

Sale, Lease, and Advanced Obligations

Sale, Lease, and Advanced Obligations

Cases and Readings

Melissa T. Lonegrass

HARRIET S. DAGGETT-FRANCES LEGGIO LANDRY PROFESSOR OF LAW,
BERNARD KEITH VETTER PROFESSOR IN LOUISIANA CIVIL LAW STUDIES,
AND WEDON T. SMITH PROFESSOR IN CIVIL LAW
LOUISIANA STATE UNIVERSITY PAUL M. HEBERT LAW CENTER

Sandi Varnado

ASSOCIATE PROFESSOR OF LAW
LOYOLA UNIVERSITY NEW ORLEANS COLLEGE OF LAW

Christopher K. Odinet

ASSOCIATE PROFESSOR OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF OKLAHOMA COLLEGE OF LAW,
AFFILIATE ASSOCIATE PROFESSOR IN ENTREPRENEURSHIP
UNIVERSITY OF OKLAHOMA PRICE COLLEGE OF BUSINESS,
AND AFFILIATE FACULTY MEMBER
SOUTHERN UNIVERSITY LAW CENTER



CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS
Durham, North Carolina

Copyright © 2019
Carolina Academic Press, LLC
All Rights Reserved

ISBN 978-1-5310-0249-7
eISBN 978-1-5310-0250-3
LCCN 2018962057

Carolina Academic Press, LLC
700 Kent Street
Durham, North Carolina 27701
Telephone (919) 489-7486
Fax (919) 493-5668
www.cap-press.com
Printed in the United States of America

Contents

Acknowledgements	xv
------------------	----

PART I · SALE

Chapter 1 · The Nature of the Contract of Sale	3
A. Introduction	3
B. Contrast with Other Contracts	3
1. Sale Distinguished from Contract to Build	4
<i>Duhon v. Three Friends Homebuilders Corp.</i>	5
2. Sale Distinguished from Lease	8
3. Sale Distinguished from Security	9
Chapter 2 · Capacity and Authority	11
A. Capacity	11
1. Capacity of Exercise	11
2. Capacity of Enjoyment; Sale of Litigious Rights	12
<i>Succession of Noah Cloud</i>	14
B. Authority	21
1. Mandate	21
<i>Tedesco v. Gentry Development, Inc.</i>	22
2. Management of Community Property	29
Chapter 3 · Consent	31
A. Consent to Essential Elements: Thing and Price	31
<i>Marcantel v. Jefferson Door Co.</i>	31
<i>DB Orban Co. v. Lakco Pipe & Supply, Inc.</i>	35
Ronald J. Scalise Jr., <i>Rethinking the Doctrine of Nullity</i>	37
B. Consent to Auxiliary Terms	38
1. Sales of Immovables	39
<i>Lasalle v. Cannata Corp.</i>	39
2. Sales of Movables	41
a. Introduction	41
b. Comparison to the Common Law	45
N. Stephan Kinsella, <i>Smashing the Broken Mirror</i>	46
<i>Gardner Zemke Co. v. Dunham Bush, Inc.</i>	56
Chapter 4 · Things Which May Be Sold	63
A. In General	63
11 Beudant, <i>Cours de Droit Civil Français</i> §§ 5, 9 (2d ed. 1938)	63

