

# UNDERSTANDING EMPLOYMENT DISCRIMINATION

Second Edition

## **LEXISNEXIS LAW SCHOOL ADVISORY BOARD**

**Charles P. Craver**

*Freda H. Alverson Professor of Law*  
The George Washington University Law School

**Richard D. Freer**

*Robert Howell Hall Professor of Law*  
Emory University School of Law

**Craig Joyce**

*Andrews Kurth Professor of Law &  
Co-Director, Institute for Intellectual Property and Information Law*  
University of Houston Law Center

**Ellen S. Podgor**

*Professor of Law &  
Associate Dean of Faculty Development and Electronic Education*  
Stetson University College of Law

**Paul F. Rothstein**

*Professor of Law*  
Georgetown University Law Center

**Robin Wellford Slocum**

*Professor of Law & Director,  
Legal Research and Writing Program*  
Chapman University School of Law

**Charles J. Tabb**

*Alice Curtis Campbell Professor of Law*  
University of Illinois College of Law

**David I. C. Thomson**

*LP Professor & Director, Lawyering Process Program*  
University of Denver, Sturm College of Law

**Judith Welch Wegner**

*Professor of Law*  
University of North Carolina School of Law

# UNDERSTANDING EMPLOYMENT DISCRIMINATION

---

Second Edition

**Thomas R. Haggard**

*Distinguished Professor of Law Emeritus  
University of South Carolina School of Law*

*With*

**Tracey C. Green, Esq.**

*and*

**Leigh Nason, Esq.**

*Contributing*



LexisNexis®

ISBN: 978-1-4224-7358-0

**Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data**

Haggard, Thomas R.  
Understanding employment discrimination/ Thomas R. Haggard.— 2nd ed.  
p. cm.  
Includes index.  
ISBN 978-1-4224-2264-9 (soft cover)  
1. Discrimination in employment—Law and legislation—United States. I. Title.  
KF3464.H34 2008  
344.7301'133—dc22  
2008016452

This publication is designed to provide accurate and authoritative information in regard to the subject matter covered. It is sold with the understanding that the publisher is not engaged in rendering legal, accounting, or other professional services. If legal advice or other expert assistance is required, the services of a competent professional should be sought.

LexisNexis, the knowledge burst logo, and Michie are trademarks of Reed Elsevier Properties Inc, used under license. Matthew Bender is a registered trademark of Matthew Bender Properties Inc.

Copyright © 2008 Matthew Bender & Company, Inc., a member of the LexisNexis Group.  
All Rights Reserved.

No copyright is claimed in the text of statutes, regulations, and excerpts from court opinions quoted within this work. Permission to copy material exceeding fair use, 17 U.S.C. § 107, may be licensed for a fee of 25¢ per page per copy from the Copyright Clearance Center, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, Mass. 01923, telephone (978) 750-8400.

**NOTE TO USERS**

To ensure that you are using the latest materials available in this area, please be sure to periodically check the LexisNexis Law School web site for downloadable updates and supplements at [www.lexisnexus.com/lawschool](http://www.lexisnexus.com/lawschool).

Editorial Offices  
744 Broad Street, Newark, NJ 07102 (973) 820-2000  
201 Mission St., San Francisco, CA 94105-1831 (415) 908-3200  
[www.lexisnexus.com](http://www.lexisnexus.com)

MATTHEW  BENDER

(2008-Pub.1191)

# *DEDICATION*

---

Dedicated to my Grandchildren—  
Danielle Gray Crowley,  
Sarah Elizabeth Hudgins,  
Laura Nell Hudgins, and  
John Ross Crowley



# PREFACE

---

The operative word in the title of this book, *Understanding*, may promise more than it can deliver. It would be a presumptuous author indeed to claim to fully understand this area of the law — if that is taken to mean *knowing* all of the literally thousands of highly technical statutory and decisional rules, *comprehending* what they mean in their individual capacities; *reconciling* them into a coherent whole; and *appreciating their practical consequences* in both the workplace and in the practice of employment discrimination law.

The reasons for this obstacle to full understanding are manifold.

- First, employment discrimination law flows not from a single statutory source, but from many statutes (federal and state), constitutional provisions, administrative regulations, and cases construing these primary sources.

- Second, these sources of law, particularly the statutes and regulations, are complex and lengthy documents that do not yield easily to paraphrase. The cases construing them are similarly prolix and difficult to untangle.

- Third, many of the statutes and administrative regulations are not adroitly drafted, leaving enormous gaps and ambiguities.

- Fourth, in attempting to fill the gaps and resolve the ambiguities, the lower courts often reach conflicting decisions. Significant differences exist between each federal circuit, between panels on each circuit, between the districts within each federal circuit, and even between the individual judges within the districts and circuits. These differences account for the proportionately large number of Supreme Court decisions devoted to employment discrimination law. But the Supreme Court cannot resolve every conflict, and so employment discrimination law remains highly federal circuit/district specific.

- Fifth, when the Supreme Court does purport to resolve the differences and clarify the law, its decisions are often beset with concurring and dissenting opinions. The precise holding of many Supreme Court cases and the significance of these decisions are fertile areas of even further disagreement among the scholars and lower courts. And it is not uncommon for the Court to revisit an issue several years later, to explain what they *really* meant in a prior decision.

