UNDERSTANDING ADMINISTRATIVE LAW

SIXTH EDITION

William F. Fox
Visiting Professor of Law
Penn State University
Dickinson School of Law
Students react in various ways to the study of administrative law. Some elect the course because they anticipate employment in a federal or state administrative agency; some choose the course merely because it is a subject tested on the bar examination; others have some abstract interest in a course that deals with the manner in which agencies make policy and decide individual cases. Often it is not until a student graduates and begins the practice of law that the pervasiveness of various administrative decision-making models becomes apparent. These models are not limited to the federal government, but may be found at the state and regional level, in municipal governments and even in many private entities such as corporations and educational institutions. For that reason this text includes a certain amount of state-based material. Students who go into a state administrative practice will encounter concepts and terminology nearly identical with federal practice.

Law professors also approach the subject from different angles: some emphasize the administrative system of a single state; others focus exclusively on the federal system; still others explore only one or two specific administrative agencies, in the belief that the administrative process can be understood best in the context of a specific agency carrying out a specific assigned mission.

This book will help the reader grasp the fundamental concepts of administrative law regardless of the approach taken by an instructor and regardless of the reader’s personal motivation for electing the course. By and large the book concentrates on the process of administrative decision-making in contrast to the substantive law of a particular agency. But as a student moves through the course and later enters practice, he or she will find that substance and procedure become more and more intertwined and, in many instances, become almost inextricable. An awareness that there is no bright line between substance and procedure, particularly in an administrative agency context, is especially helpful for a thorough understanding of the subject.

Students should also realize that the practicing bar has serious reservations as to the utility of the typical administrative law course. One prominent Washington, D.C. lawyer commented that if he ever got to the point in handling a case before an administrative agency that he needed to use or refer to anything he had been taught in his administrative law course in law school, he probably would have failed his client. For this reason, this book contains a number of attempts to sensitize law students to the lawyering operations involved in administrative law — i.e., to the manner in which a client’s problem moves through a typical agency and the manner in which a lawyer copes with the various problems and issues encountered in representing clients before administrative agencies. The relative informality of the administrative process and the fact that agencies exercise both adjudicative and legislative powers means that an administrative lawyer must often be far more creative and adaptable in dealing with an agency dispute than in handling a piece of civil litigation. Moreover, many agencies are beginning to experiment with alternative dispute resolution techniques so a well-trained lawyer needs to know something about regulatory negotiation, arbitration and mediation.

Comments of Peter Barton Hutt, as quoted in Peter L. Strauss, Teaching Administrative Law: The Wonder of the Unknown, 33 J. LEGAL EDUC. 1 (1983).
In addition, the book contains a significant amount of material on trends in administrative law such as deregulation and regulatory reform. Many governmental entities, including a number of federal agencies, have begun to move away from traditional models for exercising governmental power (the so-called “command and control” regulatory techniques) toward concepts of policymaking and decisional processes that take full advantage of the marketplace as regulator. Students anticipating thirty to forty more years of practice must realize that many areas of practice involving deregulation and regulatory reform are in fact fertile fields for a legal practice. In many cases these trends have enhanced, rather than diminished, the lawyer’s role.

A good deal of the material in this book consists of suggestions on ways to identify administrative problems and ways to organize the reader’s thinking after the problem is identified. The book does not, of course, ignore the statutory and case law basis of administrative law; but often, whether the reader is a student or practitioner, a guide on how to think through a problem is more helpful than a mere paraphrase of a statute or recitation of a case holding. Since one of the assumptions of the author is that most readers will be using this book as an adjunct to a course in administrative law and thus will have access to a casebook, lengthy verbatim quotations from cases are kept to an absolute minimum.

This book should also prove helpful to practitioners who either missed the course in law school or find themselves dealing with topics not covered in their course. In those instances, a practicing lawyer might profitably read at least a bit of the full text of any case discussed.

