PRINCIPLES OF INSURANCE LAW
LexisNexis Law School Publishing
Advisory Board

William Araiza
Professor of Law
Brooklyn Law School

Lenni B. Benson
Professor of Law & Associate Dean for Professional Development
New York Law School

Raj Bhala
Rice Distinguished Professor
University of Kansas, School of Law

Ruth Colker
Distinguished University Professor & Heck-Faust Memorial Chair in Constitutional Law
Ohio State University, Moritz College of Law

David Gamage
Assistant Professor of Law
UC Berkeley School of Law

Joan Heminway
College of Law Distinguished Professor of Law
University of Tennessee College of Law

Edward Imwinkelried
Edward L. Barrett, Jr. Professor of Law
UC Davis School of Law

David I. C. Thomson
LP Professor & Director, Lawyering Process Program
University of Denver, Sturm College of Law

Melissa Weresh
Director of Legal Writing and Professor of Law
Drake University Law School
Dedications

To Karen and Stephanie — For all your love and support

For Ann, Ryan, Shanon, and Reed

For Wenjue
Preface

There have been a number of important developments in liability insurance, property insurance, and life and health insurance that have significantly impacted insurance law. Accordingly, our Fourth Edition of *Principles of Insurance Law* has been substantially revised and updated in order to offer the insurance law student and practitioner a broad perspective of both traditional insurance law concepts and cutting-edge legal issues affecting contemporary insurance law theory and practice. We have retained the organization substantially begun in the Third Edition, with fifteen chapters, a division that enables an expanded scope of topical coverage and also segments the law of insurance in a manner more amenable to study, as well as facilitating recombination and reordering of the chapters as desired by individual instructors. We believe that this Fourth Edition is the most comprehensive insurance law course book available, a book that is both reflective and practical. In crafting the book’s contents, we strived to maintain a realistic balance between insurance law theory and practice.

At the same time, we have retained the progressive and cumulative sequence of the previous editions:

- Introductory material;
- recent and landmark illustrative judicial cases; as well as
- applying, questioning, and testing these principles in relevant Notes, Questions, and Problems.

The “Notes and Questions” sections have been expanded and updated, usually containing one or more Problems, allowing insurance law students to apply their cumulative knowledge of insurance law topics to “real life” situations and legal disputes, and to make the type of difficult decisions with which a practicing attorney or judge would be faced.

Like the Third Edition, the Fourth Edition contains comprehensive introductory and orientation material. In particular, basic axioms of contract construction and insurance policy interpretation are discussed in greater detail (Chapter 2) to assist in orienting students to the case material (no matter how much the student may have daydreamed during first-year Contracts). In addition, history of insurance is examined in detail, as are the underlying concepts and theory of insurance (Chapter 1). As compared to earlier editions, considerably more attention is given to the definition of insurance and concepts of risk shifting, risk distribution, and risk management.

Materials concerning state and federal regulation of insurance are moved to an earlier section of the casebook (Chapter 3). Instructors may, of course, present casebook material in whatever order best fits the pedagogy of their own respective classes. We also realize that many instructors, particularly in a two-credit insurance course, will minimize coverage of insurance regulation.

Chapter 4 addresses insurance contract formation in significant detail. The Fourth Edition continues the tradition of earlier editions in devoting succinct but sustained analysis to issues of insurable interest (Chapter 5), warranties and representations (Chapter 6), waiver and estoppel (Chapter 7), and causation (Chapter 8).

The Fourth Edition of *Principles of Insurance Law* retains broad coverage of life and
Preface

health insurance, property insurance, and liability insurance issues. In order to make the
casebook both more comprehensive and more accessible, the division of Chapters is
organized more according to types of insurance products: property insurance (Chapter 10),
liability insurance (Chapter 11), life and health insurance (Chapter 12), and automobile
insurance (Chapter 13), as well as reinsurance and excess insurance (Chapter 15).
The casebook also provides a separate chapter on insurance bad faith (Chapter 14), with
extensive treatment of the issue. Chapter 9, which discusses the duties of insurer and
policyholder after loss, also gives considerable attention to problems that can arise for
policyholder, insurer, and counsel in their “tripartite relationship” during litigation or
claims adjustment.
The new edition further includes new and expanded treatment of important insurance
law developments that have taken place since the prior edition:

- New caselaw about property insurance and recent mass disasters (i.e. Hurricane
  Katrina, valued policy laws);
- new cases highlight the problems of the innocent co-insured in property
  insurance contexts;
- new material about business interruption insurance (as played out in the
  aftermath of the 9/11 World Trade Center disaster);
- a re-organization of Chapter 8 (causation and accident) with updated cases;
- new cases and a re-organization of Chapter 13 (automobile insurance);
- a re-organization of Chapter 15 (Insurance Layers), including moving “other”
  insurance issues to this chapter; and
- new treatment of regulation (Chapter 3), including discussion of the Dodd-Frank
  Wall Street Reform and Consumer Protection Act, as well as new information
  about federal flood insurance, terrorist insurance, and updates relevant to ERISA
cases.
The casebook also provides more extensive treatment than most coursebooks regarding:

- The critical role of insurance binders as temporary forms of insurance, as
  illustrated in the World Trade Center property insurance dispute resulting from
  the horrific terrorist attack of September 11, 2001;
- the continuing debate between “legal formalists” and “legal functionalists” for
  “the heart and soul of insurance contract law”;
- what constitutes a policyholder’s “reasonable expectation” regarding coverage;
- the current property and liability insurance “crisis”;
- risk management and self-insurance issues;
- emerging, and frequently conflicting, caselaw concerning the intersection of
  insurance law and federal antidiscrimination regulation;
- the Court’s State Farm v. Campbell decision, which struck down a $145 million
  punitive damages award in an insurance bad faith claim as well as setting more
  restrictive parameters for the recovery of punitive damages generally;
- new issues over the dividing line between “tangible” property typically covered
  under a property insurance policy and “intangible” property, which is typically
  excluded — an issue of increasing importance in the digital and cyber age;
Preface

- refinement of liability insurance law regarding trigger of coverage, duty to defend, reimbursement of defense costs, and apportionment of insurer and policyholder responsibility for liability payments;
- the difficult-to-harmonize decisions concerning when a loss arises out of the “use” of an automobile;
- insurer bad faith and the availability, if any, of actions against a policyholder for “reverse bad faith”; and
- the degree to which excess insurance and reinsurance may be subject to modified approaches to insurance policy construction.

