LexisNexis Law School Publishing
Advisory Board

J. Martin Burke
Regents Professor of Law
University of Montana School of Law

Charles B. Craver
Freda H. Alverson Professor of Law
The George Washington University Law School

Joshua Dressler
Frank R. Strong Chair in Law
The Ohio State University, Michael E. Moritz College of Law

Paul F. Rothstein
Professor of Law
Georgetown University Law Center

Robin Wellford Slocum
Professor of Law & Director, Legal Research and Writing Program
Chapman University School of Law

Charles J. Tabb
Alice Curtis Campbell Professor of Law
University of Illinois College of Law

Judith Welch Wegner
Professor of Law
University of North Carolina School of Law

Glen Weissenberger
Chair, LexisNexis Law School Publishing Advisory Board
Dean & Professor of Law
DePaul University College of Law
ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AND JUSTICE
READINGS ON THE PRACTICE AND PURPOSES OF ENVIRONMENTAL LAW
THIRD EDITION

Kenneth A. Manaster
Professor of Law
Santa Clara University School of Law
To Ann
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

**Acknowledgments** ........................................... xiii
**Editorial Note** ........................................... xix

**Chapter 1: INTRODUCTION** ................................. 1
A. THE ROLE OF THE ENVIRONMENTAL LAWYER ............... 1
   1. Overview ............................................. 1
   2. The Changing Marketplace ............................. 5
      Ross Sandler, *Where the Jobs Are* .................. 5
      FRANK B. FRIEDMAN, *Practical Guide to Environmental Management* ............... 6
      Note ................................................. 7
B. ETHICAL CONCERNS: THE LAWYER'S VALUES VERSUS DUTY TO THE CLIENT ............... 8
   1. Problems ............................................. 9
   2. Professional Responsibility Standards ............... 11
      AMERICAN BAR ASSOCIATION, *Model Code of Professional Responsibility* ............. 11
      J. William Futrell, *Environmental Ethics, Legal Ethics, and Codes of Professional Responsibility* ............... 15
      David Richman & Donald B. Bauer, *Responsibilities of Lawyers and Engineers to Report Environmental Hazards and Maintain Client Confidences: Duties in Conflict* ............... 17
      IRMA S. RUSSELL, *Issues of Legal Ethics in the Practice of Environmental Law* ............... 18
      Notes ................................................. 19

**Chapter 2: CONCEPTS OF JUSTICE** ......................... 27
A. OVERVIEW ............................................. 27
   Richard O. Brooks, *A New Agenda for Modern Environmental Law* .................. 27
B. THREE TYPES OF CONFLICTS ............................... 28
C. EXERCISE ............................................. 30
D. THREE TYPES OF JUSTICE ................................ 31
   1. Distributive Justice ................................ 32
      John Rawls, *Constitutional Liberty and the Concept of Justice* .................. 32
      Notes ................................................. 33
      Ellen Frankel Paul, *Set-Asides, Reparations and Compensatory Justice* ............. 36
Chapter 3: SETTING REGULATORY AGENDAS .......... 47
A. OVERVIEW .................................. 47
B. SOCIAL, POLITICAL, AND ECONOMIC FACTORS .......... 47
   WILLIAM TUCKER, PROGRESS AND PRIVILEGE: AMERICA IN THE AGE OF ENVIRONMENTALISM .......... 49
   Notes ....................................... 52
   PHILIP SHABECOFF, A FIERCE GREEN FIRE: THE AMERICAN ENVIRONMENTAL MOVEMENT .......... 54
   Notes ....................................... 56
   John P. Dwyer, The Pathology of Symbolic Legislation ............. 57
   Notes ....................................... 56
   U.S. GENERAL ACCOUNTING OFFICE, ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION ISSUES ..................................... 61
   Note ......................................... 64
   Eleanor Randolph, What Cost a Life? EPA Asks Tacoma ....... 65
   Note ......................................... 69
   Richard J. Lazarus, Pursuing “Environmental Justice”: The Distributional Effects of Environmental Protection .......... 72
   Notes ....................................... 76
C. GLOBAL FACTORS ........................................ 72
   U.S. GENERAL ACCOUNTING OFFICE, ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION ISSUES ..................................... 73
   DECLARATION OF THE UNITED NATIONS CONFERENCE ON THE HUMAN ENVIRONMENT ................. 74
   UNITED NATIONS CONFERENCE ON ENVIRONMENT AND DEVELOPMENT, RIO DECLARATION ON ENVIRONMENT AND DEVELOPMENT ........................................ 75
   ALEXANDRE KISS & DINAH SHELTON, INTERNATIONAL ENVIRONMENTAL LAW ..................................... 76
   Notes ....................................... 76
D. RISK ANALYSIS METHODS ................................. 77
   CARNEGIE COMMISSION ON SCIENCE, TECHNOLOGY, AND GOVERNMENT, RISK AND THE ENVIRONMENT: IMPROVING REGULATORY DECISION MAKING ................................. 78
TABLE OF CONTENTS