- Sixth, Congress has not been hesitant to legislatively overrule the Supreme Court decisions it disagrees with. And from a purely drafting perspective, its handiwork often leaves much to be desired. These legislative overrulings then take the courts back to the drawing board to begin anew the case-by-case process of working out the details of the law.

- Seventh, even when some degree of precision and certainty is attained on a particular issue, the result is an onion-like body of law, with layer upon layer of rules, subordinate rules, exceptions to the rules, and exceptions to the exceptions.

- Eighth, the language of employment discrimination law is ripe with terms of art, jargon, acronyms, and case-name substitutes for the more descriptive names of various

---

## PREFACE

doctrines, theories, and methods of proof. Although this book has tried to minimize the confusing impact of this — with terms of art, for example, often being printed in italics — the practitioner of this art must, perforce, learn its language.

- And ninth, whatever the law is today, it is likely to be different tomorrow.

In sum, employment discrimination law is like a huge jigsaw puzzle — albeit one with many missing, mismatched, and constantly changing pieces. It can also be put together in a variety of ways at any given time, depending on one's vision — and even then the total picture is a matter of interpretation.

What can the student and beginning practitioner do? First, there are some fundamental concepts, principles, doctrines, and theories that do endure from season to season. They are the relatively stable foundation upon which the superstructure of employment discrimination law is being built — and constantly rebuilt. The primary purpose of this book is to help with the achievement of that level of understanding. Second, anyone studying or working in this field should also have at least a general grasp of what the superstructure looks like at the moment. A knowledge of the major legal rules, and of the fact that differences exist with respect to their specific details, is necessary in order to understand the significance and meaning of the changes as they occur. Although writing at that level is like shooting at a rapidly moving target, the second purpose of this book is to summarize those rules as they currently exist — as I understand them, and this too may be subject to disagreement by others also well-versed in the field.

I extend my thanks to the many people who contributed, directly or indirectly, to this undertaking. My students over the last 25 years, who expected me to provide them with some degree of *understanding* rather than leaving them in a state of puzzlement, forced me to grapple with legal issues that would have been easier to gloss over or ignore. And the honest give-and-take of our classroom discussions enriched my appreciation for the diversity of legal conclusions that might flow from a common set of premises.

The practicing lawyers who I worked with as Of Counsel to several law firms provided me with invaluable insights about how the law can be used effectively to resolve or forestall actual discrimination disputes in the workplace. And they taught me to appreciate the difference between matters that are of practical significance and those that are purely academic interest, causing me to focus this book on the former rather than the latter.

The authors of the many fine casebooks and treatises have significantly enhanced my understanding of the law, have been instructive on the various ways in which the materials can be organized, and have provided enlightenment of which cases and topics deserve coverage in this book — which is intended to supplement, not supplant, those more comprehensive sources of information.

Finally, two former students, who are now enormously successful practitioners, have contributed in a more literal and significant sense. Tracey C. Green is Special Counsel with Willoughby and Hoefer, P.A., of Columbia, South Carolina. His expertise in the procedural device through which the constitutional protections are enforced, Section 1893, and knowledge of the confusing limitations of the Eleventh Amendment have provided an enormous depth to this book. Leigh Nason, Shareholder with Ogletree,



---

## *PREFACE*

Deakins, Nash, Smoak & Stewart, PC, in the Columbia, South Carolina office, has likewise provided an in-depth coverage of the special nondiscrimination duties of government contractors, Executive Order 11246, and of the atypical nondiscrimination precepts of the Americans With Disabilities Act. I am proud to have worked with them on the book.

To all the readers of this book: I wish you success, happiness, and a fulfilling career in the law. And as you continue your reading and study of the law, remember . . .

*Of making many books, there is no end, and much study is a weariness of the flesh.*

*Ecclesiastes 12:12*

*Thomas R. Haggard  
Columbia, South Carolina  
May 2008*



# Table of Contents

<b>Part I.</b>	<b>INTRODUCTION</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>Chapter 1</b>	<b>AN OVERVIEW</b>	<b>3</b>
§ 1.01	THE SOURCES OF EMPLOYMENT DISCRIMINATION LAW	3
[A]	The United States Constitution	3
[B]	The Civil Rights Act of 1964	4
[C]	The Age Discrimination in Employment Act	4
[D]	The Civil Rights Act of 1866, Section 1981	4
[E]	Civil Rights Act of 1871, Section 1983	5
[F]	The Civil Rights Act of 1871, Section 1985(3)	5
[G]	The Equal Pay Act of 1963	5
[H]	Executive Order 11246	6
[I]	The Americans with Disabilities Act	6
[J]	Administrative Regulations	6
[K]	State and Local Anti-Discrimination Laws	7
[L]	Contract and Tort Theories	7
§ 1.02	RECONCILING THE VARIOUS SOURCES OF LAW	8
§ 1.03	STATUTORY INTERPRETATION	9
[A]	Legislative Intent	9
[B]	Interpretative Guidelines	9
§ 1.04	CHAPTER HIGHLIGHTS	10
<b>Part II.</b>	<b>CONSTITUTIONAL PROHIBITIONS</b>	<b>11</b>
<b>Chapter 2</b>	<b>THE PROSCRIBED BASES</b>	<b>13</b>
§ 2.01	CONSTITUTIONAL SOURCES	13
[A]	The Equal Protection Clause	13
[B]	Other Constitutional Provisions	14
§ 2.02	DISCRIMINATION ON THE BASIS OF RACE	15
[A]	The General Rule	15
[B]	Affirmative Action	15
[1]	Introduction	15
[2]	The Test	15
[3]	<i>Compelling</i> State Interests	16
[4]	Relationship with Title VII	17
§ 2.03	DISCRIMINATION ON THE BASIS OF NATIONAL ORIGIN	18

