

Understanding The First Amendment

CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS UNDERSTANDING SERIES

- Understanding Administrative Law,
Sixth Edition**
William Fox, Jr.
- Understanding Alternative Dispute Resolution**
Kristen Blankley and Maureen A. Weston
- Understanding Animal Law**
Adam Karp
- Understanding Antitrust and Its Economic
Implications, Sixth Edition**
E. Thomas Sullivan and Jeffrey Harrison
- Understanding Bankruptcy, Third Edition**
Jeffrey Ferriell and Edward Janger
- Understanding California Community
Property Law**
Jo Carrillo
- Understanding Capital Punishment Law,
Third Edition**
Linda Carter, Ellen Kreitzberg,
and Scott Howe
- Understanding Civil Procedure, Fifth Edition**
Gene Shreve, Peter Raven-Hansen,
and Charles Geyh
- Understanding Civil Procedure:
The California Edition**
Walter W. Heiser, Gene Shreve, Peter Raven-
Hansen, Glen Earl Weston, and Charles Geyh
- Understanding Civil Rights Litigation**
Howard M. Wasserman
- Understanding Conflict of Laws,
Fourth Edition**
William Richman, William Reynolds,
and Chris Whytock
- Understanding Constitutional Law,
Fourth Edition**
John Attanasio and Joel Goldstein
- Understanding Contracts, Third Edition**
Jeffrey Ferriell
- Understanding Copyright Law, Sixth Edition**
Marshall Leaffer
- Understanding Corporate Law,
Fourth Edition**
Arthur Pinto and Douglas M. Branson
- Understanding Corporate Taxation,
Third Edition**
Leandra Lederman and Michelle Kwon
- Understanding Criminal Law,
Seventh Edition**
Joshua Dressler
- Understanding Criminal Procedure:
Vol. 1: Investigation, Seventh Edition**
Joshua Dressler, Alan C. Michaels,
and Ric Simmons
- Understanding Criminal Procedure:
Vol. 2: Adjudication, Fourth Edition**
Joshua Dressler and Alan C. Michaels
- Understanding Disability Law, Second Edition**
Mark C. Weber
- Understanding Election Law
and Voting Rights**
Michael R. Dimino, Bradley A. Smith,
and Michael E. Solimine
- Understanding Employee Benefits Law**
Kathryn Moore
- Understanding Employment Discrimination
Law, Second Edition**
Thomas Haggard
- Understanding Employment Law,
Second Edition**
Jeffrey M. Hirsch, Paul M. Secunda,
and Richard Bales
- Understanding Environmental Law,
Third Edition**
Philip Weinberg and Kevin Reilly
- Understanding Estate and Gift Taxation**
Brant Hellwig and Robert T. Danforth
- Understanding Evidence, Fourth Edition**
Paul Giannelli
- Understanding Family Law, Fourth Edition**
John Gregory, Peter N. Swisher,
and Robin Wilson
- Understanding Federal and
California Evidence**
Paul Giannelli
- Understanding Federal Courts and
Jurisdiction, Second Edition**
Linda Mullenix, Martin H. Redish,
and Georgene Vairo
- Understanding Federal Income Taxation,
Fifth Edition**
J. Martin Burke and Michael Friel