The Fourth Edition includes a new co-author, Professor Erik S. Knutsen, of Queen’s University Faculty of Law in Kingston, Ontario, Canada.

The authors gratefully appreciate and acknowledge the research assistance of the students who helped make Principles of Insurance Law a reality. Hilary Barrett Muckelroy (UNLV — Class of 2005) deserves special thanks for her excellent work as primary research assistant for the Third Edition. Thanks also to Mary Langsner (UNLV — Class of 2013), (Michael Newby, CPCU (Richmond — 2004), Kathleen Wilde (UNLV — Class of 2011), Shannon Gallo (UNLV — Class of 2010), Angela Morrison (UNLV — Class of 2005), Tabitha Fiddyment (UNLV — Class of 2003), Erin Spicer (Queen’s — Class of 2012), and Jonathan Chen (Queen’s — Class of 2012).

Thanks also to our long-suffering families and to our respective colleagues at Richmond, UNLV, and Queen’s, all of whom are probably more than a bit puzzled at our constant fascination with insurance — an interest we hope students will grow to appreciate as they read the materials in this casebook. Special thanks to UNLV Wiener-Rogers Law Library Director Jeanne Price and Assistant Director David McClure.

Insurance is often regarded as a topic that induces a feeling of “stirring cement with my eyelids” (to use Oliver Wendell Holmes’s memorable description of first-year law school), even as compared to other parts of the law school curriculum. We beg to differ. Insurance involves many of the most intellectually interesting issues in modern law as well as topics central to modern human existence: life; death; greed; money; property; business; cars; homes; family; lawsuits; deals made and broken; steadfastness; and sharp dealing. It’s all there in insurance law. We hope we have captured some significant part of this rich picture in Principles of Insurance Law.

Welcome to the fascinating and challenging world of insurance law!

Jeffrey W. Stempel
Peter N. Swisher
Erik S. Knutsen
June 2011
# Table of Contents

## Chapter 1

**INSURANCE HISTORY AND FUNDAMENTAL CONCEPTS**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>§ 1.01.</td>
<td>INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 1.02.</td>
<td>THE HISTORICAL BACKGROUND AND NATURE OF INSURANCE</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 1.03.</td>
<td>RISK DISTRIBUTION AND POOLING — DEFINING INSURANCE</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Griffin Systems, Inc. v. Washburn</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Griffin Systems, Inc. v. Ohio Dept. of Insurance</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[B]</td>
<td>Examples of Exclusions Designed to Avoid Coverage for Large or Excessively Correlated Risk</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Pan American World Airways v. Aetna Casualty and Surety Co.</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Note: “Megarisks”</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 1.04.</td>
<td>THE INDEMNITY PRINCIPLE</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 1.05.</td>
<td>FORTUITY, ADVERSE SELECTION, AND MORAL HAZARD</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[A]</td>
<td>Fortuity Generally</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[1]</td>
<td>The Intentional Act Exclusion</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Automobile Insurance Company of Hartford v. Cook</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Minnesota Fire and Casualty Company v. Greenfield</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[2]</td>
<td>The Known Loss Doctrine</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[3]</td>
<td>Loss-in-Progress</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[4]</td>
<td>Pre-Existing Conditions</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[5]</td>
<td>Implied Exceptions to Coverage</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[a]</td>
<td>The “Friendly Fire” Implied Exception</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[b]</td>
<td>Punitive Damages as an Implied Exception</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>St. Paul Mercury Insurance Co. v. Duke University</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[c]</td>
<td>Contract and Commercial Risk</td>
<td>94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[6]</td>
<td>The Limits of Fortuity as a Defense to Coverage</td>
<td>94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[B]</td>
<td>Adverse Selection</td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[C]</td>
<td>Moral Hazard</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Chapter 2

**CONTRACT LAW, LEGAL THEORY, AND THE CONSTRUCTION OF THE INSURANCE CONTRACT**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>§ 2.01.</td>
<td>A BRIEF REVIEW OF CONTRACT LAW</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 2.02.</td>
<td>THE NATURE OF AN INSURANCE CONTRACT</td>
<td>103</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table of Contents

§ 2.03. INTERPRETING INSURANCE CONTRACTS: LEGAL FORMALISM VERSUS LEGAL FUNCTIONALISM ........................................... 110
[A] Legal Formalism .................................................. 111
[B] Legal Functionalism ............................................. 112

§ 2.04. MAINSTREAM APPROACHES TO CONTRACT CONSTRUCTION . 113

§ 2.05. THE AMBIGUITY FACTOR ........................................ 115

§ 2.06. THE HIERARCHY AND COORDINATION OF MAINSTREAM CONTRACT INTERPRETATION FACTORS ........................ 120

§ 2.07. ATTITUDES TOWARD EXTRINSIC EVIDENCE .................. 121

§ 2.08. THE KINSHIP BETWEEN CONTRACT INTERPRETATION AND STATUTORY INTERPRETATION ...................... 122

§ 2.09. THE ROLE OF REASONABLE EXPECTATIONS AND THE SEMI-CONTROVERSIAL REASONABLE EXPECTATIONS “DOCTRINE” .......................................................... 123

§ 2.10. GENERAL CANONS OF CONSTRUCTION AND OTHER GROUND RULES OF CONTRACT INTERPRETATION ...................... 128

§ 2.11. THE ORGANIZATION OF THE INSURANCE POLICY AND INSURANCE POLICY CONSTRUCTION CANONS ............... 134

§ 2.12. CONTRACT CONSTRUCTION THEORY AND DOCTRINE IN PRACTICE ............................................................ 138