---

## Table of Contents

§ 2.04	DISCRIMINATION ON THE BASIS OF SEX . . . . .	18
§ 2.05	DISCRIMINATION ON THE BASIS OF SEXUAL ORIENTATION . . . . .	19
§ 2.06	DISCRIMINATION ON THE BASIS OF AGE . . . . .	21
§ 2.07	DISCRIMINATION ON THE BASIS OF DISABILITY . . . . .	21
§ 2.08	DISCRIMINATION ON THE BASIS OF STATE RESIDENCE . . . .	22
§ 2.09	DISCRIMINATION ON THE BASIS OF CITIZENSHIP . . . . .	23
§ 2.10	DISCRIMINATION ON THE BASIS OF RELIGION . . . . .	23
§ 2.11	DISCRIMINATION ON THE BASIS OF THE EXERCISE OF OTHER FIRST AMENDMENT RIGHTS . . . . .	25
[A]	Speech . . . . .	25
[B]	Association . . . . .	26
§ 2.12	CHAPTER HIGHLIGHTS . . . . .	26
<b>Chapter 3</b>	<b>THE ELEVENTH AMENDMENT . . . . .</b>	<b>29</b>
§ 3.01	INTRODUCTION . . . . .	29
§ 3.02	THE STATE FOR ELEVENTH AMENDMENT PURPOSES .	30
§ 3.03	STATE OFFICIALS AND <i>EX PARTE YOUNG</i> . . . . .	31
§ 3.04	STATE WAIVER OF IMMUNITY . . . . .	32
§ 3.05	CONGRESSIONAL ABROGATION OF STATE IMMUNITY . . . . .	33
§ 3.06	CHAPTER HIGHLIGHTS . . . . .	36
<b>Part III.</b>	<b>THE CIVIL RIGHTS ACT OF 1964 . . . . .</b>	<b>37</b>
<b>Chapter 4</b>	<b>THE CIVIL RIGHTS ACT — AN OVERVIEW . . . . .</b>	<b>39</b>
§ 4.01	INTRODUCTION . . . . .	40
§ 4.02	THE PROHIBITED BASES OF THE CONDUCT . . . . .	40
[A]	The Limited Statutory Definitions . . . . .	40
[B]	Proxy Analysis . . . . .	40
§ 4.03	ENTITIES SUBJECT TO THE PROHIBITION . . . . .	41
[A]	Employers . . . . .	41
[1]	Liability of Supervisors and Other Corporate-Related Individuals . . . . .	42
[2]	The Aggregation of Nominally Separate Entities . . . . .	43
[3]	Employers Who Discriminate against Employees of Other Employers . . . . .	44
[4]	Provider and Client Employers of Leased or Contingent Employees . . . . .	44

---

## Table of Contents

[5]	Employer Exclusions . . . . .	45
[B]	Labor Organizations . . . . .	45
[C]	Employment Agencies . . . . .	46
§ 4.04	PROTECTED PERSONS . . . . .	46
[A]	Employees . . . . .	47
[1]	Employee Versus Independent Contractor . . . . .	47
[2]	Partners as <i>Employees</i> of the Partnership . . . . .	48
[3]	Directors and Stockholders as <i>Employees</i> of a Professional Corporation . . . . .	48
[4]	Elected Officials, Personal Staff, and Policy Advisors . . . . .	49
[5]	Miscellaneous . . . . .	49
[B]	Union Members, Applicants, and Others with a Union Connection . . . . .	50
[C]	Employment Agency Clients . . . . .	50
§ 4.05	THE PROHIBITED CONDUCT . . . . .	50
[A]	The Basic Terms of the Statute . . . . .	50
[1]	Employer Conduct . . . . .	50
[2]	Employment Agency Conduct . . . . .	51
[3]	Labor Organization Conduct . . . . .	51
[B]	The <i>Discriminatory</i> Nature of the Conduct . . . . .	52
[C]	The State-of-Mind and Causation Requirements . . . . .	52
§ 4.06	REMEDIES AND ENFORCEMENT MECHANISMS . . . . .	53
§ 4.07	A BIRD’S-EYE VIEW OF THE MATERIALS . . . . .	53
§ 4.08	CHAPTER HIGHLIGHTS . . . . .	54

---

## Chapter 5 INDIVIDUAL DISPARATE TREATMENT . . . . . 57

---

§ 5.01	INTRODUCTION . . . . .	57
§ 5.02	THE DISCRIMINATORY STATE-OF-MIND REQUIREMENT . . . . .	58
§ 5.03	PROOF OF CAUSATION . . . . .	59
[A]	Logical Theories of Causation . . . . .	59
[B]	Title VII Causation . . . . .	60
§ 5.04	SINGLE VERSUS MIXED MOTIVE DECISIONS . . . . .	61
§ 5.05	SOME SIMPLE PARADIGMS OF PROOF . . . . .	62
[A]	Model I . . . . .	63
[B]	Model II . . . . .	63
[C]	Model III . . . . .	64
§ 5.06	MODEL I — EVIDENTIARY ISSUES . . . . .	64
[A]	Statements and Documents Admitting Discriminatory Intent . . . . .	65
[B]	Evidence Comparing the Treatment of Specific Individuals . . . . .	65

