EMPLOYMENT LAW: CASES AND MATERIALS

Fifth Edition
LexisNexis Law School Publishing
Advisory Board

William Araiza
Professor of Law
Brooklyn Law School

Lenni B. Benson
Professor of Law & Associate Dean for Professional Development
New York Law School

Raj Bhala
Rice Distinguished Professor
University of Kansas, School of Law

Ruth Colker
Distinguished University Professor & Heck-Faust Memorial Chair in Constitutional Law
Ohio State University, Moritz College of Law

David Gamage
Assistant Professor of Law
UC Berkeley School of Law

Joan Heminway
College of Law Distinguished Professor of Law
University of Tennessee College of Law

Edward Imwinkelried
Edward L. Barrett, Jr. Professor of Law
UC Davis School of Law

David I. C. Thomson
LP Professor & Director, Lawyering Process Program
University of Denver, Sturm College of Law

Melissa Weresh
Director of Legal Writing and Professor of Law
Drake University Law School
To Ted St. Antoine and Clyde Summers,  
inspirational leaders in the field of employment law  

and  

To Mom and Dad,  
my first and best teachers  
—SLW

To Norma and  
Justin, Whitney, Weatherly, Zachary, and Quintin (1st edition)  
Soren and Lehman (2nd edition additions)  
Harris (3rd edition addition)  
Juliet (4th edition addition),  
and Auletta and Lincoln (a new generation for the 5th edition)  
—SJS

To Janet  
—JFB

To Eric and Grace and Rhys  
—GLLL
Our primary goal in this edition has been to update and enhance the materials. Much has happened since we last revised the materials in 2007 and it was time to bring the materials up to date. At the same time, however, we used a general presumption against change. We tried to retain as many of the cases and as much of the structure of the book as possible, both to ease the transition for teachers and for substantive reasons. The cases, for the most part, work well as teaching tools and the structure of the book provides flexibility for the many different types of courses professors offer as “employment law.”

As with our prior editions, we have attempted to edit the materials unobtrusively. We did not indicate when we deleted footnotes and citations to authority, but when we deleted anything other than footnotes or citations, we used ellipses. Citations in cases were often revised without indication (for example, by removing parallel citations). Footnotes that remain have retained their original numbers. For our own citations, except for headings for principal materials, we have followed The Bluebook: A Uniform System of Citation (19th ed. 2010).

We offer thanks to all who have helped us with this project. We began working on this book nearly two decades ago, so some of these people may have helped us so long ago that they have forgotten the precise nature of their assistance. While we inevitably will overlook some colleagues, we want to single out for thanks Rick Bales, Todd Brown, Bill Corbett, Charles Craver, Avi Cutler, Ellen Dannin, Rob Denicola, Cynthia Farina, Catherine Fisk, Dan Foote, Marshall Huebner, Alan Hyde, Sam Issacharoff, Pauline Kim, Barbara Lee, William Lyons, Deborah Malamud, Peter Martin, Colleen Medill, Richard Moberly, Alison Morantz, Andrew Morriss, Russell Osgood, Ramona Paetzold, Randy Rabinowitz, Timothy Schmidle, Bob Schopp, Paul Secunda, Sidney Shapiro, Emily Spieler, Katherine Stone, Kent Syverud, Lach Taylor, David Torrey, John True, Rip Verkerke, Mark Webb, Saul Weiss, Charles Wolfram, Bob Works, Julius Young, and William Zachary. Research assistants who have helped us include Melissa Barber, Rebecca Burton, Catherine Cano, Michael Casas, Katherine Cheng, Chad Doornink, Mark Grimes, Kristina Hon, Shin Jung Hwang, Ann Juliano, Sohyun Kim, Jonah Lalas, Andrea Loux, Joshua Mahoney, Joshua Mayes, Katherine McMahon, Audra Mitchell, Rafael Morell, Dan Muffly, Michael Nolan, Mark Pilotin, Anne Marie Pisano, Gregory Porter, J. Michael Roebuck, Michael Rosen-Prinz, Rebecca Schonberg, Deborah Steiner, Leo Tsao, Andrew Verriere, and Xunze Xiu. David Michaels at the Occupational Safety and Health Administration provided valuable information. Librarians who have helped us significantly include Mitch Fontenot, Anna Kurtz, Kris Lauber, Eugene McElroy, Donna Schulman, and Beth McWilliams.
A special thanks to Carolyn Singleton and Kerry Acker who provided us with considerable secretarial assistance on the first edition and fourth editions, respectively. And, finally, thanks to Fran Warren who was our initial contact with the publisher so many years ago and to Pali Chheda who was our principal editor for this edition.

