Sale, Lease, and Advanced Obligations
Sale, Lease, and Advanced Obligations

Cases and Readings

Melissa T. Lonegrass
Harriet S. Daggett-Frances Leggio Landry Professor of Law,
Bernard Keith Vetter Professor in Louisiana Civil Law Studies,
and Wedon T. Smith Professor in Civil Law
Louisiana State University Paul M. Hebert Law Center

Sandi Varnado
Associate Professor of Law
Loyola University New Orleans College of Law

Christopher K. Odinet
Associate Professor of Law
University of Oklahoma College of Law,
Affiliate Associate Professor in Entrepreneurship
University of Oklahoma Price College of Business,
and Affiliate Faculty Member
Southern University Law Center

Carolina Academic Press
Durham, North Carolina
## Contents

Acknowledgements                                                                                   xv

**Part I · Sale**

**Chapter 1 · The Nature of the Contract of Sale**
- A. Introduction                                      3
- B. Contrast with Other Contracts
  - 1. Sale Distinguished from Contract to Build        4
      *Duhon v. Three Friends Homebuilders Corp.*        5
  - 2. Sale Distinguished from Lease                     8
  - 3. Sale Distinguished from Security                  9

**Chapter 2 · Capacity and Authority**
- A. Capacity                                          11
  - 1. Capacity of Exercise                              11
  - 2. Capacity of Enjoyment; Sale of Litigious Rights   12
      *Succession of Noah Cloud*                          14
- B. Authority                                          21
  - 1. Mandate                                            21
      *Tedesco v. Gentry Development, Inc.*               22
  - 2. Management of Community Property                  29

**Chapter 3 · Consent**
- A. Consent to Essential Elements: Thing and Price    31
      *Marcantel v. Jefferson Door Co.*                    31
      *DB Orban Co. v. Lakco Pipe & Supply, Inc.*          35
      *Ronald J. Scalise Jr., Rethinking the Doctrine of Nullity*  37
- B. Consent to Auxiliary Terms                        38
  - 1. Sales of Immovables                               39
      *Lasalle v. Cannata Corp.*                          39
  - 2. Sales of Movables                                 41
      a. Introduction                                      41
      b. Comparison to the Common Law                     45
      *N. Stephan Kinsella, Smashing the Broken Mirror*    46
      *Gardner Zemke Co. v. Dunham Bush, Inc.*            56

**Chapter 4 · Things Which May Be Sold**
- A. In General                                        63
  - 11 Beudant, *Cours de Droit Civil Français §§5, 9* (2d ed. 1938)  63
B. Sales of Future Things and Sales of Hopes
  1. Sale of a Future Thing
     Louisiana State Law Institute, Proposed Louisiana Civil Code
     Revision of Sales 4 (1992) (Exposé des Motifs) 65
     Plaquemines Equip. & Machine Co. v. Ford Motor Co. 66
  2. Sale of a Hope
     Louisiana State Law Institute, Proposed Louisiana Civil Code
     Revision of Sales 5 (1992) (Exposé des Motifs) 69
     Losecco v. Gregory 70

C. Assignment of Rights
  1. Assignment of Rights in General 78
  2. Sale of Litigious Rights
     Clement v. Sneed Bros. 81

D. Sale of a Thing Already Owned 86
E. Sale of a Thing of Another 87
  1. In General
     Louisiana State Law Institute, Proposed Louisiana Civil Code
     Revision of Sales 7 (1992) (Exposé des Motifs) 87
  2. Movables—Bona Fide Purchaser Doctrine
     a. The Double-Dealing Seller
        Cameron Equipment Co. v. Stewart and Stevenson Servs., Inc. 89
     b. Lost or Stolen Things
        Brown & Root, Inc. v. Southeast Equip. Co. 93
     c. Things Obtained Through Vice of Consent
        Jeffrey Motor Co. v. Higgins 96
        Flatte v. Nichols 98
     d. Sales of Things by Precarious Possessors
        Tanya Ann Ibieta, Comment, The Transfer of Ownership
        of Movables 103
        Livestock Producers, Inc. v. Littleton 105
        Louisiana Lift & Equip., Inc. v. Eizel 109
     e. Registered Movables
     f. Sale of a Movable Pending Litigation 117
  3. Immovables—The Public Records Doctrine 117
     a. Introduction and General Provisions of the Law of Registry
        McDuffie v. Walker 119
        Michael Palestina, Of Registry: Louisiana’s Revised
        Public Records Doctrine 126
     b. Third Person Defined
        Bradley v. Sharp 131
     c. The Place and Manner of Recordation 138
        Wede v. Niche Marketing USA, LLC 139
     d. Exceptions to the Law of Registry
        i. Inheritance Rights 149
CONTENTS

