

FOUNDATIONS OF TORT LAW

SECOND EDITION



LexisNexis Law School Publishing Advisory Board

William Araiza

Professor of Law

Brooklyn Law School

Lenni B. Benson

Professor of Law & Associate Dean for Professional Development

New York Law School

Raj Bhala

Rice Distinguished Professor

University of Kansas, School of Law

Ruth Colker

Distinguished University Professor & Heck-Faust Memorial Chair in

Constitutional Law

Ohio State University, Moritz College of Law

David Gamage

Assistant Professor of Law

UC Berkeley School of Law

Joan Heminway

College of Law Distinguished Professor of Law

University of Tennessee College of Law

Edward Imwinkelried

Edward L. Barrett, Jr. Professor of Law

UC Davis School of Law

David I. C. Thomson

LP Professor & Director, Lawyering Process Program

University of Denver, Sturm College of Law

Melissa Weresh

Director of Legal Writing and Professor of Law

Drake University Law School

FOUNDATIONS OF TORT LAW

SECOND EDITION

Saul Levmore

*Dean and William B. Graham Professor of Law
University of Chicago Law School*

Catherine M. Sharkey

*Professor of Law
New York University School of Law*



ISBN: 9781422498866

This publication is designed to provide accurate and authoritative information in regard to the subject matter covered. It is sold with the understanding that the publisher is not engaged in rendering legal, accounting, or other professional services. If legal advice or other expert assistance is required, the services of a competent professional should be sought.

LexisNexis, the knowledge burst logo, and Michie are trademarks of Reed Elsevier Properties Inc., used under license. Matthew Bender is a registered trademark of Matthew Bender Properties Inc. Copyright © 2006 Matthew Bender & Company, Inc., one of the LEXIS Publishing companies. All Rights Reserved.

No copyright is claimed in the text of statutes, regulations, and excerpts from court opinions quoted within this work. Permission to copy material exceeding fair use, 17 U.S.C. § 107, may be licensed for a fee of 10¢ per page per copy from the Copyright Clearance Center, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, Mass. 01923, telephone (978) 750-8400.

NOTE TO USERS

To ensure that you are using the latest materials available in this area, please be sure to periodically check the LexisNexis Law School web site for downloadable updates and supplements at www.lexisnexis.com/lawschool.

Editorial Offices
121 Chanlon Rd., New Providence, NJ 07974 (908) 464-6800
201 Mission St., San Francisco, CA 94105-1831 (415) 908-3200
www.lexisnexis.com

(Pub.3337)

PREFACE

This book is a completely revamped, updated version of the original 1993 edition. It is designed to serve as a valuable resource for torts professors teaching at all levels of instruction. It provides an enhanced theoretical and empirical foundation for a diverse selection of fundamental torts topics typically taught at the introductory level, such as the Hand formula, duty to rescue, market-share liability, and vicarious liability, while, at the same time, providing an in-depth exploration of cutting-edge issues suitable for an advanced course or seminar, such as medical malpractice, products liability, federal preemption of state tort law, and punitive damages.

Each chapter includes an introductory overview of a topic in tort law, followed by abridged readings, and then notes and questions, designed to be as provocative as the readings. This edition devotes considerable attention to empirical studies that shed light on various theoretical debates. The aim here is to give the instructor interesting material with which to work, and to equip the student with foundational tools useful for the critical reading of cases and articles.

SL

Chicago, Illinois

CMS

New York, New York

May 2009

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

We are grateful to Jennifer Arlen, Mark Geistfeld, Eric Helland, Michelle Mello, and Ariel Porat for helpful comments and suggestions. NYU law students Julia Hamilton and Maiko Nakarai-Kanivas contributed enormously to the project, from beginning to end. A team of NYU law students further assisted in the editorial process: Matthew Glick, Alison Hashmall, Yuliya Lapitskaya, Jared Make, and Christina Prusak.