Steven L. Willborn
Lincoln, Nebraska

Stewart J. Schwab
Ithaca, New York

John F. Burton, Jr.
New Brunswick, New Jersey

Gillian L. L. Lester
Berkeley, California

December 2011
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

## PART I

### INTRODUCTION TO EMPLOYMENT LAW

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter 1</th>
<th>THEMES OF EMPLOYMENT LAW</th>
<th>3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

### PART II

### THE RISE AND FALL OF EMPLOYMENT AT WILL

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter 3</th>
<th>HISTORICAL FOUNDATIONS OF EMPLOYMENT AT WILL</th>
<th>45</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

#### A. EXPRESS MODIFICATION OF AT-WILL CONTRACTS, WRITTEN AND ORAL

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Notes</th>
<th>66</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Notes</th>
<th>69</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Notes</th>
<th>72</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Notes</th>
<th>73</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

---

*Copyright © 2012 Carolina Academic Press, LLC. All rights reserved.*
### Table of Contents

**A. Wrongful Discharge in Violation of Public Policy**
- Nees v. Hocks ........................................ 117
- Wright v. Shriners Hospital for Crippled Children .......... 126
- Notes .............................................. 120

**B. Intentional In infliction of Emotional Distress**
- Agis v. Howard Johnson Co. .......................... 155
- Bodewig v. K-Mart, Inc. ............................ 157
- Notes .............................................. 157

**C. Employment Manuals**
- Woolley v. Hoffmann-La Roche, Inc. ...................... 98
- Demasse v. ITT Corp. .................................. 108
- Notes .............................................. 115

**Chapter 5**

**Tort Erosions of Employment at Will**

**B. Reliance and Implied-In-Fact Contracts**
- Ohanian v. Avis Rent A Car System, Inc. .................. 74
- Grouse v. Group Health Plan, Inc. ........................ 83
- Veno v. Meredith ....................................... 85
- Notes .............................................. 88
- Pugh v. See’s Candies, Inc. ............................. 90
- Notes .............................................. 94

**Notes**

**Chapter 6**

**Good-Faith Limitations on Employment at Will**

- Fortune v. National Cash Register Co. ..................... 167
- Notes .............................................. 171
- Murphy v. American Home Products Corp. .................. 174
- Notes .............................................. 179
TABLE OF CONTENTS

Chapter 7 A COMPARATIVE LOOK AT TERMINATION LAWS 183
A. STATUTORY CHANGES TO EMPLOYMENT AT WILL .......... 183
B. DISMISSAL STANDARDS IN OTHER COUNTRIES .............. 186
  International Labour Organization, Convention 158: Termination of Employment .......... 188

PART III EMPLOYEE PRIVACY ........................................ 193

Chapter 8 EMPLOYEE FREE SPEECH AND POLITICAL PROTECTIONS ........................................ 195
A. CONSTITUTIONAL PROTECTIONS FOR PUBLIC-SECTOR WORKERS ........................................ 196
  Engquist v. Oregon Dep’t of Agriculture .......... 196
  Notes .............................................. 204
  Rutan v. Republican Party ................................ 205
  Notes .............................................. 211
  Garcetti v. Ceballos .................................. 213
  Notes .............................................. 221
B. POLITICAL AND SPEECH RIGHTS IN THE PRIVATE WORKPLACE ........................................ 224
  Novosel v. Nationwide Insurance Co. .................. 224
  Notes .............................................. 229
  Timekeeping Systems, Inc. .............................. 230
  Notes .............................................. 235