---

## Table of Contents

[C]	Epithets, Derogatory Remarks, Demeaning Jokes and Comments, and Expressions of Stereotypical Views . . . . .	66
[D]	Evidence Relating to the <i>Same Actor</i> Defense . . . . .	68
§ 5.07	MODEL II — THE PRIMA FACIE CASE METHOD OF PROOF . . . . .	68
[A]	Plaintiff Proves the Elements of the Prima Facie Case . . . . .	69
[B]	Defendant Articulates a “Legitimate Nondiscriminatory Reason” . . . . .	72
[C]	Plaintiff Proves Pretext . . . . .	74
§ 5.08	MODEL III.A — ESTABLISHING A BONA FIDE OCCUPATIONAL QUALIFICATION DEFENSE . . . . .	78
§ 5.09	MODEL III.B — MIXED MOTIVE EMPLOYMENT DECISIONS . . . . .	79
§ 5.10	MODEL III.C — THE AFTER-ACQUIRED EVIDENCE DEFENSE . . . . .	84
§ 5.11	THE AFFIRMATIVE ACTION DEFENSE . . . . .	85
§ 5.12	CHAPTER HIGHLIGHTS . . . . .	87
<b>Chapter 6</b>	<b>SYSTEMIC DISPARATE TREATMENT . . . . .</b>	<b>91</b>
§ 6.01	INTRODUCTION . . . . .	91
§ 6.02	THE SCHEME OF PROOF . . . . .	91
[A]	Stage I . . . . .	91
[B]	Stage II . . . . .	94
§ 6.03	CHAPTER HIGHLIGHTS . . . . .	94
<b>Chapter 7</b>	<b>DISPARATE IMPACT . . . . .</b>	<b>95</b>
§ 7.01	THE ORIGIN OF THE THEORY . . . . .	95
§ 7.02	THE <i>GRIGGS/ALBERMARLE</i> MODEL . . . . .	97
[A]	A Statistically Significant Disparate Impact . . . . .	97
[B]	Business Necessity . . . . .	99
[C]	Pretext . . . . .	100
§ 7.03	THE <i>WARDS COVE</i> REFORMULATION OF THE TEST . .	101
§ 7.04	THE CIVIL RIGHTS ACT OF 1991 . . . . .	103
§ 7.05	THE SECTION 703(h) EXCEPTIONS . . . . .	106
[A]	Professionally Developed Tests . . . . .	106
[B]	Seniority Systems . . . . .	108
[C]	Merit and Piecework . . . . .	109
§ 7.06	CHAPTER HIGHLIGHTS . . . . .	109

---

## Table of Contents

<b>Chapter 8</b>	<b>SPECIAL PROBLEMS RELATING TO RACE DISCRIMINATION</b>	<b>113</b>
§ 8.01	THE MEANING OF “RACE”	113
§ 8.02	FORMS OF DISCRIMINATION	113
§ 8.03	MISCELLANEOUS RACE DISCRIMINATION ISSUES	114
[A]	Proxy Analysis	114
[B]	Association	114
[C]	Race-Plus Discrimination	115
[D]	Dress and Grooming Codes	115
§ 8.04	JUSTIFICATIONS AND DEFENSES	115
§ 8.05	RACIAL HARASSMENT	116
§ 8.06	CHAPTER HIGHLIGHTS	116
 <b>Chapter 9</b>	 <b>SPECIAL PROBLEMS RELATING TO SEX DISCRIMINATION</b>	 <b>117</b>
§ 9.01	HISTORY	117
§ 9.02	PREGNANCY DISCRIMINATION	118
[A]	Introduction	118
[B]	More Favorable Treatment	119
[C]	Pregnancy Benefits for Spouses	120
[D]	The Absence of Any Medical or Leave Benefits	120
[E]	Fetal Vulnerability	120
[F]	Non-Pregnancy as a BFOQ	121
[G]	Questions about Marital Status and Child-Bearing Plans	122
§ 9.03	SEXUAL HARASSMENT	122
[A]	Quid Pro Quo Harassment	122
[1]	Proof	122
[2]	The Quid Pro Quo Implication of <i>Consensual Office Affairs</i>	123
[B]	Hostile Environment Sexual Harassment	124
[1]	Satisfying the Literal Language and Requirements of the Statute	124
[2]	Unwelcomeness	125
[3]	Severe or Pervasive	126
[C]	Third Party Claims	127
[D]	Same-Sex Harassment	127
[E]	Employer Liability	128
[F]	The First Amendment Defense	132