Hopefully, most readers will concur that there are no insoluble mysteries in administrative law, although as in all areas of law, there are many schools of thought, a large number of differing (and often conflicting) viewpoints and a great deal controversy. But there should not be very much mystery as you dig through the issues and concepts. As the author has often remarked: students are just as bright and capable as teachers, it’s just that a teacher has usually covered the same ground before; and it’s always easier to walk through a maze with someone who has already been there than to attempt the journey on your own.

This book may be used with any of the existing commercially-published casebooks on administrative law. While this Book’s tables of contents and chapter headings may not correspond directly with some of the headings used in the casebooks, there is a generally accepted core of administrative law topics that virtually every casebook covers and for which there is a standard vocabulary. There are two ways for a reader to use this book without reading it from cover to cover. First, if an outline heading in this book corresponds to a similar heading in a casebook (for example, the topic of “delegation”), the reader may move immediately to that topic. If there seems to be no correspondence between this book’s outline headings and those headings used in the casebook, the most efficient mechanism for finding relevant discussion is to match the case in the casebook against the table of cases in this book.

My thinking on administrative law has been shaped by all those who have walked the ground before me. I am especially grateful to the many students at my former academic home, The Catholic University of America, who took my course, who challenged me in class, and who sent me scurrying back to the library and to practice for answers to their questions. My current students at Penn State-Dickinson School of Law keep me busy and engaged with all of their questions, comments and insights. I have been enriched by an
association with the many lawyers I encounter in Washington practice. I owe a great debt to a number of other people who helped me grow as a lawyer and law professor: Professors Clinton Bamberger, Albert J. Broderick, and Harvey Zuckman, Judge Benigno C. Hernandez, Counselors William T. Simmons, and Theodore Voorhees, Sr. A number of research assistants, now all practicing law, were indispensable. They include: Andrew Palmieri, Scott Squillace, B. Erin Sullivan, and Roman Majtan. My most recent research assistant, Madison Cassels, was enormously helpful in preparing the manuscript for the sixth edition.
# Table of Contents

**Chapter 1** INTRODUCTION .............................................. 1

§ 1.01 STUDYING AND PRACTICING ADMINISTRATIVE LAW .......... 1
[A] An Overview of Administrative Law ............................. 1
[B] The Study and Practice of Administrative Law .................. 2

§ 1.02 THE NATURE OF ADMINISTRATIVE AGENCIES ................. 5
[A] Addressing Legal Disputes ...................................... 5
[B] Legislative Choices Involving Administrative Agencies ........ 7
[C] “Command-and-Control Regulation” .............................. 9
[D] Licensing Agencies ............................................. 9
[E] The Structure of an Agency ..................................... 9

§ 1.03 JUSTIFICATIONS FOR REGULATION ............................ 11
[A] Economic Justification ........................................... 11
[B] Political Justifications .......................................... 12
[C] Evolution of Regulatory Philosophy .............................. 13

§ 1.04 THE ADMINISTRATIVE PROCESS ............................... 16
[A] Generally ....................................................... 16
[B] Rulemaking ...................................................... 17
[C] Adjudication ..................................................... 17
[D] Informal Agency Action .......................................... 18
[E] Alternative Dispute Resolution .................................. 18

§ 1.05 JUDICIAL REVIEW OF AGENCY ACTION ....................... 19
[A] Effect of Judicial Review ......................................... 19
[B] Preclusion from Judicial Review ................................ 20
[C] Other Barriers to Judicial Review ............................... 20
[1] Statutory and Common Law Barriers .......................... 20

§ 1.06 RESEARCHING ADMINISTRATIVE LAW ....................... 22
[A] Student Awareness of Administrative Materials ............... 22
[B] Official Materials ............................................... 22
[5] Other Agency Publications ..................................... 23
[6] Presidential Documents .......................................... 24
[C] Unofficial Commercial Services ................................. 24
### Table of Contents