Chapter 9 EMPLOYEE PRIVACY RIGHTS ON AND OFF THE JOB ........................................ 239
A. ON-THE-JOB PRIVACY CLAIMS ................................ 239
  City of Ontario v. Quon ................................ 239
  Notes .............................................. 246
  K-Mart Corp. Store No. 7441 v. Trotti .................. 248
  Notes .............................................. 250
  Pure Power Boot Camp v. Warrior Fitness Boot Camp .... 253
  Notes .............................................. 261
B. OFF-WORK PRIVACY CLAIMS .................................. 263
  Brunner v. Al Attar .................................. 263
  Notes .............................................. 264
  Rulon-Miller v. International Business Machine Corp. .... 267
  Notes .............................................. 273
C. DRUG TESTING ................................................. 274
  1. Public-Employee Challenges ......................... 276
TABLE OF CONTENTS

2. Private-Employee Challenges ........................................... 277
   Sims v. NCI Holding Corp. ........................................... 278
   Notes ................................................................. 282

D. HONESTY TESTS AND OTHER KINDS OF BACKGROUND
   SCREENING ....................................................... 289
   Notes ................................................................. 290
   Soroka v. Dayton Hudson Corp. ....................................... 291
   Notes ................................................................. 298
   Note on Negligent Hiring ........................................... 305
   Thatcher v. Brennan .................................................. 305
   Notes ................................................................. 308

Chapter 10 EMPLOYER REFERENCES — DEFAMATION AND
   OTHER TORTS ..................................................... 311
   Elbeshbeshy v. Franklin Institute ...................................... 312
   Notes ................................................................. 313
   Zinda v. Louisiana Pacific Corp. ...................................... 315
   Notes ................................................................. 320
   Sigal Construction Corp. v. Stanbury .................................. 321
   Notes ................................................................. 326

PART IV EMPLOYEE DUTIES AND PROMISES ..................... 331

Chapter 11 DUTY OF LOYALTY AND TRADE SECRETS ............. 333
   Jet Courier Service v. Malei .......................................... 333
   Notes ................................................................. 340
   Dicks v. Jensen ....................................................... 341
   Note ................................................................. 345
   PepsiCo, Inc. v. Redmond ............................................ 345
   Notes ................................................................. 352

Chapter 12 ENFORCEMENT OF NONCOMPETITION CLAUSES ........ 355
   Rem Metals Corp. v. Logan ............................................ 355
   Notes ................................................................. 358
   Karpinski v. Ingrasci .................................................. 359
   Notes ................................................................. 363
   BDO Seidman v. Hirshberg ............................................ 365
   Notes ................................................................. 371

Chapter 13 EMPLOYEE INVENTIONS ................................. 377
   Francklyn v. Guilford Packing Co. .................................... 377
   Note ................................................................. 381
   Ingersoll-Rand Co. v. Ciavatta ....................................... 381
   Notes ................................................................. 390
TABLE OF CONTENTS

PART V PROHIBITIONS ON STATUS DISCRIMINATION .... 393

Chapter 14 PROOF AND REMEDY IN EMPLOYMENT DISCRIMINATION CASES ...................... 395

A. INDIVIDUAL DISPARATE TREATMENT ..................... 395
   1. The Basic Model ...................................... 395
      McDonnell Douglas Corp. v. Green ....................... 395
      Notes ............................................. 398
      Price Waterhouse v. Hopkins .......................... 400
      Note ............................................. 409
      Desert Palace, Inc. v. Costa .......................... 409
      Notes ............................................. 414
   2. Under the Age Discrimination in Employment Act ...... 416
      Gross v. FBL Financial Services, Inc. .................. 416
      Notes ............................................. 425
   3. Applied to Sex-Based Social Conventions .............. 426
      Jespersen v. Harrah’s Operating Company ............... 426
      Notes ............................................. 434
   4. The Bona Fide Occupational Qualification Defense .... 436
      Western Air Lines, Inc. v. Criswell .................... 436
      Notes ............................................. 441