Collins v. Farmers Insurance Co. of Oregon .................................. 138
Notes and Questions ..................................................... 142


[B] Text versus Context and Expectation; Formalism and Functionalism: The Battle Continues — Sometimes Within the Same Jurisdiction .... 150

Atwater Creamery Co. v. Western National Mut. Ins. Co. .............. 151
Board of Regents of The University of Minnesota v. Royal Insurance Co. ........................................................................... 157

[C] Testing the Sophisticated Policyholder Concept in Operation .... 159
Boeing Company v. Aetna Casualty and Surety Co. ......................... 160
McNeilab v. North River Insurance Co. ........................................ 169
Notes and Questions ......................................................... 175

§ 2.13. MORE ON THE ROLE OF UNCONSCIONABILITY AND PUBLIC POLICY IN CONSTRUING INSURANCE POLICIES .............. 176

Karl v. New York Life Insurance Co. .................................................. 178
Notes and Questions ......................................................... 181

§ 2.14. REFORMATION OF THE INSURANCE CONTRACT ............. 185
[A] Introduction .................................................................... 185
Notes and Questions ........................................................... 186

§ 2.15. MUST THE POLICY COVERAGE BE EXPLAINED TO THE INSURED? .............................................................. 187

[A] Introduction .................................................................... 187
Table of Contents

Lachs v. Fidelity & Casualty Co. of New York .................. 187
Notes and Questions ........................................ 194

§ 2.16. CONFLICT OF LAWS .................................. 195
[A] Introduction .............................................. 195
  State Farm Mutual Automobile Insurance Co. v. Patterson ...... 197
[B] One Applicable Law, or Several? .......................... 205
  Krauss v. Manhattan Life Insurance Co. of New York ...... 207
  Notes and Questions ....................................... 210

Chapter 3  GOVERNMENT REGULATION OF INSURANCE ....... 213

§ 3.01. GENERAL PRINCIPLES .................................. 213
[A] Introduction .............................................. 213
[B] State Versus Federal Regulation .......................... 214
  United States Department of Treasury v. Fabe ................. 214
  Notes and Questions ....................................... 222
[C] Renewed Federal Oversight of Insurance ................... 223
  Notes and Questions ....................................... 224

§ 3.02. ADMINISTRATIVE POWERS ............................... 224
[A] Power to License Insurance Companies, Agents, and Brokers .. 224
[B] Power to Prescribe Forms ................................ 225
[C] Power to Control Investments ............................. 226
[D] Power to Limit Classes of Insurance ....................... 226
[E] Power to Regulate Rates ................................ 227
  Notes and Questions ....................................... 227
[F] Regulation Seeking to Effect Public Policy — The Limits of Intervention? .................................. 228
  Question .................................................. 239
[G] Intersection Between Civil Rights Statutes and Insurance: The Americans with Disabilities Act ......................... 240
  John Doe and Richard Smith v. Mutual of Omaha Insurance Company ........................................ 240
  Notes and Questions ....................................... 248
  Pallozzi v. Allstate Life Insurance Co. ........................ 249
  Notes and Questions ....................................... 256
[H] Power to Prevent Withdrawal by Insurer from State ........ 256
[I] Retaliatory Statutes ....................................... 257

§ 3.03. SPECIFIC INSURANCE PROGRAMS ....................... 258
[A] Regulation Regimes Specific to Automobile Liability Insurance .... 258
## Table of Contents

[2] Compulsory Insurance Programs .............................................. 259
   McIntosh v. State Farm Mutual Automobile Insurance Company .... 260
   Notes and Questions ................................................................. 263
[B] Other Programs ........................................................................ 264

§ 3.04. THE INSURANCE SUB-LAW OF ERISA ............................ 266
   Rush Prudential HMO, Inc. v. Moran ...................................... 266
   Kentucky Association of Health Plans Inc. v. Miller, Commissioner,
   Kentucky Department of Insurance ....................................... 274
   Aetna Health Inc. v. Davila ...................................................... 278
   Sereboff v. Mid Atlantic Medical Services, Inc. ....................... 286
   Notes and Questions ................................................................. 289

Chapter 4 THE FORMATION, OPERATION, AND TERMINATION OF
   THE INSURANCE CONTRACT ................................................. 293

§ 4.01. INTRODUCTION ............................................................... 293
§ 4.02. VALIDITY OF ORAL CONTRACTS ..................................... 294
   Gulf Insurance Co. v. Grisham .............................................. 294
   Notes and Questions ................................................................. 297

§ 4.03. INSURANCE BINDERS AND CONDITIONAL RECEIPTS ......... 298
[A] Introduction ............................................................................ 298
[B] Binders .................................................................................. 299
   SR International Business Insurance Co. Ltd. v. World Trade Center
   Properties, LLC et al. ............................................................ 299
   Notes and Questions ................................................................. 301
[C] Conditional Receipts .............................................................. 302
   Glarner v. Time Insurance Co. ................................................. 304
   Notes and Questions ................................................................. 307

§ 4.04. INSURER’S UNREASONABLE DELAY IN ACTING UPON THE
   INSURANCE APPLICATION ...................................................... 308
   Independent Life and Accident Insurance Co. v. McKenzie ........ 309
   Notes and Questions ................................................................. 311

§ 4.05. CONTRACTUAL POWERS OF INSURANCE AGENTS .......... 312
   Weaver v. Metropolitan Life Insurance Co. .............................. 316
   Murphy v. Kuhn .................................................................... 318
   Harris v. Albrecht ................................................................. 322
Table of Contents