- Understanding The First Amendment, Sixth Edition**
Russell L. Weaver
- Understanding Immigration Law, Second Edition**
Kevin R. Johnson, Raquel Aldana, Ong Hing, Leticia Saucedo, and Enid Trucios-Haynes
- Understanding Insurance Law, Fifth Edition**
Robert H. Jerry, II and Douglas Richmond
- Understanding Intellectual Property Law, Third Edition**
Donald Chisum, Tyler T. Ochoa, Shubha Ghosh, and Mary LaFrance
- Understanding International Business and Financial Transactions, Fourth Edition**
Jerold Friedland
- Understanding International Criminal Law, Third Edition**
Ellen S. Podgor and Roger S. Clark
- Understanding International Law, Second Edition**
Stephen McCaffrey
- Understanding Jewish Law**
Steven Resnicoff
- Understanding Juvenile Law, Fourth Edition**
Martin Gardner
- Understanding Labor Law, Fourth Edition**
Douglas E. Ray, Calvin William Sharpe, and Robert N. Strassfeld
- Understanding Local Government, Second Edition**
Sandra Stevenson
- Understanding the Law of Terrorism, Second Edition**
Erik Luna and Wayne McCormack
- Understanding the Law of Zoning and Land Use Controls, Third Edition**
Barlow Burke
- Understanding Lawyers' Ethics, Fifth Edition**
Monroe H. Freedman and Abbe Smith
- Understanding Modern Real Estate Transactions, Third Edition**
Alex M. Johnson, Jr.
- Understanding Negotiable Instruments and Payment Systems**
William H. Lawrence
- Understanding Nonprofit and Tax Exempt Organizations, Second Edition**
Nicholas Cafardi and Jaclyn Cherry
- Understanding Partnership and LLC Taxation, Fourth Edition**
Jerold Friedland
- Understanding Patent Law, Second Edition**
Amy Landers
- Understanding Products Liability Law, Second Edition**
Bruce L. Ottley, Rogelio Lasso, and Terrence F. Kiely
- Understanding Property Law, Fourth Edition**
John Sprankling
- Understanding Remedies, Third Edition**
James Fischer
- Understanding Sales and Leases of Goods, Third Edition**
William H. Henning, William H. Lawrence, and Henry Deeb Gabriel
- Understanding Secured Transactions, Fifth Edition**
William H. Lawrence, William H. Henning, and R. Wilson Freyeremuth
- Understanding Securities Law, Sixth Edition**
Marc I. Steinberg
- Understanding Taxation of Business Entities**
Walter Schwidetzky and Fred B. Brown
- Understanding Torts, Fifth Edition**
John Diamond, Lawrence C. Levine, and Anita Bernstein
- Understanding Trademark Law, Third Edition**
Mary LaFrance
- Understanding Trusts and Estates, Fifth Edition**
Roger W. Andersen
- Understanding White Collar Crime, Fourth Edition**
J. Kelly Strader

Understanding The First Amendment

SIXTH EDITION

Russell L. Weaver

PROFESSOR OF LAW AND DISTINGUISHED UNIVERSITY SCHOLAR
UNIVERSITY OF LOUISVILLE
LOUIS D. BRANDEIS SCHOOL OF LAW



CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS
Durham, North Carolina

Copyright © 2017
Russell L. Weaver
All Rights Reserved

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Weaver, Russell L., 1952- author.

Title: Understanding the first amendment / Russell L. Weaver.

Description: Sixth edition. | Durham, North Carolina : Carolina Academic Press, LLC, [2017] | Series: The understanding series | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2017012427 | ISBN 9781531001247 (alk. paper)

Subjects: LCSH: United States. Constitution. 1st Amendment. | Freedom of expression--United States.

Classification: LCC KF4770 .W43 2017 | DDC 342.7308/5--dc23

LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2017012427>

eISBN 978-1-53100-125-4

Carolina Academic Press, LLC
700 Kent Street
Durham, North Carolina 27701
Telephone (919) 489-7486
Fax (919) 493-5668
www.cap-press.com

Printed in the United States of America

*To Ben, Kate, and Laurence,
as well as to my late mother, Grace L. Deets,
with love, RLW*

Contents

Chapter 1 · The Origins and Nature of the First Amendment	3
§ 1.01 Backdrop to the First Amendment	4
[A] Pre-Colonial Developments	4
[B] Colonial Developments	6
§ 1.02 Adoption of the First Amendment	7
§ 1.03 Development of the First Amendment	8
[A] An Early Tradition of Suppression	9
[B] Judicial Review and the First Amendment	10
§ 1.04 First Amendment Values	11
§ 1.05 Understanding and Applying First Amendment Standards of Review	13
[A] Speech	14
[B] Press	15
[C] Religion	16
[1] Establishment	16
[2] Free Exercise	16
§ 1.06 A Sample Analysis	16
[A] The Problem	17
[B] An Analytical Roadmap	17
§ 1.07 The First Amendment in Summary	17
Chapter 2 · Speech Advocating Violent or Illegal Action	21
§ 2.01 Formative Case Law	21
§ 2.02 Toward a More Speech Protective Standard	24
§ 2.03 Doctrinal Uncertainty	26
§ 2.04 The Modern Standard of Review	27
Chapter 3 · Content Regulation	33
§ 3.01 Basic Concepts and Applications	34
§ 3.02 Fighting Words	34
§ 3.03 Defamation	37
[A] Traditional Doctrine and Seeds of Change	37
[B] Defamation as Protected Expression: The Actual Malice Requirement	38
[1] Public Officials	38
[2] Public Figures	41
[a] The Outer Limits of the Actual Malice Standard	41
[b] The Public Figure Concept Refined	43
[3] The Not Entirely Irrelevant Public Concern Factor	44
[4] Second Thoughts on the Actual Malice Standard	44
[C] Fact and Opinion	45
[D] False Speech	46