Knighten v. Ruffin 150
ii. Community Property Rights 155
e. Special Problems in the Law of Registry 159
i. Secret Claims and Equities of the Parties 160
   (a) Nullity 160
   (b) Simulations 161
Owen v. Owen 163
   (c) Dissolution 171
ii. Pending Litigation Affecting Immovables 171
Cannata v. Bonner 172

Chapter 5 · Price 179
A. In General 179
   1. Price in Money 179
      Louisiana State Law Institute, Proposed Louisiana Civil Code
      Revision of Sales 3 (1992) (Exposé des motifs) 179
   2. Price Certain or Determinable 180
      Princeville Canning Co. v. Hamilton 180
      Benglis Sash & Door Co. v. Leonards 186
B. Price Out of Proportion with the Value of the Thing Sold 190
   Moore v. Wilson 190
C. Rescission for Lesion Beyond Moiety 195
   1. In General 195
      a. The Purpose and Mechanics of Lesion 195
      b. Problems of Valuation 198
         Cook v. Mixon 198
   2. Variations on Lesion 209
      a. Exchange 209
      b. Partition 210
   3. Exceptions—Transactions to Which Lesion Does Not Apply 211
      a. Sales of Mineral Rights 211
         Hornsby v. Slade 213
      b. Compromise 219
   4. Comparative Analysis 220
      Christopher K. Odinet, Commerce, Commonality, and Contract Law 221

Chapter 6 · Form 225
A. Movables 225
   Peter Vicari General Contractor, Inc. v. St. Pierre 225
B. Immovables 229
   1. The Writing Requirement 229
      a. In General 229
         Milliman v. Peterman 229
      b. Exception: Delivery Plus Admission 237
         Martin v. Brister 237
2. The Content of the Parties’ Agreement 240
   a. The Consent of the Parties 241
      Chauvin v. Bohn 241
   b. The Property Description 247
      i. Sufficiency of Descriptions 247
      1 Peter S. Title, Louisiana Practice Series, Louisiana Real Estate
      Lemoine v. Lacour 252
      City Bank and Trust of Shreveport v. Scott 254
      Williams v. Bowie Lumber Co. 258
      ii. Reformation of Erroneous Property Descriptions 265
      Mathews v. Emerson 266
   c. Recitation of Price 271

Chapter 7 • Effects of the Contract of Sale 273
   A. General Principles 273
      Louisiana State Law Institute, Proposed Louisiana Civil Code
      Revision of Sales 7–8 (1992) (Exposé des Motifs) 273
   B. Exceptions to the General Rules 275
      1. Things Not Individualized 275
         a. The Problem of Individualization 276
         b. Appropriation 276
         c. Sales by Weight, Tale, or Measure or by Lump 277
            Gulf Rice Milling, Inc. v. Sonnier 278
      2. Things in Transit 284
         a. Transfer of Ownership 284
            Uniform Straight Bill of Landing 286
         b. Transfer of Risk of Loss 289
      3. Sales Subject to Conditions 291
         a. In General 291
            Canal Motors, Inc. v. Campbell 291
         b. Sales Subject to Suspensive Conditions 294
            i. Sale on View or Trial 294
               7 Saúl Litvinoff, Louisiana Civil Law Treatise,
               Obligations § 56, at 76-78 (1975) 295
            ii. Buyer’s Right of Inspection 299
               Tunica Biloxi Tribe of Indians v. Bridges 300
         c. Sales Subject to Resolutory Conditions 304
            i. Sale or Return 304
               7 Saúl Litvinoff, Louisiana Civil Law Treatise, Obligations
               § 58, at 80–82 (1975) 304
               Manuel v. Shaheen 305
ii. Right of Redemption 309
Steib v. Joseph Rathborne Land Co. 310
Tyler v. Rapid Cash, LLC 317

4. Sales Conditioned on Payment of Price (a/k/a “Common Law” Conditional Sales) 320
a. Conditional Sales of Movables 320
i. The Historical Approach 321
Ventre v. Pacific Indem. Co. 321
ii. The Modern Approach 324
(a) Article 9 of the Uniform Commercial Code 324
(b) Louisiana Lease of Movables Act 325
iii. Comparative Law 330
b. Conditional Sales of Immovables (a.k.a. “Bond for Deed”) 330
Trichel v. Homes Ins. Co. 331
McCoy v. Robbins 338
Bergeron v. Parker 340

Chapter 8 · Delivery 347
A. Necessity of Delivery 347
B. Time, Place, and Manner of Delivery 348
Matthews v. Gaubler 349
C. Conformity 354
1. Movables 354
Louisiana State Law Institute, Proposed Louisiana Civil Code Revision of Sales 11–17 (1992) (Exposé des Motifs) 354
Mabry v. Midland Valley Lumber Co. 358
2. Immovables 362
Lasiter v. Gaharan 364
Long-Fork, L.C.C. v. Petite Riviere, L.L.C. 368
Fitzgerald v. Hyland 374