---

## *Table of Contents*

§ 9.04	SEXUAL ORIENTATION AND IDENTITY . . . . .	132
§ 9.05	COMPENSATION DISCRIMINATION . . . . .	133
[A]	The Equal Pay Act and the Bennett Amendment . . . . .	133
[B]	Proof of Intent . . . . .	134
§ 9.06	DRESS AND GROOMING CODES . . . . .	134
§ 9.07	DISCRIMINATORY ADVERTISEMENTS . . . . .	135
§ 9.08	CHAPTER HIGHLIGHTS . . . . .	135
<b>Chapter 10</b>	<b>SPECIAL PROBLEMS RELATING TO NATIONAL ORIGIN DISCRIMINATION . . . . .</b>	<b>139</b>
§ 10.01	DEFINITION OF “NATIONAL ORIGIN” . . . . .	139
§ 10.02	PROOF OF A VIOLATION . . . . .	139
§ 10.03	LANGUAGE DISCRIMINATION . . . . .	140
[A]	Accent Discrimination . . . . .	140
[B]	Fluency Requirements . . . . .	140
[C]	English-Only Rules . . . . .	141
§ 10.04	CHAPTER HIGHLIGHTS . . . . .	142
<b>Chapter 11</b>	<b>SPECIAL PROBLEMS RELATING TO RELIGIOUS DISCRIMINATION . . . . .</b>	<b>143</b>
§ 11.01	THE DEFINITION OF “RELIGION” . . . . .	143
§ 11.02	DISPARATE TREATMENT . . . . .	145
§ 11.03	DISPARATE IMPACT . . . . .	145
§ 11.04	THE DUTY TO ACCOMMODATE . . . . .	146
[A]	History . . . . .	146
[B]	The Analytical Model . . . . .	147
[C]	The Meaning of <i>Undue Hardship</i> . . . . .	147
[D]	Recurring Accommodation Situations . . . . .	149
[1]	Religious Holidays and Work Schedules . . . . .	149
[2]	Dress and Grooming Codes . . . . .	149
[3]	Union Membership . . . . .	150
[4]	Mandatory Devotional Services . . . . .	150
[5]	Miscellaneous . . . . .	151
§ 11.05	RELIGIOUS HARASSMENT . . . . .	151
§ 11.06	RELIGION AS A BFOQ . . . . .	152
§ 11.07	STATUTORY EXEMPTIONS . . . . .	152
§ 11.08	CONSTITUTIONAL ISSUES . . . . .	154
[A]	Establishment Clause . . . . .	154



---

## Table of Contents

[1]	The Accommodation Duty . . . . .	154
[2]	The Exemptions . . . . .	154
[B]	Free Exercise . . . . .	155
[1]	The Ministerial Exemption . . . . .	155
[2]	Secular Employers with Religious Beliefs . . . . .	156
§ 11.09	CHAPTER HIGHLIGHTS . . . . .	157
<b>Chapter 12</b>	<b>RETALIATION . . . . .</b>	<b>159</b>
§ 12.01	COVERAGE . . . . .	159
§ 12.02	THE NATURE OF THE PROHIBITED RETALIATORY CONDUCT . . . . .	160
§ 12.03	STANDARD OF CAUSATION AND MIXED-MOTIVE ANALYSIS . . . . .	162
§ 12.04	PROOF OF A VIOLATION . . . . .	162
§ 12.05	THE OPPOSITION CLAUSE . . . . .	163
[A]	What Constitutes “Opposition” . . . . .	163
[1]	Crossing the Threshold . . . . .	163
[2]	Going <i>Beyond the Pale</i> . . . . .	164
[B]	The Meaning of “An Unlawful Practice” . . . . .	165
§ 12.06	THE PARTICIPATION CLAUSE . . . . .	165
§ 12.07	OPPOSITION/PARTICIPATION BY MANAGEMENT . . .	166
§ 12.08	CHAPTER HIGHLIGHTS . . . . .	166
<b>Chapter 13</b>	<b>DISCRIMINATION BY LABOR UNIONS . . . . .</b>	<b>169</b>
§ 13.01	THE NATURE OF THE PROSCRIBED DISCRIMINATION . . . . .	169
[A]	Membership . . . . .	170
[B]	Hiring Halls and Union Referral Arrangements . . . . .	170
[C]	Apprenticeship Programs . . . . .	171
[D]	Causing an Employer to Discriminate . . . . .	171
[E]	Representational Matters . . . . .	171
[1]	Handling Grievances . . . . .	172
[2]	Collective Bargaining . . . . .	172
[F]	Religious Accommodation . . . . .	173
§ 13.02	LIABILITY ISSUES . . . . .	173
[A]	Liability for Acts of Officers . . . . .	173
[B]	Liability of Higher Union Organizations . . . . .	174
[C]	Joint Union-Employer Liability . . . . .	174

---

## Table of Contents

§ 13.03	CHAPTER HIGHLIGHTS .....	174
<b>Chapter 14</b>	<b>DISCRIMINATION BY EMPLOYMENT AGENCIES ..</b>	<b>177</b>
§ 14.01	THE PROHIBITED DISCRIMINATION .....	177
§ 14.02	DISCRIMINATION IN PROCESSING AND CLASSIFICATION .....	177
§ 14.03	ACCEPTING DISCRIMINATORY JOB ORDERS .....	178
§ 14.04	THE BFOQ DEFENSE .....	178
§ 14.05	REFUSING TO REFER .....	178
§ 14.06	DISCRIMINATORY ADVERTISING .....	179
§ 14.07	REMEDIES .....	179
§ 14.08	CHAPTER HIGHLIGHTS .....	179
<b>Chapter 15</b>	<b>TITLE VII PROCEDURE — AN OVERVIEW .....</b>	<b>181</b>
§ 15.01	INTRODUCTION .....	181
§ 15.02	THE EQUAL EMPLOYMENT OPPORTUNITY COMMISSION .....	181
§ 15.03	THREE PROCEDURAL/ENFORCEMENT MODELS FOR PRIVATE AND STATE EMPLOYEES .....	182
[A]	The Basic Model .....	182
[B]	Procedure in Deferral States .....	183
[C]	Worksharing Agreements .....	183
<b>Chapter 16</b>	<b>FILING AND PROCESSING CHARGES .....</b>	<b>185</b>
§ 16.01	CONTENT AND FORMAL REQUIREMENTS .....	185
§ 16.02	IDENTITY OF THE CHARGING PARTY .....	186
[A]	Person Aggrieved .....	186
[B]	On Behalf of a Person Aggrieved .....	188
[C]	Commissioner Charges .....	188
§ 16.03	TIME LIMITS .....	188
§ 16.04	DETERMINING WHEN A DISCRIMINATORY ACT OCCURS .....	189
[A]	<i>The Perpetuation or Present Effects of Prior Discrimination Theory</i> .....	189
[B]	<i>The Notice of Decision Rule</i> .....	192
[C]	Continuing Violations .....	193
[D]	Waiver, Estoppel, and Equitable Tolling .....	194