§ 3.04	Intentional Infliction of Emotional Distress	47
§ 3.05	Privacy	53
	[A] Publication of Personal Information	54
	[B] False Light Privacy	55
	[C] Right of Publicity	56
	[D] Intrusion on Seclusion	56
§ 3.06	Obscenity	57
	[A] The Definitional Challenge	57
	[B] Doctrinal Chaos	59
	[C] <i>Miller</i> Amplifications and Applications	60
	[1] Prurient Interest and Community Standards	61
	[2] Patent Offensiveness Specified	61
	[3] Speech Value	62
	[D] Obscenity's Safe Harbor	62
Chapter 4	· Content Regulation: Other Candidates for Categorical Exclusion or Limited Protection	65
§ 4.01	“Offensive” Speech	65
§ 4.02	Child Pornography	70
§ 4.03	Pornography as Discrimination against Women	76
§ 4.04	Crush Videos	80
§ 4.05	Violent Videos	81
§ 4.06	Support for Terrorist Organizations	83
§ 4.07	Lies Regarding the Congressional Medal of Honor	84
§ 4.08	Reparative Therapy	87
§ 4.09	Commercial Speech	87
	[A] The Backdrop to Modern Commercial Speech Doctrine	88
	[B] Commercial Speech as Protected Expression	89
	[C] The Standard of Review	89
	[D] Special Circumstances: Lawyer Advertising	94
Chapter 5	· Overbreadth, Vagueness, and Prior Restraints	97
§ 5.01	Overbreadth and Vagueness	98
	[A] Overbreadth	98
	[B] Vagueness	101
§ 5.02	Prior Restraints	102
	[A] Licensing	102
	[1] Overview	102
	[2] Motion Picture Licensing	103
	[3] Non-Licensing Notifications	105
	[4] Parade Permits	105
	[5] Licensing Fundraisers	106
	[6] Newsrack Licensing	106
	[B] Injunctions	107
	[1] Overview	107
	[2] Prior Restraints and National Security	109
	[3] Injunctions Against Trademark Infringement	111
	[4] Injunctions Against Abortion Protests	111
	[5] Prior Restraints on Commercial Speech	114

Chapter 6 · Content Neutrality	117
§ 6.01 Speech Intertwined with Conduct	118
§ 6.02 Secondary Effects	120
§ 6.03 Public Fora	123
[A] Traditional Public Forum	125
[B] Designated Public Forums	129
[C] Reserved Forums	131
§ 6.04 Private Property	134
Chapter 7 · Testing the Boundaries of Doctrine	137
§ 7.01 Religious Speech	138
§ 7.02 “Hate” Speech	141
[A] Early Precedent	141
[B] <i>R.A.V.</i>	142
[C] Sentence Enhancement	144
[D] Prohibiting Cross Burning	146
[E] Campus Speech Codes	147
§ 7.03 Campaign Finance Laws	148
[A] General Theory	149
[B] Expenditure Limitations	150
[C] Contribution Limitations	152
[D] Reporting and Disclosure Requirements	157
[E] Public Financing of Campaigns	160
[F] Government’s Authority to Equalize Resources Between Candidates	163
[G] Limitations on Expenditures from Personal or Family Resources	164
[H] Independent Expenditures	164
[I] Corporate Contributions and Expenditures	167
[J] Regulation of Judicial Elections	175
Chapter 8 · Freedom of Association and Compelled Expression	179
§ 8.01 The Right to Associate	179
[A] Early Precedent	180
[B] The House Un-American Activities Committee	181
[C] <i>Claiborne Hardware</i>	182
[D] Compelled Admission to Membership	182
[E] “Fusion” Political Candidates	189
[F] Political Primaries	190
§ 8.02 The Right “Not to Speak”	191
[A] Overview	191
[B] The Solomon Amendment and Law School Placement Offices	193
[C] Parade Inclusion — Exclusion	194
[D] Compelled Financial Support for Expression	195
§ 8.03 Unconstitutional Conditions	199
§ 8.04 The Other Side of the Right to Be Let Alone	202
Chapter 9 · The Government as Employer, Educator, and Source of Funds	205
§ 9.01 First Amendment Rights of Public Employees	206
[A] Prohibiting Electioneering	206
[B] Other Employee Speech	209