U.S. ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY SCIENCE ADVISORY BOARD, REDUCING RISK: SETTING PRIORITIES AND STRATEGIES FOR ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION ................................. 82
Peter Huber, Exorcists vs. Gatekeepers in Risk Regulation .......... 88
Notes .............................................. 97
E. RISK ANALYSIS AND EQUITY ................................. 98
U.S. ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY, ENVIRONMENTAL EQUITY: REDUCING RISK FOR ALL COMMUNITIES ................. 99
Robert D. Bullard, Conclusion: Environmentalism with Justice ..................... 103
Notes .............................................. 104

Chapter 4: SELECTING ENFORCEMENT AND CLEANUP TARGETS .................................................. 107
A. OVERVIEW ........................................... 107
B. EXERCISES .......................................... 108
C. ENFORCEMENT STRATEGIES .......................... 110
Kenneth A. Manaster, Early Thoughts on Prosecuting Polluters ............... 110
LeRoy C. Paddock, Environmental Enforcement at the Turn of the Century .......... 112
Clifford Rechtschaffen, Deterrence vs. Cooperation and the Evolving Theory of Environmental Enforcement ............... 113
Mark Seidenfeld et al., „The Friendship of the People“: Citizen Participation in Environmental Enforcement .......... 114
Clifford Rechtschaffen, Promoting Pragmatic Risk Regulation: Is Enforcement Discretion the Answer? .................. 115
D. SOCIAL AND POLITICAL FACTORS .................... 116
Marianne Lavelle & Marcia Coyle, Unequal Protection: The Racial Divide in Environmental Law ....................... 116
Note .............................................. 119
Richard J. Lazarus, Pursuing “Environmental Justice”: The Distributional Effects of Environmental Protection .......... 119
Note .............................................. 121
Mary Bryant, Unequal Justice? Lies, Damn Lies, and Statistics Revisited .......... 122
Note .............................................. 123
Richard J. Lazarus, Pursuing “Environmental Justice”: The Distributional Effects of Environmental Protection .......... 123
Note .............................................. 124
E. THE CHOICE OF CRIMINAL CHARGES ............... 125
LAW OF ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION .................. 125
Richard J. Lazarus, Assimilating Environmental Protection into Legal Rules and the Problem with Environmental Crime .......... 127
Note .............................................. 128
F. THE SIGNIFICANCE OF DILIGENCE ........................................... 128
U.S. DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE, FACTORS IN DECISIONS ON CRIMINAL
PROSECUTIONS FOR ENVIRONMENTAL VIOLATIONS IN THE CONTEXT
OF SIGNIFICANT VOLUNTARY COMPLIANCE OR DISCLOSURE EFFORTS
BY THE VIOLATOR .......................................................... 129
Notes ........................................................................... 131

Chapter 5: ADMINISTERING AND ENFORCING
ENVIRONMENTAL STANDARDS ................................................. 137
A. OVERVIEW .................................................................. 137
B. THE APPLICABLE STANDARDS ........................................ 138
   1. Clarity ...................................................................... 138
      Central States Tire Recycling of Nebraska v. State .............. 138
      State v. Normandale Properties, Inc. .............................. 138
      Exxon Company, U.S.A. v. State of Texas ...................... 140
      Notes ..................................................................... 141
      Ross Neely Express, Inc. v. Alabama Department of
      Environmental Management ......................................... 143
      Notes ..................................................................... 144
   2. Rationality ................................................................. 145
      DANIEL P. SELMI & KENNETH A. MANASTER, STATE
      ENVIRONMENTAL LAW ............................................... 145
      Rockford Drop Forge Company v. Pollution Control Board ... 146
      Notes ..................................................................... 148
   3. Delegation of Powers ................................................... 149
      People v. Martin ......................................................... 149
      Notes ..................................................................... 152
C. THE RIGHT TO BE HEARD .................................................. 154
   Horn v. County of Ventura ............................................... 154
   DANIEL P. SELMI & KENNETH A. MANASTER, STATE ENVIRONMENTAL
   LAW ........................................................................ 157
   Notes ..................................................................... 160
D. UNPREDICTABILITY, DELAY, AND OVERLAPPING
   ENFORCEMENT ............................................................... 160
   Monsanto Company v. Environmental Protection Agency ....... 160
   Notes ..................................................................... 164