B. SYSTEMIC DISPARATE TREATMENT .......................... 443
   Hazelwood School District v. United States ............... 443
   Notes ............................................. 450

C. DISPARATE IMPACT ...................................... 454
   1. The Basic Model ...................................... 454
      Griggs v. Duke Power Co. .............................. 454
      Notes ............................................. 457
   2. Under the Age Discrimination in Employment Act ...... 459
      Meacham v. Knolls Atomic Power Laboratory ............ 459
      Notes ............................................. 466
   3. Relationship Between Disparate Treatment and Disparate Impact .... 468
      Ricci v. DeStefano .................................. 468
      Notes ............................................. 487

D. SEXUAL HARASSMENT ...................................... 488
   Harris v. Forklift Systems, Inc. ........................ 488
   Notes ............................................. 492
   Oncale v. Sundowner Offshore Services, Inc. .............. 493
   Notes ............................................. 497
   Lyle v. Warner Brothers Television Productions ........... 498
   Notes ............................................. 507
TABLE OF CONTENTS

Faragher v. City of Boca Raton ............................ 508
Notes .................................................. 518

E. DISABILITY DISCRIMINATION ........................... 520
Gil v. Vortex, LLC ..................................... 521
Notes .................................................. 526
US Airways, Inc. v. Barnett ............................. 528
Notes .................................................. 542
Hoffman v. Carefirst of Fort Wayne, Inc. ............... 546
Note ................................................... 553

F. AFFIRMATIVE ACTION AND THE PROBLEMS OF REMEDIES ... 554
Johnson v. Transportation Agency ....................... 554
Notes .................................................. 563
Taxman v. Board of Education .......................... 564
Notes .................................................. 573

PART VI REGULATION OF COMPENSATION .............. 575

Chapter 15 WAGES AND HOURS LEGISLATION ............. 577

A. THE HISTORY OF WAGE AND HOUR REGULATION IN THE UNITED STATES ....................................... 577
Lochner v. New York ................................... 577
Notes .................................................. 584
Notes .................................................. 592

B. THE FAIR LABOR STANDARDS ACT ....................... 593
1. Substantive Obligations of the FLSA .................... 594
a. Minimum Wages ..................................... 594
Notes .................................................. 597
b. Premium Pay for Overtime Hours ...................... 600
Notes .................................................. 602
c. Restrictions on the Use of Child Labor ................. 604
Notes .................................................. 606
d. Problems with Implementing the Substantive Obligations 607
Bright v. Houston Northwest Medical Center Survivor, Inc. 607
Notes .................................................. 614
Marshall v. Sam Dell’s Dodge Corp. ...................... 615
Notes .................................................. 620
Dunlop v. Gray-Goto, Inc. ................................ 620
Notes .................................................. 622
2. Coverage ............................................. 623
TABLE OF CONTENTS

Morgan v. Family Dollar Stores, Inc. .......................... 624
Notes .............................................. 630

C. WAGE-PAYMENT LAWS ................................ 632
Beckwith v. United Parcel Service .......................... 632
Notes .............................................. 634

Chapter 16  UNEMPLOYMENT AND UNEMPLOYMENT INSURANCE .................. 637

A. SKETCHES OF THE UNEMPLOYED ......................... 637
Louis Uchitelle, The Disposable American: Layoffs and their Consequences .......................... 637
H.G. Kaufman, Professionals in Search of Work: Coping with the Stress of Job Loss and Underemployment .......................... 639