Notes and Questions ........................................ 384
[2] Unsecured Creditor in Debtor’s Property .................. 385
[3] Stockholder in Corporation’s Property ..................... 386
  Problems .............................................. 386
[D] When an Insurable Interest Must Exist in Property ........ 387
  Edwin Patterson, Essentials of Insurance Law ............... 387
  Kingston v. Great Southwest Fire Insurance Co. ............ 389
  Problem .............................................. 390
[E] Extinguishment of Insurable Interest ...................... 391
  Tublitz v. Glens Falls Insurance Co. ....................... 391
  Chicago Title & Trust Co. v. United States Fidelity & Guaranty Co. ............................................ 392
  Notes and Questions .................................. 393
[F] Waiver of or Estoppel to Deny Existence of Insurable Interest ...... 394

§ 5.02. LIFE INSURANCE .......................................... 396
  Rubenstein v. Mutual Life Insurance Co. of New York ....... 397
  Notes and Questions .................................. 402
[B] When an Insurable Interest Must Exist ..................... 407
  Edwin Patterson, Essentials of Insurance Law ............... 407
[C] Who May Question the Existence of an Insurable Interest? .... 409
[D] Who May Be Designated as Beneficiary? .................... 410
  American Casualty Company v. Rose ........................ 410
  Notes and Questions .................................. 413
  Grigsby v. Russell ....................................... 414
  Notes and Questions .................................. 416
[F] Creditors’ Rights ....................................... 420
[G] Extinguishment of Insurable Interest ........................ 421

§ 5.03. LIABILITY INSURANCE ..................................... 422
  James v. Pennsylvania General Insurance Co. ................ 423
  Notes and Questions .................................. 425

Chapter 6  INSURER’S LIMITATION OF RISK: WARRANTIES, REPRESENTATIONS, AND CONCEALMENT .......... 429

§ 6.01. WARRANTIES ............................................... 429
[A] General Discussion ..................................... 429
  Home Insurance Co. v. Ciconett and Ciconett v. Home
Table of Contents

Insurance Co. .................................................. 431
Notes and Questions ........................................... 432

[B] Judicial Interpretations of Warranties Generally ............ 434
[1] “Affirmative” Versus “Promissory” Warranties .............. 434
Reid v. Hardware Mutual Insurance Co. ......................... 435
Notes and Questions ........................................... 436
[2] The Descriptive Warranty Concept ............................ 437
Notes and Questions ........................................... 437
Notes and Questions ........................................... 439
[a] The “Iron Safe” Illustration ................................ 440
Liverpool & London & Globe Insurance Co. v. Kearney ....... 440
Notes and Questions ........................................... 441
[b] The “Watchman” Illustration ................................ 441
Hanover Fire Ins. Co. v. Gustin ................................ 441
Notes and Questions ........................................... 442
[c] The Burglar Alarm Illustration ............................... 443
[5] Suspension of Coverage for Breach of Warranty ............. 444

[1] Increase in Hazard Clauses .................................. 445
Industrial Development Associates v. Commercial Union Surplus Lines Insurance Company ............................. 446
Notes and Questions ........................................... 446
[2] Mode of Use of the Property Insured ......................... 450
Chiapetta v. Lumbermens Mutual Insurance Company ........... 451
Notes and Questions ........................................... 453
[4] Prohibition Against Other Insurance .......................... 455
Burgess v. North Carolina Farm Bureau Mutual Insurance Co. 455
Notes and Questions ........................................... 457
Meczkowski v. State Farm Ins. Cos. ............................. 459
Notes and Questions ........................................... 462
[D] Statutory Changes in Warranty Law ............................. 465
[1] General Discussion ........................................... 465
§ 6.02. REPRESENTATIONS ........................................ 467
[A] General Discussion ........................................... 467
Edwin Patterson, Essentials of Insurance Law .................... 467
Table of Contents

[1] Distinction Between Warranties and Representations ........ ....... 468
[B] Judicial Interpretations of Statutory and Non-Statutory
Representations ...................................................................... 469
[1] Innocent versus Deceitful Misrepresentations ....................... 469
[2] Continuing Duty of Full Disclosure During the Pendency of the
Application .............................................................................. 470
[3] The Test of Materiality ......................................................... 472
Notes and Questions ................................................................. 474
[4] Reliance by the Insurer on the Applicant’s Misrepresentation ...... 475
§ 6.03. CONCEALMENT ............................................................... 477
D. M. McGill, Life Insurance ...................................................... 477
[B] Concealment Involving Different Types of Insurance Policies ....... 479
King v. Allstate Insurance Company .......................................... 480
Notes and Questions ................................................................. 485
[C] The Sometimes Blurred Lines of Misrepresentation and Concealment ... 487

Chapter 7 THE INSURED’S DEFENSES: WAIVER, ESTOPPEL,
ELECTION, AND CONTRACT REFORMATION ................. 491

§ 7.01. WAIVER, ESTOPPEL, ELECTION, AND CONTRACT
REFORMATION .............................................................................. 491
[A] General Discussion ................................................................. 491
[B] Definition and General Rules of Waiver and Estoppel .......... ....... 492
Continental Ins. Co. v. Kingston .................................................. 492
Notes and Questions ................................................................. 498
[C] Non-Payment of Premiums ....................................................... 500
Time Insurance Co. v. Vick ......................................................... 500
Notes and Questions ................................................................. 505
[D] Course of Dealing ................................................................. 507
Notes and Questions ................................................................. 508
[E] Non-Waiver Agreements and Reservation of Rights Notice ....... 508
First United Bank v. First American Title Ins. Co. ....................... 509
Notes and Questions ................................................................. 510
[F] Delay in Returning the Insured’s Premium ......................... ....... 512
Dairyland Insurance Co. v. Kammerer ....................................... 512
Notes and Questions ................................................................. 514
[G] Election ................................................................................. 515
Howard v. Reserve Insurance Company .................................... 515
Notes and Questions ................................................................. 518
[H] Reformation ......................................................................... 519
# Table of Contents

- Board of Trustees of The University of Illinois v. Insurance Corporation of Ireland, Ltd. ........................................... 519
- Notes and Questions .................................................. 524