B. Sales of Future Things and Sales of Hopes	65
1. Sale of a Future Thing	65
Louisiana State Law Institute, <i>Proposed Louisiana Civil Code</i>	
<i>Revision of Sales 4 (1992) (Exposé des Motifs)</i>	65
<i>Plaquemines Equip. & Machine Co. v. Ford Motor Co.</i>	66
2. Sale of a Hope	69
Louisiana State Law Institute, <i>Proposed Louisiana Civil Code</i>	
<i>Revision of Sales 5 (1992) (Exposé des Motifs)</i>	69
<i>Losecco v. Gregory</i>	70
C. Assignment of Rights	78
1. Assignment of Rights in General	78
2. Sale of Litigious Rights	80
<i>Clement v. Sneed Bros.</i>	81
D. Sale of a Thing Already Owned	86
E. Sale of a Thing of Another	87
1. In General	87
Louisiana State Law Institute, <i>Proposed Louisiana Civil Code</i>	
<i>Revision of Sales 7 (1992) (Exposé des Motifs)</i>	87
2. Movable — Bona Fide Purchaser Doctrine	88
a. The Double-Dealing Seller	89
<i>Cameron Equipment Co. v. Stewart and Stevenson Servs., Inc.</i>	89
b. Lost or Stolen Things	93
<i>Brown & Root, Inc. v. Southeast Equip. Co.</i>	93
c. Things Obtained Through Vice of Consent	95
<i>Jeffrey Motor Co. v. Higgins</i>	96
<i>Flatte v. Nichols</i>	98
d. Sales of Things by Precarious Possessors	103
Tanya Ann Ibieta, <i>Comment, The Transfer of Ownership</i>	
<i>of Movable</i>	103
<i>Livestock Producers, Inc. v. Littleton</i>	105
<i>Louisiana Lift & Equip., Inc. v. Eizel</i>	109
e. Registered Movable	116
f. Sale of a Movable Pending Litigation	117
3. Immovable — The Public Records Doctrine	117
a. Introduction and General Provisions of the Law of Registry	117
<i>McDuffie v. Walker</i>	119
Michael Palestina, <i>Of Registry: Louisiana's Revised</i>	
<i>Public Records Doctrine</i>	126
b. Third Person Defined	131
<i>Bradley v. Sharp</i>	133
c. The Place and Manner of Recordation	138
<i>Wede v. Niche Marketing USA, LLC</i>	139
d. Exceptions to the Law of Registry	149
i. Inheritance Rights	149

<i>Knigheten v. Ruffin</i>	150
ii. Community Property Rights	155
e. Special Problems in the Law of Registry	159
i. Secret Claims and Equities of the Parties	160
(a) Nullity	160
(b) Simulations	161
<i>Owen v. Owen</i>	163
(c) Dissolution	171
ii. Pending Litigation Affecting Immovables	171
<i>Cannata v. Bonner</i>	172
Chapter 5 • Price	179
A. In General	179
1. Price in Money	179
Louisiana State Law Institute, <i>Proposed Louisiana Civil Code</i> <i>Revision of Sales 3 (1992) (Exposé des motifs)</i>	179
2. Price Certain or Determinable	180
<i>Princeville Canning Co. v. Hamilton</i>	180
<i>Benglis Sash & Door Co. v. Leonards</i>	186
B. Price Out of Proportion with the Value of the Thing Sold	190
<i>Moore v. Wilson</i>	190
C. Rescission for Lesion Beyond Moiety	195
1. In General	195
a. The Purpose and Mechanics of Lesion	195
b. Problems of Valuation	198
<i>Cook v. Mixon</i>	198
2. Variations on Lesion	209
a. Exchange	209
b. Partition	210
3. Exceptions—Transactions to Which Lesion Does Not Apply	211
a. Sales of Mineral Rights	211
<i>Hornsby v. Slade</i>	213
b. Compromise	219
4. Comparative Analysis	220
Christopher K. Odinet, <i>Commerce, Commonality, and Contract Law</i>	221
Chapter 6 • Form	225
A. Movables	225
<i>Peter Vicari General Contractor, Inc. v. St. Pierre</i>	225
B. Immovables	229
1. The Writing Requirement	229
a. In General	229
<i>Milliman v. Peterman</i>	229
b. Exception: Delivery Plus Admission	237
<i>Martin v. Brister</i>	237