B. THE UNEMPLOYMENT INSURANCE PROGRAM .............. 641
1. History and Financial Structure of Unemployment Insurance .......................... 641
2. Causes of Unemployment and the Role of UI .......................... 645
   Gillian Lester, Unemployment Insurance and Wealth Redistribution .......................... 646
   a. UI and Job Search Behavior ................................ 648
   b. Experience Rating and Employer Layoff Behavior .......................... 649
      Advisory Council on Unemployment Compensation, Unemployment Insurance in the United States .......................... 649
      Note ............................................. 654
3. Work Search Requirements .................................. 654
   Knox v. Unemployment Compensation Board of Review .......................... 655
   Notes ............................................. 656

C. DISQUALIFICATIONS FROM UI BENEFITS .................. 658
   Note ............................................. 660
1. Voluntary Quits ...................................... 661
   Wimberly v. Labor & Industrial Relations Commission .......................... 661
   Note ............................................. 665
   MacGregor v. Unemployment Insurance Appeals Board .......................... 665
   Notes ............................................. 670
   Jones v. Review Board of Indiana Employment Security Division .......................... 671
   Notes ............................................. 672
2. Willful Misconduct .................................... 673
   McCourtney v. Imprimis Technology, Inc. .......................... 673
   Notes ............................................. 676

D. FEDERAL REGULATION OF PLANT CLOSINGS .............. 677
   Barry Bluestone & Bennett Harrison, The Deindustrialization of America .......................... 677

xiii
PART VII EMPLOYEE BENEFITS ................................. 689

Chapter 17 LEAVE TIME ................................. 697
A. THE RIGHT TO LEAVE TIME ................................. 698
   Whitaker v. Bosch Braking Systems Division .................. 698
   Notes ................................................................... 704
B. THE CONDITIONS OF THE LEAVE ......................... 710
   Rogers v. City of San Antonio ............................... 710
   Notes .................................................................. 717

Chapter 18 PENSIONS .................................. 721
A. THE PROBLEM WITH PENSIONS .............................. 721
   McNevin v. Solvay Process Co. ............................... 721
   Notes .................................................................. 725
B. PROTECTING EMPLOYEES FROM FORFEITURE ......... 728
   Nemeth v. Clark Equipment Co. .............................. 730
   Notes .................................................................. 735
C. FIDUCIARY DUTIES ....................................... 737
   Donovan v. Bierwirth .......................................... 737
   Notes .................................................................. 745
   LaRue v. Dewolff, Boberg & Associates, Inc. .......... 745
   Lorenzen v. Employees Retirement Plan of the Sperry &
   Hutchinson Co. .................................................. 751
   Notes .................................................................. 754
   Beach v. Commonwealth Edison Company ............ 757
   Note ................................................................... 766
D. PLAN ADMINISTRATION ................................ 767
   Metropolitan Life Insurance Company v. Glenn ........ 767
   Notes .................................................................. 777
E. PLANS OF DISTRESSED EMPLOYERS ............... 777
   Defined-Benefit Plans ......................................... 778
   Pension Benefit Guaranty Corp. v. LTV Corp. ........ 778
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Notes</th>
<th>786</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2. Defined- Contribution Plans</td>
<td>788</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>John H. Langbein, <em>The Enron Pension Investment Catastrophe: Why</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>It Happened and How Congress Should Fix It</td>
<td>788</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes</td>
<td>792</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F. RETIREMENT SECURITY AND EMPLOYER-SPONSORED PENSIONS</td>
<td>794</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Michael J. Graetz, <em>The Troubled Marriage of Retirement Security and Tax Policies</em></td>
<td>794</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes</td>
<td>796</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Chapter 19 EMPLOYER-PROVIDED HEALTH INSURANCE . . . . . . . . . 799

