “Blended Sentencing” ............................................................. 310  
[F] Policy Implications ............................................................... 312  
§ 11.04 STATUS OFFENDERS .................................................. 312  
[A] Non-Incarcerative Dispositions .............................................. 313  
[B] Secure Confinement ............................................................... 314  
[1] Initial Disposition .................................................................. 314  
[2] Secure Confinement as a Secondary Disposition ...................... 315  
[3] Segregating Status Offenders and Delinquents ......................... 317  
[C] The Right to Rehabilitation .................................................. 319  
[D] Unconstitutional Punishment .................................................. 320  
[1] Punishment Violative of Due Process ..................................... 321  
[a] Punishment in “Nonpunitive” Dispositional Systems ............... 322  
[b] Punishment of Status ............................................................ 323  
§ 11.05 APPEALS ................................................................. 325  

### Chapter 12 THE FUTURE OF THE JUVENILE JUSTICE SYSTEM .......... 327  
§ 12.01 OVERVIEW ................................................................. 327  
§ 12.02 DELINQUENCY ............................................................. 327  
§ 12.03 STATUS OFFENSES ..................................................... 329
# Table of Contents

TABLE OF CASES ............................................................. TC-1
INDEX ................................................................. I-1