2. The Content of the Parties' Agreement	240
a. The Consent of the Parties	241
<i>Chauvin v. Bohn</i>	241
b. The Property Description	247
i. Sufficiency of Descriptions	247
1 Peter S. Title, <i>Louisiana Practice Series, Louisiana Real Estate Transactions</i> §§ 2:1–2:22 (2017–18 ed.)	248
<i>Lemoine v. Lacour</i>	252
<i>City Bank and Trust of Shreveport v. Scott</i>	254
<i>Williams v. Bowie Lumber Co.</i>	258
<i>Nitro Energy, L.L.C. v. Nelson Energy, Inc.</i>	261
ii. Reformation of Erroneous Property Descriptions	265
<i>Mathews v. Emerson</i>	266
c. Recitation of Price	271
Chapter 7 • Effects of the Contract of Sale	273
A. General Principles	273
Louisiana State Law Institute, <i>Proposed Louisiana Civil Code Revision of Sales 7–8 (1992) (Exposé des Motifs)</i>	273
B. Exceptions to the General Rules	275
1. Things Not Individualized	275
a. The Problem of Individualization	276
b. Appropriation	276
c. Sales by Weight, Tale, or Measure or by Lump	277
<i>Gulf Rice Milling, Inc. v. Sonnier</i>	278
2. Things in Transit	284
a. Transfer of Ownership	284
Uniform Straight Bill of Landing	286
b. Transfer of Risk of Loss	289
3. Sales Subject to Conditions	291
a. In General	291
<i>Canal Motors, Inc. v. Campbell</i>	291
b. Sales Subject to Suspensive Conditions	294
i. Sale on View or Trial	294
7 Saúl Litvinoff, <i>Louisiana Civil Law Treatise, Obligations</i> § 56, at 76-78 (1975)	295
<i>American Creosote Works v. Boland Machine & Mfg. Co.</i>	296
ii. Buyer's Right of Inspection	299
<i>Tunica Biloxi Tribe of Indians v. Bridges</i>	300
c. Sales Subject to Resolutive Conditions	304
i. Sale or Return	304
7 Saúl Litvinoff, <i>Louisiana Civil Law Treatise, Obligations</i> § 58, at 80–82 (1975)	304
<i>Manuel v. Shaheen</i>	305

ii. Right of Redemption	309
<i>Steib v. Joseph Rathborne Land Co.</i>	310
<i>Tyler v. Rapid Cash, LLC</i>	317
4. Sales Conditioned on Payment of Price (a/k/a “Common Law” Conditional Sales)	320
a. Conditional Sales of Movables	320
i. The Historical Approach	321
<i>Ventre v. Pacific Indem. Co.</i>	321
ii. The Modern Approach	324
(a) Article 9 of the Uniform Commercial Code	324
(b) Louisiana Lease of Movables Act	325
iii. Comparative Law	330
b. Conditional Sales of Immovables (a.k.a. “Bond for Deed”)	330
<i>Trichel v. Homes Ins. Co.</i>	331
<i>McCoy v. Robbins</i>	338
<i>Bergeron v. Parker</i>	340
Chapter 8 • Delivery	347
A. Necessity of Delivery	347
B. Time, Place, and Manner of Delivery	348
<i>Matthews v. Gaubler</i>	349
C. Conformity	354
1. Movables	354
Louisiana State Law Institute, <i>Proposed Louisiana Civil Code</i> <i>Revision of Sales 11–17 (1992) (Exposé des Motifs)</i>	354
<i>Mabry v. Midland Valley Lumber Co.</i>	358
2. Immovables	362
<i>Lasiter v. Gaharan</i>	364
<i>Long-Fork, L.C.C. v. Petite Riviere, L.L.C.</i>	368
<i>Fitzgerald v. Hyland</i>	374
Chapter 9 • The Warranty Against Eviction	383
A. Introduction and Scope of the Warranty Against Eviction	383
1. The Buyer’s Loss or Danger of Losing the Whole or a Part of the Thing	383
<i>Bologna Bros. v. Stephens</i>	384
2. Encumbrances and Other Charges on the Thing Sold	387
<i>Richmond v. Zapata Development Corp.</i>	389
3. Time at Which Third Person’s Right Exists	395
2 Marcel Planiol & George Ripert, <i>Traite Elementaire de Droit</i> <i>Civil No. 1492 (11th ed. 1939)</i>	395
<i>Clark v. O’Neal</i>	396
B. Rights of the Buyer	398
1. In General	398
2. Partial Eviction	400
<i>Taylor v. Fuselier</i>	401