## Chapter 8  CAUSATION AND THE CONCEPT OF ACCIDENT . . . 525

- § 8.01. INSURANCE CAUSATION .................................. 525
- [A] Approaches to Insurance Causation ............................. 527
  - Guideone Elite Insurance Co. v. Old Cutler Presbyterian Church, Inc. .................................................. 536
  - Notes and Questions ................................................ 541
- [B] Direct Loss Versus Remote Loss .............................. 543
  - Source Food Technology, Inc. v. U.S. Fidelity and Guar. Co. 543
  - Notes and Questions .............................................. 546

- § 8.02. ACCIDENTAL MEANS VERSUS ACCIDENTAL RESULTS .... 546
  - Carroll v. Cuna Mutual Insurance Society ..................... 547
  - Notes and Questions .............................................. 553

- § 8.03. ACCIDENT OR FORTUITY IN TENSION WITH THE INSURED’S VOLUNTARY ACTIONS .................. 554
  - Hairston v. Liberty National Life Ins. Co. ................. 554
  - Notes and Questions .............................................. 557

- § 8.04. PRE-EXISTING CONDITIONS, FORTUITY AND ACCIDENT .... 561
  - Hill v. Mutual Benefit Life Insurance Co. .................. 561
  - Notes and Questions .............................................. 563

- § 8.05. ACCIDENTAL DEATH BY “EXTERNAL MEANS” .......... 564
  - Spaid v. Cal-Western States Life Insurance Co. ........ 564
  - Notes and Questions .............................................. 566

## Chapter 9  DUTIES OF THE POLICYHOLDER AND INSURER AFTER LOSS .................................................. 567

- § 9.01. DUTIES OF THE INSURED .................................. 567
- [A] Requirement of Notice of Loss: Is Prejudice to the Insurer Necessary? .................................................. 567
  - Molyneaux v. Molyneaux ........................................ 567
  - Notes and Questions .............................................. 571
- [B] Notice of Loss and Proof of Loss Distinguished ......... 576
  - Goodwin v. Nationwide Insurance Co. ......................... 576
  - Notes and Questions .............................................. 578
- [C] Requirement of Cooperation by the Insured ........ 579
  - American Guarantee and Liability Insurance Co. v. Chandler Manufacturing Co., Inc. ......................... 579
  - Notes and Questions .............................................. 583
Table of Contents

[D] Misstatements by the Insured ............................................................. 585
  *Fine v. Bellefonte Underwriters Insurance Co.* ............................... 585
  Notes and Questions .............................................................................. 588

[E] Collusion Between the Insured and the Claimant ............................... 589
  *Travelers Insurance Co. v. Godsey* .................................................. 589
  Notes and Questions .............................................................................. 592

§ 9.02. DUTIES OF THE INSURER ............................................................... 592

[A] Duty to Defend the Insured ............................................................... 593
  *State Farm Fire & Casualty Co. v. Eddy* ........................................... 593
  Notes and Questions .............................................................................. 595

    Four Corners/Eight Corners Rule and the Role of Extrinsic
    Evidence .............................................................................................. 601
    *Fitzpatrick v. American Honda Motor Co., Inc.* .............................. 604
    Notes ........................................................................................................ 608

[2] Fee-Shifting in Insurance Disputes ..................................................... 609

[3] Reimbursement of Counsel Fees and the Insured’s Costs of
    Defense .................................................................................................... 611
    *General Agents Insurance Company of America, Inc. v. Midwest
    Sporting Goods Company* ................................................................... 611
    Notes and Questions .............................................................................. 618

    Rights of Insurer and Policyholder ....................................................... 619

[5] Policyholder Rights to Select Counsel ............................................... 623

[6] Issues of Insurer Control over Counsel .............................................. 627

    Settlement .............................................................................................. 628
    *Miller v. Shugart* ................................................................................ 628
    Notes and Questions .............................................................................. 633

[B] Duty to Gain the Insured’s Cooperation ............................................. 634
  *Pawtucket Mutual Insurance Co. v. Soler* .......................................... 634
  Notes and Questions .............................................................................. 634

[C] The Insurers’ Duty of Good Faith and Fair Dealing ............................ 635

[D] The Duty to Settle Claims and the Effect of Failure to Settle .............. 636
  *Mid-America Bank & Trust Co. v. Commercial Union
  Insurance Co.* ........................................................................................ 636
  Notes and Questions .............................................................................. 638

§ 9.03. WHO OBTAINS THE BENEFITS OF INSURANCE? ...................... 639

[A] General Discussion ............................................................................. 639

[1] Vendor-Vendee Situations ................................................................. 640
  *Acree v. Hanover Insurance Company* .............................................. 640

xviii
### Table of Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Notes and Questions</th>
<th>641</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><em>Starkman v. Sigmond</em></td>
<td>642</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>646</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[3] Lessor-Lessee Situations</td>
<td>647</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Folger Coffee Co. v. Great American Insurance Co.</em></td>
<td>649</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>650</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[5] Life Tenant-Remainderman Situations</td>
<td>651</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Morris v. Morris</em></td>
<td>651</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Note</td>
<td>652</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Rauch v. American Family Insurance Co.</em></td>
<td>653</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>655</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Chapter 10  
**PROPERTY INSURANCE ISSUES**  
657

#### § 10.01. AN OVERVIEW OF PROPERTY INSURANCE  
657

[A] Assignment and the Property Insurance Contract  
661

*Christ Gospel Temple v. Liberty Mutual Insurance Co.*  
661

Notes and Questions  
664

[B] The Innocent Co-Insured Problem  
666

*Borman v. State Farm Fire & Casualty Co.*  
666

*Sager v. Farm Bureau Mutual Insurance Co.*  
672

Notes and Questions  
677

#### § 10.02. SCOPE OF PROPERTY COVERAGE  
678

[A] “Friendly” Versus “Hostile” Fires  
678

[B] Place of Loss Limitations  
679

*Vargas v. Insurance Co. of North America*  
679

Notes and Questions  
682

[C] Theft and Mysterious Disappearance  
683

683

Notes and Questions  
686

[D] Coverage Under “All Risk” Policies  
687

*Great Northern Insurance Co. v. Dayco Corp.*  
688

Notes and Questions  
691

[E] Specified Risks Versus All-Risks Policies  
691

*Northwest Airlines, Inc. v. Globe Indemnity Co.*  
692

Notes and Questions  
695

[F] The Status of the Property: Occupied or Not?  
696

*Langill v. Vermont Mutual Insurance Company*  
697

[G] Trigger of Coverage — When Is Property Insurance Activated by an


Table of Contents

Event? .............................................. 701

Prudential-LMI Commercial Insurance v. The Superior Court ..... 701
Notes and Questions .................................. 708