---

## *Table of Contents*

§ 16.05	EEOC PROCEDURES .....	195
§ 16.06	EEOC FILES AND DETERMINATION LETTERS .....	196
§ 16.07	CHAPTER HIGHLIGHTS .....	197
<b>Chapter 17</b>	<b>LITIGATION .....</b>	<b>199</b>
§ 17.01	EXHAUSTION REQUIREMENTS .....	199
§ 17.02	MANDATORY ARBITRATION OF CLAIMS .....	199
§ 17.03	THE PRECLUSIVE EFFECT OF PRIOR ADJUDICATIONS .....	201
§ 17.04	TIME AND FILING REQUIREMENTS .....	202
§ 17.05	PRIVATE PARTY SUITS .....	203
§ 17.06	EEOC AND JUSTICE DEPARTMENT LITIGATION .....	204
§ 17.07	CLASS ACTIONS .....	204
[A]	The Basic Requirements .....	204
[1]	Rule 23(a) — Numerosity, Commonality, Typicality, and Adequacy .....	204
[2]	Rule 23(b) — The Suitability of the Case for Class Action Treatment .....	206
[B]	The Effect of the 1991 Amendments .....	206
§ 17.08	PARTY DEFENDANTS .....	206
§ 17.09	SCOPE OF THE SUIT .....	207
§ 17.10	CHAPTER HIGHLIGHTS .....	208
<b>Chapter 18</b>	<b>REMEDIES .....</b>	<b>211</b>
§ 18.01	INTRODUCTION .....	211
§ 18.02	INJUNCTIVE AND AFFIRMATIVE RELIEF .....	212
[A]	Ending and Curing the Discrimination .....	212
[B]	Race/Gender-Conscious Affirmative Relief .....	213
[C]	Prospective, Class-Wide Remedies .....	214
§ 18.03	MONETARY COMPENSATION .....	214
[A]	Back Pay and Other Lost Benefits .....	214
[1]	The Presumption .....	214
[2]	Calculation .....	215
[3]	Period Covered .....	215
[B]	Front Pay .....	215
[C]	Compensatory and Punitive Damages .....	216
[1]	Compensatory Damages .....	216
[2]	Punitive Damages .....	217

---

## Table of Contents

[3]	Limits on Compensatory and Punitive Damages . . . . .	218
[4]	Jury Trial . . . . .	219
§ 18.04	ATTORNEY’S FEES AND COSTS . . . . .	219
[A]	Attorney’s Fees . . . . .	219
[1]	The Test . . . . .	219
[2]	The Meaning of “Prevailing” . . . . .	220
[3]	Calculation . . . . .	222
[B]	Costs . . . . .	222
§ 18.05	CHAPTER HIGHLIGHTS . . . . .	222
<hr/>		
<b>Part IV.</b>	<b>THE AGE DISCRIMINATION IN EMPLOYMENT ACT . . . . .</b>	<b>225</b>
<b>Chapter 19</b>	<b>COVERAGE AND JURISDICTION . . . . .</b>	<b>227</b>
<hr/>		
§ 19.01	THE PROSCRIBED BASIS OF DISCRIMINATION . . . . .	227
§ 19.02	ENTITIES SUBJECT TO THE PROHIBITION . . . . .	227
§ 19.03	THE PROTECTED CLASS . . . . .	228
§ 19.04	CHAPTER HIGHLIGHTS . . . . .	229
<b>Chapter 20</b>	<b>TYPES OF VIOLATIONS AND THEIR PROOF . . . . .</b>	<b>231</b>
<hr/>		
§ 20.01	INDIVIDUAL, SINGLE MOTIVE DISPARATE TREATMENT . . . . .	231
[A]	Open Admission of Age Motivations and Policies Expressly Using an Age Criterion . . . . .	232
[B]	Ageist Comments and <i>Code Words</i> . . . . .	232
[C]	Use of Comparators . . . . .	233
[D]	Proving Discrimination Through the <i>McDonnell Douglas</i> Method . . . . .	234
§ 20.02	AFTER-ACQUIRED EVIDENCE . . . . .	235
§ 20.03	INDIVIDUAL, MIXED MOTIVE DISPARATE TREATMENT . . . . .	236
§ 20.04	SYSTEMIC DISPARATE TREATMENT . . . . .	236
§ 20.05	DISPARATE IMPACT . . . . .	237
§ 20.06	DEFENSES AND EXCEPTIONS . . . . .	238
[A]	“Reasonable Factors other than Age” and “Good Cause” . .	238
[B]	BFOQ . . . . .	238
[C]	Foreign Law . . . . .	239
[D]	Bona Fide Seniority System . . . . .	239