Chapter 9 · The Warranty Against Eviction 383
A. Introduction and Scope of the Warranty Against Eviction 383
1. The Buyer’s Loss or Danger of Losing the Whole or a Part of the Thing 383
Bologna Bros. v. Stephens 384
2. Encumbrances and Other Charges on the Thing Sold 387
Richmond v. Zapata Development Corp. 389
3. Time at Which Third Person’s Right Exists 395
2 Marcel Planiol & George Ripert, Traite Elementaire de Droit Civil No. 1492 (11th ed. 1939) 395
Clark v. O’Neal 396
B. Rights of the Buyer 398
1. In General 398
2. Partial Eviction 400
Taylor v. Fuselier 401
C. Modification of the Warranty Against Eviction 413
1. Categories of Sale 413
   a. Warranty Sale 413
   b. Non-warranty Sale 414
   c. Sale at Buyer’s Peril and Risk 414
   d. Limited Warranty Sales 414
2. Knowledge of the Danger of Eviction 415
3. Seller’s Liability for His or Her Own Acts 416
D. The Buyer’s Right of Subrogation 417

E. Quitclaim Deeds 422

F. Doctrine of After-Acquired Title 426

Chapter 10 · The Warranty Against Redhibitory Defects 431
A. In General 431

B. Seller’s Good or Bad Faith 451
   1. Determining the Good or Bad Faith of the Seller 451
      Bearly v. Brunswick Mercury Marine Div. 452
   2. Significance of Good or Bad Faith of the Seller 457
      a. Buyer’s Remedies 457
      b. Seller’s Right to Notice and Opportunity to Repair 457
      David v. Thibodeaux 458
      c. Applicable Prescriptive Period 463
C. Obligations of the Buyer 464
D. Waiver of Warranty Against Redhibitory Defects 465
E. The Buyer’s Right to Subrogation 471
   1. In General 471
      Media Production Consultants, Inc. v. Mercedes-Benz of North America, Inc. 472
   2. The Nature of the Sellers’ Liability: Solidary or Not? 479
      Aucoin v. Southern Quality Homes, LLC 481
F. Distinction from Breach of Contract 493
   1. Warranty of Fitness 493
      Cunard Line Ltd. v. Datrix, Inc. 494
      Downs v. Hammett Properties, Inc. 499
   2. Difference in Kind or Quality 503
CONTENTS

PPG Industries, Inc. v. Industrial Laminates Corp. 503

G. Other Remedies 508
   1. Louisiana Products Liability Act 509
      De Atley v. Victoria’s Secret Catalogue, LLC 509
   2. Lemon Law 512
   3. New Home Warranty Act 513
      Stutts v. Melton 514

Chapter 11 · Obligations of the Buyer 523
   A. The Buyer’s Two Obligations 523
   B. The Seller’s Remedies for the Buyer’s Failure to Perform 523
      1. Specific Performance and the Vendor’s Privilege 523
      2. Dissolution 524
      3. Damages 527
         Friedman Iron & Supply Co. v. J.B. Beaird Co. 527
         Elazab v. Bryant 530
      4. Other Remedies 534
         Leon Godchaux Clothing Co. v. De Buys 535

Chapter 12 · Contracts Preparatory to Sale 541
   A. Option To Buy or Sell 541
      Louisiana State Law Institute, Proposed Louisiana Civil Code
      Revision of Sales 64–67 (1992) (Exposé des Motifs) 542
      Federal Work Ready, Inc. v. Wright 544
      Delcambre v. Dubois 547
   B. Contract to Sell 555
      Louisiana State Law Institute, Proposed Louisiana Civil Code
      Revision of Sales 67–69 (1992) (Exposé des Motifs) 556
      1 Peter S. Title, Louisiana Practice Series, Louisiana Real Estate
      Payne v. Hurwitz 564
   C. Right of First Refusal 572
      Louisiana State Law Institute, Proposed Louisiana Civil Code
      Revision of Sales 69–70 (1992) (Exposé des Motifs) 573
      Robichaux v. Boutte 574
   D. Effects of Contracts Preparatory to the Sale 583
      1. Time Limitations 583
         Becker and Associates, Inc. v. Lou-Ark Equipment Rentals Co. 584
         Youngblood v. Rosedale Dev. Co. 588
      2. Effects as to Third Persons 591
      3. Indivisibility of the Right 592
   E. Duty to Deliver Merchantable Title 592
      Young v. Stevens 593
PART II · LEASE