FOUNDATIONS OF LAW SERIES

ROBERTA ROMANO, GENERAL EDITOR

Foundations of Administrative Law

Edited by Peter H. Schuck, Yale Law School

Foundations of Contract Law

Edited by Richard Craswell, Stanford Law School and Alan Schwartz, Yale Law School

Foundation of Corporate Law

Edited by Roberta Romano, Yale Law School

Foundations of Criminal Law

Edited by Leo Katz, Michael S. Moore and Stephen J. Morse, all of the University of Pennsylvania Law School

Foundations of The Economic Approach to Law

Edited by Avery Wiener Katz, Columbia Law School

Foundations of Employment Discrimination Law

Edited by John Donohue, III, Stanford Law School

Foundations of Environmental Law and Policy

Edited by Richard L. Revesz, New York University Law School

Foundations of International Income Taxation

Edited by Michael J. Graetz, Yale Law School

Foundations of Labor Law

Edited by Samuel Estreicher, New York University Law School and Stewart J. Schwab, Cornell Law School

Foundations of Tort Law

Edited by Saul Levmore, University of Chicago Law School and Catherine M. Sharkey, New York University School of Law

CONTENTS

1 *Theoretical Foundations of Tort Law, 1*

The Costs of Accidents: A Legal and Economic Analysis, 2
Guido Calabresi

Tort Law and the Demands of Corrective Justice, 12
Jules L. Coleman

The Concept of Corrective Justice in Recent Theories of Tort Law,
28
Richard A. Posner

2 *Negligence and the Hand Formula, 39*

Duty in Tort Law: An Economic Approach, 40
Keith Hylton

Does Risk to Oneself Increase the Care Owed to Others? Law and
Economics in Conflict, 49
Robert Cooter and Ariel Porat

Some Effects of Uncertainty on Compliance with Legal Standards,
56
John E. Calfee and Richard Craswell

Untaken Precautions, 68
Mark F. Grady

The Trouble with Negligence, 73
Kenneth S. Abraham

3 *Duty Versus No Duty, 85*

The Case for a Duty to Rescue, 86
Ernest J. Weinrib

Waiting for Rescue: An Essay on the Evolution and Incentive
Structure of the Law of Affirmative Obligations, 94
Saul Levmore

Rescue Without Law: An Empirical Perspective on the Duty to
Rescue, 111
David A. Hyman

4 *Medical Malpractice, 122*

The Poor State of Health Care Quality in the U.S.: Is Malpractice
Liability Part of the Problem or Part of the Solution? 123
David A. Hyman and Charles Silver

Rethinking Informed Consent, 141

Peter H. Schuck

Of Swords and Shields: The Role of Clinical Practice Guidelines in
Medical Malpractice Litigation, 161

Michelle M. Mello

Deterrence of Medical Errors: Theory and Evidence for
Malpractice Reform, 181

Michelle M. Mello and Troyen A. Brennan

5 *Tort Law Under Uncertainty, 196*

Probabilistic Recoveries, Restitution, and Recurring Wrongs, 197

Saul Levmore

The Doctrinal Unity of Alternative Liability and Market–Share
Liability, 215

Mark A. Geistfeld

The Causal Connection in Mass Exposure Cases: A "Public Law"
Vision of the Tort System, 231

David Rosenberg

6 *Strict and Vicarious Liability, 249*

Toward a Test for Strict Liability in Torts, 250

Guido Calabresi and Jon T. Hirschoff

The Theory of Enterprise Liability and Common Law Strict
Liability, 263

Gregory C. Keating

The Boundaries of Vicarious Liability: An Economic Analysis of
the Scope of Employment Rule and Related Legal
Doctrines, 278

Alan O. Sykes

7 *Product Liability, 291*

Product Liability Entering the Twenty-First Century: The U.S.
Perspective, 292

Michael J. Moore and W. Kip Viscusi

Proposals for Products Liability Reform: A Theoretical Synthesis,
305

Alan Schwartz

Liability for Harm Versus Regulation for Safety, 325

Steven Shavell

Products Liability Preemption: An Institutional Approach, 338
Catherine M. Sharkey

8 ***Damages, 353***

Valuing Life and Limb in Tort: Scheduling "Pain and Suffering",
354

Randall R. Bovbjerg, Frank A. Sloan, and James F. Blumstein

The Architecture of Bias: Deep Structures in Tort Law, 377
Martha Chamallas

Assessing Punitive Damages (with Notes on Cognition and
Valuation in Law), 394

Cass R. Sunstein, Daniel Kahneman, and David Schkade

Damage Caps and Settlement: A Behavioral Approach, 412
Linda Babcock and Greg Pogarsky