[H] Business Interruption Insurance ............................ 709

Schlamm Stone & Dolan, LLP v. Seneca Insurance Company ..... 710
Broad Street, LLC v. Gulf Insurance Company ............... 715

[I] Property Coverage and Large-scale Disasters ................. 720

In re Katrina Canal Breaches Litigation .......................... 721
Notes and Questions .................................. 733

§ 10.03. THE AMOUNT OF LOSS .................................................... 733

[A] Definition of “Cash Value” ........................................ 734

[B] Valued Policies ....................................................... 738

Chauvin v. State Farm Fire & Casualty Co. .......................... 740
Notes and Questions .................................. 745

[C] Cost to “Repair or Replace” ....................................... 746

[D] Appraisal of Damage ............................................. 747


Mission National Insurance Co. v. Schulman .......................... 748
Notes and Questions .................................. 751

§ 10.04. COINSURANCE .......................................................... 752

Schnitzer v. South Carolina Insurance Co. .......................... 753
Notes and Questions .................................. 757

§ 10.05. SUBROGATION ..................................................... 758

[A] Subrogation: No Subrogation to a Volunteer or Against an Insured . . . 758

[B] Settlement Between Tortfeasor and Insured on Insurer’s Subrogation

Right ....................................................... 760

Notes and Questions .................................. 761

[C] Effect of Defenses Against the Insured on Insurer’s Rights .......... 762

[D] Waiver or Estoppel of Subrogation Rights ......................... 763

[E] Mortgagor-Mortgagee Problems .................................. 764

Quincy Mutual Fire Insurance Co. v. Jones .............................. 764
Notes and Questions .................................. 768

[F] Lessor-Lessee Problems ............................................. 769

Dix Mutual Insurance Co. v. Laframboise .............................. 769
Notes and Questions .................................. 773

[G] The Loan Receipt Method ........................................ 773

[H] Title Insurance ....................................................... 774

Chapter 11 LIABILITY INSURANCE ISSUES .......................... 777

§ 11.01. THE PURPOSE AND DESIGN OF LIABILITY INSURANCE ........ 777

§ 11.02. THE ORGANIZATION OF THE GENERAL LIABILITY POLICY ........................ 779
**Table of Contents**

§ 11.03. WHAT CONSTITUTES “BODILY INJURY”? ........................................ 780
  Voorhees v. Preferred Mutual Insurance Co. ........................................ 780
  Notes and Questions ................................................................. 785

§ 11.04. WHAT CONSTITUTES “PROPERTY DAMAGE”? ................................. 786
  Kazi v. State Farm Fire and Casualty Company .................................. 790
  Note ...................................................................................... 793

§ 11.05. DEFINING AND COUNTING THE LIABILITY INSURANCE
  “OCCURRENCE” ............................................................................ 793
  Michigan Chemical Corporation v. American Home Assurance
  Company ................................................................. 793
  Notes and Questions ................................................................. 796

§ 11.06. WHAT CONSTITUTES A “CLAIM” OR “SUIT” FOR PURPOSES OF THE
  DUTY TO DEFEND? ....................................................................... 800
  Hazen Paper Company v. United States Fidelity & Guaranty
  Company ................................................................. 800
  Foster-Gardner, Inc. v. National Union Fire Insurance Company of
  Pittsburgh, Pa ................................................................. 802
  Notes and Questions ................................................................. 806

§ 11.07. THE CONCEPT OF AN UNINSURABLE “KNOWN LOSS” .................. 807
  General Housewares Corp. v. National Surety Corporation .................. 807
  Notes and Questions ................................................................. 812

§ 11.08. IS LIABILITY INSURANCE COVERAGE LIMITED TO ONLY “TORT”
  CLAIMS? ..................................................................................... 813
  Vandenberg v. The Superior Court of Sacramento County .................. 813
  Notes and Questions ................................................................. 816

§ 11.09. WHEN IS COVERAGE TRIGGERED? ......................................... 818
  Singsaas v. Diederich ................................................................. 818

§ 11.10. INSURER’S LIABILITY FOR PROGRESSIVE INJURIES — WHEN DOES
  THE INJURY OCCUR? ................................................................. 820
  Notes and Questions ................................................................. 821

§ 11.11. CGL POLICY TRIGGER FOR PROPERTY DAMAGE CLAIMS .......... 826
  Eljer Manufacturing, Inc. v. Liberty Mutual Insurance Co. ................. 826
  Travelers Insurance Co. v. Eljer Manufacturing, Inc. ......................... 831
  Notes and Questions ................................................................. 835

§ 11.12. COORDINATION OF COVERAGE AND ALLOCATION OF INSURANCE
  PROCEEDS .................................................................................... 835
  Interstate Fire & Casualty Company v. Auto-Owners Insurance
  Company ................................................................. 838
  Consolidated Edison Company of New York, Inc. v. Allstate Insurance
  Company ................................................................. 844
### Table of Contents

Goodyear Tire & Rubber Company v. Aetna Casualty & Surety Company .......................................... 848

Notes and Questions ........................................ 851

§ 11.13. COMMON EXCLUSIONS ................................... 851

[A] Exclusions for the Ordinary Economic Risks of Commercial Activity . 853
    
    Weedo v. Stone-E-Brick, Inc. ............................... 853
    
    American Family Mutual Insurance Company v. American Girl, Inc. .............. 856
    Notes and Questions ........................................ 868
    