**Chapter 2** EXTERNAL CONTROLS ON ADMINISTRATIVE AGENCIES — THE LEGISLATIVE BRANCH  

| § 2.01 | INTRODUCTION | 25 |
| § 2.02 | CONSTITUTIONAL LIMITATIONS ON THE CREATION OF AGENCIES — THE DELEGATION ISSUE | 26 |
| [A] | Legislative Authority | 26 |
| [B] | Federal Agencies and the Non-Delegation Doctrine — The Early Cases | 26 |
| [C] | The New Deal Cases | 27 |
| [1] | Background | 27 |
| [D] | Delegation Since the New Deal | 31 |
| [E] | Delegation in State Administrative Systems | 34 |
| [F] | Solving a Delegation Problem | 35 |
| [1] | Identifying a Delegation Issue | 35 |
| [G] | Delegation in the Future | 43 |
| § 2.03 | OTHER LEGISLATIVE CONTROLS | 44 |
| [A] | Congressional Devices for Policing Administrative Agencies | 44 |
| [B] | The Power to Investigate and the Doctrine of Executive Privilege | 44 |
| [C] | The Oversight Process | 46 |
| [D] | Agency Budgets and Specific Statutory Controls | 47 |
| § 2.04 | THE SPECIAL PROBLEM OF THE LEGISLATIVE VETO | 48 |
| [A] | Streamlining Agency Rulemaking | 48 |
| [C] | Issues Unresolved After Chadha | 51 |

**Chapter 3** EXTERNAL CONTROLS ON ADMINISTRATIVE AGENCIES — THE EXECUTIVE BRANCH  

| § 3.01 | INTRODUCTION | 55 |
| § 3.02 | AN EXCURSUS ON AGENCY ORGANIZATION | 55 |
| [A] | Introduction | 55 |
| [B] | The Agency’s Mission | 56 |
| [C] | Agency Accountability | 56 |
| [D] | Political Considerations | 57 |
| § 3.03 | THE APPOINTMENT AND REMOVAL PROCESS | 60 |
| [A] | The Appointment Process | 60 |
Table of Contents

[B] Termination of Officers .................................................. 61
[2] Constitutional Limitations on Removal ............................... 62
§ 3.04 OTHER PRESIDENTIAL POWERS ...................................... 67
[A] Presidential Powers Generally ........................................ 67
[B] The Role of the Executive Order ..................................... 68
[C] The Special Role of the Attorney General ........................... 69
[E] The Unresolved Theory of the “Unitary Executive” ............... 70
§ 3.05 ETHICS IN GOVERNMENT SERVICE ................................. 71
[A] Ethical Issues Arising Facing Administrative Lawyers ............ 71
[B] The Ethics in Government Act ........................................ 72
[C] The Office of Independent Counsel ................................. 73
[D] Presidential Signing Statements .................................... 74

