

FOUNDATIONS OF EMPLOYMENT DISCRIMINATION LAW

SECOND EDITION



LexisNexis Law School Publishing Advisory Board

William Araiza

Professor of Law
Brooklyn Law School

Lenni B. Benson

Professor of Law & Associate Dean for Professional Development
New York Law School

Raj Bhala

Rice Distinguished Professor
University of Kansas, School of Law

Ruth Colker

Distinguished University Professor & Heck-Faust Memorial Chair in Constitutional Law
Ohio State University, Moritz College of Law

David Gamage

Assistant Professor of Law
UC Berkeley School of Law

Joan Heminway

College of Law Distinguished Professor of Law
University of Tennessee College of Law

Edward Imwinkelried

Edward L. Barrett, Jr. Professor of Law
UC Davis School of Law

David I. C. Thomson

LP Professor & Director, Lawyering Process Program
University of Denver, Sturm College of Law

Melissa Weresh

Director of Legal Writing and Professor of Law
Drake University Law School

FOUNDATIONS OF EMPLOYMENT DISCRIMINATION LAW

SECOND EDITION

JOHN J. DONOHUE III

Professor of Law, Stanford Law School



ISBN: 9781422498835

This publication is designed to provide accurate and authoritative information in regard to the subject matter covered. It is sold with the understanding that the publisher is not engaged in rendering legal, accounting, or other professional services. If legal advice or other expert assistance is required, the services of a competent professional should be sought.

LexisNexis, the knowledge burst logo, and Michie are trademarks of Reed Elsevier Properties Inc., used under license. Matthew Bender is a registered trademark of Matthew Bender Properties Inc. Copyright © 2006 Matthew Bender & Company, Inc., one of the LEXIS Publishing companies. All Rights Reserved.

No copyright is claimed in the text of statutes, regulations, and excerpts from court opinions quoted within this work. Permission to copy material exceeding fair use, 17 U.S.C. § 107, may be licensed for a fee of 10¢ per page per copy from the Copyright Clearance Center, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, Mass. 01923, telephone (978) 750-8400.

NOTE TO USERS

To ensure that you are using the latest materials available in this area, please be sure to periodically check the LexisNexis Law School web site for downloadable updates and supplements at www.lexisnexis.com/lawschool.

Editorial Offices
121 Chanlon Rd., New Providence, NJ 07974 (908) 464-6800
201 Mission St., San Francisco, CA 94105-1831 (415) 908-3200
www.lexisnexis.com

(Pub.3334)

PREFACE TO THE SECOND EDITION

This edition has drawn upon the considerable scholarly work over the last five years that addresses issues concerning employment discrimination law. The growing importance of discrimination on the basis of age and disability has prompted me to add new chapters on those topics, thereby expanding the examination of employment discrimination beyond the areas of race and sex discrimination that were the focus of the first edition. Moreover, the Civil Rights Act of 1991 for the first time established a potential federal remedy of compensatory and punitive damages for victims of sexual harassment, which has prompted an enormous increase in the filing of such cases, and in the amount of judicial and scholarly attention directed to this issue. As a result, the material on sex harassment has been expanded and made into a separate chapter. Finally, throughout I have updated the notes and questions to capture some of the important legal and scholarly developments in all areas of employment discrimination, which continues to be one of the most dynamic and growing areas of federal civil litigation.

In addition to the very helpful research assistance of Wade Pyun, I was also extremely fortunate to be aided in every aspect of this revision by Emily Ryo, whose scholarly talents and good judgment have been critical to this effort. I can't express my gratitude strongly enough.

FOUNDATIONS OF LAW SERIES

ROBERTA ROMANO, GENERAL EDITOR

Foundations of Administrative Law

Edited by Peter H. Schuck, Yale Law School

Foundations of Bankruptcy Law

Edited by Barry Adler, New York University Law School

Foundations of Commercial Law

Edited by Robert E. Scott, Columbia Law School and George G. Triantis, Harvard Law School

Foundations of Contract Law

Edited by Richard Craswell, Stanford Law School and Alan Schwartz, Yale Law School

Foundation of Corporate Law

Edited by Roberta Romano, Yale Law School

Foundations of Criminal Law

Edited by Leo Katz, Michael S. Moore and Stephen J. Morse, all of the University of Pennsylvania Law School