---

## *Table of Contents*

[E]	Bona Fide Employment Benefit Plan . . . . .	239
[F]	Bona Fide Executive Exception . . . . .	240
[G]	Early Retirement Incentive Plans . . . . .	240
§ 20.07	WAIVER AND RELEASE . . . . .	240
§ 20.08	CHAPTER HIGHLIGHTS . . . . .	241
<b>Chapter 21</b>	<b>PROCEDURE AND REMEDIES . . . . .</b>	<b>243</b>
§ 21.01	ADMINISTRATIVE PREREQUISITES . . . . .	243
§ 21.02	LAWSUITS . . . . .	243
§ 21.03	REMEDIES . . . . .	244
§ 21.04	CHAPTER HIGHLIGHTS . . . . .	245
<b>Part V.</b>	<b>POST-CIVIL WAR CIVIL RIGHTS ACTS . . . . .</b>	<b>247</b>
<b>Chapter 22</b>	<b>SECTION 1981 . . . . .</b>	<b>249</b>
§ 22.01	PERSONS SUBJECT TO SECTION 1981 . . . . .	249
[A]	State and Local Governments . . . . .	249
[B]	Private Employers . . . . .	249
§ 22.02	THE PROTECTED CLASS . . . . .	250
§ 22.03	THE PROSCRIBED BASIS OF DISCRIMINATION . . . . .	250
§ 22.04	CONTRACT-BASED DISCRIMINATION . . . . .	251
§ 22.05	THE NATURE AND PROOF OF DISCRIMINATION . . . . .	252
§ 22.06	PROCEDURE . . . . .	252
§ 22.07	REMEDIES . . . . .	253
§ 22.08	CHAPTER HIGHLIGHTS . . . . .	253
<b>Chapter 23</b>	<b>SECTION 1983 . . . . .</b>	<b>255</b>
§ 23.01	INTRODUCTION . . . . .	255
§ 23.02	THE MEANING OF “PERSON” . . . . .	256
§ 23.03	THE MEANING OF “UNDER COLOR OF STATE LAW” . . . . .	258
[A]	Public Officials . . . . .	258
[B]	Private Parties . . . . .	258
§ 23.04	THE “DEPRIVATION OF RIGHTS” REQUIREMENT . . . . .	259
§ 23.05	REMEDIES . . . . .	260
§ 23.06	DEFENSES . . . . .	262
[A]	Immunity . . . . .	262
[1]	Absolute Immunity . . . . .	262

---

## *Table of Contents*

[2]	Qualified Immunity . . . . .	263
[3]	Interlocutory Appeal . . . . .	263
[B]	Statute of Limitations . . . . .	263
[C]	Sovereign Immunity . . . . .	263
§ 23.07	THE LIABILITY OF FEDERAL OFFICIALS . . . . .	264
§ 23.08	CHAPTER HIGHLIGHTS . . . . .	264
<b>Chapter 24</b>	<b>SECTION 1985(3) . . . . .</b>	<b>265</b>
§ 24.01	NATURE OF THE OFFENSE . . . . .	265
§ 24.02	PARTY DEFENDANTS . . . . .	265
§ 24.03	THE CONSPIRACY REQUIREMENT . . . . .	266
§ 24.04	THE PROTECTED CLASS . . . . .	266
§ 24.05	THE NATURE OF THE PROTECTED RIGHTS . . . . .	267
§ 24.06	THE STATE ACTION REQUIREMENT . . . . .	267
§ 24.07	CHAPTER HIGHLIGHTS . . . . .	267
<b>Part VI.</b>	<b>EQUAL PAY ACT . . . . .</b>	<b>269</b>
<b>Chapter 25</b>	<b>EQUAL PAY ACT — INTRODUCTION . . . . .</b>	<b>271</b>
§ 25.01	HISTORY . . . . .	271
§ 25.02	COVERED EMPLOYERS . . . . .	271
§ 25.03	AN OVERVIEW . . . . .	272
[A]	The Elements of a Violation . . . . .	272
[B]	Defenses . . . . .	272
§ 25.04	RELATIONSHIP WITH TITLE VII . . . . .	272
§ 25.05	CHAPTER HIGHLIGHTS . . . . .	274
<b>Chapter 26</b>	<b>THE ELEMENTS OF A VIOLATION . . . . .</b>	<b>275</b>
§ 26.01	DIFFERENT WAGES . . . . .	275
§ 26.02	EMPLOYEES OF THE OPPOSITE SEX . . . . .	275
§ 26.03	WITHIN THE SAME ESTABLISHMENT . . . . .	277
§ 26.04	EQUAL WORK . . . . .	277
[A]	Skill . . . . .	278
[B]	Effort . . . . .	279
[C]	Responsibility . . . . .	279
[D]	Similar Working Conditions . . . . .	279
§ 26.05	CHAPTER HIGHLIGHTS . . . . .	279