    The Continuing Battle Over Coverage in Construction Defect Litigation ......................... 870
    
[B] The "Qualified" Pollution Exclusion ........................................ 873

[C] The "Absolute" Pollution Exclusion ........................................ 876
    
    Kent Farms, Inc. v. Zurich Insurance Company .................. 876
    
    The Quadrant Corporation v. American States Insurance Company .................. 879
    Notes and Questions ........................................ 886

§ 11.14. THE PROBLEM OF GOVERNMENT-MANDATED EXPENDITURES ........................................ 887

§ 11.15. "CLAIMS MADE" VERSUS "OCCURRENCE" LIABILITY COVERAGE .......................... 888

    
    Manzarek v. St. Paul Fire & Marine Insurance Company ................ 892
    Notes ................................................................ 898

§ 11.17. ADDITIONAL TYPES OF LIABILITY COVERAGE ........................................ 899

[A] Errors and Omissions Insurance ........................................ 899

[B] Professional Liability ........................................ 900

[C] Directors and Officers Liability Insurance ........................................ 900

[D] Environmental Claims Liability Insurance ........................................ 901

    
    [1] Workers’ Compensation ........................................ 902
    Notes and Questions ........................................ 903
    
    

[F] Suretyship ........................................ 905
    
Chapter 12 LIFE, HEALTH, AND DISABILITY INSURANCE  . . . . 915

§ 12.01. INTRODUCTION ........................................ 915
§ 12.02. LIFE INSURANCE ....................................... 917
  [A] Clever or Crooked?: Misrepresentation and Mistaken Identity .... 918
      Amex Life Assurance Company v. The Superior Court of Los
      Angeles County ................................... 918
      Notes and Questions .............................. 924
  [B] Change of Beneficiaries ............................... 924
      Rendleman v. Metropolitan Life Insurance Company .......... 925
      Notes and Questions .............................. 928
  [C] Effect of Divorce and Property Settlement on Proceeds of Life
      Insurance ......................................... 929
      Eschler v. Eschler ................................ 929
      Notes and Questions .............................. 932
  [D] Effect of Payment to Wrong Beneficiary ..................... 933
      Glover v. Metropolitan Life Insurance Company ............ 933
      Notes and Questions .............................. 934
  [E] Assignment of Life Insurance Policies: Rights of Beneficiaries vis-à-vis
      Assignees ....................................... 935
      Employers Modern Life Company v. Lindley ................ 935
      Notes and Questions .............................. 937
  [F] Disqualification of Beneficiaries .......................... 938
      Diep v. Rivas .................................... 938
  [G] Insurance Gothic ...................................... 942
      Bacon v. Federal Kemper Life Assurance Company .......... 942
      Notes ............................................ 947
  [H] Intentional Injury Issues and Life Insurance ................ 947
      Todd v. AIG Life Insurance Company .................... 947
      Notes and Questions .............................. 953

§ 12.03. HEALTH INSURANCE ................................ 954
  [A] Preexisting Conditions .................................. 954
      Harrell v. Old American Insurance Company ............... 954
      Note ............................................. 958
      2010 Health Insurance Reform Legislation ................. 958
  [B] “Experimental” Medical Treatment ........................ 959
      Adams v. Blue Cross/Blue Shield of Maryland ............. 959
      Holder v. Prudential Insurance Co. of America ............ 964
      Notes and Questions .............................. 966
  [C] Coordinating Health Insurance Coverage ................... 967
      Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Kansas, Incorporated v. Riverside
      Hospital, An Osteopathic Institution ....................... 967

xxiii
Table of Contents

§ 12.04. DISABILITY INSURANCE ................................ 972
   [A] The Meaning of Disability and the Scope of Disability Insurance ..... 972
       Phillippe v. Commercial Insurance Company of Newark,
       New Jersey ........................................ 972
       Dowdle v. National Life Insurance Company .................... 979
       Notes and Questions ..................................... 983
   [B] The Limits of Conditions for Receipt of Disability Payments ...... 984
   [C] Disability Insurance and Illusory Coverage .................... 985

Chapter 13 AUTOMOBILE INSURANCE ......................... 987

§ 13.01. INTRODUCTION ........................................ 987
§ 13.02. HISTORY OF AUTOMOBILE INSURANCE ............... 988
§ 13.03. STRUCTURE OF THE MODERN AUTOMOBILE POLICY ...... 988
§ 13.04. RECURRING ISSUES IN AUTOMOBILE COVERAGE .......... 989
       State Farm Automobile Insurance Co. v. Bottger .......... 990
       Notes and Questions .................................... 993
   [B] “Owned” Versus “Non-Owned” Vehicles ..................... 995
       Simon v. Lumbermens Mutual Casualty Co. .................. 995
       Notes and Questions .................................... 997
   [C] What Is an “Automobile”? ................................ 997
       Lake v. State Farm Mutual Automobile Insurance Co. ...... 998
   [D] Loss “Arising Out of Ownership, Maintenance, or Use” of a Vehicle . 1000
       North Star Mutual Insurance Co. v. Peterson ............... 1000
       Wilson v. Progressive Northern Insurance. Co. ............ 1007
       McKenzie v. Auto Club Insurance Association ............. 1008
       Blish v. Atlanta Casualty Company .......................... 1011
       Notes and Questions .................................... 1014
   [E] Loss Distribution Disputes Implicating Auto Insurance ........ 1018
       Penn National Insurance Co. v. Costa ....................... 1019
       Cawthon v. State Farm Fire & Casualty Co. .................. 1025
       Notes and Questions .................................... 1030

§ 13.05. UNINSURED AND UNDERINSURED MOTORIST COVERAGE ... 1031
   [A] Scope of Uninsured Motorist Coverage ....................... 1031
       Zarder v. Humana Insurance Co. ............................ 1032
       Notes and Questions ..................................... 1038
   [B] Nature of Underinsured Motorist Coverage .................. 1040
       Notes and Questions ..................................... 1040