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>A. THINKING ABOUT AN EMPLOYMENT-BASED HEALTH CARE SYSTEM</th>
<th>801</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Timothy Stoltzfus Jost, <em>Private or Public Approaches to Insuring the Uninsured: Lessons from International Experience with Private Insurance</em></td>
<td>802</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes</td>
<td>806</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. ERISA PREEMPTION</td>
<td>807</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Metropolitan Life Insurance Co. v. Massachusetts</em></td>
<td>808</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes</td>
<td>814</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Retail Industry Leaders Association v. Fielder</em></td>
<td>816</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes</td>
<td>825</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. PROBLEMS WITH ENFORCEMENT</td>
<td>827</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Corcoran v. United Healthcare, Inc.</em></td>
<td>827</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes</td>
<td>836</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. ACA AND THE LIMITATIONS OF EMPLOYER-PROVIDED HEALTH INSURANCE</td>
<td>838</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Council of Economic Advisers, <em>The Economic Case for Health Care Reform</em></td>
<td>840</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lawrence H. Summers, <em>Some Simple Economics of Mandated Benefits</em></td>
<td>843</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes</td>
<td>847</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### PART VIII WORKPLACE INJURIES AND DISEASES . . . . . . . . . . 849

### Chapter 20 THE PRESTATUTORY APPROACHES . . . . . . . . . . . . . 855

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>A. THE LABOR MARKET</th>
<th>855</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Notes</td>
<td>857</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Chapter 21  WORKERS’ COMPENSATION  865

### A. THE ORIGINS OF WORKERS’ COMPENSATION  865

- C. Arthur Williams, Jr. & Peter S. Barth, *Compendium on Workmen’s Compensation*  865
- *New York Central Railroad Co. v. White*  868
- Notes  871

### B. AN OVERVIEW OF CURRENT WORKERS’ COMPENSATION PROGRAMS  875

1. Coverage of Employees and Employers  875
2. Coverage of Injuries and Diseases  875
3. Medical Care and Rehabilitation Services  876
4. Cash Benefits  876
   - a. Temporary Total Disability Benefits  877
   - b. Temporary Partial Disability Benefits  877
   - c. Permanent Partial Disability Benefits  877
   - d. Permanent Total Disability Benefits  878
   - e. Death Benefits  878
5. Financing of Benefits  879
6. Administration of Workers’ Compensation  880
   - a. The Initial Responsibility for Payment  880
   - b. The Functions of the Administrative Agency  880
   - c. Closing Cases  880
   - d. Extent of Attorney Involvement  881
7. Federal and State Responsibilities  881

### C. THE EXCLUSIVITY OF WORKERS’ COMPENSATION  882

1. Tort Suits and Other Legal Actions Against the Employer  882
   - *Millison v. E.I. du Pont de Nemours & Co.*  882
   - Notes  887
2. No Remedy Against the Employer?  893
   - *Livitsanos v. Superior Court*  893
   - Notes  900
3. To Whom Does the Exclusive Remedy Doctrine Apply?  902
   - Notes  903

### D. WHICH INJURIES ARE COMPENSABLE?  907

1. Test One: In the Course of Employment  908
   - a. Activity: Mixed Social and Business Activities  908
      - *Ezzy v. Workers’ Compensation Appeals Board*  908
TABLE OF CONTENTS