Foundations of the Economic Approach to Law

Edited by Avery Wiener Katz, Columbia Law School

Foundations of Employment Discrimination Law

Edited by John Donohue, III, Stanford Law School

Foundations of Environmental Law and Policy

Edited by Richard L. Revesz, New York University Law School

Foundations of Intellectual Property

Edited by Robert P. Merges, University of California Berkeley and Davis School of Law and Jane C. Ginsburg, Columbia University School of Law

Foundations of International Income Taxation

Edited by Michael J. Graetz, Yale Law School

Foundations of International Law and Politics

*Edited by Oona A. Hathaway, Yale Law School and Harold Hongju Koh,
Yale Law School*

Foundations of Labor and Employment Law

*Edited by Samuel Estreicher, New York University Law School and
Stewart J. Schwab, Cornell Law School*

Foundations of the Law and Ethics of Lawyering

*Edited by George M. Cohen, University of Virginia School of Law and
Susan P. Koniak, Boston University School of Law*

Foundations of Tort Law

*Edited by Saul Levmore, University of Chicago Law School and Catherine
M. Sharkey, New York University School of Law*

CONTENTS

Racial Discrimination

- 1 ***Historical Background, 2***
 - Democracy in America, 4
Alexis de Tocqueville
 - An American Dilemma: The Negro Problem and Modern
Democracy, 9
Gunnar Myrdal
 - Notes and Questions, 12

- 2 ***Freedom and Antidiscrimination Law: Philosophic Issues, 14***
 - In Defense of the Antidiscrimination Principle, 16
Paul Bresit
 - Rational Discrimination in Competitive Markets, 23
Richard A. Epstein
 - Notes and Questions, 29

- 3 ***The Theory of Employment Discrimination Law, 35***
 - 3.1 ***Equal Treatment versus Equal Achievement, 37***
 - A Theory of Fair Employment Laws, 37
Owen M. Fiss
 - Racism, Rights, and the Quest for Equality of Opportunity:
A Critical Legal Essay, 47
Alan Freeman
 - Race, Reform, and Retrenchment: Transformation and
Legitimation in Antidiscrimination Law, 51
Kimberlé Williams Crenshaw
 - Notes and Questions, 56
 - 3.2 ***Affirmative Action, 59***
 - Affirmative Action and Racial Discrimination under Law:
A Preliminary Review, 59
William W. Van Alstyne
 - Persuasion and Distrust: A Comment on the Affirmative
Action Debate, 67
Randall Kennedy

Affirmative Action as a Majoritarian Device: Or, Do You
Really Want to Be a Role Model? 72
Richard Delgado
Notes and Questions, 76

4 *The Evolution of the Law, 85*

4.1 *Constructing the Doctrinal Framework, 88*
The Law Transmission System and the Southern
Jurisprudence of Employment Discrimination, 88
Alfred W. Blumrosen
Notes and Questions, 101

4.2 *The Battle over Testing, 103*
Within-Group Norming and Other Forms of Score
Adjustment in Preemployment Testing, 103
Paul R. Sackett and Steffanie L. Wilk
Employment Testing and Job Performance, 116
Jan H. Blits and Linda S. Gottfredson
Concepts of Discrimination in “General Ability” Job
Testing, 118
Mark Kelman
Notes and Questions, 122

5 *The Nature and Extent of Racial Prejudice, 126*

Recent Unobtrusive Studies of Black and White
Discrimination and Prejudice: A Literature Review,
128
Faye Crosby, Stephanie Bromley, and Leonard
Saxe
The Content of Our Categories: A Cognitive Bias
Approach to Discrimination and Equal Employment
Opportunity, 135
Linda Hamilton Krieger
The Id, The Ego, and Equal Protection: Reckoning with
Unconscious Racism, 139
Charles R. Lawrence III
Cooperation and Conflict; The Economics of Group Status
Production and Race Discrimination, 143
Richard H. McAdams

Notes and Questions, 148

6 ***The Nature and Extent of Racially Discriminatory Conduct, 152***

Racism du Jour at Shoney's, 153

Steve Watkins

“We’d Love to Hire Them, but . . .”: The Meaning of Race
for Employers, 159

Joleen Kirschenman and Kathryn M. Neckerman

The Urban Institute Audit Studies: Their Methods and
Findings, 167

James J. Hackman and Peter Siegelman

Notes and Questions, 176

7 ***Are Antidiscrimination Laws Efficient? 179***

Is Title VII Efficient? 181

John J. Donohue III

The Efficiency and the Efficacy of Title VII, 190

Richard A. Posner

Further Thoughts on Employment Discrimination
Legislation: A Reply to Judge Posner, 194