<i>Guthrie v. Rudy Brown Builders, Inc.</i>	406
C. Modification of the Warranty Against Eviction	413
1. Categories of Sale	413
a. Warranty Sale	413
b. Non-warranty Sale	414
c. Sale at Buyer's Peril and Risk	414
d. Limited Warranty Sales	414
2. Knowledge of the Danger of Eviction	415
3. Seller's Liability for His or Her Own Acts	416
D. The Buyer's Right of Subrogation	417
<i>Hoggatt v. Halcomb</i>	417
E. Quitclaim Deeds	422
<i>Simmesport State Bank v. Roy</i>	422
F. Doctrine of After-Acquired Title	426
<i>St. Landry Oil & Gas Co. v. Neal</i>	426
Chapter 10 • The Warranty Against Redhibitory Defects	431
A. In General	431
<i>Dage v. Obed</i>	432
<i>Royal v. Cook</i>	438
<i>Rey v. Cuccia</i>	443
B. Seller's Good or Bad Faith	451
1. Determining the Good or Bad Faith of the Seller	451
<i>Bearly v. Brunswick Mercury Marine Div.</i>	452
2. Significance of Good or Bad Faith of the Seller	457
a. Buyer's Remedies	457
b. Seller's Right to Notice and Opportunity to Repair	457
<i>David v. Thibodeaux</i>	458
c. Applicable Prescriptive Period	463
C. Obligations of the Buyer	464
D. Waiver of Warranty Against Redhibitory Defects	465
<i>Shelton v. Standard/700 Associates</i>	465
E. The Buyer's Right to Subrogation	471
1. In General	471
<i>Media Production Consultants, Inc. v. Mercedes-Benz</i> <i>of North America, Inc.</i>	472
2. The Nature of the Sellers' Liability: Solidary or Not?	479
<i>Aucoin v. Southern Quality Homes, LLC</i>	481
F. Distinction from Breach of Contract	493
1. Warranty of Fitness	493
<i>Cunard Line Ltd. v. Datrix, Inc.</i>	494
<i>Downs v. Hammett Properties, Inc.</i>	499
2. Difference in Kind or Quality	503

<i>PPG Industries, Inc. v. Industrial Laminates Corp.</i>	503
G. Other Remedies	508
1. Louisiana Products Liability Act	509
<i>De Atley v. Victoria's Secret Catalogue, LLC</i>	509
2. Lemon Law	512
3. New Home Warranty Act	513
<i>Stutts v. Melton</i>	514
Chapter 11 • Obligations of the Buyer	523
A. The Buyer's Two Obligations	523
B. The Seller's Remedies for the Buyer's Failure to Perform	523
1. Specific Performance and the Vendor's Privilege	523
2. Dissolution	524
3. Damages	527
<i>Friedman Iron & Supply Co. v. J.B. Beaird Co.</i>	527
<i>Elazab v. Bryant</i>	530
4. Other Remedies	534
<i>Leon Godchaux Clothing Co. v. De Buys</i>	535
Chapter 12 • Contracts Preparatory to Sale	541
A. Option To Buy or Sell	541
Louisiana State Law Institute, <i>Proposed Louisiana Civil Code</i>	
<i>Revision of Sales 64–67 (1992) (Exposé des Motifs)</i>	542
<i>Federal Work Ready, Inc. v. Wright</i>	544
<i>Delcambre v. Dubois</i>	547
B. Contract to Sell	555
Louisiana State Law Institute, <i>Proposed Louisiana Civil Code</i>	
<i>Revision of Sales 67–69 (1992) (Exposé des Motifs)</i>	556
1 Peter S. Title, <i>Louisiana Practice Series, Louisiana Real Estate</i>	
<i>Transactions</i> §§ 9:47–9:59 (2017–18 ed.)	558
<i>Payne v. Hurwitz</i>	564
C. Right of First Refusal	572
Louisiana State Law Institute, <i>Proposed Louisiana Civil Code</i>	
<i>Revision of Sales 69–70 (1992) (Exposé des Motifs)</i>	573
<i>Robichaux v. Boutte</i>	574
D. Effects of Contracts Preparatory to the Sale	583
1. Time Limitations	583
<i>Becker and Associates, Inc. v. Lou-Ark Equipment Rentals Co.</i>	584
<i>Youngblood v. Rosedale Dev. Co.</i>	588
2. Effects as to Third Persons	591
3. Indivisibility of the Right	592
E. Duty to Deliver Merchantable Title	592
<i>Young v. Stevens</i>	593