Note .................................................. 913
b. Activity: Horseplay ................................ 914
   Prows v. Industrial Commission .................. 914
   Note ............................................. 920
c. Time and Place: Going and Coming Rule ....... 920
   Santa Rosa Junior College v. Workers’ Compensation
     Appeals Board .................................. 920
     Notes .......................................... 927
2. Test Two: Arising Out of Employment ........... 929
   Donahue v. Maryland Casualty Co. .............. 931
   Katz v. A. Kadans & Co. .......................... 932
   Notes ............................................ 933
   Hanson v. Reichelt ............................... 934
   Notes ............................................ 938
   Nippert v. Shinn Farm Construction Co. .......... 939
   Note ............................................. 941
3. Tradeoffs Between Tests One And Two .......... 942
   Technical Tape Corp. v. Industrial Commission .. 942
   Notes ............................................ 944
4. Test Three: Accident .............................. 945
   Matthews v. R.T. Allen & Sons ................... 945
   Notes ............................................ 949
5. Test Four: Personal Injury ......................... 950
   Note ............................................. 951
E. WHICH DISEASES ARE COMPENSABLE? ............ 951
   Tisco Intermountain v. Industrial Commission ... 951
   Notes ............................................ 953
F. INJURIES AND DISEASES FOR WHICH COMPENSABILITY IS PROBLEMATIC .................. 956
1. Workplace Stress .................................. 956
   Chicago Board of Education v. Industrial Commission 956
   Notes ............................................ 961
2. Trends in Compensability .......................... 964
   Emily A. Spieler & John F. Burton, Jr., Compensation For Disabled Workers: Workers’ Compensation 964
   Notes ............................................ 966
   Brodie v. Workers’ Compensation Appeals Bd. .... 968
   Note ............................................. 977
G. CASH BENEFITS .................................. 978
1. Temporary Disability Benefits .................... 980
   Temporary Total Disability Benefits .............. 980
   Tobin v. All Shore All Star ....................... 980
TABLE OF CONTENTS

2. Permanent Partial Disability Benefits
   a. Introduction ........................................ 986
   b. Scheduled Permanent Partial Disability Benefits .......... 987
   c. System I PPD Benefits: Nonscheduled PPD Benefits Based on
      Impairment ......................................... 987
   d. System II PPD Benefits: Nonscheduled PPD Benefits Based on Loss
      of Earning Capacity ................................. 987
   e. System III PPD Benefits: Nonscheduled PPD Benefits Based on
      Actual Wage Loss .................................... 989

4. Death Benefits ........................................ 996

H. MEDICAL AND REHABILITATION BENEFITS ................. 996
   Petrilla v. Workmen’s Compensation Appeal Board .......... 997
   Notes ............................................. 1001
   Shawnee Management Corp. v. Hamilton .................... 1002
   Note .............................................. 1004