John J. Donohue III

Market Affirmative Action, 198

Robert Cooter

Notes and Questions, 205

8 ***Are Antidiscrimination Laws Effective? 213***

Black Economic Progress after Myrdal, 215

James P. Smith and Finis R. Welch

Continuous versus Episodic Change: The Impact of Civil
Rights Policy on the Economic Status of Blacks,
225

John J. Donohue III and James Heckman

Notes and Questions, 242

9 ***The Responses of Litigants and Employers to Antidiscrimination
Law, 248***

- 9.1 *The Growth and Composition of Litigation, 250*
The Changing Nature of Employment Discrimination
Litigation, 250
John J. Donohue III and Peter Siegelman
Victims in the Shadow of the Law: A Critique of the Model
of Legal Protection, 272
Kristin Bumiller
Notes and Questions, 278
- 9.2 *Changing Personnel Practices, 282*
Equal Opportunity Law and the Construction of Internal
Labor Markets, 282
Frank Dobbin, John R. Sutton, John W. Meyer, and
W. Richard Scott
Notes and Questions, 293
- 10 *Using Statistical Evidence to Prove Discrimination, 297*

What Happened in Hazelwood: Statistics, Employment
Discrimination, and the 80% Rule, 298
Paul Meier, Jerome Sacks, and Sandy L. Zabell
Statistical Proof of Discrimination: Beyond “Damned
Lies,” 313
Kingsley R. Browne
Notes and Questions, 317

Sex Discrimination

- 11 *Historical and Psychological Perspectives, 326*

Understanding the Gender Gap: An Economic History of
American Women, 328
Claudia Goldin
Mothering, Male Dominance, and Capitalism, 334
Nancy Chodorow
Notes and Questions, 339
- 12 *Feminist Theory, 344*

Reconstructing Sexual Equality, 346
Christine A. Littleton

Structuralist and Cultural Domination Theories Meet Title
VII: Some Contemporary Influences, 353
Martha Chamallas
Notes and Questions, 365

13 *Sex Segregation, 368*

An Economic Analysis of Sex Discrimination Laws, 369
Richard A. Posner
Prohibiting Sex Discrimination in the Workplace: An
Economic Perspective, 383
John J. Donohue III
Telling Stories About Women and Work: Judicial
Interpretations of Sex Segregation in the Workplace
in Title VII Cases Raising the Lack of Interest
Argument, 397
Vicki Schultz
Notes and Questions, 408

14 *Sexual Harassment, 412*

Sexual Harassment: Its First Decade in Court (1986), 415
Catharine A. Mackinnon
When Is Sex Because of Sex? The Causation Problem in
Sexual Harassment Law, 424
David S. Schwartz
The New Jurisprudence of Sexual Harassment, 434
Kathryn Abrams
Notes and Questions, 441

15 *Alternative Proposals for Creating Sexual Equality in the
Workplace, 450*

The Economics of Comparable Worth: Analytical,
Empirical, and Policy Questions, 451
Mark R. Killingsworth
Women and the Workplace: Accommodating the Demands
of Pregnancy, 459
Samuel Issacharoff and Elyse Rosenblum
Notes and Questions, 467

16 *Age Discrimination, 474*

- Is Age Discrimination Really Age Discrimination? The
ADEA's Unnatural Solution, 477
Samuel Issacharoff and Erica Worth Harris
- Age Discrimination by Employers and the Issue of
Mandatory Retirement, 486
Richard A. Posner
- ADEA and ADA Assessed, 494
Lawrence M. Friedman
- Hands-Tying and the Age Discrimination in Employment
Act, 497
Christine Jolls
- Notes and Questions, 506

17 *Disability Discrimination, 513*

- Discrimination With a Difference: Can Employment
Discrimination Law Accommodate the Americans
With Disabilities Act? 516
Samuel Issacharoff and Justin Nelson
- Subordination, Stigma, and "Disability" 523
Samuel R. Bagenstos
- The Economics of the Americans With Disabilities Act,
Part III: Does the ADA Disable the Disabled? 533
Susan Schwochau and Peter David Blanck
- Labor Markets, Rationality, and Workers with Disabilities,
539
Michael Ashley Stein
- Notes and Questions, 546