Chapter 6: ACCESS TO DECISIONS AND DATA ........................... 169
A. OVERVIEW ................................................................. 169
   DANIEL P. SELMI & KENNETH A. MANASTER, STATE ENVIRONMENTAL
   LAW ........................................................................ 170
   Richard J. Lazarus, Pursuing “Environmental Justice”:
   The Distributional Effects of Environmental Protection ........ 171
   Note ........................................................................ 173
B. ACCESS TO COURT .......................................................... 173
   Lujan v. Defenders of Wildlife ........................................... 173
   Notes ........................................................................ 177
## TABLE OF CONTENTS

*Massachusetts v. Environmental Protection Agency* ............... 178  
Note ......................................................... 183

C. ACCESS TO THE REGULATORY PROCESS .................. 184

1. Participation Rights .................................. 184  
   *Phibro Resources Corporation v. State Department of Environmental Regulation* ......................... 184  
   *United States v. Cannons Engineering Corp.* .............. 187  
   Notes ..................................................... 187

2. Confidentiality Interests .............................. 188  
   *Ruckelshaus v. Monsanto Co.* .......................... 188  
   Notes ..................................................... 191

3. Open Meetings ....................................... 193  
   *Krause v. Reno* ........................................ 193  
   OPINION OF THE ATTORNEY GENERAL, STATE OF CALIFORNIA .... 194  
   Note ..................................................... 195

D. ENGLISH AS A BARRIER ................................. 196  
   Peter L. Reich, *Greening the Ghetto: A Theory of Environmental Race Discrimination* ............ 196  
   *El Pueblo Para el Aire y Agua Limpio v. County of Kings* .......... 196  
   *El Pueblo Para el Aire y Agua Limpio v. County of Kings* .......... 197  
   Notes ..................................................... 198

**Chapter 7: SITING OF POLLUTING FACILITIES** ............... 201

A. OVERVIEW ............................................. 201

B. RACISM AND SITING .................................... 204

1. Historical Background ............................... 205  
   GREEN POWER FOUNDATION, FINAL REPORT: URBAN  
   ENVIRONMENTAL IMPROVEMENT PROJECT — LOS ANGELES —  
   PHASE II .................................................. 205  
   Note ..................................................... 206  
   Roberto Suro, *Pollution Weary Minorities Try Civil Rights Tack* ............. 207  
   Robert D. Bullard, *Environmental Blackmail in Minority Communities* ........ 207  
   Notes ..................................................... 210

2. Data and Debate ..................................... 212  
   COMMISSION FOR RACIAL JUSTICE (UNITED CHURCH OF CHRIST),  
   TOXIC WASTES AND RACE IN THE UNITED STATES: A NATIONAL REPORT ON THE RACIAL AND SOCIO-ECONOMIC CHARACTERISTICS OF COMMUNITIES WITH HAZARDOUS WASTE SITES .......... 212  
   CHRISTOPHER BOERNER ET AL., *ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE?* .......... 218  
Notes ................................................. 227
3. Definitions and Causes .......................... 228
Benjamin F. Chavis, Jr., Foreword ............... 228
Robert D. Bullard, Environmental Equity: Examining the Evidence of Environmental Racism, LAND USE FORUM ........ 228
Tseming Yang, Melding Civil Rights and Environmentalism: Finding Environmental Justice’s Place in Environmental Regulation ........................................ 228
Gerald Torres, Introduction: Understanding Environmental Racism ........................................ 229
Bunyan Bryant & Paul Mohai, Environmental Racism: Reviewing the Evidence ......................... 230
Notes .................................................... 232
ROBERT D. BULLARD, DUMPING IN DIXIE: RACE, CLASS, AND ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY .................... 233
Richard J. Lazarus, Pursuing “Environmental Justice”: The Distributional Effects of Environmental Protection .... 234
Note ..................................................... 236
Vicki Been, Locally Undesirable Land Uses in Minority Neighborhoods: Disproportionate Siting or Market Dynamics? .................................................. 237
Notes ..................................................... 241
C. LEGAL TOOLS AND STRATEGIES ......................... 246
1. Linkage to Concepts of Justice ............... 246
Vicki Been, What’s Fairness Got To Do With It? Environmental Justice and the Siting of Locally Undesirable Land Uses .... 247
Note ..................................................... 248
2. The Need for Legal Action ....................... 249
Robert D. Bullard, Environmentalism with Justice .... 249
Vicki Been, What’s Fairness Got To Do With It? Environmental Justice and the Siting of Locally Undesirable Land Uses .... 250
CHRISTOPHER BOERNER ET AL., ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE? .................... 250
ROBERT D. BULLARD, DUMPING IN DIXIE: RACE, CLASS, AND ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY .................... 254
Notes ..................................................... 254
3. State Siting Statutes .............................. 255
Rachel D. Godsil, Remediing Environmental Racism .... 256
Stablex Corporation v. Town of Hooksett ........... 259
City of Shelton v. Commissioner of the Department of Environmental Protection ....................... 267
Notes ..................................................... 268
4. Litigation Theories ............................... 270
a. Environmental Statutes ......................... 270
First National Bank v. Richardson ................. 271
Notes ..................................................... 272
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