Chapter 22 THE OCCUPATIONAL SAFETY AND HEALTH
   ACT .................................................. 1005

   A. AN OVERVIEW OF THE ACT .............................. 1006
   1. Coverage ........................................... 1006
   2. OSHA’s Administrative Structure .......................... 1006
   3. Promulgation of Standards ................................ 1007
   4. Interim Standards ..................................... 1007
   5. Emergency Temporary Standards ........................... 1008
   6. Permanent Standards ................................... 1009
   7. Variances ........................................... 1011
   8. The General Duty Clause ................................ 1011
   9. Enforcement ......................................... 1011
   10. Procedure in Contested Cases ............................ 1012
   11. Imminent Danger ..................................... 1013
   12. State Plans .......................................... 1013
### TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>13. Other Provisions of the Act</td>
<td>1013</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14. The Small Business Regulatory Enforcement Fairness Act</td>
<td>1014</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15. The Government Performance and Results Modernization Act</td>
<td>1014</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16. The Environmental Protection Agency</td>
<td>1015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>B. SUBSTANTIVE CRITERIA FOR OSHA STANDARDS</strong></td>
<td>1015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. The First and Second Criteria: Technological and Economic Feasibility</td>
<td>1016</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>AFL-CIO v. Brennan</strong></td>
<td>1019</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. The Third Criterion: Benefits to Workers’ Health or Safety</td>
<td>1020</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. The Fourth Criterion: Cost-Benefit Analysis</td>
<td>1023</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>C. LEGAL CHALLENGES TO PERMANENT STANDARDS</strong></td>
<td>1027</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes</td>
<td>1029</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>American Textile Manufacturers Institute v. Donovan</strong></td>
<td>1030</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes</td>
<td>1039</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Generic Rulemaking</strong></td>
<td>1040</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>AFL-CIO v. OSHA</strong></td>
<td>1042</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes</td>
<td>1051</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>D. THE GENERAL DUTY CLAUSE</strong></td>
<td>1054</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>National Realty &amp; Construction Co. v. OSHRC</strong></td>
<td>1054</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes</td>
<td>1058</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>E. ENFORCEMENT</strong></td>
<td>1063</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Marshall v. Barlow’s, Inc.</strong></td>
<td>1066</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes</td>
<td>1072</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>F. EMPLOYEE RIGHTS AND RESPONSIBILITIES</strong></td>
<td>1073</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Atlantic &amp; Gulf Stevedores, Inc. v. OSHA</strong></td>
<td>1073</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Whirlpool Corp. v. Marshall</strong></td>
<td>1081</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes</td>
<td>1088</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>G. EMPLOYER RESPONSIBILITIES</strong></td>
<td>1089</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Secretary of Labor v. Summit Contractors, Inc.</strong></td>
<td>1090</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Note</td>
<td>1094</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>National Association of Home Builders v. OSHA</strong></td>
<td>1094</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Note</td>
<td>1097</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>H. FEDERAL VERSUS STATE AUTHORITY FOR WORKPLACE SAFETY AND HEALTH</strong></td>
<td>1097</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. State Authority Ceded Under OSHA</td>
<td>1097</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Other Sources of State Authority</td>
<td>1098</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Gade v. National Solid Wastes Management Association</strong></td>
<td>1099</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes</td>
<td>1107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Criminal Prosecutions of Employers</td>
<td>1109</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>People v. Chicago Magnet Wire Corp.</strong></td>
<td>1109</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes</td>
<td>1114</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
TABLE OF CONTENTS

4. Tort Suits ........................................... 1117

Chapter 23 RETHINKING THE APPROACHES TO WORKPLACE INJURIES AND DISEASES ................. 1119

A. THE LABOR MARKET .................................. 1119
   Economic Report of the President ..................... 1119
   Note .................................................. 1120

B. TORT SUITS ......................................... 1121
   Economic Report of the President ..................... 1121
   John F. Burton, Jr., Workers’ Compensation .......... 1122
   Notes .................................................. 1125

C. WORKERS’ COMPENSATION ............................ 1127
   Economic Report of the President ..................... 1127
   Note .................................................. 1128
   H. Allan Hunt, Adequacy of Earnings Replacement in Workers’ Compensation Programs ...... 1128
   Monroe Berkowitz & John F. Burton, Jr., Permanent Disability Benefits in Workers’ Compensation .......... 1130
   John F. Burton, Jr., Workers’ Compensation .......... 1132
   Note .................................................. 1135

D. THE OCCUPATIONAL SAFETY AND HEALTH ACT ........... 1136
   Economic Report of the President ..................... 1136
   Notes .................................................. 1137
   Sidney A. Shapiro, Occupational Safety and Health Regulation ........................................ 1138
   John F. Burton, Jr. & James R. Chelius, Workplace Safety and Health Regulations: Rationale and Results .......... 1139
   Notes .................................................. 1141

PART IX ENFORCEMENT OF EMPLOYMENT RIGHTS ..... 1143

Chapter 24 COMMON ENFORCEMENT ISSUES ............... 1145

A. WHO ENFORCES? ..................................... 1145
   Christiansburg Garment Co. v. EEOC ................... 1145
   Notes .................................................. 1150

B. WHO BENEFITS? ...................................... 1151
   Bahramipour v. Citigroup Global Markets, Inc. .......... 1151
   Notes .................................................. 1154

C. REMEDIES ........................................... 1157
   Balbuena v. IDR Realty LLC .......................... 1157
   Notes .................................................. 1162