Chapter 4 THE EXERCISE OF AGENCY POWER ....................... 77
§ 4.01 INTRODUCTION ......................................................... 77
§ 4.02 AGENCY JURISDICTION-THE ULTRA VIRES DOCTRINE ......... 78
§ 4.03 AGENCY EXERCISE OF LEGISLATIVE POWER ...................... 80
§ 4.04 AGENCY EXERCISE OF JUDICIAL POWER ....................... 81
[A] The Basic Power to Adjudicate ....................................... 81
[B] Penalty Assessments and Other Remedies ........................... 87
[C] Agencies and Criminal Sanctions .................................... 88
[D] Agency Regulation of Attorney Conduct ........................... 90
§ 4.05 AGENCY ACQUISITION OF INFORMATION — AN OVERVIEW .. 92
[A] Congress’ and the Courts’ Recognition of Agency Need for Information .................................................. 92
[B] Recordkeeping Requirements .......................................... 92
[C] Reporting Requirements ............................................. 93
[D] Subpoenas ............................................................ 93
[E] Physical Inspections ................................................ 93
[F] Other Forms of Information Gathering ............................... 93
§ 4.06 RECORDKEEPING AND REPORTING REQUIREMENTS ............ 94
[A] Information Requests Generally .................................... 94
[B] The Limitations of the Fifth Amendment Right Against Self-Incrimination .................................................. 95
[C] Limitations Imposed by the Paperwork Reduction Act ............ 99
§ 4.07 AGENCY SUBPOENAS .................................................. 100
[A] Some General Considerations ....................................... 100
[C] Who May Utilize an Agency’s Subpoena Power and What Showing Is Necessary to Obtain a Subpoena? ....................... 101
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter 5</th>
<th>AGENCY DECISION-MAKING: THE CONSTITUTIONAL LIMITATIONS</th>
<th>117</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>§ 5.01</td>
<td>AN INTRODUCTION TO CONSTITUTIONAL DUE PROCESS</td>
<td>117</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[A]</td>
<td>Issues Pertaining to Due Process</td>
<td>117</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[B]</td>
<td>Whether</td>
<td>119</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[C]</td>
<td>When</td>
<td>119</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[D]</td>
<td>What Kind</td>
<td>119</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 5.02</td>
<td>THE EARLY DECISIONS</td>
<td>119</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 5.03</td>
<td>THE IMPACT OF GOLDBERG v. KELLY</td>
<td>122</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 5.04</td>
<td>THE CURRENT TEST FOR DUE PROCESS — MATHEWS v. ELDRI lDGE</td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 5.05</td>
<td>RESOLVING ADMINISTRATIVE DUE PROCESS ISSUES</td>
<td>132</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[A]</td>
<td>Approaches</td>
<td>132</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[B]</td>
<td>Resolving a Whether Issue</td>
<td>132</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[C]</td>
<td>Resolving a When Issue</td>
<td>140</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[D]</td>
<td>Resolving a What Kind Issue</td>
<td>142</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 5.06</td>
<td>SUBSTANTIVE DUE PROCESS IN ADMINISTRATIVE LAW</td>
<td>144</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[A]</td>
<td>Substantive Due process Generally</td>
<td>144</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[B]</td>
<td>The Impact of the “Takings” Doctrine</td>
<td>145</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter 6</th>
<th>AGENCY DECISION-MAKING: CHOOSING RULE OR ORDER</th>
<th>149</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>§ 6.01</td>
<td>INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>149</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 6.02</td>
<td>SOME BASIC DISTINCTIONS BETWEEN A RULE AND AN ORDER</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table of Contents

§ 6.03 THE SUPREME COURT'S VIEW: *CHENERY AND WYMAN-GORDON* .................................................. 152
§ 6.04 THE CURRENT VIEW: *BELL AEROSPACE* .......................................................... 158
§ 6.05 SOLVING A RULE VERSUS ORDER PROBLEM .................................................. 161

Chapter 7 RULEMAKING .................................................. 163

§ 7.01 INTRODUCTION .................................................. 163
§ 7.02 BASIC RULEMAKING PROCEDURE UNDER THE APA .................................................. 164
  [A] Triggering of Rulemaking Process .................................................. 164
  [B] The Scope of § 553 .................................................. 165
  [C] The Notice Requirement .................................................. 166
  [D] Consideration of Comments .................................................. 168
  [E] Promulgation of a Final Rule .................................................. 169
  [F] Electronic Rulemaking .................................................. 171
§ 7.03 THE IMPACT OF *FLORIDA EAST COAST RAILWAY AND VERMONT YANKEE* ON BASIC RULEMAKING PROCEDURE .................................................. 173
  [A] *Formal and Hybrid Rulemaking* .................................................. 173
  [B] Formal Rulemaking and *Florida East Coast Railway* .................................................. 173
  [C] “Hybrid” Rulemaking and *Vermont Yankee* .................................................. 175
§ 7.04 PROPER HYBRID AND FORMAL RULEMAKING .................................................. 177
§ 7.05 NEGOTIATED RULEMAKING AND OTHER STATUTORY CONTROLS ON AGENCY RULEMAKING .................................................. 178
  [A] Negotiated Rulemaking .................................................. 178
  [B] Other Statutory Controls .................................................. 182
§ 7.06 SUPERVISION OF EXECUTIVE BRANCH RULEMAKING BY THE OFFICE OF MANAGEMENT AND BUDGET .................................................. 183
§ 7.07 COST-BENEFIT ANALYSIS .................................................. 187
  [A] Cost-Benefit Methodology .................................................. 187
  [B] The Supreme Court and Cost-Benefit Analysis .................................................. 189
  [C] Cost Benefit Analysis Under Presidential Executive Orders .................................................. 192
§ 7.08 EX PARTE CONTACTS AND BIAS IN AGENCY RULEMAKING .................................................. 193
  [A] Ex Parte Contacts .................................................. 193
  [B] Agency Bias .................................................. 196
§ 7.09 THE LEGAL EFFECT OF AGENCY RULES .................................................. 197
  [A] Distinguishing Between Substantive Rules and Other Types of Agency Pronouncements .................................................. 197
  [B] The Legal Effect of Substantive Rules .................................................. 199
  [C] Amending or Rescinding Substantive Rules .................................................. 200
  [D] The Legal Effect of Other Than Substantive Rules .................................................. 202
  [E] The Retroactive Effect of Agency Rules .................................................. 203
§ 7.10 ESTOPPEL AGAINST THE GOVERNMENT .................................................. 206
  [A] WARNING! .................................................. 206
Table of Contents