*In the Matter of Genesee Power Station Limited*

- Partnership .................................................. 274
- Notes ......................................................... 278

b. *Equal Protection Doctrine* .................................. 281

- Peter L. Reich, *Greening the Ghetto: A Theory of Environmental Race Discrimination* ............... 281
- *Bean v. Southwestern Waste Management Corporation* .......... 283
- *East Bibb Twiggs Neighborhood Association v. Macon-Bibb County Planning & Zoning Commission* ............. 289
- Peter L. Reich, *Greening the Ghetto: A Theory of Environmental Race Discrimination* ............... 291

c. *Title VI of the Civil Rights Act of 1964* ................. 293

- Richard J. Lazarus, *Pursuing “Environmental Justice”: The Distributional Effects of Environmental Protection* ......... 293
- Notes ......................................................... 295
- U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Draft Title VI Guidance ......................................................... 301
- Note ......................................................... 315

**D. PRESIDENTIAL AND CONGRESSIONAL RESPONSES** ........ 316

- Executive Order 12898, Federal Actions to Address Environmental Justice in Minority Populations and Low-Income Populations ......................................................... 316
- President William J. Clinton, Memorandum on Environmental Justice ......................................................... 318
- David Schoenbrod, *Environmental “Injustice” Is About Politics, Not Racism* ......................................................... 319
- Notes ......................................................... 321

**Table of Cases** ................................................ TC-1

**Index** ......................................................... I-1
I wish to express my appreciation for the talented research assistance of the Santa Clara law students who helped in the initial preparation of this book: Brian Frank, Brian Heffernan, Alexandra McClure, Ted Stevens, and Amy Treadwell. In preparing the Second Edition, I received helpful suggestions from some of the professors at other schools who have used the book in their courses, and I am very grateful for their insights. Those professors are Craig Anthony Arnold, Alan Ramo, Irma Russell, Carlton Waterhouse, and Tseming Yang. Preparation of the Third Edition was assisted with remarkable skill and diligence by Santa Clara law students Ahan Kim Morris, Hilary Stevenson, and Akshay Verma.

My thanks for their generous and hard work also go to Barbara Friedrich, Reference Librarian, and Angeles de Leon, Alyssa deMars, Dorice Kunis, and Dorothy Madden, Administrative Assistants, The gracious support of Deans Gerald F. Uelmen, Mack A. Player, and Donald J. Polden was indispensable. At the publishers, the initial interest and guidance of Sean Caldwell, Dee Dunn, and Glen Weissenberger, and the later assistance of Keith Moore and Pali Chheda, also meant a great deal to me.

My deepest gratitude is to my family: To my daughter, Jenny, for her enthusiastic, continuing interest in this project; my son, Cole, for the extra opportunities he gave me to think about the first edition of this work (and even this sentence) during nighttime feedings in his first four months in 1994; and most especially to my wife, Ann Brandewie, for her unfailing support and so much more for which I am thankful beyond words.

Finally, I gratefully acknowledge the permissions granted by the authors and publishers of the following works to reproduce excerpts in this book:


ACKNOWLEDGMENTS


ACKNOWLEDGMENTS


Monroe H. Freedman & Michael Tigar, DEBATE ON PUBLIC INTEREST LIMITS ON EFFECTIVE ADVOCACY (1970). Reprinted by permission of the authors.


Frank B. Friedman, PRACTICAL GUIDE TO ENVIRONMENTAL MANAGEMENT (2003).

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS


Kenneth A. Manaster, Early Thoughts on Prosecuting Polluters, 2 Ecology Law Quarterly 471 (1971). Copyright © 1971 by Ecology Law Qua-
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS


Peter L. Reich, Greening the Ghetto: A Theory of Environmental Race Discrimination, 41 UNIVERSITY OF KANSAS LAW REVIEW 271. Reprinted by permission of the University of Kansas Law Review.


SANTA CLARA CENTER FOR OCCUPATIONAL SAFETY AND HEALTH, LETTER EXCERPTED IN SILICON VALLEY TOXICS ACTION, Vol. 13, No. 1 (Spring 1994). Reprinted by permission of the authors.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS


Philip Shabecoff, A Fierce Green Fire. Copyright © 2003 by the author. Reproduced by permission of Island Press, Washington, D.C.


EDITORIAL NOTE

In the excerpts from other works in this book, the editorial omission of words within a sentence is indicated by an ellipsis. Omissions of sentences and paragraphs, however, usually are not indicated.

Similarly, omissions of footnotes and citations from an excerpt are seldom shown. When a footnote has been retained, the original numbering has not been followed.

Footnotes appearing within an excerpt but added by the author of this book are preceded by “[Ed.]”