§ 13.06. NO-FAULT AUTOMOBILE INSURANCE .................. 1041
       Notes and Questions ..................................... 1041
### Table of Contents

§ 13.07. MEASURING RECOVERY FOR AUTOMOBILE PROPERTY DAMAGE ............................................ 1043  
  * Gonzales v. Farmers Insurance Co. of Oregon  ............................................ 1043  
  * American Manufacturers Mutual Insurance Co. v. Schaefer  ........................... 1049  
  Notes and Questions ............................................. 1053  
§ 13.08. RIGHTS OF AN INJURED PARTY AGAINST AN INSURER ............................... 1055

Chapter 14 “BAD FAITH” LITIGATION AND CLAIMS ADMINISTRATION ............................... 1057  
§ 14.01. THE CONCEPT OF GOOD FAITH AND BAD FAITH — IN GENERAL ................................. 1057  
§ 14.02. AN ILLUSTRATIVE CASE ON BAD FAITH ............................................. 1064  
  * Deese v. State Farm Mutual Auto Ins. Co. ............................................. 1064  
  Notes and Questions ............................................. 1068  
§ 14.03. HISTORY OF BAD FAITH ACTIONS ................................................... 1069  
§ 14.04. DIFFERENCES AMONG THE STATES REGARDING INSURANCE BAD FAITH ............................................. 1070  
§ 14.05. PUNITIVE DAMAGES AND BAD FAITH ............................................. 1077  
§ 14.06. INSURANCE BAD FAITH LITIGATION IN OPERATION ............................................. 1078

[A] The Tort Law Approach to Bad Faith ............................................. 1079  
[1] Liability Insurance ............................................. 1079  
  * Crisci v. The Security Insurance Company of New Haven, Connecticut  ............. 1079  
  Notes and Questions ............................................. 1083  
  * Ellwein v. Hartford Accident and Indemnity Company ............................................. 1089  
  * Boone v. Vanliner Insurance Company ............................................. 1099  
  Notes and Questions ............................................. 1103  
[B] The Contract Law Approach to Bad Faith ............................................. 1104  
  * Beck v. Farmers Insurance Exchange ............................................. 1104  
  Notes and Questions ............................................. 1109  
[C] The Measure of Damages from Bad Faith Conduct ............................................. 1110  
  * The Birth Center v. The St. Paul Companies, Inc. ............................................. 1110  
  Note ............................................. 1114  
[D] Punitive Damages ............................................. 1115  
  * Campbell v. State Farm Mutual Automobile Insurance Company  ...................... 1115  
  * State Farm Mutual Automobile Insurance Company v. Campbell  ...................... 1124  
  * Campbell v. State Farm Mutual Automobile Insurance Company  ...................... 1134  
  Notes and Questions ............................................. 1139
Table of Contents

[E] Institutional Bad Faith .......................................................... 1141

Chapter 15 INSURANCE LAYERING: “OTHER” INSURANCE, EXCESS INSURANCE, SELF-INSURANCE, AND REINSURANCE .............................. 1143

§ 15.01. “OTHER” INSURANCE: THEORIES OF APPORTIONING INSURER LIABILITY .............................................................. 1143

Peerless Insurance v. Vermont Mutual Insurance Co. .......................... 1143
U.S. Fidelity & Guarantee Insurance Co. v. Commercial Union .......... 1146
Midwest Insurance Co. .................................................................. 1146
Notes and Questions .................................................................. 1152

§ 15.02. EXCESS INSURANCE: DUTIES OF THE PRIMARY INSURER AND THE EXCESS INSURER ........................................ 1154

[A] Introduction ............................................................................ 1154
R.C. Wegman Constr. Co. v. Admiral Insurance Co. ....................... 1156
Johnson Controls, Inc. v. London Market ........................................ 1161
Notes and Questions .................................................................. 1171

§ 15.03. SELF-INSURANCE AND RISK RETENTION GROUPS .......... 1174

[A] Introduction ............................................................................ 1174
Montgomery Ward & Co. Inc. v. Imperial Casualty and Indemnity Co. et al. ................................................................. 1175
Notes and Questions .................................................................. 1178

§ 15.04. REINSURANCE ................................................................. 1180

[A] Introduction ............................................................................ 1180
Contractual Relationship Between the Insured and the Reinsurer .... 1185

The Mercantile & General Reinsurance Company v. Spanno Corporation ................................................................. 1186
Notes and Questions .................................................................. 1187
Note: Additional Potential Reinsurer Liability to Policyholders 1188

[C] Contractual Relationship Between the Insurer and the Reinsurer .... 1191

Christiana General Insurance Corporation of New York v. Great American Insurance Company ......................................................... 1192
Notes and Questions .................................................................. 1198

[D] The Duty of Utmost Good Faith and the Follow-the-Fortunes Doctrine ................................................................. 1200

Reliastar Life Insurance Company v. IOA Re, Inc. ................................ 1200
Bellefonte Reinsurance Co. v. The Aetna Casualty and Surety Co. 1206
Notes and Questions .................................................................. 1210

Appendix A LIFE INSURANCE POLICY ........................................ 1211
Appendix B PERSONAL AUTOMOBILE POLICY ........................ 1227
Appendix C HOMEOWNER’S POLICY ........................................ 1239
Appendix D COMMERCIAL PROPERTY INSURANCE ................. 1261

xxvi
## Table of Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Appendix</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Appendix E</td>
<td>COMMERCIAL GENERAL LIABILITY COVERAGE FORM</td>
<td>1285</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix F</td>
<td>BANKER’S BLANKET BOND</td>
<td>1301</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix G</td>
<td>MARINE HULL INSURANCE</td>
<td>1307</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table of Cases</td>
<td></td>
<td>TC-1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Index</td>
<td></td>
<td>I-1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>