[B] The Estoppel Case Law ........................................ 206
[C] Dealing With Estoppel as a Practitioner .................... 208
§ 7.11 RULEMAKING IN THE STATES .......................... 210
§ 7.12 DRAFTING A RULE ........................................ 212
§ 7.13 SOLVING RULEMAKING PROBLEMS ..................... 214

Chapter 8  TRIAL-TYPE PROCEEDINGS ....................... 217
§ 8.01 INTRODUCTION ............................................. 217
§ 8.02 AN APA ROADMAP ........................................ 218
[A] Agency Impact on Trial-Type Proceedings .................. 218
[B] The Scope of APA Adjudications ........................... 218
[C] Pre-Hearing Matters ........................................... 221
[D] The Hearing ................................................... 221
[E] The Agency Decision .......................................... 222
[F] Alternative Dispute Resolution in Federal Agencies ...... 222
§ 8.03 INITIATION OF AN AGENCY ACTION ................. 224
§ 8.04 PRE-HEARING ACTIVITIES .............................. 225
[A] Analysis of Pre-Hearing Process ............................ 225
[B] Participation and Right to Counsel ......................... 225
[1] Participation .................................................. 225
[2] Right to Counsel ................................................ 229
[C] Discovery ....................................................... 230
[D] The Pre-Hearing Conference ................................. 232
§ 8.05 THE HEARING ............................................ 233
[A] Preparation for the Hearing .................................. 233
[B] The Hearing Format ............................................ 233
[C] Cross-Examination ............................................. 234
[D] Formal Rules of Evidence .................................... 234
[E] Official Notice .................................................. 238
[F] Limiting Evidence at Hearing by Prior Rulemaking .... 241
[G] Burden of Proof ................................................ 241
[H] Standard of Proof ............................................. 242
[I] Hearings on a Purely Written Record ....................... 243
§ 8.06 THE ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGE ................. 244
[A] Establishing and Appointing ALJs .......................... 244
[B] The Role of the ALJ ........................................... 245
[C] Separation of Functions ....................................... 246
§ 8.07 BIAS AND EX PARTE CONTACTS IN AGENCY PROCEEDINGS .... 247
[A] Poisoning of Agency Hearing ............................... 247
[B] Bias and Disqualification .................................... 247
[1] Need for Impartiality .......................................... 247
Table of Contents

§ 10.06 STANDING ................................................. 288
[A] The Basic Concepts ........................................ 288
[B] The Early Cases ............................................ 289
[C] The Data Processing Test ................................... 290
[D] The Post-Data Processing Refinements - The Journey from Sierra Club to Valley Forge ......................................................... 291
[E] Tightening Standing: The Contributions of Lujan, Clarke and Air Courier ................................................. 294
[F] Taxpayer Standing .............................................. 300
[G] Third-party Standing ........................................... 302
[H] Standing on the Part of State Governments .................. 304