Chapter 13 · The Nature and Essential Elements of the Contract of Lease

A. Introduction

B. Essential Elements of the Contract of Lease
   1. Consent to Lease
      *Faroldi v. Nungesser*
   2. The Thing
   3. The Rent
   4. The Term
      a. Conventional vs. Legal Terms
      b. Fixed vs. Indeterminate Terms
   5. Form

C. Effects Against Third Persons
   1. Immovables
      *Motwani v. Fun Centers, Inc.*
   2. Movables

D. Transfer of Interest by Lessor or Lessee
   1. By Lessor
      a. Transfer of the Interest in the Leased Thing
      b. Transfer of Interest in the Lease
   2. By Lessee
      *Illinois Central Gulf Railroad Co. v. International Harvester Co.*

Chapter 14 · Obligations of the Lessor and the Lessee

A. Introduction

B. The Lessor’s Obligations
   1. To Deliver
      *Hinds v. Poo-Yies Inc.*
   2. To Maintain and Warrant Against Vices and Defects
      a. Lessor’s Responsibility for Repairs
      *Davilla v. Jones*
      b. Lessor’s Warranty Against Vices and Defects
      *Reed v. Classified Parking System*
      c. Lessor’s Delictual Liability for Vices and Defects
         Melissa T. Lonegrass, *The Anomalous Interaction Between Code and Statute: Lessor’s Warranty and Statutory Waiver*
         *Tassin v. Slidell Mini-Storage, Inc.*
         *Stuckey v. Riverstone Residential SC, LP*
         Melissa T. Lonegrass, *The Anomalous Interaction Between Code and Statute: Lessor’s Warranty and Statutory Waiver*
   3. Lessor’s Warranty of Peaceful Possession
      *Union Bank v. Cottonport Ins. Exchange*
CONTENTS

Potter v. First Federal Savings & Loan Ass’n of Scotlandville 667

C. The Lessee’s Obligations 674
1. To Pay Rent 675
2. To Use the Thing as a Prudent Administrator and in Accordance with the Lease 675
New Orleans & C.R. Co. v. Darms 675
3. Return of the Thing in the Same Condition 678

D. Attachments, Additions & Improvements 679
E. Security Devices 679
1. Lessor’s Privilege 679
2. Security Deposit 680

Chapter 15 • Termination and Dissolution of the Lease 683

A. The Arrival of the Term 683
1. Indeterminate Term Leases 683
Herring v. Breedlove 684
2. Fixed Term Leases 686
a. General Rule 686
b. Exceptions 687
i. Reconduction 687
ii. Extension/Renewal 689
Le Blanc v. Barielle 690
Huval v. 4S Const. & Maintenance, Inc. 694
iii. Amendment 699
Waller Oil Co. v. Brown 700
iv. Termination at Will 707

B. Expropriation, Loss, and Destruction 708
Bossier Center, Inc. v. Palais Royal, Inc. 709

C. Termination of Lease Granted byUsufructuary 714

D. Death of Lessor or Lessee 715

E. Dissolution for Party’s Failure to Perform 715
1. The Right to Dissolution 715
Edwards v. Standard Oil Co. of Louisiana 717
Purnell v. Dugue 720
2. Specific Performance and Related Remedies 725
a. Specific Performance 725
b. Accelerated Rental 726
c. Reletting the Premises 728
Sunbelt Security Services, Inc. v. Delahoussaye 728
Dixie Services, LLC v. R&B Falcon Drilling USA, Inc. 737

Index 743
Acknowledgements

This textbook is a project many years in the making. It has been deeply influenced by our students, by our own teachers, and by our many friends and colleagues with whom we have shared materials and ideas for this course over the years. We would like to acknowledge the editorial advice, encouragement, and inspiration of those without whom this textbook would not have been possible, including Dian Tooley-Knoblett, John A. Lovett, David W. Gruning, Ronald J. Scalise Jr., J. Randall Trahan, Alain Levassuer, Patrick S. Ottinger, Wendell Holmes, L. David Cromwell, Peter S. Title, Shael Herman, Nikolaos A. Davrados, and, without question, Saúl Litvinoff, the chief architect of Louisiana’s modern law of sales, and Symeon Symeonides, the principal draftsman of the revised law of lease. We are also indebted to our excellent research assistants: Malerie Bulot (LSU, Class of 2018), Endya Hash (LSU, Class of 2018), Jourdan Curet (LSU, Class of 2019), and M.J. Hernandez (LSU, Class of 2019).

MELISSA T. LONEGRASS,  
Louisiana State University Law Center

SANDI S. VARNADO,  
Loyola University New Orleans College of Law

CHRISTOPHER K. ODINET,  
University of Oklahoma College of Law / Southern University Law Center