PART II • LEASE

Chapter 13 • The Nature and Essential Elements of the Contract of Lease	601
A. Introduction	601
B. Essential Elements of the Contract of Lease	602
1. Consent to Lease	602
<i>Faroldi v. Nungesser</i>	602
2. The Thing	605
3. The Rent	606
4. The Term	606
a. Conventional vs. Legal Terms	606
b. Fixed vs. Indeterminate Terms	607
5. Form	608
C. Effects Against Third Persons	608
1. Immovables	609
<i>Motwani v. Fun Centers, Inc.</i>	610
2. Movable	613
D. Transfer of Interest by Lessor or Lessee	613
1. By Lessor	614
a. Transfer of the Interest in the Leased Thing	614
b. Transfer of Interest in the Lease	614
2. By Lessee	616
<i>Illinois Central Gulf Railroad Co. v. International Harvester Co.</i>	617
Chapter 14 • Obligations of the Lessor and the Lessee	627
A. Introduction	627
B. The Lessor's Obligations	628
1. To Deliver	628
<i>Hinds v. Poo-Yies Inc.</i>	628
2. To Maintain and Warrant Against Vices and Defects	632
a. Lessor's Responsibility for Repairs	632
<i>Davilla v. Jones</i>	633
b. Lessor's Warranty Against Vices and Defects	638
<i>Reed v. Classified Parking System</i>	639
c. Lessor's Delictual Liability for Vices and Defects	647
Melissa T. Lonegrass, <i>The Anomalous Interaction Between Code</i>	
<i>and Statute: Lessor's Warranty and Statutory Waiver</i>	647
<i>Tassin v. Slidell Mini-Storage, Inc.</i>	650
<i>Stuckey v. Riverstone Residential SC, LP</i>	654
Melissa T. Lonegrass, <i>The Anomalous Interaction Between Code</i>	
<i>and Statute: Lessor's Warranty and Statutory Waiver</i>	661
3. Lessor's Warranty of Peaceful Possession	663
<i>Union Bank v. Cottonport Ins. Exchange</i>	664

<i>Potter v. First Federal Savings & Loan Ass'n of Scotlandville</i>	667
C. The Lessee's Obligations	674
1. To Pay Rent	675
2. To Use the Thing as a Prudent Administrator and in Accordance with the Lease	675
<i>New Orleans & C.R. Co. v. Darms</i>	675
3. Return of the Thing in the Same Condition	678
D. Attachments, Additions & Improvements	679
E. Security Devices	679
1. Lessor's Privilege	679
2. Security Deposit	680
Chapter 15 • Termination and Dissolution of the Lease	683
A. The Arrival of the Term	683
1. Indeterminate Term Leases	683
<i>Herring v. Breedlove</i>	684
2. Fixed Term Leases	686
a. General Rule	686
b. Exceptions	687
i. Reconduction	687
ii. Extension/Renewal	689
<i>Le Blanc v. Barielle</i>	690
<i>Huval v. 4S Const. & Maintenance, Inc.</i>	694
iii. Amendment	699
<i>Waller Oil Co. v. Brown</i>	700
iv. Termination at Will	707
B. Expropriation, Loss, and Destruction	708
<i>Bossier Center, Inc. v. Palais Royal, Inc.</i>	709
C. Termination of Lease Granted by Usufructuary	714
D. Death of Lessor or Lessee	715
E. Dissolution for Party's Failure to Perform	715
1. The Right to Dissolution	715
<i>Edwards v. Standard Oil Co. of Louisiana</i>	717
<i>Purnell v. Dugue</i>	720
2. Specific Performance and Related Remedies	725
a. Specific Performance	725
b. Accelerated Rental	726
c. Reletting the Premises	728
<i>Sunbelt Security Services, Inc. v. Delahoussaye</i>	728
<i>Dixie Services, LLC v. R&B Falcon Drilling USA, Inc.</i>	737
Index	743

Acknowledgements

This textbook is a project many years in the making. It has been deeply influenced by our students, by our own teachers, and by our many friends and colleagues with whom we have shared materials and ideas for this course over the years. We would like to acknowledge the editorial advice, encouragement, and inspiration of those without whom this textbook would not have been possible, including Dian Tooley-Knoblett, John A. Lovett, David W. Gruning, Ronald J. Scalise Jr., J. Randall Trahan, Alain Levassuer, Patrick S. Ottinger, Wendell Holmes, L. David Cromwell, Peter S. Title, Shael Herman, Nikolaos A. Davrados, and, without question, Saúl Litvinoff, the chief architect of Louisiana’s modern law of sales, and Symeon Symeonides, the principal draftsman of the revised law of lease. We are also indebted to our excellent research assistants: Malerie Bulot (LSU, Class of 2018), Endya Hash (LSU, Class of 2018), Jourdan Curet (LSU, Class of 2019), and M.J. Hernandez (LSU, Class of 2019).

MELISSA T. LONEGRASS,
Louisiana State University Law Center

SANDI S. VARNADO,
Loyola University New Orleans College of Law

CHRISTOPHER K. ODINET,
University of Oklahoma College of Law / Southern University Law Center