§ 10.07 RESOLVING THRESHOLD JUDICIAL REVIEW ISSUES .... 305

Chapter 11 JUDICIAL REVIEW: STAYING IN COURT .............. 307

§ 11.01 INTRODUCTION ............................................ 307
§ 11.02 PRIMARY JURISDICTION ..................................... 309
[A] Analysis of the Fundamentals ................................... 309
[B] The Landmark Case - Abilene Cotton .......................... 310
[C] The Case Law After Abilene Cotton ............................ 311
[D] The Impact of Nader ............................................ 315

§ 11.03 THE APA’S FINAL ORDER REQUIREMENT .................. 317
§ 11.04 RIPENESS .................................................. 317
[A] Limitations on Court’s Analysis of Issues .................... 317
[B] The Impact of Abbott Laboratories ............................. 318

§ 11.05 EXHAUSTION .............................................. 323
[B] Some Exhaustion Case Law ..................................... 324

Chapter 12 JUDICIAL REVIEW: ON THE MERITS .............. 327

§ 12.01 INTRODUCTION ............................................ 327
§ 12.02 JUDICIAL REVIEW UNDER THE APA .................... 329
§ 12.03 THE OVERTON PARK ROADMAP FOR § 706 ............. 330
[A] Introduction .................................................. 330
[B] Reviewing the Agency Record .................................. 330
[C] Picking the Appropriate Standard for Review ................. 331
[1] Parties’ Choices .............................................. 331
[2] De Novo Review .............................................. 331
[3] Substantial Evidence Review ................................... 332
Table of Contents

§ 12.04 JUDICIAL REVIEW OF AN AGENCY’S FACTUAL DETERMINATIONS ......................................................... 334
[A] Introduction ......................................................... 334
[B] De Novo Review ..................................................... 335
[C] Substantial Evidence Review ..................................... 335
[D] The Arbitrary/Capricious Test ................................... 339

§ 12.05 JUDICIAL REVIEW OF QUESTIONS OF LAW AND MIXED QUESTIONS OF LAW AND FACT ................................................................. 342
[A] Formulating the Issues ............................................. 342
[B] The Constitutional Fact/Jurisdictional Fact Muddle ........... 344
[C] An Agency’s Interpretation of Its Own Statutes: NLRB v. Hearst and Gray v. Powell .............................................. 345
[D] An Agency’s Interpretation of Its Own Statutes: From Chevron Through Brown & Williamson and Mead and Beyond .............. 347
[B] An Agency’s Interpretation of Its Own Rules: Skidmore, Christensen and Mead .................................................. 354
[C] Agency Consistency .................................................. 358
[D] Agency Policy and Political Considerations ..................... 360

§ 12.07 RESOLVING PROBLEMS INVOLVING REVIEW ON THE MERITS .................................................. 361

Chapter 13 PRIVATE ACTIONS AGAINST THE GOVERNMENT AND GOVERNMENT OFFICIALS ..................... 363

§ 13.01 INTRODUCTION .................................................. 363
§ 13.02 SOVEREIGN IMMUNITY AND SUITS AGAINST FEDERAL OFFICERS .................................................. 364
[A] Ex Parte Young ..................................................... 364
[B] Immunity on the Part of Federal Officers-Larson and Barr ........ 365
[C] Immunity for Constitutional Violations—the Progeny of Bivens and Butz .................................................. 366

§ 13.03 THE FEDERAL TORT CLAIMS ACT .................................................. 369
§ 13.04 THE TUCKER ACT .................................................. 372

Chapter 14 OBTAINING GOVERNMENT INFORMATION ............ 375

§ 14.01 INTRODUCTION .................................................. 375
§ 14.02 THE FREEDOM OF INFORMATION ACT ...................... 377
[A] Background ......................................................... 377
[B] A FOIA Roadmap .................................................... 377

§ 14.03 WHO MAY REQUEST GOVERNMENT INFORMATION? .................................................. 379
[A] Generally ......................................................... 379
[B] Which Agencies Are Subject to the FOIA? ....................... 380
[C] How and With Whom Do You File an FOIA Request? ........ 380

xv