	[C] Other Governmental Employee Associational Rights	219
§ 9.02	The First Amendment in the Public Schools	224
§ 9.03	Government Financed Speech	231
	[A] Overview	231
	[B] The National Endowment for the Arts	236
	[C] Legal Services Corporation Funding	237
	[D] Monuments on Government Property	239
	[E] State-Issued Specialty License Plates	239
Chapter 10	· Media and the First Amendment	245
§ 10.01	The Significance of the Press Clause	246
§ 10.02	The Newsgathering Function	247
	[A] Reporter's Privilege	247
	[B] Newsroom Searches	249
	[C] Access to Prisons	250
	[D] Access to Judicial Proceedings	251
	[E] The Problem of Prejudicial Publicity	253
	[F] Electronic Media in the Courtroom	255
§ 10.03	Media Technology and First Amendment Standards	256
	[A] Print	257
	[B] Broadcasting	258
	[1] Fairness Regulation	258
	[2] Regulation of Indecent Programming	261
	[C] Cable	263
	[1] Must Carriage	264
	[2] Regulation of Indecent Programming	265
	[D] Telephony	266
	[1] Common Carrier Status	266
	[2] Indecency Regulation	266
	[E] Internet	267
	[1] Blogs, Email, and Social Media	267
	[2] Regulation of Indecency	268
	[F] Video Games	270
	[G] Social Media	270
Chapter 11	· The Establishment Clause	273
§ 11.01	Financial Aid to Religion	274
	[A] Early Cases	274
	[B] The <i>Lemon</i> Test and Doctrinal Turmoil	277
	[C] Other Applications of the <i>Lemon</i> Test	279
	[D] Criticism of <i>Lemon's</i> Three-Part Test	281
	[E] <i>Agostini</i> , <i>Mitchell</i> , and Continued Doctrinal Turmoil	282
	[1] <i>Agostini's</i> Modification of <i>Lemon</i>	283
	[2] <i>Mitchell</i> and Neutrality	286
	[3] <i>Agostini</i> and <i>Mitchell's</i> Impact	288
§ 11.02	School Vouchers	290
§ 11.03	State Sponsored Prayer	297
	[A] In Public Schools	297
	[B] Moment of Silence Laws	299
	[C] Legislative Prayer	300

[D] Graduation Prayer	301
[E] Prayer at Athletic Events	304
§ 11.04 Curricular Issues	304
[A] Bible Readings	304
[B] Evolution	306
[C] Balanced Treatment of Creation Science	307
[D] Intelligent Design	309
§ 11.05 Official Acknowledgment	309
[A] The Ten Commandments	310
[B] Church Vetoes	316
[C] Holiday Displays	317
[D] Swearing Belief in God	321
[E] Day of Rest	321
§ 11.06 Establishment-Free Exercise and Free Speech Tension	322
[A] <i>Kiryas Joel</i> and Special School Districts	322
[B] Prohibitions Against Discrimination	325
[C] Armed Forces Chaplains	325
[D] Speech and Religion	326
[E] Religious Instruction in Public Schools	327
[F] Use of Public School Facilities	327
[G] Vocational Assistance to the Handicapped	328
[H] Funding of Non-Profit Private Organizations	328
[I] College Scholarships	329
Chapter 12 · The Free Exercise Clause	333
§ 12.01 Burdens on Religion	333
[A] Early Cases	334
[B] From <i>Sherbert</i> to <i>Smith</i>	335
[C] Modern Cases	339
§ 12.02 Discrimination against Religion	349
Table of Cases	355
Index	365