---

## *Table of Contents*

<b>Chapter 27</b>	<b>DEFENSES</b>	<b>281</b>
§ 27.01	SENIORITY	281
§ 27.02	MERIT SYSTEMS	282
§ 27.03	QUANTITY OR QUALITY OF PRODUCTION	282
§ 27.04	A FACTOR OTHER THAN SEX	282
[A]	Training Programs	283
[B]	<i>Red Circle</i> Rates	284
[C]	Economic Benefit	284
[D]	Market Forces	285
[E]	Factors Having a Disparate Impact	285
§ 27.05	CHAPTER HIGHLIGHTS	285
 <b>Chapter 28</b>	 <b>ENFORCEMENT</b>	 <b>287</b>
§ 28.01	VOLUNTARY COMPLIANCE	287
§ 28.02	GOVERNMENT ENFORCEMENT	288
§ 28.03	PRIVATE ENFORCEMENT	288
§ 28.04	LIMITATIONS PERIOD	288
§ 28.05	REMEDIES	288
§ 28.06	CHAPTER HIGHLIGHTS	289
 <b>Part VII.</b>	 <b>OBLIGATIONS OF GOVERNMENT CONTRACTORS</b>	 <b>291</b>
 <b>Chapter 29</b>	 <b>EXECUTIVE ORDER 112461</b>	 <b>293</b>
§ 29.01	CONTRACTORS SUBJECT TO THE EO	293
§ 29.02	THE PROTECTED BASES	294
§ 29.03	THE CONTRACTOR'S OBLIGATIONS	294
[A]	Nondiscrimination	294
[B]	Affirmative Action	294
[C]	Other Requirements	296
§ 29.04	ENFORCEMENT	297
§ 29.05	CHAPTER HIGHLIGHTS	297

---

## *Table of Contents*

---

<b>Part VIII.</b>	<b>DISABILITY DISCRIMINATION . . . . .</b>	<b>299</b>
<b>Chapter 30</b>	<b>AN OVERVIEW OF THE COVERAGE AND ENFORCEMENT OF FEDERAL STATUTES . . . . .</b>	<b>301</b>
§ 30.01	THE REHABILITATION ACT OF 1973 . . . . .	301
[A]	Covered Employers . . . . .	301
[B]	Enforcement . . . . .	302
§ 30.02	THE AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT . . . . .	303
[A]	Covered Employers . . . . .	303
[B]	Enforcement . . . . .	303
§ 30.03	CHAPTER HIGHLIGHTS . . . . .	303
<b>Chapter 31</b>	<b>THE PROTECTED CLASS . . . . .</b>	<b>305</b>
§ 31.01	THE BASE DEFINITIONS . . . . .	305
§ 31.02	THE MEANING OF “MENTAL OR PHYSICAL IMPAIRMENT” . . . . .	307
[A]	Actual Physical Impairments . . . . .	307
[B]	Actual Mental Impairments . . . . .	308
[C]	Having a Record of Impairment . . . . .	308
[D]	Regarded as Impairments . . . . .	308
§ 31.03	THE MEANING OF “SUBSTANTIALLY LIMITS” A “MAJOR LIFE ACTIVITY” . . . . .	309
[A]	The Meaning of “Major Life Activity” . . . . .	310
[B]	The Meaning of “Substantially Limits” . . . . .	311
[1]	The Baseline for Measurement . . . . .	311
[2]	The Meaning of “Substantial” . . . . .	312
§ 31.04	THE MEANING OF “QUALIFIED INDIVIDUAL” . . . . .	314
[A]	Establishing “Qualification” . . . . .	314
[B]	The Meaning of “Essential Functions of the Job” . . . . .	314
[C]	The “Direct Threat” Limitation . . . . .	315
[D]	The Meaning of “Reasonable Accommodation” . . . . .	317
§ 31.05	CHAPTER HIGHLIGHTS . . . . .	317
<b>Chapter 32</b>	<b>THE PROSCRIBED FORMS OF DISCRIMINATION AND OTHER PROHIBITED CONDUCT . . . . .</b>	<b>319</b>
§ 32.01	ADVERSE LIMITATIONS, SEGREGATION, OR CLASSIFICATIONS . . . . .	319



---

## *Table of Contents*

§ 32.02	ILLEGAL CONTRACTUAL ARRANGEMENTS . . . . .	320
§ 32.03	DISCRIMINATORY TESTS, STANDARDS, AND SELECTION CRITERIA . . . . .	321
§ 32.04	RELATIONSHIP OR ASSOCIATION WITH A DISABLED PERSON . . . . .	323
§ 32.05	FAILURE TO MAKE REASONABLE ACCOMMODATION . . . . .	323
§ 32.06	DISCRIMINATORY BENEFIT PLANS . . . . .	326
§ 32.07	MEDICAL EXAMINATIONS AND INQUIRIES . . . . .	326
§ 32.08	RETALIATION . . . . .	327
§ 32.09	CHAPTER HIGHLIGHTS . . . . .	327
<b>Chapter 33</b>	<b>PROOF AND DEFENSES . . . . .</b>	<b>329</b>
§ 33.01	ADMITTED DISCRIMINATION . . . . .	329
§ 33.02	INDIVIDUAL DISPARATE TREATMENT . . . . .	330
§ 33.03	SYSTEMIC DISPARATE TREATMENT . . . . .	331
§ 33.04	DISPARATE IMPACT . . . . .	332
§ 33.05	CHAPTER HIGHLIGHTS . . . . .	332

